

Document: EC 2012/72/W.P.7/Add.1
Agenda: 8
Date: 11 June 2012
Distribution: Public
Original: English

E



Enabling poor rural people
to overcome poverty

President's Report on the Implementation Status of Evaluation Recommendations and Management Actions

Volume II

Agreement at completion point Recommendations and follow-up actions taken by the Programme Management Department

Addendum

Note to Evaluation Committee members

Focal points:

Technical questions:

Shyam Khadka
Senior Portfolio Manager
Programme Management Department
Tel.: +39 06 5459 2388
e-mail: s.khadka@ifad.org

Kaushik Barua
Portfolio Officer
Programme Management Department
Tel.: +39 06 5459 2697
e-mail: k.barua@ifad.org

Queries with respect to the response of the Independent
Office of Evaluation to the report should be addressed
to:

Luciano Lavizzari
Director
Independent Office of Evaluation of IFAD
Tel.: +39 06 5459 2274
e-mail: l.lavizzari@ifad.org

Dispatch of documentation:

Deirdre McGrenra
Head, Governing Bodies Office
Tel.: +39 06 5459 2374
e-mail: gb_office@ifad.org

Evaluation Committee — Seventy-second Session
Rome, 17 July 2012

For: Review

Document: EB 2012/106/R.
 Agenda: 6
 Date: _____
 Distribution: Public
 Original: English

E

Enabling poor rural people
to overcome poverty

President's Report on the Implementation Status of Evaluation Recommendations and Management Actions

Volume II

Agreement at completion point Recommendations and follow-up actions taken by the Programme Management Department

Addendum

Note to Executive Board representatives

Focal points:

Technical questions:

Shyam Khadka
Senior Portfolio Manager
Programme Management Department
Tel.: +39 06 5459 2388
e-mail: s.khadka@ifad.org

Kaushik Barua
Portfolio Officer
Programme Management Department
Tel.: +39 06 5459 2697
e-mail: k.barua@ifad.org

Queries with respect to the response of the Independent
Office of Evaluation to the report should be addressed
to:

Luciano Lavizzari
Director
Independent Office of Evaluation of IFAD
Tel.: +39 06 5459 2274
e-mail: l.lavizzari@ifad.org

Dispatch of documentation:

Deirdre McGrenra
Head, Governing Bodies Office
Tel.: +39 06 5459 2374
e-mail: gb_office@ifad.org

Executive Board — 106th Session
Rome, 20-21 September 2012

For: Information

Contents

Abbreviations and acronyms	ii
Categories used for the classification of agreement at completion point agreed actions	iii
A. Country Programme Evaluation	1
India: Country Programme Evaluation	1
Kenya: Country Programme Evaluation	6
Niger: Country Programme Evaluation	10
B. Completion Evaluation	13
Dominican Republic: South Western Region Small Farmers Project - Phase II	13
Laos: Oudomxai Community Initiatives Support Project	15
C. Interim Evaluation	17
Ethiopia: Rural Financial Intermediation Programme	17
Mauritania: Poverty Reduction Project in Aftout South and Karakoro	19
Rwanda: Smallholder Cash and Export Crops Development Project	23
Uganda: Vegetable Oil Development Project	25
D. Corporate Level Evaluation	28
IFAD's Private Sector Development and Partnership Strategy	28

Abbreviations and acronyms

AFD	Agence Française de Développement (French bilateral development agency)
APR	Asia and the Pacific Division
ASAL	Arid and semi-arid land
CFS	Controller's and Financial Services Division
CGIAR	Consultative Group on International Agricultural Research
COSOP	Country Strategic Opportunities Paper
CPO	Country program officer
DEA	Department of Economic Affairs
DRR	Disaster Risk Reduction
ECD	Environment and Climate Division
e-PROMIS	Electronic Projects Monitoring System (Kenya)
ESA	Eastern and South Africa Division
GIZ	Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (German development agency)
GRDR	Rural Development Research Group
HR	Human Resources
I3N	Initiative for Nigeriens Feeding Nigeriens (Niger)
ICAR	Indian Council of Agricultural Research
ICO	IFAD Country Office
ICRAF	International Center for Research in Agroforestry (now World Agroforestry Centre)
ICRISAT	International Crops Research Institute for the Semi-Arid Tropics
ICT	Information and communication technology
JRM	Joint Review Mission
KfW	Kreditanstalt für Wiederaufbau (German development bank)
LAC	Latin America and Caribbean Division
NEN	Near East, North Africa and Europe Division
NRLM	National Rural Livelihoods Mission (India)
PASK	Poverty Reduction Project in Aftout South and Karakoro (Mauritania)
PBAS	Performance Based Allocation System
PMU	Project management unit
ProGRN	Natural Resource Management Programme (Mauritania)
ProLPRAF	Value Chains Development Programme for Poverty Reduction (Mauritania)
PTA	Policy and Technical Advisory Division
RUFIP	Rural Financial Intermediation Programme (Ethiopia)
RUSACCO	Rural savings and credit cooperatives (Ethiopia)
ToR	Terms of Reference
UTaNRMP	Upper Tana Catchment Natural Resource Management Project
WATS	Withdrawal Application Tracking System
WCA	West and Central Africa Division

Categories used for the classification of agreement at completion point agreed actions

CE completion evaluation
 CLE corporate level evaluation
 CPE country programme evaluation

SN serial number

Level

IFAD IFAD corporate level
 REG IFAD regional level
 CTRY IFAD country level
 GOV government authorities (national, local level and institutions)
 PROJ project

Nature

PLCY policy
 STR strategy development, including COSOPs and projects
 OPER operational and implementation

Themes

ASR analysis, studies and researches
 BEN beneficiaries and stakeholders' participation and consultation
 COS Country Strategic Opportunities Programme (COSOP)
 DEC decentralization
 DES project design
 DIA policy dialogue
 FLD field presence
 GDR gender (including targeting to women)
 GOV governance
 HR human resources (management, recruitment)
 INF infrastructure (construction, contracting, management, supervision)
 INN innovation
 KM knowledge management
 NRM natural resource management
 ORG organizations, groups, institutions and collective approaches
 PAR partnership
 PRM private sector, market and enterprise development
 PMA project management and administration
 RFI rural finance
 RME results monitoring, evaluation
 SCA replication and scaling up
 STRA strategy
 SUP supervision
 SUS sustainability
 TCB training, capacity-building
 TGT targeting

Agreement at completion point recommendations and follow-up action taken by the Programme Management Department

A. Country Programme Evaluation

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
India: Country Programme Evaluation							
India	CPE	1	CTRY	STR	COS	Sustainable smallholder agriculture should be included as a thrust area in the new COSOP, as an engine for promoting pro-poor growth and reducing hunger and rural poverty. This would include an emphasis on promoting the viability and risk-management of farming activities by smallholder farmers, with specific attention to rainfed areas with emphasis also on in-situ water conservation, livestock development, and crop production, including staple cereal and pulse productivity.	The new COSOP was discussed at the May 2011 Executive Board included explicit text on smallholder agriculture. It also specified a geographic focus on rainfed areas. It also included text to emphasize water conservation and the other issues highlighted.
India	CPE	2	CTRY	STR	TGT	In future, greater emphasis should be devoted to smallholder farmers but also continue to support rural women and tribal. The geographic focus should in principle be narrowed to a smaller group of states, and not expanded beyond the 11 states covered by ongoing operations.	The new COSOP contains smallholder farmers as the primary target group. A focus on women and tribal has also included. The geographic focus in the new COSOP is limited to the 11 states covered by ongoing projects.
India	CPE	3	CTRY	OPER	DES	Two-state projects through one loan and one supervision budget should be avoided in the future.	Two state projects have been stopped from 2011. This is evidenced by the new pipeline in the COSOP. Both the new projects are one state projects.
India	CPE	4	CTRY	OPER	COS	Given IFAD's positive experiences in India and other countries (e.g., the Philippines), opportunities to work in conflict areas could be pursued in consultation with Government. This will however require projects to include in crisis prevention measures (e.g., flexibility in terms of project area coverage).	The focus on conflict areas has been maintained in the new COSOP (including areas in the North-East, Jharkhand and Orissa). This is evidenced by the new project design in Jharkhand for approval by the Board in December 2012.
India	CPE	5	CTRY	OPER	SUP	Adequate expertise would need to be mobilised for supervision and implementation support purposes.	Adequate expertize is mobilized on a consistent basis. All missions are led by senior mission leaders. All mission reports are subject to quality assurance in IFAD HQ. The quality assurance reviews in 2011 reported that the quality of India supervision reports is high.
India	CPE	6	CTRY	STR	PAR	The partnership with the private sector should be enhanced further, to deliver rural finance and extension services to the rural poor, provide input supply and access to agro-processing infrastructure, facilitate transport of agricultural produce to market points, promote innovations	The new COSOP contains an emphasis on the private sector as follows: (i) a specific strategic objective on access to financial services and value chains is included; (ii) opportunities for innovation in the areas of value chains and ICT (information and communication technology) has been included; (iii)

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
						and up-scaling, make information and communication technology more widely available in rural areas, and so on.	reference to the ongoing private sector partnership with the Ratan Tata Trust has been included.
India	CPE	7	CTRY	STR	INN	The main aim of IFAD-funded projects and programme in India in the future should be to promote pro-poor innovations that can be replicated and upscaled by government, other donors, the private sector, and others. It is therefore recommended that the new COSOP include a well-defined innovation agenda, which would outline the areas that merit to be prioritised.	The new COSOP contains a well-defined innovation agenda (see section IV C for details). It contains emphasis on renewable energy, climate change, remittances and micro insurance, fair and effective value chains, and ICT.
India	CPE	8	CTRY	STR	SCA	The country strategy should make explicit the approach that will be pursued for replication and upscaling.	The new COSOP includes a well-defined approach to replication and upscaling. This is evidenced by the inclusion of an upscaling concept note for both the Uttarakhand and Jharkhand projects, both of which have been formulated.
India	CPE	9	CTRY	OPER	PAR	Opportunities for developing and strengthening partnerships with national institutions, such as the Indian Council for Agricultural Research, but also the private sector including foundations, for the implementation of this recommendation should be actively explored.	The new COSOP contains an emphasis on private sector as follows: (i) a specific strategic objective on access to financial services and value chains is included; (ii) opportunities for innovation in the areas of value chains and ICT has been included; (iii) reference to ongoing private sector partnership with the Ratan Tata Trust has been included. In addition, in response to a request from DEA (Department of Economic Affairs), IFAD is planning a national level workshop in October 2012 to define linkages with ICAR (Indian Council of Agricultural Research) and CGIAR (Consultative Group on International Agricultural Research) institutions in India.
India	CPE	10	CTRY	STR	PAR	Partnership with NGOs and other rural institutions need to be further expanded in order to scout for, develop, pilot test and assess innovations emerging from the grassroots level.	The new COSOP includes a commitment to continue to partner with NGOs. NGOs are the main field level implementing partners in both the new IFAD projects in the 2010-12 PBAS (Performance Based Allocation System) cycle.
India	CPE	11	CTRY	OPER	KM	The new COSOP should include a distinct and clearly resourced knowledge programme. One of the key aims of the programme would be to fill any knowledge gaps on agriculture and rural development and more generally in rural poverty reduction in the country. It could be funded by grants, but also supported by individual operations financed through loans.	The new COSOP includes a specific cross cutting objective to share knowledge and learning. In response to a request from DEA, IFAD is assisting DEA to set up a knowledge sharing website. Furthermore, there is a full time knowledge management officer in the ICO (IFAD Country Office). "IFAD in India" newsletters are now produced every 6 months to share knowledge.
India	CPE	12	CTRY	STR	STR	There must be greater convergence within government-funded programmes, and between operations and other donor-funded activities and Government-assisted programmes.	Convergence is a central theme of both the new IFAD projects in India, and is also a key issue looked at in all supervision missions for ongoing projects.

