

Document: EC 2009/57/W.P.5/Add.1
Agenda: 6
Date: 15 July 2009
Distribution: Public
Original: English

E



Enabling poor rural people
to overcome poverty

President's Report on the Implementation Status of Evaluation Recommendations and Management Actions (PRISMA)

Volume II

**Agreement at completion point
recommendations and follow-up
actions taken by the Programme
Management Department**

Addendum

Evaluation Committee — Fifty-seventh Session
Rome, 20-21 July 2009

For: **Review**

Note to Evaluation Committee Members

This document is submitted for review by the Evaluation Committee.

To make the best use of time available at Evaluation Committee meetings, members are invited to contact the following focal point with any technical questions about this document before the session:

Shyam Khadka

Senior Portfolio Manager

telephone: +39 06 5459 2388

e-mail: s.khadka@ifad.org

Queries regarding the dispatch of documentation for this session should be addressed to:

Deirdre McGrenra

Governing Bodies Officer

telephone: +39 06 5459 2374

e-mail: d.mcgrenra@ifad.org

Contents

Abbreviations and acronyms	ii
Categories used for the classification of agreement at completion point agreed actions	iii
A. Interim Evaluations	1
Burkina Faso: Community-Based Rural Development Project	1
B. Completion Evaluations	5
Albania: Mountain Areas Development Programme	5
Belize: Community-Initiated Agriculture and Resource Management Project (CARD)	8
Pakistan: Dir Area Support Project	10
Romania: Apuseni Development Project	10
C. Country Programme Evaluations	11
Brazil	11

Abbreviations and acronyms

ACP	agreement at completion point
CIRAD	Centre de coopération internationale en recherche agronomique pour le développement
COSOP	country strategic opportunities programme
FDC	financial development company
M&E	monitoring and evaluation
MADA	Mountain Areas Development Agency
MAFF	Mountain Areas Finance Fund
MMP	Mountain to markets programme
PDRD	Sustainable Rural Development Programme
PMD	Programme Management Department
PNGT	Community-Based Rural Development Project
PREVAL	Programme for Strengthening the Regional Capacity for Monitoring and Evaluation of IFAD's Rural Poverty-Alleviation Projects in Latin America and the Caribbean
REAF	Commission on Family Farming
RFP	Rural Finance Programme
SDRMA	Sustainable Development for Rural Mountain Areas

Categories used for the classification of agreement at completion point agreed actions

Type of Evaluation

IE	interim evaluation
CE	completion evaluation
CPE	country programme evaluation

SN	serial number
-----------	---------------

Level

IFAD	IFAD corporate level
REG	IFAD regional level
CTRY	IFAD country level
GOV	government authorities (national, local level and institutions)
PROJ	project

Nature

PLCY	policy
STRA	strategy development, including COSOPs and projects
OPER	operational and implementation

Themes

ASR	analysis, studies and researches
BEN	beneficiaries and stakeholders' participation and consultation
DEC	decentralization
DES	project design
DIA	policy dialogue
FLD	field presence
GDR	gender (including targeting to women)
GOV	governance
HR	human resources (management, recruitment)
INF	infrastructure (construction, contracting, management, supervision)
INR	innovation and replication
KM	knowledge management
NRM	natural resource management
ORG	organizations, groups, institutions and collective approaches
PAR	partnership
PRM	private sector, market and enterprise development
PMA	project management and administration
RFI	rural finance
RME	results monitoring, evaluation
STRA	strategy
SUP	supervision
SUS	sustainability
TCB	training, capacity-building
TGT	targeting

Agreement at completion point recommendations and follow-up action taken by the Programme Management Department

A. Interim Evaluations

Country	Eval	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at completion point (ACP) Agreed Action	PMD follow-up
Burkina Faso: Community-Based Rural Development Project (PNGT II)							
Recommendation 1: Further IFAD involvement in the next PNGT II phases							
Burkina Faso	IE	1	CTRY	STRA	STRA	The evaluation recommends that IFAD continue to participate in PNGT II. It is important for IFAD to engage in a dialogue with the Government and the International Development Association to ensure that the recommendations emerging from the evaluation are taken fully on board by the main partners, in a timely manner.	Given its current PBAS allocation, it has not been possible to design a new operation to cofinance the PNGT II under the current cycle. However, this will be possible under the new 2010-2012 PBAS allocation, and the Government of Burkina Faso (GoBF) was notified in May 2008. PA Division envisages starting the process of pipelining a follow-up project early next year. It will be important to align this potential new cofinancing operation with the current implementation calendar of PNGT II.
Burkina Faso	IE	2	CTRY	STRA	STRA	IFAD should base any future participation on an in-depth analysis of the design and preliminary lessons learned from the second phase. In order to optimize its value added, IFAD should identify a specific niche of support, either thematic or geographic, in line with its objectives and strategies and in synergy with the other elements of its country programme.	Same as above.
Burkina Faso	IE	3	CTRY	STRA	SUP	IFAD should fully involve itself in the supervision of its intervention and in implementation support to PNGT II.	Same as above.
Burkina Faso	IE	4	CTRY	STRA	STRA	Derive more value from its future participation in PNGT II to fully draw on lessons learned in terms of project approaches and multiple issues relating to reducing poverty and inequality.	Same as above.
Recommendation 2: Inclusion of the most vulnerable population groups							
Burkina Faso	IE	5	PROJ	STRA	TGT	The partners involved in the next phase of the project should ensure that the poorest, most marginalized and vulnerable among the active rural population fully participate in project interventions and share in all project benefits.	Same as above.
Burkina Faso	IE	6	PROJ	STRA	TGT	Ensure a better understanding by the project of the mechanisms of social and economic exclusion and marginalization affecting the most vulnerable social groups in subproject design and implementation.	Same as above.

