Distribution: Restricted REPL.VI/1/R.7 21 February 2002
Original: English Agenda Item 5 English



#### IFAD

# INTERNATIONAL FUND FOR AGRICULTURAL DEVELOPMENT Consultation on the Sixth Replenishment of IFAD's Resources – First Session

Rome, 21 February 2002

### EXTERNAL REVIEW OF THE RESULTS AND IMPACT OF IFAD OPERATIONS

### TERMS OF REFERENCE

### A. Background

- 1. At the meeting of the convenors of the three Lists held on 15 January 2002, it was proposed that the results and impact of IFAD operations be reviewed by a team of external experts as an input to the Sixth Replenishment of IFAD's Resources. The convenors underlined that this external review should not impinge on the scheduled date of completion of the Sixth Replenishment in 2002. For this purpose it was decided that the external review's report be discussed during the third session of the Sixth Replenishment meeting in July.
- 2. Assessing the impact and results of the Fund's operations has been a priority in IFAD for quite some time. However, IFAD has only recently put in place a comprehensive system for assessing and consolidating the results and impact of the operations it supports. In 2000 a number of measures were put in place, such as the new format for project completion reports and a revamped process for progress reporting on the project portfolio (which includes greater links between project performance and impact). Similarly, following a specific objective of the Plan of Action 2000-2002, in 2001 IFAD developed: (a) the New Methodology for Impact Evaluation, which will allow better, more consistent and consolidated impact assessment of a number of projects in the future and (b) a Practical Guide for Monitoring and Evaluation (M&E) at the Project Level, as part of a series of measures that aim to improve the quality and effectiveness of M&E in IFAD-supported projects.
- 3. The present document outlines how the task of undertaking and reporting on the outcome of the external review will be approached.

Document #: 237747 Library: DMS



### **B.** Objectives

4. The objective of the external review will be to report on (a) the results and impact achieved by IFAD-supported operations, and (b) the recently established methodologies and processes for assessing the results and impact of IFAD-supported projects and other changes introduced to enhance IFAD's focus on results.

## C. Scope of the Review

- 5. Given the very limited time period during which the external review is to be carried out, it will be necessary to be selective in delineating the scope of the review. This will set limits in particular regarding resource/time-consuming field investigations and other efforts to carry out independent validations.
- 6. In accordance with these objectives, the review covers the two interlinked areas related to the assessment of IFAD's results and impact and the processes designed to ensure that these results are being achieved. It will be based on review of documents, interviews with IFAD staff and partners and visits to a limited number of countries.

### **Review of Results and Impact**

- 7. The universe of evaluative reports available in IFAD consists of the following:
  - (a) Programme Management Department ('self-assessment') reports, covering virtually all IFAD operational activities
    - Progress reports on the project portfolio
    - Supervision reports and mid-term reviews
    - Project completion reports
    - Country portfolio reviews
    - Impact assessments/case studies
  - (b) Reports by the Office of Evaluation and Studies ('independent evaluation'), covering selected areas of IFAD operations
    - Corporate evaluations
    - Thematic evaluations
    - Country programme evaluations
    - Interim evaluations
    - Completion evaluations
    - Mid-term evaluations

The review will focus on reports issued since the beginning of 2000, but will also address relevant earlier reports.

- 8. Given the tight schedule, the review will select relevant reports from the foregoing universe. It will focus on eight to ten countries, reflecting the geographic distribution of IFAD-assisted activities and for which a significant information basis is available.
- 9. Consistent with the foregoing, the review will synthesize results and impact as documented in available evaluative reports and comment on utility, quality and internal consistency, though without independent validation through original research (including at the field level) or review of the documentation underlying such reports.



