

Distribution: Restricted  
Original: English

EC 2005/40/W.P.4  
Agenda Item 5

10 August 2005  
English

---

a

**IFAD**  
**INTERNATIONAL FUND FOR AGRICULTURAL DEVELOPMENT**  
**Evaluation Committee – Fortieth Session**  
Rome, 2 September 2005

**PRESIDENT’S REPORT ON THE IMPLEMENTATION STATUS OF EVALUATION  
RECOMMENDATIONS AND MANAGEMENT ACTIONS**



**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

<b>ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS</b>	<b>iii</b>
<b>I. INTRODUCTION</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>II. EVALUATIONS UNDERTAKEN IN 2003</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>III. METHODOLOGY</b>	<b>2</b>
<b>IV. NATURE OF EVALUATION RECOMMENDATIONS</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>V. THEMATIC REVIEW</b>	<b>4</b>
<b>VI. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS</b>	<b>8</b>
<b>ANNEXES</b>	
<b>I. OFFICE OF EVALUATION RESPONSE</b>	<b>11</b>
<b>II. EVALUATIONS UNDERTAKEN IN 2003</b>	<b>16</b>
<b>III. CATEGORIES USED TO ANALYSE THE ACP RECOMMENDATIONS</b>	<b>17</b>
<b>IV. ISSUES BY TYPE OF EVALUATION</b>	<b>19</b>
<b>V. EVALUATIONS BY ISSUE</b>	<b>20</b>
<b>VI. ACP RECOMMENDATIONS AND PMD FOLLOW-UP ACTIONS</b>	<b>21</b>



## ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS

ACP	agreement at completion point
CE	completion evaluation
CLE	corporate-level evaluation
COSOP	country strategic opportunities paper
CPE	country programme evaluation
ELWDP	Eastern Lowlands Wadi Development Project (Eritrea)
IE	interim evaluation
M&E	monitoring and evaluation
OE	Office of Evaluation
PA	Western and Central Africa Division (IFAD)
PAGER	Income-Generating Activities Project (Benin)
PF	Eastern and Southern Africa Division (IFAD)
PI	Asia and the Pacific Division (IFAD)
PL	Latin America and the Caribbean Division (IFAD)
PMD	Programme Management Department (IFAD)
PN	Near East and North Africa Division (IFAD)
PRISMA	Implementation Status of Evaluation Recommendations and Management Actions
Prodepine	Development Project for Indigenous and Afro-Ecuadorian Peoples (Ecuador)
Progavião	Community Development Project for the Rio Gavião Region (Brazil)
Prosalafa	Support Project for Small Producers in the Semi-Arid Zones of Falcon and Lara States (Venezuela)
PRSP	Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper
RIMS	results and impact management system
RTIP	Root and Tuber Improvement Programme (Ghana)
TE	thematic evaluation



## I. INTRODUCTION

1. At its Seventy-Eighth Session in April 2003, the Executive Board approved the IFAD Evaluation Policy (EB 2003/78/R.17/Rev.1). This policy stipulates that the President will submit to the Board an annual report on the status of the adoption and implementation of evaluation recommendations and that the Office of Evaluation (OE) will provide the Board with its independent comments on this report, including an inventory of recommendations not found feasible by the users and, hence, not implemented.

2. In line with the above requirements, this is the President's second report to the Executive Board on the implementation status of evaluation recommendations and management actions (**P**resident's **R**eport on the **I**mplementation **S**tatus of Evaluation Recommendations and **M**anagement **A**ctions – PRISMA). It covers the implementation status of evaluations carried out in 2003 that formed the basis of OE's Annual Report on Results and Impact of IFAD Operations Evaluated in 2003 (EB 2004/82/R.6). The objective of the PRISMA report is to provide the Executive Board with information on the follow-up actions taken in response to the recommendations made, thus providing a basis on which to measure the accountability of the Fund and to demonstrate the Fund's commitment to learning and improvement through self-assessment. It also serves to provide management with the opportunity to offer recommendations so as to improve the processes associated with evaluation.

3. This report also takes into consideration comments made by the Evaluation Committee on the 2004 report. In particular, it provides a greater synthesis of the ways in which the recommendations of the evaluations have been infused into IFAD business processes and are considered in the elaboration of policies, strategies and follow-up actions.

## II. EVALUATIONS UNDERTAKEN IN 2003

4. This report covers the 17 evaluations undertaken in 2003, comprising eight interim evaluations (IEs),<sup>1</sup> two project completion evaluations (CEs), four country programme evaluations (CPEs), two thematic evaluations (TEs) and one corporate-level evaluation (CLE). The table provides a breakdown of the evaluation by regional division, and further details are provided in Annex II..

**TABLE 1: EVALUATIONS BY REGIONAL DIVISION**

<b>Regional Division</b>	<b>IE</b>	<b>CE</b>	<b>CPE</b>	<b>TE</b>	<b>CLE</b>	<b>Total</b>
Western and Central Africa (PA)	4		2			6
Eastern and Southern Africa (PF)		1				1
Asia and the Pacific (PI)	1		1	1		3
Latin America and the Caribbean (PL)	3		1	1		5
Near East and North Africa (PN)		1				1
<b>IFAD Total</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>17</b>

5. All five of IFAD's regional divisions are covered by the evaluations in 2003; however, the coverage is uneven. Projects in Western and Central Africa accounted for four of the project evaluations (IE or CE) and two of the four CPEs, while three projects in Latin America and the Caribbean were evaluated, and only one project in three divisions was evaluated (Eastern and Southern Africa, Asia and the Pacific, and Near East and North Africa). Following the completion of the evaluation in Lebanon, the country has indicated that it will look to IFAD for technical assistance in formulating projects, but is not likely to borrow from IFAD in the foreseeable future. The four CPEs were carried out to allow for the timely inclusion of the recommendations of the evaluation in

<sup>1</sup> IEs are mandatory before a second phase of a project is undertaken. Regional divisions request that OE undertake an IE in time to contribute to the design of a second phase. Other evaluations are proposed by regional divisions, with final selection by OE.

the elaboration of the next country strategic opportunities paper (COSOP). One of the projects covered by an IE was also included in a CPE (Benin). Innovation was a primary theme in both of the TEs.

6. The IEs and CEs carried out in 2003 were generally for “older” projects; Board approval of these projects ranged from 1987 to 1997. On average, the span from the date of Board approval to the completion date was 8.5 years, an implementation period that is longer than the IFAD-wide average of 7.5 years for projects completed by the end of 2003.<sup>2</sup> In view of the age of these projects, some of the recommendations or findings have been superseded by policies put in place by IFAD subsequent to the original project design.

### III. METHODOLOGY

7. The evaluation process is an essential element within the development learning loop. It provides an opportunity to seek the views and agreement of a variety of stakeholders and to improve the implementation of ongoing projects and the design of future interventions. The evaluation process is designed to facilitate the transformation of this learning into concrete action, i.e. agreements at completion point (ACPs). According to the evaluation policy, “The two objectives of the ACP are to: (i) clarify and deepen the understanding of evaluation recommendations, document those that are found acceptable and feasible and those that are not, make the former more operational, and eventually generate a response by the stakeholders on how they intend to act upon them within the framework of an action plan that assigns responsibilities and deadlines; and (ii) flag evaluation insights and learning hypotheses for further future discussions and debate”.

8. In an effort to be as inclusive as possible, the number of participants in some of the ACP workshops has reached more than 100. The large number of participants ensures that a wide cross section of stakeholders are aware of the evaluation findings. It may, however, result in a larger number of operationally focused agreements that make relatively greater contributions to the local context and, consequently, less to learning and policy development.

9. Working closely with OE, the Programme Management Department (PMD) started the reporting process by compiling a comprehensive set of ACP recommendations.<sup>3</sup> The regional divisions were then requested to indicate the follow-up actions taken for evaluations carried out for the respective divisions. These responses were provided to OE for its assessment of the extent to which the evaluations had been implemented. The results of the OE assessment form an integral part of this report and are contained in Annex I.

10. In order to analyse the implications of the evaluations, the recommendations from each evaluation were reviewed and classified by PMD, first in terms of the entity or the level to which each recommendation was directed (i.e. IFAD, the country, or the project), then according to the nature or implication of the recommendation (policy, strategy, operational) and finally with regard to the main theme or issue addressed by the recommendation.<sup>4</sup> A recommendation was considered to address “policy” issues if it was related to the elaboration of the principles guiding the future direction of the Fund; to “strategy” if the recommendation suggested a course of action; and to “operational” if it proposed a specific action or response.

11. This document is confined to reporting on the ACP recommendations; it does not attempt to address the findings of the individual evaluations or OE’s Annual Report on the Results and Impact of IFAD Operations.

---

<sup>2</sup> See the Progress Report on the Portfolio, EB 2004/81/R.25.

<sup>3</sup> Annex VI sets out the ACP recommendations, by evaluation, along with the PMD follow-up response.

<sup>4</sup> See Annex III for a list of these categories.



#### IV. NATURE OF EVALUATION RECOMMENDATIONS

12. As shown in Table 2 below, some three quarters of the recommendations were operational in nature, while slightly more than 20% can be considered strategic, and less than 2% deal with policy formulation. Recommendations made for IEs and CEs were, quite as expected, mostly operational in nature. Almost half of the recommendations made for CPEs, on the other hand, were strategic. The recommendations for the two TEs were also more operational rather than strategy or policy oriented. On average, about 16 recommendations were made for each evaluation.

**TABLE 2: RECOMMENDATIONS BY TYPE OF EVALUATION AND LEVEL OF RECOMMENDATION**

	IE	CE	CPE	TE	CLE	Total	%
Number of evaluations	8	2	4	2	1	17	
Number of recommendations	131	23	90	24	10	278	100
Policy	2	2	1		1	6	2
Strategy	6		42	8	3	59	21
Operational	123	21	47	16	6	213	77
Average per evaluation	16	11	22	12	10	16	

#### Policy

13. The recommendations made on private sector involvement in the 2003 evaluations were reflected in the recently approved policy on the private sector.<sup>5</sup> The issue of targeting (see below) was raised in a number of evaluations, and issues related to post-crisis situations in two of the evaluations; both are the subject of forthcoming policy position papers. The ACP recommendations have been addressed in these papers. However, it should be noted that the evaluation recommendation were generic and contributed relatively less to the cogitative process in the development of the policy papers. In other cases, notably with respect to gender and rural financial services,<sup>6</sup> the evaluation recommendations were generally more operational and are already embodied in current IFAD policy documents, thus serving the important purpose of validating those policies.

14. The two TEs were both concerned with innovation. While the evaluation on local knowledge systems and innovation in Asia pointed to the “need for [an] explicit policy and strategy statement” on innovation, the evaluation on innovative approaches in Peru was more strategic in nature (i.e. methodologies and tools).

#### Strategy

15. As noted in last year’s PRISMA report,<sup>7</sup> most of the strategic recommendations were found in CPEs. In the case of Senegal, where a COSOP was recently approved, the recommendations provided the strategic direction for the preparation of the COSOP both in terms of focus and substance. Similarly, it was agreed that highly participatory processes would be used for the definition of COSOPs in Benin, Indonesia and Tunisia; recommendations which have been fully internalized for upcoming COSOPs. Other strategies highlighted by ACP recommendations include those with respect to improving targeting (Senegal and Tunisia), promoting partnership (Benin, Indonesia, Senegal and Tunisia), and increasing participation and ownership by beneficiaries (Benin, Tunisia and innovation in Asia). These recommendations have already been reflected in the preparation of COSOPs or project interventions.

16. The elaboration of IFAD’s new operating model will address many of the cross-cutting strategic recommendations, including the recommendation on the need for more integrated and coherent country programmes and greater country presence. For a number of years, IFAD has adopted

<sup>5</sup> See IFAD’s Private Sector Development and Partnership Strategy, EB 2005/84/R.4/Rev.1.

<sup>6</sup> See, for example, recommendation 4 of the Lebanon CE.

<sup>7</sup> Report of the President on the Status of the Implementation of Evaluation Recommendations, EB 2004/82/R.8.

the evaluation recommendation that the COSOP “should be squarely framed within the poverty reduction strategy paper”<sup>8</sup> and that national strategies for poverty reduction, including Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers (PRSPs), should be taken into account in the design of new interventions. Thus, IFAD is fully engaged in the harmonization process.

17. Other themes, strategic in nature, covered by the evaluations have included the private sector, gender, natural resource management, exit strategies and rural financial services. The recommendations on these themes are largely specific to a single project. They form an important input into the design of second phase projects or have been implemented in the closing years of ongoing projects.

### **Operational**

18. As noted above, most of the evaluation recommendations can be classified as operational. As expected, close to 60% of these recommendations were contained in IEs. These recommendations proposed actions to improve performance during the remaining implementation period and, more importantly for second phase projects, foster “on the ground” learning. This type of learning reveals needed mid-course corrections and contributes to better projects. Almost all of these recommendations have already been implemented or will be implemented in the near future as part of the implementation of the project(s) under review, in the course of the preparation of the next phase of a project, or in the elaboration of upcoming COSOPs. Recommendations stemming from the thematic and CLEs will take longer to implement fully.

19. It is noteworthy that most recommendations made within the context of CEs were also operational in nature. The ACP recommendations have a wider application when the focus is on learning rather than implementation issues. From this perspective, the learning from the CEs could have been more strategic and policy oriented.

20. A number of operational recommendations were part of the CLE on supervision. These will be assessed during the elaboration of IFAD’s future policy on supervision, including the need to revise cooperation agreements and letters of appointment, as well as minimum supervision requirements.

## **V. THEMATIC REVIEW**

21. As noted earlier, the ACP recommendations in each of the evaluations were classified according to theme. Annex IV sets out the number of recommendations by theme for each type of evaluation, while Annex V shows the number of recommendations by theme and evaluation. For the most significant themes, this section highlights approaches that the Fund has taken or will take in response to the recommendations.