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
India	CPE	13	CTRY	STR	ASR	Deeper convergence with government will require in-depth analysis during project design of other ongoing or planned development initiatives in the districts to be covered by IFAD-supported projects.	In depth analysis on convergence was undertaken during the designs of both new IFAD projects in the 2010-2012 PBAS cycle. An NRLM (National Rural Livelihoods Mission) convergence action plan is being prepared for all ongoing projects in India, following a high level meeting between IFAD and Ministry of Rural Development.
India	CPE	14	CTRY	STR	PAR	One way of ensuring convergence is to link project management units more directly with state and district administrations, so convergence can be facilitated during project execution.	Both new IFAD projects in India are implemented by State Government administrations. In the case of Uttarakhand, the convergence with NRLM is automatic, due to the fact that the lead project agency is the same department. District and Block level PMUs (project management units) of all projects work closely with the District and Block level administration; their plans are incorporated in the District Plans in most instances.
India	CPE	15	CTRY	OPER	ORG	IFAD-supported projects should build and strengthen the communities' capacity to access the available schemes of different Government's departments.	All IFAD supported projects work on this principle - i.e. assist IFAD project groups become vehicles for receipt of services from other government programmes such as MGNREGA (Mahatma Gandhi National Rural Employment Guarantee Act) and NRLM and various social security schemes of the government.
India	CPE	16	CTRY	OPER	PAR	In coordination with the Department of External Affairs, IFAD needs to engage more proactively with the central Ministries, especially Ministry of Agriculture and Ministry of Rural Development, to leverage their expertise and experience to focus on some of the important areas that help achieve sustainable livelihoods in the agricultural sector.	High level meetings between IFAD's President and Ministers from the Ministry of Rural Development, Ministry of Agriculture, Ministry of Tribal Affairs, and Ministry of Women's Affairs were held in November 2011.
India	CPE	17	CTRY	STR	PAR	A wider partnership with key central Ministries can provide an opportunity for the Fund to contribute towards shaping the design of centrally sponsored schemes and national policies and acts, building on IFAD's own priorities and experiences in the country.	High level meetings between IFAD's President and Ministers from the Ministry of Rural Development, Ministry of Agriculture, Ministry of Tribal Affairs, and Ministry of Women's Affairs were held in November 2011.
India	CPE	18	CTRY	OPER	PAR	IFAD should encourage exposure visits of central government officials to project areas.	DEA officials visited JTDP (Jharkhand Tribal Development Programme) in 2011.
India	CPE	19	GOV	STR	DES	State Governments need to be involved from the very beginning of project design to ensure that they take full responsibility of the activities and act on the issues that IFAD-supported operations are recurrently facing.	Both new IFAD projects (Uttarakhand and Jharkhand) originated through State Government requests and home grown Concept Notes.
India	CPE	20	GOV	OPER	STR	State Government should ensure: (i) smooth flow of funds; ii) timely provision of counterpart funds; (iii) their direct participation in Joint Review Missions; (iv) timely follow-up on agreed recommendations; (v) ensure competitive and attractive salaries and allowances, including their	There are no current problems with flow-of-funds. All supervision missions are undertaken jointly with State Governments - they are called Joint Review Missions (JRM's). Follow-up on mission recommendations is excellent in most cases. In 2011, three projects moved out of the problem status. Salary structures range

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
						timely adjustments, so as to recruit and retain highly qualified project staff, including NGO staff; and (vi) and last but not least, continuity of tenure of Project Directors and key-management staff.	from being very competitive to being very uncompetitive across projects. Project Directors continue to rotate frequently in some States (for example Tamil Nadu, Madhya Pradesh and Maharashtra). Often, this is due to state-level political issues.
India	CPE	21	CTRY	STR	STR	IFAD should consider increasing the average loan size of the operations in the country and undertaking fewer projects in the next COSOP cycle.	IFAD has moved from a model of three projects every three years to two projects every three years. This has led to a big increase in loan size. The loan size for Uttarakhand was US\$90 million - the largest in IFAD's history. The loan size for Jharkhand is US\$50 million.
India	CPE	22	CTRY	OPER	COS	Given the size of the programme, the country and the number of rural poor, it is recommended that financing larger projects should not result in a commensurate cut in IFAD's administrative budget allocated towards country programme management.	The 2012 India budget allocation has seen a very marginal decline compared to the 2011 budget execution. Big reductions in unit costs have been achieved. Formulation costs are now as low as US\$80 000. Supervision mission costs are now as low as US\$30 000. This has mostly been achieved by relying on local expertise and mission teams comprised of national consultants.
India	CPE	23	CTRY	OPER	FLD	There is a need to further strengthen the IFAD country office in India, including the out posting of the country programme manager (CPM) to Delhi and appointment of a full-time coordinator. In general, a strengthened country office is required to enhance project supervision and implementation support, improve policy dialogue, strengthen cooperation and harmonisation with other donors, and further facilitate follow-up on supervision and mid-term review decisions.	This is subject to IFAD's Country Presence Policy and Strategy approved by the EB in Sept. 2011, which sets out the policy for outposting CPMs and opening up sub-regional offices. The India Country Office has been strengthened with the appointment of a senior Country Coordinator in September 2011. IFAD has committed to outpost the CPM by the end of 2015. The Host Country Agreement is currently being drafted for negotiations with the Government of India.
India	CPE	24	CTRY	OPER	FLD	The role, priorities and organisation of the India country office will need to be reconsidered in developing the new COSOP and implementing the CPE recommendations.	The ICO structure was fully re-organized in November 2011. There is now a full time financial management focal point, an M&E focal point, and a KM focal point. In addition there are two senior project focal points.
India	CPE	25	CTRY	OPER	FLD	In this regard, the opportunities, challenges and budgetary implications of out posting the India CPM should be examined in order to bring full decision making and follow-up actions related to IFAD operations closer to the country level.	IFAD has committed to outpost the CPM by the end of 2015. The budget implications of outposting the CPM will be examined and will be clear when the process of outposting progresses further. More active follow-up at the country level has now been enabled through the appointment of the Country Coordinator in September 2011.
India	CPE	26	CTRY	OPER	HR	Country office staff should be provided with fixed-term contracts and better mainstreamed into IFAD's overall work force, to provide greater job security and incentives and improve performance.	All country staff is now on IFAD contracts.

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
India	CPE	27	CTRY	OPER	FLD	The current hosting arrangements with WFP should be reconsidered, especially in light of the cost escalation in services charged by WFP, and the merits of hiring alternative premises analysed.	The current hosting arrangements with WFP were reviewed and they are working very well. The cost escalation has not happened due to the fact that all contracting is now done by HQ and not by WFP. Presently there is no reason to find alternative premises.
India	CPE	28	CTRY	OPER	FLD	The office infrastructure also needs upgrading, for example, in terms of space and information technology facilities, which are currently constraining the work of the office, inter alia, such as the access to IFAD databases and reports at headquarters.	All country staff have access to IFAD databases. Country staff are now responsible for directly uploading to the corporate databases, for example upload of RIMS data, Audit Reports, WAs (Withdrawal Applications) into WATS (Withdrawal Application Tracking System) etc. Resources are available to replace computers if this becomes necessary.
India	CPE	29	GOV	OPER	HR	Central Government and State Government shall endeavour to ensure continuity in project directors to the extent possible.	In some States (for example Tamil Nadu, Madhya Pradesh and Maharashtra), there is still very poor continuity of project directors. In other projects (Uttarakhand, North-East), the continuity of project directors has improved.
India	CPE	30	CTRY	OPER	HR	IFAD and the Government could consider alternatives including, inter alia, recruiting from the open market or deputing senior level staff from established civil society organizations.	Alternatives were considered during the design of both the new projects in Uttarakhand and Jharkhand. Usually, the government nominates a civil services officials. In the case of Jharkhand, in order to maintain continuity, the incumbent project director was appointed. In the case of Uttarakhand, the discussions are ongoing about the recruitment process.
India	CPE	31	CTRY	OPER	STR	Some measures should be deployed to improve efficiency, including streamlining the flow of funds to limit implementation delays, strengthen the capacity in the project management unit but also state governments in procurement and other loan administration issues, and ensuring the assignment and continuity of staff to the project with adequate expertise and experience in project management.	Disbursement performance improved from US\$10 million in 2010 to US\$30 million in 2011 as a result of streamlining the WA process and flow-of funds. The time taken for WA processing also decreased by 5 days in 2011 due to the decentralization of some loan administration functions to the ICO. The time taken for procurement reviews improved in 2011 with the recruitment of a procurement specialist on retainer contract. A target of 5 days has been established for IFAD procurement reviews.
India	CPE	32	CTRY	OPER	COS	The management should conduct a detailed cost analysis during the formulation of the next COSOP and make the necessary allocations commensurate with the size, focus and coverage of IFAD-supported activities in the country.	A detailed cost analysis has been undertaken. With the CPE recommendation of larger projects limited to one state, the overall number of ongoing projects drops from 12 in 2011 to 7 in 2016. This reduces the annual supervision budget in India by 42%. Annual design costs will remain constant with two new designs every three years. With the huge drop in the size of the country programme, it is anticipated that the number of ICO staff would drop to 3 in 2016 (a cost saving of 40%). This would bring the ICO size back in line with the IFAD corporate recommendation for maximum number of 3 ICO staff.