Country	Eval	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at completion point (ACP) Agreed Action	PMD follow-up
Burkina Faso	IE	7	PROJ	STRA	BEN	Develop participatory approaches to local planning and monitoring and evaluation (M&E) that ensure full participation by vulnerable or marginalized groups in consensus-building and assign an unequivocal place to reducing vulnerability among such groups.	Same as above.
Burkina Faso	IE	8	PROJ	STRA	RME	M&E should make it possible to appreciate the quality of consensus-building and inclusion/exclusion and to assess impact on vulnerable groups.	Same as above.
Burkina Faso	IE	9	PROJ	STRA	TGT	Provide for financing rules that assign a specific place to subprojects aimed at reducing vulnerability and exclusion, as well as a system of incentives to promote such projects.	Same as above.
Recommendation 3: Empowerment of rural communities in the recent decentralisation context							
Burkina Faso	IE	10	PROJ	STRA	BEN	It is important that the next phase of the project should work to further develop village community capacities to ensure the quality of services delivered by the rural communes and public technical services.	Same as above.
Burkina Faso	IE	11	PROJ	STRA	BEN	Develop appropriate facilitation methods to promote effective accountability on the part of elected officials and village development councils (VDCs) in developing, financing, implementing and monitoring their projects. The future project phase should therefore accord greater importance and financial resources to individual and collective empowerment (at the VDC and municipal council level) in accordance with the General Code on Territorial Entities, the Decree on VDCs and the VDC guide. This should include feedback mechanisms and accountability at all levels of planning and management.	Same as above.
Burkina Faso	IE	12	CTRY	STRA	DES	Support a shift in the roles of public technical services, refocusing their mission around advising local governments and supporting the management of commune-level and local subprojects. The next phase of PNGT II should help set up a system to deliver public and private services managed by, and driven by demand from, rural citizens.	Same as above.
Burkina Faso	IE	13	CTRY	STRA	ORG	Capacity-building for these services should be underpinned by training and promotion of collaboration protocols (for technical and advisory assistance) among local governments and public technical services, in the framework of implementing community development plans.	Same as above.
Burkina Faso	IE	14	CTRY	STRA	BEN	Ensure that village and community-based planning approaches place greater emphasis on endogenous potential and initiatives to develop local resources	A recent supervision mission of the Sustainable Rural Development Programme (PDRD), a programme that uses mostly the same community-based participatory planning

Country	Eval	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at completion point (ACP) Agreed Action	PMD follow-up
						(natural resources, human and cultural resources, and so on). Accompanying measures should incorporate endogenous local actions and organizations fully and systematically into planning, to avoid limiting subprojects to those investments that are eligible for external financing.	processes as PNGT II, made this same recommendation, which is already being implemented in the PDRD programme area.
Recommendation 4: Sustainability of local investments							
Burkina Faso	IE	15	PROJ	STRA	SUS	<p>Adopt cost-sharing mechanisms that are equitable and adapted to the specificities of each investment and its maintenance requirements. The PNGT2 should more closely examine how community contributions have been collected and whether such contributions have favoured sustainable infrastructure management.</p> <p>While respecting the principle of cost-sharing as defined in the Policy Letter on Decentralized Rural Development, the way it is being implemented should be revisited in light of decentralization and changes in local society.</p> <p>The principle of financial cost-sharing as a condition for acquiring project financing should be highly nuanced and applied in direct relation to the fiscal system set up by rural communes in charge of the management of a large number of local investments.</p> <p>Moreover, a clause should be included in contracts with private enterprises requiring them to use unskilled local labour and to buy materials available locally from communities.</p>	Given its current PBAS allocation, it has not yet been possible for IFAD to design a new operation to cofinance the PNGT II under the current cycle. This will however be possible under the new 2010-2012 PBAS allocation, of which GoBF has been notified in May 2008. PA Division envisages starting the process of pipelining such a follow-up project early next year, and it will be important to seek to align this potential new cofinancing operation with the current implementation calendar of PNGT II.
Burkina Faso	IE	16	PROJ	STRA	STRA	Promote access by populations to adequate means for maximizing investments. Local investment subprojects should ensure that adequate means are accessible to the population to maximize their use of the facilities constructed.	Same as above.
Burkina Faso	IE	17	PROJ	STRA	SUS	Provide adequate coaching to ensure investment management and maintenance. The PNGT II should strongly support communes in setting up adapted and equitable local fiscal systems that are acceptable to citizens and would replenish a communal maintenance fund for municipal infrastructure.	GoBF is studying the feasibility of putting such a fund in place. The IFAD design mission on the Rural Business Development Services Programme has assessed progress in this respect and has called on GoBF to further intensify dialogue with IFAD-funded community-driven development projects and programmes such as PDRD and the Community Investment Programme for Agricultural Fertility to draw on lessons learned so far.
Burkina Faso	IE	18	PROJ	STRA	NRM	The community-driven development approach should be adjusted to more easily accommodate community subprojects. Land tenure security should be built as a cross-cutting issue into each local investment subproject.	The Land tenure security component of PDRD is working on precisely this issue, starting with the community-driven development approach of PDRD, and has recently benefited from a number of national and international implementation support missions, including from