### **Targeting and Gender**

22. Seventeen recommendations were related to targeting (including project area), and eight were directed towards gender. Many of the issues raised vis-à-vis targeting are addressed in the forthcoming policy position paper on targeting, particularly the call for better poverty analysis that can form the basis for the project’s targeting strategy, an exercise that should be repeated iteratively during the project. The ACP recommendations noted that better geographic targeting is required, especially in view of IFAD’s limited resources and the importance of designing interventions that address the needs of poorer populations and resource poor communities.

23. IFAD recognizes the need for better geographic focus and selectivity so as to ensure the implementation of a critical mass of activities that will generate impact, but, at the same time, the Fund recognizes that certain target groups may be more geographically dispersed. A more holistic

---

<sup>8</sup> Senegal CPE, recommendation 18.

approach to country planning will support efforts to leverage the synergies and effectiveness of individual loan or grant financed interventions.

24. IFAD's comprehensive approach to targeting requires an accurate identification of the target group and the requirements of the target group and the subsequent differentiation of strategic approaches that respond to the interests of the target group and that are feasible. While it is primarily focused on the poorer segments of the population, it does not exclude linkages with other actors. No one targeting approach is suitable in all cases. The assessments contained in the annual reports on results and impact and in evaluations have served to reinforce and complement recommendations emerging from other sources, including the Initiative for Mainstreaming Innovation pilot project, on targeting under demand-driven approaches, portfolio performance reviews, mid-term reviews and internal reviews (e.g. the Technical Review Committee and the Operational Strategy and Policy Guidance Committee).

25. One ACP recommendation concerning gender suggests that "specific measures with regard to gender issues should be . . . incorporated into the next phase" (Benin IE 9), while another notes that the "next COSOP should . . . present approaches to the promotion of women that consider the difficulties they face" (Benin CPE 9). The gender plan of action, approved by the Executive Board in 2003,<sup>9</sup> including the prerequisites of gender-sensitive design, provides the policy framework and tools in relation to gender mainstreaming in IFAD projects. These are supported by memory checks for project designers and checklists used during the review to ensure that gender issues are adequately addressed. Regionally focused programmes, notably the Regional Programme to Consolidate Gender-Mainstreaming Strategies in IFAD-Financed Projects of Latin America and the Caribbean (PROGENDER), provide support for dealing with gender issues during the implementation of projects. Specific actions have been taken to address the operational recommendations.

### **Beneficiary Participation and Organizations of the Poor**

26. Most recommendations on the participation of primary stakeholders, the group benefiting from IFAD's assistance, focus on the participation of these stakeholders in the design stage as "dialogue partners". Another subset recommends their participation in identifying technologies relevant to them, and still other recommendations focus on legitimizing innovations by seeking the participation of beneficiaries. Recommendations have also been made with respect to adapting the participation rate of farmers (e.g. in the contribution to community infrastructure) to the capacity of the farmers and in a harmonized manner across national programmes and projects.

27. Because most IFAD-assisted projects tend to involve some grass-roots institution building, a fairly large number of recommendations have been made in this area. These recommendations include adopting a "collective or group approach", promoting social capital, extending support to farmer organizations, strengthening community organizations, strengthening cooperatives, employing self-help groups as the basic social foundation in organizing other groups such as user groups, and clearly defining the role of community organizations vis-à-vis professional or economic interest groups.

28. Since the strengthened capacity of the rural poor and their organizations is one of the three objectives of IFAD under the current strategic framework, enhancing beneficiary participation in decision-making and assisting beneficiaries in strengthening their organizations is accorded very high priority. Overall, IFAD-assisted projects allocate a significant proportion of resources to grass-roots institution building, and most of them embody the principle that initiatives should be community driven. Beneficiary involvement is also being sought in the identification of target groups and the expectations of target groups (e.g. the Tunisia CPE). Many projects embrace articulated participatory planning and management processes involving beneficiaries, as demonstrated in the detailed responses in Annex VI. Such grass-roots initiatives are being strengthened by forging partnerships

---

<sup>9</sup> Progress Report on the Project Portfolio, EB 2003/78/R.16.

with farmer organizations and IFAD headquarters and engaging these organizations within policy forums.

### **Local Capacity Building, including Training**

29. Of the 13 recommendations related to local capacity building, most are operational in nature, e.g. recommending a study of the comparative advantages and costs of farmer field schools versus normal extension, suggesting subjects to be included in the curricula of training programmes, or proposing methodologies to be employed by trainers. These types of recommendations will be addressed by project implementers or by design teams. One key issue raised in the recommendations is the need to use the control over project funds to promote capacity building. It is further suggested that “project funds . . . be directly released to community-based organizations for implementing development work”. Demand-driven approaches that aim to empower beneficiary communities both in terms of decision-making and the responsibility for funds are featured in many country programmes. A recent project in Ecuador and other projects elsewhere use a demand-driven development approach whereby beneficiaries identify, formulate, contract for, implement and monitor subprojects funded through the IFAD project. In addition, the revised procurement guidelines make provision for activities for which procurement occurs through communities.

### **Knowledge Management and Innovation**

30. Recommendations on knowledge management within the cohort of projects evaluated in 2003 focus on defining an innovation strategy within country strategies and in projects, on using local knowledge to promote pro-poor changes, and on establishing processes to facilitate reliance on or building of local knowledge. The fact that some project designs are silent on the knowledge component was identified as one of the conclusions of the TE. Both of the TEs were related to innovation. Interestingly, the recommendations of these TEs focused much more on managing participatory processes than on innovation per se. The recommendations of other evaluations suggested as follows: (a) “determine whether current management practices provide a suitable framework for managing flexibility, innovation and risks”; and (b) “clearly define innovation objectives in the next country strategy”.

31. Overall, the realization that the Fund needs to put more emphasis not only on scouting out innovations, but also on validating and facilitating the dissemination of innovations has increased in recent years. Consequently, the innovation objective is being explicitly mentioned in the regional strategy, as well as in country strategies. In the case of country strategies, potential innovative elements have been identified, and replication and scaling-up are being considered. The issue of the inclusion of innovation in the development of IFAD country strategies will be incorporated when the COSOP framework is revised as part of the new operating model. In addition, regional projects have been funded to encourage the promotion and utilization of knowledge and innovation, such as in the Hindu Kush Himalayan region in Asia. The use of regional networks in facilitating knowledge sharing has been particularly successful in Latin America. As shown by the evaluation undertaken in Peru, major innovations have been introduced in an ongoing and consistent basis in that country with satisfactory results.

32. Knowledge management continues to be identified in the Fund as an area that needs to be accorded high priority. In light of this, a knowledge management strategy will be developed as part of the new operating model. Evaluation recommendations, particularly those pertaining to policy actions, will be utilized in developing the knowledge management strategy. Among other processes, the portfolio review process was reoriented in 2004 towards the identification of “emerging lessons”, and this will be emphasized in future. In 2005, the project completion process will be revised to refocus it mainly on learning and the dissemination of lessons.

### **Credit and Rural Financial Services**

33. In the area of credit and rural financial services, the evaluations highlight that the capacity of borrowers and institutions needs to be taken into account in the design of credit programmes; this important point is contained in IFAD's policy on rural finance. The evaluations also note the need to support umbrella structures to enhance the sustainability of microfinance institutions and village savings associations. Participation by IFAD in the elaboration of a national rural finance action plan (Burkina Faso) was also recommended. To the extent possible, these recommendations have been implemented or are planned for implementation.

34. Certain of the evaluation recommendations are devoted to project-specific implementation issues, such as the repayment of credits or the disposition of unutilized funds for credit, that have been addressed by the projects concerned. In other instances, the recommendations have focused on past design practices such as avoiding subsidized or supervised credit schemes.

35. The approach to credit and rural financial services has undergone a transformation since these projects were designed, and, in response, IFAD has put in place policies<sup>10</sup> and other tools to guide the development and implementation of rural financial service interventions. As in the case of targeting, the evaluations have served to validate current IFAD policies and approaches on rural financial services. The rural finance policy addresses many of the concerns raised in the ACPs, including building sustainable rural finance institutions, encouraging active stakeholder participation, creating diversified financial infrastructures and helping to create a regulatory and policy environment conducive to rural finance activities. The policy is complemented by decision tools developed in 2002 that provide operational guidance on key rural finance issues and that, in some cases, are flagged in the ACPs.

### **Monitoring and Evaluation**

36. Effective monitoring and evaluation (M&E) systems are an important consideration for the evaluators, and the improvement of these systems has become a high priority for the Fund. Of the close to 20 recommendations on M&E, all were operational and focused on the definition of indicators, streamlining data collection and the importance of analysis. The role of M&E in the improvement of project performance is embodied in a number of the recommendations. Most of these recommendations have already been implemented in the projects or are proposed in the design of future projects. It is anticipated that the implementation of results and impact management systems (RIMSs) that had not been designed at the time of the evaluations will strengthen project M&E. The process of mainstreaming RIMSs will allow IFAD to apply these recommendations in other projects.

### **Partnerships and Stakeholders**

37. The importance that IFAD attaches to in-country partnerships and closer dialogue with all stakeholders is evident in recent initiatives to promote field presence and in IFAD's greater involvement in in-country forums, including those related to poverty reduction strategies. Of the more than 20 recommendations focusing on partnership and stakeholders, most are being implemented. The organization of round-table discussions has been undertaken, and participation in thematic forums are planned. In the case of a cofinancing partnership, the evaluation pointed to the need to ensure that the government is part of the partnership arrangements; in one case, government exclusion from the memorandum of understanding contributed to the poor performance of a non-IFAD implemented component. Current practice is to ensure government "legal" participation in any such arrangements. Although the evaluation recommendations did not specifically refer to participation in sector-wide approaches, the recently approved policy paper indicates IFAD's commitment to more partnerships in the design and implementation of country programmes. Partnerships and greater stakeholder involvement are central features of the new operating model; less project specific and more strategic approaches to partnership will therefore be part of future country programmes.

---

<sup>10</sup> Policy approved in May 2000, EB 2000/69/R.12.

## Supervision

38. Most of the recommendations related to supervision are found in the CLE of supervision. The recommendations from this evaluation have made a useful contribution to the action plan for the management's response to the Independent External Evaluation and the definition of the new operating model. Recommendations with regard to the revision of minimum supervision requirements and cooperation agreements will be taken up once the overall strategy for supervision is approved. Other recommendations highlight the importance of coordination among in-country supervising entities, knowledge sharing and the need for better planning in the supervision process. In order to improve coordination and increase knowledge sharing, country programme managers and regional divisions routinely participate in supervision missions. In terms of planning and improving the **qualitative** aspects of supervision, the evaluation recommendations present a challenge given the current constraints to project supervision.

## Advice on Design and Implementation

39. Quite a large number of recommendations (almost 70) are classified as design or implementation advice. This category covers a broad array of recommendations, ranging from the conduct of studies (featured in many of these recommendations), to extensions of the implementation period, to the disposition of project assets. These recommendations are focused largely on actions that need to be carried out by the project coordination units and often have budgetary or staffing implications that cannot be easily resolved, in particular if the project is at the late stage of implementation. These recommendations also tend to be closer to the type that would be expected in the case of supervision recommendations.

## VI. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

40. The evaluation exercises undertaken in 2003 address a range of operational, as well as policy and strategic issues. The recommendations made through the IEs have contributed in the design of Phase II projects. Suggestions regarding wider stakeholder participation during design processes have also been implemented in a broad range of projects. A number of the recommendations provide insights to and suggest avenues for policy dialogue with governments and other stakeholders, but particularly governments. The fact that these issues were raised during the ACP process should make it easier to follow up with governments.

41. It is also being increasingly realized that the involvement of a wide range of in-country stakeholders during the ACP process ensures broad agreement, though the result may be recommendations that are more operational and contextual. Thus, these recommendations are more useful from the point of view of the national stakeholders, but sometimes relatively less so from the IFAD perspectives of cross-cutting and thematic learning. Overall, there is a need to work more towards achieving the second objective to "flag evaluation insights and learning hypothesis for further future discussions and debate".<sup>11</sup> In general, IFAD would benefit from a greater focus on processes rather than events or activities so that learning can be more readily transferred among country programmes.

42. IFAD management appreciates the insights from the ACP recommendations and is committed to using these recommendations to improve project and corporate performance. The recommendations and the follow-up actions could be improved in a number of areas. To start with, the strengthening of activity planning by OE, PMD and other organizational units, including policy, in the selection of TEs and CLEs, while ensuring the independence of the evaluation exercises, would increase the contribution of evaluation recommendations to learning and policy formulation. Achieving a more effective programming framework would not pose a serious challenge in view of the significantly

---

<sup>11</sup> Document EB 2003/78/R.17/Rev.1.

enhanced level of the collaborative processes that have been instituted together by OE and PMD in recent years.

43. In terms of enhancing the effectiveness of the evaluation recommendations, emphasis needs to be placed upon arriving at a set of recommendations that are fewer in number, but that are more focused and strategic. Similarly, the recommendations on M&E systems would be more useful if the focus was on the internal learning and analysis processes with projects, i.e. on how to use information to improve performance and increase impact. Overall, greater efforts need to be made to provide a broader forum within IFAD for the ACP process so as to ensure that the recommendations are not limited to the development of new projects, but contribute to the overall policy development framework and knowledge creation and utilization.

44. In terms of improving follow-up actions, IFAD management realizes the need to devote greater attention to the crafting of ACPs in order to ensure that there is a common understanding among principal stakeholders, including governments, about the implications of and responsibilities for implementing the recommendations. This means that PMD must also devote more attention in analysing the implications of the ACPs so that the actions required for implementing the recommendation are fully understood, planned and executed.





