

Document: EC 2010/63/W.P.5/Add.1  
Agenda: 6  
Date: 22 June 2010  
Distribution: Public  
Original: English

**E**



Enabling poor rural people  
to overcome poverty

## **President's Report on the Implementation Status of Evaluation Recommendations and Management Actions (PRISMA)**

### **Volume II**

### **Agreement at completion point recommendations and follow-up actions taken by the Programme Management Department**

### **Addendum**

#### **Note to Evaluation Committee Members**

##### Focal points:

##### Technical questions:

**Shyam Khadka**  
Senior Portfolio Manager  
Programme Management Department  
telephone: +39 06 5459 2388  
e-mail: [s.khadka@ifad.org](mailto:s.khadka@ifad.org)

##### Dispatch of documentation:

**Deirdre McGrenra**  
Governing Bodies Officer  
telephone: +39 06 5459 2374  
e-mail: [d.mcgrenra@ifad.org](mailto:d.mcgrenra@ifad.org)

Evaluation Committee — Sixty-third Session  
Rome, 15–16 July 2010

---

**For: Review**

## Contents

<b>Abbreviations and acronyms</b>	<b>i</b>
<b>A. Country Programme Evaluation</b>	<b>1</b>
Ethiopia: Country Programme Evaluation	1
Nigeria: Country Programme Evaluation	3
Pakistan: Country Programme Evaluation	10
Sudan: Country Programme Evaluation	13
<b>B. Completion Evaluations</b>	<b>16</b>
Argentina: Rural Development Project for the North-eastern Provinces (PRODERNEA)	16
Ethiopia: Southern Region Cooperatives Development and Credit Project	18
Madagascar: Upper Mandraré Basin Development Project – Phase II (PHBM II)	19
<b>C. Interim Evaluations</b>	<b>25</b>
China: Qinling Mountain Area Poverty Alleviation Project	25
Guatemala: Rural Development Programme for Las Verapaces (PRODEVER)	27
Democratic People's Republic of Korea: Uplands Food Security Project (UFSP)	30
Philippines: Western Mindanao Community Initiatives Project (WMCIP)	33

## Abbreviations and acronyms

ACP	agreement at completion point
CDD	community driven development
CPM	country programme manager
COSOP	country strategic opportunities programme
ICRISAT	International Crops Research Institute for the Semi-Arid Tropics
IITA	International Institute of Tropical Agriculture
LGA	local government areas
M&E	monitoring and evaluation
MIS	management information system
MFI	microfinance institutions
PMD	Programme Management Department
RB-COSOP	results-based country strategic opportunities programme
RTEP	Root and Tuber Expansion Programme (Nigeria)
USAID	United States Agency for International Development

## Categories used for the classification of agreement at completion point agreed actions

IE	interim evaluation
CE	completion evaluation
CPE	country programme evaluation
SN	serial number

### Level

IFAD	IFAD corporate level
REG	IFAD regional level
CTRY	IFAD country level
GOV	government authorities (national, local level and institutions)
PROJ	project

### Nature

PLCY	policy
STRA	strategy development, including COSOPs and projects
OPER	operational and implementation

### Themes

ASR	analysis, studies and researches
BEN	beneficiaries and stakeholders' participation and consultation
DEC	decentralization
DES	project design
DIA	policy dialogue
FLD	field presence
GDR	gender (including targeting to women)
GOV	governance
HR	human resources (management, recruitment)
INF	infrastructure (construction, contracting, management, supervision)
INR	innovation and replication
KM	knowledge management
NRM	natural resource management
ORG	organizations, groups, institutions and collective approaches
PAR	partnership
PRM	private sector, market and enterprise development
PMA	project management and administration
RFI	rural finance
RME	results monitoring, evaluation
STRA	strategy
SUP	supervision
SUS	sustainability
TCB	training, capacity-building
TGT	targeting

# Agreement at completion point recommendations and follow-up action taken by the Programme Management Department

## A. Country Programme Evaluation

Country	Evaluation	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at completion point (ACP) agreed action	PMD follow-up
<b>Ethiopia: Country Programme Evaluation</b>							
<b>Recommendation 1: Where to Focus</b>							
Ethiopia	CPE	1	CTRY	STR	TGT	The COSOP should include a targeting strategy.	Completed. See paragraphs 38 to 40 of the RB-COSOP (Dec. 2008).
Ethiopia	CPE	2	CTRY	STR	TGT	There should be scope for focusing on food-deficit <i>woredas</i> (now better mapped with appropriate data) and for supporting dynamic economic changes in the rural economy with trickle-down effects.	Completed. The Participatory Small-scale Irrigation Development Programme is focussed on food-deficit <i>woreda</i> .
Ethiopia	CPE	3	CTRY	STR	STR	The new COSOP should identify measures to link different interventions (for example how to link rural finance with small-scale irrigation and agricultural marketing) and ensure better synergy between programmes.	Completed. Paragraph 44 of results based country strategic opportunities programme (RB-COSOP) (Dec. 2008).
Ethiopia	CPE	4	CTRY	STR	STR	For the next 10 years, IFAD should prioritize areas where it has developed a lead position, such as in small-scale irrigation and rural finance.	Completed. Paragraphs 31 to 34 of the RB-COSOP (Dec. 2008).
Ethiopia	CPE	5	CTRY	STR	STR	IFAD should continue involvement in pastoral community development (and promote synergies with rural finance).	The second Pastoral Community Development Project (PCDP II) was approved by the Executive Board in September 2009.
Ethiopia	CPE	6	CTRY	STR	SUS	Within small-scale irrigation, IFAD should scale up, refine and consolidate participatory approaches to improve sustainability.	Completed. The Participatory Small-scale Irrigation Development Programme includes specific criteria that must be complied with to ensure sustainability of related investments.
Ethiopia	CPE	7	CTRY	STR	NRM	IFAD should effectively address water use management, and soil and watershed conservation.	That criterion includes measures to improve water management and ensure watershed treatment.
Ethiopia	CPE	8	CTRY	OPER	PMA	Within rural finance, efforts need to be made in automating the manual systems and introducing proper, real time, management information systems (MIS).	The second phase of the ongoing Rural Financial Intermediation Programme, slated for presentation to the Executive Board in 2011, will include specific investments to strengthen the existing MIS systems of participating microfinance institutions (MFIs).
Ethiopia	CPE	9	CTRY	STR	PMA	Support should be provided for developing services in pastoral and other access deficit areas.	This is the main objective of PCDP II.
Ethiopia	CPE	10	CTRY	STR	NRM	Natural resource degradation is an area that warrants attention. But the strategy for dealing	The Community-based Integrated Natural Resources Management Project (CBINRMP), approved at the April 2009 Board, was designed

Country	Evaluation	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at completion point (ACP) agreed action	PMD follow-up
						with the problem needs to be carefully developed (in the design of the sustainable land use and management project with GECC).	jointly with GEF specifically to address the problem of sustainable land management in the Lake Tana Basin. Experiences and lessons learnt will provide a sound basis for scaling-up in other regions.
Ethiopia	CPE	11	CTRY	STR	NRM	With regard to the sustainable land use and management project, the factors that caused the felling of trees and the overexploitation of steep slopes need to be identified and proper solutions found.	Completed. See project design report.
Ethiopia	CPE	12	CTRY	STR	NRM	As in SN 11, in densely populated mountain countries, the poorest are often both victims of and contributors to natural resource degradation (they have to use common lands and forests for firewood collection and grazing their livestock). Strict protection, without providing alternatives, may make them worse off.	These factors were taken into account in the design of the CBINRMP.
<b>Recommendation 2: Tools to promote innovation</b>							
Ethiopia	CPE	13	CTRY	STR	ASR	<b>Using grants in a smart way for knowledge management and pilot testing:</b> IFAD could be innovative and use supplementary grant funds for preparatory studies, baseline surveys and impact studies, which could be contracted to independent third parties.	Supplementary grant funds have been secured to finance the services of a full-time knowledge management and communication officer for the country programme.
Ethiopia	CPE	14	CTRY	STR	DIA	<b>Policy dialogue:</b> Supplementary activities such as specific studies and symposia on thematic issues may be required and objectives, instruments and resources (staff time, particularly for the country office [CO] staff, and financial resources) have to be allocated.	Ongoing - in collaboration with development partners and the Government. Market studies and symposia have been organized by the Government and the microfinance industry stakeholders on themes such as agricultural output marketing, rural finance and pastoral community development.
Ethiopia	CPE	15	CTRY	OPER	DIA	Well targeted study tours to countries that have undergone similar challenges should be considered as an effective tool of policy dialogue.	Ongoing - in collaboration with development partners and the Government. Study tours have been organized to India and the United Republic of Tanzania.
<b>Recommendation 3: Working with whom?</b>							
Ethiopia	CPE	16	CTRY	STR	PAR	Partnerships in Ethiopia (at the federal as well as the regional and sub-regional or woreda level) should continue in the context of future interventions. It is recommended to increase the focus on constructing partnerships between the public sector, civil society and the private sector at the regional and sub-regional level.	Ongoing - in collaboration with development partners and government. Partnerships have been forged with stakeholders, for example IFAD is working with 10 NGOs (national and international) on pastoral community development.
Ethiopia	CPE	17	CTRY	STR	PAR	Partnerships with the private sector should be	Ongoing - in collaboration with development partners and the

Country	Evaluation	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at completion point (ACP) agreed action	PMD follow-up
						encouraged. Although the Agricultural Marketing Improvement Programme (AMIP) is at the implementation stage, successful experiences at the local level should be encouraged in order to enhance public-private sector collaboration.	Government. Under AMIP, the driving force in project implementation is the district based, commodity-specific agri-marketing improvement plans which are prepared and implemented jointly with key players in the value chain including producers, brokers, transporters, traders, etc.
Ethiopia	CPE	18	CTRY	STR	PAR	Even though aid modalities and priorities of bilateral donors have undergone major changes recently, the CPE finds that IFAD should not stop seeking cooperation opportunities with bilateral donors.	Ongoing - in collaboration with development partners and the Government. For example, under the CBINRMP, cofinancing has been mobilized from Spain.
Ethiopia	CPE	19	CTRY	STR	PAR	The complexity of diverse procurement procedures with the cofinancier (AfDB) and cooperating institution (World Bank) has not been conducive to smooth implementation and should be avoided unless one set of procedures and rules for procurement can be agreed.	Noted. Appropriate measures have been taken to forestall such protracted procedures. However, complex procurement procedures are an inevitable part of cofinancing.
<b>Recommendation 4: Programme and project cycle management</b>							
Ethiopia	CPE	20	CTRY	STR	STR	Given IFAD's limited resources for strategy work and COSOP formulation, a six-year planning period (covering two Performance Based Allocation System (PBAS) periods instead of one) is recommended, with a review at mid-term. As prescribed by the current COSOP guidelines, the COSOP should have a clearly specified implementation period and should be updated at the mid-term review.	The RB-COSOP covers a period of seven years (2009-15) in parallel with the country's third generation poverty reduction strategy paper. It will be reviewed annually and updated every two years. See paragraph 43 of RB-COSOP (2008).
Ethiopia	CPE	21	CTRY	STR	SUP	IFAD needs to carry out an assessment of financial and human resource requirements and training needs for managing direct supervision.	Continuous.
Ethiopia	CPE	22	CTRY	STR	FLD	The assessment of financial/HR requirements and training needs should begin with the COs where resources should be increased.	The country programme manager (CPM) and associate CPM will be out-posted to Ethiopia in 2010.
<b>Nigeria: Country Programme Evaluation</b>							
<b>Recommendation 1: Renewal of focus on small-scale agriculture for poverty alleviation</b>							
Nigeria	CPE	1	CTRY	STR	TGT	The evaluation recommends that future IFAD strategy and activities in Nigeria should address the main challenges related to the low productivity of smallholder farmers.	IFAD adopted two strategic approaches to address smallholder farmers' low productivity. First is within the framework of the IFAD/FAO/Federal Ministry of Agriculture and Water Resources (FMAWR) rapid response project to rising food prices, conceived in 2009 by PA in collaboration with FAO and the Government of Nigeria. The project was modelled alongside a value chain approach that has productivity and income increases as the main objective. It has an inbuilt mechanism to facilitate farmers' access to yield-

Country	Evaluation	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at completion point (ACP) agreed action	PMD follow-up
							<p>enhancing technologies through targeted partnership with credible agri-input dealers (for guaranteed agri-inputs supply) and private extension operators (for effective extension delivery services) to ensure best practices for crop and livestock production.</p> <p>Second, the recently approved RB-COSOP, through its first strategic objective, aims to improve the access of smallholder farmers to more affordable agricultural production technologies, farm inputs and support services so as to transform agriculture sustainably from subsistence to business-oriented activities. A specific value chain development programme to which IFAD will contribute US\$70 million will emphasize competitiveness and value addition along the entire chain through increased farm level productivity, processing and access to market. This programme will partner with relevant private sector operators to leverage their services in the provision of high tech inputs to improve productivity of smallholder farmers, while at the same time ensuring the best use of natural resources (land, forest and water) and environmental management practices.</p> <p>The CO in Nigeria has initiated commodity alliances and partnerships with service providers on behalf of the programmes. For instance, the Community-based Natural Resource Management Programme (CBNRMP) and the Community-based Agricultural and Rural Development Programme (CBARDP) recently entered into partnership with Notore, Candel, and Savannah Seed Companies for the timely supply of premium fertilizers, crop protection products and high quality seeds. The CO is currently relying on the country programme management team to improve the quality of supervision and extension delivery and enhance productivity at the farm level. In all the partnerships mentioned above, the private sector plays a critical role in driving the process by ensuring smallholder farmers' access to inputs and the needed technologies in order to improve productivity, competitiveness, profitability and income.</p>
Nigeria	CPE	2	CTRY	STR	TGT	The heterogeneity of small farmers would require different approaches that cater to the needs of both subsistence and market-oriented individuals and groups.	Subsistence farmers are hampered by low productivity resulting from low-input technologies or lack of inputs altogether. Existing programmes address the low productivity issue by making modern inputs available to these farmers through private sector operators (agri-kiosks) in rural areas. Market-oriented farmers are assisted by means of processing technologies provided by private service providers and NGOs.
Nigeria	CPE	3	CTRY	STR	PRM	Particular attention should be given to ensuring more systematic access to markets by adopting a value-chain approach, as well as linkages with the private sector, for example, for the provision of sustainable rural financial services and agro-processing.	The post-CPE era has been devoted to mainstreaming a value chain approach in IFAD programmes using the Root and Tuber Expansion Programme (RTEP) and the IFAD/FAO/FMAWR joint project to pioneer the process. Accordingly, the two interventions have internalized an outgrower-processor linkage to sustainably supply raw materials from farmers to identified markets (processors). For

