

Document: EC 2016/93/W.P.6/Add.1
Agenda: 7
Date: 9 August 2016
Distribution: Public
Original: English

E



Investing in rural people

President's Report on the Implementation Status of Evaluation Recommendations and Management Actions (PRI SMA)

Volume II

Recommendations and follow-up actions taken by Management

Addendum

Note to Evaluation Committee members

Focal points:

Technical questions:

Lisandro Martin
Chief
Operational Programming and Effectiveness Unit
Tel.: +39 06 5459 2388
e-mail: lisandro.martin@ifad.org

Sara Kouakou
Portfolio Officer
Programme Management Department
Tel.: +39 06 5459 2868
e-mail: s.kouakou@ifad.org

Queries with respect to the response of the Independent
Office of Evaluation to the report should be addressed to:

Oscar A. Garcia
Director
Independent Office of Evaluation of IFAD
Tel.: +39 06 5459 2274
e-mail: o.garcia@ifad.org

Dispatch of documentation:

William Skinner
Chief
Governing Bodies Office
Tel.: +39 06 5459 2974
e-mail: gb_office@ifad.org

Evaluation Committee — Ninety-third Session
Rome, 6 September 2016

For: Review

Document: EB 2016/118/R.
Agenda: X
Date: 2016
Distribution: Public
Original: English

E



Investing in rural people

President's Report on the Implementation Status of Evaluation Recommendations and Management Actions (PRI SMA)

Volume II

Recommendations and follow-up actions taken by Management

Addendum

Note to Executive Board representatives

Focal points:

Technical questions:

Lisandro Martin
Chief
Operational Programming and Effectiveness Unit
Tel.: +39 06 5459 2388
e-mail: lisandro.martin@ifad.org

Sara Kouakou
Portfolio Officer
Programme Management Department
Tel.: +39 06 5459 2868
e-mail: s.kouakou@ifad.org

Queries with respect to the response of the Independent
Office of Evaluation to the report should be addressed to:

Oscar A. Garcia
Director
Independent Office of Evaluation of IFAD
Tel.: +39 06 5459 2274
e-mail: o.garcia@ifad.org

Dispatch of documentation:

William Skinner
Chief
Governing Bodies Office
Tel.: +39 06 5459 2374
e-mail: gb_office@ifad.org

Executive Board — 118th Session
Rome, 21 – 22 September 2016

For: Review

Contents

Abbreviations and acronyms	ii
Categories used for the classification of actions/ recommendations	iv
<u>Evaluations conducted in 2014 and 2015</u>	
Corporate Level Evaluations (CLEs)	
CLE: Fragile and conflict-affected states and situations	1
CLE: Replenishments	6
Country Programme Evaluations (CPEs)	
CPE Zambia	11
CPE Bolivia	16
CPE China	21
CPE Tanzania	25
Project Performance Assessments (PPAs)	
PPA Morocco	28
PPA Sudan	29
PPA India	31
PPA Pakistan	32
PPA Rwanda	34
PPA Albania	39
PPA Turkey	46
<u>Historic follow up</u>	
Corporate level evaluations	
CLE: IFAD's Institutional Efficiency and Efficiency of IFAD-funded operations	46
CLE: IFAD Supervision and Implementation Support Policy	65
Country and project evaluations	
CPE Madagascar	75
CPE Mali	77
CPE Nepal	80
CPE Uganda	83
CPE Ghana	87
CPE Rwanda	90
CPE Vietnam	92
CPE Yemen	94
Brazil Interim Evaluation	86
Ghana Interim Evaluation	96

Abbreviations and acronyms

ACP	Agreement at Completion Point
AJK	Azad Jammu and Kashmir Community Development Programme(Pakistan)
APR	Asia and the Pacific Division
ARPP	Annual Review of Regional Portfolio Performance
AROPA	Support to Farmers' Professional Organizations and Agricultural Service Project (Madagascar)
ARRI	Annual Report on Results and Impact of IFAD Operations
ASAP	Adaptation for Smallholders Agriculture Programme
AWPB	Annual Work Programme and Budget
BI	Business Intelligence
BOD	Budget and Organizational Development Unit
CFS	Controller's and Financial Services Division
CLEAR	Center for Learning on evaluation and Results Latin
COSOP	Country Strategic Opportunities Paper
CPE	Country Programme Evaluation
CPM	Country programme manager
CPMT	Country Programme Management Team
CSN	Country Strategy Note
EB	Executive Board
ECD	Environment and Climate Division
ESA	East and Southern Africa Division
FAO	Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations
FOD	Financial Operations Department
FORMAPROD	Vocational Training and Agricultural Productivity Improvement Programme (Madagascar)
FSU	Field support unit
GASH	Gash Sustainable Livelihood Regeneration Project (Sudan)
GASIP	Ghana Agricultural Sector Investment Programme (Ghana)
GCR	Grant completion report
GLF	Grant life file
GRIPS	Grants and Investment Projects System
GSR	Grant supervision report
GTWDP	Goksu Taseli Watershed Development Project (Turkey)
HCA	Host Country Agreement
HMDP	Highlands Milk shed Development Project (Tanzania)
HRD	Human Resources Division
HVAP	High-Value Agriculture Project in Hill and Mountain Areas (Nepal)
ICDS	Integrated Child Development Services
ICO	IFAD Country Office
ICT	Information and communication technology
ICSC	International Civil Service Commission
ILSP	Integrated Livelihood Support Project (India)
IMT	IFAD Management Team
INRA	National Agricultural Research Institute
IOE	Independent office of evaluation of IFAD
JSIR	Joint Supervision and Implementation Review
KM	Knowledge Management
LAC	Latin America and Caribbean division
LAMP	Livelihoods and Access to Markets Project (India)
LFLP	Leasehold Forestry and Livestock Programme (Nepal)
LGS	Loan and grant system
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation
MGP	Matching Grant Programme

MPAT	Multidimensional Poverty Assessment Tool
MIC	Middle income countries
MSME	Micro, small and medium enterprises
NEN	Near East, North Africa and Europe division
OSC	Operational strategy and policy guidance committee
OMC	Operations management committee
ONCA	National Office for Agricultural Advisory Assistance
OPELIP	Odisha Particularly Vulnerable Tribal Groups Empowerment and Livelihood
PBAS	Performance based allocation system
PCR	Project Completion Report
PAF	Poverty Alleviation Fund Project (Nepal)
PASP	Post-harvest and Agribusiness Support Project (Rwanda)
PASPTA	Support Project for the Strategic Plan for the Transformation of Agriculture
PDRZM	Rural Development Project in the Mountain Zones (Morocco)
PIDRK	Kidal Integrated Rural Development Programme (Mali)
PIDRN	Northern Regions Investment and Rural Development Programme (Mali)
PLF	Project life file
PMD	Programme Management Department
PRM	Resource Mobilization and Partnership Office
PRICE	Project for Rural Income through Exports
PRS	Poverty Reduction Strategy
PRT	Portfolio Review Team
PRO-CAMELIDOS	Integral Development Programme of the Bolivian Altiplano
PSR	Project Status Report
PTA	IFAD Technical Advisory Division
QA	Quality Assurance
QE	Quality enhancement
QUASAR	Quality Assurance Archiving System
REP	Rural Enterprises Programme (Ghana)
RCTs	Randomized control trials
RIMS	Results and impact management system
RMF	Results measurement framework
RTA	Reimbursable Technical Assistance
SEDP	Sivas-Erzincan Development Project (Turkey)
SFDA	Society for financing small farmers
SIMES	Standard IFAD Monitoring and Evaluation System
SIPs	Strategic Investment Plans
SIS	Supervision and implementation support
SKD	Strategy and Knowledge Department
SOEs	Statement of Expenditures
VODP	Vegetable Oil Development Project (Uganda)
VPGs	Vulnerable Producer Groups
WCA	West and Central Africa division
WUPAP	Western Uplands Poverty Alleviation Project (Nepal)

Categories used for the classification of actions/ recommendations

SN Serial Number

Type of evaluation

CLE Corporate Level Evaluation
CPE Country Programme Evaluation
PPA Project Performance Assessment
IE Interim Evaluation

Level

IFAD IFAD Corporate Level
REG IFAD Regional Level
CTRY IFAD Country Level
GOV Government Authorities (national, local level and institutions)
PROJ Project

Nature

PLCY Policy
STR Strategy Development, including COSOPs and Projects
OPER Operational and Implementation

Themes

ASR Analysis, studies and researches
BEN Beneficiaries and stakeholders' participation and consultation
COS Country Strategic Opportunities Programme (COSOP), also including country strategy
DEC Decentralization
DES Project design
DIA Policy dialogue
EFF Efficiency
FLD Field presence
GDR Gender (including targeting to women)
GOV Governance
GRT Grants/ grants financing policy
HR Human resources (management, recruitment)
ICT Information and communication technology
INF Infrastructure (construction, contracting, management, supervision)
INN Innovation
KM Knowledge management
NRM Natural resource management and environment
ORG Organizations, groups, institutions and collective approaches
PAR Partnership
PRM Private sector, market and enterprise development, value chains
PMA Project management and administration (incl. financial management)
REPL Replenishment
RFI Rural finance
RME Results monitoring, evaluation
SCA Replication and scaling up
SOU South-south and triangular cooperation
STRA Strategy
SUP Supervision and implementation support
SUS Sustainability
TCB Training, capacity-building
TGT Targeting

Corporate Level Evaluation - Fragile and conflict-affected states and situations

Corporate Level Evaluation - Fragile and conflict-affected states and situations							
Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	2016 Follow Up	Status
					Policy and strategy		
CLE	1	IFAD	STR	STRA	Draft an overarching corporate policy statement including a new definition that sets out the principles for IFAD's approach to engagement with fragile and conflict-affected states and subnational situations. As part of the policy, clearly define the development threshold that will assist staff in determining the fragility situation in particular countries or regions, allowing them to design operations using appropriate tools and instruments. This policy statement should be approved by the Board and consider the major issues identified in this evaluation.	This is ongoing: the approach to IFAD's strategy for engagement in countries with fragile situations was presented to the Evaluation Committee in March and the Executive Board in April 2016. The new approach draws on existing strengths and develops differentiated approaches for countries with fragile situations. The final strategy will build on feedback provided by the EC/ EB and be submitted in December 2016 as part of the corporate paper on MICs, PBAS, fragility and decentralization.	O
CLE	2	IFAD	STR	STRA	Adopt a simpler approach to classification of countries with fragile situations, which is specific to IFAD's mandate and priorities. The country's policy and institutional capacity should be among the most fundamental criteria considered in the new classification system.	This has been addressed in the approach paper. IFAD is moving from a harmonized list of 'fragile states' to an IFAD-specific definition and classification of countries with 'fragile situations'. Institutional capacity is a key element of the new index proposed to classify countries with fragile situations (the other two elements being vulnerability and conflict).	O
CLE	3	IFAD	STR	COS	Strengthen the fragility and conflict analysis in the COSOP through the provision of greater resources and by building more explicitly on the analysis by partner IFIs and United Nations organizations in these countries. More frequent updating is desirable to enable IFAD to manage the strategy more effectively. Future COSOPs should include budget estimates for achieving agreed-upon objectives.	This has been addressed in the approach paper. The paper suggests fragility analysis in all COSOPs and CSNs. Such analysis will be undertaken for country programmes in the most fragile situations, and draw on assessments undertaken by development partners and governments themselves. For other countries, the extent of fragility analysis undertaken during COSOP/CSN preparation will be determined by the Country Programme Management Team. Pipeline projects expected to be implemented in more fragile situations within less fragile countries will be flagged and deeper analysis undertaken during project design.	O
					Project and programme design		

Corporate Level Evaluation - Fragile and conflict-affected states and situations								
Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme		Recommendation	2016 Follow Up	Status
CLE	4	IFAD	STR	DES		Programme design needs to identify where IFAD can engage and where it cannot. In countries with subnational fragile situations, where basic security requirements do not preclude IFAD's involvement, IFAD needs to decide whether to engage or not based on the potential for impact on rural poverty.	This has been recommended in the approach paper. If approved in the strategy, additional criteria tools will be developed to determine operational engagement or withdrawal. Resilient delivery models – drawing on models that have proved effective in country programmes in fragile situations- will enable IFAD to stay engaged and continue implementation in difficult contexts. Risk management will also extend to IFAD and project staff and their security, with clear criteria for operational engagement or withdrawal.	O
CLE	5	IFAD	OPER	DES		Include simple objectives and design, taking into account the country's policy and institutional context, and devote greater attention to ensuring customization of development approaches (e.g. to gender equality and women's empowerment) depending on the context.	This is suggested in the approach paper and will be recommended in the strategy. Following approval of the strategy, a series of knowledge products could be produced, providing guidance to country teams on designing simple, appropriate and resilient projects for fragile situations, as well as to quality enhancement/quality assurance reviewers on key issues.	O
CLE	6	IFAD	STR	BEN		In countries experiencing weak institutional capacity and poor governance, IFAD can build on current practices of working with local communities, farmer organizations and lower levels of government dealing with service delivery.	The approach paper has addressed this recommendation, to be finalised in the strategy. IFAD engagement in fragile situations is already oriented towards strengthening community and government institutions, particularly at the local level. These include farmers' organizations, indigenous peoples' organizations, women's associations, water users' associations, and other community-level institutions as well as local government agencies and service providers. The strategy will leverage IFAD's reputation as a trusted partner of governments and rural communities to strengthen social cohesion among different stakeholders across social, economic, ethnic, political and other divides.	O
						Project and Programme implementation		

Corporate Level Evaluation - Fragile and conflict-affected states and situations								
Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme		Recommendation	2016 Follow Up	Status
CLE	7	IFAD	STR	SUP		Expand direct supervision and implementation support in quantity and technical content, ensuring allocation of corresponding budgets based on needs rather than on pre-determined allocations by project. Technical staff from IFAD's Policy and Technical Advisory Division should further expand their participation in such processes as well as in COSOP and project designs.	The approach paper suggests differentiated approaches to supervision/ implementation support. As per the approach paper, '30. Supervision and implementation support are of key importance in fragile situations from a risk management perspective, ensuring that fiduciary safeguards are being implemented, guiding the application of flexible approaches to project management to address dynamic fragility contexts and providing necessary additional support to implementing agencies. They also present key opportunities to build trust with project teams, beneficiaries, partners and government officials. IFAD's focus on supervision and implementation support for problem projects already targets many projects in fragile situations. A future differentiated approach would aim to maximize both support to problem projects, and learning opportunities from successful projects in fragile situations.' With regard to additional budgets, the approach paper suggests additional resources for programmes in fragile situations. The modality and structure for additional resources will be developed as the strategy is developed (in alignment with other corporate processes such as the PBAS reform). As stated in the approach paper, 'IFAD will explore how fragility could be incorporated into the PBAS, while retaining the system's foundations as a performance-based model. The option of creating a specific "crisis response window" (or similar) will be considered as a way of establishing an additional source of financing. IFAD will also review options to give Member States and other partners the opportunity to provide IFAD with financing earmarked for fragile situations through complementary or supplementary financing windows and to further leverage remittance flows for investment.'	O
CLE	8	IFAD	STR	FLD		Explicitly prioritize the establishment of new IFAD country offices and out-posting of CPMs in countries affected by fragility and conflict.	This is ongoing: currently over half the ICOs are in countries with fragile situations (as per the current list).	O

Corporate Level Evaluation - Fragile and conflict-affected states and situations								
Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme		Recommendation	2016 Follow Up	Status
CLE	9	IFAD	STR	PAR		Create strategic partnerships to leverage complementary skills and provide a higher level and broader basis of implementation support.	This is addressed in the approach paper and will be part of the final strategy. As stated in the approach paper, 'The specific importance of partnership in fragile situations warrants its inclusion as a guiding principle. Partnerships help IFAD to manage risks and enable it to stay engaged in more challenging contexts because they provide the means to address root causes of fragility that lie outside IFAD's areas of comparative advantage but pose a threat to IFAD's country programmes. IFAD's use of partnerships in fragile situations will be guided by the IFAD Partnership Strategy (2012). Partnerships with the Rome-based agencies and other United Nations agencies will receive particular attention in fragile situations, as will partnerships with other development partners with strong implementing capacity, such as trusted civil society organizations and the private sector. Partnerships with humanitarian agencies are key to bridging the humanitarian-development gap.'	0
						Empowerment of staff		
CLE	10	IFAD	STR	HR		Efforts should be made to introduce specific incentives for staff working in fragile states and conflict-affected situations, including those based in headquarters discharging similar functions. Greater attention to capacity-building and training needs of staff should also be explicitly promoted, and platforms for exchanging knowledge, good practices and experiences of working in fragile states (across regional divisions) should be introduced.	This has been addressed in the approach paper, especially through non-financial incentives. As per the paper, '36. Human resource management and empowerment of staff are the subject of recommendations in the CLE on fragile states and play a key role in IFAD's organizational and operational resilience. The Human Resources Division (HRD) will contribute to developing IFAD's strategy for engagement in countries with fragile situations and Management will review incentives for staff working in fragile situations, whether based in headquarters or in ICOs, on the principle that willingness to work in countries with fragile situations should be rewarded, recognizing the benefits such experience brings to the institution. Such incentives would be of a non-financial nature and take into consideration issues such as security and broader concerns about staff well-being and career development.'	0
						Results Measurement		

Corporate Level Evaluation - Fragile and conflict-affected states and situations								
Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme		Recommendation	2016 Follow Up	Status
CLE	11	IFAD	STR	RME		Plan and resource project monitoring and evaluation more selectively. Greater attention needs to be paid to planning for monitoring and evaluation during project design. At present, the approach is one size fits all. All projects should be required to defend their design with proven evidence from earlier phases or other locations that the intervention will work in the planned context. Where evidence is lacking, contexts are different or where a project is an acknowledged innovation or pilot, monitoring and evaluation will require more resources.	M&E will be addressed through an ongoing series of reforms across the self-evaluation system, including updating completion and supervision guidelines, updating the RIMS framework and guidelines, developing new country strategy guidance, and developing an M&E curriculum. These changes are being implemented under an overall self-evaluation reform process. These changes will improve M&E processes and systems across the portfolio, including the countries with fragile situations. In addition, given the institutional constraints in these countries, IFAD will encourage impact assessment methodologies that are simple and cost-effective but capable of capturing coherent results data in fragile situations.	O
CLE	12	IFAD	STR	RME		Revise IFAD's results measurement framework to include indicators of outcomes related to fragility. The major gaps lie in measuring women's empowerment and institutional performance. Indicators and means of measurement need to be established in both areas.	See response above. In the overall M&E framework, gender indicators and markers have been integrated across the project cycle. In addition, institutional performance is a key element of analysis in fragile situations. After the approval of the strategy, detailed indicators if required will be developed. Based on feedback received during the April EB, gender will be integrated as a key principle of the strategy. If required, additional indicators will be developed for programmes in fragile situations.	O