**OFFICE OF EVALUATION RESPONSE**

1. The purpose of the President's Report on PRISMA is to communicate to the IFAD Executive Board whether the Fund is learning from evaluations and is taking corrective actions and preventive measures to avoid a recurrence of past problems. The President reports on the implementation of the recommendations generated through evaluations undertaken by OE and of the follow-up actions IFAD and its partners have agreed to carry out, thus demonstrating whether critical analysis and learning are actually taken into account in initiatives of the Fund. By implication, the report is to some extent an indication of the effectiveness of OE by illustrating how evaluations have influenced IFAD's policies, strategic directions and operations.
2. This year's report is a considerable improvement over that of last year (EB 2004/82/R.8). The synopsis (rather than a project-by-project account) presented in the report gives a systematic overview of key performance issues in the IFAD portfolio and actions begun in response to evaluation findings and recommendations. As in last year's report preparation, OE and PMD have worked closely on defining the structure of the report. OE would like to commend PMD for its collaborative and receptive attitude in this process.
3. This year's PRISMA report illustrates that IFAD, particularly PMD, introduced changes on a number of fronts and demonstrates that OE is making a valuable contribution to the process of continuous improvement. Annex VI (with detailed information on each project and country programme) illustrates, however, that there are still significant variations across the Fund in absorbing lessons, putting the lessons into action and properly reporting on them. This means that there is a need for a more systematic approach if the Fund is to operate as an effective learning organization.

**I. Comments on Follow-Up Actions Reported by PMD****A. Introduction**

4. In accordance with the evaluation policy (EB 2003/78/R.16/Rev.1), it is the responsibility of the President to ensure that the evaluation recommendations are adopted at the policy, strategic and operational levels and to report to the shareholders on progress in this respect. By presenting the PRISMA report, this requirement is met. A further requirement of the evaluation policy (paragraph 49) is that the "OE will provide to the Board its independent comments on this report, including an inventory of recommendations not found feasible by users, hence not implemented". This Annex constitutes OE's independent comments.
5. In last year's report, it was not possible to report on the recommendations not found feasible and therefore rejected. The ACPs of evaluations conducted during the review period did not contain explicit details on the recommendations that were rejected, nor on the reasons for the rejection. This situation prevailed for ACPs covering the projects and country programmes evaluated in 2003, i.e., largely before the evaluation policy came into effect, and, thus, OE's comments cannot provide a summary of the recommendations that were rejected by ACP partners.
6. Likewise, last year's report suggested that "OE's comments cannot refer to the actual implementation of these recommendations nor to the effectiveness of implementation processes". OE continues to be in this position, as OE has neither the resources (time or staff), nor the mandate to verify all reported actions. However, OE participates in IFAD internal review processes for a number of projects and countries where evaluations have been carried out in order to ascertain whether agreed evaluation recommendations have been incorporated in the design of new projects and COSOPs. In the context of this report, OE's comments focus on reported actions and the extent to which these

demonstrate that IFAD has learned from evaluations and that processes have been put into place for learning and remedial actions.

### B. OE's Perspective on Reported Follow-Up Actions

7. Because of its level of synthesis, the PRISMA report highlights a number of issues, some of which were also identified in OE's annual reports on results and impact, which require systemic responses. This year's PRISMA report provides a sense of the institutional measures taken to address problems at various levels, including: (a) policies; (b) interactions with partners; (c) the issuance of guidelines; and (d) projects. These measures are at varying stages of implementation; some have been implemented, while others have merely been initiated or will be forthcoming.

8. However, the PRISMA report and its role in demonstrating IFAD's capacity to learn and evolve could be strengthened by reporting on the process through which learning takes place at IFAD and by providing concrete examples of changes that have been introduced (at the policy, strategy, and project levels) as a result of acting on the evaluation recommendations. The following paragraphs provide examples of cases in which more information would have been useful in underpinning the reported improvements.

9. **Retrofitting older projects.** Paragraph 6 of the PRISMA report suggests that some of the evaluation recommendations have been overtaken by policies that came into effect after the projects had been approved. A crucial question, as yet unanswered, concerns projects that continue to operate after the adoption of new policies: Have they been reviewed and redesigned to comply with more recent policies? The OE findings suggest such that such retrofitting does not occur systematically. One example is the case of the rural finance policy, which would have required that projects supporting credit lines to be redesigned or closed.

10. **Working in partnership with beneficiaries.** The ACPs included a range of recommendations and agreed actions for improving partnerships (paragraph 37),<sup>1</sup> targeting and gender (paragraphs 22-25), participation and organizations of the poor (paragraph 26-28), and local capacity building (paragraph 29). PRISMA reports on the forthcoming policy position paper about targeting, on an enhanced exchange with farmers associations and on specific projects that have adopted participatory measures. While these initiatives may be the first steps in the right direction, it would have been useful to illustrate, for instance, how participatory approaches in current projects differ from those used in the past and what the forthcoming policy on targeting would actually entail. In addition, more will need to be done to ensure that these initiatives (policies, exchanges with partners and projects) embed a better understanding and clear notions of empowerment, ownership and exit strategies into IFAD's work. The latter is particularly important to ensure the sustainability of the results of IFAD's assistance.

11. **Strategic partnerships with other development actors.** The evaluations and ACPs highlight the need for strategic partnerships, including the search for a proactive role in the process of formulating PRSPs and related coordination fora. The responses of IFAD and, more specifically, PMD to these suggestions have been positive in terms of recognizing the importance of such partnerships, but evaluation findings continue to highlight the need for greater integration into harmonization processes. Field presence, which is often cited as the panacea to improving IFAD's partnerships, will not be effective unless IFAD develops a better understanding of potential partners (beyond government and development agencies and including innovators and local agents of change) and the skills to manage its partnerships.

---

<sup>1</sup> Paragraph numbers refer to the main text of the PRISMA report.

12. **Promoting innovation and knowledge management.** OE appreciates that the PRISMA report highlights the importance of innovation and knowledge management and that it reports on measures taken to ensure innovation is built into regional and country strategies. For projects, it would have been useful if the PRISMA report explained how the design of today's projects differ from older ones in regard to innovation. For instance, the independent external evaluation suggested that IFAD could achieve considerable improvements if innovation were made an essential part of the objective of each project (rather than an additional part) and if mechanisms for scaling-up and replication were built into project design.

13. **M&E systems.** OE acknowledges that IFAD is committed to improving M&E systems in projects and in RIMS. It may be desirable for future PRISMA reports to provide information on how the M&E systems were better integrated into local decision-making processes, as per agreed ACP follow-up actions, so as to ensure that these systems collect meaningful data for use by local decision-makers.

## II. OE Critical Self-Reflection

### A. Introduction

14. In line with professional evaluation standards, OE is fully aware of the need for and committed to improving continuously its own operations and products. In last year's report on the implementation of evaluation recommendations,<sup>2</sup> OE reflected that (a) evaluation recommendations needed to be fewer in number and drafted with a clear sense of priority; (b) a common understanding on these recommendations among evaluators and other partners was needed so as to ensure appropriate follow-up actions; and (c) it was easier to ensure follow-up when evaluations were carried out in preparation for another COSOP or second-phase project, but more difficult in the case of CEs where no immediate follow-up was foreseen. This year's PRISMA report underpins some of these problems.

### B. Response to PMD's Observations

15. PMD's recommendations for improvements in the evaluation process cover similar ground relative to OE in its identification of areas needing improvement – the selection of evaluations, consultations between PMD and OE in the selection and throughout the evaluation process, the focus and the number of evaluation recommendations, and the ACP process – and thus form an additional, useful input into OE's continuous learning process.

16. OE's process for selecting evaluations is primarily geared to the identification of those projects and country programmes where follow-up projects or new COSOPs are planned, corporate level evaluations that are of importance in changing IFAD business processes, or evaluations that respond to the requests of IFAD's governing bodies. Consultations between IFAD management and OE are held regularly during the preparation of OE's work programme and budget. However, in accordance with the evaluation policy, final decisions on the work programme are taken independently by OE.

---

<sup>2</sup> "Report of the President on the Status of Implementation of Evaluation Recommendations", EB 2004/82/R.8, submitted to the Eighty-Second Session of the Executive Board, 8-9 September 2004.

### C. Corrective Actions

17. OE is currently introducing changes at three levels: strategy, partnerships and operations.
18. OE agrees with PMD that OE resources would be better used for generating evaluative information and lessons of a strategic nature through higher plane evaluations, i.e., country programme, thematic and corporate level evaluations (paragraph 19). However, until PMD's self-evaluation system is strengthened to ensure that issues at the operational level are monitored and corrective actions are taken systematically and consistently, project level evaluations will remain indispensable. Initiatives of PMD to improve its self-evaluation system will be welcome and would complement measures OE is introducing, as discussed below.
19. At the **strategic level** of choosing the "unit" of evaluation, OE, while retaining a critical mass of project evaluations in its annual work programme, has consistently moved towards higher plane evaluations that are more appropriate to generating cross-cutting learning applicable across operations. This is in line with trends in the international development community and corresponds to in-house demands for OE to contribute to the generation of cross-cutting knowledge. By contrast, project evaluations, especially CEs, focus on context-specific issues, and thus the learning generated by these evaluations is not easily transferable. Such project level evaluations are, however, still needed for accountability purposes, and accountability remains one of the main objectives of OE.
20. Going a step further, OE is considering the possibility of establishing a three-year strategic framework as part of its planning processes so as to establish specific objectives for OE's contributions to IFAD's learning and accountability and thus form the framework within which a coherent set of evaluations can be planned. The higher plane evaluations that would be selected in such a context would ensure that evaluations would produce systemic and strategic recommendations of wider relevance to IFAD's learning processes. The preparation of such a framework, however, is challenging given the manifold demands for evaluations that OE has already received, especially at the corporate level.
21. At the **level of partnerships**, the ACP practice is the only one of its kind in the international development community. Other development agencies require a response from their management units about the recommendations and follow-up actions that will be taken by the organization itself, but not by its borrowers. By contrast, the ACP process engages IFAD management and its partners in a dialogue to arrive at agreed actions. Experiences gained over the past two years indicate that the process requires some fine tuning in terms of identifying decision-makers and determining the responsibilities and ownership of evaluation recommendations and agreed follow-up actions. A more proactive role of PMD in this process (as indicated in the PRISMA report) would be completely in line with the provisions of the evaluation policy and be welcome by OE, which will be reviewing and revising the process during the course of 2005.
22. At the **operational level**, OE recognizes that the nature and the number of evaluation recommendations need to be kept to a level that is meaningful for follow-up action and implementation. In 2005, OE introduced:
- (a) briefings with evaluation teams so as to provide upfront guidance on the preparation of evaluation recommendations: Evaluations lead to a large number of insights and lessons, which evaluators are eager to translate into learning and specific follow-up actions. These ideas need to be understood in a broader context (e.g., a call for a project-specific reporting system may be appropriate at the project level, but not suitable to harmonization efforts at the country level), prioritized and checked in terms of implementation potential. Evaluation teams are advised to operate in line with these goals;

## ANNEX I

- (b) OE internal quality control in the form of peer reviews that aim to ensure the quality standards of evaluation reports and, in particular, that evaluation recommendations are fewer in number, prioritized and grounded on the findings of the evaluation; and
- (c) a process of revisiting OE's methodologies that will, among other goals, cover the formulation of conclusions and recommendations and integrate changes in the ACP process.

## EVALUATIONS UNDERTAKEN IN 2003

Type	Region	Country	Project	Board Approval	Status of Second-Phase Project	Projects Effective/ Approved <sup>a/</sup>	Number of Agreements
IE	PA	Benin	Income-Generating Activities Project (PAGER)	1995	Appraisal <sup>b/</sup>	1 / 8	10
IE	PA	Burkina Faso	Special Programme for Soil and Water Conservation and Agroforestry in the Central Plateau	1988	Approved 2004	1 / 8	10
IE	PA	Ghana	Root and Tuber Improvement Programme (RTIP)	1997	Appraisal	1 / 12	25
IE	PA	Guinea	Smallholder Development Project in North Lower Guinea	1995	Approved 2004	1 / 11	14
IE	PI	Nepal	Hills Leasehold Forestry and Forage Development Project	1989	Approved 2004	1 / 11	15
IE	PL	Brazil	Community Development Project for the Rio Gavião Region (Progavião)	1995	Inception	1 / 5	20
IE	PL	Ecuador	Development Project for Indigenous and Afro-Ecuadorian Peoples (Prodepine)	1997	Inception	1 / 5	10
IE	PL	Venezuela	Support Project for Small Producers in the Semi-Arid Zones of Falcon and Lara States (Prosalafa)	1991	Approved 2003	1 / 5	27
CE	PF	Eritrea	Eastern Lowlands Wadi Development Project (ELWDP)	1994		1 / 2	15
CE	PN	Lebanon	Smallholder Livestock Rehabilitation Project	1992		1 / 3	8
CPE	PA	Benin				4 / 8	19
CPE	PA	Senegal				6 / 11	33
CPE	PI	Indonesia				3 / 12	29
CPE	PN	Tunisia				4 / 9	9
TE	PI		Promotion of Local Knowledge Systems and Innovations in the Asia and Pacific Region			52 / 162 <sup>c/</sup>	15
TE	PL	Peru	Review of Innovative Approaches in Peru			2 / 7	9
CLE	All		Evaluation of Supervision Modalities in IFAD Supported Projects			225 / 651	10

<sup>a/</sup> Number of effective projects / total approved (as of the end of 2003).

<sup>b/</sup> The CPE superseded the evaluation of PAGER. Based on the evaluation recommendation, a second phase is not being developed; however, a follow-up to PAGER and the Microfinance and Marketing Project is being prepared.

<sup>c/</sup> Eight case studies selected for the evaluation.