Country	Evaluation	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at completion point (ACP) agreed action	PMD follow-up
							instance, RTEP and CBARDP developed two levels of out-growers, namely: (a) out-growers for the production of high quality seeds/planting materials and (b) out-growers for the production and supply of raw materials to processors. The two categories of outgrowers are further linked to agri-input suppliers, financial institutions and spray-men to leverage timely, yield-enhancing agro-chemicals, commercial credit and extension services respectively from private sector operators. For instance, the CBARDP has developed community seed out-growers in Yobe, Jigawa and Kebbi States while similar groups exist for cassava multiplication in the 26 states in which RTEP has been operating. Each group is linked to foundation seed companies in liaison with processors to plant and produce raw materials according to specific end-users' requirements. In addition, two levels of market linkages are in use, namely: (a) linkage to major processors that exert a big pull at the supply side (farmers end) and linkage to small processors that are clustered around farmers for immediate and timely uptake of farm produce from small farmers. Moreover, the inclusion of a paid market officer was extended to the established groups in order to handle their market/marketing issues including sales and diversification of product range. The IFAD-assisted Rural Finance Institution Building (RUFIN) will provide capacity-building assistance to financial institutions in order to improve service delivery and sustainable credit access to the poor and smallholder farmers. The Regional Cassava Processing and Marketing Initiative, a pilot programme in the West and Central Africa Division attempted to introduce an integrated medium-scale processing unit comprising a cassava processing unity, cassava processing shed and cassava processing plant to process high quality cassava flour and odourless fufu as part of value addition to fresh tubers.
Nigeria	CPE	4	CTRY	STR	TGT	It is recommended that the renewed focus should be accompanied by a reduced geographic coverage of IFAD-supported operations, including those that have a national coverage as well as those that take an area-based development approach. For example, the levels of rural poverty and gender inequality are two important criteria for choosing the intensity of support to states and LGAs (local government areas) upon which to focus.	IFAD will take advantage of the upcoming mid-term review of CBNRMP in the Niger Delta Region to scale down the geographical coverage. A similar approach will be followed during the extension period of CBARDP and the design of the new value chain programme to maximize impact. Efforts are being made to streamline and refocus RUFIN so as to concentrate in those areas where existing IFAD-funded programmes are intervening. The joint IFAD/FAO/FMAWR project to be implemented soon will focus on three states of CBARDP and CBNRMP, respectively while field activities will take place in one location per state in line with the CPE recommendation.
<b>Recommendation 2: Adaptation of the Institutional Framework and Partnerships</b>							
Nigeria	CPE	5	CTRY	STR	DEC	The CPE recommends that the current operational arrangements whereby the roles	IFAD-funded programmes have focused their attention on local and state governments though some capacity building at the federal



Country	Evaluation	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at completion point (ACP) agreed action	PMD follow-up
						and responsibilities of the Federal Government and state and local governments are adequately stratified be further deepened to emphasize intensity of action at the local levels.	level is provided. This approach, which will continue to drive the implementation of these programmes, will be deepened. However, this approach has been challenged by the inability of the state and local governments to meet their counterpart fund obligations to which the disbursement of IFAD resources has been tied, thereby slowing down programme implementation. The deduction at source, as recommended by the CPE and various supervision missions, cannot be enforced because of the limitations imposed by the Constitution of the Federal Republic of Nigeria.  To remedy the situation, the Regional Implementation Workshop held in Accra, Ghana in December 2009 recommended an amendment of the financing agreements to limit the contributions of the state and local governments to taxes, salaries and office accommodation. Steps have been taken to reflect this recommendation in the CBARDP Financing Agreement being amended. Likewise, the CBNRMP Financing Agreement will also be amended accordingly.
Nigeria	CPE	6	CTRY	STR	PAR	Lending to State Governments under the Subsidiary Loan Agreements with the Federal Ministry of Finance is an effective way of increasing ownership and giving greater direct responsibility to facilitate the flow of funds and allocation of counterpart financing by the States authorities.	Lending to the state governments has been operational through the Subsidiary Loan Agreement between the Federal Government of Nigeria (FGN) and the state governments. Certainly, this situation has brought the state governments closer to IFAD operations. But, it has not improved the flow of funds, as envisaged by the CPE. Rather, the state governments have continued to not meet their counterpart fund obligation. Because of this constraint, it will be advisable to limit government contribution to salaries, office accommodation and taxes in order to enable programmes to leverage available IFAD funds and increase the intensity of service delivery.
Nigeria	CPE	7	CTRY	STR	ASR	Allocation of grant resources to national agricultural research institutions will contribute to the development of appropriate technologies and identify innovative approaches to sustainable agricultural development.	The IFAD-funded programmes are presently benefiting from the International Crops Research Institute for the Semi-Arid Tropics (ICRISAT) grant on varietals improvement of sorghum and millet, IFDC grant on soil fertility improvement management, International Institute of Tropical Agriculture (IITA) grants on varietals improvement and production management for cowpea, yam and cassava through collaboration on adaptive research and provision of improved materials and practices to farmers. IITA has made available to RTEP farmers, through IFAD grant, over five improved varieties of yams and 10 improved varieties of cassava. Collaboration with these research institutions will continue.
Nigeria	CPE	8	CTRY	STR	PMA	IFAD needs to ensure that the federal partner agencies selected have the required skills, experience and competencies to ensure effective implementation and support to IFAD-financed activities.	IFAD will ensure that the federal partner agencies selected have the required skills, experience and competencies to ensure effective implementation and support to IFAD-financed activities. It is within this framework that a handful of agencies such as the Central Bank of Nigeria, the National Poverty Eradication Programme, the Nigerian

Country	Evaluation	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at completion point (ACP) agreed action	PMD follow-up
							Agricultural, Cooperative and Rural Development Bank and the Federal Department of Cooperatives have been selected to work with RUFIN.
Nigeria	CPE	9	CTRY	STR	PAR	It is recommended that IFAD expeditiously develop a mutually satisfactory understanding on pending institutional issues, in terms of coordination, division of labour and implementation, especially as they relate to the Rural Microenterprise Development Programme (RUMEDP), which has not yet been negotiated.	The institutional complexity in RUMEDP which delayed the programme negotiation was harmoniously sorted out in February 2009. FMAWR was appointed as the lead agency during the negotiations held in September 2009, while the Federal Ministry of Commerce and Industry (FMCI) is a collaborating ministry. The Financing Agreement of RUMEDP has not been signed yet.
Nigeria	CPE	10	CTRY	STR	STR	In the absence of an understanding (see recommendation above), IFAD management may consider cancelling the corresponding loan in the near future, thereby allowing IFAD to devote its limited resources to other pressing country strategy, programme development and implementation issues.	The FGN requested an extension of the signing of the Financing Agreement to 31 March 2010. As the deadline has passed without the signing of the agreement, IFAD will cancel the loan.
<b>Recommendation 3: Promoting Pro-poor Innovative Solutions</b>							
Nigeria	CPE	11	CTRY	STR	INR	IFAD should focus its future country strategy and programme on promoting pro-poor innovative solutions to rural poverty, which can be replicated and scaled up by the Government, donors, private sector and others.	IFAD has successfully pioneered a community-driven development (CDD) approach to rural development which is participatory, bottom-up and demand-driven. Because of its demand-driven nature, the CDD approach was followed by RTEP which established 166 functional cassava processing units and over 350 out-growers in the 26 states of Nigeria. The states and local government councils (LGCs) are increasingly involving the communities in the decision making process. The CDD model is presently being used and up-scaled by the World Bank-funded FADAMA III Project, AfDB-assisted CBARDP and EU-funded micro-projects programme in the Niger Delta State of Nigeria, and the World Bank-funded Local Empowerment and Environmental Management Program (LEEMP), etc. The integration of rural infrastructure in community development and provision of revolving seed capital, revolving seed support and various coping mechanisms to climate change and environmental degradation are among the innovations that are presently being scaled up by CBARDP and CBNRMP.
Nigeria	CPE	12	CTRY	STR	INR	A more systematic approach should be adopted to finding and piloting innovations, and greater attention be paid to policy dialogue, knowledge management and development of strategic partnerships, which are important factors in replication and scaling up of successful innovations.	The IFAD-funded programmes, with assistance from the CO, are currently developing a communication and knowledge sharing strategy that will serve as a sustainable platform to finding, piloting and sharing innovations within and outside the programmes. This strategy will complement the effort of the CO which has been strengthened and mandated to forge strategic partnerships, participate in policy dialogue, track success stories and facilitate replication of success stories.

Country	Evaluation	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at completion point (ACP) agreed action	PMD follow-up
Nigeria	CPE	13	CTRY	STR	INR	Proactive efforts are required to link grants to loan-funded investment projects. Grants may be used for testing innovative solutions, which can then be applied more broadly through loans.	The IFAD programmes are currently benefiting from the ICRISAT grant on varieties improvement of sorghum and millet, IFAD grant on soil fertility improvement management, IITA grants on varieties improvement and production management for cowpea, yam and cassava through collaboration on adaptive research and provision of improved materials and practices to farmers. These grants are intended to test innovative solutions that can be replicated at the programme level.
Nigeria	CPE	14	CTRY	STR	INR	Among other areas, innovations should be centred on the objective of improving smallholder farmer productivity, taking into account the challenges currently facing farmers, including those of rising commodity prices. This should also include consideration of adaptive research oriented to the needs of small farmers. Likewise, innovative solutions to limit the effects of climate change on farmers should be explored.	The programmes are collaborating with IITA, ICRISAT, ADPs and federal agricultural agencies, the United States Agency for International Development (USAID), and the Notore Fertilizer Company in effective utilization of research findings through field trials and demonstration. In addition, innovative approaches in zero tillage have been applied during planting and use of foliar fertilizers during specific weeks to increase the productivity of cereals by over 70 per cent. The programmes (RTEP, CBARDP and CBNRMP) have introduced various business-oriented and income-generating enterprise diversification activities and land management practices as coping mechanisms to climate change. These include grass-cutter cage production, backyard piggery production, mobile aquaculture production system, zero tillage (to maximize soil fertility, minimize erosion, silt formation and water pollution) etc. The programme recently introduced a contract farming model to facilitate the access of smallholder farmers' market and credit.
Nigeria	CPE	15	CTRY	STR	PAR	More attention should be given to private/public sector partnerships, donor coordination and policy dialogue.	IFAD programmes in Nigeria have increasingly weaved interventions around private/public partnership. Partnerships have been developed with selected private sector operators such as Notore Fertilizer Company, Candel Agri-Input Company, Savannah Seeds, etc. Partnerships have been forged with Olam Nig Ltd, Cassava Agro-Industries Services Ltd, Fidelity Bank, First Bank, United Bank for Africa and several MFIs to leverage services on behalf of farmers. CBARDP and CBNRMP have recently entered into partnership with the United Nations Development Fund for Women and USAID-funded Farmer-to-Farmer programme on gender integration in the development process as well as with specialized bodies on beekeeping, fisheries production and poultry management to deepen involvement in agri-business and enterprise development. The CO has been very active in donor coordination meetings and policy dialogues through the IFAD/FAO Food Security Thematic Group that meets periodically, the United Nations Programme Management Team, and multilateral and bilateral donor group meetings. It is taking advantage of those fora to positively influence policy and strategy on smallholder agriculture and strengthen community-based and local institutional authority.

Country	Evaluation	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at completion point (ACP) agreed action	PMD follow-up
							<p>It has also taken advantage of its participation in the FAO/FMAWR/IFAD Consultative Group, Federal Agricultural Development Project Executive Committee and the Microfinance Advisory Board (for rural finance) to positively influence decisions for smallholder farmers and the microfinance policy framework in Nigeria.</p> <p>In addition, the RB-COSOP has given due recognition to various partnerships as exemplified by: (i) partnerships between smallholders and national agricultural research institutes (IITA, the International Center for Agricultural Research in the Dry Areas [ICARDA], the International Centre of Insect Physiology and Ecology [ICIPE] and Africa Rice Center) to develop affordable technologies to improve extension services at all levels of government as well as raise smallholder productivity; (ii) collaboration with the World Bank, the African Development Bank and USAID, on value chain segments; (iii) partnership with the Niger Delta Development Commission, the Ministry of Niger Delta Affairs, the national environment ministries, and the ministries of agriculture at all levels of government; (iv) partnership with local government councils, NGOs and community-based organizations (CBOs), as well as farmers' and producers' organizations to strengthen community involvement in local planning and development, which is key to the CDD approach.</p>
<b>Recommendation 4: Strengthening Local Governance</b>							
Nigeria	CPE	16	CTRY	STR	GOV	<p>More attention should be devoted to positioning CDD within the broader local governance framework, strengthening the capability of actors at all levels, such as the state and LGAs, elected local bodies, the private sector, and local NGOs and CBOs (community-based organizations). In particular, at the state and LGA level, there is a need to reinforce grass roots and local government capabilities in development planning, delivery and improvement of service provision. Empowerment and consolidation for progressive devolution of governance to the local level should be supported through policy dialogue and improved knowledge management. The CDD approach should in fact be adopted even more widely as an instrument for participatory agriculture and rural development activities in Nigeria.</p>	<p>CDD has been the hallmark of IFAD's intervention in Nigeria. The programmes have extended training in capacity building in CDD to key staff of the local government authority and community leaders following the introduction of the training with the rural communities. The outcome has resulted in increased community and LGC buy-in, community involvement in the decision-making process, accountability, infrastructure reflecting community priorities, and use of the model by non-benefiting LGCs. It has been estimated that over 70 per cent of the LGCs have adopted the CDD approach. The programmes have intensified training in participatory planning, monitoring and evaluation (M&amp;E) at the community level to enable community members to initiate, implement and monitor their own developmental initiatives so as to ensure sustainability of rural projects after completion.</p> <p>Activities on gender mainstreaming have been increasing to provide women and youth with the opportunity to contribute to the decision-making process as well as enhance their income from agriculture and other micro-enterprises. The last supervision missions of the programmes observed that jobs have been created by the first set of women and youth beneficiaries in sewing, agro-processing welding, soap manufacturing and making finished products.</p> <p>Despite the successful results from the CDD approach, more time is</p>