Corporate Level Evaluation: Replenishments

Corporate Level Evaluation: Replenishments								
Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme		Recommendation	2016 Follow Up	Status
CLE	1	IFAD	STR	REPL		<p>The global context calls for close monitoring and analysis. Monitoring and analysing global trends in development financing and emerging global issues is key to understanding IFAD's opportunities and threats. This is a task that may be undertaken jointly with peers, who face the same challenges and are interested in the same trends and issues. As IFAD is also subject to global trends such as increasing earmarking and development of new financial instruments, it may consider how it could best have a voice in and contribute to global discussions on these issues and brand the organization in this area, including for example in the OECD and through various virtual platforms. The latter could be part of IFAD's communication strategy.</p>	<p>Actively followed replenishment processes and innovative financing approaches of other IFIs with the aim of testing applicability of new models to IFAD. Followed policy dialogue and strategic discussions of partner institutions, including World Bank (IDA), Asian Development Bank, African Development Bank and IFC. Monitored and analysed replenishment discussions of partner institutions, IFIs/MDBs, funds and other development partners, represented IFAD at relevant replenishment meetings and conferences, presented IFAD's replenishment role within the broader development framework in the international aid architecture. Specifically, participated in ADF13 MTR and IDA17 MTR in November 2015, as well as replenishment Consultations for ADF14 and IDA18 in 2016</p>	F
CLE	2	IFAD	STR	REPL		<p>The preparation of a strategic vision would help set the scene for IFAD10 and beyond. Current efforts at preparing a strategic vision document, reflecting the overall development trends mentioned above, are commendable and, could, if the process is so designed, also shape future replenishments. It should be seen as the first step in a process of preparing a medium- to long-term strategic vision and care should be taken to design a process that also engages the new donors in sharing their agricultural and rural development experiences and expectations. It should position IFAD in the post 2015 development landscape and should clearly address IFAD's role in non-lending activities, the need for diversification depending on country circumstances, and IFAD's comparative advantage in reaching some of world's poorest and most fragile countries and target groups. The strategic vision would help keep the various replenishment consultations focused at a strategic level, and better argue the case for IFAD also beyond the short three year replenishment cycles</p>	<p>Strategic Vision and Role. The Strategic Framework for 2016-2025 was presented to the December Executive Board and approved with minor revisions by correspondence. It was formulated in the context of Agenda 2030 and the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs). It outlines the Fund's overarching goals, its strategic objectives, the thematic areas of focus, and the principles of engagement that will guide our operations. The Medium-Term Plan (2016-2018), will help to operationalize the Strategic Framework.</p>	F

o

Corporate Level Evaluation: Replenishments								
Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme		Recommendation	2016 Follow Up	Status
CLE	3	IFAD	OPER	REPL		The replenishment process can still be improved. The good practice of having an independent external chair should be continued in the future, and the opportunities and challenges of changing the duration of the replenishment cycle from 3 to 4 years should be further analysed by the Management and a proposal made accordingly before the commencement of IFAD11.	It is planned that an independent external Chair will be selected for IFAD11. Opportunities for changing the duration of the replenishment cycle from 3 to 4 years are being analysed through the Ad Hoc Working Group on Governance Issues. The Working Group, which includes selected members from all Lists, held several meetings, both informal and formal, to consider governance issues. Regular updates were provided to the Executive Board, and a final report of the Working Group will be provided to the Governing Council in 2017, through the December Executive Board.	F
CLE	4	IFAD	OPER	REPL		Building on the experience in previous replenishments, more time should be devoted to discussing development results including the MTR, ARRI and relevant independent evaluations.	The Synthesis of Lessons Learned from the IFAD9 Impact Assessment Initiative was presented to the Evaluation Committee in March and to the EB in April. This impact assessment is a milestone for IFAD10, it lays a scientific basis for assessing the impact of IFAD9 and draws key lessons for the design and implementation of projects. This work is a major contribution to improving our results and impact in IFAD10 and beyond.	O
CLE	5	IFAD	STR	REPL		Voice, representation and governance merits further study. The implication of the fact that participation and contribution is delinked merits further thought and study both in terms of financial incentives, visibility, burden-sharing and perceived influence. Gaining insights into this complex field would be highly beneficial to PRM, who should conduct or commission the study.	Voice, representation and governance arrangements area major focus of the Ad Hoc Working Group on Governance Issues. The Working Group is expected to prepare a report on this matter, including any recommendations, and on voice and representation, governance.	O
CLE	6	IFAD	OPER	REPL		The demand for more informal sessions and more engagement with Management and between Members could be met through use of working groups or informal sessions, as is the practice in peers; this might enhance the sense of ownership. To broaden understanding and ownership, consideration should be given to organize informal side events at the GC prior to the first replenishment consultation meeting to discuss the agenda and a similar event to present the consultation report the following year.	Informal seminars of the Executive Board are now open to all Member States as per decision of the Executive Board in February 2016. Previously, the informal seminars were open only to the Executive Board representatives.	O

Corporate Level Evaluation: Replenishments								
Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme		Recommendation	2016 Follow Up	Status
CLE	7	IFAD	STR	REPL		Finally, further study is also recommended of the implications of changes to the List system. An effective system for dialogue which can help generate consensus and ownership of decisions is a fundamental building block for maintaining trust in the institution and its multilateral character.	Implication of changes to the List system have been considered by the Ad Hoc Working Group on Governance Issues. The Working Group will prepare a report with any recommendations on the List system and present it to the Governing Council in 2017, through the December Executive Board	O
CLE	8	IFAD	PLCY	REPL		Policy and organizational change should be directly linked to the strategic objectives and the underlying logic of changes should be clearly articulated. As IFAD is subject to the global "policy diffusion" in particular with respect to operational and policy issues from the IDA and AfDF replenishments that precede IFAD's replenishment process, the organization should be in a strong position to anticipate proposed change well ahead at the start of a replenishment process. This would allow a thorough analysis of the relevance for IFAD of these issues. Furthermore, any proposed change, emanating from such "policy diffusion" or from internal reviews and evaluations, should clearly articulate the underlying logic connecting the proposed change to IFAD's overall strategy. This would minimize the risk of mis-alignment and might also be a powerful communication tool to replenishment deputies and Member States.	IFAD closely monitored and followed policy dialogue and strategic discussions of partner institutions, including World Bank (IDA), Asian Development Bank, African Development Bank. Management also monitored and analysed replenishment discussions, specifically, participated in ADF13 MTR and IDA17 MTR in November 2015, as well as replenishment Consultations for ADF14 and IDA18 in 2016.	F
CLE	9	IFAD	OPER	RME		Results reporting can be further improved. It is recommended that the MTR of IFAD10 be presented to IFAD11 in a dedicated meeting a few months prior to the first session. Should a three year replenishment cycle be retained in the future, IFAD 11 would be held in 2017. The MTR should also include a completion report of IFAD9. This would allow members to discuss results and lessons from IFAD9 and progress in implementing IFAD10, as well as examine emerging global issues of importance that could inform the provisional agenda for IFAD11.	IFAD10 MTR will take place at the first meeting of IFAD11 Consultations. 3-year cycle is retained for IFAD11. IFAD10 MTR will include a completion report of IFAD9.	O

Corporate Level Evaluation: Replenishments								
Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme		Recommendation	2016 Follow Up	Status
CLE	10	IFAD	OPER	RME		It is further recommended that in IFAD10 efforts be made to more explicitly articulate the underlying theory of change among the different levels in the RMF, as well as find ways to maintain or reduce the total number of indicators, if possible, rather than include additional indicators. This would contribute to making the RMF a more useful tool for reporting as well as managing for results. Finally, IOE data should be used in reporting results against indicators in the RMF, as and where available.	Revisions to RMF, revisions to RIMS and strategy for IFAD10 impact assessment are being proposed in the context of the new Development Effectiveness Framework.	O
CLE	11	IFAD	OPER	REPL		Financial perspectives. Management should consider clarifying nomenclature for replenishment and other resources that IFAD owns or administers, identifying sources and uses transparently and consistently.	IFAD10 had stipulation for core and unrestricted complementary contributions, Sovereign Borrowing Framework and other sources of funding for IFAD	F
CLE	12	IFAD	STR	REPL		As in the past, due efforts, resources and energies must continue to be attributed to mobilize resources through replenishment process that are not earmarked, as these are the most useful type of funds to fulfil IFAD's mandate. While it is critical for IFAD to mobilize additional resources, such resources must be provided so that: they finance activities squarely within IFAD's strategic framework; the governing bodies are able to fulfil their supervisory role vis a vis these resources; they are of a minimum quality, i.e. preferably untied and un-earmarked and subject to IFAD's standard administrative arrangements, rather than requiring burdensome special treatment; and, most important of all, they must be truly additional crowding in new resources, and not displacing regular resources. IFAD Management and Member States should explore what flexibility with respect to existing administrative, legal and governance requirements may be necessary and tolerable to secure an appropriate level and type of additional financing.	For IFAD10 unrestricted complementary contributions (UCC) have been agreed in four main areas: mainstreaming nutrition, 4Ps, SSTC and climate change. Focal points for UCC have been nominated. List of countries for UCC has been proposed. Report on supplement funds to the EB timely provided in September 2015. A working group has been formed to propose a revised financing architecture for ASAP to the EMC. A Letter of Intent has been drafted for donors (i.e Germany) who have announced a UCC for climate (as a contribution to a second phase of ASAP) at COP21. In 2015 IFAD's Executive Board approved the Sovereign Borrowing Framework prepared in consultation with the Member States. The framework, established to guide future sovereign borrowing, represents an innovative financial policy tool to meet the increased need for investing in the Fund's agricultural development projects.	O
CLE	13	IFAD	PLCY	STRA		Building on the findings of the IOE evaluation synthesis on MICs, Management should update the MIC policy, including clarifying the resource allocation options to such countries in the future	An Update on IFAD's engagement with MICs was presented to the Executive Board in April 2016. Management will present a single corporate document on MICS, PBAS and fragile situations to the Board in December 2016.	O

Corporate Level Evaluation: Replenishments								
Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme		Recommendation	2016 Follow Up	Status
CLE	14	IFAD	STR	REPL		<p>Continuous engagement may further strengthen the process. Interviews revealed a strong desire not to see the replenishment as ad hoc 3-year events, but more as a continuous engagement, something that would be facilitated by the preparation of the vision. But given the large number of Member States this might also be facilitated by setting criteria for selecting key donors and representatives of key membership groups on which to develop and continuously update engagement profiles. In terms of mobilizing resources, irrespective of global trends, there is no alternative to close engagement with individual donors, as decisions to fund a specific institution does not necessarily reflect any global trend, but is often opportunistic and a reflection of the immediate policy priority of that country. Engagement is particularly important at the time of end-of-year budget period where allocation decisions are made, and IFAD may have the opportunity to pitch its case to good effect. Given the diversity of decision-makers, it would be important that senior level staff maintain a dialogue with key donors across the involved agencies, also in between replenishments, so that IFAD remains on the "radar screen" of donors and is aware of any ad hoc opportunity to mobilize resources, also outside the replenishment negotiation period. This seems particularly important given the reduced number of countries who contributed to IFAD9.</p>	<p>Strategic advocacy with select Member States would be identified during the course of IFAD11. New strategic approaches would be deployed during IFAD11 consultation to engage with Member States. External political communications firm would be hired to gather early evidence and advise on advocacy plans for identified key donors. Country-tailored strategic political outreach, identification and outreach strategies for key decision makers, engagement of advocates/advisory group would be applied to position IFAD as a key partner to deliver on the target country's own development priorities.</p>	O

Country and project evaluations

Zambia - Country Programme Evaluation										
Country	Reg	Eval.	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	F	Recommendation	2016 Follow Up	Status
								Recommendation 1. Improve programme cohesiveness.		
Zambia	ESA	CPE	1	CTRY	STR	COS		Despite the intention to create a synergistic portfolio, especially in the 2011 COSOP, coherence among projects has so far been sub-optimal. To maximize its impact, IFAD should prioritize the development of a cohesive country programme with synergies among its components. Coordination and communications systems must be established at the various stages of the programme cycle – COSOP preparation, project design, start up and implementation. There must also be clarity as to the profiles and objectives of projects and as to the roles and responsibilities of stakeholders to ensure that the programme is concerted.	In response to this recommendation, IFAD and the GRZ fielded a mission (June-July 2015) to define an approach to create a "synergistic programme across the portfolio". To strengthen programme cohesiveness - a portfolio alignment exercise was completed in September 2015 and its implementation has been initiated. The alignment is seeking to address the following: (i) any duplication efforts; (ii) inadequate partnership and communication between projects; and (iii) poor inter-project linkage for synergy and sub-optimal use of resources.	F
								Recommendation 2. Sharpen the focus on poverty and geographic issues.		
Zambia	ESA	CPE	2	CTRY	STR	TGT		The focus on poverty and on geographic issues needs to be refined in the next COSOP to reflect Zambia's middle-income status and to ensure that poor smallholder farmers are included in the economic transition. Targeting should be based on a combination of income criteria and geography. The self-targeting approach needs to be balanced by greater attention to the poverty gap to ensure that extremely poor but capable smallholder farmers are included. And there should be deeper engagement in fewer areas so that impacts are not constrained by spreading IFAD's limited resources too thinly.	During the COSOP extension exercise, consultation on the sharpening of the poverty and geographic focus were carefully considered. It was agreed that the Extended-COSOP will promote the further refinement of the target group and the targeting tools to promote broad-based growth in the agricultural sector to benefit a large number of poor rural households. The targeting criteria have been updated to include income in addition to food and nutrition security to ensure that no one is left behind. However, sharpening the geographic focus will take time because (i) of the alignment process and (ii) each ongoing programme has its own intervention areas. SAPP and E-SAPP are commodity-based and do not spread IFAD limited resources thinly. E-SLIP is confined where ECF and CBPP are inherent, whereas	F

								RUFEP is implemented in areas that have established demands for financial services, with Financial Service Providers already in place or willing to outreach to new rural clients. The Extended-COSOP was approved in January 2016.		
								Recommendation 3. Support the development of Government capacity		
Zambia	ESA	CPE	3	CTRY	STR	TCB		To eliminate the implementation delays caused by limited government capacities, IFAD must factor capacity-building into its intervention processes, and allow for the time required.	Each programme in the current portfolio supports Government's capacity development. SAPP provides capacity building to its Implementing Agencies (from the central to decentralised government authorities). The ICO holds weekly meetings with the Programmes and MAL Procurement & Supply Unit to ascertain progress made in procurement and has helped in the establishment of a procurement tracking system to allow to track progress and identify any bottlenecks. During the design of RUFEP, a year zero was factored in to allow for any implementation start delay. Also, the ICO worked on a seamless transition between SLIP and E-SLIP: it took only three months for E-SLIP to start implementation after its entry into force. The ICO is supporting the GRZ in ensuring that seasoned and experienced project staff are retained to manage new projects. This was the case for RUFEP and E-SLIP. This is greatly contributing to cutting down on delays of implementation.	F
Zambia	ESA	CPE	4	CTRY	STR	DIA		It should also help the Government to establish an enabling policy and an institutional environment for agriculture and rural development: this is as important as increasing investments in the sector.	The ICO has positioned itself as a reliable Cooperating Partner, supporting the GRZ in the development of an enabling environment for policy support and institutional cadre conducive for developing Zambia's agricultural potential and reducing rural poverty. As clearly stated by the CPE, the current portfolio is providing strong policy support and institutional environment in: (i) rural finance (rural finance policy & strategy-mobile banking and agency banking); (ii) establishment of an agribusiness development framework;	F

								(iii) redefining the space for public and private sector in the provision of veterinary services; and (iv) provision of an enabling environment for crop productivity enhancement.		
Zambia	ESA	CPE	5	CTRY	STR	TCB		IFAD may also need to increase capacity development for its own project staff and for other stakeholders to optimize implementation processes and ensure transparency and compliance with government procedures.	Since the reinforcement of the ICO in 2013, with the out-posting of the Country Director, the ICO has been implementing an open-door policy in terms of continuous implementation support to the ongoing programmes and their implementing partners. A net improvement of performance has been noted across the portfolio. SAPP no longer has an APP, S3P is improving its performance, RUFEP and E-SLIP are on implementation target. More support will continue to be provided to the programmes to improve their planning and implementation reporting capacity.	F
								Recommendation 4. Promote private-sector involvement		
Zambia	ESA	CPE	6	CTRY	STR	PRM		To maintain private-sector interest and engage all players in the agricultural sector, IFAD and the Government should use lending and non-lending activities. This will include discussion of the next COSOP, and the roles and responsibilities of the Government and private-sector entities in current operations; it will also involve approaches to eliciting future private-sector support, and consideration of the risks affecting the parties.	Private sector engagement: SAPP has successfully engaged a number of private agribusiness companies involved in producing, processing and marketing livestock, beans and groundnuts. The new Programme E-SAPP will scale up these arrangements by expanding to other value chains and working in direct partnership with the private sector actors within the value chains rather than through contracted service-providers.	F
								Recommendation 5. Ensure sustainability		
Zambia	ESA	CPE	7	CTRY	STR	SUS		A combination of approaches in various areas will be required to ensure sustainability: i) the projects must optimize their mechanisms for sustainability;	All designs are spearheaded by GRZ-appointed Programme Design Groups that ensure ownership throughout implementation when they transform into Technical Advisory Groups. In this way, RUFEP and E-SLIP designs had factored in lessons learned from their predecessors (RFP and SLIP), and consolidated key activities to ensure sustainability. E-SLIP has built in adequate cost recovery strategies.	F

Zambia	ESA	CPE	8	CTRY	STR	DIA	ii) IFAD must engage in policy dialogue, knowledge management and communication to promote visibility and its achievements with a view to obtaining public commitment in terms of financial obligations;	IFAD is engaged in various policy dialogues as reported under S3P, SAPP, RUFEP and E-SLIP. It is promoting South-South Triangulation Cooperation with Malawi and Eritrea. Knowledge management and communication products are regularly being produced. The ICO is constantly considering new partnerships either during designs and/or during implementation. IFAD is recognised as a solid and reliable partner in Zambia.	F
Zambia	ESA	CPE	9	CTRY	STR	PRM	and iii) public-private collaboration should be explored with a view to funding aspects of the programme such as a vaccination drive to eradicate contagious bovine pleuropneumonia.	E-SLIP will be supporting MOFL in the preparation of the policy and strategy for animal health services through public-private collaboration. Provision has also been made for progressive increments in GRZ/beneficiary/private sector contributions to replace IFAD financing as the programme matures.	F
							Recommendation 6. Increase support for value chains and open up to new partners		
Zambia	ESA	CPE	10	CTRY	STR	PRM	IFAD should increase its support for interventions that promote the development of value chains. Three approaches are required – IFAD should: i) allocate substantial resources to attract and educate the rural private sector in value chain development;	Through the Department of Agribusiness and Marketing (ABM) of MOA, SAPP is supporting development of an Agribusiness Model for Zambia that will define the expected functions and roles of stakeholders. Programmes are promoting Private Public Producer Partnerships (PPPPs) through matching grants, and encouraging significant contributions from the private sector. S3P is piloting pluralistic extension services aimed at expanding private sector participation in the provision of extension services. Innovative mechanisms to attract greater private sector involvement with smallholder farmers will be reviewed during implementation.	F
Zambia	ESA	CPE	11	CTRY	STR	PAR	ii) build partnerships with the Government and other development partners to ensure that resources and technologies are available on a scale that would be beyond the scope of a single provider;	All programmes are working with a multitude of partners: GRZ, private sector operators, NGOs, other development partners. SAPP, S3P and RUFEP have matching grant facilities to attract more players willing to link and work with smallholder farmers. This approach is	F

								conducive to diversity of service provision, partnership and to increasing the level of resources destined to support any activity.	
Zambia	ESA	CPE	12	CTRY	STR	RME	and iii) improve its monitoring and evaluation tools to cover the impact of value-chain development on poor smallholder farmers; this would include the establishment of an effective learning tool.	The ICO is working closely with the programmes to support better M&E reporting. The Portfolio Alignment calls for a "Portfolio M&E Unit" to allow consolidation of the portfolio results and better reporting on impact. RUFEP is a programme that will be adopting RCT approach. The portfolio will afford an excellent opportunity for learning.	F
							Recommendation 7. Build farmers' institutional capacity		
Zambia	ESA	CPE	13	CTRY	STR	TCB	The focus on value chain development and private-sector promotion means that IFAD must pay more attention to building farmers' capacities, for example by organizing them into groups and building institutional capacity to enable them to benefit from the development of agri-businesses and to develop commercial and business-management skills. This organization is also essential in view of the high unit costs of reaching smallholder farmers in areas of low population density and the need for them to share the risks and benefits of products and financial consolidation.	As reported under recommendation 4, focus on farmers organisations and building their capacities to be able to fully participate in commodity value chain development is ongoing. S3P is strongly engaged in supporting the strengthening of farmers organisations, and their needs in terms of services required for productivity enhancement. E-SLIP is maintaining its focus on community disease surveillance in monitoring any epidemic outbreak and community drive-livestock stoking and restocking operations. Farmers and their organisations are the central focus of all ongoing programmes.	F
Zambia	ESA	CPE	14	CTRY	STR	PRM	IFAD should improve the flow of information, train staff to evaluate markets, and provide the technology, infrastructure and finance to access the markets.	The proposed recommendation is under implementation. Information exchange is being enhanced through commodity platforms and team- building workshops that bring together all Value chain actors and support services. To date staff officers from the public sector have been trained in value chain approaches and have started engaging with markets. Training has not yet extended to evaluation of markets, but a few officers have been trained in basic market research as part of a broader training in agricultural entrepreneurship training of trainers. Matching grants are being used as sources of finance to support establishment of infrastructure in both	O

									Livestock and crops. The agribusiness activities around the infrastructure are a basis of access to markets through elaborate market linkages between the smallholder farmers and actual and potential buyers.	
									Recommendation 8. Mainstream environmental issues, with particular attention to climate change	
Zambia	ESA	CPE	15	CTRY	STR	NRM		The effects of climate change on the rural smallholder economy, evident in the intensity of recent droughts, must be addressed. An assessment mechanism should be developed to study price and yield risks facing smallholder farmers, and innovations that reduce transaction costs and spread risks – examples are index-based insurance and commodity price hedging – must be adopted more widely. Index-based insurance can cover smallholder farmers against weather-related losses more effectively than the current fiscally burdensome mechanisms for responding to natural disasters. By promoting partnerships with development partners, IFAD could help the Government to design and test mechanisms to deal with the above mentioned risks in rural areas.	S3P is promoting good agricultural practices; RUFEP has a grant window dealing with equity funding and other related innovations enhancing farmers' coping mechanisms against the negative impacts of climate change. In principle, ASAP should be earmarking funding to Zambia from 2016. PARM has included Zambia as a target country eligible for their support as of 2016, while both ECD and PARM will be supporting the portfolio to set climate change coping mechanisms.	F
Bolivia - Country Programme Evaluation										
									Recommendation 1. Adopt a territorial approach	
Bolivia	LAC	CPE	1	CTRY	STR	TGT		The CPE recommends adoption of a territorial approach to adjust interventions to the characteristics and potential of each area or community and thus achieve significant results, for instance in terms of the environment or production.	This recommendation is being applied to ongoing projects and will be also to new proposals to be designed in the next future. For Instance, the Accesos/ASAP Project is already supporting territorial development plans for natural resources management at municipalities and communities levels, while the Plan Vida project is developing coordination mechanisms with various territorial stakeholders (such as private sector municipalities and local governments) in order to ensure the Project's sustainability.	F