## CATEGORIES USED TO ANALYSE THE ACP RECOMMENDATIONS

### Level

IFAD = IFAD corporate  
CTRY = country  
PROJ = project

### Implication

PLCY = policy development implications  
STRAT = strategy development, including COSOP and projects  
OPER = operational and implementation issues

### Theme

ADV = implementation advice  
BENE = beneficiary participation  
CRED = credit  
DECNT = decentralization  
EXIT = exit strategy  
FIELD = field presence  
GNDR = gender  
INNOV = innovation  
KMGMT = knowledge management  
LCLCAP = local capacity building, training  
M&E = monitoring and evaluation, reporting, communication  
NRM = natural resource management  
ORG = organizations of the poor, including groups and collective approaches  
PART = partnerships  
PLCY = policy  
POST = post-crisis  
PRIV = private sector, markets and marketing  
REPL = replicability, catalytic, sustainability of institutions, of project investments  
STAKE = stakeholder  
STRAT = strategy  
SUPER = supervision  
SUST = sustainability  
TRGT = targeting, including target area

### Other acronyms and abbreviations (also see the list at the beginning of the text)

CO = country  
EV = evaluation  
PMU = project management unit  
PDRD = Sustainable Rural Development Programme (Burkina Faso)  
PIDRA = Post-Crisis Programme for Participatory Integrated Development in Rainfed Areas (Indonesia)  
PROMER = Rural Microenterprise Project (Senegal)  
PSAOP = National Agricultural Services and Producer Organizations Programme (Senegal)  
PY = project year  
READ = Rural Empowerment for Agricultural Development Programme in Central Sulawesi (Indonesia)

## ANNEX III

Sierra Sur= Marketing Strengthening and Livelihood Diversification in the  
Southern Highlands Project (Peru)

VFA = village finance association (Nepal)

Note also that country names are abbreviated, i.e. Benin (BJ), Brazil (BR), Burkina Faso (BF), Ecuador (EC), Eritrea (ER), Ghana (GH), Guinea (GN), Indonesia (ID), Lebanon (LB), Nepal (NP), Peru (PE), Senegal (SN), Tunisia (TN) and Venezuela (VE).



ANNEX IV

**ISSUES BY TYPE OF EVALUATION**

Issue	IE	CE	CPE	TE	CLE	Total
ADV	51	7	6	3		67
BENE	1		5	2		8
CRED	9	2	3			14
DECNT	4		2			6
EXIT	3		2			5
FIELD			3			3
GNDR	7	1	1			9
INNOV			3			3
KMGMT	1		2	6	1	10
LCLCAP	10	1		2		13
M&E	9	4	6	2		21
NRM	8		1			9
ORG	9	3	4	5		21
PART	1	2	14			17
PLCY			7	1		8
POST		2				2
PRIV	6	1	4	1		12
REPL	5		2			7
STAKE			7	1		8
SUPER			7		9	16
SUST	2					2
TRGT	5		11	1		17
Total	131	23	90	24	10	278

## EVALUATIONS BY ISSUE

CO	ADV	BENE	CRED	DECNT	EXIT	FIELD	GNDR	INNOV	KMGMT	LCLCAP	M&E	NRM	ORG	PART	PLCY	POST	PRIV	REPL	STAKE	SUPER	SUST	TRGT	Total	
BF	2		4		2				1			1												10
BJ	7	2	2	1		1	2	1			1		2	2	1						2		5	29
BR	10		1	3			1			1		1	2					1						20
EC	2						1			1	2		3					1						10
ER	7									1	2		2	2		1								15
GH	13	1								2	3		1				3	2						25
GN	3		1	1							2	1	1				1					2	2	14
ID	2							1	1		1	1		7	4		1	1	3	4			3	29
LB			2				1				2		1			1	1							8
NP	5		2				1			3	1	1		1									1	15
SN	3	2	2	1	2	2			1		4		3	4	1		2	1	3				2	33
TN		1						1						1	1		1		1	1			2	9
VE	10				1		3			3	1	4	1				2	1					1	27
PE	2	1							1	1	1		1				1		1					9
PI	1	1							5	1	1		4		1								1	15
IFAD									1												9			10
Total	67	8	14	6	5	3	9	3	10	13	21	9	21	17	8	2	12	7	8	16	2	17		278

**ACP RECOMMENDATIONS AND PMD FOLLOW-UP ACTION**

CO	EV	No.	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Actions	PMD Follow-Up Action
BJ	CPE	1	CTRY	STRAT	PLCY	The general focus of the next COSOP on the reduction of rural poverty will be maintained, in particular, on the linkages to the PRSP and the general agricultural policy documents approved in recent years by Benin, with a view to ensuring ownership of the document by the Beninese authorities. The COSOP will be prepared by means of a participatory process, involving all concerned Beninese stakeholders.	The new COSOP takes account of two major developments that occurred in 2002, namely (a) the launch of administrative decentralization associated with increased democratization; and (b) the adoption of a national strategy for poverty reduction ( <i>Document de stratégie de réduction de la pauvreté</i> ). These are undeniably the most significant policy changes in Benin over the past two-three decades, and they are indivisible. In fact, the Government's declared aim is to promote poverty reduction by empowering local populations to govern the running of community affairs, including development and poverty reduction. The PSRP has been officially declared the "principal reference guide" ( <i>le référentiel unique</i> ) for the partners in development of Benin. The formulation of the new COSOP involved a strongly participatory process, the results of which have been merged with the main policy orientations laid down in a number of policy documents adopted by the Government since 1996. The process, which has been managed by an ad-hoc orientation and monitoring committee, involved a national forum and two regional forums for the northern and southern departments. All the meetings and consultations were attended by the main stakeholders in agricultural and rural development in Benin, including grass-roots organizations, NGOs, senior staff of projects financed by IFAD and other donors, and elected representatives of the beneficiaries of IFAD financed projects.
BJ	CPE	2	IFAD	OPER	PART	Any IFAD general, sectoral, or regional policy documents with a bearing on ongoing projects should be disseminated in a targeted manner through a communication effort adapted to the national context.	
BJ	CPE	3	CTRY	STRAT	PART	The effort to form strategic partnerships with the other donors in Benin and not merely with cooperating institutions should be continued so as to avoid duplications and make the best use of existing resources. The coordination should be beneficial to all parties, and it should also make the participation of public institutions easier. IFAD should sensitize its project managers, as well as its staff and consultants, to this need. Furthermore, the attempt should be made to establish institutional or organizational mechanisms to foster the effectiveness of the partnership.	The donor community in Benin created a thematic group on agriculture and the environment in April 2004 to compensate for the weak coordination by the public administration. The group is to be led by all members in turn. The group plans to meet monthly to discuss the main challenges and issues. During the four meetings held to date, the group defined its mandate and started discussions on the agricultural sector. Representatives of the Ministry of Agriculture, Livestock and Fisheries have been invited to participate in the meetings, an important first step towards strengthening its coordination capacities. IFAD will seek

CO	EV	No.	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Actions	PMD Follow-Up Action
							<p>to play an important role in this new group.</p> <p>IFAD financed projects will be required to promote complementarities with the projects financed by other donors. Opportunities have been identified with regard to the following three ongoing initiatives: (a) reform and restructuring of the cotton commodity chain supported by the World Bank and French bilateral aid (French Development Agency); (b) functional literacy and basic French, supported by SwissAid; and (c) the programme to support the agricultural sector and farmer organizations (Agricultural Services and Farmer Organizations Support Programme, PASAOP) assisted by a group of donors led by the World Bank. A fourth opportunity for mutually reinforcing partnerships may be provided by a new nationwide project to support community-based development that is being prepared by the World Bank. The twofold objective of such partnerships would be to build on IFAD's considerable experience with the fostering of village level institutions and to assist rural populations to render these institutions sustainable.</p>
BJ	CPE	4	CTRY	STRAT	FIELD	IFAD's presence in Benin should be stronger and more permanent in order to ensure its participation in the development policy dialogue and its role as an advocate for the poor. The project coordinators should be encouraged to participate more actively in policy dialogues in their respective fields of action.	To enhance the voice of the poorest in decision-making on the poverty reduction actions to be included in development programmes, IFAD will endeavour to establish a permanent presence in the country. This will also have two additional aims: enhancing the policy dialogue with partners in development (donors and the Government) and advocating on behalf of the poorest in other areas.
BJ	CPE	5	IFAD	STRAT	INNOV	IFAD should examine its current management practices to determine if they provide a suitable framework for fostering flexibility and innovation and managing risks and for making adjustments when needed. In particular, the decisions taken in this regard should be more well documented.	
BJ	CPE	6	IFAD	OPER	SUPER	Project-reporting should devote more attention to the analysis of qualitative, innovative and strategic aspects, and cooperating institutions should do the same. IFAD should examine ways to give more precise guidance and establish minimum standards for the supervision that would be part of the mandates entrusted to cooperating institutions.	See IFAD COR 2.
BJ	CPE	7	CTRY	STRAT	BENE	The next COSOP should present clear guidelines on the various aspects involved in strengthening beneficiary participation in formulating and implementing the programme. They should be developed following an examination of the experience gained and the different approaches employed under the projects of	See CPE BJ 1.

CO	EV	No.	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Actions	PMD Follow-Up Action
						IFAD and other cooperation agencies and should indicate how the experiences are to be recorded as part of a learning process.	
BJ	CPE	8	CTRY	STRAT	TRGT	IFAD should enter into a dialogue with authorities and rural stakeholders in order to establish a strategy for those people who progress out of the target population. These people should receive ongoing support in order to keep them out of poverty. If the young remain a target group, the activities proposed to them must meet their concerns so that the activities have a chance of generating interest.	See CPE BJ 15.
BJ	CPE	9	CTRY	STRAT	GNDR	The next COSOP should reflect IFAD's general policies with regard to women and should present approaches for the promotion of women that consider the difficulties women face.	Gender equity is one of the pillars of national policy, notably the PSRP, which has been adopted as the framework document of the national struggle against poverty. Most of the ministries, including the Ministry of Agriculture, Livestock and Fisheries, have developed gender strategies. The overarching principle of the policy document adopted by the Ministry of Agriculture, Livestock and Fisheries in 2001 (policy for the promotion of rural women, <i>Politique de promotion de la femme rurale</i> ) is to strengthen rural women in all respects: economic, social, cultural and legal. It recognizes the importance of women's contributions to crop and animal production both as family members and as farmers of their own account; the processing and marketing of crop, animal, fishery and forestry products; the physical and spiritual well-being of family members; and community development, albeit mostly as providers of labour. The main constraints on rural women have been identified as follows: (a) difficult access to factors of production and gainful employment; (b) low educational and literacy levels; (c) weak participation in decision-making; and (d) ignorance of their own legal rights. Within the new strategic framework, IFAD will continue to support women's activities and will design a gender-sensitive M&E system.
BJ	CPE	10	CTRY	STRAT	ORG	The collective approach should be continued for activities that lend themselves to it (e.g., sensitization, extension and training) in order to reach as many people as possible. The approach and its operational modalities should be carefully examined, with full recognition of the importance of individual initiative in certain activities (for example, production).	
BJ	CPE	11	CTRY	STRAT	BENE	A study of the suitability and feasibility of the "do together" ( <i>faire-avec</i> ) approach, which gives the beneficiaries greater responsibility, should be undertaken as part of the formulation of the next COSOP, with the aim of identifying areas of intervention that might benefit from this approach and	Under the "done by others" ( <i>faire-faire</i> ) and <i>faire-avec</i> approaches, most of the field work in IFAD financed projects is being performed by local NGOs and private-sector service providers through performance-based contracts with the relevant project management. As steady improvements in performance at

CO	EV	No.	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Actions	PMD Follow-Up Action
						determining what support would be needed by project staff in order to apply it effectively. If the COSOP recommends this approach, it should be introduced gradually into existing projects and monitored closely so as not to damage the effectiveness achieved by the project management units (PMUs).	the grass-roots level confirm the validity of these approaches, the new programme will continue to apply them, doing so increasingly in ways that can enhance the complementarity of local actors and thereby generate critically important synergies.
BJ	CPE	12	CTRY	STRAT	ADV	The drafting of the next COSOP should be based on a strategic reflection aimed at, on the one hand, determining ways to increase the profitability of income-generating activities through a vertical production chain (a <i>filière</i> approach) and identifying appropriate alliances to foster for that purpose and, on the other hand, ways to promote activities that are not land dependent (small scale livestock with zero grazing techniques, the processing of agricultural and fishery products, crafts, etc.) and that can provide a decent family income without relying on the availability of land or on fishing activities. The pressure on the land must be decreased as land rights are secured.	IFAD's efforts to promote small scale businesses and other productive activities will continue to focus on four main areas: (a) expand the range of productive activities on the basis of local comparative advantage by helping producers identify and penetrate new markets and respond to them by creating vertical and horizontal linkages; local commodity chains for crops, livestock, fisheries and forestry, as well as non-farm activities such as the processing and trading of agricultural products, tool-making and repairs will be fostered, resulting in new jobs and higher value added locally; (b) facilitate the access to appropriate technologies so as to improve output quantity and quality, strengthen the emphasis on technical adaptation and enable access by the poor in these areas. Support will be provided for participatory action-research involving the rural people themselves in identifying and developing new solutions that respond best to the needs of these people; (c) promote environmentally sound natural resource management by encouraging farmers to adopt conservation practices to protect and improve soil fertility and water management, while meeting household food and cash needs; and (d) promote non-land-based rural activities by developing human capital, facilitating access to microfinance and marketing, and building rural infrastructure.
BJ	CPE	13	CTRY	STRAT	TRGT	IFAD should focus its activities on a limited number of areas and address as many needs as possible. This is why the coordination of activities, strategic alliances and policy dialogue should receive emphasis in the future.	The recommendation appears to contradict BJ CPE 1.
BJ	CPE	14	CTRY	OPER	CRED	The rural microfinance system (financial services associations) should be extended, reinforced by a modest umbrella structure that would ensure personnel training, establish rules for the conduct of business, monitor the financial viability of financial services associations, form alliances with other systems pursuing the same goals and applying similar methods, offer linkages with other institutions for members who need larger amounts of credit and be an advocate for microfinance among the national entities responsible for overseeing savings and lending systems. The ultimate goal is a system that will gradually achieve institutional autonomy and economic viability. IFAD support should be	IFAD's considerable experience in the development of rural finance is an important asset that must consolidated by improving outreach to the poorest and by developing appropriate financial products for rural producers, thereby allowing these producers to raise productivity and earn the higher incomes needed to reduce poverty. The quality of financial services offered to rural borrowers will be improved by enhancing the professional skills of microfinance operators so that they can develop innovative financial products in response to the real needs of rural clients. Capacity building inputs may be required in order to enhance efficiency in the implementation of the