Country	Eval	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at completion point (ACP) Agreed Action	PMD follow-up
							CIRAD/Green.
Recommendation 5: Natural Resource Management							
Burkina Faso	IE	19	PROJ	STRA	NRM	<p>Develop appropriate accompanying measures and financing instruments to support the inter-village and inter-community consensus building process in order to encourage users and decision-makers to adapt natural resource management rules. The process of building up a consensus among natural resource users and owner-managers needs to involve elected commune officials, socio-professional organizations and public technical services.</p> <p>It should be based on a sound analysis of the resource dynamics concerned, and on existing operating approaches and management rules.</p> <p>The process should involve all villages involved in the shared natural resource (watershed, sylvopastoral area, transhumance axis, grazing area), and lead to local agreements on natural resource management, conservation and use, in order to ensure the resource's sustainability.</p> <p>Supporting such a process calls for work on a time scale that goes beyond the typical annual cycle of village subprojects, and requires a special kind of financing.</p>	<p>Accompanying measures and financing instruments to support the inter-village and inter-community consensus building process in order to encourage users and decision-makers to adapt natural resource management rules are currently being promoted by PDRD in five pilot watersheds. The integrated watershed management approach, supported as of early this year also through a Global Environment Facility grant, will ensure that the process of building up a consensus among natural resource users and owner-managers needs to involve elected commune officials, socio-professional organizations and public technical services. It will also be based on a sound analysis of the resource dynamics concerned, and on existing operating approaches and management rules, and involve all villages in the watersheds concerned. Through the Land tenure security component of PDRD, the integrated watershed management approach is to lead to local agreements on natural resource management, conservation and use.</p>
Burkina Faso	IE	20	PROJ	STRA	NRM	<p>Mainstream land tenure security as a cross-cutting theme into all local investment subprojects. An in-depth evaluation of pilot experiences in the first phase should be carried out in order to measure expected and unexpected results of PNGT II interventions. Once the rural communes have taken on the central role attributed to them under the General Code on Territorial Entities, the project should focus its support on land tenure management at that level. Support to the General Directorate for Land Tenure and Farmer Organizations should help define accompanying measures for land tenure management by the communes pursuant to the provisions of the new legislation now being finalized.</p>	<p>On the issue of mainstreaming land tenure security as a cross-cutting theme, see PMD follow-up to SN 18 above. The land tenure security component of PDRD, also supported by IFAD grant 866-BF, is furthermore collaborating with the General Directorate for Land Tenure and Farmer Organizations and the National Committee for Rural Land Tenure Security on evaluating pilot experiences for increasing rural land tenure security of poor and marginalized population groups as provided by the recently approved national rural land tenure security policy. Support to the General Directorate for Land Tenure and Farmer Organizations to help define accompanying measures for land tenure management by the communes pursuant to the provisions of the new legislation is being done under IFAD grant 866-BF.</p>

B. Completion Evaluations

Country	Eval	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD follow-up
Albania: Mountain Areas Development Programme (MADP)							
Recommendation 1: Accelerate the strategic shift supporting a private sector led structural transformation							
Albania	CE	1	CTRY	STRA	PRM	This should form the backbone of the mountain areas growth and poverty reduction strategy. However, all partners should remain clear that this process will produce both winners and short-term losers. Assistance should be provided to small scale, under-capitalised and often under-educated farmers who often have only limited prospects in a scenario of privatisation. They should be assisted in managing the transition out of small-scale farming.	Under the IFAD loan financed Programme for Sustainable Development for Rural Mountain Areas (SDRMA); the Mountain Areas Development Agency (MADA) is co-financing with Programme beneficiaries the introduction and development of technological innovations in sub-sectors with opportunities for enhanced competitiveness and substantial multiplier effects on rural incomes in areas such as product quality, food safety, product storage, processing, branding and marketing with the objectives of: (a) demonstrating and transferring improved and innovative technologies to small-scale agriculture and rural businesses; (b) building capacity and assisting rural business entities to improve competitiveness, profitability and business management practices; and (c) building capacity of rural service providers to support rural business entities.
Albania	CE	2	CTRY	STRA	PAR	Facilitate accelerated technology transfer and adaptation by partnering with relevant organizations and enterprises both in and outside Albania. The beneficiaries should be commercially oriented farmers with a documented potential to up-scale. IFAD will provide assistance to the process, including identification of international partners for technology transfers and piloting.	Same as above.
Recommendation 2: Increase the poorest labour market mobility enabling them to exploit emerging non-agricultural opportunities							
Albania	CE	3	CTRY	STRA	PRM	Instead of focusing mainly on marginally improving the productivity of small-scale farmers, more efforts should be focused on complementing the private sector led growth strategy with targeted efforts aimed at improving the poorest people's skills and competencies, enabling them to take advantage of the new opportunities emerging in both rural and non-rural settings. Retraining, vocational education and targeted courses could form part of such a complementary strategy, especially in subjects where labour shortages exist as identified during SIP preparatory work.	Refer to PMD follow-up to SN 1 above. Under the SDRMA, MADA has initiated the implementation of a workforce and capacity building programme aimed at enlarging the pool of appropriately qualified labour available to emergent mountain businesses. Similar activities are planned under the forthcoming IFAD loan financed Mountain to Markets Programme (MMP).
Recommendation 3: Prioritize districts with higher than average poverty rates							
Albania	CE	4	CTRY	STRA	TGT	It is unfortunate that the investment and activity levels of MADP remained largely concentrated in the relatively	Both the Borrower - through MADA and the Mountain Areas Finance Fund (MAFF) - and IFAD are closely