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
India	CPE	33	CTRY	OPER	RME	In close collaboration with the Asia and the Pacific Division, IOE will explore opportunities for supporting the Planning Commission's efforts to establish an independent evaluation outfit in India. Given its mandate and specialisation, IFAD's contribution will be restricted to evaluation capacity development in the agriculture and rural sectors. This will include initiatives to further enhance project-level monitoring and evaluation systems, so that they are also equipped to effectively collect, analyse and report on results and impact in addition to the achievement of physical and financial targets.	IOE has updated Management that IOE has held numerous discussions with the Planning Commission (Abhijit Sen) and the Ministry of Finance (several staff) on independent evaluation in India. In fact, in early 2011, the Government of India indeed established an Independent Evaluation Office, and further discussions are on-going (with the head of the office, Abhijit Banerjee) on how IOE can support their activities and capabilities in the future.
Kenya: Country Programme Evaluation							
Kenya	CPE	1	CTRY	STR	COS	The next COSOP should be built on the foundations of IFAD's comparative advantage and specialization in Kenya. The new COSOP should specify that IFAD will include loan-funded investments in the arid and semi-arid lands, which has a large untapped economic potential (e.g., in irrigated crop farming and livestock development) and is home to around 50 per cent of all rural poor in Kenya.	PMD has requested the Government to indicate a priority project for inclusion as Concept Note in the formulation of the next COSOP, and has also reminded the Government of the need for investments in arid and semi-arid lands (ASALs).
Kenya	CPE	2	CTRY	STR	COS	The COSOP should specifically analyse, among other issues, the poverty profile of the rural poor in arid and semi-arid lands, the prevailing institutional capacities and infrastructure to support economic development, as well as the opportunities for partnership with other donors who could provide essential complementary inputs.	This is reflected in the TOR for COSOP formulation. IFAD has contributed to the formulation of the "Joint Initiative between the Government of Kenya (GoK) and Rome-based Agencies on Disaster Risk Reduction (DRR) and Resilience Building in the ASALs of Kenya" but IFAD role in implementation from 2013 will be determined by provisions in the new COSOP. The COSOP Terms of Reference (ToR) specifically highlights these recommendations of the CPE: analysis of the poverty profile of the rural poor, institutional analysis and opportunities for partnerships.
Kenya	CPE	3	CTRY	STR	COS	The COSOP should clearly define a narrower set of sub-sectors to prioritise in the future, including commodity value chain development with greater engagement of the private sector, small-scale participatory irrigation development especially in the arid and semi-arid lands, livestock development, agriculture technology to enhance productivity and long-term soil fertility, and natural resources and environmental management.	This is reflected in the ToR for COSOP formulation: highlighting that the COSOP should clearly define a narrower set of sub-sectors including commodity value chain development.

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
Kenya	CPE	4	CTRY	STR	COS	The COSOP should explicitly articulate thematic areas that will not be covered by IFAD interventions in the future, including domestic water supply, health and sanitation, as they are not areas where IFAD has a comparative advantage.	This is reflected in the ToR for COSOP formulation: clearly stating that the COSOP should articulate thematic areas that will not be covered by IFAD in the future, including domestic water supply, health and sanitation.
Kenya	CPE	5	CTRY	STR	BEN	IFAD should continue working on community development and promote participatory and bottom-up approaches to agriculture and rural development.	The newly designed and approved project- Upper Tana Catchment Natural Resource Management Project (UTaNRMP) - sufficiently addresses this. The project will be delivered through community empowerment- it aims at engaging communities to develop and implement plans related to NRM, thereby promoting a truly participatory and bottom-up approach to agricultural and rural development.
Kenya	CPE	6	CTRY	STR	ORG	IFAD should continue working on building strong grass-roots institutions.	This is sufficiently addressed in UTaNRMP; a number of crucial project benefits will be delivered by building strong grassroots institutions. This includes strengthening key community organisations with increased capacities to manage natural resources sustainably.
Kenya	CPE	7	CTRY	STR	GDR	IFAD should continue working on investing in gender equality and women's empowerment.	The UTaNRMP specifically addresses the roles of, and opportunities for, women. A special focus in terms of targeting will be on women, and on the activities they are traditionally engaged in (fuel wood collection and domestic water supply) which utilise natural resources.
Kenya	CPE	8	CTRY	STR	PRM	IFAD's renowned development approach should be weaved into its broader efforts aimed at commercialization and promoting small farming as a business.	The development approach traditionally adopted by IFAD has been utilised in new projects. This includes building community institutions for sustainable use of natural resources. The emphasis on income-generating activities will also be achieved through community-based income generating groups (this will be maintained, because project technical staff will also emphasize and focus on their technical areas). Therefore, while the aim might be to promote small farming as a business, the implementation is still through IFAD's development approach.
Kenya	CPE	9	CTRY	STR	INN	The next COSOP should clearly highlight areas where innovation will be pursued in the country programme, following a thorough assessment of areas where the introduction of innovation in agriculture can contribute to better results in reducing rural poverty.	This is reflected in the ToR for COSOP formulation (the first mission to be held in May 2012), requiring that clear areas for innovation should be highlighted. Objectives and scope of work also include identifying opportunities for innovation within each of the strategic objectives, including existing activities/ initiatives with potential to be scaled up.

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
Kenya	CPE	10	CTRY	STR	SCA	The new COSOP should devote emphasis to scaling up for wider poverty impact. This will however require greater investment in building partnership with multilateral development banks and other donors as well as engage the Government in policy dialogue, based on good practice examples and lessons emerging from the field.	This is reflected in the ToR for COSOP formulation, emphasizing scaling up for wider poverty impact. Specific objectives also include articulating a clear link between scaling up and the objectives and indicators in the results matrix and defining the drivers, spaces and pathways for scaling up.
Kenya	CPE	11	CTRY	STR	COS	The new COSOP should more precisely articulate how the various IFAD instruments (loans, regional and country grants, policy dialogue, partnership building and knowledge management) will complement each other and contribute towards the achievement of country programme objectives.	This is reflected in the ToR for COSOP formulation, emphasizing the need for articulating how the various instruments will complement each other and contribute towards achievement of country program objectives. The specific objectives include examining the full range of instruments including loans, grants, policy dialogue, partnerships, knowledge management, pooled financing arrangements and scaling up.
Kenya	CPE	12	CTRY	STR	COS	The non-lending activities will need to be resourced adequately, if they are to truly contribute to strengthening coherence within the country programme.	This will be reflected in the formulation of the COSOP and in annual budgeting exercise. The TOR already specifies that non-lending activities will need to be adequately resourced. A closer examination of various non-lending activities including knowledge management, policy dialogue and partnerships has been specified in the objectives and scope of work.
Kenya	CPE	13	CTRY	STR	DIA	In terms of priority for policy dialogue, based on the experience from IFAD-supported projects, the Fund could support Government in developing new and refining existing policies for livestock development especially in arid and semi-arid areas, water management, and private sector engagement in small scale agriculture.	The formulation of the COSOP will provide an entry point for this; this is reflected in the TOR. Specifically, under the COSOP, IFAD would support the formulation of policies for the Dairy Industry, Feed and Fertilizer, and Horticulture, and participate actively in policy dialogue with government and other donors related to the ASALS.
Kenya	CPE	14	CTRY	OPER	PAR	Partnerships with the AfDB, FAO, USAID and World Bank should be strengthened, especially in identifying options for co-financing operations and scaling up, as well as undertaking joint policy dialogue with Government on key agriculture and rural development issues.	The formulation of the COSOP will provide an entry point for this emphasis. The formulation team will consult with various partners in finalising the COSOP.
Kenya	CPE	15	GOV	STR	STR	The Government will need to ensure that it puts in place the necessary supporting policy and institutional framework, as well as allocate the required resources, that will lead to the regeneration of pro-poor growth in the country's agriculture sector.	The rationalization of the agriculture sector ministries in line with the new Constitution will also rationalize resource allocation to the sector.
Kenya	CPE	16	GOV	OPER	PMA	The Government will need to ensure that its auditing, financial and procurement systems are strengthened to ensure responsible use of IFAD loan funds, as well as work towards increasing its share of counterpart funds in IFAD-supported projects.	The e-PROMIS (Electronic Projects Monitoring System) has been rolled out to improve financial management information.

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
Kenya	CPE	17	CTRY	OPER	TCB	IFAD can provide support to capacity building of government officials for better service delivery at the local level, support the Government in the implementation of the national irrigation policy, and contribute to improving its financial and procurement systems to ensure more timely flow of funds and due diligence in use of resources.	Capacity building at the local government level is integral to IFAD projects and Government endorsement of small-scale irrigation will enable support for irrigation policy.
Kenya	CPE	18	CTRY	OPER	FLD	The country office could play a greater role in evidence-based policy processes, which will however require allocating the required resources and time.	A CPO (country program officer) recruited in October 2011 is enhancing the capacity of the Country Office in policy dialogue.
Kenya	CPE	19	CTRY	OPER	DIA	The role of the CPM in policy dialogue should also be reflected adequately in his/her annual performance evaluation system objectives.	This is reflected in the CPM's objectives in E-performance.
Kenya	CPE	20	REG	STR	FLD	It is essential that the relationships between the Kenya country office and the IFAD regional office in East and Southern Africa be rapidly outlined and communicated to all concerned in Kenya and throughout the region.	The relationships will be further outlined following the visit by the new ESA Director and the HR Advisor to Nairobi. At the Nairobi Office retreat in January 2012, it was proposed to make the Nairobi Office an IFAD Regional Office at Nairobi (IRON) since it now has staff from Eastern and South Africa Division (ESA), Regional Finance Officer (CFS), Environment and Climate Division (ECD) and partly Policy and Technical Advisory Division (PTA). Another idea that was mooted was to reinforce the exchange of expertise and experience between ESA and Western and Central Africa Division (WCA) and the inclusion of some WCA countries in the workload of the Nairobi CFS staff.
Kenya	CPE	21	REG	STR	FLD	The regional office's organizational structure should be articulated clearly, including its relationships with headquarters and the various country programmes in the region, the technical expertise that should be housed there, and its work programme.	The formalization of relationships between the regional office and headquarters, and the country programmes, and the technical expertise to be housed in Nairobi will be further advanced following the visit of the new ESA Director and Human Resources (HR) Advisor to Nairobi in April 2012. Since June 2011, the following additional staff have joined the Nairobi Office: Country Programme Officer (03/10/11), environment and climate change specialist (09/01/12) and a financial Intern (30/01/12). The process to recruit a Regional Finance Officer (CFS) is ongoing.
Kenya	CPE	22	REG	OPER	FLD	It would be advisable to develop specific indicators that can be used to evaluate the performance and contribution of the regional office at an appropriate time in the future, including indicators that might shed light on value for money of the regional office.	The indicators will be revisited after the visit of the ESA Director and HR Advisor. In the meantime, the vision for the Nairobi Office defined at the retreat in January is: "Work together seamlessly as one organization to maximize IFAD impacts in East and Southern Africa - so as to be recognized as an effective partner in alleviating rural poverty"