									The ProCamelidos Project will generate synergies and strategic alliances with public and private entities that operate in some municipalities in the programme area, thus contributing to harmonization of activities in rural territories.	
Bolivia	LAC	CPE	2	CTRY	STR	PAR		It also recommends building alliances with a range of actors for interventions at various levels – family, community, municipality, group of municipalities or indigenous territory.	IFAD's work in Bolivia is already based on active partnerships with Govt, IFI, UN agencies, NGOs and CSOs. In addition IFAD projects in the country directly work with municipalities and communities, especially with Indigenous People communities.	F
								Recommendation 2. Develop a comprehensive strategy based on product lines and value chains.		
Bolivia	LAC	CPE	3	CTRY	STR	TGT		The Government and IFAD should identify the value chains to be supported based on the potential for product lines in each territory.	The recommendation was applied to the new project designed in 2015 and will be also taken into account for the active portfolio and for new projects. The Pro-Camelidos Project prepared in 2015 focuses on the camelid value chain and includes support to processing marketing as well as access to Financial services The new Project to be design in 2016 will also aim at developing the value chains of products with high nutritional value. The choice of the products will be based on based on production potential, market opportunities, nutritional value, water availability and relevance for IFAD target group.	O
Bolivia	LAC	CPE	4	CTRY	STR	PRM		They should then take into account, in addition to the provision of technical assistance, key aspects such as institutional strengthening of local authorities and organizations for business management, leveraging investments with other initiatives, providing financial services and financial education, and supporting access to value chains and markets.	Same as above.	O
								Recommendation 3. Seek greater alignment and synergies with national, regional and local public programmes		

Bolivia	LAC	CPE	5	CTRY	STR	DIA	It is recommended, in particular, to closely involve in project design those public sectors responsible for their implementation and expand the dialogue between IFAD and the Government to include new interlocutors responsible for other public programmes so as to explore potential partnerships under an inter-sectoral vision – for instance, the Ministry of Productive Development and Plural Economy or the Ministry of Environment and Water.	IFAD is actively consulting with the Government. Both Pro-Camelidos and the new project to be prepared under IFAD 10 will continue to respond to national priorities. IFAD is currently implementing projects with two different ministries: Ministry of Development Planning (Ministerio de Planificación del Desarrollo) for Plan VIDA Project and Ministry of Land and Rural Development (Ministerio de Desarrollo Rural y Tierras) for Accesos Project and the new Project under design will be implemented through the Ministry of Productive Development and Plural Economy (Ministerio de Desarrollo Productivo y Economía Plural).	O
Bolivia	LAC	CPE	6	CTRY	STR	DIA	It is also recommended that opportunities be sought for synergies with the public policy system in general at the territorial level – for instance in health and education.	This will be applied if feasible and taking into account government's capacities for implementation.	O
							Recommendation 4. Define differentiated targeting of beneficiaries and adjust interventions and instruments accordingly		
Bolivia	LAC	CPE	7	CTRY	STR	TGT	The future programme and interventions will need to distinguish between populations that can, with some support, exit poverty within a relatively short time and those who need more sustained assistance. It is recommended that interventions be targeted with priority to people possessing productive potential – possibly including those having already received support under previous interventions.	The new design (to start preparations in Q3 2016) will take into account this recommendation. The target group includes existing farmers 'organizations and communities and micro-enterprises affected by poverty and limited access to assets and services but with potential to develop products with high nutritional value and to supply markets 'demand.	O
Bolivia	LAC	CPE	8	CTRY	STR	TGT	For the most vulnerable populations, it is recommended that consideration be given to instruments that enable greater achievements in food security and poverty reduction, such as nutrition programmes, microcredit or financial education, the latter relating to government direct transfer programmes or migrant remittances.	The new project to be prepared under IFAD10 will specifically aim at developing the value chains of products with high nutritional value.	O

Bolivia	LAC	CPE	9	CTRY	STR	TGT	It is also recommended that women's participation be stepped up in the context of affirmative action, and that specific interventions be targeted to indigenous people, with respect for their culture and identity, and to young people.	The new project to be designed in 2016-2017 will specifically target Women, youth and Indigenous people and contemplates specific activities for those groups. (Details will be defined during Project design)	O
							Recommendation 5. Seek greater geographical concentration for interventions		
Bolivia	LAC	CPE	10	CTRY	STR	TGT	In view of IFAD's limited resources and the need to increase the programme's efficiency and effectiveness for future scaling-up, the evaluation recommends that efforts be concentrated in a few geographical areas, in favour of prolonged interventions, and in regions with the greatest number of poor people, in line with the objective of reducing rural poverty.	The new operation will follow this recommendation. This new project will focus on a limited number of value Chains and the choice of the products will be based on production potential, market opportunities, nutritional value, water availability and relevance for IFAD target group.	O
							Recommendation 6. Define a strategy for policy dialogue based on knowledge acquired and opportunities for scaling up		
Bolivia	LAC	CPE	11	CTRY	STR	DIA	In the context of the Government's new international cooperation policy, the CPE recommends that IFAD and the Government jointly define a strategy for dialogue based on the experience and results of IFAD-supported programme, and on an analysis of the main rural development challenges affecting programme performance. This strategy should clearly define the dialogue's objectives and IFAD's specific contribution, as well as establish continuity throughout M&E systems, knowledge dissemination, opportunities for scaling up project results and innovations, and partnerships with government agencies and other actors.	Useful recommendation, which is already being followed through close contacts with IFAD's focal point, VIPFE, and operationalized through periodic joint portfolio reviews	F
							Recommendation 7. Find systemic solutions to programme implementation delays and inefficiencies		

Bolivia	LAC	CPE	12	CTRY	STR	PMA	The evaluation recommends that the Government and IFAD undertake a joint review of problems encountered in project effectiveness and implementation to seek systemic solutions, possibly looking to other financial institutions for inspiration. The following measures, inter alia, could be considered: submit new operations for Executive Board approval only once rapid Government approval and start-up have been assured; involve ministerial teams in outlining strategies for action during the pre-investment phase of projects; and include elements in design that can guarantee rapid effectiveness.	The preparation of the new operation will offer a unique opportunity to apply this recommendation. Other entry points will be the next portfolio review (planned for June) and the supervision/MTR missions expected for Q3/Q4. Efforts were already made in order to accelerate project's implementation: for Instance the Pro-Camelidos Project was approved in September 2015, signed in December 2015 and entered into force in April 2016, which constitutes a great improvement with respect to previous project in Bolivia.	O
							Recommendation 8. Follow best practices in programme implementation		
Bolivia	LAC	CPE	13	CTRY	OPER	PMA	It is recommended that proven best practices be followed, based in particular on the implementation experience of the PROSAT: (i) provide the national coordination unit with technical, administrative and financial autonomy and locate it outside La Paz, in view of the territorial approach advocated;	This recommendation will be applied for Pro-Camelidos and the new design and, whenever possible, for the ongoing portfolio. For Pro-Camelidos, the Programme implementation Unit will be based in la PAZ but three departmental Units will be located in the project area. For the new design, modalities still have to be defined.	O
Bolivia	LAC	CPE	14	CTRY	OPER	PMA	(ii) ensure that competitive staff recruiting includes an in-depth assessment of specific capacities and competencies, and consider regular external technical support to project teams;	Same as above.	O
Bolivia	LAC	CPE	15	CTRY	OPER	PMA	and (iii) involve the relevant authorities on issues of team remuneration and institutional sustainability of interventions after project completion.	Government and partners are already being consulted on these issues	F
							Recommendation 9. Set up sound monitoring and evaluation systems		
Bolivia	LAC	CPE	16	CTRY	OPER	RME	The evaluation recommends mobilizing funds, as of the design phase, to set up baselines before implementation begins, and subsequently in the relevant project budgets to assess impact.	Recommendation will be applied if budget is made available to country team. Otherwise, during first stage of implementation	O
Bolivia	LAC	CPE	17	CTRY	OPER	RME	It is also recommended that values be assigned to such impact and that verifiable indicators be set in the appraisal documents and measured in project completion reports.	Supervision mission of ongoing projects include M&E specialist and special attention is given to the development of a sound M&E system and the definition of relevant	O

								indicators in new projects.		
Bolivia	LAC	CPE	18	CTRY	OPER	RME		It is also important to include funding in IFAD's grants programme to help measure project impact and benefits using rigorous methods, as well as to strengthen M&E capacity at project and programme levels and coordinate efforts with national systems.	An RCT is planned for the Accesos-Asap Project and baseline has already been carried out.	0
								Recommendation 10. Support IFAD's new country office in Bolivia		
Bolivia	LAC	CPE	19	CTRY	OPER	FLD		The evaluation invites IFAD, both through the Latin America and the Caribbean Division and at the corporate level, to provide the support of senior management staff in the form of regular visits to the country;	ICO La Paz was visited by Regional Economist and Sub-regional Coordinator in 2015 and during 2016 will be closely supported from Rome and Lima	0
Bolivia	LAC	CPE	20	CTRY	OPER	FLD		and to allocate sufficient financial and human resources to the office in La Paz, in particular for: (i) COSOP preparation and management; (ii) portfolio implementation, with a better balance in relation to resources allocated to design; and (iii) support staff.	COSOP was successfully completed. Well-prepared staff is being employed for regular portfolio activities (design, supervision, monitoring, etc.). No increase in regular staff (FTA or similar) due to reduction in IFAD budget	0
China - Country Programme Evaluation										
								Recommendation 1.		
China	APR	CPE	1	CTRY	STR	COS		The CPE recommends that IFAD and the Government of China prepare a new COSOP, building on the findings and recommendation of this evaluation. The new COSOP will provide the basis for renewed partnership and cooperation between IFAD and China, including the six key recommendations outlined below.	China COSOP 2016-2020 is under development. In-country validation workshop is planned for June 2016; presentation to IFAD EB planned for September 2016. China IOE's Country Programme Evaluation findings and recommendations used as background documentation for the preparation of the COSOP.	0
								Recommendation 2. Targeting in a changed rural context		

China	APR	CPE	2	CTRY	STR	TGT	Careful consideration should be given to the selection of provinces, counties and villages for future IFAD-supported programmes. They should be relevant to both IFAD's corporate policy on targeting and government priorities in relation to rural poverty reduction. Particular attention should be devoted to villages with high poverty rates and production potential where young people are willing to engage in farming as a business. The targeting strategy should also include continuing support for integrating ethnic minorities living in remote mountain and forest areas with mainstream markets.	Consistent with IOE's China CPE recommendations on targeting, the targeting strategy of the China COSOP 2016-2020, currently under development, would focus on: (i) the 14 national poverty priority areas; (ii) within the 14 national priority areas, poor villages but with production and market potential (not necessarily in very remote areas); (iii) among the population in the targeted villages, (a) women; (b) rural youth who want to make farming a business, even if they are not below the poverty line; and (c) ethnic minorities, regardless of their poverty status.	O
							Recommendation 3. Strengthen knowledge cooperation		
China	APR	CPE	3	CTRY	STR	KM	The future IFAD-supported country strategy and activities should continue to include knowledge cooperation as a specific objective. To ensure the likelihood of success, IFAD should maintain an adequate lending programme in China to promote learning and knowledge and enable the identification of good practices in promoting poverty reduction in remote rural areas.	Consistent with IOE's China CPE recommendation on Knowledge Cooperation, Knowledge Management (to inform policy and support south-south cooperation) would represent one of the three key strategic elements of the China COSOP 2016-2020, currently under development. IFAD is expected to maintain an adequate lending programme in China for the foreseeable future (pipeline of investments are being developed for the next two PBAS cycles, 2016-2018 and 2019-2012), and the PBAS allocation for the period 2016-2018 is 16% higher than the PBAS allocation for the period 2013-2015.	O
China	APR	CPE	4	CTRY	STR	KM	The human and financial resources to be allocated to knowledge sharing need to be clearly specified, especially with regard to the administrative budget, in order to satisfactorily achieve this key objective.	The China ICO staffing include a national officer with specific responsibility on knowledge management and M&E. Due to budget limitations however, dedicated resources from the administrative budget to support the knowledge cooperation agenda remain limited, thus constraining the potential scope of IFAD involvement/leadership in this area.	O
							Recommendation 4. Sharpen focus on scaling up impact		

China	APR	CPE	5	CTRY	STR	SCA	The scaling up of projects beyond China's individual counties and provinces/regions by others (e.g. national Government, donors and the private sector) should represent a priority for the future. This will require the cooperation of IFAD and the Government of China (at the central and provincial levels) to: (i) dedicate resources to non-lending activities (knowledge management, partnerships and policy dialogue); and (ii) ensure that objectives relating to scaling up are clearly specified in the COSOP and included in project design, and that progress is assessed and reported in all supervision, midterm review and project completion reports.	Consistent with IOE's China CPE recommendation on Scaling-up, scaling-up would represent one of the three key strategic elements of the China COSOP 2016-2020, currently under development. To operationalize the integration of this strategic element into the country program, the adoption of a programmatic approach (vs. a project/area-based development approach) is proposed. A specific pillar on non-lending activities is included in the COSOP 2016-2020. Under this pillar, a small grant (USD300,000) to support Knowledge Management, South-South Cooperation and Policy Dialogue was approved in December 2015; a third party-funded RTA to develop a Provincial rural strategy is currently being discussed, and synergies with ongoing and future regional grants are being pursued. However, dedicated, predictable resources to support the non-lending agenda remain limited compared with the potential for expanding IFAD engagement in this strategic area.	O
							Recommendation 5. Promote South-South and triangular cooperation		
China	APR	CPE	6	CTRY	STR	SOU	IFAD should continue to facilitate South-South and triangular cooperation between China and other Member States.	South-South Cooperation will remain an important mechanism to facilitate knowledge sharing between China and other countries under the COSOP 2016-2020, currently under development. A small grant (USD300,000) to support Knowledge Management, South-South Cooperation and Policy Dialogue was approved in December 2015. It is envisaged that the IFAD Country Office in Beijing could in the future become a Knowledge Hub for rural development and South-South Cooperation. However, limited resources for non-lending activities would limit the capacity to support South-South Cooperation through the country allocation.	O

China	APR	CPE	7	CTRY	STR	SOU	The CPE further recommends that IFAD Management, in consultation with the Government of China, explore opportunities to establish a dedicated facility for south-south and triangular cooperation within IFAD.	In July 2015, China pledged USD 5 million as complementary contribution to support South-South and Triangular Cooperation during IFAD-10. moreover, on 04 June, the IFAD President signed an MoU with the MoF and the MoA of China with the purpose to strengthen cooperation between the MOF, the MOA and IFAD in the area of SSTC, foster innovative cooperation mechanisms, and take joint actions to contribute to global food security, poverty alleviation, and implementation of the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development.	O
							Recommendation 6. Strengthen partnership with the Government of China and other in-country stakeholders		
China	APR	CPE	8	CTRY	STR	PAR	Future country strategy and operations should ensure a strengthened partnership with other relevant government institutions at the national level. Opportunities for greater involvement of the private sector, as well as academic and research institutions, should be proactively explored. The development of partnerships with international organizations – in particular the Asian Development Bank, Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations and World Bank – should be a priority.	Partnership is one of the principles of engagement outlined under the COSOP 2016-2020, currently under development. IFAD has recently enhanced its engagement, collaboration, and partnership with a number of different partners, particularly at national level, including IPRCC, FECC, various universities and research centers, and AsDB and the World Bank. Given the greater focus on supporting market access and value chain development in the new COSOP, involvement of private sector players in the new operations in pipeline is actively sought.	O
							Recommendation 7. Enhance IFAD presence and capacity in country, including out-posting the China country programme manager		
China	APR	CPE	9	CTRY	STR	FLD	The country office's capacity and resources should be strengthened to adequately support project work and non-lending activities, such as knowledge management and policy dialogue, as well as South-South and triangular cooperation.	Country office's (human and financial) resources and capacity have not been so far enhanced vis-à-vis previous resources and capacity. There is however a plan to recruit one Country Program Assistant (CPA) in the future to support on administrative matters. The future (planned) outposting of the CPM would possibly enhance the capacity of the	O

								country office to better engage in policy dialogue and facilitate partnership building.	
China	APR	CPE	10	CTRY	OPER	FLD	The CPE recommends that the China country programme manager be outposted from Rome to Beijing by the end of 2015.	Outposting of the CPM is tentatively planned for 2017, as soon as the Host Country Agreement (HCA) - currently under negotiation - between IFAD and the Government of China is signed.	O
Tanzania - Country Programme Evaluation									
							Recommendation 1.		
Tanzania	ESA	CPE	1	CTRY	OPER	COS	Prepare a new COSOP, in collaboration with the Government and key national and international partners, to define a new strategy of intervention and investment priorities in the country. The new COSOP should reflect the main findings and recommendations of this CPE and select priorities taking into account the estimated resources available for lending.	New COSOP has been prepared in line with recommendation of CPE with in country consultation. It has been endorsed by IFAD Board in April 2016, which noted that it is sound and responsive to the CPE recommendations. The 4 Strategic Objectives of the new COSOP reflects all CPE recommendations.	F
Tanzania	ESA	CPE	2	CTRY	OPER	COS	In particular, the COSOP needs to link IFAD's support to basket funding, within the ASDP, with its support to other initiatives such as agricultural value chain development; explore opportunities for coordination with other donors; and avoid geographic and subsectoral dispersion.	Results management framework of the new RB COSOP is aligned with the ASDPII objectives. ICO was actively engaged with Government in the development of ASDPII.	F
Tanzania	ESA	CPE	3	CTRY	STR	COS	It should also establish clear linkages between non-lending activities, grants and the lending programme and devote greater attention to COSOP reviews, so that adjustments can be made to respond to the evolving context.	The new RB COSOP has identified three non-lending facilities. (i) Farmer empowerment strategy and operational plan (ii) Value chain development strategy and operational plan (iii) Strategy for Zanzibar Agricultural Sector Development Programme. Linkages have been identified with proposed lending investments. A concept note has been prepared for each non-lending facility. A COSOP completion review will be carried out at mid-term.	F
							Recommendation 2.		

Tanzania	ESA	CPE	4	CTRY	STR	COS	The first programmatic priority should be to support the preparation and implementation of the next phase of ASDS/ASDP both on the mainland and in Zanzibar. Within ASDS and ASDP, the livestock subsector, together with rangeland management and the dairy value chain, deserve specific focus. The United Republic of Tanzania has great livestock potential but to date this has received limited attention and investment. In addition to opportunities there are also risks, notably those related to conflicts between pastoralists and farmers, as well as national policy issues. Country grants could be used for diagnostic and piloting initiatives.	The first programmatic lending priority of the new COSOP is to support completion of ASDP II preparation. Target approval for this support is in 2017. The new COSOP has also earmarked support to two new projects (i)Highlands milkshed development project (HMDP) (ii) Dryland development project all with direct focus on livestock development.	0
							Recommendation 3.		
Tanzania	ESA	CPE	5	CTRY	STR	COS	Subject to the availability of resources, in addition to supporting ASDS/ASDP, IFAD could consider funding traditional projects, within certain priorities and conditions. Traditional projects may be needed to focus on targeting specific socio-economic groups, addressing problems relating to specific geographic or resource contexts, as well as to test/develop innovations before they can be scaled up through the ASDP-supported extension system. For these types of projects, IFAD should insist on geographical areas or commodities that are likely to have significant welfare benefits for a high number of poor households, while controlling project management costs.	The new RB COSOP has identified traditional stand-alone projects with a geographical focus and opportunity for scaling up within the framework of ASDP II. These are dry-land development project for marginal areas of central Tanzania and the southern highland milk shade development project with focus on southern highlands. The latter project is scheduled for submission to IFAD Board in December 2016. The dry-land development project will be formulated during 2017.	0
Tanzania	ESA	CPE	5	CTRY	STR	DES	In addition, there needs to be far more focus on implementation readiness at the project design stage, with the Government playing a more active role in the design.	An implementation readiness grant for BASIC was approved by IFAD.	0
							Recommendation 4.		