Country	Eval	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD follow-up
						richer southern mountain areas and the MADA in particular focused efforts on relatively better off areas, leaving out poorer ones. This needs to be corrected and more investment will need to be directed to the northern mountain areas.	monitoring the distribution of SDRMA-financed investments as to ensure an appropriate geographical balance of investments. In addition, the forthcoming MMP focuses exclusively on the four poorest regions of Albania (Diber, Kukes, Lezhe and Shkoder).
Albania	CE	5	CTRY	STRA	TGT	IFAD should closely monitor the geographically-based resource allocation and should not allow a repetition to occur, but ultimate responsibility rests with MADA. Special efforts should be made in order to ensure an appropriate geographical allocation of resources, according to poverty rates.	Same as above.
Recommendation 4: Make a clear, sequenced and time specific privatisation plan for the Mountain Areas Finance Fund (MAFF)							
Albania	CE	6	CTRY	STRA	PRM	Commercial banks are, partly taking their cue from MAFF, investing heavily in mountain areas, and MAFF should be given the full operational and management freedom needed to remain competitive, as only a full privatisation process could offer. In this process MAFF should be assisted to define its comparative advantages vis-à-vis its competitors which are probably still related to the less affluent market segment in the mountain areas.	MAFF has embarked on a process that would lead to its transformation from a not-for-profit foundation into a self-sustainable non-banking financial institution. To this effect, international technical assistance, including for the identification and strengthening of its comparative advantages, financed by IFAD supplementary funds is ongoing.
Albania	CE	7	CTRY	STRA	SUS	MAFF should be dissolved as a foundation and created as an initially 100 per cent government owned for-profit non-bank financial institution (probably a financial development company [FDC]), with the clear intention of selling the shares to a strategic investor.	MAFF has been converted into a shareholding FDC, 100 per cent owned by the Ministry of Finance. The FDC 2009-2011 strategy foresees, inter alia, the entry of a strategic investor in the second half of 2009.
Albania	CE	8	CTRY	STRA	TCB	Both MAFF and IFAD will need to assist in making the detailed planning needed to ensure a smooth, transparent and fair process in the privatisation of MAFF. IFAD, in particular, will need to provide specialized technical assistance of international quality to ensure this outcome.	Refer to SN 6 and 7 above. With IFAD assistance, MAFF has developed a new conversion strategy, which was approved by the Government of Albania in May 2008, a business plan, and a new statute and act of establishment. These documents are available in PN upon request.
Albania	CE	9	GOV	STRA	PRM	Bank of Albania will need to provide the restructured entity with full license as a non-bank financial institution. The Albanian Parliament will have to pass necessary legislation allowing for the dissolution of MAFF and the creation of a for-profit non-bank financial institution, initially owned by the government.	The newly established company (FDC) has been granted the relevant licenses to operate as a non-banking financial institution and MAFF has been converted into a shareholding FDC, 100 per cent owned by the Ministry of Finance.

Country	Eval	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD follow-up
Albania	CE	10	CTRY	STRA	PRM	<p>It will be very important to have a carefully sequenced plan for the conversion of MAFF, respecting all legal requirements. Also, in order to attract the best possible strategic investor, the privatisation should not be rushed. A first step should be the establishment of the for-profit non-banking financial institution (e.g. a FDC) as a legal entity. This could be completed within a year. Concurrently there is a need to develop a business plan for the conversion period in order to ensure that MAFF does not lose momentum and market share during this critical period.</p> <p>Furthermore, to minimise uncertainty the identification of a strategic investor should also receive priority and probably be completed before the end of 2009.</p> <p>It is important that IFAD complements this process by providing assistance in upgrading MAFF's product portfolio ensuring alignment to the objectives of the for-profit entity.</p>	Refer to SNs 6, 7, 8 and 9 above.
Recommendation 5: Ensure more realistic analysis of incentives and political economy issues							
Albania	CE	11	CTRY	STRA	DES	<p>The MADP experience testifies to the need to critically analyse both economic and political incentives of all stakeholders (including possible losers) especially when designing interventions based on collective approaches. The MADP experiences also suggest that there are significant dangers in following donor fashions as the evidence from irrigation, forest management and micro-credit testify.</p>	The design of the MMP took into account these lessons and carefully evaluated such issues during programme design.
Albania	CE	12	CTRY	STRA	ORG	<p>Interventions relying on the establishment of new groups and associations need to be carefully evaluated, utilising both insight from the political economy of collective action and more simple incentive analysis grounded in the local realities.</p>	The design of the MMP took into account these lessons and carefully evaluated such issues during programme design.
Recommendation 6: Increase the voices of the poorest mountain people in policy making and allocations of importance to them							
Albania	CE	13	CTRY	STRA	BEN	<p>Going forward, IFAD and MADA may need to devote more resources in analysing how to better ensure the representation of the poor in lobbying efforts, perhaps by supporting Civil Society Organizations (CSOs) and other more pro-poor groups directly, as a complement to Fora support.</p>	MADA has revised its approach to supporting the Fora to ensure: (i) a stronger institutionalization of Fora membership and structure/governance; (ii) a distinct connotation with respect to territory and thematic coverage; (iii) a specialized focus and consistent operational capacity; (iv) a coherent programming framework ensuring strategic relevance and coordination; and (v) a clear relation with available local development opportunities.