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
Kenya	CPE	23	REG	OPER	FLD	Similarly, it would be useful for ESA to prepare a periodic progress report on the regional office for the IFAD Senior Management, outlining the achievements and challenges of such a decentralised organizational arrangement.	The ESA Director will outline the reporting framework after the visit to Nairobi.
Niger: Country Programme Evaluation							
Niger	CPE	1	CTRY	STR	DES	The next IFAD project financed through the 2010-2012 PBAS allocation should aim at diversifying sources of rural income, paying special attention to irrigated market gardening, livestock, and off-farm income-generating activities to reduce dependence on the traditional rain-fed production system which is in crisis and suffers from significant risks (drought, market fluctuations, etc.)	Under the 2010-12 PBAS, 3 projects have been financed to promote food and nutrition security (including through small-scale irrigation development and Rural SME). This includes 2 projects under 2010-2012 PBAS (approved in Dec 2010 and Dec 2011) and one under the Spanish Trust Fund (to be presented in Sep 2012); they all include a focus on income diversification including through small-scale livestock and irrigated market gardening.
Niger	CPE	2	CTRY	STR	PRM	The project should promote access by the rural poor to markets and the reinforcement of private services (suppliers of inputs, rural financial services, etc.) taking a cross-cutting approach based on partnerships.	The new project (Food Security and Development Support Project in the Maradi Region-PASADEM, approved in Dec 2011) focuses on the access of farmers organisations to the five main rural markets in the Maradi. The new project will scale up by promoting access of farmers organisations (FOs) to rural markets in Tahoua and Zinder. With regard to partnerships, the joint programme (a coordination mechanism between the government and UN agencies to coordinate activities in the Maradi region) is to be signed in May 2012.
Niger	CPE	3	CTRY	STR	TGT	At least for the four-year period covered by the ARDDI-ISC (Agricultural and Rural Rehabilitation and Development Initiative Project- Institutional Strengthening Component), means and efforts should continue to be focused on the Maradi region, which has been targeted since the 2006 COSOP. The next project, oriented to the diversification of income, should focus, at least initially, on the 56 communities covered by the ARDDI-ISC in order to develop stronger managerial capacity in the communes and the deconcentrated technical services.	The four ongoing projects all have a focus on the 56 communities and the Maradi region. The latest project (Food Security and Development Support Project in the Maradi Region or PASADEM) continues this focus on the Maradi region. On the basis of the experience gained in the Maradi region, IFAD is starting to scale up its activities to the Tahoua and Zinder regions. But the main focus continues to be, as recommended, the Maradi region.
Niger	CPE	4	CTRY	STR	PAR	IFAD should support the process of regionalization of the rural development strategy for Maradi, as the Government would like to see, and fully integrate IFAD financed interventions within the regional strategy, which will then constitute the programme which the Government would control.	The government's rural development strategy (SDR) has now been replaced by a new food security and agricultural development strategy (I3N- Initiative for Nigeriens Feeding Nigeriens). Therefore, this recommendation in its current form is no longer relevant. In the context of the new strategy, IFAD's operations are fully integrated in the new I3N strategy.

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
Niger	CPE	5	CTRY	STR	COS	The process of developing the new COSOP and, in particular all the analyses that will support it, should be used to provide the Government and the technical and financial partners operating in the region with a deeper understanding of local constraints and opportunities in rural development.	The new COSOP is based on a broad participatory process, including the Government and technical and financial partners working in the region. Also, local constraints and experiences from past projects have been taken into consideration in developing the COSOP and in the interactions with partners including national and provincial governments.
Niger	CPE	6	CTRY	STR	PAR	The strategic guidelines and procedures for implementing IFAD's new COSOP should be defined jointly with the national and regional governments and the technical and financial partners active in the Maradi region.	The guidelines and procedures will be elaborated in 2012. The consultations include the government both in the centre and in the provinces- including Maradi, as well as Tahoua and Zinder- and technical and financial partners.
Niger	CPE	7	CTRY	STR	COS	The new COSOP should make provision for non-lending activities to assist the local partners (government and civil society) in preparing the rural development strategy for the Maradi region, and to support coordination of its implementation, and its monitoring and evaluation.	The rural development strategy (SDR) has been replaced by the I3N. Also see recommendation 4 (in the context of the new strategy, IFAD's operations are fully integrated in the new I3N strategy).
Niger	CPE	8	GOV	STR	PAR	The Maradi letter of understanding and the recently-created coordination mechanism between the Government and the technical and financial partners in the Maradi region should be re-examined in light of their contribution to implementing the regional rural development strategy.	The joint program to be signed in May (which will signify a coordination mechanism between UN agencies and government) will contribute to the I3N.
Niger	CPE	9	CTRY	STR	INN	The fields in which IFAD has built up some experience in Niger and for which it is necessary to find innovative solutions are primarily natural resource management, small-scale irrigation, access to land, access to markets, and strengthening the means of action of marginalized social groups, particularly women. Other pertinent fields undoubtedly merit greater attention, such as sedentary livestock raising and off-farm activities (processing of farm products, crafts, services, etc.).	IFAD projects will continue working on agro-pastoral systems, so there is a focus on small livestock. There will also be a continued focus on off-farm activities including market access, micro-businesses for women, food processing (including paddy processing).
Niger	CPE	10	CTRY	STR	INN	IFAD and the Government should make full use of the experience of beneficiary-targeting approach with regard to the identification and promotion of innovations in the rural world without, however, neglecting to capitalize on innovations and extend them beyond the projects and the Maradi region.	The new IFAD program will extend its focus to the neighbouring Tahoua and Zinder regions. This will be done by scaling up the lessons learnt from experiences in the Maradi region- including in terms of the beneficiary-targeting approach, promotion of innovations and natural resource management.
Niger	CPE	11	CTRY	STR	SCA	It is essential for IFAD's new COSOP to develop a realistic strategy to promote the scaling up of innovations produced from interventions in the field, making full use of non-lending activities, being: (i) partnerships between communities, universities, and research institutions, and	Under the new COSOP, IFAD will be partnering with universities and research institutions, including University of Amsterdam, ICRAF (International Centre for Research in Agroforestry now World Agroforestry Centre), ICRISAT (International Crops Research Institute for the Semi-Arid Tropics) and other CGIAR

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
						projects to engage in research and development and to identify local innovations, monitor their scaling up, and report regularly; (ii) knowledge management to ensure the capitalisation and dissemination of innovations by means that are appropriate for the different publics; and (iii) coordination to promote institutional ownership of innovations.	(Consultative Group on International Agricultural Research) institutions. The objective is to identify local solutions for scaling up. Relevant community material is also being developed by project management and aimed at a policy-level audience. A capacity analysis of different institutions was conducted in order to promote local ownership.
Niger	CPE	12	CTRY	STR	PAR	Given the wide differences in the capacity of public and private service providers in Niger in the technical and managerial fields, partners for project implementation should be chosen more selectively, based on their capacity.	A capacity analysis of implementing partners was conducted during the design of the last two projects (approved in Dec 2010 and Dec 2011). This ensured that implementation partners were selected more selectively, based on their respective capacities.
Niger	CPE	13	CTRY	STR	TCB	Adequate technical assistance should be provided destined to be phased out over time. Such assistance should concern technical fields in which capacity is not yet available locally, as well as the administrative and financial management of projects.	International technical assistance on M&E, fiduciary aspects and financial management have been provided to project teams. This exercise was conducted over 2011-2012, and was performed for all the ongoing projects and for the projects under design.
Niger	CPE	14	PROJ	STR	DES	It is necessary to seek simplicity in project objectives and activities, given the implementation capacity of the partners which should, however, gradually improve.	Projects' Logframe are simplified during supervision and design missions. Specifically, all project logframes have been simplified over 2011-2012.
Niger	CPE	15	CTRY	OPER	DES	In view of the often unforeseeable nature of developments in Niger, sufficient flexibility should be built into the design of interventions so they can be adapted in function of how the situation evolves.	IFAD's projects displayed flexibility to adequately respond to the food and pastoral crises in 2009-10 and 2011-12. Some specific measures taken include recapitalization with small ruminants, food cereal community based banks, and cash for work.
Niger	CPE	16	CTRY	OPER	SUP	Supervision and implementation support to the activities financed by IFAD should be further strengthened with enhanced participation by IFAD, the Government, and the other partners involved.	This has been addressed and joint supervision missions are now carried out by IFAD, Government of Nigeria, World Bank, World Food Programme and the Belgian Survival Fund (now Belgian Fund for Food Security).
Niger	CPE	17	CTRY	OPER	SUP	The length and frequency of supervisory missions should be increased and lending agencies with international standing should be called upon to provide regular technical assistance commensurate with needs.	Regular technical assistance is provided. However increased length and frequency of supervision missions is also subject to budget availability: currently the country programme does not have enough resources for more than one supervision mission per year. Also insecurity in the project area implies that missions cannot be very long due to security reasons. In particular, insecurity in the project areas limits the mobilisation of international TA.

B. Completion Evaluation

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
Dominican Republic: South Western Region Small Farmers Project - Phase II							
Dominican Republic	CE	1	CTRY	STR	DES	Ensure an institutional and policy anchor for new projects at an institution specializing in rural development, within the framework of the new policies and strategies of the Government of the Dominican Republic.	The IFAD country programme (two loans) is currently under the responsibility of the Ministry of Agriculture. However, the Ministry of Economy and Planning which is the institution responsible for the 2010-2030 National Development Strategy participates in the Steering Committee of the IFAD-funded projects.
Dominican Republic	CE	2	CTRY	STR	PAR	Closer relations are recommended with various public entities – both central and municipal – as well as with other development projects and private entities, to identify possible synergies and achieve a more solid base for new project activities in the area.	At COSOP formulation and project design stage, a large consultation process was carried out. Efforts to develop such a network are underway in the case of the project being implemented in the Western provinces.
Dominican Republic	CE	3	CTRY	STR	TGT	Improve the definitions of the target population, indicating those units to which the project is addressed (families, individual microenterprises, grass-roots organizations, communities); and ensure a clear differentiation of the set of "instruments-interventions-timeliness" according to the different needs, capacities and "development paths" of the various target groups.	The current country programme basically has two categories of target population: (i) small organised farmers for farming-related activities and (ii) individual women and youth for off farm income generating activities. The project implementation manual was finalised and validated with the project staff to ensure an appropriate reality check.
Dominican Republic	CE	4	CTRY	STR	BEN	Ensure the active participation of beneficiaries in defining and implementing avenues of action throughout the project, adhering to the principle of demand-driven services in addition to taking into consideration elements such as the potential and risks of organizations, the environment, markets and the region as a whole.	The design of the new projects strictly followed this principle which is also one pillar of the current COSOP approved in April 2010.
Dominican Republic	CE	5	CTRY	STR	DES	Highlight the provisional nature of certain design elements as an initial guideline, differentiating those which are obligatory for the project (commitments included in the loan agreement) from those which are indicative and subject to the discretion of implementers (steering committee and management); it is suggested that the loan agreement predefine implementation guidelines to be followed by implementers.	As a result of most recent design guidelines and related Quality Enhancement/Quality Assurance (QE/QA) processes, design reports are much more complete than in the past in the area of project implementation manuals and procedures. Nevertheless, technical assistance has been provided in early implementation stage to help project staff become familiar with the project.
Dominican Republic	CE	6	CTRY	STR	PMA	Ensure that functions which are strategic to project implementation are performed by entities with appropriate experience and capacity. Such functions include supervising operational and financial execution, monitoring implementation and decision making on project orientation, particularly in the case of major changes;	Both IFAD projects are managed by a IDB/IFAD co-funded management unit which proved to be very successful in the execution of a previous IDB (Interamerican Development Bank) project. This unit was institutionalised by the Minister to become the project execution unit for all IDB and IFAD projects under the responsibility of the Ministry.