Tanzania	ESA	CPE	6	CTRY	STR	PRM	Value chain development requires more ex ante consultation with private-sector actors and better coordination between donors to create a better enabling environment for policy formulation, enhance consistency of interventions and reduce transaction costs for the Government. This could be done either within the ASDP II framework (if found suitable) or through other emerging multi-donor initiatives. Private-sector entrepreneurs and other relevant partners (e.g. the cooperative apex organizations) could be more actively involved in regular COSOP review meetings as well as through country grant-funded initiatives.	The in-country CPMT team and DPs-Agriculture working group which IFAD currently chairs provide a platform for consultation; additionally consultations with civil society organizations are conducted on a regular basis (e.g. SAGCOT and ANSAF)	F
							Recommendation 5.		
Tanzania	ESA	CPE	7	CTRY	STR	KM	Support knowledge management, partnership development and policy dialogue activities that are closely connected to IFAD-funded operations. To be realistic, objectives for non-lending activities should be better focused and linked to resources. Options include: (i) embedding knowledge management and policy dialogue components in future financed operations and supporting M&E capacity of national agencies through grant instruments; (ii) using the annual COSOP review workshops more strategically to engage key partners (e.g. non-governmental and private-sector organizations); (iii) mobilizing country grant financing both from its regular resources and from external donors; and (iv) learning from practices adopted in other IFAD-supported programmes, for example in Madagascar.	The new RB-COSOP interconnected SOs, to which all IFAD activities will contribute, are underpinned by a sound results chain; they promote complementarity between lending and non-lending assistance and are supported by catalytic knowledge management. They are focused squarely on IFAD's key target groups, and they reflect and build on IFAD's comparative advantage in Tanzania. They offer expanded support to agricultural and associated priority non-farm rural enterprises and value chains, and they mainstream and enhance governance and farmer empowerment and gender equality at various levels. Finally, they provide a vehicle for scaling up promising innovations, and for strengthening linkages to other partners and initiatives for which IFAD has already built strong constituencies through the country programme.	F

Morocco: Rural Development Project in the Mountain Zones of Al-Haouz Province – Project Performance Assessment

Morocco	NEN	PPA	1	CTRY	STR	DEC	<p>Commune planning. To ensure the sustainability of the future participatory process, it seems logical that it be included in the commune plans already in place. Since the enactment of Law No. 17-08 in 2009 amending and supplementing Law No. 78-00 on Commune Charters, communes are required to prepare economic and social development plans. Under this new law, "with a view to sustainable development and based on a participatory approach that includes special consideration of the gender approach, the six-year commune development plan describes the development activities to be undertaken in commune territory." The adoption of this new local planning instrument, the commune development plan is a major step toward decentralization, which rural development operations, including IFAD projects, must take into account. In fact, the systematic inclusion of these operations in commune development plans is a supplementary gauge of ownership and the sustainability of development activities.</p>	<p>Given the characteristics of the mountain zones, the approach taken for their development is to focus on integrated community development involving all components intended to improve living standards and conditions for the populations concerned. As such, the "Plan de Développement Communautaire" is based on "Plan de Développement des Filières" and "Plan de Développement des Douars (small villages)". This has been adopted as the main participatory approach by the last three on-going projects: Value Chain Development Project in the Province of Taza and Value Chain Development Project in the Province of Alhaouz and the most recent Programme of Rural Development in Mountain Zones covering Sefrou and Azilal provinces. The PDRZM-II currently being designed is foreseen to be an integrated rural development project using the same communal participatory approach as a key planning instrument at the local levels.</p>	F
Morocco	NEN	PPA	2	CTRY	STR	STRA	<p>Sustainable development strategy in mountain zones. Mountain zones will soon be the focus of a sustainable development strategy that could build on IFAD's long record of accomplishment in Morocco's mountain zones. Indeed, the achievements of IFAD projects in this domain are numerous and largely involve specific approaches to project design and intervention modalities in mountain zones. Capitalizing on the achievements of IFAD and other agencies operating in these areas would be very useful, especially for the new Directorate of Rural Areas and Mountain Zones, and could directly support the development of the strategy and other policies.</p>	<p>Indeed, this has been done. IFAD and GOM agreed to focus IFAD assistance in the next 15 years exclusively on the mountain zones through design and implementation of the multi-tranche PDRZM. The design of the PDRZM-I is built on lessons learned from PRDMO, PDRME, PDFAPT, PDFAPH. One of the main activities financed by a IFAD grant is institutional support to operationalize the Mountain Zones Development Strategy. In the development of this latter strategy, the GOM has incorporated the lessons from all IFAD-supported projects in the mountain zones.</p>	F

Morocco	NEN	PPA	3	CTRY	STR	PAR	Partnerships for project implementation. Potential partnerships among the institutional stakeholders involved in project implementation should be carefully explored and fostered from the outset in the project design stage to keep potential problems to a minimum. Proper planning of methodological, administrative and financial aspects will prevent delays in the implementation of agreements, and consequently, activities.	After careful assessments, the partnerships have been enlarged to include the National Agricultural Research Institute (INRA) for applied research, National Office for Agricultural Advisory Assistance (ONCA) for extension, SFDA (Society for financing small farmers) for rural finance and many private sector entities (contractual farming for agro-processing). The design of PDRZM-I identified these partners and established arrangements to conclude these partnerships during the first year in order to avoid delays. The same is foreseen during the design and implementation of the PDRZM-II.	F
Morocco	NEN	PPA	4	CTRY	STR	TCB	Agricultural extension. For sustainable diversification and intensification of cultivation systems, farmers should receive long-term support and guidance to acquire sound technical skills. Research centres should likewise provide scientific and technical support to improve technical know-how for mountain zones. Particular attention should therefore be paid to the agricultural extension component of projects operating in areas where traditional agricultural practices are the norm.	The classical approach adopted by the structures of extension for the dissemination of new technologies was until recently top-down. The newly approved PDRZM-I adopted an alternative learning approach, by implementing field farmer schools. It is a participatory way of transferring technology to producers, but also of building local capacity in decision making regarding the integrated management of their fields in the agro-ecological and socio-economic conditions. In addition, specialized teams have been formed from within the villages. Furthermore, the projects receive support from the National Office for Agricultural Advisory Assistance (ONCA) that was created in 2012.	F
Sudan: Gash Sustainable Livelihood Regeneration Project - Project Performance Assessment									
Only recommendations specifically addressed to IFAD have been listed below. Recommendations 2 (role of public institutions in the scheme O&M), 4 (distinct governmental unit to support WUAs), 5 (development of a Gash river management plan) and 6 (irrigation profitability and efficiency) have not been considered because addressed to the Government of The Sudan.									

Sudan	NEN	PPA	1	CTRY	STR	DIA	<p>IFAD could consider engaging in discussion with the Government to address key outstanding issues threatening the sustainability of the Gash Irrigation Scheme. IFAD decided not to continue supporting the Gash scheme; however, as a partner that provided substantial financing under GSLRP and as a major partner in the agricultural sector, IFAD is well-placed to work with the Government to tackle these issues. These include: (i) clarification on the institutional arrangements concerning O&M of the Gash Irrigation Scheme, including the GAS status; (ii) putting in place measures to strengthen institutional arrangements and capacity of both GAS and WUAs; and (iii) critical reflection on how best to bring the land tenancy reform in the Gash Irrigation Scheme to a conclusion, based on an comprehensive assessment of the interests of all concerned stakeholders, together with consultations with key influential stakeholders to obtain their endorsement.</p>	<p>Given the specificity of the political and tribal considerations in the GASH area, coupled with post conflict fragility, IFAD has decided to engage in a dialogue on these aspects of institutional strengthening and sustainability in connection with the follow-up investment. See also next point.</p>	0
Sudan	NEN	PPA	3	CTRY	STR	NRM	<p>To ensure the development of WUAs that are managed in a transparent and accountable manner, it is recommended that further medium-term investment be made under a follow-on project to strengthen their capacities to undertake O&M activities in an effective and efficient manner.</p>	<p>Through GSRLP, IFAD has supported preparatory study for a follow up project. The study was used by the Eastern Development Fund to solicit funding from the IsDB for an investment in the Gash scheme. IsDB is providing in excess of USD 50 million to support two spate irrigation schemes in eastern Sudan (including Gash). The Government of Sudan reports that the investments are expected to commence in 2017. Eastern Development Fund is active and supports development efforts in Eastern Sudan, however local political considerations and competing demands have delayed the start-up of the follow up project in the Gash.</p>	0

India: Livelihoods Improvement Project in the Himalayas - Project Performance Assessment

India	APR	PPA	1	CTRY	STR	TGT	Inclusive targeting. Ensure the targeting strategy and approach specifically target the poor so that they have access to and benefit from project investments. As noted in the conclusion, IFAD's key target group (the rural poor) did not benefit as intended in Uttarakhand, while Meghalaya was more successful. However, as there is a move to more inclusive projects (i.e. they will include those above the poverty line) it is even more essential that a strategy outlining how the rural poor will access and benefit from project activities is well articulated. The strategy should also ensure that gender equality measures are spelled out. It is possible that the Social, Environmental, and Climate Assessment Procedures required as of 2015 will also address this issue.	This recommendation has been followed in new projects. For example, in a follow-up project in Uttarakhand (called the Integrated Livelihood Support Project) approved by IFAD in 2011, and to ensure that the poorest are not excluded from the project activities, the project is setting up Vulnerable Producer Groups (VPGs) comprising the poorest populations. Members of the VPGs are given additional support by the project. The project has a strong gender strategy and is ensuring that under component 1 almost 90% of participants are women. Another recent example - the Odisha Particularly Vulnerable Tribal Groups Empowerment and Livelihood Project (OPELIP), approved by the Board in April 2015, was exclusively targeted to the most vulnerable portion of the tribal population of the State of Odisha.	F
India	APR	PPA	2	CTRY	OPER	PAR	Synergy and partnerships. Design must ensure that the mandated body be assigned the appropriate roles and responsibilities during implementation. This means that the government is best suited to delivering on public goods, the private sector should be involved especially when accessing value chains, and that relevant ministries at state and national levels are involved and informed through the country programme management team and particularly at wrap-up meetings for supervision missions.	This recommendation is adhered to across the portfolio. Public sector investments are being provided through Government bodies. Social mobilization activities are being undertaken by specialized non-governmental organizations. Private sector agencies are increasingly becoming involved in the commercialization and marketing of agricultural production. Government has a role to play to broker the partnerships between the producers and the private sector with assistance from qualified non-government organizations and technical partners. At the state level, programme management is embedded in Government agencies. Senior bureaucrats in the state (usually the Chief Secretary) chair all key wrap up meetings.	F

India	APR	PPA	3	CTRY	STR	DIA	<p>Policy issues. To ensure project delivery and long-term sustainability both at design and during implementation, IFAD has a responsibility to support the government and stakeholders to address policy issues. In this project the key policy issues relate to: reduction in staff turnover in order to speed up implementation in the field; unsustainable practices that impact negatively on forests; land rights for access to community lands; the depletion of water sources in mountain areas; and a disaster risk reduction strategy for fragile areas like the Himalayas.</p>	<p>All new projects approved in India provide vehicles to pursue a policy agenda in partnership with the Government. Some examples are provided below. Under the Livelihoods and Access to Markets Project (LAMP), IFAD is assisting the government in testing proof-of- concept for Enterprise Facilitation Centres. The project is also testing Integrated Village Co-operative Societies as an alternative institutional model for access to rural finance. Policy issues being pursued under the Integrated Livelihood Support Project (ILSP) include promotion of high nutritive value inputs such as millets and pulses into the Government's flagship Nutrition programme -the Integrated Child Development Services (ICDS). Federations of SHGs have been preparing and supplying Take Home Rations (THR) for the ICDS. Both the projects are also enabling the respective state governments to enhance their knowledge management services and MIS, especially with regards to traditional knowledge and crops.</p>	F
Pakistan: Azad Jammu and Kashmir Community Development Programme - Project Performance Assessment									
Only recommendations specifically addressed to IFAD have been listed below. Recommendation 1 (Institutionalize participatory approach for local development planning in AJK) has not been considered because addressed to the Government of Azad Jammu and Kashmir									

Pakistan	APR	PPA	1	CTRY	STR	STRA	Address institutional-building issues for AJKRSP. It is recommended that AJKRSP focus on a number of key issues: (i) develop a new medium-term strategic plan for guiding its directions and operations; (ii) based on the strategic plan, realign its staffing and field presence with realistic budget projections; and (iii) re-establish linkages with other rural support programmes and their network to access knowledge, skills and platforms for exchanging experiences.	The recommendation has been implemented. A number of actions have been taken to support institutional development of AJKRSP. The AJKRSP has been restructured to enhance institutional sustainability. An official notification (by the Office of the President of AJK) was issued on the workings and the role of AJKRSP as lead community mobilisation agency for participatory development activities. A coordination mechanism for participatory planning and implementation has been put in place. A Community Development Section in the Planning and Development Department has been established and capitalized with funds to enable continuation of the Programme activities.	F
Pakistan	APR	PPA	2	CTRY	STR	RFI	Clarify the nature of matching funds and possible future direction for microfinance. Based on consultations between the Government of AJK and AJKRSP, a final decision needs to be made about the nature of matching funds (i.e. grant or loan) that have been disbursed and this needs to be communicated to COs.	There has been no decision yet on the status of matching funds as grants or loans to communities. The Government of AJK has transferred the responsibility of micro finance operations to AJKRSP.	O

Pakistan	APR	PPA	3	CTRY	STR	PMA		<p>Improve stability in programme management in future projects. For future IFAD-financed projects, there should be a joint strategy to increase the chances of assigning and retaining competent staff for programme management, carefully reflected upon by IFAD, the Government of Pakistan and provincial governments that are designated as lead implementing agencies.</p>	<p>Such a joint strategy is not formally in place. However, IFAD has been pursuing with the provincial governments the creation of a section in the Planning and Development Departments for provision of project management support. Currently, most of the staff of PMUs belong to provincial/state administrative services and/or line departments services. Since there is no separate project management staff in the current civil services system, project staff are assigned back to their respective departments after closure of projects. In view of the highly decentralised governance structure, employees of provincial government cannot be transferred and assigned to other provinces. Nonetheless, staff working in projects add to the project management capacities of government and such staff are given preference in future projects.</p>	O	
Pakistan	APR	PPA	4	CTRY	STR	RME		<p>Support the development of systems to better measure the results and impact of IFAD support. As a general point, IFAD should pay greater attention and provide support at all stages in this area – including proposing a solid basis for monitoring and evaluation in project design reports, providing support to project management in the preparation of terms of reference for relevant consulting services (e.g. baseline survey, monitoring and evaluation system development, impact surveys), selecting consultants, and reviewing and advising on proposed methodologies and draft reports.</p>	<p>Provisions are made in project designs for M&E systems to measure results at output, outcome and impact levels. Indicators are included in logical frameworks which are used as management tools during implementation. The M&E systems are guided by IFAD's Results and Impact Management System (RIMS). M&E plans are formulated at the start of programme implementation. These provide the basis for annual M&E plans and activities. Learning and knowledge management are included as key activities in all projects. Implementation support is provided by the ICO and by consultants with specialist M&E skills.</p>	F	
<p>Rwanda: Support Project to the Strategic Plan for the Transformation Agriculture - Project Performance Assessment</p>											
<p>Only recommendations specifically addressed to IFAD have been listed below. The first part of Recommendation 1 (Sustainability) has not been considered because addressed to the Government of Rwanda.</p>											

Rwanda	ESA	PPA	1	CTRY	STR	SUS		Sustainability. Another aspect related to sustainability is the capacity to continue the delivery of services such as the ones provided by the resource person and village contact person. One option may be to consider the adoption of a fee-for-service approach in this context.	The provision of services is progressively being reinforced through farmers' cooperatives. Service providers recruited by the projects have supported cooperatives to develop their own structures able to provide some services based on established fees. Trained farmers have been equipped to allow them providing basic services The activity is continuous. In addition, lead farmers were trained through the "farmer to farmer extension model" in order to improve agricultural practices.	F
Rwanda	ESA	PPA	2	CTRY	STR	TGT		Targeting. PASPTA has reached the rural target population, including vulnerable groups (women, youth and child-headed households). As already noted, these groups still face specific challenges and should receive greater support for skills development (e.g. technology transfers, business skills) – for example by facilitating access to high-level training opportunities (e.g. establishment of national scholarship programme for secondary and tertiary education). Youth training centres could also offer new opportunities to youth to become technical specialists.	Extensive focus is being put on technology transfer and business skills through ongoing projects and those under design. The Climate Resilient Post-harvest and Agribusiness Support Project (PASP) supports its beneficiaries including youth and women to improve their business skills (Business coaching programme, business plan formulation ,etc.)and bring innovative post-harvest technologies to add value t agricultural produce. To that effect, specialized service providers and TA have been recruited. Even though scholarships are no longer provided since PAPSTA's closure (the project funded 50 scholarships in India and Netherlands), the youth who graduated from that programme are currently employed by MINAGRI and other agriculture development institutions. However, the Ministry (MINAGRI) continued the provision of specialized scholarships in agriculture through other programmes funded by other DPs. For example many young people are currently following specialized trainings in Israel .	F

Rwanda	ESA	PPA	3	CTRY	STR	PAR	Partnership with the Government. Government structures and performance are conducive to piloting new financing partnerships with donors. In this context IFAD could undertake different actions such as the production of a single five-year-period design document and the adoption of a programmatic financing approach.	Within the COSOP context, IFAD will continue its partnership with line ministries positioning itself as a key partner in rural development. The programmatic financing approach has been discussed many times with the GoR and IFAD is open to this option. Within the context of ongoing discussions, IFAD and GoR are seeking opportunities. To date, the Ministry of Agriculture and Animal Resources still prefers the project approach as it allows to achieve quick results.	O
Rwanda	ESA	PPA	4	CTRY	STR	PRM	As far as the involvement of the private sector is concerned, it would be useful for the Government to develop a set of "principles of engagement" between the parties (Government, private sector entity and the target group). In this respect, IFAD could act as broker, ensuring equitable risk mechanisms, capacity-building and technology transfer.	IFAD will continue supporting equitable business partnerships between private enterprises and small-scale producers, in line with the successful experiences in the tea and coffee sectors. A number of tea producers' cooperatives supported under PRICE are acquiring equity stakes in their respective tea processing companies, thus participating in the management of these factories and increasing their incomes through dividend earnings. This is a very important innovation that started with PDCRE and is set to be scaled up under PRICE and PASP. The RDDP under design will also promote the 4 Ps.	F

Rwanda	ESA	PPA	5	CTRY	STR	COS	<p>Financing Mechanisms. Rwanda provides a unique opportunity to pilot a new mechanism for financing – programmatic financing – which would also provide increased efficiencies and effectiveness for both the Government and IFAD over a country strategic opportunities programme (COSOP) period (approximately five years). The PPA proposes to pilot a "programmatic financing" approach. Such an approach would provide flexibility to respond to unforeseen emergencies, allow for follow-up support to critical target groups (women and child-headed households) and in the long run reduce costs associated with design. This proposal would require having an "in-depth" COSOP along the lines of a single five-year-period design document and thus identifying clearly differentiated target groups, thematic focuses, geographical priorities, etc., in priority order – for which full criteria would need to be developed and agreed. Through the process a full list of key criteria for other countries to engage with IFAD on this basis could also be further developed following an assessment of the pilot.</p>	<p>IFAD will deepen its long-term commitment with public institutions such as Banque Rwandaise de Développement (BRD), BDF, NAEB, RAB, RCA and the National Cooperatives Confederation of Rwanda. IFAD and GoR have been discussing the use of a programmatic approach. Based on World Bank experience (satisfactory and moderate in some cases) through the Programme for Results Approach (P4R) programme, the Ministry of Agriculture and Animal Resources is still exploring better ways for involving IFAD in a similar approach. The P4R has been facing long administrative procedures between the Ministry of Finance and MINAGRI, thus delaying implementation of activities. MINAGRI is clear about their preference: project approach as the P4R is not yet providing the expected results.</p>	O
--------	-----	-----	---	------	-----	-----	--	--	---

Rwanda	ESA	PPA	6	CTRY	STR	NRM	<p>Scaling up. Scaling up requires thorough preparation which would include environmental and social impact assessment studies to ensure long-term environmental and social impacts using appropriate mitigation strategies for interventions. Such measures could include leaving some marshland areas uncultivated and ensuring ecological corridors between such remaining wetlands for the migration of plant and animal species and the preservation of biodiversity. The introduction of environmentally friendly cooking and heating devices – for example improved stoves (or biogas digesters) – should be a standard feature of any agriculture package to save more than 30 per cent of firewood and trees. Moreover, such a measure can promote local employment and business opportunities, especially for the young people.</p>	<p>As per the COSOP, IFAD will concentrate its cooperation with the Government on core areas with good prospects for scaling up. IFAD has put a great emphasis on natural resources management including the use of renewable energies. To date, IFAD portfolio promoted the flexi-biogas, thus reducing the use of firewood by rural households. In addition, collaboration with the Rwanda National Resources Management Authority through MOUs contributed to implement mitigation strategies related to environmental protection in projects' intervention areas. In addition, the National Biogas Programme has adopted the flexi-biogas system based on the experience of KWAMP which piloted the model in Rwanda. Local companies have been trained on the installation and maintenance of flexi-biogas.</p>	F
--------	-----	-----	---	------	-----	-----	---	---	---