Country	Eval	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD follow-up
Belize: Community-Initiated Agriculture and Resource Management Project (CARD)							
Recommendation 1: Continued investment in the southern districts of Belize							
Belize	CE	1	CTRY	STRA	STRA	There should be continued investment in the southern districts of Belize. There are a number of initiatives developed through the project such as livestock development and bee keeping which still require support to ensure that the full benefits from project investments can be realized.	The Government of Belize requested IFAD to focus on the sustainable and inclusive expansion of the access to rural financial services by the rural poor population. The provision of non financial services will be ensured by the European Union-funded Belize Rural Development Project (BRDP). Activities such as those mentioned in the evaluation will be eligible for receiving both financial and non financial services.
Belize	CE	2	CTRY	STRA	PAR	There is a need for detailed negotiations with the European Union's BRDP and other sources of funds to definitively assess whether or not, and how, these priorities can be accommodated.	Coordination with the European Union will take place within the District Development Committees that have been created by the BRDP to evaluate and approve its investments at the local level.
Belize	CE	3	CTRY	STRA	BEN	Investment needs to be more targeted in relation to the lessons learned regarding greater involvement of local leaders in decision-making, building local capacity and longer term investments.	The IFAD-financed Rural Finance Programme (RFP) will be implemented by private local institutions such as the credit unions, whose memberships are made up of the local population, including local leaders. Credit unions will assess the viability of the investments and decide whether to finance or not.
Recommendation 2: Continuing support for rural finance							
Belize	CE	4	GOV	STRA	RFI	The GoB can assist in further development in the southern districts of Belize by ensuring that the funds are available to the south in perpetuity.	The RFP covers the entire country in strengthening rural financial services, including the southern region.
Belize	CE	5	CTRY	STRA	RFI	There is still a need for additional credit funds throughout Belize. Marketing support, recognition of collateral (particularly land) and decreasing delinquency need improved strategies.	The RFP has been initiated, thus enabling additional credit funds. The RFP's key objectives include improving governance, management and operational capabilities of CUs, therefore addressing these deficiencies.
Belize	CE	6	GOV	STRA	TCB	Investment is required in capacity building of the credit unions to develop a stable financial market for rural financial services.	The RFP supports credit unions and has a comprehensive strategy to support the sustainable and inclusive expansion of rural finance in Belize.
Belize	CE	7	GOV	STRA	KM	Policy reviews are required of broader financial processes such as taxes, incentives, trade finances, rural credit policies, etc. to support the microfinance sector.	The RFP has a comprehensive strategy to support the sustainable and inclusive expansion of rural finance in Belize, including institutional strengthening and capacity building grants, matching incentives for share and saving mobilization and credit funds.
Recommendation 3: Realistic implementation (only operational recommendations issued)							
Recommendation 4: Investment in people							
Belize	CE	8	PROJ	STRA	TGT	Improved communication mechanisms and opportunities for cultural exchange need to be encouraged so that there is an increased mutual understanding of the different cultures that comprise the national identity of Belize.	The capacity-building package to be offered to each participating credit union will be based on this principle. Therefore, assistance will be tailored to the specific needs and the different socioeconomic context in which each credit union operates.

Country	Eval	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD follow-up
Belize	CE	9	PROJ	STRA	TGT	Targeting needs to focus on the poor but specifically those people with commitment to participate. The mechanism for targeting needs to consider cultural/area specifics and not just formal poverty indicators. Criteria that are too rigid can exclude people with capacity e.g. community leaders who can support others in achieving change.	The RFP targeting strategy is one of the most innovative features of the programme design and is based on international best practices (i.e. the Consultative Group to Assist the Poor [CGAP]) for this particular type of stand-alone rural finance project. There is also a specific focus on the poorest and the indigenous populations of the south.
Belize	CE	10	PROJ	STRA	ORG	There is a need for local organizations to be made aware of their roles and responsibilities in the project so that there is greater likelihood of them being able to take full advantage of available opportunities.	Credit unions are among the local organizations with greatest potential. RFP institutional support will be helping them to fully acknowledge their key role for the long term development of the districts in which they operate.
Belize	CE	11	PROJ	STRA	BEN	Policy level review and practical support for decentralization is needed to assess the representation of different ethnic groups in decision-making for their own development. There is a need for community leaders, both traditional mayors and local councils to receive more orientation, training and basic tools for leadership.	This is not within the scope of the new IFAD loan-funded intervention. However, IFAD is presently financing with a small country grant the National Village Council Association with the purpose of strengthening the Belize incipient decentralization process.
Recommendation 5: Professionalising project processes (only operational recommendations issued)							
Recommendation 6: Productive partnerships							
Belize	CE	12	CTRY	STRA	PAR	Some amendments in the implementing arrangements between Caribbean Development Bank (CDB), IFAD and the Government of Belize (GoB) could make the partnership more productive, for instance, clearer distinction in the roles and responsibilities, particularly for CDB fulfilling a dual role as a financing partner of CARD, and as a cooperating institution for IFAD supervision and implementation support activities.	The RFP cofinancier is the Central American Bank for Economic Integration. The RFP will be directly supervised by IFAD.
Belize	CE	13	GOV	STRA	PAR	There is a need for GoB and donors to consider more public/private partnerships in project management and implementation. The mechanism of a Project Steering Committee (PSC) is a critical partnership for project implementation and in this regard, issues such as selection of members, conflict of interest, incentives, etc. must be realistically addressed. The GoB should make election to PSC/Boards more transparent.	The new RFP is implemented by the private sector through the credit unions. The role and composition of the RFP Oversight Committee has been extensively discussed during the programme design and lessons learnt from previous projects have been taken into account.
Belize	CE	14	GOV	STRA	PMA	There is a need to orientate and strengthen the Steering Committee/Board at an early stage in the project so all members understand the culture, responsibilities and requirements as a member and to make sure that they are capable of making the necessary decisions.	This recommendation will be addressed in the implementation of the RFP.