### **Review of Improved Processes**

- 10. During the last two to three years, IFAD has introduced a number of changes to its modus operandi with the objective of improving results and enhancing impact. These changes have flowed primarily from processes connected with the Fifth Replenishment and their operational expression in the Plan of Action. Notwithstanding the recentness of these initiatives, the external review proposes to examine these in the interests of being fully and properly up to date in its assessment. This will be done with a view to determining to what extent IFAD has indeed changed its operations in line with the Plan of Action and ascertaining whether or not there are discernible trends in the direction of attaining the objective of these initiatives. The focus will be on three areas: policy dialogue and partnership; IFAD-specific approaches to impact enhancement; and improved impact assessment.
- 11. With regard to the area of policy dialogue and partnership, the review will examine:
  - (a) at the strategic level, measures taken affecting the relationship between IFAD policy and strategy development and that of other stakeholders, including, *inter alia*, *g*overnments, United Nations agencies, cooperating institutions, non-governmental organizations (NGOs), civil-society organizations and beneficiaries, and the roles of country strategic opportunities papers (COSOPs), participation in poverty-reduction strategy papers (PRSPs); and participation in the Comprehensive Development Framework/United Nations Development Assistance Framework (CDF/UNDAF) processes and other policy processes;
  - (b) at the country level, what measures have been taken to link performance assessment with country resource allocation; and
  - (c) at the project level, the extent and modalities of stakeholder involvement.
- 12. With regard to the area of IFAD-specific approaches to enhancing impact, the review will examine progress made with respect to the following key issues:
  - (a) innovation and innovativeness;
  - (b) scaling up, replicability and leverage; and
  - (c) knowledge management.
- 13. With regard to the area of improved impact assessment, the review will examine progress made with respect to:
  - (a) monitoring and evaluation at the project level;
  - (b) annual portfolio progress report of the Programme Management Department;
  - (c) impact evaluation methodology by the Office of Evaluation and Studies; and
  - (d) dissemination, learning, and utilization of information from improved impact assessment.
- 14. The review's findings, conclusions and recommendations in these areas will be based upon assessment of the relevant documentation, interviews with appropriate IFAD staff, and selected field visits.



### **D.** External Review Team

- 15. The External Review Team will be composed of the following people drawn from evaluation departments of development agencies as well as IFAD Evaluation Committee members, who represent the three Lists:
  - Chairman: Mr Niels Dabelstein, head of Evaluation Secretariat, Danish International Development Assistance, and Chairman of the Development Assistance Committee (DAC) Working Party on Aid Evaluation.
  - Vice-Chairman: Mr Víctor Hugo Morales Meléndez, chairman of the Evaluation Committee and member from Mexico.
  - Mr Adnan Bashir Khan, former member of the Evaluation Committee from Pakistan.
  - Mr Lothar Caviezel, Executive Director for Switzerland and member of the Evaluation Committee.
  - Mr Osvaldo Feinstein, manager, Operations Evaluation Department, World Bank.
  - Prof Gabriel Lombin, member of the Evaluation Committee from Nigeria.
  - Mr Rob van den Berg, director, Policy and Operations Evaluation Department, Dutch Ministry of Foreign Affairs.
- 16. The Office of Evaluation and Studies will act as secretariat for the External Review Team. The team will work independently and have unrestricted access to IFAD staff and documents as required.
- 17. The External Review Team will avail itself of the services of the following three consultants, to be recruited for this purpose:
  - Mr Ian Jones, a freelance consultant in rural social and economic analysis, with emphasis on the structure and causes of poverty, target-group definition, gender and development, decentralization and local institution-building. He has worked principally with the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO), the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) and IFAD.
  - Ms Govind Kelkar, a freelance consultant in agricultural development, rural povertyalleviation strategy and gender mainstreaming. She has worked with various international development organizations and the Asian Institute of Technology in Thailand.
  - Mr Hans Wyss will head the team of consultants. He is a former World Bank director and was involved, *inter alia*, in the preparation of the study on "Harmonization of Operations Evaluation among Multilateral Development Banks" in 1998-99 and "The Assessment of IFAD Project Supervision Arrangements and Preparation of Proposals for their Management" in 1996.
- 18. The consultants will work in accordance with terms of reference set forth by the External Review Team and submit their report to the team. They will work closely with the team through electronic means as well as field visits and meetings.



### **Timing and Calendar**

19. The work of the External Review Team should be completed in time to submit its report for review at the third session of the Sixth Replenishment of IFAD's Resources. The box below summarizes the tentative calendar of events leading up to a full discussion of the external review report on 2-3 July 2002.

**14-15 February:** meeting of External Review Team and consultants in Rome to review and finalize the approach paper, terms of reference, etc., and in particular determine the key questions and issues to be addressed by the review and the selection of documents.

**21 February:** presentation by the team of the terms of reference of the external review to the first session of IFAD's Sixth Replenishment.

**16 February-6 May:** review of documents, joint consultants/team field visit, discussions with IFAD staff and partner agencies, writing of report and teleconsultation with review team.

**7 May:** dispatch of draft report to the team.

**15-17 May:** meeting of the team in Rome to discuss and finalize the report.

**20-27 May:** preparation of final draft and editing of the report.

**27 May:** dispatch of the report to IFAD management.

**3 June:** meeting in Rome with IFAD management.

**3-7 June:** finalization of the report.

**7 June:** IFAD management to provide independent response to be attached as an annex to the external review report.

**7 June:** dispatch of the final report to the IFAD secretariat for translation.

**10-18 June:** translation into the four official IFAD languages.

**19 June:** dispatch to participants of the replenishment session.

**2-3 July:** presentation of the report by the External Review Team and discussion of the report at the third session of the Sixth IFAD Replenishment.