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
Dominican Republic	CE	7	PROJ	OPER	PMA	Examine the approximate costs of different implementation models (execution by project, outsourcing of services, or a combination) to set reference guidelines;	All activities of the projects are outsourced to third parties (including organizations of beneficiaries if they have the capacity to do so) under the coordination of the project staff.
Dominican Republic	CE	8	CTRY	OPER	STR	Provide for adequate outsourcing of technical and financial services; making use of local capacities calls for explicit negotiating strategies, particularly with important NGOs active in each territory.	During the design of both projects, a partnership was negotiated with two financial institutions (Banco ADEMI and Banco ADOPEM) that committed to cofinance viable business plans presented by organised farmers. Technical services are provided by a wide range of actors including the federations of farmers, local NGOs, private sector.
Dominican Republic	CE	9	CTRY	OPER	STR	Complete support for commercial crops such as coffee and bananas produced by peasant groups throughout the entire value chain and reconsider the range of products to be promoted, including irrigated farming (as identified in the design of PROPEUR), with potential for rural job creation.	The core of the DR country programme is to strengthen the sustainable inclusion of small coffee/banana/cacao organised farmers in value chains in partnership with the private sector.
Dominican Republic	CE	10	CTRY	OPER	BEN	Promote competition for access to project funds to carry out community-based production projects, incentivizing participation by young people;	The third strategic objective of the COSOP explicitly targets rural youth and the promotion of non-farming income generating activities. Competitive mechanisms are foreseen in project designs.
Dominican Republic	CE	11	CTRY	STR	INN	Incentives should be provided for innovations, including the development of economic relations between communities and cities;	One key innovative area in the Dominican Republic is strengthening the economic relations between rural and touristic (costal) areas.
Dominican Republic	CE	12	PROJ	STR	ORG	Evaluate the consolidation status of social organizations to be strengthened as a basis for defining specific project support in each case;	The design report includes a diagnostic of economic organizations which are the entry point of the projects in the context of the current COSOP.
Dominican Republic	CE	13	CTRY	STR	INF	If continued support is to be provided for social works, explicitly define the relationship between community representation and grass-roots organizations with respect to responsibilities for maintenance and possible future expansion of the works;	No further support in this areas is envisaged within the current country programme (COSOP).
Dominican Republic	CE	14	CTRY	STR	RFI	Provision of access to financing should (re)consider its connection to rural demand and also support microfinance initiatives more deeply rooted in rural communities;	A very comprehensive rural finance strategy has been developed.
Dominican Republic	CE	15	CTRY	OPER	RFI	A climate insurance instrument warrants support to contribute to a nationwide modality (rather than a service exclusively for the projects clients as long as it is in the area)	One project includes a subcomponent to pilot the design of a weather index based insurance scheme.
Dominican Republic	CE	16	CTRY	STR	DES	In terms of food security, an investment should be made in designing a program with prospects for improvement over the medium to long term, rather than the short term, as well as exploring the possibility of combining it with government	Food security is addressed mostly by the project in the western (border) area by focusing on food staple crops (such as beans, cereals). Possible linkages with Conditional Cash Transfer (CCT) programmes are being explored.

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
						subsidies.	
Dominican Republic	CE	17	CTRY	OPER	KM	With respect to knowledge exchange, the evaluation recommends completing the systematization of PROPESUR experiences and disseminating and exchanging them with specialized actors (NGOs, public entities, projects) to consolidate best practices and lessons learned.	The experience of PROPESUR (South Western Region Small Farmers Project) has been widely disseminated through various means (including a video documentary). It was also largely utilised during the design of the following two projects, particularly the one focusing on the western border provinces.
Laos: Oudomxai Community Initiatives Support Project							
Laos	CE	1	PROJ	OPER	RFI	(a) improving the capacity of villagers to manage their own VSCSs while continuing to strengthen and supervise the recently established district and provincial microfinance institutions;	The just approved Soum Son Seun Jai programme will address this concern. The programme has started on 22 December 2011. The design document has noted the need to improve the capacity of the village savings and credit societies (VSCS), while continuing to strengthen and supervise the district and provincial MFIs.
Laos	CE	2	PROJ	OPER	TCB	(b) strengthening the Agricultural Technical Service Centres.	This has been noted in the design document for the new project. The project has now started, and this will be addressed during the project.
Laos	CE	3	PROJ	OPER	INF	(c) monitoring the maintenance of rural infrastructure, linking it to district services for major repairs	The project includes the creation of Village Road Maintenance Groups across 50 villages to ensure that communities assume responsibility for routine road maintenance. For the drinking water schemes, villagers will be trained both to maintain the scheme and to supervise the financing of scheme maintenance and repairs. Similarly, for irrigation, the WUA (water user associations) will develop a set of internal rules and regulations for operation and maintenance.
Laos	CE	4	CTRY	OPER	STR	(d) finding ways to increase the commitment of resources from government departments at all levels.	Counterpart funds for the Soum Son Seun Jai programme include funds for road maintenance and major repairs. The major maintenance or repairs on roads will be financed by the government.
Laos	CE	5	CTRY	STR	STR	Any future ANRM strategy should focus more explicitly on the uplands and include: (a) agricultural intensification; (b) agricultural diversification; (c) increasing livestock productivity through forage planting; (d) improved harvesting of NTFPs; (e) a value chain approach that will strengthen the links between farmers, transporters and traders; and (f) participatory land and forest management and awareness raising on villagers rights to use and manage natural resources.	All these points have been reflected into the design of the Soum Son Seun Jai programme. The programme is expected to yield benefits including diversified and intensified upland production systems to balance food security and income generation needs. The integrated farming systems will include a balance between various factors: diversifying cropping options during dry and rainy seasons, integrating non-timber forest products (NTFPs) and natural resources as a key source of income, integrating livestock husbandry as an integral part of household income generating activity (expected outcomes also include increased forage crops). The component will also include activities focused on understanding ethnic groups' traditional land use and tenure arrangements and help

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
							generate community awareness on official land rights.
Laos	CE	6	CTRY	STR	STR	Any new project that focused primarily on ANRM would have to address the deficiencies of the agricultural extension system, not only increasing resources and capacity building but also improving institutional management and commitment.	Interventions will be delivered through community-based agricultural development plans (CADPs) as part of the community development plan where integrated farming-livestock-forestry activities will be defined. Based on the contents of these plans, support activities including the strengthening of farmers' organisations, agricultural extension and demonstration tools will be organised.
Laos	CE	7	CTRY	STR	INN	The extension system also needs to be much more focused on innovation.	The programme will address the deficiencies of the extension system, including the lack of innovation. Extension officers will be trained and supported in order to find suitable solutions for upland agriculture and natural resource management.
Laos	CE	8	CTRY	OPER	PAR	Extension officers and researchers need to work together to identify problems and find solutions for upland agriculture and natural resource management.	Extension officers will be trained and supported in order to find suitable solutions for upland agriculture and natural resource management. Agricultural extension activities will be undertaken in conservation agriculture, crop diversification during the rainy and dry seasons, climate risk management strategies, NTFPs sustainable harvesting and domestication. The preferred extension tool will be the Farmer Field Schools (FFS). These activities will adopt a cascade training approach.
Laos	CE	9	PROJ	STR	PAR	The new ANRM component should include a broader range of partnerships, including private sector operators, research institutions, the National Agricultural and Forestry Extension Service and training establishments. Government departments that have an interest in the sector could also be involved, such as the National Land Management Authority and the Ministry of Industry and Commerce.	The Soum Son Seun Jai programme comprises a very large group of partners including national institutes, university, NGOs, private sector, etc.
Laos	CE	10	PROJ	OPER	PMA	The primary responsibility for project management, coordination and decision-making should continue to be located in the provincial and district planning offices, with oversight from the local Steering Committees, but a mechanism for accessing advice from relevant national line ministries should also be established.	The design of the Soum Son Seun Jai programme addresses this concern. It decentralises the implementation down to the lowest level which is Kum-ban. At the same time it includes an oversight and coordination role played at the national level.
Laos	CE	11	PROJ	STR	TGT	Any new project should focus explicitly on the more remote ethnic villages; however, the range of activities should be considered carefully.	About 90% of the target group of the Soum Son Seun Jai programme are from ethnic groups and cover remote villages. Specific criteria have been included in the design document and applied for the target villages selection.
Laos	CE	12	PROJ	STR	STR	Any future project should combine quick wins through the provision of rural infrastructure with longer term development of agriculture and	The design of the Soum Son Seun Jai programme addresses this concern. It includes a focus on more remote villages and combines quick wins with a focus

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
						natural resource management.	on the provision of rural infrastructure (e.g. roads, drinking water) with the longer term development of agriculture and natural resource management (through the upland production systems).
Laos	CE	13	CTRY	STR	BEN	The community development approach should be more narrowly focused on these two areas, building local participatory capacities to interface with project implementers. The broad based Community Development approach with a proliferation of implementers and activities might not be cost effective in the more remote areas.	The focus is on these two aspects (as addressed in the above responses).
Laos	CE	14	PROJ	OPER	KM	A future project should systematically build in a fully resourced knowledge management component, which analyses the lessons from OCISP and future project experiences, produces knowledge products, and organises dissemination activities with links to other projects, researchers, policy makers and beneficiaries.	This is planned in the design document of the Soum Son Seun Jai programme. A first knowledge sharing exercise was undertaken at the start-up workshop on 15 March 2012 in Vientiane where all IFAD projects were invited as well as other projects working in similar fields in Laos.

C. Interim Evaluation

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
Ethiopia: Rural Financial Intermediation Programme							
Ethiopia	IE	1	CTRY	STR	RFI	In light of IFAD's and the Government's strong commitment to continued support to the rural finance sector, careful consideration must be given to the further development of the MFI and RUSACCO sub-sectors. While both sectors have great potential, albeit with very different strategic requirements, for a possible second phase of RUFIP, IFAD should consider supporting the two sectors independently.	During the design of RUFIP II, the MFI and RUSACCO (rural savings and credit cooperatives) sub sectors have been carefully treated as two distinct sub-sectors of the Ethiopian rural financial market and provisions for the development the respective sectors have been made based on in-depth considerations of their specific requirements.
Ethiopia	IE	2	GOV	STR	RFI	Since their inception, Ethiopian MFIs have mobilized increasing amounts of savings, yet are still far from exhausting this potential source of funds. This will entail pursuing several different strategies, particularly in terms of expanding outreach: a) Developing new savings deposit products and expanding outreach in savings mobilization efforts among the rural households; b) Ensuring that the attractive deposit rates are offered in order to mobilize deposits while MFIs continue to remain operationally sustainable institutions.	Based on key lessons learnt over the past ten years, targets for mobilizing incremental savings of about US\$1.1 billion through both compulsory and voluntary products is envisaged under RUFIP II. Accordingly, MFIs are required as a condition for programme credit support to: (i) expand outreach to much larger number of excluded people, (ii) offer much greater variety of products that actually suit the needs of the customers and (iii) increase the overall and per customer volume of savings.