CO	EV	No.	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Actions	PMD Follow-Up Action
						ensured throughout this period of reorganization and consolidation.	national microfinance development policy. Efforts to strengthen the capabilities of microfinance institutions will comply with the law governing the promotion of microfinance in the member countries of the West African Economic and Monetary Union (the <i>Projet d'appui à la réglementation des mutuelles d'épargne et de crédit</i> , Support Project for the Regulation of Savings and Credit Cooperatives). The development of partnerships will be enabled by a network at the service of all the stakeholders in microfinance development. More specifically, IFAD will consolidate the network of financial services associations established through past and ongoing projects and provide support to microfinance institutions specialized in responding to the needs of rural poor wanting to establish small businesses. The success of this objective in alleviating poverty will be heavily conditioned by the extent to which poor rural producers are able to identify and develop profitable economic activities. The ability of rural borrowers to repay credit will continue to be enhanced in two main ways: (a) by promoting profitable income-generating activities; and (b) by improving their access to markets.
BJ	CPE	15	IFAD	STRAT	TRGT	When IFAD decides for reasons of practicality or expertise to limit its scope of action, it should offer linkages to other institutions that can address the needs that it cannot meet. A strategy should be devised, for example, to assist those individuals among the poorer whose success lifts them out of target groups: additional support, up to a certain point, through IFAD projects or the establishment of linkages to other institutions. Furthermore, income-generating activities based on improved agricultural production, small scale livestock or fishery production could, for example, be incorporated in more profitable production chains that integrate processing and marketing. This could link the local level with the national level, and alliances should be forged with the various actors at the different points of the chain so as to allow IFAD projects to focus on one part of the chain. Closer collaboration should be established with farmer organizations by geographic area and by sector of production.	IFAD's efforts to promote small scale businesses and other productive activities will continue to focus on four main areas: (a) expand the range of productive activities on the basis of local comparative advantage by helping producers identify and penetrate new markets and respond to them by creating vertical and horizontal linkages; local commodity chains for crops, livestock, fisheries and forestry, as well as non-farm activities such as the processing and trading of agricultural products, tool-making and repairs will be fostered, resulting in new jobs and higher value added locally; (b) facilitate access to appropriate technologies in order to improve output quantity and quality, strengthen the emphasis on technical adaptation and enable access by the poor in these areas. Support will be provided for participatory action-research involving rural people themselves in identifying and developing new solutions that respond best to their needs; (c) promote environmentally sound natural resource management by encouraging farmers to adopt conservation practices to protect and improve soil fertility and water management, while meeting household food and cash needs; and (d) promote non-land-based rural activities by developing human capital, facilitating access to microfinance and marketing and building rural infrastructure.

CO	EV	No.	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Actions	PMD Follow-Up Action
BJ	CPE	16	CTRY	STRAT	TRGT	The next COSOP should emphasize national rather than area-based projects and programmes.	The four ongoing projects constitute a coherent and mutually reinforcing whole both among themselves and within the national context of externally funded development actions. To continue maximizing the effectiveness and efficient use of resources, the new programme will be designed as an umbrella programme.
BJ	CPE	17	IFAD	OPER	SUPER	To facilitate comparisons and, based on experience, choose the most rational and least costly solutions, all projects should adopt uniform guidelines for the budgetary allocation of expenditure by category and subcategory. IFAD should devise a means of standardizing project accounting regardless of which institution carries out supervision.	This recommendation needs to be reviewed in the context of the harmonization process.
BJ	CPE	18	CTRY	OPER	M&E	With a view to ensuring rational and economical use of resources, the M&E work programme and the periodicity thereof should be examined to determine whether the work programme is addressing real needs.	To this effect, the new programme, the Rural Development Support Programme, would include an M&E system that would cover its own activities, as well as the M&E of all IFAD programmes in the country, in order to ensure the link with the PRSP, through the observatory on social change under the Ministry of State in Charge of Planning and Development, in measuring the impact of rural poverty reduction. The observatory has been created to monitor PRSP implementation and impact. Intended as a permanent mechanism for collecting and analysing data on poverty and household living conditions and for disseminating the findings to all stakeholders, the observatory will operate as a network bringing together a broad range of institutions charged with the enabling of macroeconomic and social development. In addition, the Rural Development Support Programme will streamline the financing, administration and human resource management of all IFAD programmes so as to save on operational costs and ensure a better synergy and complementarity within IFAD's portfolio.
BJ	CPE	19	PROJ	OPER	DECNT	A process of strategic reflection should be undertaken on the linkage between project activities and the development of municipalities in Benin, as well as on the support that might be provided to a certain number of municipalities in which there is a particularly strong project presence in order to help them establish and implement their development plans and strengthen coordination among the various stakeholders involved.	The role of project implementing partners is to assist rural populations in developing the skills and institutions needed to respond to the new challenges created through decentralization. The experiences have been positive and will be scaled up through the Rural Development Support Programme because these approaches have demonstrated their ability to assist beneficiary populations in developing the skills needed to ensure their own development.
BJ	IE	1	PROJ	OPER	TRGT	In a second phase of PAGER, the income-generating activities component might employ two approaches: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• extend interventions of the "first-stage" type to the portion of the target population that has not yet benefited from this sort</li> </ul>	See BJ CPE 15.



CO	EV	No.	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Actions	PMD Follow-Up Action
						<p>of support;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>develop subcomponents that better address the growth needs of the most dynamic microenterprises, thereby gently easing them out of the PAGER area of intervention. This second option would have to be supported through the implementation of appropriate policies and measures on the part of Beninese authorities.</li> </ul>	
BJ	IE	2	PROJ	OPER	ORG	The “group approach” and the establishment of processing centres should be reviewed correctly to scale this part of the project based on the structural realities encountered in the field.	See CPE responses.
BJ	IE	3	PROJ	OPER	ADV	Particular attention should be paid to the impact of any new activities on labour intensity and costs in order to select activities that can be mechanized, decrease the labour intensity and costs and increase the economic and social profitability of production.	See CPE responses.
BJ	IE	4	PROJ	OPER	ADV	The “credit line subcomponent” of the rural finance component has proved irrelevant, ineffective and consequently inefficient.	<i>No recommendation made.</i>
BJ	IE	5	N/R	OPER	CRED	The outlook for the sustainability of the financial services associations is promising, but it could take some time to achieve and might require sustained and fairly long term support.	See CPE responses.
BJ	IE	6	PROJ	OPER	ADV	If a follow-up to the project is agreed, solutions to the two weaknesses (high costs and beneficiary dependence) should be sought, e.g., through the use of a different implementation approach, the outsourcing of some costs and a reduction in project subcomponents.	See BJ CPE 18.
BJ	IE	7	PROJ	STRAT	ADV	A different approach that might be considered is the <i>faire-avec</i> approach. A study of suitability and feasibility should be carried out in order to identify the areas of intervention that would benefit from this approach and the support needed by the PMU in order to apply it effectively. The findings of that study should then be taken into account in formulating the next phase of PAGER. The <i>faire-avec</i> approach should be introduced gradually into the interventions deemed most suited to its application, and the approach should be monitored closely in order not to sacrifice the effectiveness achieved by the PMU.	See BJ CPE 16.
BJ	IE	8	PROJ	OPER	ADV	The reduction of subcomponents will require an analysis of impacts by each component prior to the formulation of a follow-up phase to determine the added value of each subcomponent in achieving impacts and thus identify the combination of the components and subcomponents that will maximize impact and efficiency.	See BJ CPE responses.
BJ	IE	9	PROJ	PLCY	GNDR	A policy and specific measures with regard to gender issues	See BJ CPE 9.

CO	EV	No.	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Actions	PMD Follow-Up Action
						should also be formulated and incorporated into the next phase.	
BJ	IE	10	PROJ	OPER	ADV	If the project and the PMU are to continue, the special treatment accorded to NGOs should be replaced by a competitive bidding system open to all operators in a sector, not just the NGOs working in that sector.	See CPE responses.
BR	IE	1	PROJ	OPER	ADV	Extend the implementation period for two years.	The project has been extended for two additional years. The formulation mission to design Progavião II will initiate its work in June 2005.
BR	IE	2	PROJ	OPER	DECNT	Develop a more participatory work style that is decentralized towards the executing unit and rural associations.	A more participatory and decentralized approach to the development of rural associations has been implemented.
BR	IE	3	PROJ	OPER	ADV	Analyse and review gender, environment and M&E strategies. Formulate a marketing strategy for products covered by the project.	With support from PL's Regional Programme to Consolidate Gender-Mainstreaming Strategies in IFAD-Financed Projects of Latin America and the Caribbean and Programme for Strengthening the Regional Capacity for Monitoring and Evaluation of IFAD's Rural Poverty-Alleviation Projects in Latin America and the Caribbean (PREVAL), gender and M&E strategies and actions have been revised, and a set of recommendations implemented. Environmental strategies have been reviewed with the support of a consultant.
BR	IE	4	PROJ	OPER	ADV	Focus more attention and investments on the project's technical team. Restructure the team by placing more emphasis on staff specialized in social action and increase the number of women on the team to the extent possible. Retrain the technical staff of the project and of partner organizations in appropriate methodologies and content for the new phase of the project. Foster participation in non-project training activities and information.	The project team has been evaluated; some changes in personnel have led to a more "socially oriented" field staff. The recommendations on field staff professional structures will be used in Progavião II design.
BR	IE	5	PROJ	OPER	ADV	Prepare a new, detailed work programme with the co-executing institutions for the remainder of the implementation period.	A new work programme has been prepared and has been implemented.
BR	IE	6	PROJ	OPER	ORG	Strengthen rural participation and the operation of community organizations in order to extend project benefits to a greater number of families and beyond the communities already covered.	Project coverage has been widened, taking into consideration the available project physical and budgetary resources. New, wider areas will be covered in Progavião II. Local associations are involved in local development management as a first step towards sustainability and strengthening the links with local governments, civil society and the private sector.
BR	IE	7	PROJ	OPER	ORG	Associations should undertake activities of general community interest that are essential to the sustainability of project actions.	
BR	IE	8	PROJ	OPER	GNDR	Continue and strengthen the work with the gender perspective.	See BR IE 3.
BR	IE	9	PROJ	OPER	LCLCAP	Evaluate the educational process in the three family farm schools in the project area and the impact of the schools on rural development.	
BR	IE	10	PROJ	OPER	DECNT	Situate the project in the region, using a territorial development approach and strengthening linkages with local government, civil	In this scheme, the project is also supporting municipal action committees.

CO	EV	No.	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Actions	PMD Follow-Up Action
						society and organizations linked to all projects under way in the area, be they federal or state, public or private.	
BR	IE	11	PROJ	OPER	DECNT	In the same way as other active projects in Bahia, the project should support the implementation of municipal action committees as called for in the original design and, if applicable, the establishment of a regional organization that groups all the <i>municípios</i> in the project area.	
BR	IE	12	PROJ	OPER	ADV	The project's technical, organizational and implementation capacity should be made available to local agencies in order to combine capacities and undertake integrated action for local development.	The field personnel of local agencies have been trained in the technical, organizational and implementation strategies used by the project.
BR	IE	13	PROJ	OPER	ADV	Disseminate new technologies for cassava and livestock.	With the support of the State of Bahia agricultural extension service, cassava and livestock management techniques have been disseminated to a wider audience and to other geographical areas in which they are applicable. A new bean and maize cropping system has been designed and is being tested by project field staff.
BR	IE	14	PROJ	OPER	ADV	Ensure the maintenance of new, selected plant materials for cassava, new rangelands and the regional and local stocking of fingerlings for reservoirs.	
BR	IE	15	PROJ	OPER	ADV	Develop a new technology package for bean and maize cropping, using the same methodology as for cassava.	
BR	IE	16	PROJ	OPER	ADV	Analyse the overall programme for irrigated crops and design a new programme reflecting the necessary modalities.	A new irrigation programme has been designed and is being tested in pilot experiences throughout the project area.
BR	IE	17	PROJ	OPER	ADV	Maintain the current microenterprise strategy and develop an alternative for action that is more participatory and grass-roots based, less complex and far-reaching in terms of beneficiaries and sustainability.	An alternative, more participatory and grass-roots-based approach to microenterprise development has been implemented.
BR	IE	18	PROJ	OPER	CRED	Tap microcredit potential as a means to empower and strengthen grass-roots organization. Reformulate the programme for microcredit distribution and management, adopting a social policy approach.	Microcredit has been reformulated and is currently being tested as an empowerment tool for microenterprise organizations.
BR	IE	19	PROJ	OPER	NRM	Strengthen environmental awareness in all facets of the project.	An environmental evaluation (see the response to BR-3) has led to a strengthened environmental awareness programme.
BR	IE	20	PROJ	OPER	REPL	Possible <i>second phase or new project</i> . In view of the foregoing, it is proposed that work be continued under a second phase through a new project in an appropriate area of Bahia having a baseline situation very similar to the one encountered at the beginning of Progavião, combining infrastructure and production-related actions with community and social development.	As stated, the formulation mission to design Progavião II will initiate its work in Brazil in June 2005. All recommendations included in BR 11 are part of the terms of reference for the mission.
BF	IE	1 (a)	PROJ	OPER	NRM	In view of the programme's achievements and the broad scope of the environmental, agricultural and human challenge in this area, the mission recommends: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>preparation of another sector intervention on issues of land use management and crop settling, supported by IFAD and</li> </ul>	Another sector intervention has been prepared, the Sustainable Rural Development Programme ( <i>Programme de développement</i> )