Rwanda	ESA	PPA	7	CTRY	STR	PAR,	<p>Partnerships. The partnership between Government, World Food Programme and IFAD has resulted in significant achievements. Where appropriate such a partnership should be actively sought for better outcomes and sustainability. For example, the trilateral partnership IFAD, WFP and the Government demonstrated to be an excellent means to achieve the PSTA III objective of scaling up watershed management and soil conservation measures (WFP covered the costs of earth works, while the Fund accompanied technical, institutional and capacity-building support) and importantly provided an income for the poor. It is noted that this approach did not work in KWAMP.</p> <p>Financing/Partnership agreements need to be strengthened so as not to have a negative impact should the partner not deliver on their promised commitments.</p>	<p>IFAD will remain an active member of the ASWG and the Agriculture SWAp Group. Engaging with the World Bank, European Union and other development partners with larger complementary financial, technical and advisory services that will enable IFAD leverage its more limited resources to reach the desired scale of intervention. IFAD established partnership with Heifer International in livestock development. IFAD mobilized USD 4 million as co-financing of the RDDP under design. UNIDO also expressed its interest to be involved in the project through the development of dairy technologies. Their co-financing will be confirmed later.</p>	0
Albania - Programme for Sustainable Development in Rural Mountain Areas									
<p>Only recommendations specifically addressed to IFAD have been listed below. Recommendation 1 (role of communes in local development) and 3 (establishment of effective national institutions in charge of mountain area programmes) have not been considered because addressed to the Government of Albania. All recommendations of the PPA Albania currently not applicable since the Government of Albania did not confirm its interest to borrow from IFAD.</p>									

Albania	NEN	PPA	1	CTRY	STR	TGT	<p>Recommendation 2. The market orientation, value chain analyses and funding to address critical constraints for producers and SMEs are other approaches which should be scaled up in a simplified form, as there are further potential benefits for the mountain areas population. This, however, requires a differentiated approach in terms of targeting for gender equality and funding according to the poverty level of the direct beneficiaries, as the poorer population would require grants with minimal contribution requirements, whereas better-off beneficiaries could assume loans. Implementation of such a differentiated approach needs to be carefully considered based on experiences elsewhere, as this is not straightforward. Also, this approach should be developed in the context of EU accession preparation, as relevant instruments might become available.</p>	<p>Since Albania did not confirm its interest to borrow from IFAD under the current lending cycle (2016-2018), the findings of the PPA are not immediately applicable in Albania, also because the last ongoing project in Albania just reached completion. However, the recommendation to explore more differentiated approaches towards pro-poor targeting and women empowerment was taken up as part of an on-going Lessons Learning process initiated by the NEN Division, and will be applied to the extent possible when designing in similar profile countries, particularly the first IFAD loan for Montenegro (new member since 2015).</p>	NA
Albania	NEN	PPA	2	CTRY	STR	TGT	<p>Recommendation 4. Targeting poor areas is required but not sufficient to reach poor households. IFAD should make a strong effort to first understand the characteristics of the poor people and be clear from the start about how they can and will benefit from a project being designed. If poor people are to benefit only indirectly, then their proportion among the beneficiaries should be specified in the President's Report and progress in reaching them should be closely monitored and targeting should be adjusted if needed.</p>	<p>Design teams are strongly encouraged to have a 'Profile of the Poor' established during the project design phase, in order to inform the targeting approach selected and help design interventions and selection procedures. Scenarios in which the rural poor are to benefit only indirectly will be mentioned in the President's Report and detailed monitoring arrangements will be ensured in such cases. Response to Recommendation 2 above also refers.</p>	NA

Albania	NEN	PPA	3	CTRY	STR	GDR		Recommendation 5. Economic empowerment of women at the level of farm enterprises and SMEs should be pursued vigorously. Efforts to increase women's capacity and build their levels of institutional representation and overall inclusion in terms of decision-making and governance are likely to steadily lead to changes in gender relations in the rural mountainous areas.	Response to Recommendation 2 above also refers, i.e. preparation/establishment of a profile of the cultural, historic, social, legal or administrative obstacles to women empowerment during design. Based on such findings, relevant criteria should be developed for inclusion and application in project implementation to ensure women empowerment activities are appropriately designed and implemented. Establishing appropriate indicators and an adequate monitoring system will further strengthen women empowerment activities in IFAD projects.	NA
Albania	NEN	PPA	4	IFAD	OPER	RME		Recommendation 6. IFAD should make M&E a condition for loan effectiveness, which is also a conclusion that NEN has reached in its 2014 portfolio review. This implies building capacity and setting a baseline – with and without intervention – from the very start, in year zero.	PMD is continuously making efforts to strengthen M&E capacity at government levels and this includes provision to establish the baseline during design or project start-up/year one; supporting capacity building during project start-up in order to strengthen project planning for results, which includes the setting up of results monitoring and evaluation systems. PMD and SKD have joined efforts in this regard, in order to include strengthening projects' abilities to assess and evaluate impact from project results achieved. Given the scarcity of resources, however, borrowers often need project funds to execute such plans, and therefore establishing this as a condition for disbursement may not be conducive to the desired outcome.	NAG
Albania	NEN	PPA	5	CTRY	OPER	RME		It is also necessary for the implementers to report to the Steering Committee every six months on progress and outcome indicators, with follow-up decisions from the Committee, documented in the local language and in English, and effectively carry out a midterm review.	Management agrees with the principle of this recommendation, as one the way to enhance the monitoring role of the Steering Committee is to regularly provided it with output and outcome data. However, for the reasons explained above , the recommendation is not applicable.	NA

Turkey: Sivas-Erzincan Development Project - Project Performance Assessment

Turkey	NEN	PPA	1	CTRY	STR	SCA	<p>Fine tuning the SEDP model. In replicating the SEDP model, M&E must be given priority along with adequate knowledge management, including the transfer of high-level technical expertise in several technical and 'soft skill' areas including, but not limited to, targeting, gender and community development. An ambitious project design requires support staff in the field to properly guide villagers in activities that are mainly new to them, and to provide training and coaching to local trainers, as well as trainers of trainers.</p>	<p>It has been widely accepted that appropriate M&E systems are needed for collecting, analysing and documenting project results and achievements and hence, all recently approved projects include funds for M&E capacity building. As such the set-up for Central PMU and Provincial PMUs of the most recent GTWDP includes M&E specialists to be recruited at early stages of implementation, either as staff or as service-providers. The same GTWDP Project includes in its design the funding of training to build effective learning and adaptation processes into the project M&E system and project management cycle. This will contribute to establishing a rigorous M&E system, and provide for effective learning and support knowledge management. The approach of continuous performance enhancement driven by tailored capacity building will also be adopted for the pipeline UPRDP. Furthermore, the Ministry of Agriculture has in place a robust, computerized system, "TARBIL", for tracking the government's agricultural support programme in terms of the physical inputs, beneficiaries, production, etc. Data is entered into the system at provincial levels and forms the backbone of the MFAL's general monitoring system. Thanks to exchanges between TARBIL and projects M&E system, the capacity of MFAL to monitor and report on outcomes and impacts will be strengthened while also providing a viable platform to monitor other projects. This would also be an indicator for the success of the IFAD Knowledge Management platform approach.</p>	F
--------	-----	-----	---	------	-----	-----	---	--	---

Turkey	NEN	PPA	2	CTRY	STR	DES	<p>Build on existing structures vs. parallel ones. Future design of projects based on the SEDP model should place major emphasis on existing markets and market players, ensuring direct collaboration with such players rather than building up parallel structures that are difficult to manage and maintain after project closure. The role of information technology in measuring, monitoring and aggregating data and contributing to better market functioning should be emphasized in the future.</p>	<p>Through investment, knowledge management and policy dialogue, the recently designed and approved GTWDP promotes access of small producers to markets in partnership with private actors within the existing VCs. In particular, the GTWDP addresses the reluctance of private entrepreneurs to invest in agro processing, cold storage and handling facilities in rural areas by encouraging them through access to finance to enter into producers public private partnerships (PPPP) along strategically identified supply chains. The same approach is planned to be applied by the pipeline Uplands Rural Development Programme; the design of that programme would ensure upfront capacity building and training at the producers' levels to reinforce upland beneficiaries' integration into larger markets. To facilitate these partnerships, the programme would finance marketing consultancies for service providers to mentor and assist these upland smallholders and their organizations, such as producers associations and water users associations. The government's recently completed 'state of the art' MIS TARBI will be tapped into for agricultural data to establish the baseline, as well as a source for regular monitoring of progress. The MFAL would further ensure that the project M&E system is designed to also capture and manage data on private sector actors upstream in the VC, as well as the PPPP that would be formed.</p>	F
--------	-----	-----	---	------	-----	-----	--	---	---

Turkey	NEN	PPA	3	CTRY	STR	PRM	<p>Potential of value chain approach. The piloted value chain approach has the potential to contribute usefully to the future investment portfolio of IFAD in Turkey. It is recommended to retain and further strengthen this theme with particular focus on (i) the inclusiveness of project-supported value chains; and (ii) careful determination of the selection of the type of value chains and modes of support (production-related or financial).</p>	<p>The most recently approved project (GTWDP) in Turkey has fully adopted a value chain approach. In full collaboration with and participation of the beneficiaries, individually or through their associations, Strategic Investment Plans (SIPs) will be prepared for each VCs. SIPs will be developed in full collaboration with the potential investors; i.e. mainly farmers, FOs and SMEs. Participatory preparation of the SIPs is intended to ensure inclusiveness and support prioritization of VC by the targeted rural population. A similar approach is likely to be adopted by the pipeline Uplands Rural Development Programme.</p>	F
Turkey	NEN	PPA	4	CTRY	STR	PRM	<p>Managing the learning process. Emerging learnings from SEDP, Ardahan-Kars-Artvin Development Project and Diyarbakir, Siirt and Batman Rural Development Programme (IFAD) value chain support should be systematically monitored and an emerging model of IFAD support for inclusive agricultural value chains be drawn up based on the experience derived from this pool of projects with a focus on value chain.</p>	<p>Continuous learning and KM are fully integrated into the design of GTWDP and mainstreamed into implementation across all levels (central, provincial and local). In addition the pipeline programme under the current RB-COSOP (URDP) pays greater attention to M&E as a knowledge generator to make informed decisions for Government and IFAD, most notably regarding policy dialogue, KM and scaling up. The VC model adopted by IFAD-supported projects will be included in the two knowledge products planned for preparation within the current RB-COSOP period: (i) thematic study on "Sustainable Development and Poverty Alleviation in Mountainous Ecosystems", (ii) IFAD will also help the Government to generate knowledge on the impact of matching grants and subsidies as there is no impact analysis available on the performance of the support programmes.</p>	F

Turkey	NEN	PPA	5	CTRY	OPER	PMA	Strategic Investment Plans as planning and management tool. The Strategic Investment Plan route as 'business plan' for an entire value chain is useful. In future, all opportunities that this instrument affords should be utilized, in particular with regard to market and competitor analysis and specification of technical and logistical details of value chains to be supported, value chain actors and intermediate products.	Indeed, the MFAL is convinced by this planning and management tool and the approach has gained a high replication potential in other geographic areas of Turkey and within other sub-sectors. It will be used in the recently approved GTWDP and is intended to be included in the design for the pipeline URDP.	O
Turkey	NEN	PPA	6	CTRY	STR	PRM	Reinforcing value chains with appropriate value chain financing instruments. Even though Turkey has a well-developed banking sector, there are still unutilized potentials in strengthening value chains with appropriate financial instruments. IFAD should consider supporting innovative and very diverse value chain financing instruments that are currently gaining importance in Near East and North African countries, including Turkey. Future IFAD-funded interventions should include appropriate instruments and arrangements ensuring that the poorest beneficiaries in the target group are granted access to such financing.	In Turkey, one of the most effective rural finance instruments for rural poor farmers, rural women and SMEs was the well-designed Matching Grant Programme (MGP). The targeting of IFAD-supported MGPs was significantly superior to that applied by GOT- matching grants, which turned out to not be pro-poor and failed to take into consideration the absorption capacity of the beneficiaries. The small producers, rural women and SMEs and their associations supported through IFAD financed MGPs, generated enough revenue and built assets that allowed them become bankable and engage in borrowing from Ziraat Bank (Turkish Agricultural Bank) or commercial banks when needed. As part of the preparation of the current RB-COSOP (2018-2021) a financial sector assessment was conducted. A potential partnership with Ziraat Bank is indeed included in the pipeline Uplands Rural Development Programme.	O

Historic Follow up

Corporate level evaluation: IFAD's institutional efficiency and efficiency of IFAD-funded operations (from Action Plan)

Eval.	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2014 Follow up	2015 Follow up	2016 Follow Up	Status
Corporate level evaluation: IFAD's institutional efficiency and efficiency of IFAD-funded operations (from Action Plan)										
						Recommendation 1: Scaling up of high impact, innovative approaches emerging out of IFAD-supported projects and programmes should become the objectives of IFAD's business model				
						Increase strategic selectivity				
CLE	1	IFAD	PLCY	STRA		Prepare a paper outlining various options for country selectivity for consideration by the Executive Board.	The relevant paper is due for the September 2014 Board. IFAD management believes that the issue of country selectivity would need to be addressed in the context of the PBAS Working Group and the paper to this effect is planned to be submitted in the September 2014 session of the Executive Board.	Senior Management are proposing an informal seminar with the Board in the 2nd quarter of 2015. The date will be confirmed soon. Therefore, while work has started in this regard, the future course of action in this area will be decided based on the consultations with the Board.	A Paper on country selectivity, addressing the Consolidated Action Plan responses to the CLEE with regard to country selectivity and updating the status of IFAD's thematic selectivity, was presented to the Board in 2014 (EB 112/ R.2).	F
						Balance the workload among CPMs				

Eval.	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2014 Follow up	2015 Follow up	2016 Follow Up	Status
Corporate level evaluation: IFAD's institutional efficiency and efficiency of IFAD-funded operations (from Action Plan)										
CLE	2	IFAD	STR	HR		Develop a more robust database with a management dashboard showing the status of the programme of work as a tool for workload analysis	Reports already available in PPMS showing status of programme of work and CPM responsibilities for investment projects. This reporting will be further enhanced after the deployment of GRIPS II and introduction of reporting from Data Warehouse.	In addition to the previous update, BOD has developed a time-estimation program which will be crucial in workload analysis.	GRIPS has been implemented with a dashboard and reporting features to monitor the programme of work and inform workload analysis by Management.	F
						Implement a more differentiated allocation of resources and increase customization to country needs				
CLE	3	IFAD	PLCY	STRA		Develop and implement more responsive instruments for MICs	IFAD's strategy and instruments for engagement with MICs are being reviewed to increase responsiveness to evolving circumstances in these countries. Management's proposals will be discussed in the IFAD10 replenishment consultation within a broader review of IFAD's business model.	In line with the IFAD 10 activities and targets, IFAD is revising its MIC strategy. IFAD will submit updated information on IFAD's strategy on engagement with MICs by December 2015.	In the update on IFAD's engagement with MICs, presented to the 2016 April Board, Management confirms the need to pursue on-going efforts to enhance and consolidate IFAD's engagement in MICs through a mix of financial and knowledge products and services, such as: single currency lending, reimbursable technical assistance (RTA), country-level policy engagement, KM and South-South and Triangular Cooperation. The Financial Operations Department (FOD) and the Programme Management Department (PMD) have been exploring the possibility of introducing	O

Eval.	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2014 Follow up	2015 Follow up	2016 Follow Up	Status
Corporate level evaluation: IFAD's institutional efficiency and efficiency of IFAD-funded operations (from Action Plan)										
									single-currency loans building on the experience of the Spanish Trust Fund and KfW funds. Procedures for the RTA are currently being developed to expand its use. Management will present to the EB in December 2016 a single corporate document on MICS, PBAS and fragility.	
						Aim for better integration between lending and non-lending activities				
						Knowledge management and grants strategy				
CLE	4	IFAD	PLCY	KM		Implement the KM framework and plan, including incentives for staff participation	The Knowledge Management Framework prepared in 2013 will enable IFAD to more effectively synthesize and manage lessons, experience and knowledge for improved performance. It supports the increasing focus on and linkage between improved M&E, impact evaluation, policy dialogue, partnership-building and scaling up. A process is underway to identify gaps and prioritise learning activities in the form of a targeted KM plan, placing emphasis on	The KM framework has already been developed. In December 2014, OMC agreed to postpone the presentation of an 18-month action plan to late 2015, due to the recent appointment of the new AVP-SKD and reconfiguration of the Department. The additional time will allow SKD to further simplify and focus the KM Framework, in particular with regard to priority thematic areas. The action plan will reflect the reconfiguration and refocusing of SKD and its work, especially in the development of knowledge	The OMC has asked SKD to lead development of a Knowledge Management Action Plan with 4 to 5 concrete targets, addressing gaps and priorities identified through consultation within the organization. SKD expects to submit the Action Plan to OMC in the 2nd quarter of 2016.	O

Eval.	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2014 Follow up	2015 Follow up	2016 Follow Up	Status
Corporate level evaluation: IFAD's institutional efficiency and efficiency of IFAD-funded operations (from Action Plan)										
							learning partnerships and improved use of the global and regional grant programme as a vital knowledge instrument. Its implementation will be underpinned by incentives developed for staff to manage knowledge more effectively that were integrated into IFAD's new competency framework (based on a review of good practice in other organizations), and the IFAD-wide KM Coordination Group which promotes a more collaborative and coherent approach to KM.	products to position IFAD's knowledge globally. It will also be necessary to review accountabilities for KM in the organization, given the centralized coordination function may no longer be feasible.		
CLE	5	IFAD	PLCY	RME		Conduct, synthesize and report on up to 30 impact evaluations	A RIMS survey inventory analysis was carried out to select the 24 projects that will be subject to ex post impact evaluation. The six projects to use randomized control trials (RCTs) methods were identified. Their evaluations will be conducted in the context of the 3IE Agricultural Innovation Thematic Window (supported with US\$10 million from DFID and the B&MGF). These projects have been matched with internationally renowned	The 24 studies are on-going and will be delivered between April and August 2015. The synthesis report will be ready by end of September 2015, and will cover results from the 24 ex-post evaluations, together with the poverty projections and lessons learned.	The synthesis report was officially provided to the board in May 2016. It incorporates the results from the individual country studies, including 22 of the impact evaluations (two still ongoing) into a single synthesis report.	F

Eval.	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2014 Follow up	2015 Follow up	2016 Follow Up	Status
Corporate level evaluation: IFAD's institutional efficiency and efficiency of IFAD-funded operations (from Action Plan)										
							research institutions, including IFPRI, Wageningen University and Research Centre, the University of California, etc. which will conduct the impact studies. Support for the design of RCTs for ASAP-related projects is also being provided.			
						Results-based country strategic opportunities programmes				
CLE	6	IFAD	PLCY	COS		Review and update IFAD's RB-COSOP guidelines, including the criteria for deciding when an RB-COSOP is required, e.g. in small country programmes	The issuance of revised RB-COSOP guidelines is scheduled for mid-2014. An inter-departmental team led by the AVP/PMD has been set up, and will produce a concise version of RB-COSOP guidelines and a full RB-COSOP Source Book.	This is ongoing, and very close to completion at the time of the drafting of the PRISMA report. The new version of the RB-COSOP Guidelines is scheduled to be approved by IFAD Senior Management by June 1, 2015.	Revised guidelines for the preparation of RB-COSOPs were issued on December 2015. According to the new guidelines, all countries with which IFAD maintains active engagement require an RB-COSOP. Under special circumstances, a Country Strategy Note (CSN) is prepared instead of a COSOP, for instance: PBAS allocation equal or below USD 5 million.	F
						Project supervision and financial management				

Eval.	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2014 Follow up	2015 Follow up	2016 Follow Up	Status
Corporate level evaluation: IFAD's institutional efficiency and efficiency of IFAD-funded operations (from Action Plan)										
CLE	7	IFAD	PLCY	SUP		Issue revised guidelines for project supervision that incorporate the recommendations made in CLEE and the corporate-level evaluation of supervision	Draft Joint Implementation Review guidelines have been prepared and circulated internally for comments before being formally issued.	Joint Supervision and Implementation Review Guidelines have been drafted and are ready for approval in-house (process to be guided by Senior Portfolio Manager). The current draft addresses all the recommendations made during the corporate level evaluation on supervision (see section on Supervision CLE in PRISMA 2015).	In July 2015, PMD undertook a stock-take of IFAD's supervision and implementation support (SIS) practices, aiming to respond to the 2013 CLE on IFAD's Supervision and Implementation Support Policy and to assess the extent to which SIS is aligned with IFAD's results measurement framework. PMD is currently working on new guidelines to (i) include the results of this stock-take exercise, as well as inputs from consultations with staff from regional divisions; and (ii) align them with the recently introduced operational procedures on Country Strategies, Logframes and Economic and Financial Analysis, and Completion Reporting. In cooperation with ICT, PMD is also working on an IT system that will track project results and performance from design through completion. The new guidelines will be finalized in the second half of 2016.	O