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
Ethiopia	IE	3	CTRY	STR	DIA	Over the longer term, if the MFI sector is to continue to expand to meet unmet demand for access to rural financial services, RUFIP, in its follow-up phase, should encourage commercial bank lending to MFIs. This would entail policy dialogue with MoFED, and NBE and commercial banks on several issues.	<p>The design of RUFIP II steering mechanism provides adequate space to IFAD for evidence based policy dialogue and consultative process including innovative guarantee schemes to enhance commercial bank lending to MFIs and RUSACCOs.</p> <p>Encouraging discussions have been made with the senior management of NBE (National Bank of Ethiopia) and MoFED (Ministry of Finance and Economic Development) regarding opportunities towards enhancing commercial bank lending to MFIs.</p>
Ethiopia	IE	4	CTRY	STR	RFI	It should be explored the potential, inter alia, of: a) Creating an apex institution for MFIs in the medium to long term which would: i) Mobilize financial resources from domestic and international resources and wholesale such resources to MFIs on a competitive basis; and ii) Supervise MFIs on behalf of NBE in accordance with international best practice. b) Assisting in establishing a credit guarantee fund which would make it possible for MFIs to borrow on commercial terms without significant collateral requirements; and c) Studying collateral substitute mechanisms, including independent ratings of MFIs as currently implemented in other countries.	<p>The potential for establishment of an apex institution for MFIs in the medium to long term has been carefully explored and a comprehensive draft document which provides details of the proposed apex institution including vision, mission, legal framework, ownership, function, governance, organizational structure and possible basket of resources have been produced as part of RUFIP II PDR (project design report). Additionally, to facilitate the way forward provisions have been made in the design for a visit to 3 selected apex institutions with different frameworks to better understand the concept and relate it to the Ethiopian context; (ii) Provisions have also been made under RUFIP II towards exploring opportunities for the establishment of a credit guarantee fund, which would make it possible for the MFIs to borrow on commercial terms.</p>
Ethiopia	IE	5	CTRY	STR	RFI	Should the second phase of RUFIP continue providing support for the further development of the credit cooperative network, this should require a system of appropriate regulation and supervision by a financial authority and a fully functional operating and reporting system, as well as the complementary institutional capacity building functions that this would require.	<p>Adequate provisions have been made under RUFIP II towards improving the regulation and supervision of RUSACCOs.</p> <p>The key expected outcomes along this front include: (i) establishment of a functioning separate department for rural financial cooperatives at national, regional, zonal and woreda levels with satisfactory staffing pattern; (ii) development of a separate legal code for rural financial cooperatives; (iii) establishment of a regulatory and supervisory arrangement for financial cooperatives including audit framework; (iv) preparation and implementation of supervision manual for rural financial cooperatives; and (v) designing and implementation of functioning MIS system.</p>
Ethiopia	IE	6	CTRY	OPER	PAR	The new programme could build upon the significant international experience which exists by establishing a partnership with an institution with a recognized track record in credit cooperative system development. This would then make it possible to leverage international	In order to expeditiously close the institutional capacity gap of RUSACCOs, Unions of RUSACCOs, facilitators, regulators and supervisors adequate resources have been earmarked under RUFIP II for institutional capacity building including twinning arrangements and building strategic partnerships with

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
						technical assistance in credit cooperative system development- recognized centres of excellence in this field include DGRV (Deutsche Genossenschafts- und Raiffeisenverband e.V.), WOCCU and Rabobank, amongst others- complementing financial assistance by IFAD.	international network of financial cooperatives such as WOCCU (World Council of Credit Unions), Rabobank, etc., which have significant experiences in providing value adding services to similar programmes.
Ethiopia	IE	7	GOV	OPER	STR	The exact course of action would be determined by the Government in consultation with the international assistance partner, stakeholders in the credit cooperative sector and IFAD.	The loan agreement has been signed between Government of Ethiopia and IFAD in December 2011, MOFED has initiated the process for the ratification of the agreement by the parliament. ICO (IFAD Country Office) is following up the ratification of the agreement to accelerate implementation of the project. The project implementation is set to commence in July 2012. Substantial preparatory work is underway and several start-up activities are scheduled for completion before the formal launch of the project.
Mauritania: Poverty Reduction Project in Aftout South and Karakoro							
Mauritania	IE	1	CTRY	STR	DES	Appropriate resources should be allocated to the design of a possible second phase of the project to allow for an in-depth analysis of specific strengths, weaknesses and threats concerning vulnerable rural populations in the project intervention area.	The design of PASK II (Poverty Reduction Project in Aftout South and Karakoro, phase II) benefited from appropriate resources including the findings and recommendations of the IE of PASK. The project builds on the achievements and lessons learned of PASK as well as on scaling up successful results of activities financed by partners such as GIZ/KfW (German development agency and development bank- Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit and German Kreditanstalt für Wiederaufbau) and AFD (Agence Française de Développement, French bilateral development agency).
Mauritania	IE	2	CTRY	STR	SUP	During the course of implementation, the project should benefit from additional supervision resources and technical support proportionate with its complexity and the difficulty of intervention conditions.	Two direct supervisions missions will be conducted each year by IFAD. During the start-up mission, the training needs of the PCU will be assessed, with emphasis for project staff involved in design, building and monitoring the hydraulic infrastructures. The PASK II will be linked up with the 2ie Institute in Ouagadougou for capacity strengthening training. Lastly, since two of the components will be sub-contracted to GIZ and AFD, PASK II will benefit from the technical expertise of these two bilateral organizations.
Mauritania	IE	3	CTRY	STR	DES	IFAD should take into consideration the following aspect: Allocation of appropriate resources for the project development process, taking into account the difficulties and complexity of the target zone – which would justify the allocation of sums substantially higher than the IFAD average.	As indicated in point 1, appropriate resources were devoted to project development.

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
Mauritania	IE	4	CTRY	STR	SUP	Supervision and technical support during the period of project implementation have to take into account institutional capacities and available human resources. IFAD should consider the possibility of allocating substantial amounts to supervision to ensure the support necessary for proper project execution.	As indicated in point 2, two supervision missions will be conducted per year. Moreover, the partners (GIZ, AFD) will also provide supervision support. The partnership with PGRNG-GIZ (Resources Management Project in Guidimakha), and the AfD-Vaincre will provide much needed expertise and value added for harmonizing and scaling-up successful activities. The MDR (Ministère du Développement rural) which oversees and supervises the implementation of all the 3 project-funded by IFAD in Mauritania will contribute to monitoring PASK II.
Mauritania	IE	5	CTRY	STR	DES	A possible second phase of the project will have to ensure a better match between objectives and project execution modalities.	Compared to the first phase, PASK II focuses on a limited number of activities and for its execution, arrangements have been made to collaborate with other projects (Vaincre, ProGRN and GRDR) to scale up their successful activities including the outsourcing of some activities to these partners in areas where they have proven expertise in Mauritania (Vaincre, ProGRN and GRDR) .
Mauritania	IE	6	CTRY	STR	PAR	Special attention will be on the promotion of a solid partnership with the appropriate ministerial departments, to ensure the articulation and integration of project activities with their respective sectoral programmes; and with other partners to provide additional technical and financial support, primarily in connection with infrastructure (rural roads, health care and drinking water).	The project is housed at the Ministry of rural development which is the line ministry in charge of the execution of all 3 IFAD-funded projects in Mauritania. PASKII is attached to the Directorate of rural infrastructure (Direction de l'Aménagement Rural) of the MDR which has proven its capacities during the implementation of KfW's PGRNG (Resources Management Project in Guidimakha). As indicated in the design document, the PASK II will replicate and scale-up proven interventions such as the management and conservation of soils developed by PGRNG, strengthening of project management at the municipal level according to the approach developed by AfD-Vaincre, managing sylvo-pastoral areas across communities promoted by the ProGRN. Also, the expertise of GRDR (Rural Development Research Group) in terms of negotiated land agreements "entente foncière" and will be tapped into.
Mauritania	IE	7	CTRY	STR	TGT	Special attention will be on concentration of the area of project intervention and better targeting of the poorest villages to enhance and integrate with local interventions, to maximize the project impact on one hand, and attenuate logistical pressures and reduce project management costs on the other.	The design document clearly indicates that the target group of PASK II are the poorest rural households (21,000 households mainly comprising small farmers / breeders) in the following three mughatas M'Bout (43%), Kankossa (37) and Ould-Yengé (21%). A 3-phase targeting approach recommended by PRSP (Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper) of Mauritania will be used to geographically identify the poorest villages. Then, the project in consultation with the government and local stakeholders will purposefully target poor women and young people, and then utilize community

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
							based mechanism for self- targeting of the most vulnerable and poorest households.
Mauritania	IE	8	CTRY	STR	PAR	Special attention will be on the introduction of concrete mechanisms for coordination, exchange and integration with other development projects in the area or in bordering regions, primarily those of the IFAD programme, promoting the convergence of different stakeholders around the community development plan.	PASK II will be implemented in partnership with the GIZ-ProGRN and the Afd-Vaincre. Regarding the Afd-Vaincre, this project is strengthening the implementation of communal development plans to which IFAD will be directly contributing in order to reach out to its specific target group. Coordination. Exchange and integration will be realized through the Comités Communaux de Concertation (CCC).
Mauritania	IE	9	CTRY	STR	PAR	Special attention will be on the involvement of deconcentrated State technical services as privileged strategic partners: for the strengthening of local capacities at start-up; and for project implementation and enhancement of learning after project completion.	The project PASK II approach aims to implement national policies. PASKII will establish policy dialogue with the competent national structures, and work closely with decentralized government agencies. For example, decentralised technical services together with the PCU and members of CCC are the tripartite that decide with projects to fund with the FIEC (Fonds d'investissement à l'échelle communale).
Mauritania	IE	10	CTRY	STR	NRM	In line with legislation on land use planning, special attention will be on improving the competitiveness of infrastructure by grouping localities to build a critical mass of populations and promote the pooling of resources.	This principle has been taken in account in the project design. For example, before the establishment of any infrastructure, a maintenance agreement is signed with the users.
Mauritania	IE	11	CTRY	STR	BEN	Special attention will be on promotion of communal project ownership, primarily for inter-community activities.	The support of the project will mainly channel through producer organisation. For instance, as a community based institution, CCC will have the responsibility to decide the type of social investments that need to be undertaken. Sylvo-pastoral resources will be managed at the intercommunal level. For activities requiring investment in infrastructure, the establishment of maintenance agreement with users before making any clear sense of ownership. For instance the AGLC (Associations de gestion locale collective) supported by ProGRN (Natural Resource Management Programme) are inter-village entities for the sustainable use and management of natural resources.
Mauritania	IE	12	CTRY	STR	NRM	Refocus the project on its economic objectives by promoting the area's water and agro pastoral potential in an optimum and sustainable way, and by consolidating the experience in promoting income-generating activities launched during this first phase, while ensuring effective coordination with crop and livestock development strategies and sustainable management of natural resources.	The emphasis on PASK II is on soil and water conservation, sustainable animal husbandry with a view to expanding and increasing agricultural production and productivity and to enhance food security and income increase for agricultural producers.