CO	EV	No.	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Actions	PMD Follow-Up Action
						subject to the results of in-depth studies before the formulation of the new programme, e.g.:	<i>rural durable</i> , PDRD), approved in December 2004 and signed in February 2005.
BF	IE	1 (b)	PROJ	OPER	ADV	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>carry out a zoning exercise to measure changes and current trends in water and wind erosion in the central plateau;</li> </ul>	Will be done during project year (PY) 1 as part of the programme baseline; interventions funded through PDRD's Global Environment Facility will use an integrated watershed management methodology that normally also requires some zoning exercises and trend analysis.
BF	IE	1 (c)	PROJ	OPER	CRED	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>study the configuration and capacity for intervention of local operators and borrowers;</li> </ul>	Carried out for operators (see Working Paper 6) and will be deepened during implementation, especially for borrowers.
BF	IE	1 (d)	PROJ	OPER	KMGMT	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>put in place small-scale pilot operations to determine the feasibility of certain new rural occupations (groups of young conservationists, in particular);</li> </ul>	"Learning fields" are planned and will promote tested agro-sylvopastoral activities that conserve the environment; local technical assistance for activities adopted to fight against soil erosion will be based on the Sahelian Eco-Farming model of the International Crops Research Institute for the Semi-Arid Tropics.
BF	IE	1 (e)	PROJ	STRAT	EXIT	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>based on lessons learned through experience acquired under the programme, adopt a fundamentally different approach that includes, from the outset, an evolutionary strategy based on local actors and an exit strategy for the planned withdrawal of the project structure.</li> </ul>	The withdrawal strategy is based on the plan that the village and inter-village natural resource management committees ( <i>Comités villageois de gestion des terroirs</i> and <i>Comités inter-villageois de gestion des terroirs</i> ) will gradually take over project functions, aided by the chambers of agriculture being put in place with PDRD support.
BF	IE	1 (f)	PROJ	OPER	CRED	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>an intervention in rural finance that falls within the strategy of counterpart institutions, but sets much more ambitious targets for shared penetration rates (currently only 4% after 15 years).</li> </ul>	Targets will be fixed in the context of annual programmes of work and budget and take note of this recommendation.
BF	IE	2 (a)	PROJ	OPER	EXIT	<p>The mission recommends the following measures for managing the final programme phase:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>ensure that the government counterpart funding that has been committed is forthcoming so as to achieve favourable project implementation and closure of the IFAD and West African Development Bank loans;</li> </ul>	Done.
BF	IE	2 (b)	PROJ	OPER	ADV	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>take steps to maintain rolling stock and equipment with a view to continued intervention; and</li> </ul>	Following the evaluation of the special programme, some equipment and vehicles have been retained in order to facilitate the start-up of the PDRD.
BF	IE	2 (c)	PROJ	OPER	CRED	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>ensure proper implementation of operations to repay the credits granted by the Agricultural and Commercial Bank of Burkina (<i>Banque agricole et commerciale du Burkina</i>); the mission recommends that the programme approach the bank to arrange for repayments to be made through a financial operator set up in the programme area.</li> </ul>	Recovery of the bank loans is continuing through the village credit committees, bank staff and special programme personnel. Contacts with the bank are maintained in order to recoup monies due after 2006; a special account will be opened with the public treasury to this effect.
BF	IE	3	CTRY	STRAT	CRED	In view of the possibility of future intervention in the central plateau area and renewed collaboration with the institutions	IFAD will ensure that this recommendation is carried out as soon as PDRD implementation begins.

CO	EV	No.	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Actions	PMD Follow-Up Action
						there, it is important for IFAD to take part in the steering committee for the rural finance action plan.	
EC	IE	1	PROJ	OPER	ADV	To promote the potential of the indigenous and Afro-Ecuadorian peoples as part of a multicultural society, a practical mechanism based on non-discriminatory rules should be examined, in order to train communities from the base and grant resources directly to these communities.	<b>Background:</b> The design of the new Prodepine II includes strategies and funds to train grass-roots organizations and to develop proposals differentiated by regions and indigenous peoples. (a) IFAD designed a new operation to work with Afro-Ecuadorian peoples. The loan agreement for the Development of the Central Corridor Project (650-EC), negotiated in December 2005; project not yet effective; (b) Prodepine II, entirely financed by the World Bank, not yet effective.
EC	IE	2	PROJ	OPER	ADV	Promote regionalized strategies with a double objective. First, in accordance with the local ethno-cultural and environmental realities of the peoples in the Coast, Sierra and Amazon regions develop, for example, an Afro-Prodepine and an Amazon Prodepine. Second, financial allocations by second- and third-tier organizations, per capita and per project, should include regional costs that take into account the organizational level of the projects and acknowledge the internal and external political factors affecting the development of the projects.	1. May 2005, agreement with the Government of Ecuador to use funds remaining from Prodepine to cofinance Prodepine II costs and to strengthen the village savings banks ( <i>cajas solidarias</i> ); IFAD mission report to be presented in July 2005. 2. Development of the Central Corridor Project (650-EC) approved by the December 2004 Executive Board; loan agreement negotiated; signature pending. To incorporate lessons learned in designing the new Prodepine.
EC	IE	3	PROJ	OPER	REPL	Establish mechanisms to regionalize Prodepine by conducting an informed consultation with the target group and second- and third-tier organizations in all three regions of the country.	The World Bank conducted public consultations during the design of Prodepine II. This second phase will be entirely financed by the World Bank.
EC	IE	4	PROJ	OPER	ORG	Concentrate on the institutional strengthening of communities, local committees and associations. The strengthening should include training in diagnosing and prioritizing the needs of communities and ways to resolve these needs, as well as training in development management and administration. It is equally important to promote the social capital of the communities and train people in the monitoring and social auditing of the processes and projects carried out in communities.	The Development of the Central Corridor Project will apply this approach, prioritizing the training of members of grass-roots organizations.
EC	IE	5	PROJ	OPER	GNDR	In order to verify whether a comprehensive gender strategy is being implemented in all other components, Prodepine should periodically gather information disaggregated by gender using participatory methods. Specifically, the gender strategy should be implemented, along with a verifiable conceptual framework, performance indicators, methodology and other forms of operation for the application of the gender approach and a monitoring system to measure progress and make adjustments.	There is a gender strategy and indicators for Prodepine II and peasant communities.
EC	IE	6	PROJ	OPER	M&E	Complete the <i>Rikuk Pacha</i> monitoring system with indicators covering critical intercultural, gender and participation factors, as well as indicators monitoring processes and results and indicators related to the recovery, strengthening and revitalization of the	The <i>Rikuk Pacha</i> monitoring system would be completed during Prodepine II.

CO	EV	No.	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Actions	PMD Follow-Up Action
						diverse culture of peoples and nationalities, as identified through the Integrated System of Social Indicators for Ecuador for the Social Indicators for Nationalities and Peoples of Ecuador.	
EC	IE	7	PROJ	OPER	M&E	Wherever possible, the indicators mentioned should be elaborated, tested and updated by the communities to ensure that the impact of projects on the livelihoods of households is monitored.	
EC	IE	8	PROJ	STRAT	ORG	In order to empower the communities to take responsibility for their own destiny, it is recommended that consideration be given to decentralizing project management to community organizations selected by the communities themselves. Under this arrangement, the communities are invested with the power, capacity and authority to hire their own executing agencies (almost always community agencies) for training and projects. The community may hire the second-tier organization or the municipality if they are capable of providing the service. In order to formulate and carry out the kinds of subprojects mentioned above, it is recommended that communities be trained to formulate, implement, monitor and evaluate their own projects.	Prodepine II is pursuing a more balanced distribution of investments in public works among inhabitants, groups and regions.  In the Development of the Central Corridor Project, funds are directly transferred to grass-roots organizations so they will be able to hire the specific services they might need.
EC	IE	9	PROJ	OPER	ORG	Given the need expressed by many communities to have cultural revitalization projects exclusively, it is recommended that funding be allocated for cultural revitalization projects for each of the indigenous and black peoples.	Although the project has not commenced operations yet, it is designed to allocate funds for cultural revitalization projects for each of the indigenous and black peoples. Final audit reports (2004-05) already approved by the World Bank.
EC	IE	10	PROJ	STRAT	LCLCAP	Train communities to be accountable regarding the management of public funds. There is a need to strengthen accounting and project administration skills and to provide training in the monitoring and control of compliance with the guidelines governing social processes by second- and third-tier organizations, local government, municipal government and the Government of Ecuador. Support beneficiary communities in demanding accounts from indigenous and non-indigenous authorities, contractors, supervisors and any others involved in community development. Likewise, communities must be prepared to render accounts to those institutions they cooperate with, to the indigenous organizations that support them and to other state agencies.	The recommendations to improve the capacities of the Council for the Development of the Nationalities and Peoples of Ecuador ( <i>Consejo de Desarrollo de las Nacionalidades y Pueblos de Ecuador</i> ) are being followed with the support of the World Bank.
ER	CE	1	PROJ	OPER	ADV	An extension of ELWDP activities until 31 March 2006 is required to ensure the successful and safe completion and sustainability of the project. Project implementation accelerated from 2000 onwards, and several important activities in agricultural training, livestock services and irrigation	Extension has been processed by PF in December 2004, and extension was approved by the President in December 2004. The Office of the General Counsel presented the letter of amendment to the Office of the President in April 2005, and the letter has been signed and sent to the Government of Ecuador.

CO	EV	No.	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Actions	PMD Follow-Up Action
						<p>management transfer have started that need to be consolidated. Furthermore, the current operation of the system, particularly the breaching bunds, entails a risk that should be resolved in the extension period.</p> <p>Due to the inclement weather in Sheeb, project activities only take place during the October-April interval. Activities in the extension period should be in support of the Sheeb Farmers Association, improving technical operations and strengthening the support to the agricultural component and the paraveterinarian programme. An extension may also be used to monitor project impact over a longer period and summarize the lessons learned and may contribute to a spate irrigation development strategy in Eritrea.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The evaluation of the operational system is continuing by both parties, the Ministry of Agriculture and the Sheeb Farmers Association. Already, some key areas have been identified.</li> <li>Strengthening the Sheeb Farmers Association is continuing by giving them day-to-date management assistance, training based on problems identified by the executive committee on the day-to-day assistance of management and training on different subjects such as operation and maintenance, financial management, fee collection and planning and budgeting for operation and maintenance.</li> <li>A summary operation and maintenance handbook has been extracted from the main operation and maintenance handbook and prepared in the local language.</li> <li>Strengthening of community animal health workers is also a continuing activity. Since the evaluation, 40 such workers have been trained. The number has now been raised to 84, and the supply of drugs, vaccines and tools is also continuing.</li> </ul>
ER	CE	2	PROJ	OPER	M&E	The proposal is to improve the financial reporting on the ELWDP and also include subcomponent analysis.	<p>The project accounting system is computerized, but the system is still based on the IFAD loan agreement and the International Development Association financial reporting system. The financial reporting system remains organized by categories, and the new system allows following up from the categories to components. To fulfil the recommendation, the funding agency and the cooperating agency system should be changed.</p> <p><i>Care needs to be taken that the reporting systems are harmonized to the extent possible with the government systems and that donors (IFAD) do not require significantly different systems.</i></p>
ER	CE	3	PROJ	OPER	ORG	To build on the now well-structured participatory process and extend support to the Sheeb Farmers Association. The following needs to be achieved up to 2006: discussions and then training of farmers in the operation of the system, especially the breaching bund and the gravel trap, the management of earth-moving equipment, needs assessments and capacity building in priority areas, especially among members of the executive committee, including crucial tasks such as financial administration, the collection of fees and planning in order to bring about improvements in the command area, including improvements in the system of water distribution.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Training on operation and maintenance, the collection of fees, the management of day-to-day activities, planning and budgeting, estimating costs, the management of equipment and the prioritization of the maintenance area has been conducted and is continuing.</li> <li>The management of equipment has been assessed; management guidelines agreed upon by both sides have been prepared, and the amendment has been made in the handover agreement.</li> <li>The border map for the command area (irrigable land) for both Wadis has been prepared and submitted to all concerned bodies.</li> </ul>

CO	EV	No.	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Actions	PMD Follow-Up Action
							<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Since the evaluation, 14 command area structures have been constructed.</li> </ul>
ER	CE	4	PROJ	OPER	ADV	It has been agreed that a technical audit should be undertaken to evaluate the operation of the Wadi Laba and Mai Ule systems. This technical audit is to be performed by an external expert, in close collaboration with representatives of the Sheeb Farmers Association and the Ministry of Agriculture. The ministry and the Sheeb Farmers Association, with the help of external experts, will review the operation of the breaching bunds, including the feasibility of forced breaching. The technical audit will also be used to review the 1995 and 1998 design parameters so that lessons may be learned on several aspects, including the sizing of the headworks. The audit should also look at a programme for regular hydrological monitoring.	The technical audit is in preparation and has not yet been finalized.
ER	CE	5	PROJ	OPER	ADV	It is important to continue the recently intensified collaboration among contact farmers, extensionists and researchers, particularly as there is a well-established practice of dissemination of extension messages by communities within communities. It is understood that, since the fielding of the evaluation mission, the ministry, IFAD and the cooperating institution have agreed to continue the extension programme in this direction, making a larger effort to engage women farmers, involve contact farmers and strengthen the linkages among extension, research and farmers.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>New varieties of cotton, sesame and groundnuts have been introduced. As a pilot project in Laba, 75 ha of cotton have been planted.</li> <li>The training programme for women farmers is continuing; over 200 women farmers have been trained so far. Women's participation in extension programmes is systematically being sought.</li> <li>Women have been included in the Sheeb Farmers Associations.</li> </ul>
ER	CE	6	PROJ	OPER	ADV	The paraveterinarian and community animal health workers programme has been well received and appears to fulfil an important need. It is important that the paraveterinarian services continue after the completion of the ELWDP. It has been agreed to undertake a detailed assessment of the paraveterinarian programme and the way to which the paraveterinarians should be linked to the ministry programme in animal health and livestock extension.	Some data have been collected; the study is not yet finalized.
ER	CE	7	PROJ	OPER	LCLCAP	It has been agreed to develop a capacity building plan, identify training needs among existing staff and assess the total staff strength required, as well as responsibilities in the various parts of the ministry. The plan should also describe the most practical arrangements for building capacity either in-country or abroad.	The needs have been identified. Some activities are under way at the national level.
ER	CE	8	PROJ	OPER	PART	It has been agreed, despite the unsatisfactory achievements of the ELWDP in this field, that the drinking water component needs to be completed in an appropriate manner, not least because this is a high priority in the area. Funding for investments will come from	Project management has stated that they are awaiting formal notification from UNICEF.