Country	Evaluation	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at completion point (ACP) agreed action	PMD follow-up
							needed by the two community-based programmes (CBARDP and CBNRMP) to consolidate the achievements and integrate sustainability properly in the process, one of the reasons for seeking an extension of the CBARDP completion date.
Nigeria	CPE	17	CTRY	STR	ORG	The development of robust farmer associations as part of a stronger local governance framework that can lead to better empowerment of the poor would be another area of innovation for IFAD and the Government to pursue in the future.	The recently closed RTEP started working on strengthening farmer associations. Unfortunately, there was not enough time to consolidate this work. It is expected that the implementation of the value chain programme scheduled to be designed in the next few months will build on the unfinished RTEP work and use it as an entry point for the development of commodity value chains.
Nigeria	CPE	18	CTRY	STR	BEN	IFAD can play a role in supporting the broader participation of all tiers of government and research institutions and grass roots organizations in development, principally through sensitization, capability building, counselling and mentoring.	Sensitization, capability building, counselling and mentoring in all tiers of government and non-government organizations, as well as awareness creation for donors in CDD have been the IFAD comparative advantage in Nigeria. IFAD will continue to play a major role in this area for years to come by working with local government to ensure replication and scaling up.
<b>Recommendation 5: Adaptation of the IFAD Operating Model</b>							
Nigeria	CPE	19	CTRY	STR	FLD	IFAD should seek ways and means of strengthening its country presence, for example in terms of human and financial resources, infrastructure, roles and responsibility.	IFAD put extensive efforts into the recruitment of a highly experienced country programme officer who has strengthened the technical capacity of the Country Programme Office. Unfortunately, the financial resources have not been commensurate with the technical capacity. For instance, the Country Programme Office is not endowed with a vehicle to allow full mobility of the office staff for programme supervision and interaction with other donors.
Nigeria	CPE	20	CTRY	STR	FLD	The option of out-posting the CPM should be explored. Such an IFAD country presence could eventually have a sub-regional dimension, which would entail the CPM covering and based in Nigeria also assuming responsibilities for IFAD operations in selected neighbouring countries.	This option is worthwhile and IFAD's Western and Central Africa Division has been reflecting on this as the base for its medium-term plan. In the meantime, the pressing need is to strengthen the Country Programme Office through additional financial means.
Nigeria	CPE	21	CTRY	STR	STR	Given the current levels of IFAD human resources allocated to Nigeria, it was suggested that financing fewer projects with larger loan amounts would appear to be the most plausible option.	The recommendation has been taken into account in Nigeria. The RB-COSOP envisages a top-up on an existing programme and design a large value chain programme that will absorb the bulk of the resources under the current (2010-2012) PBA cycle.
<b>Pakistan: Country Programme Evaluation</b>							
<b>Recommendation 1: Better balance between agricultural and non-farm investments</b>							
Pakistan	CPE	1	CTRY	STR	PRM	The CPE recommends that more resources be devoted to non-farm opportunities, including small agri-businesses and family-based rural microenterprises. It also stresses the importance of promoting wider market linkages for both agricultural and non-farm outputs.	Exploring non-farm opportunities is one of the central focuses in the design of the post-CPE projects. For instance, the recently started Crop Maximization Support Programme has devised a special revolving fund for income diversification initiatives by special interest groups of women and the landless poor people. Promoting market linkages and value chain development are part of the objectives for

Country	Evaluation	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at completion point (ACP) agreed action	PMD follow-up
							the two new projects currently under design in Punjab and Balochistan.
Pakistan	CPE	2	CTRY	STR	RFI	The CPE states that further developing rural financial services and products for agriculture and non-agricultural activities is central to ensuring that the poor have access to financing for rural poverty alleviation initiatives.	The ongoing Programme for Increasing Sustainability and Outreach in Microfinance (PRISM) is supporting and has made progress on some innovative microfinance enhancement initiatives, such as letters of credit, cash collateral, guarantee, equity fund, etc. The bulk of CMSP funding is devoted to establishing revolving funds to be operated by village organizations for the purpose of enhancing the target groups' access to financial resources. The new project under design in Punjab envisages support to a micro health insurance scheme for the target group.
Pakistan	CPE	3	CTRY	STR	STR	In terms of agricultural activities, greater attention should be paid to livestock development and high-value crops such as fruit, vegetables and flowers that provide higher returns on investments.	Livestock development will be one of the main activities for support under the new projects in Punjab and Balochistan. High-value crops such as off-season vegetables is also a priority item for the Punjab project.
Pakistan	CPE	4	CTRY	STR	NRM	Agricultural land investments should be accompanied by measures aimed at improving environmental and natural resource management, such as integrated catchment management and increasing the efficiency of water use under rainfed conditions, and to instituting environmental assessments for infrastructure constructed by projects.	The Punjab project is expect to support, as a part of project activities, land improvement measures such as conservation agriculture (zero/minimum tillage, mulching/cover-cropping and crop rotation), soil drainage to overcome the water-logging problems, etc. Conducting an environmental assessment is a standard requirement for infrastructure development.
<b>Recommendation 2: Capacity development support to decentralized entities</b>							
Pakistan	CPE	5	CTRY	STR	TCB	IFAD should provide capacity development support to decentralized entities and other bodies working at the local level to complement the work of other larger development partners. This requires that continued attention be given to social mobilization and the strengthening of CBOs, local NGOs and rural civil society in general.	Given its comparative advantage and based on lessons learnt, IFAD's focus of support for local capacity development is on the village- and community-level organizations, as well as the apex body of these organizations. Social mobilization is always treated as the foundation for community development and is done as the first step for group formation. All these are embedded in the ongoing CMSP and the new projects currently under design in Punjab and Balochistan.
Pakistan	CPE	6	CTRY	STR	DEC	The Fund should take a more inclusive approach to supporting decentralization by establishing the building blocks for a more service orientated relationship between governments and local organizations.	See 5 above. In addition, in the specific project context, where government agencies act as implementation partners, IFAD endeavours to promote a service-orientation of these agencies. This is envisaged, e.g., for the Punjab project for the Departments of Agriculture and Livestock.
Pakistan	CPE	7	CTRY	STR	TCB	IFAD should build up the capacity both of local governments (at the district, <i>tehsil</i> and union levels) and of representatives of elected bodies (e.g. village councils, local legislative assemblies, etc.) that play an important role in planning and resource allocation for rural poverty alleviation at the grass-roots level and	See 5 above. It should be noted that currently there are many uncertainties on the prospect of decentralization and devolution.

Country	Evaluation	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at completion point (ACP) agreed action	PMD follow-up
						in promoting accountability and transparency of local administrations involved in IFAD-supported projects.	
Pakistan	CPE	8	CTRY	STR	BEN	Greater participation by private-sector groups of farmers and enterprises is warranted to ensure better results.	Farmer groups in the form of village organizations/community organizations/self-interest groups are always standard instruments for community development activities under IFAD-funded projects and these will be sustained under new operations. The role of private sector enterprises will become more prominent in the new projects in Punjab and Balochistan because of the intention of promoting market linkage and value chain development.
<b>Recommendation 3: Working in disadvantaged, remote and conflict-ridden areas</b>							
Pakistan	CPE	9	CTRY	STR	TGT	The CPE recommends that the Fund continue to support the Government in its engagement in disadvantaged, remote and conflict-ridden areas such as the NWFP (North West-Frontier Province), AJK (Azad Jammu and Kashmir) and the FATAs (Federally Administered Tribal Areas). However, this requires a more differentiated approach that is flexible and adapted to such challenging areas, paying careful attention to the specific social context, culture and priorities of the rural people living there.	For the PBAS 2010-2012 cycle, the Government has requested IFAD to finance two new projects in Punjab and Balochistan. This means that IFAD will not have new projects in NWFP, AJK and FATA in the near future.
Pakistan	CPE	10	CTRY	STR	PMA	In these areas, it will be essential to mobilize specific expertise for project design, implementation and supervision.	Agree, but see 9 above.
Pakistan	CPE	11	CTRY	STR	STR	The interventions in these areas should have more time for project execution, without having a negative impact on the PBAS score.	This is beyond operations.
<b>Recommendation 4: Promote Innovations</b>							
Pakistan	CPE	12	CTRY	STR	INR	The strengthening of IFAD's capacity to promote innovations that can be scaled up and replicated by the Government, donor organizations and the private sector, merits increased attention and resources in Pakistan. This will include a more systematic approach to identifying and piloting innovative approaches to agriculture and rural development; better documentation; the sharing of successfully tested innovations; greater resources and capacity to engage in policy dialogue (e.g. on local governance issues, rural finance outreach, pro-poor agricultural policies); and carefully selecting partner institutions with a good track record both in introducing and	Promoting innovation is a key cross-cutting concern well integrated into new project design. For instance, CMSP has designed a special window of funding for women and the landless. Successful implementation of the scheme will have wider demonstration and replication effect in the baseline CMP-II, which is much bigger in scope. Similarly, the proposed use of a poverty scorecard for the identification of target groups in the new Punjab project will ensure more accurate poverty targeting; the approach is likely to have major replication effect. These efforts will be backed up by a systematic approach for knowledge management (KM), both at country programme and project levels. A country programme KM strategy has been prepared, and preparation of a KM strategy and action plan is now a standard requirement for the new projects.

Country	Evaluation	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at completion point (ACP) agreed action	PMD follow-up
						nurturing innovations and in working with the rural poor in similar IFAD priority areas.	
Pakistan	CPE	13	CTRY	STR	INR	Promoting innovations will also call for greater synergies between, and the wider use of, the mix of instruments (loans, grants, policy dialogue, etc.) available to the Fund as well as enhanced country involvement and ownership of grants.	This remains a challenge, especially in terms of loan/grant linkages and country ownership of grants (particularly regional ones). However, efforts have been made to enhance the synergies, e.g., the better integration of lessons from grant projects into the design of loan operations (e.g. Punjab).
Pakistan	CPE	14	CTRY	STR	INR	Innovative approaches are needed in a number of areas such as remittances (savings accounts, investment opportunities); migration (improving the value of landless people on the employment market through vocational training and helping them find employment in small towns, urban centres and overseas); promotion of local governance; and the use of grants (as opposed to loans) to support efforts by larger development actors in conflict areas such as FATAs.	No major actions yet, due to either varied operational priorities or limitation of instruments.
<b>Recommendation 5: Adjust IFAD's operating model</b>							
Pakistan	CPE	15	CTRY	STR	FLD	IFAD should establish a more consolidated and permanent country presence in line with Executive Board approved policies and budget allocation (one option to strengthen country presence in Pakistan is to outpost the CPM from Rome).	Pakistan is on IFAD's official list of countries where the CO will be formally established and be led by an out-posted CPM. IFAD has communicated with the Government on the matter.
Pakistan	CPE	16	CTRY	STR	SUP	IFAD should undertake direct supervision and implementation of IFAD-funded projects and programmes; and make efforts to improve both knowledge management and project- and country-level M&E systems.	All IFAD projects are/will be directly supervised by IFAD, except in two cases where World Bank acts as CI. These latter two cases were designed and started before IFAD was allowed to assume supervision responsibility. Refer to 9 above for KM. The CO has set up a quarterly monitoring system. Efforts of improving project M&E systems are routine. Such efforts are backed up by the appointment of a national M&E focal point as part of the CO (who also serves as implementation support specialist).
<b>Sudan: Country Programme Evaluation</b>							
<b>Recommendation 1: Agriculture as a key sector of intervention</b>							
Sudan	CPE	1	CTRY	STR	STR	The Evaluation recommends that IFAD address further the root causes of low smallholder productivity by focussing more on agriculture in the next COSOP. Localities where market access is available and where basic services and infrastructure have proved to support labour productivity could be favoured.	Low productivity in agriculture is attributed to policy factors, inappropriate and limited outreach of agricultural services and to marketing and financing practices that exclude the rural poor. The three strategic objectives of the RB-COSOP 2009-2012 refer to the key interventions required for agricultural development, namely: (i) increased capacity of producers' organizations to participate in policy planning and monitoring for sustainable development; (ii) increased access of poor rural people to agricultural services;



Country	Evaluation	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at completion point (ACP) agreed action	PMD follow-up
							and (iii) increased access of poor rural women and men to markets and microfinance. The focus on better endowed localities was partially adhered to in the selection of geographic areas of interventions of the two projects scheduled in the 2010 and 2011 pipeline. Indeed, exclusive focus on better endowed localities in terms of services and infrastructure may lead to aid crowding as this is where all the international development assistance is directed.
Sudan	CPE	2	CTRY	STR	PRM	In the environment of rising prices, the issues of value-chain marketing and market access require more consideration than they received in the past.	Three projects out of the four to be submitted to the EB during the period 2009-2012 address marketing constraints. These three projects are: (i) the monopoly of the gum arabic trade in the Revitalizing The Sudan Gum Arabic Production and Marketing Project approved in September 2009; (ii) the physical access to secondary markets in the Rural Access Project approved in December 2009; (iii) the organization of producers to scale up production, improve producers' bargaining power, and attract traders to production areas in the forthcoming project in Southern Sudan to be submitted to the Board in April 2011.
Sudan	CPE	3	CTRY	STR	DEC	IFAD could also build on current efforts such as the decentralized agricultural extension services which have been beneficial to smallholders.	Support decentralized extension is a constant feature of ongoing and upcoming projects. IFAD supervision is currently addressing the issue of financing the recurrent costs of extension services in the post project period. Fee-based services are being introduced in addition to partnerships with other donor-funded projects. This is under implementation in the South Kordofan Rural Development Programme (SKRDP).
Sudan	CPE	4	CTRY	STR	NRM	Land tenure, traditional rainfed cultivation, overgrazing and livestock should continue to be addressed. However, consideration should be given to pursuing these in a more focused and systematic manner to ensure greater integration and synergies in these areas.	The country team will produce a detailed analysis in the second semester of 2010 on the constraints and lessons learned from the land tenure reform process and its outcome in the context of the Gash Sustainable Livelihoods Regeneration Project. With regard to the opening of stock routes and management of the mobility of pastoral herds, the Western Sudan Resources Management Programme is still in the consolidation phase and being monitored in the context of the direct supervision missions.
<b>Recommendation 2: Promoting pro-poor agricultural innovations</b>							
Sudan	CPE	5	CTRY	STR	INR	Notwithstanding the programme's good performance in the areas of rural finance or institutional innovations, the Evaluation recommends that IFAD redouble efforts in promoting pro-poor agricultural innovations. These have been weaker than innovations in the other programme components. A more systematic approach to replication and scaling up of agricultural innovations should also be developed.	In collaboration with Mr. Cheikh Sourang, IFAD CPM, the country team is learning to use the scaling-up framework of its ongoing and future operations. The work is still under progress.