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
Mauritania	IE	13	CTRY	STR	KM	The practical measures to be taken in this regard should include: Improvement and promotion of available knowledge on the area's potential (studies by PASK, achievements of other projects, a new study to be carried out on surface water management and development, etc.).	All previous studies carried out in the context of PASK and other projects funded by IFAD or other donors were utilized to inform the design of PASKII. For instance, the design document took into account for the extensive analysis of livestock development opportunities in Mauritania undertaken under the design of IFAD's Programme de Lutte contre la Pauvreté par l'Appui aux Filières. Also, GRDR has with the support of two IFAD grants, tested technical packages adapted to the situation of target groups of (poultry farming and vegetable production).
Mauritania	IE	14	CTRY	STR	NRM	The practical measures to be taken in this regard should include: Preparation of strategies and programmes adapted for the integrated development of agriculture, animal husbandry and sustainable management of the area's natural resources with the involvement of populations and the technical services concerned.	The focus of the second component of the project is on the integration of agriculture, animal husbandry and NRM with the active involvement of the concerned technical services and the local populations.
Mauritania	IE	15	CTRY	STR	STR	The practical measures to be taken in this regard should include: Mobilization of adequate financial resources for the implementation of these programmes, particularly through a local investment fund responsible for supporting local initiatives identified for the development of these sectors.	The project PASK II includes a 'Fond d'Appui aux Initiatives Economiques' (FAIE) to support agriculture and livestock micro-projects developed by producers' organizations. Village level priority development plan are prepared and presented to CCC for financing the Fonds d'Investissement à l'Echelle Communale (FIEC).
Mauritania	IE	16	CTRY	STR	TCB	The practical measures to be taken in this regard should include: Consistent organizational and technical support to producer organizations through appropriate programmes of research and development, training, mentoring and monitoring, while promoting crop and livestock diversification and related promising subsectors.	Besides building the capacity of producer organisation within the context of CCC, PASKII will provide capacity enhancing services to producer organisations that participate in labour intensive activities and for access to market in collaboration with ProLPRAF (Value Chains Development Programme for Poverty Reduction). With lessons learned in Cape Verde and cotton producing western African countries, high labour intensity activities will be utilized for not only for infrastructure building and maintenance and for generating income opportunities but also to contribute to the structuring of producer organizations
Mauritania	IE	17	CTRY	STR	PAR	A specific linkage should be created with IFAD's Value Chains Development Programme for Poverty Reduction (ProLPRAF).	The linkage with ProLPRAF will be created as recommended in the design document and in the framework of building a coherent country program.
Mauritania	IE	18	CTRY	STR	STR	The practical measures to be taken in this regard should include: Improved methods for preparation, selection, implementation and management of income-generating activities to move towards greater accountability and improved economic viability of private initiatives. This programme should maximize the	The recommendation has been taken into account in all components of the projects. For example, the methodology and techniques of PGRNG for the restoration of soils, control and better uses of surface water can be mastered by users. The expertise of PGRNG for soil restoration will be scaled up with PASKII. The ProGRN experience in sustainable

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
						opportunities offered by integrated agricultural development and support the promotion of promising subsectors.	management of natural resources will also be scaled up. It consists in supported the process of forming resources user groups organized in inter-village entities (AGLC) in the preservation, use and restoration of their natural resources.
Mauritania	IE	19	CTRY	STR	INN	The practical measures to be taken in this regard should include: Promotion and dissemination of technical and technological innovation, improving the performance of crop and livestock production systems by developing local potential.	This concern is being addressed. The two parts of the action-research are being carried out by GRDR with the support of two IFAD grants which focus on introducing and testing improved varieties and methods of poultry farming and vegetable production. Both PASKII and PrOLPRAF will internalise the finding of GRDR in their operations.
Mauritania	IE	20	CTRY	STR	STR	The practical measures to be taken in this regard should include: Improvement of rural livelihoods by promoting rural housing, introducing and disseminating technologies that make use of local materials and developing alternative energy sources.	This recommendation has been addressed as well. See point 19.
Rwanda: Smallholder Cash and Export Crops Development Project							
Rwanda	IE	1	CTRY	STR	DES	The next project phase should emphasize expanding the capacity to process coffee.	<p>The Project for Rural Income through Exports (PRICE) was designed to build on achievements and lessons learned under PDCRE; it was approved by IFAD's Executive Board in September 2011 and was recently launched in January 2012.</p> <p>As an integral design element of PRICE, the value chain approach places emphasis on processing and marketing of export crops, particularly coffee. The coffee development component of PRICE aims at securing better returns to coffee growers through higher marketed volumes and better prices for higher quality. In line with the National Coffee Strategy, PRICE supports increasing the production of high-grade fully-washed coffee through turning existing washing stations profitable; by increasing the number of well managed eco-friendly mini-washing stations; and by enhancing processing techniques for improved coffee washing, cupping, milling and presentation through training/ capacity-building and development of standards and norms.</p> <p>PRICE will support existing cooperative-owned coffee washing stations (CWS) as well as support the installation and operation of up to 50 mini washing stations.</p>

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
Rwanda	IE	2	CTRY	OPER	TCB	The next project phase should expand the training capacities of central cooperatives agencies.	Cooperatives and their apex structures are central stakeholders in PRICE implementation for production development, marketing, provision of support services and participation in value chain governance. The PRICE strategy and programme of activities are geared towards ensuring that, by the end of the project, they have become professional players in their respective value chains, monitoring that their members reap a fair return of value chains' added value. In efforts to promote institutional sustainability, specific capacity building support for unions and federations is foreseen to respond to the demand for services by cooperatives.
Rwanda	IE	3	CTRY	STR	RFI	The next project phase should support SACCOs (savings and credit cooperatives) as a means to facilitate financial services for small farmers.	As part of the efforts to facilitate access to sustainable financial services, PRICE will build on the existing network of SACCOs (savings and credit cooperatives) not only to strengthen their regular lending operations based on their own resources, but also to act as intermediaries for banks to channel resources to and from rural clients. As part of the development activities in all supported value chains, PRICE will facilitate capacity building services to existing SACCOs in the project area. This will provide each SACCO in the project area with technical assistance focusing on the financing of farmer-based activities related to a project-supported value chain.
Rwanda	IE	4	CTRY	STR	SUS	The development goal of the next phase should include an institutional element as institutional sustainability is required.	Efforts to promote institutional sustainability are illustrated by the following project features: (i) responsibility for project implementation lies with the existing Single Project Implementation Unit (SPIU) and National Agricultural Export Board (NAEB), avoiding the need to create a separate PCU; (ii) provision of support to cooperatives for improved technical and management capacities, as well as provision of some financial resources; (iii) facilitating for the development of sustainable support services.
Rwanda	IE	5	CTRY	OPER	ORG	In the next phase strengthening cooperatives and their management should be a priority, starting with a detailed analysis of management's shortcomings and of gaps in the skills and competencies among the members, committee members and staff.	IFAD management and the Government agreed on this recommendation. However, they disagreed on the need to study in detail the management shortfalls of cooperatives, before designing an institutional strengthening programme. Shortcomings of cooperative governance and management are known, which ultimately led to design of the Turnaround Programme, with custom-made support to build up management capacities of participating cooperatives (approximately 67 additional cooperatives).

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
Rwanda	IE	6	CTRY	OPER	ASR	The evaluation mission recommends a number of other studies: (i) a study on the environmental effects of the coffee-washing stations and tea factories; (ii) an updated study on "other cash crops" because the earlier one is 6 to 7 years old and the economy of sericulture appears uncertain; and (iii) a cost-benefit analysis of organic coffee production in Rwanda coffee cooperatives.	While IFAD management and Government disagreed with the selection of the proposed studies, it was agreed that other studies of more practical and operational relevance would be undertaken. Under PRICE, the following studies will be undertaken: coffee pulp transformation, market and value chain analysis of promising commodities within the horticulture component, and a study to develop FFS methodology in the tea and coffee sectors.
Rwanda	IE	7	CTRY	STR	TGT	The next phase of the project should work to ensure that the PPP is pro-poor.	The PPP (public private partnership) approach in PRICE is pro-poor as the private investors on greenfield sites will need to compete on different criteria (Greenleaf price as a percentage of the made-tea price, farmers support interventions) in order to receive the greenfield site package from PRICE.
Rwanda	IE	8	CTRY	OPER	DES	In the next phase the project should introduce a "money-for-work program".	PRICE includes the provision of alternative income schemes for poor farmers who have converted their land to growing coffee or tea.
Uganda: Vegetable Oil Development Project							
Uganda	IE	1	CTRY	STR	PAR	A second phase will continue and extend the partnership with Oil Palm Uganda Limited (OPUL) through the replication of the nucleus estate and smallholder oil palm model on Buvuma Island, and continued consolidation and expansion in Kalangala District to some outlying islands.	The IFAD Loan for the second phase was approved in April 2010 and signed in October 2010. The start-up has been delayed due to slow progress by the ministry to recruit PMU staff, but this has now taken place and some activities have taken place under the management of the PMU for VODP 1 (Vegetable Oil Development Project). Land acquisition on Buvuma and outlying islands has started, and is progressing satisfactorily. About half of the estimated potential land on the outlying islands has been surveyed. Farmers from Buvuma have visited Kalangala on a study trip.
Uganda	IE	2	CTRY	STR	ASR	Efforts to identify new areas for future oil palm production will be continued through oil palm research trials.	The Government is continuously collecting data and other information for oil palm expansions. The process has been slowed due to understaffing at the PMU in the transition period between the two phases of the project, where the focus has been on the oil palm production already taking place.
Uganda	IE	3	CTRY	STR	NRM	The lessons learned from the current phase have been already incorporated into the design of the second phase. These will be addressed through a full social and environmental impact assessment, a new environmental management plan with emphasis on communications, and activities to promote livelihood enhancement in the oil palm communities.	Evaluation of bids for the Environment and Social Impact Assessment study in Buvuma & outlying Islands was completed on 24th November, 2011. The report is to be submitted to Contracts Committee for approval, before being sent to IFAD for No Objection. Communications continues to be a core centre of attention for VODP, with the assistance of an IFAD consultant in the country office. When the environmental impact assessment has been finalized, and phase two has commenced, an environmental