Country	Eval	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD follow-up
Belize	CE	15	GOV	STRA	KM	Better communication mechanisms and practices are required at all levels to expedite critical correspondence, exchange views more regularly, increase mutual understanding of the challenges faced by the project and lead to more rapid identification of solutions.	This recommendation will be addressed in the implementation of the RFP.
Pakistan: Dir Area Support Project (DASP)							
Pakistan	CE	1	CTRY	STRA	DES	For future projects where IFAD envisages a community development approach, it was recommended that such projects would include a three-year phasing-out stage.	This is to be integrated into the design of future projects.
Pakistan	CE	2	CTRY	STRA	SUS	IFAD should explore supporting post-project sustainability through working with financial apex institutions or even possibly trust funds.	Through a small country grant, IFAD is supporting the Sarhad Rural Support Programme to support the apex body set up by DASP. This one-year grant project is under implementation, and will be continued with provincial government funding in 2010.
Pakistan	CE	3	PROJ	STRA	RME	Efforts should be made on capacity building of the project in terms of impact monitoring, including by creating linkages with other organizations, and that these measures could be financed with the remaining Dir Area Support Project funds. (remaining recommendations in Pakistan were operational).	This aspect was not funded through DASP funds, but linkages with other organizations were supported through a small country grant supporting the Sarhad Rural Support Programme.
Romania: Apuseni Development Project (ADP)							
<p><i>Note:</i> The follow up to the ACP for the Romania Apuseni Development Project will have to be monitored as a special case. The ACP states that "There are no specific recommendations for the project per se since further IFAD loans are not in the pipeline, given the fact that Romania has become a part of the European Union. However, the following recommendations are offered to IFAD and the Government of Romania for the design and implementation of future projects and programmes similar to the ADP." Given the closure of the pipeline for projects in Romania, IFAD or PMD will not be implementing or following up on recommendations in any project or activities in the country. A number of the recommendations highlighted issues related to project design- these issues are already being addressed in the context of the development and roll-out of the design, quality enhancement and QA processes. There are only two recommendations specific to the project, with regard to which PMD could follow up with the national government and project authorities.</p>							The Apuseni Development Project closed on 30 June 2007. Given the termination of IFAD's activities in Romania and the fact that there will be no future engagement, the follow-up chain was disrupted.
Romania	CE	1	PROJ	STR	RFI	Avoid extending the rural credit fund to additional banks.	N/A
Romania	CE	2	PROJ	STRA	RFI	The Participating Credit Institutions should consider leveraging any funds (or funds from other donors) to maintain rural credit funds and/or develop new product or services of relevance to the target group.	N/A

C. Country Programme Evaluations

Country	Eval	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD follow-up
Recommendation: Strengthen innovation, promotion and knowledge management							
Brazil	CPE	1	REG	STRA	DIA	Policy dialogue, undertaken through initiatives such as the Commission on Family Farming (REAF) can provide a main tool by which IFAD-promoted innovations and knowledge are promoted and disseminated in the MERCOSUR region.	Last September, IFAD approved the third and final grant of US\$1.08 million to consolidate the REAF, prepare an impact assessment, and disseminate lessons learned to other IFAD partners in Latin America and other regional groups.
Brazil	CPE	2	CTRY	STRA	INR	<p>With regard to promoting innovations and policy dialogue (both at the national and regional level), it is crucial to ensure that the Fund devotes enhanced attention to scouting innovative solutions from different sources, including the rural poor and their organizations, the private sector, NGOs, research institutions and others.</p> <p>Greater use needs to be made especially of country-specific grants, but also regional grants, for this purpose. Grant-related activities need also to be more appropriately linked to loan-funded projects and programmes.</p> <p>Likewise, a more systematic approach, additional resources and larger efforts should be devoted to partnership building and knowledge management.</p>	<p>These recommendations have been fully considered within the COSOP designed in 2008 soon after the CPE. It includes two strategic objectives completely oriented to support Policy Dialogue (PD) and Knowledge Management (KM).</p> <p>Strategic objective 3: <i>To improve, through knowledge generation and dissemination, the capacity of the rural poor and of relevant institutions in the north-east to co-exist with semi-arid conditions, adapt to climate change and better exploit the development potential of the semi-arid region.</i></p> <p>Strategic objective 4: <i>To deepen the discussion on rural poverty reduction and family farming policies at the national and international levels.</i></p> <p>These objectives are expected to be achieved mainly through non-reimbursable contributions from IFAD and its partners.</p> <p>The activities to be implemented are currently under design:</p> <p>Concerning PD, they will mainly include: i) building an agenda with the Federal Government on the main issues identified by the Ministry of Agrarian Development, ii) carrying out a comparative study on the family agriculture and public policy oriented to this sector in five middle-income countries (MICs) (India, China, Mexico, South Africa and Brazil), iii) on the basis of the previous study, fostering the debate and dialogue so as to strengthen and feed back the design of public policies oriented to support family agriculture in Brazil.</p> <p>Concerning KM, the main activities will include: i) fostering networking and knowledge sharing among organizations linked to the development of the north-eastern semi-arid region, especially to strengthen the links between research and extension, ii) systemization of experience related to designing, implementing and articulating the development of public policies and programmes in the semi-arid region.</p>
Brazil	CPE	3	CTRY	STRA	KM	IFAD can and should become an important partner for knowledge management on rural poverty reduction	<i>The COSOP's Strategic Objective 3 includes: (i) supporting the dissemination and exchange of information and, with</i>