Country	Evaluation	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at completion point (ACP) agreed action	PMD follow-up
Sudan	CPE	6	CTRY	STR	INR	In particular, Government and IFAD will identify, test and replicate technological packages that constitute an adaptation to climate change such as technologies for increased soil fertility, herd and range management in drought-affected areas, cost-effective environmental conservation, energy efficient agro-processing.	Currently and in the short term the main technological packages - in response to productivity constraints at the smallholder level - address moisture management through soil and water conservation; crop rotation and inclusion of leguminous crops to address fertility issues; inclusion of fodder crops in the rotation; management of communal rangelands and promotion of community forestry. Furthermore, discussions are ongoing with GEF and the Environment and Climate Division in IFAD to test climate change mitigation measures.
<b>Recommendation 3: Scaling Up Policy Dialogue</b>							
Sudan	CPE	7	CTRY	STR	DIA	The Division should scale up agricultural policy dialogue to the national level. This could be done by presenting a limited set of strategic themes for dialogue in the forthcoming Sudan COSOP which are the most relevant to the new strategic orientations. Policy dialogue on these strategic themes could then be enhanced and sustained throughout the life of the next COSOP through the regular follow-up and analysis mandated in the RB-COSOP framework, including annual workshops and the mid-term review exercise.	Three themes were identified in the COSOP as follows: (i) budgetary allocation to the rainfed sector; (ii) devolution of water management to users' organizations; and (iii) sustainable microfinance services supported by an enabling policy framework. The country team is formulating a road map for policy dialogue to guide advocacy in these areas.
<b>Recommendation 4: Tackling Sustainability</b>							
Sudan	CPE	8	CTRY	STR	SUS	The Evaluation recommends that the next COSOP ensure sustainability is incorporated in the broad framework of the country programme's strategic elements in terms of design (e.g. clarity of exit strategies), and partnership (e.g. stakeholder ownership) at the outset of the new country programme.	Para 38 of the RB-COSOP 2009-2012 explains how sustainability will be addressed in operational terms. In the two projects approved in 2009, sustainability was rated 5 for the Rural Access Project and 3.5 for the Revitalizing the Sudan Gum Arabic project in Quality Enhancement reports. For the ongoing projects, the sustainability strategy is still under formulation and will be reported on in the next PRISMA report.
Sudan	CPE	9	CTRY	STR	SUS	Recognizing the contextual realities of The Sudan, where conflict over natural resources is an integral part of the daily reality of farming and pastoral communities, the Government and IFAD should develop their capacity in disaster preparedness and quick response.	Disaster preparedness was included as part of the risk management in the RB-COSOP 2009-2012. Measures to respond to the severe shortage in rainfall in 2009 and ensuing food/feed/water gaps, the Western Sudan Resources Management Programme included in its annual workplan and budget for 2010 a series of short-term measures to bridge these gaps, particularly in the area of fodder availability and animal health.
Sudan	CPE	10	CTRY	STR	SUS	The projects should develop the capacity of the field staff in conflict prevention as an integral component of its programmatic interventions in The Sudan in order to enhance sustainability.	The main responsibility of the field staff regarding conflict is to analyse the root causes of the conflict, report to management on potential conflict situations and recommend prevention or mitigation measures based on the analysis conducted. The field staff, namely extension workers, are being trained on resources mapping, stakeholder analysis, and development of inclusive action plans. The local administration was trained in 2009 on conflict management and a manual was developed accordingly in collaboration with an

Country	Evaluation	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at completion point (ACP) agreed action	PMD follow-up
							experienced national center.
Sudan	CPE	11	CTRY	STR	SUS	The Fund's assistance to the state-owned banks such as the Agricultural Bank of Sudan (ABS), which resulted in a major change in its rural finance policy, should be pursued if gains achieved are to be further enhanced and sustained.	IFAD, together with the Central Bank of Sudan and the Sudan Microfinance Development Facility have agreed to monitor the process, results and lessons learned from the ongoing downscaling of ABS rural financial services. The knowledge gained will be used to guide the expansion of microfinance services to the rural poor.

## B. Completion Evaluations

Argentina: Rural Development Project for the North-eastern Provinces (PRODERNEA)							
Recommendation 1: Negotiate a framework agreement at the national level, within which specific projects will be negotiated with each jurisdiction							
Argentina	CE	1	CTRY	STR	DEC	In large countries with federal constitutional structures such as Argentina, additional review is needed for any future project proposals calling for decentralized implementation in the provinces. More in-depth consideration needs to be given to the impact of gradually incorporating the provinces over time, as naturally occurs, and to the specificities and autonomies involved in different administrative and political jurisdictions.	A programme approach was adopted in the design of the most recent IFAD intervention in 2006: the Rural Areas Development Programme (PRODEAR), now under implementation in three provinces, with a phased approach whereby nine additional provinces' gradual phasing in is limited to the initial 18 months of implementation. A central coordination mechanism now allows optimizing the blend of federal policies with provincial development strategies for decentralized development.
Argentina	CE	2	CTRY	STR	DEC	All projects under the framework agreement should be negotiated with the provincial authorities accompanied by explicit statements of political intent to implement them by stakeholders.	This approach was adopted in designing PRODEAR and in reorienting the North Western Rural Development Project (PRODERNOA) in 2006 and the Patagonia Rural Development Project (PRODERPA) in 2009. During the CPE in 2009, the PRODEAR was publicly praised by the representatives of the Family Farmers' National Forum (FONAF) for its highly participatory consultation process.
Argentina	CE	3	CTRY	STR	PMA	Operating regulations – beyond general guidelines – should be established in the course of each specific negotiation process.	During the November and December 2009 training events in Buenos Aires, this requirement was specifically discussed and it was agreed to further detail Operations Manuals, if and as required by local and provincial specificities.
Recommendation 2: Strengthen social capital through partnerships among various economic actors in rural development, as a strategic thrust for development policies and projects							
Argentina	CE	4	GOV	STR	ORG	Rural development should support the consolidation of existing local and regional organizations.	This principle is widely accepted by both federal and provincial authorities.
Argentina	CE	5	GOV	STR	PRM	Rural development should integrate the element: linking producers and the entire rural population with advantageous commercial and industrial value chains; linking producers with all public and private services providing support for production and a better quality of life for rural society.	Current IFAD-supported operations are proceeding along these lines, particularly for the upper layers of our target group.

Country	Evaluation	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at completion point (ACP) agreed action	PMD follow-up
<b>Recommendation 3: Promoting dialogue, research and design of sound rural finance policies in Argentina</b>							
Argentina	CE	6	CTRY	STR	DIA	Some processes under way such as the policy discussion on rural finance around REAF (Commission on Family Farming) initiatives provide an opportunity for dialogue in this regard. IFAD, in particular, should support such discussion and policy-making processes, identifying success factors in other countries and facilitating exchanges with other projects. In addition, important lessons can be drawn from successful experiences in the country, such as the Social Capital Fund (FONCAP) and the examples of cooperatives receiving funding from PRODERNEA.	There is still much room for improvement in the rural financial sector in Argentina. Meanwhile, both PRODEAR and reoriented PRODERPA have no rural financial sector components as such. As for REAF, the regional success of this experience, particularly in the MERCOSUR area, has deeply influenced the internal policy discussions that led to the institutionalization of this subsector in 2008, further strengthened in 2009 with the upgrading of family farming to a Secretaría de Estado under the Ministry of Agriculture.
<b>Recommendation 4: Strengthen the rural technical assistance services system able to provide holistic responses to the producers' demands</b>							
Argentina	CE	7	GOV	STR	PRM	The evaluation recommended expanding the range of technical services - beyond the current concentration on aspects of production - to include multi-disciplinary teams with experience in areas such as marketing, commercialization and organizational strengthening, making sure the continuity of technical assistance is guaranteed throughout the process.	This approach was adopted in designing PRODEAR (2006) and in reorienting PRODERNOA (2006) and PRODERPA (2009). There is more attention to marketing and value chains nowadays than in 1996 when PRODERNEA was approved.
Argentina	CE	8	GOV	STR	PAR	The evaluation recommended supporting initiatives to develop or strengthen inter-institutional partnerships with public and private organizations, such as the National Institute of Agricultural Technology (INTA).	IFAD-supported projects and programmes currently work with institutions such as INTA at the provincial level in most, if not all provinces where IFAD projects operate. Conversations with INTA are under way to analyse the feasibility of a specific project with INTA, in spite of the scarce resources available for future IFAD-supported operations in Argentina.
Argentina	CE	9	GOV	STR	PRM	The evaluation recommended promoting the development of institutional frameworks that promote cooperative contracting of private technicians, with the collaboration of public authorities when necessary, particularly at the project organization and start-up stages.	This is now happening wherever needed, e.g. in Argentina with PRODERPA or with the Colegio de Agrónomos in Catamarca (PRODERNOA).
<b>Recommendation 5: Design and implement differentiated and specialized projects to improve living conditions for the indigenous population</b>							
Argentina	CE	10	GOV	STR	TGT	These specialized projects for IPs should be independent of those targeted to commercially-oriented family farmers, leading to effective affirmative action. Such projects should be designed and implemented by multidisciplinary technical teams trained to work with IPs, in participatory initiatives under the leadership of social actors that focus on	PRODERNEA was particularly successful in tackling rural development for indigenous communities in the north-east of the country. All IFAD-supported projects currently under implementation maintain this differential approach, while building on PRODERNEA's positive experiences that have been properly systematized for knowledge management at completion.

Country	Evaluation	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at completion point (ACP) agreed action	PMD follow-up
						improving the lives of the target groups.	
Argentina	CE	11	GOV	STR	TGT	With regard to IPs, it is also necessary to develop a consistent institutional framework that provides for advocating and developing policies that meet the needs of beneficiaries.	Same as above, within the framework defined by the Argentine constitution and laws.
<b>Recommendation 6: Environmental sustainability should play a central role in rural development strategy</b>							
Argentina	CE	12	GOV	STR	NRM	The challenge associated with more pressure on natural resources (water, soil, vegetation) as a consequence of the expansion of the agricultural frontier, more intensive production methods, and a limited environmental awareness are key issues that need to be addressed beyond the possibilities of individual projects. This situation calls for policy dialogue at local, provincial and national levels focusing on sustainability.	This area has been neglected for a long time, although IFAD operations have had limited impact, either positive or negative, on the environment. Discussions are under way with the Environment and Climate Division at IFAD to introduce an additional, specific component to the PRODEAR national programme with GEF funding for environmental purposes. The CPE NRTW in June 2010 will offer an excellent opportunity to discuss this further with Argentina's Ministry of Agriculture and the <i>Secretaría de Medioambiente</i> .
<b>Ethiopia: Southern Region Cooperatives Development and Credit Project</b>							
Ethiopia	CE	1	CTRY	STR	TGT	It is recommended that consideration be given to interventions that are more focused on the number of beneficiaries to be reached and geographic coverage, within the overall framework of IFAD's targeting policy. This would ensure greater synergies across activities and ultimately deeper impact on rural poverty.	It is worthwhile to note that this project was designed nearly twenty years ago. The completion evaluation report was published nearly six years after most of the project activities financed by IFAD had closed and its recommendations had clearly been overtaken by events, in particular, new corporate strategies and policies within the Government and IFAD, which had adequately addressed all the issues arising from the CE.
Ethiopia	CE	2	CTRY	STR	DES	Project duration should be long enough to achieve the desired results and in particular take into account the time needed to implement attitude and cultural changes.	The comments made in item (1) above would apply equally to items (2) through (9).
Ethiopia	CE	3	PROJ	STR	PMA	Project management structures should be kept simple to ensure the integration and harmonization among different implementing agencies.	
Ethiopia	CE	4	CTRY	STR	DES	Greater attention should be given in future project design and implementation to country context issues, and the identification of indicators of quality, and actions necessary to achieve real and lasting impact, alongside those relating to numerical outputs.	
Ethiopia	CE	5	CTRY	STR	DIA	More explicit attempts should be made to engage in policy dialogue with the Government and other development actors, where appropriate and required involving a wider range of national and international specialists,	

Country	Evaluation	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at completion point (ACP) agreed action	PMD follow-up
						rather than just IFAD and cooperating institution staff.	
Ethiopia	CE	6	CTRY	STR	BEN	It is recommended that future IFAD-funded projects and programmes in Ethiopia be more attentive to people's participation, especially as it has not been a tradition of development practice in Ethiopia in the past.	
Ethiopia	CE	7	CTRY	STR	DES	In future multi-component projects, it is recommended that greater attention be paid to the linkages between the components and between those agencies responsible for delivering them. The evaluation team is in favour of projects which involve multiple components addressing the diverse needs of target populations – but the difficulties of integrating such efforts should be carefully considered.	
Ethiopia	CE	8	CTRY	STR	FLD	Projects need to be more decisively managed. It is recommended that new approaches be explored, either through IFAD itself taking a more hands-on role during execution, facilitated by the Fund's country programme officer, which allow closer monitoring and follow-up to implementation.	
Ethiopia	CE	9	CTRY	OPER	FLD	The country programme officer should, among other tasks, provide implementation support to IFAD-funded operations and has the potential to enhance partnerships and policy dialogue in Ethiopia. Hence, the country presence should be further strengthened, so that it can play a greater role in enhancing IFAD's development effectiveness in Ethiopia.	
<b>Madagascar: Upper Mandraré Basin Development Project – Phase II (PHBM II)</b>							
<b>Recommendation 1: Government, technical and financial partners</b>							
Madagascar	CE	1	GOV	STR	PAR	The evaluation recommended promoting the balanced and sustainable development of rural areas of Madagascar, by better harmonizing interventions of integrated participatory local development projects with national, sectoral and regional development programmes, on the basis of clear and firm partnership commitments.	The Malagasy Government has adopted the SWAp approach and the programme PSA is being prepared. The methods of intervention and financing are taken into account in sectoral approaches and programming. The sectoral programming enables better joint programming, coordination and M&E of interventions at different scales (national, regional, local). IFAD-funded projects provide a link between the pre-SWAp and regional levels through political dialogue and strengthen the involvement of the COs and the private sector in the process at