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
							management plan with focus on communication and activities to promote livelihoods enhancements will be further developed.
Uganda	IE	4	CTRY	STR	SUS	GOU and IFAD will give priority to ensuring the long term financial sustainability of KOPGT (Kalangala Oil Palm Growers Trust) by 2016. The Trust will be fully assessed by type of task in order to ensure full cost recovery for services provided as well as the sustainability of financing operations.	Two core business meetings have been held, with KOPGT staff and management, PMU and external consultants, and a business plan and time table of KOPGT self-sustainability have been put in place. KOPGT is currently preparing for its first dry-run audit in the second half of 2012. In addition, draft manuals on finance, credit and human resources have been developed, and will be piloted by KOPGT for one year before being finalized.
Uganda	IE	5	CTRY	OPER	SUS	A medium term plan will be developed to indicate the long term scope of extension and financial services and how these can be provided on a sustainable basis.	A time-line for the self-sustainability of KOPGT has been developed, and accounts have been re-structured (and more accounts re-opened) to ensure full cost recovery of transport services (for which an accounts assistant will be hired). The step following this will be income generation on transport and, as foreseen in the business model, income generation of fertilizer, the possibility of different interest rates for different products and other measures.
Uganda	IE	6	CTRY	OPER	PAR	The plan will clarify the relationship between KOPGT and the Kalangala Oil Palm Growers Association (KOPGA).	The roles and responsibilities of KOPGT and KOPGA are listed in the guidelines mentioned above. Its implementation will be followed-up as part of supervision and implementation support.
Uganda	IE	7	CTRY	OPER	DES	IFAD and GOU have considered carefully the need for a second phase and decided that the focus should be on helping smallholder farmers to supply crushing material (both sunflower and soya bean) to millers.	The second phase has been approved by the IFAD EB (Executive Board) and the Ugandan Parliament, and one of the main goals is "raising the production of crushing material". One of the components is the supply of high-performing seeds and extension services to ensure high levels and quality of production.
Uganda	IE	8	CTRY	OPER	NRM	The second phase of the programme will address concerns about declining soil fertility and farmer training will be provided in the use of fertilizers and other agro-chemicals, conservation agriculture and other related activities.	In the design documents, 5 main objectives of the extension services are listed, and includes "introduction of conservation agriculture for oilseed production". The extension themes include field demonstration sites (focus on agronomy; improved seed; fertilizer; rhizobium inoculum; pest and disease etc.), conservation and crop rotation. Introduction of these best practices is expected to address declining soil fertility.
Uganda	IE	9	CTRY	OPER	PRM	There will be support for mechanization and value addition activities, as well as post-harvest handling and group marketing.	As stated in the design document, VODP2 will support mechanization and animal traction. This will be one of the key themes for extension, including other labour-saving techniques and household and village level oil pressing. Post-harvest handling is another key extension theme. The extension methodology will build on group participation (using a participatory M&E

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
							approach) and on farmer group mobilization. Value addition activities are listed in the design document as complementary income-generation activities. Group marketing is being addressed through bulking arrangements and capacity building of smallholders.
Uganda	IE	10	CTRY	OPER	PRM	IFAD and GOU will continue to support the development of food standards and codes of practice for the vegetable oils subsector through Uganda National Bureau of Standards (UNBS).	This is foreseen in the design document. The details of the partnership between VODP2 and Uganda National Bureau of Standards (UNBS) will be worked out during the next year when the PMU will be fully operational.
Uganda	IE	11	CTRY	STR	SUS	In the second phase, there will be a stronger focus on promoting direct commercial relations between farmers and private sector actors, such as extension providers and processors, to promote the long term sustainability of oilseeds development.	A strong element of the second phase is formalized contracts with pay-for-service providers and the strong focus on linkages with the private sector in the mature hub. The Oilseed Sub Sector Platform (OSSUP), a sector-wide platform supported by an IFAD grant to the Netherlands Development Organisation (SNV), will ensure overall coordination of the sector. The objective of this approach, and the issues described above, is to "establish direct linkages between millers and farmers".
Uganda	IE	12	CTRY	OPER	TGT	IFAD and GOU consider that oilseeds development offers good potential for livelihoods improvement, and this component will be expanded into areas further north (where the ex-Lords Resistance Army (LRA) has been operating).	The project areas covered by the oil seeds component are focused in 4 hubs. Two of them, West Nile/Arua and Gulu, cover areas where the Lord's Resistance Army (LRA) has previously been operating, in the North.
Uganda	IE	13	CTRY	OPER	TGT	The follow-on project will take account of the need for special skills in post-conflict work and coordination with other donors and NGOs working in this region.	A targeting study was carried out in the whole project area, providing guidance on how best to implement the project in the various hubs, depending on their level of integration into the value chain. The smallholders in the Northern area are typically the least integrated, and a special approach has been developed to target these. Operational partnerships with operators with necessary skills in post-conflict work will be worked out as necessary during project implementation.
Uganda	IE	14	CTRY	STR	DES	IFAD/GOU will build upon the experience being developed by the Oilseed Sub Sector Platform (OSSUP) so that it can expand its work in promoting information exchange and coordination amongst the different value chain actors, and developing policy dialogue to promote the subsector.	Lessons learnt from working with OSSUP have been incorporated in the project design, where hub coordinators will be employed to ensure coordination at the regional level, in close collaboration with OSSUP. OSSUP is being supported through a grant to SNV in order to take maximum advantage of services to the sector.
Uganda	IE	15	CTRY	STR	PAR	IFAD will provide a grant to Netherlands Development Organization (SNV) to support OSSUP. Through this support, OSSUP will be able to play a critical role in promoting public/private partnerships for a range of activities to support	IFAD has given a grant to SNV for the further development and support to OSSUP. The grant has been effective since December 2011.

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
						oilseeds development (with millers, seed companies, banks for inputs and stock financing and farmers groups for bulking).	
Uganda	IE	16	CTRY	STR	KM	Drawing upon the experience and learning gained, OSSUP will support the institutional and sub sector knowledge management frameworks that are necessary for promoting the sustainable development of Uganda's vegetable oils subsector.	The OSSUP grant to SNV became effective in December 2011, and activities to this effect have started, including a first meeting with all stakeholders to explain future activities.
Uganda	IE	17	CTRY	STR	STR	IFAD and GOU recognize that large scale public investment should be directed to commercial oilseeds such as sunflower, soybeans, groundnuts and sesame.	Public investment is being channelled to these areas through the oil seeds component.
Uganda	IE	18	GOV	STR	PAR	Citronella is produced in limited quantities and remains a niche crop and it is unlikely to receive significant public investment. There is need for the GOU to identify partners, either NGOs or a private sector operator to carry on the Citronella work.	Work in this respect, which is not an immediate priority for the time being, will be done by the PMU when it is fully operational.
Uganda	IE	19	CTRY	OPER	PAR	Once a viable partner is identified, IFAD will provide modest grant financing to support this endeavour.	A modest grant financing will be provided; this will be done based on the results of the work mentioned above.

D. Corporate Level Evaluation

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
IFAD's Private Sector Development and Partnership Strategy							
IFAD	CLE	1	IFAD	PLCY	PRM	The evaluation suggests that consideration of a new corporate private-sector strategy would be timely.	The new Private Sector Strategy was submitted and approved by the Executive Board in December 2011.
IFAD	CLE	2	IFAD	STR	BEN	In preparing a new IFAD private-sector strategy, a consultative process should be followed within IFAD to ensure that all key inputs are duly captured and as a means to building ownership for its implementation.	A very intensive and participatory consultation process was employed with a large spectrum of both internal and external stakeholders being consulted during the preparation of the new strategy. This includes an internal Policy Reference Group, composed of 18 staff members from 11 different divisions (to ensure including different and thematic perspectives and to ensure in-house ownership). Also, consultations were held with other international financial institutions (including the African Development Bank, the International Finance Corporation, the World Bank), other United Nations agencies (including FAO, WFP, UN Global Compact, UNDP), bilateral organisations (Agence Française de Développement, the UK's Department for International Development, USAID), farmers' organisations, NGOs and civil society representatives (ACDI-VOCA, Oxfam, Technoserve)

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
							and private sector companies (Altima Partners, Coca-Cola, Société-Générale, Unilever).
IFAD	CLE	3	IFAD	PLCY	PRM	A clearer and more focused definition of the private sector should be adopted.	The new strategy has a more focused definition of the private sector. While recognising that the rural private sector covers the entire spectrum from the small-scale farmer and trader to large international businesses, the strategy focuses on how IFAD intends to engage with the "corporate private sector", defined as for-profit businesses or companies that are not owned or operated by the government. The spectrum of private-sector entities that operate in rural areas are also mapped out.
IFAD	CLE	4	IFAD	STR	PRM	The existing instruments to support private-sector development should be strengthened.	The strategy focuses in detail on how the existing instruments can be strengthened to engage with the private sector. COSOPs would be used for more systematic engagement with the private sector. There will be increased use of IFAD projects as a tool to engage with the private sector and successful project experiences will be replicated and scaled up. There will also be increased use of grant resources and supplementary funds to strengthen the relationship between the private sector and poor rural women and men.
IFAD	CLE	5	IFAD	STR	PRM	Strengthen the design, supervision, and implementation support of loan-funded projects that include private-sector development.	Successful project experiences will be identified for replication and scaling up. Also, support will be provided through staff capacity building. The portfolio review guidelines also refer to the private sector strategy. Additionally, resources will be used to strengthen capacity of staff (CPMs, country office staff and others) on engaging with the private sector. This will be especially relevant in the areas of value chain analysis and implementation, various forms of PPPs (public private partnerships). Instruments that can be used to engage with the private sector include sovereign loans and grants, and policy dialogue for private-sector development. Conceptual and practical toolkits for engaging with the private sector will be developed and disseminated to staff.
IFAD	CLE	6	IFAD	STR	COS	COSOPs should be used as a platform for more systematic engagement with the private sector.	The strategy elaborates how COSOPs could be used for more systematic engagement. COSOP consultations would provide a platform for policy dialogue on a supportive business environment (in October 2011 in Hanoi, Vietnam, a discussion forum was organised on building partnerships and sharing ideas with the private sector).

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
IFAD	CLE	7	IFAD	STR	PAR	IFAD should pursue more actively partnerships with other institutions, NGOs, and private sector companies that can complement the work of IFAD.	The strategy outlines how IFAD can pursue partnerships to pursue this objective. This includes linking to other knowledge forums such as the UN Global Compact and the Donor Committee for Enterprise Development. IFAD has also contributed to multi-donor funds such as AECF (Africa Enterprise Challenge Fund, a \$50-100 million fund) and AAF (African Agriculture Fund, a \$300 million fund seeking to invest in commercial farming operations). IFAD has not contributed financially to AAF, but sits as a permanent observer on the advisory board. In addition, IFAD raised 10 million Euros from EU for complementary technical assistance to targeted investments.
IFAD	CLE	8	IFAD	PLCY	PRM	A separate private-sector development financing facility should be established.	This was not supported by the Executive Board. There were extensive discussions during the 104th session (when the strategy was presented and discussed). However, the Board did not fully support the proposal for a financing facility; therefore Management decided not to pursue this option further.
IFAD	CLE	9	IFAD	STR	HR	IFAD should assess the human resources and organizational architecture needed to appropriately manage IFAD private sector development.	This was not supported by the Executive Board. The feasibility study was to be conducted in the context of the separate financing facility. However, there have been other initiatives to strengthen staff capacity towards better managing private sector development. This includes assigning a Senior Technical Adviser on private sector development, recruiting another technical adviser on rural markets and enterprise development; and strengthening knowledge management through workshops.