CO	EV	No.	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Actions	PMD Follow-Up Action
						the Cooperazione Italiana-UNICEF programme. It is agreed that UNICEF will complete drinking water supply systems in Men'sheeb, Bises, Tiluk and Genab by mid-April 2005. In doing so, UNICEF and the Ministry of Local Government will make use of the material still remaining from the 2000 procurement. The material that cannot be used in the project area will be used elsewhere in the country on an exchange basis.	
ER	CE	9	IFAD	PLCY	POST	Due to the uncertainties of the post-conflict situation, the staff appraisal report has already advocated a 'simple' approach. The experience of the ELWDP confirms that simplicity and clarity in implementation arrangements are crucial to the success of the project in such circumstances. A second lesson is the importance of activities that quickly rectify immediate resource constraints in post-conflict situations, such as the supply of draught animals or bulldozers for earth works. A third lesson is to acknowledge the capacity problems that may arise in conflict and post-conflict situations and show the flexibility to reassess arrangements for project implementation.	Point well taken. The forthcoming COSOP mission will be duly considering these issues in the draft strategy. PF would have, however, preferred the CE to have developed more in-depth these issues than it managed to do. This is so because more valuable experiences would have been analysed and subsequently reported in the document than is currently the case. The current IFAD Crisis and Post Conflict Reconstruction Policy Work will definitely take stock of this unusual interstate conflict, which is putting Eritrea into a "No Peace-No War" situation and destabilizing the country.
ER	CE	10	PROJ	OPER	M&E	It is strongly suggested that setting up such financial systems and monitoring and feedback mechanisms be the joint responsibility of the implementing government and the project financier, not of the implementing government only. The project financier, by virtue of its broader experience in this field, should, if required, take the lead in investing in these systems and in the human resource development that goes with these systems.	The system has been computerized, and the project accountant has been sent to a financial management short course. The newly introduced system has a very good financial monitoring system.  The remark made in this section regarding the RIMS surely does not apply to this project, which was designed more than 12 years ago and is near completion. Point well taken for future investments.
ER	CE	11 (a)	PROJ	OPER	ADV	Because spate irrigation is considered a main area for improved food security in Eritrea, it has been agreed that, in addition to the civil engineering approach followed in the ELWDP, a broad range of approaches and options is being considered in the improvement and development of spate irrigation. Other approaches for spate irrigation improvement in Eritrea may include the provision of bulldozers at paid or even commercial rates, the improvement in command areas networks and water distribution strategies, the development of relatively cheaper spate systems on smaller rivers, the use of low-cost technology to strengthen traditional diversions, the introduction of improved draught animals and the development of high-value cropping patterns.	Not prepared, but will be discussed with the Government of Eritrea and the World Bank during the forthcoming COSOP mission.
ER	CE	11 (b)	PROJ	OPER	ADV	It has been agreed that the cost, benefits and longevity of each of these interventions vary and should be documented on the basis of experiences in Eritrea and elsewhere. Each area may have its	The data have been collected and compiled, but not yet published.

CO	EV	No.	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Actions	PMD Follow-Up Action
						own set of suitable measures. An inventory of what combination of measures is most appropriate in each area should be prepared. Such an inventory should also look at the arrangements for identification (given the general absence of data) and implementation (including the role of farmer associations and sub-zoba government).	
ER	CE	12	PROJ	OPER	ORG	One lesson is that, for farmer participation to be effective, it should be given a central place from the beginning in the implementation of projects such as the ELWDP. This should be done in a systematic manner through the establishment of a farmers association at an early stage and through formal and structured consultations, leading to mutual agreements on designs and responsibilities.	Point well taken.
ER	CE	13	PROJ	OPER	PART	The lesson learned here is to separate implementation and supervision functions and clarify responsibilities. Agreements between agencies should include provisions to take corrective action if things do not evolve as planned. A second lesson is that the Government was not party to the Memorandum of Understanding, and, in the future, this situation should be avoided. The role of the government agencies involved in implementation should also be clarified.	Point well taken and will be duly taken into account for future investments.
ER	CE	14	PROJ	OPER	ADV	One of the recommendations with respect to the agricultural programme was to promote the use of low-cost tube wells for cash crops in the project area. Though there was no disagreement on the relevance of this recommendation, the Ministry of Agriculture indicated that, given the time left for the project, this recommendation cannot be incorporated in the project programme.	If appropriate, the recommendation could be considered for the Gash Barka Project.
GH	IE	1	PROJ	OPER	ADV	It was agreed that the programme coordination office will: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• have full flexibility to continue the distribution of planting materials at the current pace in light of its expectations about future trends in prices and demand for outputs and the continuing need to disseminate new varieties.</li> </ul>	Cassava prices are high again, and there is a shortage of planting material. The programme coordination office will have the flexibility to continue the distribution of planting material, but a business-development approach is to be used at the third level. The RTIP will start with market-based distribution of planting material in root and tuber focal zones with a high production of root and tuber crops.
GH	IE	2	PROJ	OPER	ADV	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• ensure completion of building on the insectaries;</li> <li>• ensure distribution of predators of the larger grain borer in known hotspot areas; and</li> <li>• commission a study of the economic impact of current biological control methods.</li> </ul>	In the RTIP, building on insectaries will be carried out. The distribution of predators of the larger grain borer is planned during the RTIP. A study of the economic impact of current biological control methods was made available (economic rate of return: 48%) (see GH 4).

CO	EV	No.	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Actions	PMD Follow-Up Action
GH	IE	3	PROJ	OPER	ADV	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>emphasize financial and socio-economic analyses of proposed interventions in ongoing research programmes;</li> <li>step up the production of extension materials and increase the availability and exchange of the information generated through all components.</li> </ul>	<p>The following studies were completed through the RTIP during the period July-August 2004 as input for the formulation mission: (a) a cost-benefit analysis of farmer field schools and other extension approaches used in Ghana; (b) an assessment of the economic impact of the biological control of cassava green mites under the RTIP; (c) a study of the economic sustainability of improved cassava and sweet potato production systems in Ghana; (d) a study of wheat substitution in snacks and biscuits in Ghana; (e) a baseline study on the preference of farmers for yam varieties other than <i>Pona</i> and <i>Laribako</i>; (f) a feasibility study on the organization of supply lines for cassava chips; (g) a study on the nutritional status of children; (h) a cost-benefit analysis of alternative root and tuber processing methods in Ghana. A tracer-study is available. The conclusion is that the results of the first phase in the area of post-harvest are weak.</p> <p>Limited progress on extension materials (some booklets on processing). Further publications are planned during the RTIP.</p>
GH	IE	4 (a)	PROJ	OPER	ADV	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>undertake a cost-benefit analysis of current approaches to processing, comparing the best set-up and scale for various village-based groups and individual processing options, including guidelines for processors.</li> </ul>	<p>Studies already available (see GH 3). Conclusions were weak, but the formulation team developed an approach.</p>
GH	IE	4 (b)	PROJ	OPER	M&E	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>undertake a tracer study of those individuals who have been trained by the RTIP in processing techniques; the purpose would be to determine the impact of the training conducted and the follow-up that may be required for that training.</li> </ul>	<p>A tracer study was made available. The conclusion is that the process should be demand driven. Too many people were trained who do not use their new skills. During the RTIP, training will focus on business skills.</p>
GH	IE	4 (c)	PROJ	OPER	PRIV	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>begin to undertake assessments of markets, demand and prices for root and tuber crops and products.</li> </ul>	<p>Not enough progress has been made in monitoring markets. The RTIP will have an entire component on promoting marketing relations within the root and tuber commodity chain.</p>
GH	IE	5	PROJ	OPER	ORG	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>concentrate the work of the community support and mobilization component on processing groups;</li> <li>respond to the demand for support from groups collaborating with semi-industrial and industrial users of cassava, including the Ayensu Starch Company.</li> </ul>	<p>Component A: fostering market-based linkages between (groups of) small root and tuber farmers and processors and larger scale processors and traders (Initiatives Fund) and building up the capacity of small root and tuber farmers and processors (e.g., a root and tuber apex body).</p> <p>Component C: upgrading of traditional and artisanal root and tuber processing in terms of upgraded equipment and (business) skills. The specifics of the collaboration between the RTIP and the Ayensu factory are to be worked out (the current cassava price is too high for factory).</p>
GH	IE	6	PROJ	OPER	ADV	<p>It was agreed to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>seek more human resources for the post-production and marketing component. Due to budgetary concerns, partners</li> </ul>	<p>See: GH 5.</p> <p>The RTIP will employ for the programme coordination office:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a root and tuber linkages and marketing specialist;</li> </ul>

CO	EV	No.	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Actions	PMD Follow-Up Action
						<p>agreed to recruit one person and to consider adding more resources in future;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>develop work plans for post-production marketing with colleagues working in adaptive research, community support and extension that will begin efforts, including staff training, to implement the recommendations for Phase II.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a root and tuber processing and post-harvest specialist;</li> <li>a business development training and credit specialist;</li> <li>a root and tuber crops specialist;</li> </ul> <p>and for the zonal offices:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a root and tuber commodity-chain officer.</li> </ul> <p>Regular staff training foreseen.</p>
GH	IE	7	PROJ	OPER	M&E	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>review the current M&amp;E system to reduce the collection, generation and processing of data on physical and financial progress to the bare essentials. They did not agree to recruit one M&amp;E assistant to help implement the system;</li> <li>review the current monitoring of RTIP log frame indicators to develop the work begun on the participatory evaluation of the impact at the household level;</li> <li>consider how to link RTIP M&amp;E work to the regional M&amp;E officers and look for ways to strengthen the capacity of the latter to collect and analyse data during the second phase.</li> </ul>	<p>During the second phase, M&amp;E will be revamped (a new management information system), and the zonal office coordinator will become involved in M&amp;E tasks.</p> <p>For component B, the Ministry of Food and Agriculture's M&amp;E system will be utilized, while the implementing partners and technical service providers will be responsible for monitoring components A and C. Representatives of all primary and secondary stakeholders will be involved (e.g., in the preparation of the Mid-Term Review).</p> <p>The evaluation of programme results and impact will be outsourced (e.g., to the university), as will responsibility for the participatory impact surveys and tracer studies in preparation for the Mid-Term Review and the programme achievement report.</p>
GH	IE	8	CTRY	STRAT	REPL	<p>It has been agreed that IFAD and the Government of Ghana:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>will more explicitly direct future investments in root and tuber crop development to achieve the goals of increased incomes and greater food security.</li> </ul>	<p>The RTIP builds up the capacity of traditional and artisanal processors. The programme is more decentralized and more demand driven. The budget has been increased to USD 24 million.</p>
GH	IE	9	PROJ	OPER	REPL	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>prior to undertaking further joint investments in the root and tuber crop sector, will study where the RTIP and others have made the most significant progress in improving the livelihood systems of poor rural households with respect to food security and income. They will use these findings in the design of the second phase of the RTIP.</li> </ul>	<p>A price and market study has been undertaken. Participatory workshops were organized to prepare for the formulation mission and during the mission.</p> <p>The price of cassava is rising again, which makes cassava once more an interesting crop for the rural poor.</p>
GH	IE	10 (a)	PROJ	OPER	BENE	<p>It has been agreed that the Ministry of Food and Agriculture and IFAD:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>in the design of a second phase of the RTIP, will include procedures so field staff can systematically ascertain the views of poor farmers, using participatory approaches for the analysis of their constraints and the potential and ranking of their priorities. These procedures will be developed in harmony with the work of the research and extension linkage committees in each region.</li> </ul>	<p>The RTIP will organize some 200 farmer field fora to provide opportunities for an exchange of knowledge and experiences between local farmers and researchers facilitated by agricultural extension officers. They will meet regularly (every one-four weeks) throughout the crop cycle. This will provide good opportunities to monitor developments in the villages and the need for support interventions and research.</p>
GH	IE	10 (b)	PROJ	OPER	ADV	<p>It has been agreed that the Ministry of Food and Agriculture:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>in the second phase of the RTIP and other, similar poverty reduction efforts, will identify and rank research topics for</li> </ul>	<p>In order to reach poor rural women, the RTIP will focus on access to appropriate small-scale root and tuber processing equipment. Together with marketing and other training, this is</p>

CO	EV	No.	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Actions	PMD Follow-Up Action
						inclusion on research agendas using, among others, the following criteria: (a) the prevalence of the constraint or opportunity to be addressed among relatively poorer farmers; (b) the type and level of benefits expected to be accrued; (c) the way benefits would be accrued; and (d) to whom the benefits would accrue.	expected to have a major impact on the livelihoods of these women.
GH	IE	10 (c)	PROJ	OPER	LCLCAP	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>in the second phase of the RTIP and other, similar poverty reduction efforts, will prepare training courses and materials to transfer knowledge, including research results, according to the priorities ranked highest by poorer farmers, with due regard to larger technical and policy issues.</li> </ul>	The RTIP will set up 14 good practice centres to be used as demonstration centres to show solid practices in small-scale root and tuber processing. Exposure visits of (groups) of root and tuber farmers and processors, especially women, will be organized to learn about good standards, equipment, processing techniques, the lay out of the workplace, marketing, (potential) markets, hygiene, packaging, quality control, costing and pricing, business management, etc.
GH	IE	11 (a)	PROJ	OPER	ADV	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>prior to the formulation of a second phase of the RTIP, will analyse the financial and economic costs of the multiplication and dissemination system created through the RTIP.</li> </ul>	Study undertaken, but the final results are not yet available.
GH	IE	11 (b)	PROJ	OPER	ADV	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>in the implementation of the second phase of the RTIP and other, similar efforts, will analyse how more closely to match the varieties selected for dissemination to farmers and locations, taking into consideration: (a) the needs and preferences of the farmers who are targeted; (b) the storage and processing options; (c) the absorption capacity of local markets; and (d) alternatives to local marketing.</li> </ul>	Under the RTIP farmer field fora, will be used as the main mechanism for the participatory screening of new varieties.
GH	IE	12	PROJ	OPER	LCLCAP	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>prior to the formulation of a second phase of the RTIP, will commission a study to compare the relative costs and benefits per farmer beneficiary of farmer field schools versus normal extension service practices at the district level;</li> <li>IFAD, in the formulation of the second phase of RTIP, will include a rationale and strategy for the transfer of knowledge on root and tuber crops to farmers via training and other means that include the total number and type of farmers to be targeted, the amount and level of knowledge to be transferred, the timeframe, the human and financial resources required and the expected benefits.</li> </ul>	The study is available and shows that farmer field schools are more expensive. The formulation team prepared a new approach (farmer field fora) that also uses secondary and tertiary multipliers and that is significantly cheaper than the farmer field school approach. About 14 000 farmers would be trained in the 350 farmer field fora (180 fora for cassava, 70 for yams, 100 for sweet potatoes); these farmers would be trained in soil fertility, planting material multiplication, integrated pest management, crop husbandry issues and improved storage techniques; at least 350 secondary farmers would receive additional training as facilitators of farmer field fora.
GH	IE	13	PROJ	OPER	PRIV	<p>It has been agreed that the Ministry of Food and Agriculture, IFAD and the Government of Ghana:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>in the design and implementation of the second phase of the RTIP, will identify and make available increased amounts of expertise and resources for investments to develop the</li> </ul>	The part of the budget to be used for processing and marketing has been increased from 45% at formulation to 48% at appraisal.