Country	Evaluation	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at completion point (ACP) agreed action	PMD follow-up
							different levels.
Madagascar	CE	2	GOV	STR	PAR	To ensure proper coordination and synchronization between local development project interventions and sectoral support programmes, it will be essential to forge strong, formal partnerships based on the complementarities of both types of projects. It will be necessary to go beyond making an inventory of what sectoral programmes intend to do in the project intervention area, and to ensure that any agreements negotiated specify the commitment of each programme as well as mechanisms to operationalize them.	The development of joint programming approaches is reinforced from pre-SWAp programming framework and the description of the operationalization mechanism and modality of intervention should be clarified. Programming and M&E at the regional level are supported and strengthened in order to jointly identify interventions to be implemented and the commitment of each partner.
Madagascar	CE	3	GOV	STR	PAR	It will be essential that such partnerships be included both in the regional development programme and in communal development plans, so as to ensure coordination of interventions, optimal use of available financial and human resources in the region and communes, and, ultimately, ownership of achievements by regional and communal authorities. The region and its public technical services, on the one hand, and the communal development committees, on the other hand, must play an active role in the formulation and negotiation of partnerships, and in the coordination and implementation of local development projects and interventions of sectoral programmes at the regional and communal levels, respectively.	The budget entry of these investments is made through different channels. This does not facilitate their links. Nevertheless, the region has made efforts in the inventory of the achievements of different interventions. Each IFAD-funded operation has a regional steering committee ensuring participation of all major stakeholders, including farmer organizations.
<b>Recommendation 2: Government, regions</b>							
Madagascar	CE	4	GOV	STR	STR	The evaluation recommended promoting the diversification, integration and competitiveness of agricultural activities, by promoting a diversified and integrated value-chain approach, while placing women and youth at the centre of this development effort.	The women and the gender aspect are integrated into the targeting of projects. Indeed, gender and agricultural training strategies have been launched for better access to project benefits for young people and women. The country programme has established a gender strategy in 2009.
Madagascar	CE	5	GOV	STR	STR	The development of value chains, already initiated in the project area and focused mainly on three irrigated crops (rice, onion and garlic), should be diversified in such a way as to achieve a better balance between irrigated crops, rainfed crops and livestock, in order to reach the maximum number of farmer categories, reduce risks related to the market	The strategy adopted by the regions is to focus on a few value chains based on the regional potentials and opportunities. The value chains developed by each project (Support Programme for Rural Microenterprise Poles and Regional Economies [PROSPERER], Support to Farmers' Professional Organizations and Agricultural Services Project [AROPA], and Rural Income Promotion Programme) are retained by the region.

Country	Evaluation	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at completion point (ACP) agreed action	PMD follow-up
						and the natural environment, and achieve the various production objectives of farmers (food security, income generation, social status, etc.).	
Madagascar	CE	6	GOV	STR	PRM	Better integration must be sought both vertically by acting on all the links in the chain, with particular attention to the supply of agricultural inputs and equipment, and horizontally by better integrating value chains with each other.	This requires important financial resources and implementation capacities. This is not feasible for the entire sector given the lack of resources available. The Government began to consider the development potential of the rice value chain both upstream and downstream.
Madagascar	CE	7	GOV	OPER	PRM	The Regional Rural Development Directorates should continue efforts to identify and promote promising new value chains both for irrigated and rainfed agriculture (potato, tomato, maize, cassava, sorghum, etc.) and for livestock (fattening, animal traction, dairy).	The implementation of the value chain development plan is strong and widespread throughout the programme by all projects (onions, potatoes, maize, rice, silk, sisal, litchis, pineapple, etc)
Madagascar	CE	8	GOV	OPER	ASR	Regional studies of agro ecological, financial, and human and market potential should guide the choice of commodities to promote and ensure better coordination with the opportunities offered by national and regional strategies, especially in the field of agribusiness and export.	The study of regional value chains is updated regularly. Each value chain is chosen based on regional characteristics and is built on discussions with stakeholders from the region.
Madagascar	CE	9	GOV	OPER	PRM	The CSA (Centre for Agricultural Services) has a very important role to play in terms of information transfer, upwards on local conditions and downwards on the evolution of market demand and production techniques. It must facilitate contact between producers and their organizations, on the one hand, and funding sources, input suppliers and agricultural produce markets on the other hand.	The implementation of the activities of CSA at the regional level and funding of service via the FRDA are on track (cofunding European Commission and IFAD). IFAD contributes significantly to the financing of FRDA and CSA through the AROPA project. The CSA supports the farmer organizations.
Madagascar	CE	10	GOV	STR	TGT	Agricultural development should primarily benefit women and youth through well-targeted actions aimed at improving and securing their access to productive resources (land, water, inputs, capital) and at strengthening their technical and organizational capacity.	The Government is very sensitive to the integration of women in agricultural development. Young people, the farmers of the future, receive similar attention. Accordingly, both the gender strategy and the agricultural training strategy are being developed.
<b>Recommendation 3: IFAD</b>							
Madagascar	CE	11	CTRY	STR	DES	The evaluation recommended promoting flexibility in project design and implementation for the refinement and adaptation of the implementation modalities in response to the	The volume of the project document is reduced, - The mid-term review conducted every three years can best fit the project in achieving its mandate. - Direct supervision plays a more important role in the resolution of



Country	Evaluation	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at completion point (ACP) agreed action	PMD follow-up
						changing context, to achieve and maintain a good level of performance (relevance, effectiveness and efficiency) and increase ownership of projects by their stakeholders.	constraints to implementation of projects.
Madagascar	CE	12	CTRY	STR	DES	A project's design documents, loan agreement and subsidiary agreements should be sufficiently flexible to enable project teams and implementing agencies to adapt working modalities to the realities and socio-economic, agro-ecological and institutional developments in the project area, while ensuring that that project objectives and target groups agreed between the Government and IFAD are reached.	The mid-term review of IFAD projects is beneficial to the planning and implementation of actions. - The intervention strategy of IFAD is aligned with the national development strategy. - The COSOP cycle is framed within the politics of poverty reduction to reduce the risk of distortion with the national policy.
Madagascar	CE	13	CTRY	OPER	DES	When starting up any project, a summary of project documents in the national language should be delivered to representatives of the target population.	The dissemination of full project documentation in the national language is not yet feasible given the lack of technical vocabulary of the Malagasy language, although a summary of the project is already available in Malagasy.
Madagascar	CE	14	CTRY	STR	PMA	When adopting the participatory approach, it is important to provide appropriate advice and support for the preparation and implementation of microprojects. In future, this support should be provided by the CSA.	The prioritization and consolidation of microprojects are beginning to be done at the CSA level. The targets are better defined thanks to the preparation of the national farmers' services strategy.
Madagascar	CE	15	CTRY	STR	SUS	Subsidies to farmer groups can be justified as a first step to starting up or intensifying an economic activity, but should be gradually replaced by resources mobilized by the population and through individual and group credit.	The implementation strategy is being developed. This is part of the recommendation of the review of the COSOP in 2008 and 2009. Credit is taking an increasingly important role.
Madagascar	CE	16	CTRY	STR	SUP	The supporting role of supervision missions in project implementation should be strengthened. This would enable them to provide more methodological and technical support to project teams to help them interpret and, if appropriate, adjust project design in order that implementation arrangements and approaches may be developed to optimize the performance of project components.	Direct supervision has broad coverage fields. - In addition, follow-up missions are conducted between supervision missions - Too frequent supervision and follow-ups can lead to demotivation of the department or ministry in charge of the monitoring aspect.
Madagascar	CE	17	CTRY	OPER	SUP	It would be beneficial to increase the number and weight of project reviews during the implementation period (usually known as 'mid-term reviews'), which constitute the most appropriate occasion to jointly evaluate (Government, project team, IFAD and possibly co-sponsors and the cooperating institution)	The mid-term review of projects is already carried out as requested.  -The project review just before the achievement is not appropriate for best fit at the right time.

Country	Evaluation	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at completion point (ACP) agreed action	PMD follow-up
						project performance, identify major constraints to performance and make the proper adjustments to implementation modalities.	
Madagascar	CE	18	CTRY	OPER	RME	In addition to evaluating only the implementation status of programmed activities, the project's M&E system should also capture the relevance of interventions, level of achievement of objectives (effectiveness), ratio results/costs (efficiency) and impact of the project on the living conditions of the rural population. The system must become functional as early as possible in the life of the project.	The initiative "Monitoring and Evaluation and Management of Knowledge" (SEGS) has addressed these issues and is a great success. Specific recruitment was made in the context of this initiative for the need for technical analysis of agronomic and economic results.
<b>Recommendation 4: Government, regions and IFAD</b>							
Madagascar	CE	19	CTRY	STR	SUS	The evaluation recommended consolidating quickly the dynamics of social and economic development already well engaged by PHBM II in its area of intervention, to sustain and enhance the achievements of the project.	On the link between the FOs (farmer organizations) are strengthened in the various levels (local, regional, national). - Consolidation of constraints and adjustments are consolidated by the AROPA project.
Madagascar	CE	20	CTRY	STR	SUS	It will be necessary to strengthen the capacity of technical services and the CSA to take over key project functions, ensure the consolidation of project achievements and strengthen the capacity of communes and farmer organizations, including the young umbrella organizations. This should be a priority of the upcoming AROPA project.	The strengthening of CSA and FOs are under way and are provided by AROPA. Fifteen districts are covered.
Madagascar	CE	21	GOV	STR	SUS	The Regional Directorate for Rural Development should foster collaboration between regional partners in terms of rural extension and coaching.	Several players came to intervene in the area after the project. The Regional Directorate for Rural Development coordinates interventions and strengthening partnerships.
Madagascar	CE	22	GOV	OPER	SUS	It will be necessary to complete the rural roads programme, primarily through: (i) upgrading the "black" section of 20 km and the destroyed river crossing on inter-provincial road no. 107 in the south of the project area; and (ii) linking up inter-provincial road no. 117 with national road no. 13 in the west.	Despite the delay of the FER (Fonds Entretien Routier) funding for RIP (Route inter provincial), the "black" point of 20 km and the strike of the RIP 107 have been rehabilitated.

Country	Evaluation	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at completion point (ACP) agreed action	PMD follow-up
Madagascar	CE	23	GOV	OPER	SUS	It will also be very important to establish an effective maintenance system for inter-communal and communal tracks, under the responsibility of the communes, using local microenterprises for routine maintenance and the Road Maintenance Fund (RMF) for periodic maintenance.	This function is provided directly by the Communes.
Madagascar	CE	24	GOV	OPER	SUS	With support from the RMF, the region should assume full responsibility for the maintenance of inter-provincial roads. Roadside dwellers (users' associations of tracks and roads) should be involved only for emergency works (accidental interruptions etc.).	The Region and the Ministry of Public Works have worked hard to increase the budget for maintenance, but the needs far exceed available resources.
Madagascar	CE	25	GOV	STR	SUS	It will be necessary to promote sustainable agricultural production systems in accordance with national policies and strategies through: (i) better water management at the irrigation scheme and plot level; (ii) promotion of adequate fertilization and crop rotations on irrigation schemes, possibly by introducing horticulture; and (iii) taking more account of the risks associated with recurrent drought, by developing and implementing specific, integrated strategies for adaptation to drought (water and soil conservation, integrated water resources management at the watershed and micro watershed levels, securing fodder, etc.).	During the dry season, crops are in areas close to water resources and served by water points with booster pumping.
Madagascar	CE	26	GOV	STR	SUS	It will be necessary to continue improving basic social services (education, health and drinking water mainly) in partnership with the relevant departments and programmes.	The project area is considered a favourable response to social projects. Example: the campaign of 1200 drilling started in Tsimbucy.
Madagascar	CE	27	GOV	STR	RFI	It will be necessary to consolidate the rural finance system by upgrading the technical and management skills of staff; sensitizing farmers to microfinance through exchange visits, information days, etc.; and promoting savings (especially among herders) by means of specific tools and mechanisms and by mobilizing, through novel microfinance products, the enormous potential for savings and credit offered by farmer organizations.	Mutual empowerment achieving FIVOY (Mandrare savings and credit scheme), and its area is extended into other regions. Establishment of IFRA (Regional savings and credit institution).

Country	Evaluation	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at completion point (ACP) agreed action	PMD follow-up
<b>C. Interim Evaluations</b>							
<b>China: Qinling Mountain Area Poverty Alleviation Project</b>							
<b>Recommendation 1: Proceed with a follow-on project</b>							
China	IE	1	CTRY	STR	DES	The continuing pockets of poverty in the project provinces suggest that there is a valid reason for proceeding with a follow-on project. A follow-on project should be considered with a continuing focus on areas of poverty. The design process should retain key elements such as: targeting the poorest households, participation of women and farmers in village planning processes, an integrated and specific package of interventions addressed to the needs of the villagers, and a project management process that strengthens local governance.	The Asia and the Pacific Division is in the process of a country programme review and an update of this COSOP for China. A follow-up project has been considered by both China and IFAD, but a final decision has not yet been taken.
<b>Recommendation 2: Increased flexibility in project design</b>							
China	IE	2	CTRY	STR	DES	IFAD and the Government of China (GOC) should work together on identifying which aspects of project design must be compliant for the whole project period and which aspects can be subject to change in line with project conditions.	IFAD and GOC work closely and continuously on these aspects in ongoing projects in the sphere of supervision and evaluations.
China	IE	3	CTRY	STR	DES	It would be more appropriate to consider design changes after each supervision mission rather than delaying until the mid-term review. If changes to the loan agreement are required, the Government should make timely requests to IFAD.	Design changes have been considered at each supervision mission.
China	IE	4	CTRY	STR	DES	Specific consideration should be given to: i) periodically reviewing the definitions of poverty groups throughout the project life in order to respond to the changing situations of households; ii) assessing the availability of labour in the project area as the demand for migrant work in cities is likely to continue growing despite the fact that, in the short term, the world financial crisis is likely to reverse the flow of migration to rural areas; iii) supporting the changing role and greater prominence given to women; iv) supporting a mix of credit sources, such as community development funds and small group lending for	The targeting criteria and approach were recently updated with all ongoing projects, and new guidelines were developed. The targeting indicator and threshold have been amended and staff in all ongoing projects were trained. RCC banks micro loan products are designed to attract only members of the target group, i.e. the loan size is far below the usual minimum loan size offered by RCCs. Besides, RCCs are requested to rigorously monitor and assess households on the use of loans for agricultural or created income-generating activities.