Eval.	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2014 Follow up	2015 Follow up	2016 Follow Up	Status
Corporate level evaluation: IFAD's institutional efficiency and efficiency of IFAD-funded operations (from Action Plan)										
CLE	8	IFAD	PLCY	PMA		Implement reforms to enhance the quality of financial management in projects, such as introduction of risk-based methodologies, increased reliance on country systems and capacity-building in financial management for project staff and IFAD's workforce	Gradual introduction of modern Financial Management practices is on-going. A range of CFS Guidance Notes have been issued on FM risk assessments, selection of project auditors, financial reporting and documenting results of FM assessments. Staff training was completed on country PFM (public financial management) Assessments. Capacity building events for project staff were conducted for APR and WCA/ESA.	Modernisation of FM practices within CFS is continuing. Additional Capacity building events have been now been completed for NEN and LAC clusters.	The CFS functional review has led to the splitting of the division into two, separating the loan administration from project financial management, thereby enhancing focus on both areas. The accreditation process for financial management consultants will commence in 2016 and responsibility and budget will transfer from Operations to FMD. PMD staff performing financial management tasks will also transfer. Appropriate training will be provided. Phase 1 of the upgrade to the Loans and Grants System LGS2 will be implemented by year-end and business process improvements have already started to facilitate the change. The Financing Administration Manual is being updated. Work is also continuing on enhancing the capacity of Supreme Audit institutions through the INTOSAI Development Initiative.	O

Eval.	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2014 Follow up	2015 Follow up	2016 Follow Up	Status
Corporate level evaluation: IFAD's institutional efficiency and efficiency of IFAD-funded operations (from Action Plan)										
CLE	9	IFAD	STR	FLD		Scale up the Nairobi disbursement processing unit to an interregional decentralized hub servicing Western and Central, Eastern and Southern, and Northeast and Near African countries, by gradually shifting additional loan administration tasks from Rome to the Nairobi unit	The scaling up of the Nairobi Disbursement Centre is progressing. The Centre now processes all ESA and 90% of WCA disbursements. Transfer of NEN disbursements to the Centre is scheduled to commence by mid-2014.	Nairobi office continues to perform well and services all of ESA and 90% of WCA disbursements. NEN disbursements continue to be processed at HQ. This recommendation has been partially addressed, with WCA and ESA serviced by the Nairobi office.	The creation of a Finance Administration Services unit within ACD will go beyond the scope of the recommendation as the loan administration process for all regions will be spread across HQ and Nairobi. Currently Nairobi covers WCA and ESA. Management has also envisaged moving to a pooled approach with WA disbursement, which emphasises how the staff based on Nairobi will deal across the global portfolio.	O
						Accounting and financial reporting				
CLE	10	IFAD	PLCY	FLD		Provide an enabling environment to support extension of decentralized country offices by implementing a financial accountability framework for decentralized operations in ICOs and enabling access to financial systems.	This action is being addressed as part of a broader corporate initiative, the outcome of which will determine IFAD's approach to expenditure monitoring and reporting on ICOs.	IFAD Country Presence decentralization strategy aims to improve the effectiveness of IFAD's work at the country level. To achieve this goal FSU has been focused on standardizing processes as a requirement to further enhance ICOs' efficiency. Administrative guidelines and a standard budget template have been implemented to better monitor and report on ICOs' procedures and expenditures. Moreover, CFS and FSU will work together to implement the pilot for monitoring ICO budget in ESA with the view to leverage this experience	All ICOs have now access to IFAD's financial systems, and the budget monitoring template developed by FSU is fully used by all ICOs reporting through Statements of Expenditures (SOEs).	O

Eval.	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2014 Follow up	2015 Follow up	2016 Follow Up	Status
Corporate level evaluation: IFAD's institutional efficiency and efficiency of IFAD-funded operations (from Action Plan)										
								and apply to other regions. The extent of decentralisation will entail a full analysis, following which a decision can be made as to the way forward on a corporate level.		
						Enhance staff skills and productivity				
CLE	11	IFAD	STR	KM		Make relevant knowledge products available to frontline staff, such as CPMs, in easily accessible formats	Knowledge management process have been strengthened within IFAD, with a continuous stream of learning and knowledge-sharing events, and improvements to the quality enhancement QE/QA processes. See also progress on action 10 above on KM Framework and Plan.	A number of knowledge products have been developed for CPMs and country teams since the last update. This includes, inter alia, How To Do notes developed by PTA across a number of thematic areas such as gender and value chains to enhance CPM capacity during design and implementation. An updated handbook on economic and financial analysis is also being developed, with the first volume made available to all staff in March 2015.	Hands-on "user friendly" how to knowledge products covering almost all thematic areas in which IFAD is engaged will have been completed by 2016. The focus in 2016 will be to disseminate knowledge products through CPMTs, in-country missions, on line platforms, thematic networks and training. Furthermore, there will be a progressive shift from thematic knowledge products to more demand-driven "country-based" knowledge products addressing policy.	O
						CLEE recommendation 3: Manage oversight and support units, including critical ICT functions, with a clear focus on increasing service quality and cost-efficiency				
						Improve business processes				

Eval.	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2014 Follow up	2015 Follow up	2016 Follow Up	Status
Corporate level evaluation: IFAD's institutional efficiency and efficiency of IFAD-funded operations (from Action Plan)										
CLE	12	IFAD	STR	EFF		Delegate procurement authority to division directors for conducting low-value procurement of up to €10,000 and related changes in workflow	The new version of the Corporate Procurement Manual has been prepared and the agreed changes will be applied in the first half of 2014. This includes the delegation of low value procurements to Division Directors. The new manual will be issued with a President's Bulletin by end Q2 2014. The related changes in Peoplesoft workflow are expected to be released by April 2014 as a pilot project for 2 divisions. After successful testing this will be rolled out to other divisions together with an enhanced and user friendly e-procurement interface.	The revision of the Corporate Procurement Manual was delayed in 2014, however it is now on its final stage of approval workflow and we expect its final approval by Q2 2015. In the meantime, additional rules have been added to reinforce the delegation of low value procurement to Division Directors and the transparency of the procurement process. New competitive procedures have also been introduced for supporting innovation and efficiency of the process. The Peoplesoft has been updated and the new functionality on Delegation of Low Value Procurement is being deployed to all IFAD Divisions. As second phase of this implementation, a more user-friendly Oracle e-procurement interface is also under implementation and testing. Completion foreseen by Q3 2015.	The revision of the Corporate Procurement Manual was completed in Q4 2015. The new rules reinforce the delegation of low value procurement to Division Directors and the transparency of the procurement process. New competitive procedures have also been introduced for supporting innovation and efficiency of the process. The Peoplesoft has been updated and the new functionality on Delegation of Low Value Procurement has been deployed to all IFAD Divisions. The new manual also includes the option to re-delegate the authority for Low Value Procurement to selected Professional Staff members, in particular to the Country Programme Managers (CPMs), which would enable ICOs to satisfy their needs directly and efficiently, and also ease their reliance on the respective host agencies for conducting Low Value Procurement.	F

Eval.	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2014 Follow up	2015 Follow up	2016 Follow Up	Status
Corporate level evaluation: IFAD's institutional efficiency and efficiency of IFAD-funded operations (from Action Plan)										
CLE	13	IFAD	STR	EFF		Further streamline travel processing, including making the necessary adjustments to the ERP system	The following adjustments to the Peoplesoft system are to be delivered by April 2014: (1) allowance of the system to automatically process a 50% DSA for PHP location, Rome; (2) implementation of the expense automation process; (3) pre-calculation of terminals on TA; (4) changes to the current workflow, allowing Travel Manager to modify the report after Budget Holder approval, elimination of the need for Budget Holder approval when the difference between TER and TA is less than 10%, batch approval for TERs with zero changes. To be delivered in Q2 2014: (1) integration with UNDSS to allow users to pre-populate data from their TA; (2) review of Business Purposes related to travel; (3) control for consultant payments.	(1) allowance of the system to automatically process a 50% DSA for PHP location, Rome IMPLEMENTED; (2) implementation of the expense automation process IMPLEMENTED; (3) pre-calculation of terminals on TA IMPLEMENTED; (4) changes to the current workflow, allowing Travel Manager to modify the report after Budget Holder approval, elimination of the need for Budget Holder approval when the difference between TER and TA is less than 10%, batch approval for TERs with zero changes IMPLEMENTED. To be delivered in Q2 2014: (1) integration with UNDSS to allow users to pre-populate data from their TA IMPLEMENTED; (2) review of Business Purposes related to travel POSTPONED TO 2015; (3) control for consultant payments POSTPONED TO 2015.	The following measures have been implemented to streamline travel processing: (1) allowance of the system to automatically process a 50% DSA for PHP location, Rome; (2) implementation of the expense automation process; (3) pre-calculation of terminals on TA; (4) changes to the current workflow, allowing Travel Manager to modify the report after Budget Holder approval; elimination of the need for Budget Holder approval when the difference between TER and TA is less than 10%; batch approval for TERs with zero changes; (5) integration with UNDSS security clearances website to allow users to pre-populate data from their TA. The following measures are still in progress: (1) review of Business Purposes related to travel, expected to be completed in Q3 2016; (2) control for consultant payments is being reassessed. A new global travel services contract is in place which allows local ticketing at the country office, while maintain centralised control. This has been implemented in	O

Eval.	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2014 Follow up	2015 Follow up	2016 Follow Up	Status
Corporate level evaluation: IFAD's institutional efficiency and efficiency of IFAD-funded operations (from Action Plan)										
									the LAC region and Ghana, Kenya, Tanzania, Vietnam, Zambia, Ethiopia, Mozambique. More are expected by the end of the year.	
CLE	14	IFAD	PLCY	EFF		Streamline the Corporate Procurement Guidelines to enhance administrative efficiency by eliminating transactional steps for low-value and low-risk purchases	The new version of the Corporate Procurement Manual has been prepared and the agreed changes will be applied in the first half of 2014. This includes the delegation of low value procurements to Division Directors. The new manual will be issued with a President's Bulletin by end Q2 2014. The related changes in Peoplesoft workflow are to be released by April 2014 as a pilot project for 2 divisions. After successful testing this will be rolled out to other divisions together with an enhanced and user friendly e-procurement interface.	The revision of the Corporate Procurement Manual was delayed in 2014, however it is now on its final stage of approval workflow and its final approval is expected by Q2 2015. In the meantime, additional rules have been added to reinforce the delegation of low value procurement to Division Directors and the transparency of the procurement process. New competitive procedures have also been introduced for supporting innovation and efficiency of the process. The Peoplesoft has been updated and the new functionality on Delegation of Low Value Procurement is being deployed to all IFAD Divisions. As second phase of this implementation, a	The revision of the Corporate Procurement Manual was completed in Q4 2015. The new rules reinforce the delegation of low value procurement to Division Directors and the transparency of the procurement process. New competitive procedures have also been introduced for supporting innovation and efficiency of the process. The Peoplesoft has been updated and the new functionality on Delegation of Low Value Procurement has been deployed to all IFAD Divisions. The new manual also includes the option to re-delegate the authority for Low Value Procurement to selected Professional Staff members, in particular to the Country Programme	F

Eval.	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2014 Follow up	2015 Follow up	2016 Follow Up	Status
Corporate level evaluation: IFAD's institutional efficiency and efficiency of IFAD-funded operations (from Action Plan)										
								more user-friendly Oracle e-procurement interface is also under implementation and testing. Completion foreseen by Q3 2015.	Managers (CPMs), which would enable ICOs to satisfy their needs directly and efficiently, and also ease their reliance on the respective host agencies for conducting Low Value Procurement.	
						Increase application of information and communications technology				
CLE	15	IFAD	STR	RME		Implement ICT systems to support IFAD's operational monitoring and evaluation processes	Systems identified to support M&E that were identified at ITGC for 2014/2015 are: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Project financial risk indicators • Audit report tracking for Grants • Extend results and impact monitoring to project level At the impact level, new guidelines are being developed in 2014. The process will include a software for data entry and analysis, to assist projects and to be developed by PMD in consultation with ICT.	Analysis and development on the projects for financial risk indicators and audit report tracking for grants is underway. The definition of requirements for project on the extended results and impact monitoring will be finalized in the first half of 2015.	The projects to monitor and report on Project Risk factors and to monitor the submission of Grant audit reports were successfully delivered in 2015 as planned. The PID for the PMD-sponsored "LogFrame" project was approved in Q4 2015. This multi-year project has been designed to fully support PMD's project life cycle and fully support IFAD's operational monitoring and evaluation processes	O

Eval.	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2014 Follow up	2015 Follow up	2016 Follow Up	Status
Corporate level evaluation: IFAD's institutional efficiency and efficiency of IFAD-funded operations (from Action Plan)										
CLE	16	IFAD	STR	ICT		Implement mobile technologies to allow access to IFAD systems on the move via a range of devices including smart phones and tablets	New applications being developed are browser based and so can be accessed from mobile devices. The Members' interactive platform for example was upgraded to allow use from mobile devices, resizing the layout of information depending on the device being used. Oracle have released an application for mobile devices which allows access of IFAD business intelligence (BI) applications from mobile devices which is currently being tested. Moving forward, opportunities to leverage mobile technologies will be analysed in areas such as approval processes.	Mobile devices are an entirely new way for staff to interact with IT services. ICT will implement a Mobile Device Corporate strategy and the infrastructure needed to enable staff to securely maintain office productivity on mobile devices. This is a multi-year project. In 2015 ICT will lay the foundation by implementing a Mobile Device Management platform, drafting the policies and procedures needed and selecting a service provider for mobile devices. In addition, "mobile" is a guiding principal for application development and 3 core platforms are being upgraded to support this initiative, including PeopleSoft (People Tools 8.54 upgrade), Business Intelligence and Sharepoint.	Mobile technologies to allow access to IFAD systems on the move via a range of devices including smart phones and tablets have been implemented. The Mobile Device Management solution has been rolled out to corporate smart phones and provides access to key corporate applications and services and has introduced enhanced security for IFAD data on mobile devices. In addition, SEC and ICT delivered IFAD's first fully mobile application, IFAD Mango, to IFAD staff and Member States at the 2016 Governing Council. Moving forward, 'mobile' will continue to be a guiding principle for application and service development	F
CLE	17	IFAD	STR	ICT		Develop business intelligence solutions to provide relevant management information to support business decisions	The new LGS reporting was implemented in Data Warehouse using BI. Employee BI dashboards for HRD which give a dashboard view of employee data held in the different PeopleSoft HR modules have been delivered for use in HRD. The latter will be rolled out as a	In 2015 it is planned to enhance contributions reporting to include supplementary funds.	This recommendation has been implemented. The data warehouse has been in operation since 2014 and is the source for report and dash board development which aids decision making for Business Units across the organization. Using the Data	F

Eval.	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2014 Follow up	2015 Follow up	2016 Follow Up	Status
Corporate level evaluation: IFAD's institutional efficiency and efficiency of IFAD-funded operations (from Action Plan)										
							self-service functionality for all employees in 2014.		Warehouse, there will continue to be enhancements and further evolution of reports and dashboards based on the requirements of the business.	
CLE	18	IFAD	STR	ICT		Introduce GRIPS, retire PPMS and reconfigure existing systems that rely on PPMS	CSD: GRIPS has been implemented for Grants. A project is currently underway to bring investment project data into GRIPS, scheduled for go-live in early Q2 2014. This will improve reporting significantly as it will allow financial and other data to be sourced from multiple applications.	GRIPS was released in Q2 2014 and provides oversight onto the full portfolio of Investment Projects and Grants. PPMS data was migrated to GRIPS prior to the release. In 2015 the remaining systems that rely on PPMS for data will be reconfigured to source data from GRIPS. Therefore, the introduction of GRIPS is complete, the retirement and reconfiguration of other systems is almost complete.	This recommendation is closed. All of the remaining systems that relied on PPMS for data were reconfigured to source data from GRIPS and the legacy PPMS has been fully retired.	F
CLE	19	IFAD	STR	ICT		Upgrade the Operations Dashboard to accommodate new business imperatives, using information from GRIPS and Flexcube	This is envisaged once DataWarehouse has been fully populated. DataWarehouse will allow for integration of information from different systems (i.e., PeopleSoft and FlexCube) and within modules of PeopleSoft.	Further integration of project data into the data warehouse will provide enhanced reporting across IFAD's project portfolio	This recommendation is now closed. The Business Intelligence Operations Dashboard, with 12 key reports, was delivered in 2015 in time for the Portfolio Review integrating information from GRIPS, Flexcube and other corporate data sources. Using the Data Warehouse, there will	F

Eval.	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2014 Follow up	2015 Follow up	2016 Follow Up	Status
Corporate level evaluation: IFAD's institutional efficiency and efficiency of IFAD-funded operations (from Action Plan)										
									continue to be enhancements and further evolution of reports and dashboards based on the requirements of the business.	
						CLEE recommendation 5: Manage strategically the skills composition, cost and performance of the workforce				
CLE	20	IFAD	OPER	HR		Implement a new rewards and recognition framework, taking into account best practices for talent and rewards management that include monetary and non-monetary rewards	IFAD's first Reward and Recognition Framework including monetary and non-monetary rewards will be implemented in 2014 based on the 2013 performance cycle. The Framework complies with ICSC guidelines and is aligned with key UN common system priorities in the area of human resources management.	The Reward and Recognition Framework was successfully implemented in 2014, recognizing excellent performance in the 2013 performance cycle. The IFAD model is being carefully studied by the ICSC as it plans for the wider introduction of incentive pay in the Common System.	Following a successful implementation in 2014-2015, the model for rewards and recognition has been fine-tuned and is now being implemented in 2016 based on the 2015 MRG confirmed ratings of 2015. IFAD remains at the forefront of such initiatives within the UN System and as such regularly provides advice to other UN agencies in this domain.	F

Eval.	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2014 Follow up	2015 Follow up	2016 Follow Up	Status
Corporate level evaluation: IFAD's institutional efficiency and efficiency of IFAD-funded operations (from Action Plan)										
CLE	21	IFAD	OPER	HR		Strengthen the performance management system to provide managers with the tools to recognize excellent performance and to motivate staff to achieve continuously stronger results	Following an external assessment, IFAD's performance management process and system have been further enhanced in support of the implementation of the Reward and Recognition Framework. As part of this process, a new Competency Framework was launched in 2013 and will be a central element of IFAD's HR management as it will be used in strategic workforce planning, recruitment, performance management and 360 degree feedback, reward and recognition, and staff development.	In addition to successfully implementing the new Reward and Recognition framework, including monetary and non-monetary rewards in 2014, based on the results of the 2013 performance cycle, IFAD also strengthened the performance management process to include a more accelerated MRG schedule, aiming at finalizing the PES cycle in early April 2015 to ensure early final feedback to staff on their prior year performance and time to take advantage of non-monetary rewards, including travel to facilitate familiarization with ICO operations.	During 2015, a review of the non-monetary rewards has been completed to assess their value and possible identification of new and more relevant ones for staff members. Management is currently discussing a thorough review of the whole process, starting with performance management. It is to be noted that the completion rate of the performance management system is extremely high (99%) and IFAD is also adopting a 360 degree feedback to strengthen the performance evaluation culture within the organization (with a 82% response rate). It is noteworthy to observe that the whole Senior management Team are part of it and as such, are spearheading the whole process. Finally, the EMC as a team benefits from a specific, open and constructive team-based assessment where each member provides open feedback to others.	F
						CLEE recommendation 7: Instil an institutional culture of accountability and performance, and				

Eval.	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2014 Follow up	2015 Follow up	2016 Follow Up	Status
Corporate level evaluation: IFAD's institutional efficiency and efficiency of IFAD-funded operations (from Action Plan)										
						strengthen reporting for results				
CLE	22	IFAD	STR	RME		<p>Improve the data and information base for IFAD's Results Measurement Framework</p>	<p>M&E and impact evaluation capacity is being strengthened to provide expert advice to projects at different stages of the programme cycle. Impact evaluation guidelines have been developed, placing strong premium on the integration of IFAD-supported project M&E systems within broader national M&E systems. To support gender mainstreaming throughout IFAD's programmes and projects, IFAD has set up systems to closely monitor and report on gender indicators. Guidelines for the Results and Impact Measurement System (RIMS) and the preparation of Project Completion Reports (PCRs) will be updated in 2014 to ensure that improved M&E and impact assessment methods and practices are fully mainstreamed into IFAD's results measurement processes.</p>	<p>This has been implemented- a number of changes and improvements have already been incorporated into the guidelines/ handbooks/ systems used in IFAD to measure results. An illustrative list of changes in the last year includes: (a) updating the RIMS 1st and 2nd level Handbook to incorporate climate-change related indicators, (b) updating the impact survey guidelines, now produced as one integrated set issued by SKD/ PMD to avoid multiple messages (this includes best practices in impact assessments, provides a menu of options to projects to assess impact, includes core indicators from the RIMS surveys, includes an annex on gender and women's empowerment based on the Women's Empowerment in Agriculture Index). Therefore significant changes have been implemented over 2014-2015, but obviously this will be an ongoing process as the context in which IFAD operates changes, and as</p>	<p>Management is currently working on a Development Effectiveness Framework that includes the CLEAR grant initiative, the establishing of a certification framework for M&E, an overall enhancement of the self-evaluation framework anchored in results, and the creation of an online system to track results throughout the project cycle. This will address the concerns expressed in this recommendation.</p>	O

Eval.	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2014 Follow up	2015 Follow up	2016 Follow Up	Status
Corporate level evaluation: IFAD's institutional efficiency and efficiency of IFAD-funded operations (from Action Plan)										
								the state of the art M&E practices and tools evolve globally.		