Country	Eval	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD follow-up
						<p>issues in Brazil. More systematic efforts and greater funds need to be allocated to documenting project experiences and sharing them among key actors involved in supporting the IFAD-funded programme in Brazil.</p> <p>In this regard, IFAD can facilitate the collaboration and knowledge sharing between Brazil and Africa, in the Lusophone, and also other countries.</p> <p>Furthermore, the FIDAMERICA network's coverage should be expanded in the Brazil country programme, and periodic exchange visits between project staff, government officials and other partners from Brazil to other countries with IFAD operations should be organized.</p>	<p><i>the participation of state governments, academic institutes and civil society organizations, setting up discussion and knowledge-sharing networks for the purpose of sharing successful experiences and technologies for development in the semi-arid north-east; (ii) support for the monitoring of climate change in the north-east and in disseminating adaptation measures; (iii) partnerships with relevant institutions dealing with science, technology and innovations for the semi-arid areas; and (iv) strengthened capacity to learn from experience under IFAD projects. Special attention will be paid to ensuring that M&E systems work effectively and efficiently.</i></p> <p><i>The conceptual basis of this SO is that, rather than a problem, the semi-arid north-east should be viewed as a region with its own identity, with irregular rainfall patterns, varied and complex ecosystems, rich human and natural resources, and specific growth potential.</i></p> <p>The Strategic objective 4 includes <i>national-level activities, which will be undertaken with the Ministry of Agrarian Development as privileged partner and include other Federal Government entities, universities and research institutions, national unions representative of the rural population, NGOs and donor agencies (areas of discussion are indicated below under "policy linkages")</i>.</p> <p><i>The international level will have three aspects: i) continued engagement of the Fund in discussions on policy options for family farmers in MERCOSUR countries, through REAF; ii) IFAD support to expand Brazil's South-South cooperation programme, particularly in Africa, through its projects in the Latin America and the Caribbean region and, iii) policy dialogue on family agriculture in the MICs (see above). Besides what has been mentioned above, IFAD investment projects will develop networking and knowledge sharing among them and other organizations linked to the development of the north-eastern semi-arid region.</i></p> <p>As the IFAD-funded project Dom Helder Camara (DHC) will conclude its operations in 2009, both IFAD and project staff will undertake completion and systematization exercises in 2009 and 2010 so as to analyse and record project experience and achievements.</p> <p>The same project already carried out an exchange visit in Capo Verde in 2008. In collaboration with the country programme manager (CPM) for South Africa, the CPM in charge of REAF in PL also organized a visit from South Africa government's representatives to DHC project and REAF meetings in November 2008.</p>

Country	Eval	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD follow-up
Brazil	CPE	4	CTRY	STRA	RME	IFAD could provide valuable support to strengthening Brazil's monitoring and evaluation capacity by, <i>inter-alia</i> , promoting a more active involvement of PREVAL in the country.	As mentioned above, collaboration with PREVAL will be fostered under the strategic objective 4. PREVAL is already supporting "Gente de Valor Project" in Bahia on the Results and Impact Management System issue.
Recommendation: Partnerships to support the IFAD country programme							
Brazil	CPE	5	CTRY	STRA	PAR	It is important for IFAD to intensify its collaboration with the federal and state governments, with national and state research and knowledge institutions (e.g., EMBRAPA), and with civil society organizations. Additional efforts should be devoted to expanding IFAD's outreach to states, municipalities and other actors involved in its activities. Opportunities for direct lending to state governments, in consultation with relevant federal agencies, should be explored.	The projects currently under design in the States of Piauí and Paraíba, which will be implemented by State governments, will support the collaboration among the relevant federal research enterprise, Paraíba's state research enterprise, the state extension enterprise) and other service providers. As part of COSOP orientations, the Federal Government and IFAD agreed to lend to state governments, as is the case for the projects currently under design in the states of Piauí and Paraíba.
Brazil	CPE	6	CTRY	STRA	DIA	At the same time, the Fund must devote sufficient attention to maintaining close dialogue and communication with the federal government on strategic directions, policy issues and all aspects of the Fund's relations with the country.	The Federal Government fully endorsed the new COSOP, which represents a shared vision of IFAD's contribution to rural development in Brazil. In this framework, it has also been agreed that IFAD and the Federal Government would carry out every year a "joint portfolio review and analysis". PL is building a strong dialogue with SEAIN (Secretariat of International Affairs [Ministry of Planning, Budget and Management, federal Government of Brazil] the Brazilian Federal counterpart) to provide strategic guidance to the Fund for programme orientations. (Also refer to policy dialogue with the Federal Government previously mentioned.)
Brazil	CPE	7	CTRY	STRA	PAR	Finally, IFAD should enhance partnerships with multi-lateral and bi-lateral agencies.	IFAD foresees strengthening relations with the multilateral and bilateral agencies. While designing the investment projects in Piauí and Paraíba, a strong collaboration with the World Bank has been sought to promote synergies and avoid overlapping.
Recommendation: Expand geographical focus and targeting options							
Brazil	CPE	8	CTRY	STRA	TGT	In addition to focusing on the North-east, the Fund should consider the possibility of expanding its geographic outreach to cover the rural poor living in the Northern areas of the country, which also show high levels of poverty. IFAD should seek ways and means to support indigenous peoples in the Amazon in consultation with governmental agencies for indigenous peoples, such as the National Foundation for Indians (FUNAI). For this purpose, the Latin America division might also consider mobilizing resources from the indigenous people grant facility available at IFAD.	After a broad consultation process in which the Federal Government, State Governments and other institutions participated, it was agreed during COSOP preparation to maintain the geographical focus in the north-east, although the possibility to explore other opportunities in the Amazonian states is still open.
Recommendation: Redefine priority areas of operations							