Country	Evaluation	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at completion point (ACP) agreed action	PMD follow-up
						the lowest income groups, collective credit mechanisms for cooperative activities, and RCCs (rural credit cooperatives) for larger enterprise loans.	
<b>Recommendation 3: Customized scale of operations per village</b>							
China	IE	5	CTRY	STR	DES	A clearer investment mechanism is required per village so that the greatest economies of scale and optimum benefits can be achieved. In project design, guidelines for an investment quota could be defined based on area, population, and potential.	This is under consideration for infrastructure investments in upcoming projects.
China	IE	6	CTRY	OPER	DES	The participatory decision making approach of the village development plan (VDP) could be replicated but with greater analysis of feasibility and more stringent approval processes for any proposals that exceed the quota.	Recent project design has addressed this in a way that the composition of the village implementation group (VIG) more women and poor people. This group designs the VDP which is then presented at the township and higher level project steering committees (called project leading group) for consolidation and approval.
China	IE	7	CTRY	OPER	TCB	Additional capacity building for VIGs who are having difficulty in reaching the quota should be considered.	Please see above.
China	IE	8	CTRY	OPER	BEN	There should be a greater focus on participatory processes that involve a greater number of participants per village.	As outlined above, project design has been explicit in creating the numbers of poor women and men in the VIG to ensure the poverty focus of the VDP and the project activities. Reference is made to recent designs, e.g. the Sichuan Post-Earthquake Agricultural Rehabilitation Project and Dabieshan Area Poverty Reduction Programme (DAPRP) in Henan provinces.
<b>Recommendation 4: Support to employment generation as a design strategy</b>							
China	IE	9	CTRY	STR	ASR	Further analysis is required in terms of the characteristics and needs of migrant labour and the attitude of households towards external employment opportunities.	This could not be addressed thus far.
China	IE	10	CTRY	OPER	TCB	Further analysis may result in consideration of special credit and training facilities to support migration, or organizational support for labour rights of rural immigrants.	This is being addressed. Please see DAPRP and the support to migration through skills training.
<b>Recommendation 5: Greater local mobilisation and capacity building</b>							
China	IE	11	CTRY	OPER	ORG	In the future intervention, more focus should be placed on investing in local organizations, leadership, and community activities.	The DAPRP will foster, firstly, the development of privately managed farmer cooperatives and will support these cooperatives to include poor farmers. Secondly, the project provides skills and vocational training to men and women who want to migrate. Third, women and poor people have access to community organizations and also to the VIG as per design.
China	IE	12	CTRY	OPER	SUS	Establishing infrastructure operations and maintenance groups would enhance the	These aspects receive utmost attention to increase investment sustainability.

Country	Evaluation	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at completion point (ACP) agreed action	PMD follow-up
						sustainability of project investments in physical infrastructure and facilities.	
China	IE	13	CTRY	OPER	ORG	Initiating and supporting farmer producers and marketing organizations would provide an additional stimulus to the local economy. It would also align strongly with the current GOC policy towards strengthening farmers' organizations.	The development of pro-poor farmer cooperatives has been included as a development module in the DAPRP in Henan.
<b>Recommendation 6: Enhanced management information and analysis</b>							
China	IE	14	CTRY	OPER	RME	A fully functional management and information system (MIS) should be installed early in the project. To facilitate the operations, it should be simple and training should be provided so that the importance is understood.	Each PMO (project management officer) has been trained on M&E and MIS.
<b>Guatemala: Rural Development Programme for Las Verapaces (PRODEVER)</b>							
Guatemala	IE	1	CTRY	STR	BEN	The evaluation recommended modifying the preparation of future programmes similar to PRODEVER by giving more of a voice to stakeholders active in the project area.	All programmes – and the RB-COSOP – have been designed with direct involvement/appropriation by users-beneficiaries and other stakeholders. This is particularly the case with the Sustainable Rural Development Programme for the Northern Region (PRODENORTE), which incorporates all of PRODEVER's evaluation lessons. Implementation will involve local and municipal committees/associations (COCODES and COMUDES) and the municipalities.
Guatemala	IE	2	PROJ	OPER	HR	It is recommended that national consultants be hired in the project area, together with an external consultant to act as a facilitator, in support of drafting proposals that meet IFAD requirements.	National consultants have been involved in all aspects of programme design and implementation, while external consultants and former staff of IFAD projects provide specialized technical support, e.g., M&E/Results and Impact Management System (RIMS), etc.
Guatemala	IE	3	PROJ	OPER	BEN	A campaign is needed to publicize the project/programme proposal in the area in advance, raising awareness and supporting regional and local counterparts on the project proposal and its implementation.	Social communication has been active in the programme area, complementing the work with the COCODES and COMUDES, which are the entry point for all programme planning and execution, and for municipal planning in the first place.
Guatemala	IE	4	CTRY	STR	DES	A better definition is needed of what an initial design should include and what should be left to the implementation stage (to avoid a design that is superseded by changes), to ensure sufficient flexibility in the project/programme design.	Recent programme design in Guatemala has encouraged flexibility, within the framework of consistent programme components/principal lines of action defined with the participation of users-beneficiaries. Programme execution will be driven by demand (e.g. micro irrigation expansion)
Guatemala	IE	5	CTRY	STR	RFI	The evaluation recommended intensifying the search for alternative ways to promote bottom-up savings and credit, to encourage the development of small financial markets adapted to the habits of potential community	Innovative activities for enhanced rural financial services have been incorporated in PRODENORTE and El Quiche programmes for expanded coverage and design of new products, thus facilitating both the provision (supply) and access to services (demand). One instrument is the RFS Innovation Funds. The approach is being

Country	Evaluation	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at completion point (ACP) agreed action	PMD follow-up
						clients (savings and credit associations).	applied in the PRODEVER area in preparation for PRODENORTE.
Guatemala	IE	6	CTRY	STR	RFI	The evaluation states that it is necessary to differentiate the approach in response to different financing needs of smallholders. On one hand, commercial credit needs to be developed at the same time as supporting forms of micro-savings and credit for various family and community purposes. On the other, community microfinance organizations already existing in rural communities neighbouring Las Verapaces could be expanded to the PRODEVER area. At the same time, other mechanisms should be considered (e.g. credit funds) for placements by intermediary financial institutions.	It is in response to these recommendations that innovative instruments have been incorporated in the design of the most recent programmes. The proposed model for the connection between the supply and demand of rural financial services; and the development of financial management capacities within the producer associations/ rural enterprises involves 'Asset-building Funds for Innovation in RFS, i.e. capitalization for microfinancing intermediation; technical assistance to microfinancing entities and producer organizations; product development; savings/expansion of service points.
Guatemala	IE	7	CTRY	STR	TGT	The evaluation recommended identifying, from the outset, different approaches and methods to support different types of target groups: those who have the potential to lift themselves out of poverty through economic investments, and those living in extreme poverty without resources who need social assistance, at least initially. Objectives and strategies should be designed and adopted that are specifically adapted to the different target groups	A dedicated targeting and gender strategy has been applied within the design of the recent Guatemalan programmes, which pay special attention to the various social/economic segments, and vulnerable groups. Activities for these latter groups involve affirmative actions and linkage with the Government's social programmes (e.g. Mi familia progresá). This is possible through programme-supported municipal planning.
Guatemala	IE	8	GOV	STR	TGT	The evaluation recommended incorporating lessons learned under food security projects carried out by PRODEVER to improve interventions addressed to the country's poorest 45 municipalities, which have been prioritized by the Government of Guatemala.	The recommendation has been duly taken into account by the implementation team as part of the programme's exit/consolidation strategy, and food security has been supported through diversified rural household gardens/plots.
Guatemala	IE	9	GOV	STR	TGT	The design of measures needed by different target groups should be differentiated by production system (commercial or subsistence), based on prior research, e.g. by local universities. It is also very important to define support options based on different areas and environmental conditions, and to consider prospects for improving and complementing forms of production already in place.	The sustainable agricultural production activities, under the ongoing and new IFAD-financed programmes in Guatemala, are intimately linked to the market signals and opportunities, and to the actual agro-ecological productive potential for the value chains of interest to the IFAD target groups (grains, higher value crops). They also take into account the comparative advantages of exporting municipalities following an entrepreneurial linkages approach, while new crops are identified and best production/manufacturing practices are adopted.
Guatemala	IE	10	GOV	OPER	DES	The CPE suggested including in IFAD's loan agreements a due diligence requirement with respect to the executing capacity of the implementing agency, evaluating requirements	FONAPAZ (the National Fund for Peace) has demonstrated good implementation capacity. This institution also executed the Programme for Rural Development and Reconstruction in the Quiché Department. the loan agreements signed give enough flexibility for

Country	Evaluation	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at completion point (ACP) agreed action	PMD follow-up
						in terms of governance and administrative guidelines to be met by future projects and their degree of compliance to ensure smooth and successful implementation.	projects implementation y the country
Guatemala	IE	11	PROJ	OPER	SUS	The evaluation recommended that a review be performed, together with FONAPAZ (the National Fund for Peace), of PRODEVER's current operating and financial capacity, including Government contributions, up to the programme's conclusion.	This is a recommendation that overlooks the country's financial reality and the consequent budgetary restrictions. Despite the current financial constraints, the programme has met its targets. The Government's contribution is limited in the new programmes to taxes and duties.
Guatemala	IE	12	PROJ	STR	SUS	Consideration should be given to a review of the continuing components and subcomponents and those which are to be closed, to enhance the sustainability of supported structures.	Consideration has been given to this recommendation as part of PRODEVER's exit strategy, particularly in view of the follow-on PRODENORTE programme (e.g., RFS, microenterprise development). Direct IFAD support is also being provided to enhance the M&E/systematization capacities of all ongoing programmes.
Guatemala	IE	13	PROJ	OPER	SUS	Annual financial planning should be established up to the programme's conclusion, including government contributions, with a view to reducing programme financial resources and therefore the number of staff, to ensure successful completion and the achievement of proposed objectives and goals.	Annual financial planning is in place, as part of the overall planning and budgeting activities.
Guatemala	IE	14	CTRY	STR	SUS	The evaluation recommended establishing closer links between programme initiatives and permanent structures now emerging in the area: municipalities, development councils and others at the communal, municipal and departmental levels.	IFAD has worked with and supported the consolidation of the community development structures nation-wide in all programmes (COCODES, COMUDES). This is an intrinsic component of the targeting and implementation actions. All prior to PRODEVER's evaluation.
Guatemala	IE	15	CTRY	STR	SUS	IFAD should offer technical support to the State institutions involved in rural development, according to their needs in this area.	IFAD has provided specialized support through various consulting tasks, applying national expertise.
Guatemala	IE	16	GOV	STR	DIA	The evaluation suggested that policy dialogue be maintained and reinforced by setting an agenda agreed upon by the authorities, IFAD and other agencies, with periodic meetings and work plans that include a review of the application of the Government's rural development policies.	IFAD is a strategic partner for the Government. Policy dialogue is of the highest level. A CPMT is in place, and this has facilitated the expeditious design of two programmes in record time.



Country	Evaluation	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at completion point (ACP) agreed action	PMD follow-up
Guatemala	IE	17	GOV	OPER	DIA	It is important to set up a rural development sector round table, to identify actors (national and potential cooperants) and prioritize actions. A sector development plan is also needed at the local level.	As the primary financier for rural development/poverty alleviation, IFAD is the key development institution supporting the rural development dialogue at the national and department levels.
<b>Democratic People's Republic of Korea: Uplands Food Security Project (UFSP)</b>							
<b>Recommendation 1: Project Design</b>							
Korea	IE	1	CTRY	STR	DES	The design process for future IFAD interventions in the country will require: Broad participation by the envisaged target population and their representatives at all levels.	This recommendation will be followed when a new project is designed for the Democratic People's Republic of Korea (DPRK).
Korea	IE	2	CTRY	OPER	DES	Design teams will spend considerable time in the field, meeting with poor people and observing the reality in rural areas. The views and needs of intended beneficiaries will be clearly reflected in project design documents.	Same as above.
Korea	IE	3	CTRY	STR	DES	The design process for future IFAD interventions in the country will require strong collaboration with national and international rural development partners. Design teams will be composed of staff from potentially partnering institutions.	Same as above.
Korea	IE	4	CTRY	OPER	DES	Design teams will be composed of staff from potentially partnering institutions.	Same as above.
Korea	IE	5	GOV	OPER	DES	Along the design process frequent stakeholder meetings will be organized by the Government to ensure that ideas and opinions are regularly shared	Same as above.
Korea	IE	6	GOV	OPER	DES	The Government is to grant full access to relevant information required for a sound project design, such as the national poverty reduction and rural development strategies, data on population and the economy, current agricultural practices, agricultural research results, information on health and education in the rural areas and so on. The Government will provide information requested to IFAD before mission arrival.	Same as above.
Korea	IE	7	CTRY	OPER	DES	IFAD will request information required for project design well in advance of field missions and be as precise as possible in its requests. The Government will provide information requested to IFAD before mission arrival	Same as above.