Corporate Level Evaluation: IFAD Supervision and Implementation Support Policy

Eval.	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2015 Follow up	2016 Follow Up	Status
Corporate Level Evaluation: IFAD Supervision and Implementation Support Policy									
CLE	1	IFAD	PLCY	SUP		<p>SIS activities should be a joint responsibility between IFAD and the Government. IFAD management should prepare an accountability framework with clear distinction of roles and responsibilities. IFAD should retain a leading role in the review of fiduciary issues while the Government/PMUs could lead the process of identifying issues and solutions; The terms "Supervision" and "Recommendations" could be replaced by "Joint Implementation Review" and "Agreed Actions".</p>	<p>The supervision guidelines are being updated with precisely these objectives (the draft if at an advanced stage and will soon be finalised and issued by Management). They have been restructured as 'IFAD's Joint Supervision and Implementation Review Guidelines', with a clear focus on joint accountabilities and responsibilities. The term supervision has been replaced by 'joint implementation review' and recommendations by 'agreed actions' to reflect joint ownership of the agreed commitments. This principle of joint ownership is explicitly stated in the policy at various points, including in para 5. IFAD still retains a leading role in fiduciary issues, with reviews of withdrawal applications, procurement plans (and with development of improved systems and processes underway in the organisation to implement these reviews even more effectively), while the process of identifying issues and solutions is firmly a joint responsibility (with the actual implementation done as always by PMU/ Government). Different modalities and delivery mechanisms have been outlined to deliver these missions across different institutional contexts.</p>	<p>Management is in the process of revamping and modernizing its supervision practices as an essential step to assess results and promote in-course corrections. SIS practices are also being streamlined as a clear joint IFAD-government responsibility, in accordance to this recommendation and in alignment with the principle of joint ownership and accountability of the IFAD's Policy on Supervision and Implementation Support. The new approach will be reflected in updated supervision guidelines by the end of 2016.</p>	O

Eval.	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2015 Follow up	2016 Follow Up	Status
Corporate Level Evaluation: IFAD Supervision and Implementation Support Policy									
CLE	2	IFAD	PLCY	SUP		<p>IFAD should make strategic use of its grant instrument and/or mobilize additional resources (i.e. ad-hoc multi-donor trust funds) to enhance project readiness and support SIS activities. This would require the establishment of project preparation facilities.</p>	<p>This has been done, with the FAO Grant designed specifically to support persistent problem projects. The update on this grant is also provided in the section on efficiency recommendations: ' The grant programme on capacity development of weakly performing projects and country programmes is implemented by FAO in 8 countries with fragile and/or weak institutional settings in Africa, the Middle East and Asia. The Initiative provides capacity development to 18 on-going projects on about 7 main topics. IFAD has been soliciting and tracking regular updates on the progress of the grant and results achieved.'</p> <p>Based on the results of this initiative, further facilities could be designed.</p>	<p>Regional divisions make use of country grants (as opposed to pre-financing by the Government) to implement start-up plans aiming at facilitating and accelerating project's start-ups. The grants generally cover the recruitment of project staff, first months salaries, baselines survey, purchase of equipment, preparation of bidding documents. Management is promoting wider utilization of this type of grants, and at the same time exploring additional measures to enhance project readiness.</p>	O

Eval.	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2015 Follow up	2016 Follow Up	Status
Corporate Level Evaluation: IFAD Supervision and Implementation Support Policy									
CLE	3	IFAD	PLCY	SCA		<p>Scaling-up opportunities of successful interventions should be reviewed during the course of SIS activities, with the effective engagement of local and national authorities, in order to build ownership and provide political mileage for the achievements made.</p>	<p>Scaling up has received specific, and separate, attention in the new guidelines. This includes a section on the role of joint supervision and implementation review (JSIR) in scaling up activities. Some indicative text from the scaling up section is ' IFAD's corporate strategy now requires all new RB-COSOPs and projects to incorporate specific proposals to seek out innovation, learning and scaling-up opportunities. Given the 'organic' linkages between different stages of the project cycle, the implementation phase, including the JSIR processes, provide effective entry points to design improved scaling up initiatives based on knowledge and learnings from implementation experience.'</p> <p>In terms of clear guidelines, Annex 11 of the latest draft includes clear steps, and highlights the importance of ' drivers (ideas, vision leadership, external forces, incentives) and spaces (financial, environmental, social, institutional political, partnership, learning) and the need for a systematic approach for success in scaling-up'. Country level questions that should be examined to develop a feasible pathway and to identify suitable projects, as well as entry points for scaling up have also been identified.</p>	<p>In December 2015, Management released the IFAD' s Operational Framework for Scaling up Results, providing the operational guidance to country teams on how to mainstream the scaling up agenda across the project cycle. The new Joint Supervision Guidelines, currently being developed, will foresee the inclusion of an assessment of Scaling-up opportunities of successful interventions.</p>	O

Eval.	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2015 Follow up	2016 Follow Up	Status
Corporate Level Evaluation: IFAD Supervision and Implementation Support Policy									
CLE	4	IFAD	OPER	SUP		<p>SIS arrangements, including budgetary allocations, need to be flexible. At the same time, IFAD management should mainstream the QA of SIS activities.</p>	<p>The issue of flexible budgets has been addressed in the context of developing an annual JSIR plan. The JSIR annual plan should 'identify the main issues to be addressed during the coming year, the inputs required in terms of specialized expertise (in-house, in-country and consultants) and budget. How these resources are to be utilized and the optimal time schedule for fielding of missions should be elaborated, including in-loan grants, MTRs, project completion report, etc. An annual JSIR plan is also prepared for CI supervised projects. The CPM should agree with the CI the issues to be addressed, IFAD participation in JSIR missions and other IFAD inputs and resources needed to support the plan. Such plans are updated annually.' (para 25) Further, with regard to budget flexibility, the guidelines state specifically: 'The JSIR budget should be allocated flexibly in relation to the specific needs, as well as to enhance efficiency and following appropriate consultation within IFAD and the country partners. Efficiency gains can be made through use of suitable local consultants, partnerships with national, regional and international organizations, cost sharing with Government agencies and, where possible, collaboration with IFAD grant funded projects. If appropriate, the plan should take into consideration the potential for combining JSIR missions and activities with other project and country-level activities such as</p>	<p>A special supervisory effort will be required in countries where project start-up delays are particularly long, and where project implementation problems are severe. Supervision efforts will therefore continue to be customized to the country and project situation. This will be done by increasing the frequency and quality of supervision and implementation support, in turn permitted by expanding capacity in IFAD country offices to undertake this work. As mentioned above, Management's efforts are under way to streamline supervision reporting tools into one single action-oriented instrument. A new on-line Supervision template is being conceived, merging the Supervision report template and the project status report currently in use. The template would be self-explanatory, in line with the proposed updated Guidelines and take into account any mandatory reporting requirements (legal, financial, other), without duplicating the Guidelines. The template shall be conceived as an interactive tool, of which sections will automatically feed into the Aide Memoire and Management Letter, and of which some sections will not be disclosed (as per IFAD's Disclosure Policy).</p>	O

Eval.	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2015 Follow up	2016 Follow Up	Status	
Corporate Level Evaluation: IFAD Supervision and Implementation Support Policy										
							design work and the annual country programme (COSOP) review.' (para 26)As part of the corporate development process, section I addresses the issue of quality assurance/ enhancement of JSIR and implementation support, and outlines some practices currently undertaken or under development in the different regional divisions. While there is some diversity in the methods adopted by different divisions, there is also a common portfolio review conducted across all divisions at the PMD level. Some details presented in the guidelines include: 'The main instrument for enhancing quality and reviewing implementation progress is tied to the annual portfolio review process. This process, internal to the PMD, takes place at the regional (division) and the corporate levels. Each region produces an Annual Review of Regional Portfolio Performance (ARPP) report, which effectively identifies cross-cutting issues, contributes to learning across projects in the region, and suggests measures to improve project outcomes with a focus on problem and risky projects. This focus is maintained at the corporate level, leaving an opening to strengthen monitoring of the JSIR work and its outputs against an agreed Divisional JSIR plan. At present such a plan is not required from each Division leaving a gap in the quality enhancement process. The only independent avenue for evaluating benefits/impact of the JSIR process			

Eval.	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2015 Follow up	2016 Follow Up	Status
Corporate Level Evaluation: IFAD Supervision and Implementation Support Policy									
							are the Country Portfolio Evaluations undertaken by the Office of Evaluation, which only cover a small sample each year. At the Divisional level, different approaches have been adopted to enhance quality and to monitor progress of the JSIR work. APR and EN regularly assess JSIR reports with the help of an independent reviewer to improve standards based on an integrated view of performance across key strategic, operational and fiduciary areas. In addition, feedback is also obtained from project implementers as to the usefulness of support provided by the JSIR missions. West and Central Africa Division carries out post-mission reviews with the full IFAD level CPMT and has engaged services of an organizational development specialist, who provides hands on support to staff and regularly trains staff on principle and practices of good JSIR approaches. ESA has set up a portfolio review team (PRT), comprising the regional economist, financial management and knowledge management officers, and the programme assistant. The PRT reviews the coherence of PSR ratings and addresses major fiduciary and technical issues arising from the JSIR process during the annual portfolio review process.' (para 90-91)		

Eval.	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2015 Follow up	2016 Follow Up	Status
Corporate Level Evaluation: IFAD Supervision and Implementation Support Policy									
CLE	5	IFAD	OPER	SUP		SIS reports' formats and contents should be adjusted to the needs of Project Management. SIS's "agreed actions" should focus on the key measures that have the highest impact on project performance. Aide-Memoires can be shorter and data requirements can be reduced to avoid burdening PMUs.	This has been done in the context of formulation of 'agreed actions' throughout the guidelines. The agreed actions feed directly into improved outputs, outcomes and objectives as defined in the programme. The new outline for the aide memoire is clear and coherent. In terms of reducing data requirements, clear objectives (as stated in responses to other recommendations) and processes have been developed. Clearer processes will reduce the need for extraneous information and data. But in general, there is also a need to improve the overall quality of data, and this includes collecting data more consistently at the impact level.	See above on the new template.	O

Eval.	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2015 Follow up	2016 Follow Up	Status
Corporate Level Evaluation: IFAD Supervision and Implementation Support Policy									
CLE	6	IFAD	OPER	SUP		While it is acknowledged that all IFIs are struggling with this challenge, IFAD should further strengthen its efforts to ensure that a functioning M&E system is in place before project implementation starts.	The quality of M&E results is often a function of projects' capacity for coherent, regular data collection and analysis through M&E systems. This is a problem that extends beyond IFAD-financed projects to the majority of development and government financed programmes and projects. IFAD provides support to M&E processes overall, most specifically by developing guidelines and handbooks as support tools for projects. In the last year, IFAD has updated its RIMS Handbook for annual reporting (with changes, including integration of environment and climate change related indicators). Further guidance tools under development are the impact guidelines (including greater flexibility in terms of methods and processes available to projects, gradation in terms of suggested systems and expected level of rigour to suit the capacities of projects) and updated PCR guidelines (whereby the project completion process would be viewed as a more holistic process, drawing on results and analyses from project M&E systems). In addition, IFAD is increasingly advocating conducting baseline surveys at the beginning of project implementation and including crucial M&E advice during start-up workshops. The objective is to have M&E systems in place as soon as possible in the project life cycle, but considerations such as financing sources and recruitment (subject to national legislations) also influence progress in this regard.	Management is currently working on a Development Effectiveness Framework that includes the CLEAR grant initiative, the establishing of a certification framework for M&E, an overall enhancement of the self-evaluation framework anchored in results, and the creation of an online system to track results throughout the project cycle. This will address the concerns expressed in this recommendation.	O

Eval.	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2015 Follow up	2016 Follow Up	Status
Corporate Level Evaluation: IFAD Supervision and Implementation Support Policy									
CLE	7	IFAD	OPER	SUP		<p>IFAD management should invest more on KM activities linked to SIS and strengthen policy dialogue opportunities by using its middle management (regional directors) to bring systemic issues to the attention of the national authorities. Grant resources can be also used to finance KM activities and research studies to support an evidence based policy dialogue.</p>	<p>There is a specific focus on KM, and guidance and suggested activities in the guidelines include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • learning in the context of the project or programme implementation for improved performance and results; and • learning about innovative techniques and approaches that have potential for scaling up, and for sharing with a wider audience. <p>The JSIRs will assess whether projects have a KM plan, assessing what support is required for the development of a plan, reviewing progress of KM activities and measuring the emerging results and impact from these activities. Bringing systemic issues to the attention of national authorities will be done through a range of comprehensive and systemic measures, including discussions and follow up with national authorities following missions and policy dialogue activities at the country level, not merely through individual participation of middle management.</p>	<p>Some fundamental changes in the revised guidelines, among others, will include: (i) shifting from a culture of supervision "by mission" to a culture of "continuous supervision"; (ii) anchoring supervision in results by updating LogFrames and streamlining project performance ratings to be supported with evidence; and (iii) streamlining supervision reporting tools into one single action-oriented instrument. This new approach will allow greater capture and use of knowledge generated from supervision. It will help IFAD build up a stock of good operational practices and technical knowledge that will be used to enhance project performance and support country policy engagement.</p>	O

Eval.	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2015 Follow up	2016 Follow Up	Status
Corporate Level Evaluation: IFAD Supervision and Implementation Support Policy									
CLE	8	IFAD	OPER	SUP		In view of a likely flat budget in the coming years, SIS efficiency could be enhanced by savings generated from the adoption of a country program approach, nationalizing SIS activities with increased use of local/regional consultants, mobilization of technical support from PTA, FAO and grant-funded partners, and cost-sharing arrangements with Governments. Part of these savings should be re-invested on additional capacity building of CPMs/CPOs, further strengthening IFAD Country Offices, and extending the duration of supervision missions.	Measures for increased efficiency have been outlined through the guidelines or have been developed and implemented recently: this includes specific references to use of local consultants (already in practice across many programmes), cost-sharing and nationalising activities and budgets, using grant-funded partners (such as with the FAO grant) to improve project quality. IFAD is already operating in an environment of flat or declining budgets across programmes, and is delivering products within such constraints and innovating to deliver quality and quantity within these constraints. Regional divisions have the flexibility to use costs savings in order to achieve greatest impact through their programmes, and this could include the measures suggested.	Management's major shift towards more continuous supervision and implementation support, initiated in 2015, embraces efforts to identify more creative, cost-effective ways to undertake supervision and implementation support, learning from innovative methods already in use in some regional divisions.	O

Historic follow up from PRI SMA 2014 Madagascar Country Programme Evaluation

Country	Reg	Eval.	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2014 Follow up	2016 Follow Up	Status
Madagascar Country Programme Evaluation											
								Recommendation 2. Environmental protection and adaptation to climate change as cross-cutting activities in the strategy and in operations			
Madagascar	ESA	CPE	1	CTRY	STR	NRM		These issues should be promoted in strategy and operations through partnerships, particularly by: [...] (ii) stepping up coordination and the sharing of experience with the main donors involved in catchment area management (for example the World Bank, the African Development Bank and the French Development Agency) in order to incorporate this approach into IFAD supported interventions.	The design of the new ASAP project is being utilized as an occasion to develop partnerships and exchange of experiences with main donors in the area of catchment area management.	The design of the phase II of AD2M integrates partnerships and exchange of experiences with main donors in areas such catchment area management.	F
								Recommendation 4. Better definition of the respective roles of CAPFIDA and the IFAD office in Madagascar in supporting the portfolio, non-lending activities and monitoring of the COSOP			
Madagascar	ESA	CPE	2	CTRY	OPER	FLD		IFAD should prepare for the out-posting of the Country Programme Manager to Antananarivo.	The recruitment of Madagascar CPM is scheduled in 2014.	The new CPM has started working since Feb 2016, and following ESA reorganization, the CPM will be based in Rome. As part of the ESA decentralization strategy, Madagascar is in a "Hub" that	NA

										comprises Mozambique and all Indian Ocean islands states.	
								Recommendation 5. In the short and medium term, special attention to two operations (AROPA, FORMAPROD)			
Madagascar	ESA	CPE	3	CTRY	OPER	TGT		In the case of AROPA, it could prove necessary to reconsider the project's approach through a clearer definition of the various objectives and support mechanism for ... [...] ... (iii) the institutions anticipated by the Agricultural Sector Programme (regional agricultural development funds and agricultural service centres).	Efforts are ongoing to further clarify the functions of CSA / FRDA; also they have already adopted more flexibility to better meet demands.	The functions of CSA / FRDA have been clarified in the process of the request of an additional financing for AROPA; also they have already adopted more flexibility to better meet demands.	F
Madagascar	ESA	CPE	4	CTRY	OPER	PMA		In the case of FORMAPROD, it will be necessary to support preparations for implementation and establish a solid management team at the central level (rather than delegating management to other project teams that are not involved with agricultural training).	At the national level, an executive secretariat is currently under establishment. Meanwhile, an inter - ministerial commission dedicated to vocational training is developing the methodologies for the implementation of FORMAPROD.	The management team of FORMAPROD at the central level was strengthened during the interim review that took place in May 2016.	F

Mali Country Programme Evaluation											
								Recommendation 1: IFAD and the Government should take advantage of this 'forced pause' (referring to the unstable political situation in the north due to which project activities have been stalled) to define the thrusts of the new COSOP.			
Mali	WCA	CPE	1	CTRY	OPER	COS		Given the limited resources allocated to preparing COSOPs, IFAD could use grants to ensure an adequate level of expertise in formulating the COSOP and to ensure a participatory preparation process.	A new COSOP is scheduled in 2015. Grant resources will be considered to ensure adequate level of expertise and a participatory preparation process.	The preparation of a new COSOP has been delayed due to the on-going political crisis in Mali. However a CSN is under-process with the support of an expertise to ensure a wide participatory preparation process. A workshop with all IFAD partners in Mali has been organised in December 2015.	0
Mali	WCA	CPE	2	CTRY	STR	COS		The following measures should be taken to correct strategic orientations: (i) a diagnosis in the COSOP of poverty and rural development opportunities and a more thorough analysis of conflict-related risks and measures to reduce such risks.	These two aspects will be considered next year during COSOP preparation.	In the CSN under preparation, the conflict-related risks have been analysed and taken into account with a focus on South Mali until the end of the political crisis dividing the country in two, and then a new joint analysis of the situation with the Government to assess possible extension to the North.	0

Mali	WCA	CPE	3	CTRY	OPER	DIA	Preparation of a plan for communication and policy dialogue activities: (i) experience gained in supporting (issues such as responsibility for local development interventions and national norms that are ill-suited to conflict fragile zones, weakness in support of ANICT), (ii) lessons learned in involving grassroots and umbrella organisations in project management and policy dialogue, (iii) sustainability of productive and environment micro projects.	Within the COSOP preparation, the policy dialogue component will be developed. Regarding communication, a plan has been developed with IED support through a divisional grant and a specific officer has been recruited by the national coordination of IFAD supported projects and programmes (CNPPF) to implement the strategy.	Regarding communication, a plan has been developed with IED support through a divisional grant. Within the CSN preparation, the policy dialogue component is developed taking into account lessons learnt from previous projects. However, due to the changing context, policy dialogue activities will focus on Inclusive financial services, Youth and employment, and small irrigation.	0
							Recommendation 2: Definition of an action plan for current operations			

Mali	WCA	CPE	4	CTRY	STR	PMA	<p>For operations in the north (PIDRN and PIDRK), given the conflict and risks of misappropriation of resources, it would be appropriate to plan for a definitive termination of the projects if the situation does not change within a clearly defined period.</p>	<p>It has been decided not to follow this recommendation . The two projects have been maintained in order to support local populations in a difficult context where many donors have left the field. In this context, activities have been positively implemented with different partners (AVSF, local NGOs, WHO...). Regarding supervision missions, meetings with representatives of beneficiaries and local NGOs were organized with mission members in Bamako. PIDRN has been extended for a year and is closing in June 2014. PIDRK should also close this year but its extension will be assessed during the next supervision mission.</p>	<p>With close monitoring of the security situation in the North and careful risk assessment, it was decided to continue project implementation in order to support local populations in a difficult context where many donors have left the field. In this context, activities have been positively implemented with different partners (AVSF, local NGOs, WHO...). Regarding supervision missions, meetings with representatives of beneficiaries and local NGOs were organized with mission members in Bamako. PIDRN was extended for a year and closed in June 2014. PIDRK closed also in 2014.</p>	NAG
------	-----	-----	---	------	-----	-----	---	---	---	-----