Country	Eval	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD follow-up
Brazil	CPE	9	CTRY	STRA	PRM	IFAD should continue working in the provision of support services for small farmers, such as financial services, technical assistance and applied research. A key new priority area should be further cooperation in the enhancement of market linkages, including access to markets, market infrastructure and market information. For this purpose, greater partnership with the private sector should be sought.	<p>COSOP's objectives 1 and 2, which take into account these recommendations and back up the next operations design, are the following: <i>Strategic objective 1: To increase commercial agricultural production by small farmers, with corresponding access to markets under rewarding and sustainable conditions. This will call for improving productive infrastructure, equipment and support services (especially technical assistance); strengthening farmer organizations; promoting and supporting productive alliances; and providing incentives to small farmers to intensify production and introduce innovations suitable to semi-arid conditions and a climate change context.</i></p> <p><i>Emphasis on increasing commercial production does not mean that IFAD should not be involved in improving production for self-consumption and food security. It does indicate, however, that the main priority for this new cycle should be on commercial rather than subsistence production. Regarding commercial agriculture, the crisis in food prices has to be taken into account, both as a risk for the poor and as an opportunity for small commercial farmers.</i></p> <p><i>Strategic objective 2: To improve access by the rural poor to off-farm employment and business activities in rural areas and villages, focusing on women and young people. This objective, oriented to both individuals and groups, will call for: (i) seeking local opportunities to develop business enterprises for the rural poor; (ii) investments in developing the entrepreneurial culture and managerial capacity at the individual and community levels; (iii) identification of employment opportunities and of the technical qualifications/skills that are sought after on local markets; and (iv) development of special skills training programmes aimed at IFAD's target population.</i></p> <p><i>A territorial approach to rural development should help in identifying such opportunities and in programming the investments needed to expand off-farm employment opportunities. These strategic objectives fully back up the design of the Piauí and Paraíba projects.</i></p>
Brazil	CPE	10	CTRY	STRA	PRM	The overall enhancement of access to markets should gain prominence in the new COSOP.	Refer to previous comment and COSOP's Strategic Objectives 1 and 2.
Brazil	CPE	11	CTRY	STRA	STRA	The Fund should not engage directly in enabling access to land.	This recommendation has been agreed, no further operations will contemplate this issue.
Brazil	CPE	12	CTRY	STR	RFI	IFAD should pay deeper emphasis to strengthening of rural financial services at the grassroots level. Through loans, IFAD could cooperate in creating or strengthening microfinance entities capable of providing a variety of financial services, including savings and	Brazil has important partners in the broad rural finance sector with large amounts of resources (the National Family Agriculture Support Programme and others). In this situation, IFAD's direct involvement in the provision of financial services is not a priority.

Country	Eval	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD follow-up
						non-agricultural loans. In addition, there are good opportunities to expand outreach to the rural poor through retail partnerships.	
Recommendation: IFAD's operating model							
Brazil	CPE	13	REG	STRA	FLD	The Latin America and Caribbean Division should explore the possibility of enhancing its country presence in Brazil. The options for using Brazil as a sub-regional office covering the MERCOSUR countries (and others) should also be explored.	As stated and agreed in the COSOP, a country office will be set up and a country officer based in Brazil will be hired to work on COSOP management with the CPM. The Fund and the Government are currently agreeing on arrangements for this office.
Brazil	CPE	14	CTRY	STRA	SUP	It is recommended to initiate the necessary dialogue and actions to bring under direct supervision and implementation support the last two projects approved in Brazil, as well as new projects funded in Brazil.	The on-going projects are under direct supervision and all new projects will be directly supervised by the Fund.
Brazil	CPE	15	IFAD	STRA	STRA	It is important for IFAD to increase (within the overall framework of the PBAS) the level of resource allocated to Brazil and to increase attention and resources to non-project activities.	The PBAS amount depends on corporate decisions. Activities to be implemented under strategic objectives 3 and 4 (KM and PD) are expected to be financed through non-reimbursable contributions from IFAD and its partners.