Country	Evaluation	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at completion point (ACP) agreed action	PMD follow-up
Korea	IE	8	CTRY	STR	DES	IFAD is to mobilize its own resources to enhance its knowledge and understanding of the socio-economic country context and the needs of the rural poor, considering that little country economic and sector work on DPRK by other international institutions exists.	This recommendation will be followed when a new COSOP is designed for DPRK. As a preparatory work for COSOP formulation, draft background papers have been prepared on the rural poverty situation, and on potentials for sustainable agricultural production in DPRK.
<b>Recommendation 2: Partnerships</b>							
Korea	IE	9	CTRY	STR	PAR	IFAD will give particular attention to enhancing its partnerships and building new collaborations with national and international institutions concerned with agricultural and rural development in the DPRK.	This recommendation will be followed in the preparation of the new COSOP as well as when a new project is designed for DPRK.
Korea	IE	10	GOV	STR	PAR	The Government will actively encourage partnerships among national and international institutions. The coordinating role at the strategic level will be taken up by the Ministry of Foreign Affairs and at the technical/implementation level by the concerned line ministry.	We will pro-actively encourage the Government to play this role. This is a challenging task. When IFAD was invited to a United Nations' country team meeting in January 2010 to discuss the United Nations' Strategic Framework for 2011-2015, the DPRK government informed the United Nations' Resident Coordinator that the Government would like to deal with IFAD separately and not as part of the United Nations. As a result, IFAD did not participate in the United Nations Country Team meeting.
Korea	IE	11	GOV	STR	KM	The Government will also promote information sharing between the PMU and project partners, all through the project cycle, with the aim of developing a transparent framework conducive to sound planning, implementation and monitoring.	The Division will pro-actively encourage the Government to follow this recommendation when a new project is designed and implemented in the country.
Korea	IE	12	GOV	OPER	KM	Information sharing will be done using various media such as county- and province-level technical workshops and training, workshops and seminars at the line Ministry, radio and television, publications.	Same as above.
Korea	IE	13	GOV	OPER		It is essential that project teams be granted permanent access to international phone, fax and e-mail.	Same as above.
Korea	IE	14	CTRY	STR	PAR	Project partnerships, including co-financing arrangements, will be formally established with a clear distribution of responsibilities among partners, as early as possible in the project design process. Coordination mechanisms among partners will also be clearly specified.	Same as above.
<b>Recommendation 3: Sustainability</b>							
Korea	IE	15	CTRY	STR	SUS	Environmental, technical and economical sustainability of rural development efforts and achievements will be given greater attention in	This recommendation will be followed when a new project is designed and implemented in DPRK.

Country	Evaluation	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at completion point (ACP) agreed action	PMD follow-up
						project design and implementation.	
Korea	IE	16	CTRY	STR	SUS	Environmental components in IFAD projects will focus not only on reforestation and protection of sloping lands, but also on their sustainable and profitable use and management. IFAD and its partners should investigate ways to support the rural poor living outside cooperative farms early on to develop sustainable agriculture production systems.	Same as above.
Korea	IE	17	GOV	OPER	SUS	The Government will consider the formal allocation of plots on sloping land to cooperative farm (CF) members and others, and provide advice on measures to avoid land degradation.	Policy dialogue will be held with the Government to implement this recommendation.
Korea	IE	18	GOV	STR	SUS	The Government will consider the challenges of working the land and maintaining soil fertility in a context of very limited access to imported inputs, machinery and energy, as an opportunity for designing and developing new alternative measures.	Same as above.
Korea	IE	19	GOV	OPER	SUS	For the above recommendation, a sub-work team, by average size, composition and land holding, could be perceived as a group of small producers. Properly organized and endowed with adequate autonomy and incentives, sub-work teams could evolve into highly motivated crop and livestock production groups, within cooperative farm structures. The latter would then assume the functions of credit providers and technical advisers to those independent producers' groups.	Same as above.
Korea	IE	20	CTRY	STR	SUS	Several technical options to increase and maintain soil fertility on CF and sloping lands will be further explored by field trials and, if found adequate, validated and agreed upon as best practices and disseminated widely for generalization. This sub-recommendation will be initiated with the support of an IFAD grant, complemented by technical assistance from national and international rural development partners.	Same as above.

Country	Evaluation	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at completion point (ACP) agreed action	PMD follow-up
<b>Recommendation 4: Household Credit</b>							
Korea	IE	21	GOV	STR	RFI	The household credit scheme will be scaled up to other CFs in the country, possibly with the support of a new IFAD intervention. However, challenges regarding technical and market risks and limited opportunities for reinvestment of additional income need to be addressed.	Same as above.
Korea	IE	22	GOV	OPER	RFI	Loans will be used to promote innovation and diversification of household-level activities. The expansion of credit activities, which could be achieved by an increase in individual loan ceilings, requires greater opportunities to develop individual economic activities	Same as above.
Korea	IE	23	GOV	OPER	RFI	Savings will be promoted. The Central Bank (CB) will ensure that the value of savings is safeguarded against economic measures such as administered price increases.	Same as above.
Korea	IE	24	GOV	OPER	RFI	The concomitant lending for productive activities to CFs, either through work teams or sub-work teams, remain an option, which may have significant potential for synergy with household economic activities. Economic analysis will be used to determine the appropriate level of investment and activity.	Same as above.
Korea	IE	25	GOV	OPER	RFI	Credit to CFs and households will be accompanied by sound technical, managerial and marketing advice.	Same as above.
Korea	IE	26	GOV	OPER	RFI	The reporting system of CB towards the PMU and project partners will be improved, and the bookkeeping system at farm level standardized.	Same as above.
<b>Philippines: Western Mindanao Community Initiatives Project (WMCIP)</b>							
<b>Recommendation: IFAD activities should continue to support development in upland areas where poverty remains persistent and IFAD has experience</b>							
Philippines	IE	1	CTRY	STR	TGT	IFAD should continue working in areas where poverty remains persistent. In particular, it will be desirable to continue working in the WMCIP upland areas of Zamboanga Peninsula.	The proposed Integrated Natural Resources and Environmental Management Project (INREMP), which is being designed jointly by the AsDB and IFAD for approval by the end of December 2010, will cover a total of at least 1.0 million ha with an estimated population of around 1.6 million, in the URBs (or the uplands) of: Chico River Basin; Bukidnon River Basins; Wahig-Inabanga River Basin; and Lake Lanao Watersheds. Two of these areas, namely Bukidnon and Lake Lanao URB, are adjacent to the areas of intervention of WMCIP and are expected to upscale the WMCIP activities. Their selection was based on biophysical conditions, socioeconomic and

Country	Evaluation	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at completion point (ACP) agreed action	PMD follow-up
							conservation values, taking account of installed water management infrastructure, and the state of land and forest degradation, as well as their ability to serve as possible upscaling of the activities to the WMCIP areas. In addition, it is being negotiated that IFAD's funding under INREMP will focus on the Mindanao areas to ensure the continuity of the activities under WMCIP and the Northern Mindanao Community Initiatives and Resource Management Project (NMCIREMP) which closed at the end of 2009. Thus, while INREMP shall be implemented in the four sample URBs, IFAD may use the model in other URBs or watersheds located in previous IFAD projects in Northern and Western Mindanao.
<b>Recommendation 1.1: Clarity of Design</b>							
Philippines	IE	2	CTRY	STR	NRM	Integrate the principles of a watershed and landscape approach to NRM. In order to promote better control and accountability over resource destructive activities and the flow of positive benefits between communities (e.g. less saltation and improved water quality) within the project area, future interventions should work in a more limited geographic area. Future interventions should be limited to headwater areas incorporating the principles of a landscape approach considering downstream effects, but limiting implementation or support to critical upland areas.	Under INREMP, like under the Second Cordillera Highland Agricultural Resource Management Project (CHARMP-2), science-based land management regimes in the uplands along major critical bodies of water are united with local knowledge. Project sites will be assessed for land capability, based on current land use and biophysical parameters, current tenure that includes ancestral domains, and appropriate sustainable management regimes that incorporate biodiversity conservation, climate change mitigation and adaptation requirements to enable full economic, social and environmental appraisal of land use options. Consequently, the INREM process shall benefit from a combination of science-based land management regimes with local knowledge, to wit: (i) conservation and protection of natural forests; (ii) rehabilitation and reforestation of degraded forests and woodlands; (iii) sustainable forest management; (iv) commercial plantations with community participation; (v) agroforestry in areas subject to shifting cultivation; and (vi) conservation farming in agricultural lands, supported by improvement of irrigation systems, rural access roads, and communal water supply systems.
Philippines	IE	3	CTRY	STR	NRM	Within the upland areas, targeting of project sites should be to the extent possible contiguous for better environmental benefits and incorporate the principles of a landscape approach, which integrates social, cultural, and environmental concerns with the management of the land area, but with special care taken of the possibilities of environmental disturbances beyond the control of the project.	Each of the watersheds in the selected URBs under INREMP will be considered for a subproject. This subdivision has been undertaken to focus investment planning and implementation, and preserve the integrity of a watershed ecosystem. Selection of subprojects will be undertaken in accordance with criteria for selection and approval agreed between the Government, the Asian Development Bank (AsDB), and IFAD, which will include that: (a) INREMP's integrated ecosystem management approach requires integration of interventions from conservation in the closed canopy forests, rehabilitation and reforestation of degraded forests and woodlands, agroforestry in areas subject to shifting cultivation, conservation farming in agricultural lands and in some areas pasture improvement for livestock, supported by improvement of irrigation systems, rural access roads, and communal small-scale water

Country	Evaluation	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at completion point (ACP) agreed action	PMD follow-up
							supply systems, all within the same watershed/subproject area. As the subprojects correspond to an entire watershed, they may extend to one or more municipalities and range in size from 20,000 to 35,000 ha. The criteria for the selection of subprojects, to be designed during implementation, will include (i) consistency with provincial/national development strategy; (ii) socioeconomic significance and impact on poverty reduction; (iii) concurrence by concerned national agencies and local government units (LGUs); (iv) social acceptability of the design and implementation arrangements; (v) ecological significance in terms of biodiversity and carbon sequestration potential; (vi) contribution to sustainable production of goods and services; (vii) post-investment financial sustainability; (viii) commitment of LGUs to facilitate resolution of any social or environmental problems; (ix) willingness of the LGUs and concerned regional and national agencies to support and facilitate operations and maintenance of the facilities supported by the Project; (x) constitute complete watersheds; (xi) minimal or absence of resettlement impacts; (xii) do not result in adverse environmental impacts that cannot easily be mitigated; and (xiii) the state of watershed degradation and impacts on downstream communities requiring urgent attention.
Philippines	IE	4	CTRY	STR	DES	A locus for intervention in terms of geographic coverage and beneficiary needs has to be clearly identified during design of a potential second phase - together with the corresponding institutional considerations for the development of improved monitoring and supervision and implementation support arrangements.	The INREMP clearly defines the geographic location to be the catchments and watersheds along the URBs of a number of carefully selected river basins in the country. The Technical Working Group put together by the DENR. The institutional arrangements for INREMP are also clearly defined national, regional, provincial, municipal, and local barangay levels. They include a national project steering committee, inter-agency technical working group, national project coordination office, project operations group, project executive coordination group, regional Department of Environment and Natural Resources (DENR) units, provincial LGUs councils and coordination offices, and municipal watershed project coordination offices, with clearly-defined terms of references and will ensure close monitoring and impact assessments to ensure the development objectives will be achieved. Furthermore, an appropriate project performance M&E system will be designed and executed for individual subprojects. Also, while implementation monitoring will be the responsibility of the implementing agencies concerned at all levels, an independent organization will be contracted directly to monitor performance and impact assessments.
Philippines	IE	5	CTRY	STR	TGT	The evaluation suggested specifying the target group more accurately. Aligned with the GOP development thrusts and directions, the project design should be in line with the IFAD targeting policy and clear on the poverty level	INREMP's target group has been clearly defined to include all those living in the URBs. Since the subprojects and activities to be supported will be contiguous within the selected geographic areas (watersheds in particular) the targeting will be mainly through the nature of the interventions themselves. For example activities like

Country	Evaluation	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at completion point (ACP) agreed action	PMD follow-up
						of the targeted groups, and whether to include the enterprising poor and vulnerable groups.	land use assessment and URB management planning, plus conservation, rehabilitation and protection of URB state forests will target the whole communities. On the other hand, commercial forestry and certain livelihood enhancement support activities may target the enterprising poor.
Philippines	IE	6	CTRY	STR	DES	Improved integration of components: Any future operation should build on and improve the implementation of the approach adopted in WMCIP to ensure improved integration and sequencing of components and activities.	The integration and sequencing of the components under INREMP have been well defined. The INREMP process shall result in a marriage of science-based land management regimes with local knowledge. The INREM process shall result in a marriage of science-based land management regimes with local knowledge. Project sites will be assessed for land capability based on current land use and biophysical parameters, current tenure that includes for ancestral domains, and appropriate sustainable management regimes that incorporate biodiversity, conservation, climate change mitigation and adaptation requirements to enable full economic, social and environmental appraisal of land use options.
Philippines	IE	7	CTRY	STR	DES	Enhance the government's participation in the design process: In line with the evolving operating model within IFAD, future project design should involve the CPMT and enhance the participation of government, in all levels, in order to improve country ownership, relevance, and partnership.	The Government was encouraged to establish a TWG to oversee the design of the INREMP. This has become a key player in the CPMT, which has the role of ensuring the local ownership of the project. Furthermore, the lead project agency, DENR, is allowed to subsequently choose to prioritize other river basins, other than the four used during the design phase for modelling purposes, taking into account relevant recent events during implementation, prior to undertaking any land use and capability assessment and as long as the effective use of project funds is not sacrificed and the integrity of the watershed ecosystem is preserved. The very intensive consultative process used in the design of INREMP can be assessed in the full design reports.
<b>Recommendation 1.2: Project Organisation and Management</b>							
Philippines	IE	8	CTRY	STR	SUS	Mainstreaming for sustainability: activities should be mainstreamed into regular regional and provincial operations of all agencies and sustainability instituted from project onset.	INREMP is fully integrated into the regular regional and provincial operations by both the central government agencies and the LGUs. The updated Medium Term Philippine Development Plan (MTPDP) of 2009, specifically chapter 3 on Green Philippines (formerly entitled Environment and Natural Resources) was the basis of the design of INRENMP. In particular, it supports two of the four thematic areas of that chapter namely, sustainable forest management and protected area and wildlife management. The project incorporates the concerns raised in the sustainable forest management theme anchored on participatory approaches to tackle rehabilitation and restoration of degraded forestlands and protection of residual forest areas as well as promoting more environmentally sustainable farming practices, especially on steeply sloping land to reduce erosion of valuable topsoil. These measures will address concerns on food and water security and demand for forest products and promote social development and poverty reduction through effective