								Recommendation 3: Improvement in the management at the programme level			
Mali	WCA	CPE	5	CTRY	STR	RME		Improvement in the effectiveness of project M&E systems by strengthening methodology (particularly for impact studies) and monitoring of the quality of activities and their costs (anticipated and actual) by allocating necessary human and financial resources to national monitoring capacities in collaboration with other donors.	Collaboration with other donors in this regard has not been easy during the past months due to the crisis but efforts are being developed to improve collaboration among partners.	A new approach (MPAT: Multidimensional Poverty Assessment Tool) has been tested and shared with the national Division in charge of M&E. The new IFAD supported project FIER has developed an effective M&E system to monitor results and costs.	O
Nepal Country Programme Evaluation											
								Recommendation 4: Appreciating local context; providing adequate implementation support.			
Nepal	APR	CPE	1	CTRY	OPER	PMA		The government should engage external technical support from specialised service providers in the private sector and civil society to address three problem areas that are common in a significant part of the portfolio: (i) implementation driven by quantitative targets rather than being responsive to the demand and problems of beneficiaries; (ii) monitoring systems that do not capture livelihoods changes and indicators for objectives; and (iii) sub-standard financial management.	Partnerships were heavily promoted in the COSOP, MOUs signed and agreed with the Government. Unfortunately, the Government did not retain its commitment and diverged from the agreement (this was the case with NGOs to be engaged in both HVAP and ISFP).	While the Government of Nepal Development Cooperation Policy restricts the use of external technical support from specialized service providers, the IFAD portfolio has achieved the following: i) Projects are oriented to the activities and outputs within the project through continuous support during	F

Nepal	APR	CPE	2	CTRY	OPER	RME	Two important evaluation techniques that deserve wider use in the coming COSOP cycle are case studies of outcomes (encompassing both successes and failures), and opinion polling (perhaps the most objective way to measure the extent to which institutions are achieving popular legitimacy).	Outcome surveys have been implemented by the LFLP and HVAP projects. Opinion polling has not yet been tested.	Substantial efforts have resulted in improved M&E systems of projects in the portfolio. All projects are adopting a Standard IFAD Monitoring and Evaluation System (SIMES) from 2014. HVAP has introduced a tablet-based data collection system with computerized database which measures production, consumption, sales and income of each beneficiary household and is being rolled out to other new projects, such as ISFP. This has helped timely reporting with results and is acknowledged by the central level ministries as among the best M&E system. Under KM, project staff have been trained in operating Learning Route (LR) with support from a regional grant to PROCASUR; one national and one international LR have been implemented with support from the regional grant and	F
-------	-----	-----	---	------	------	-----	--	---	--	---

									three projects (WUPAP, HVAP and PAF) are implementing the LR on their own each year. Knowledge generated from project activities are shared through IFAD Asia as appropriate. APR will launch the opinion polling exercise this year, it was intended to be launched last year and then suspended due to the earthquake that hit Nepal.	
Uganda Country Programme Evaluation										
							Recommendation 2: Support to commodity value-chain development			
Uganda	ESA	CPE	1	CTRY	STR	PRM	Building on the success of VODP and its innovative public-private partnership, the CPE recommends that IFAD and GoU explore opportunities for promoting value chain development in specific sub-sectors in Uganda. In particular, it is recommended that during the COSOP preparation process, IFAD and GoU undertake a thorough analysis to determine which commodity value chain should be given priority.	Investment priority for the 2013-15 PBA cycle has been given to rural finance (key strategic thrust of IFAD COSOP) and the Northern region (see recommendation above). Identification of possible other sub-sectors for investment will be done in 2014-15 to orient the	GoU indicated its priority for IFAD investment in 2016-18 in scaling up of oil palm investment to other areas of the country rather than investing in other sub-sectors/commodities . This recommendation will not be implemented as it is not aligned with the GoU strategic priorities.	NA

									investment of 2016-18 PBA resources (see ACP).		
								Recommendation 5: Functional and workload analysis as a basis for determining staff requirements and division of labour			
Uganda	ESA	CPE	2	IFAD	OPER	HR		The role and responsibilities of the IFAD divisions at headquarters in Rome involved in supporting the Uganda country programme should also be clarified and defined.	This is an issue that goes beyond the Uganda country programme and touches on the functional relationships of HQ divisions with ICOs in general. Overall, the relationship between HQ and country offices is being clarified at the corporate level: this includes tools being developed to assign greater responsibilities to country offices and different models being implemented and assessed.	This recommendation refers to the functional relationships between HQ divisions and ICOs in general. IFAD Management will submit the corporate decentralization plan to the Executive Board in December 2016, as part of the corporate paper on MICs, Fragility, PBAS and Decentralization. The plan will be informed by both the IOE evaluation and Management's own assessment of IFAD's experience.	O
Uganda	ESA	CPE	3	IFAD	OPER	FLD		The CPE recommends that IFAD actively consider strengthening the Uganda country office, including outposting the Uganda CPM.	Outposting of the CPM to Uganda is being considered within the context of the divisional priorities. No strengthening of	The CPM was outposted as of August 2014 and accredited as Country Representative. An Administrative Assistant was recruited as of	F

									the budget office has occurred due to budget constraints; but other corporate measures are being implemented to support ICOs.	March 2015.	
--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	---	-------------	--

Historic follow up from PRI SMA 2013

Brazil Interim Evaluation: Sustainable Development Project for Agrarian Reform Settlements in the Semi-Arid North East

Country	Region	Eval.	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2013 Follow up	2016 Follow Up	Status	
Brazil Interim Evaluation: Sustainable Development Project for Agrarian Reform Settlements in the Semi-Arid North East												
								Recommendation 3: Knowledge generation and dissemination				
Brazil	LAC	IE	1	CTRY	OPER	RME		Incorporate a results-oriented M&E system that will enable the project to measure the progress in implementing the proposed approach and the results achieved at various levels (gender, ethnicity, age, households and institutions, empowerment, citizenship, environmental sustainability).	It was agreed with the Government to prioritize the setting-up of a results oriented M&E system with differentiated gender and youth indicators. This activity is under development as part of the project design process.	A results-based M&E common to the entire country programme is being developed in Brazil, to be fed by all 6 ongoing (and future) projects and operated by ICO staff in Salvador, Bahia. The system is expected to go live by mid-June, when all projects' key staff and partners will be trained on its characteristics and use.	F	
								Recommendation 5: Managing for sustainability				

Brazil	LAC	IE	2	CTRY	STR	SUS		Define at the outset the strategy for engagement with settlements and communities, and its duration. This includes the type and length of support and the indicators triggering the termination of project support – the exit strategy. The design should specify the institutional features and conditions expected at the time of project completion to ensure the continuation of benefits after the end of project financing.	Sustainability is a key focus area for this project, agreed between IFAD and the Government, both in institutional, organizational and environmental terms. Concrete mechanisms and operational definitions are being built as part of the on-going project design process.	Sustainability is a key focus area for this project, agreed between IFAD and the Government, both in institutional, organizational and environmental terms. Concrete mechanisms and operational definitions have been built as part of the design of the second phase of the project.	F
Ghana Country Programme Evaluation											
								Recommendation 1: Bolstering the next COSOP and the programme with more analytical work			
Ghana	WCA	CPE	1	CTRY	OPER	DES		At the project design level, similar work (specific studies, action-research or “intelligence-gathering”) should help fill knowledge gaps and investigate areas of risk.	This is ongoing under the design of the Ghana Rural Growth Programme (see studies mentioned above which are being carried out and will contribute to the design of subsequent projects), which is to be presented to the EB in April 2014.	The GASIP Programme, now launched, is based on rolling analysis of market opportunities and risks; it feeds the knowledge of government and IFAD through its policy advisor. The MTR of REP included four third party studies on risks and opportunities for the programme’s impact.	F
								Recommendation 2: Balancing between sectorial and geographic focus and building a model for Upper West			

Ghana	WCA	CPE	2	CTRY	STR	INF	IFAD should concentrate on devising an intervention model suitable for the Upper West region. The model should concentrate on (i) transportation infrastructure	The Ghana Rural Growth design is taking this recommendation into consideration. Discussions are ongoing with GoG and AfDB to mobilize adequate cofinancing for infrastructure investments in the Upper West Region.	GASIP, now launched, distributes resources to value chain development based on benefit cost ratio vis-à-vis smallholders across Ghana.	F
Ghana	WCA	CPE	3	CTRY	STR	NRM	(ii) water management and irrigation (river gardens, water pumping, small dams where feasible)	The Ghana Rural Growth design is taking this recommendation into consideration. Discussions are ongoing with GoG and AfDB to mobilize adequate cofinancing for infrastructure investments in the Upper West Region, including on the theme of water management and irrigation highlighted in the evaluation.	GASIP, now launched, distributes resources to value chain development based on benefit cost ratio vis-à-vis smallholders across Ghana--this includes investments in irrigation.	F
Ghana	WCA	CPE	4	CTRY	STR	TGT	(iii) strengthening existing value chains more suitable for the poor (e.g. tuber cultivation, higher humidity crops, tree crops, small livestock such as guinea fowl, small ruminants).	The Ghana Rural Growth design is taking this recommendation into consideration. Discussions are ongoing with GoG and AfDB to mobilize adequate cofinancing for investments in this regard in the Upper West Region, including on value chains, as highlighted in the evaluation.	As immediately above. GASIP is open to any value chain that merits investment based on the VC's ability to demonstrate income generation for smallholders.	F

							Recommendation 3: Engage more in partnerships with the Government and donors for scaling up innovations			
Ghana	WCA	CPE	5	CTRY	OPER	RFI	One priority area is: Matching grants in rural finance which have important potential for policy dialogue on support to micro and small businesses without distorting the market.	Steps have been initiated in this regard. A joint study with PTA and FAO/TCI on MGs is being carried out during 2013 to better understand the impact and effects of this instrument based on the pilot activities carried out since 2008.	A joint study with PTA and FAO/TCI on MGs has been carried out in 2013 to better understand the impact and effects of this instrument based on the pilot activities carried out since 2008. Consequently GASIP, RAFIP, REP, NRGF all currently use both matching grants and challenge grants to crowd in PPP arrangements.	F
							Recommendation 4: Engage in more fruitful partnerships with the private sector			
Ghana	WCA	CPE	6	CTRY	OPER	PRM	Successful approaches could then be piloted in Ghana, using grants if necessary, so as to garner real-world knowledge and resources from successful private entrepreneurs.	Ghana has a yellow DSF status, thus it cannot receive stand-alone country grants. However, the mechanism proposed by GRGP is in line with the recommendation.	Same as above	F
							Recommendation 6: Bring to bear IFAD's country presence and outposted CPM			
Ghana	WCA	CPE	7	CTRY	STR	KM	In terms of knowledge management, it should further mobilize expertise and analytical resources from within Ghana and the region as a whole, both for COSOP preparation and project design.	Within the context of limited resources, the ICO is building these contacts over time as and when opportunities emerge. This includes expertise mobilised for the activities, and expertise who are	Within the context of limited resources, the ICO is building these contacts over time as and when opportunities emerge. This includes expertise mobilised for the activities, and expertise who are	F

									based in the country and are in regular touch with the ICO.	based in the country and are in regular touch with the ICO.	
Rwanda: Country Programme Evaluation											
								Recommendation 1: Place greater emphasis on institutional support and non-lending activities to promote the scaling up of innovations and harmonized approaches to rural finance and cooperative development			
								Provide institutional support to local governments in the scaling up of agricultural innovations and in paving the way for the forthcoming agricultural SWAp			
Rwanda	ESA	CPE	1	CTRY	STR	SCA	IFAD will explore opportunities for integrating its interventions in the forthcoming SWAp in order to ensure its participation in major strategic and policy dialogue initiatives in the agriculture and rural development sector. IFAD's participation in the SWAp may also include the development of implementation tools and methodologies that ensures ownership by local governments in up-scaling innovations.	The 2013-2018 COSOP plans an increased IFAD participation in major strategic and policy dialogue initiatives in the agriculture and rural development sector. Scaling up of innovative and successful pilots will strongly be pursued in its second financing cycle of the COSOP. More specifically, the development of concept notes on soil and water conservation, Community Innovation Centres (CCIs) and Watershed Management Planning have been	Within the implementation of the 2013-2018 COSOP, IFAD increased its participation in strategy and policy dialogue especially with regards to small scale irrigation and dairy development (active participation in related sub-working groups of the Agriculture Sector Working Group). IFAD has also promoted the scaling up of innovations. Apart from the SRI method in rice cultivation, the IWUOs has been adopted by the GoR following IFAD support and TA.	F	

								completed.		
							Support harmonized thematic programmes in rural/micro finance and cooperative development			
Rwanda	ESA	CPE	2	CTRY	OPER	DIA	Through a modest financial contribution to harmonized thematic programmes, IFAD could establish its presence in high-level policy dialogue and share its experiences.	This is being explored in the new COSOP and in the formulation of the new project PASP (Post-harvest Agribusiness Support Project). Specific areas of intervention for policy dialogue are being identified.	IFAD participates in high level policy dialogue as an active member of the Agriculture Sector and SWAp working groups. Specific areas for policy dialogue are dairy development, irrigation, IWUOs and extension services. The RDDP under design has a component on policy and institutional support in order to increase IFAD support in those key areas.	F

Rwanda	ESA	CPE	3	CTRY	STR	PAR	Regarding cooperative development, IFAD should contribute to efforts to develop a harmonized support framework. The Rwanda Cooperative Agency reports that it is planning to harmonize the current highly fragmented support for cooperative development; it would be appropriate for IFAD to support this endeavour. If the initiative leads to a harmonized framework with financial support from government and several development partners, IFAD should explore the possibility of making a financial contribution so as to become an active participant	Support to cooperative development as well as rural finance will follow a more harmonized approach under its new COSOP and the new project PASP.	Support to cooperatives has improved through active collaboration with the Rwanda Cooperative Agency. The IFAD portfolio is now focusing on cooperatives' capacity building in order to improve their management, good governance and autonomy. To this effect, the SPIU for IFAD-funded projects signed an MOU with the Rwanda Cooperative Agency (it has also provided the required budget). The possibility of a grant to the Rwanda Cooperative Agency is also being explored in collaboration with its leadership.	F
Vietnam: Country Programme Evaluation										
							Recommendation 5: Strengthening partnerships			
Vietnam	APR	CPE	1	CTRY	STR	PAR	It is recommended that IFAD should continue to participate in the One UN Initiative, albeit in a selective manner, with regard to agenda items commensurate with its resources and comparative advantage.	To the extent possible the ICO participates in the One UN initiative when relevant. If the working group for the improvement of the livelihood for ethnic minorities is re-established the ICO will seek to participate.	The ICO is active in selected policy initiatives together with key partners from One UN and IFIs. To mention few examples, IFAD leads the donor group in revision of the National Target Programme for New Rural Development with 3 billion USD allocation by the	F

									government; IFAD actively participates in the Mekong Delta donor coordination group.	
							Recommendation 6: Increased counterpart funding from the Government			
Vietnam	APR	CPE	2	CTRY	STR	PAR	It is recommended that, during formulation of the next COSOP, IFAD should reach agreement with the Government on increased levels of counterpart funding, especially in view of the country's middle-income country status and numbers of poor rural people. The COSOP might also include broad criteria for determining the proportion of such counterpart funding (e.g. minimum percentage of total projects costs) in future IFAD-supported projects in Viet Nam	Increased counterpart funding is being contemplated in on-going designs however these efforts are to some extent made difficult due to the declining growth of the Vietnamese economy for the past three years with the resulting budgetary constraints.	Through closer planning with the provincial governments, the level of counterpart funding has been increased for the new projects. The 2013-14 started projects AMD and SRDP had GoV financing share of 12.3% and 9.4%, while the 2015 started CPRP project has GoV financing share of 23.7%.	F
							Recommendation 8: A strengthened IFAD country office			
Vietnam	APR	CPE	3	CTRY	STR	FLD	IFAD will need to provide its country office with clear guidelines on prioritizing this agenda, in line with IFAD's new business model and an enabling work environment, i.e. appropriate human and financial resources.	Under the new management in APR procedures are being developed to optimize and improve the working conditions for ICOs in the region including the office in Vietnam.	Procedural guidelines for ICO operations have been received at the Vietnam ICO. An specific audit was also carried out and recommendations are implemented. An additional person has been recruited for the ICO and financial resources have been adjusted to cope with increased workload.	F

Yemen: Country Programme Evaluation										
							Recommendation 4: More prominent consideration of country context challenges in future strategy.			
Yemen	NEN	CPE	1	CTRY	STR	SUP	[In the context of discussions with the Government for the next COSOP, IFAD should have an ongoing assessment of its strategic direction in light of the current unstable political situation and the wide range of social, economic and security challenges facing the country.] This would include various scenario settings and risk analysis. Consideration should be given inter alia to the adequacy of IFAD's operating model to respond to these challenges. For example, it is essential to mobilize experts in design, supervision and implementation who are experienced in peace-building and tribal affairs and accustomed to working in conflict areas.	Expertise is mobilised in missions and different phases of the project cycle. The intensity of supervision is the maximum possible within current budgetary constraints and the security context.	PMD has tried different approaches to ensure mobilization of the right expertise in the context of Yemen. The design team for the RGP, for example, included two experts experienced in post conflict activities. When the security deteriorated again and it was not possible to field missions due to the strict security restrictions, IFAD signed an institutional contract with ICARDA and managed to mobilize the right expertise, accustomed to working in conflict zones, and who were able to visit the targeted project areas.	F
							Recommendation 7: Policy dialogue			
Yemen	NEN	CPE	2	CTRY	OPER	DIA	[IFAD should take advantage of its privileged position as the Government of Yemen's main development partner in rural poverty alleviation, and take a more prominent role in policy dialogue on key rural development issues.] Such dialogue should cover the questions of subsidized diesel fuel for agriculture (often the biggest driver	IFAD is not positioned to influence Government in areas in which it is not investing, such as fuel costs for groundwater extraction or spate irrigation. IFAD	The security situation in Yemen has deteriorated. The intention was, and is, to include these policy elements in the new COSOP but the COSOP preparation, initially planned for 2013, has been	PD

							of water depletion, as it effectively lowers extraction costs and therefore farmers have no incentive to save water), equity improvement in spate irrigation and rural finance. Policy dialogue on rural finance might, for example, involve the Government's policy, financial and supervisory framework to support the growth and sustainability of fledgling SCAs.	participates in relevant UN-Government forums dealing with policy aspects, such as the Consultative Group and the UN country team. These elements will be confirmed in the design of the new COSOP in 2013. On rural finance, the EOF is taking an equity position in a major MFI, thereby obtaining a seat on its BoD and influencing bank policy. It is also supporting the other two MFIs in Yemen through TA for development of adapted rural finance products.	postponed to an unspecified date due to the situation. IFAD suspended the on-going Yemen portfolio at the end of May 2015, by invoking the force majeure clause in the General Conditions due to the intensifying conflict and acute fighting. The ICO is closed and no missions to the country are allowed; IFAD participation in relevant UN-Government forums dealing with policy aspects has thus been halted. Despite the fact that the EOF is holding a seat on the BoD of Al-Amal Bank, its influence on the bank policy has not yet fully materialized and cannot be monitored/measured.	
							Recommendation 8: Country programme management			
Yemen	NEN	CPE	3	CTRY	OPER	FLD	The CPE recommends that IFAD should consider strengthening its country presence to enable it both to participate more actively in policy dialogue with the government and to strengthen its partnerships with donors.	The recommended strengthening of the ICO is dependent on budgetary allocations and divisional cost efficiency analysis. Partnerships and cofinancing are highly developed, as indicated earlier. The CPM's role in policy dialogue is reflected in the specific objectives of the	The recommended strengthening of the ICO is dependent on budgetary allocations and divisional and corporate decentralization plans. For the time being any action in that sense is halted by the security situation and the suspension of the portfolio. However,	PD

								assignment, and the results documented.	despite the presence on the CPM in HQ, partnerships and cofinancing are highly developed, as indicated earlier. The CPM's role in policy dialogue is reflected in the specific objectives of the assignment, and the results documented.	
Ghana Interim Evaluation: Rural Enterprises Project, Phase II										
							Recommendation 5. Sector development			
Ghana	WCA	IE	1	CTRY	STR	DIA	Another opportunity to be pursued is the development of a Ghana MSE policy based on learning and knowledge from the implementation of previous REP interventions.	REP is contributing significantly to institutional development at the national level. The development of a Ghana MSE policy will be fully underway once the implementation of REP III gathers full momentum.	As of Midterm, REP III had prepared third party studies on its activities to demonstrate key investments to government. AfDB is sponsoring a policy advisor for the programme. However, the ultimate decision on whether to have or not a national MSE policy based on learning and knowledge from the implementation of previous REP interventions will depend on the Government.	NA