Country	Evaluation	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at completion point (ACP) agreed action	PMD follow-up
							management of the natural resource base. The management of protected areas covered by the second theme, is where the project will emphasize the valuation of the environmental services in soil and water and biodiversity conservation in order to generate payments from a wide range of beneficiaries to ensure sustainability of these services, including for example, payments under the proposed reducing emissions from deforestation in developing countries (REDD) initiative. Policy support is encouraging as regards the Sustainable Forest Management Bill and the National Land Use Bill which are being processed.
Philippines	IE	9	CTRY	STR	SUS	Clear coordination mechanisms between partner agencies should be established. NRM in particular cuts across institutional mandates of several agencies, and the project design and logical framework should be clear on inputs, activities and expected outputs and impact. To enhance project mainstreaming, coordination mechanisms between the IFAD and the GOP/Executing Agency should be in line with the institutional set ups negotiated and agreed in the project loan agreement, based on a transparent assessment of the needs of the project and the existing institutional capabilities.	The technical working group (TWG) is the first coordination mechanism established during the design of INREMP. The interagency TWG, whose terms of references includes supporting the National Programme Steering Committee by coordinating the respective agencies' work in support of INREMP implementation, and providing necessary interagency linkages and coordination, is chaired by the FMB (Forest Management Bureau) Director and co-chaired by the PAWB (Protected Areas Wildlife Bureau) Director. Its members will comprise of designated technical staff from National Economic and Development Authority (NEDA), the Department of Agriculture, the Department of Agrarian Reform, National Commission on Indigenous Peoples, Municipal Development Fund Office of the Department of Finance, DBM (Department of Budget and Management), DILG (Department of Interior and Local Government), National Irrigation Authority, NWRB (National Water Resources Board), NAMRIA (National Mapping and Resource Information Authority), and DENR offices concerned. The other project coordination mechanisms being negotiated during the design of INREMP include national project steering committee, a national project coordination office, a provincial INREMP council, a provincial project coordination office, and a watershed project coordination office, whose terms of references and modus operandi are being negotiated and improved during the design of the project.
Philippines	IE	10	CTRY	STR	SUS	Clarity of responsibilities is also important if the project covers parts of Autonomous Region in Muslim Mindanao (ARMM) as well as Region 9 (e.g. in Basilan).	Programme does not cover these areas.
Philippines	IE	11	CTRY	STR	PMA	Project management in conflict zones: Project execution and supervision and implementation support mechanisms need to be flexible, given the constantly changing security circumstances in the region.	The INREMP is not going to cover the deep conflict affected areas covered under WMCIP. Nevertheless, the management of the project is flexible and largely dependent on the local conditions at any given province or municipality.
Philippines	IE	12	CTRY	OPER	PMA	Project management staff must be able to work with and communicate across the varied different groups in conflict areas: at local	The selection of project staff is largely local as the key implementing agencies of DENR and the LGUs all rely on local recruitment. This will be monitored during implementation.



Country	Evaluation	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at completion point (ACP) agreed action	PMD follow-up
						levels, being indigenous to the area or of the same ethnic group would be advantageous.	
Philippines	IE	13	CTRY	STR	SUP	Increased IFAD visibility. IFAD needs to make its presence felt more widely during project execution, for example, by ensuring that its policy priorities and declarations (e.g. related to IPs) remain areas of focus throughout the project life cycle and undertaking direct supervision and implementation support including participation of the country programme officer.	The design of INREMP has incorporated full sections of the past IFAD-funded projects like WMCIP, NMCIREMP and CHARMP-2, especially on the critical aspects of working with IP and on various livelihoods development approaches. Furthermore, even though AsDB has accepted to be the Cooperating Institution of IFAD for the project IFAD will continue to play a major role during supervision and implementation support. AsDB has acknowledged at various meetings with the Government of the Philippines that the design and organized of INREMP should be considered entirely due to the efforts of IFAD. Thus, both GOP and AsDB expect IFAD to continue being more present throughout the design process and the implementation of the project.
Philippines	IE	14	CTRY	STR	PMA	Screen community initiatives: New community infrastructure projects, while continuing to be selected in a participatory manner by communities, should also be screened by the project for technical and environmental feasibility. Project appraisal mechanisms to ensure objective review and approval of infrastructure projects should be established.	Subprojects, to be designed during implementation, will be selected according to the need for remedial measures to reduce degradation and an assessment benefits that can be achieved. This will cover consistency with provincial and national development strategies, the socioeconomic significance, particularly from reduced soil erosion and impact on poverty reduction, the ecological significance in terms of biodiversity and carbon sequestration potential, the contribution to sustainable production of goods and post-investment financial sustainability. In addition, institutional criteria that will impact on implementation that include: (i) concurrence by concerned national agencies and LGUs and willingness of the LGUs to participate and put up the required equity; (ii) LGUs' willingness to surveys and safeguards assessments for individual subproject feasibility studies; (iii) willingness of LGUs to abide by the AsDB, IFAD, and government procurement guidelines and anticorruption policies, and to enforce financial due diligence and fiduciary management; etc
<b>Recommendation 1.3: Specific Project Components and Implementation</b>							
<b>(a) Resources and Environment</b>							
Philippines	IE	15	PROJ	STR	SUS	Mindanao conflict and regulation of resource use: Future projects must recognize and support the dynamics of tri-communities (Muslim, Christian and IPs) in conflict areas by bringing these partners together to resolve conflicts and manage natural resources.	If conflict affected areas are included under the project these recommendations will be executed.
Philippines	IE	16	GOV	STR	NRM	Environment: The influx of mining activities within the four provinces poses a clear threat to the sustainability of WMCIP and needs to be kept under review. If there is no IFAD follow on intervention, as part of the mainstreaming, Department of Agrarian Reform (DAR), DENR, and relevant LGUs should be involved in this	Since IFAD does not have a follow-up project in the exact areas covered under WMCIP there is no information available about the follow-up from DAR, DENR and LGUs on this recommendation.

Country	Evaluation	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at completion point (ACP) agreed action	PMD follow-up
						review.	
Philippines	IE	17	PROJ	STR	TGT	IPs and Certificate of Ancestral Domain Claims (CADCs): There are two pressing issues that affect the concern for IPs and should be incorporated into future activities; (i) financing of Ancestral Domain Sustainable Development and Protection Plans; and (ii) organizing other IPs groups within the region to formally file their respective CADC where viable under the Indigenous Peoples Rights Act.	INREMP foresees deliberate efforts to help IPs prepare their Ancestral Domain Sustainable Development and Protection Plans and improve their tenurial rights to their land through CADCs and even CADTs.
<b>(b) Capacity Building</b>							
Philippines	IE	18	PROJ	STR	ORG	Community development: Financial support by MLGUs should be continued for the CDVs to support POs and development work in barangays, in coordination with the Sangguniang Pambarangay (Barangay Council). The financial management capabilities of officers of People's Organizations, Farmers/Fishermen's Associations and Cooperatives should be further enhanced and include provisions for assessing the economic viability of proposed investment activities. In addition, assistance should be provided in establishing market linkages.	INREMP has built into its activities lessons learnt from WMCIP and other projects in this respect. As a general strategy, the Project will seek to empower communities and IPs and local governments, through multi-sectoral bodies guided by science-based analysis and economic appraisal of watershed conditions. These bodies shall take decisions on inter-sectoral conflicts (e.g. forests versus mines, high-value agriculture versus biodiversity conservation) that ensure sustainability and avoid further natural resource degradation. There will be no need for superimposing any new institutional arrangements that overlap existing institutions. The Project will employ a calibrated phased development through capacity building and information education and communication (IEC) as well as an area-based approach corresponding to integrated ecosystem management. Capability-building and organizational strengthening support to national, regional and local organizations will be implemented as an integral part of the development cycle.
Philippines	IE	19	PROJ	STR	TCB	LGU capacity development: (i) Continue training and technical support to Municipal and Provincial LGU personnel in monitoring and evaluation; and (ii) Continue support to LGUs in assessing and updating of the Sustainable Barangay Development Plans responsive to the emerging needs of the barangays and for fund mobilization.	Based on a thorough assessment of institutional challenges and opportunities, and the needs of project implementation, INREMP has included a number of actions for institutional strengthening like: (a) conduct a capacity needs assessment for DENR and participating LGUs (number of personnel, budgetary support needed, available expertise/skills) to implement project components; (b) based on the assessment, engage experts to provide the technical skills training needed to improve service delivery and decision-making in the various institutions implementing the project; (c) establish the structures and systems needed, such as the geographical information system (GIS)-based decision-support system. The specific generic institutional capacity-building elements, based on the requirements to implement an INREM approach, included: trainers' training for DENR technical staff who will then train LGU staff; basic and advanced GIS for selected LGUs; field validation and data gathering support for LGUs; land use planning support for LGUs leading to community mapping and land use zoning and eventually consensus-building at community level; assisted natural

Country	Evaluation	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at completion point (ACP) agreed action	PMD follow-up
							regeneration, rehabilitation, afforestation, and law enforcement, just to name a few.
Philippines	IE	20	PROJ	STR	PAR	Line agency support and partnership: (i) Line agencies should continue providing technical support to community organizations in pursuing NRM, livelihood and marketing and credit; (ii) Linkage of ongoing and new programs using existing structures such as Barangay Development Team/ Municipal Development Team and Barangay Infrastructure Monitoring Board should be pursued to ensure continuity of institutional development (and avoid duplication) in the identification and implementation of projects funded by other agencies.	The design of INREMP includes these supports as expected. In order to implement the project following the INREM approach, existing institutions must be strengthened to perform the required activities. Institutional strengthening requires an adjustment of roles for the DENR, local governments and peoples' organizations, aside from acquiring necessary skills and resources. DENR will shift from primary implementer to enabler/trainer of local governments and community-based organizations/peoples organizations. DENR has the technical knowledge to share; what it needs to build are: (i) Capacity to transfer technical knowledge to local governments and CBOs/peoples organizations on land assessment and natural resource management planning; (ii) Capacity and resources to monitor and evaluate INREM outputs and outcomes based on pre-agreed environmental performance Indicators built into a GIS-based decision support system. Local governments have the skills for local programme/enterprise management and local finance; what LGUs should build are: (i) technical knowledge to manage the URB as an ecosystem, with appropriate strategies for conserving and ensuring environmental services, participatory decision-making and generating income to finance conservation; (ii) capacity to monitor and evaluate performance from ecological, financial and socio-cultural perspectives, as linked to the GIS-based decision support system.
<b>(c) Enterprise Development and Credit</b>							
Philippines	IE	21	PROJ	STR	PRM	Market-oriented approach: An integrated approach is needed covering production, processing and marketing, recognizing the importance of market linkages for the rural poor.	While marketing is not a major component of INREMP, there are provisions under the second component (field investments) for undertaking livelihood support for the poor by providing communities within a watershed, inter-alia, extension and training on micro-, small-, and medium-sized agro-agribusinesses and post harvest management to be strengthened by business advisory services, market linkages and linking to microcredit and finance institutions.
Philippines	IE	22	PROJ	STR	TCB	Capacity-building and investment is needed in activities that are commercially viable in the market. NGOs may not have capabilities in enterprise development and business development services, and if used, need training.	All business development services to be provided under INREMP will be through service providers competent enough for the task that will be recruited through open competitive processes. While NGOs may be considered they will have to compete like all others in the process.
Philippines	IE	23	PROJ	OPER	RFI	Credit: A different credit modality should be sought with other government entities. This should take into account lessons learned from the evaluation of the previously IFAD-funded Rural Micro-Enterprise Finance Program and	No credit facility is foreseen under INREMP. Provision has, however, been made to link with existing credit providers in the areas to be covered.

Country	Evaluation	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at completion point (ACP) agreed action	PMD follow-up
						the recently launched Rural Micro-Enterprise Promotion Project (RuMEPP). For example, RuMEPP's effort to use the credit funds as a deposit/guaranty in the Small Business Guaranty and Finance Corporation working in partnership with MFIs is a step in the right direction.	
<b>Recommendation 2.1 – Coastal areas</b>							
Philippines	IE	24	CTRY	STR	PAR	Environment: If a follow on intervention continues to work in coastal areas, greater effort has to be made to enhance the involvement of the Department of Agriculture-Regional Field units and Bureau of Fisheries and Aquatic Resources, especially in regard to extending technical assistance to the various land and water resource management technologies.	No coastal areas are covered under INREMP as activities will be concentrated along the catchments in the URBs.
Philippines	IE	25	CTRY	STR	PAR	DENR complementarity of two laws, namely RA 7586 and RA 8550 affecting marine and coastal resource management and fisheries in National Integrated Protected Areas Systems (NIPAS), needs to be addressed. The Fisheries Code (RA8550) is more localized and operable at the LGU level. NIPAS requires congressional approval across a vast stretch of protected areas.	The cross-sectoral nature of URB management caused the design of INREMP to include the development of proposals that will resolve the issues of: (a) fragmented and overlapping policies, legislation and institutional responsibilities; (b) conflicting, contradictory or ambiguous regulations and institutional roles; (c) insufficient capacity of concerned stakeholders to ensure sustainable management of critical watersheds; (d) ineffective implementation and enforcement of forest and mining laws and regulations; (e) inadequate land tenure classification; and (f) insufficient funding. Project implementation does not require that laws or major policies be changed significantly, except to ensure that the policies and regulations are consistent. Existing laws and policies are already supportive of the INREM approach, except for some inter-sectoral inconsistencies and lack of implementation. As a general strategy, the project will seek to empower communities and IPs and local governments, through multisectoral bodies and guided by science-based analysis and economic appraisal of watershed conditions, to take decisions on inter-sectoral conflicts (e.g. forests versus mines, high-value agriculture versus biodiversity conservation), that ensure sustainability and avoid further natural resource degradation