CO	EV	No.	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Actions	PMD Follow-Up Action
						processing and marketing of root and tuber crops in Ghana.	
GH	IE	14	PROJ	OPER	ADV	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>in the design and implementation of the second phase of the RTIP, will require the appointment of at least one senior social scientist among the programme coordination office staff. This person will be made responsible for ensuring that the programme addresses issues of targeting, the research priority setting and post-production issues, as well as the needed improvements in M&amp;E and impact assessment.</li> </ul>	<p>See GH 6.</p> <p>Under the RTIP, the programme coordination office will have two specialists in the area of business development, while at the zonal office there will be a root and tuber commodity-chain linkages officer. With regard to M&amp;E, the programme coordination office will have an M&amp;E specialist at the office, while the zonal office coordinator will also be involved in M&amp;E.</p> <p>Detailed targeting strategies have been developed.</p> <p>A budget is available to contract a technical service provider for permanent evaluation of the programme (e.g., a university).</p>
GH	IE	15	PROJ	OPER	ADV	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>will establish zonal offices.</li> </ul>	The programme will establish three zonal offices in: (a) Tamale; (b) Koforidua; and (c) Kumasi. These offices will be supervised by and receive technical backstopping from the programme coordination office. Each zonal team will comprise two technical officers.
GH	IE	16	PROJ	OPER	ADV	<p>It has been agreed that the Ministry of Food and Agriculture:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>IFAD and the Ministry of Finance and Economic Planning will discuss with the formulation team of the second phase of the RTIP the arrangements about the function and location of the financial controller of the RTIP, as well as other ways to improve the design of financial management practices and the proposal of concrete measures to improve financial management practices in the RTIP's next phase.</li> </ul>	The appraisal report stipulates that the financial controller in the programme coordination office should be based in Kumasi.
GH	IE	17	PROJ	OPER	M&E	<p>It has been agreed that the Ministry of Food and Agriculture, IFAD and the Government of Ghana, in the design of RTIP Phase II:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>would foresee actions to improve RTIP M&amp;E and its contribution to programme management, including linkages with regional M&amp;E officers and the strengthening of regional staff and facilities to fulfil RTIP support functions.</li> </ul>	See GH 7.
GH	IE	18	PROJ	OPER	ADV	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>will seek to place more emphasis on soil fertility and seek to form stronger links between producers and researchers on the area of soil fertility and other areas of major concern to poor producers.</li> </ul>	The RTIP includes a soil fertility subcomponent relying on farmer field fora.
GH	IE	19	PROJ	OPER	PRIV	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>will study possible areas for private sector involvement in the production of planting material. It will also make explicit provisions for helping tertiary farmers to access the improved materials produced by secondary multipliers.</li> </ul>	Under the RTIP, a business development approach with the market-based distribution of planting materials will be adopted.
GH	IE	20	PROJ	OPER	ADV	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>will significantly increase the resources and attention dedicated to root and tuber crops other than cassava.</li> </ul>	Provisions are made for poor groups to start the multiplication of planting material.

CO	EV	No.	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Actions	PMD Follow-Up Action
GN	IE	1 (a)	PROJ	OPER	TRGT	The mission recommends that the project area be reduced in order to improve actual coverage. It supports the recommendation already made by the Mid-Term Review mission to refocus project activities on the ten rural development communities (two in each of the original project districts) selected according to their conditions and the concentration of activities. This approach would allow a continued presence in all original prefectures, while increasing the emphasis on training and closer monitoring in certain more well targeted zones.	Due to (still) existing pockets of poverty in the area covered by the first phase, the area covered by the new project has remained relatively the same. However, project activities are concentrated in the prefectures and rural development communities in which roads were rehabilitated during the first phase. With improved access in the project area resulting from the road rehabilitation, the monitoring of project activities will be facilitated (which was not the case during the first project), as well as the organization of meetings among the peasants, thereby improving experience sharing.
GN	IE	1 (b)	PROJ	OPER	ADV	It also recommends that interventions be refocused on the original agricultural objectives so as to make the roadwork investments profitable.	
GN	IE	1 (c)	PROJ	OPER	TRGT	The authorities want the future project to be refocused not only on a geographical basis, but also to take into account the increased access from the production zones (the valley bottoms) toward the main roads. Such an approach would require that cofinancing be sought.	In view of the importance of this issue, IFAD will be discussing it with other donors, particularly the World Bank, which is financing a new project in the country (the National Infrastructure Programme, <i>Programme national d'infrastructure</i> ) and with which IFAD is cofinancing the Village Community Support Programme. Sustainable infrastructure financing will be provided through the rural development community.
GN	IE	2 (a)	PROJ	OPER	ADV	The actions in a second phase should focus on agriculture in order to maximize the benefits of the road infrastructure: the development of cereal banks, processing structures and the organization of production groups around agricultural activities, especially in the valley bottoms. Finally the adaptive research results could be disseminated.	The interventions of the second phase are indeed focused on agricultural development. In fact, the agricultural development and rural population capacity-building components account for 45% of the total project costs. Road rehabilitation will only be undertaken to link production zones and the rural development communities. During project implementation, actions aimed at agricultural development have been given high priority.
GN	IE	2 (b)	PROJ	OPER	NRM	With regard to the environment, the reforestation actions begun by charcoal-burners and their cooperatives in some locations – together with the media campaign – should be carried on rigorously and reinforced with supplementary activities to halt deforestation.	The reforestation actions started by charcoal and other cooperatives, as well as other actions aiming at protecting the environment, will be pursued in the second phase. This is clearly indicated in the second phase project document. During the start-up workshop and other workshops, this will be discussed and emphasized. The population will be sensitized to the environment issue at an early stage of implementation.
GN	IE	3 (a)	PROJ	OPER	SUST	There is no reason to plan additional infrastructure except for access roads to connect the valley bottoms to the road system built during the first phase. Emphasis should instead be placed on promoting ownership by the beneficiary populations so as to ensure maintenance and management of these new infrastructures.	No additional road rehabilitation has been planned in the project document of the second phase, except rehabilitation aimed at connecting the valley bottoms to the road system built during the first phase.
GN	IE	3 (b)	PROJ	OPER	SUST	Before planning rural infrastructure works for the second phase, the local financing situation for the maintenance of such works should be examined in depth in order to find a sustainable balance between investment and operation.	

CO	EV	No.	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Actions	PMD Follow-Up Action
GN	IE	3 (c)	PROJ	OPER	ADV	In order to refocus the project and bearing in mind IFAD's mandate and the specificity and practical reasons for training beneficiaries and monitoring activities, any new interventions not falling within the scope of the Ministry of Agriculture should be kept to a minimum.	See IE 2(a).
GN	IE	4 (a)	PROJ	OPER	ORG	A subsequent phase should include significant support for grass-roots institutions: farmer organizations, financial services associations and the rural development community.	Significant support is envisaged during the second phase for grass-roots organizations. These organizations will be developed and supported around an economic activity, and assistance will be provided so they can obtain proper legal status. During the implementation of the second phase, rural development community participation will be crucial. All this aims at ensuring sustainability. See also GN IE 1 (c).
GN	IE	4 (b)	PROJ	OPER	PRIV	During the programme phase, it should be kept in mind that farmer organizations are part of the private sector.	
GN	IE	4 (c)	PROJ	OPER	CRED	The financial services associations should begin to work towards becoming officially recognized financial institutions. What kind of steps should be taken so they can acquire an administrative and legal status allowing continued growth and broader geographic coverage, while still being considered as village banks?	
GN	IE	4 (d)	PROJ	OPER	DECNT	For the future, the project should aim at increasing rural development community participation in the organization and day-to-day management of activities. This would not only be effective in terms of strengthening project personnel, but it would also allow for the more effective, more consolidated training of local partners.	
GN	IE	5 (a)	PROJ	OPER	M&E	There is a need at all levels (the project, the Ministry of Agriculture, the Major Projects Control Authority, the Planning Ministry, the Economic Affairs and Finance Ministry, the UN Office for Project Services, IFAD and the Organization of the Petroleum Exporting Countries) to step up the monitoring of activities through much stricter budgetary control (approval of disbursements and the monitoring of withdrawal requests) and commitments (compliance with programme estimates) to avoid considerable unexpected overruns.	Will be taken up by the Phase II project.
GN	IE	5 (b)	PROJ	OPER	M&E	Regarding the involvement of the various financing partners and the cooperating institution, participation in a joint yearly monitoring mission would certainly make it possible to prevent situations such as those being experienced currently by the project; the participants would be able to decide together and immediately on ways to address any special situations that may arise.	The Phase II project is exclusively financed, which will expedite decision-making. The IFAD participation in supervision missions will provide the opportunity for joint review.
ID	CPE	1	CTRY	STRAT	PRIV	Ensure that the IFAD strategy to empower the poor includes efforts to raise farm and non-farm productivity in a sustainable manner.	The entire strategy of the Rural Empowerment for Agricultural Development Programme in Central Sulawesi (READ), Loan No. 645-ID, addresses this recommendation. Community empowerment investments are embedded within a rural



CO	EV	No.	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Actions	PMD Follow-Up Action
							<p>enterprise development component, thus linking social capital investments to opportunities for income increases and market-led investment choices.</p> <p>The design of the Post-Crisis Programme for Participatory Integrated Development in Rainfed Areas (PIDRA), Loan No. 539-ID Phase II, has inserted the community empowerment subcomponent within a sustainable livelihood development component to address the issue. The promotion of rural microenterprises, markets and other aspects of market linkages to capture benefits from production increases, such as rural infrastructure, market information and agro-processing, is an element of the design of Phase II. The strategic framework for COSOP development negotiated during the national consultations on the update of the performance-based allocation system for 2005 included all the CPE ACP recommendations, including this one, which will be an integral part of the future country strategy.</p>
ID	CPE	2	CTRY	OPER	KMGMT	<p>Increase the inputs devoted to knowledge generation, advocacy and policy dialogue. In this regard, attention should be paid to documenting what works; this would help carry the policy and advocacy dialogue forward. Moreover, it should rely on networking (both real and virtual) and experimentation on the ground as key instruments in knowledge generation.</p>	<p>Policy development support has been inserted within the READ programme's financing through a grant of USD 0.5 million to the Ministry of Agriculture. The grant will cover the establishment of an M&amp;E system that will integrate the M&amp;E systems of all IFAD projects and insert these, as well as the results and impact indicators that will be negotiated and included in the COSOP, within the country programme M&amp;E. This will enable the Ministry of Agriculture to attribute the impact of the IFAD financed projects in terms of their contributions to the PRSP targets. The main goal of this effort is to integrate the M&amp;E system of IFAD financed projects within the PRSP M&amp;E system and thus help the Government monitor its progress in achieving the Millennium Development Goals. The grant will also support the establishment of a national programme coordination office covering all IFAD financed projects and programmes and mandated with the task of producing country programme progress reports and sharing knowledge within the Government about the achievements under IFAD financed projects, as well as the lessons learned. It will also be in charge of communicating these with other partners and donors in support of the Government's replication efforts of successful models in poverty eradication identified through the experience gained through the IFAD financed activities.</p> <p>The Government has also requested IFAD's support in producing a replication manual for PIDRA, considering it the most</p>

CO	EV	No.	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Actions	PMD Follow-Up Action
							<p>successful model in eradicating poverty. The Government has already allocated its own resources for the replication in nine provinces. IFAD intends to support the development effort for a manual to ensure that knowledge is well documented and implementation arrangements, a key to success, are well described. In addition, IFAD intends to organize workshops and seminars aimed at sharing knowledge with other government agencies, NGOs and official development assistance partners on PIDRA. Finally, IFAD also intends to support the identification of financiers.</p> <p>Experimentation: grant to the Foundation for Development Cooperation to develop a model linking information technology, microfinance and remittances within the context of the poor communities of East Java covered by PIDRA.</p>
ID	CPE	3	CTRY	STRAT	PART	<p>IFAD and its partners should continue to establish and nourish strategic partnerships. First would come partnerships to find new and workable solutions to raising incomes and empowering the rural poor. Second would be partnerships to identify and introduce new ways of building the capacity of enablers for effective rural poverty reduction. And third would be an effort to enhance partnerships so as to provide an audience for new policies and ideas and tested poverty reduction projects in the rural economy. Such partnerships can be established with NGOs, community-based organizations and government agencies, as well as other aid agencies.</p>	<p>NGOs continue to be strong partners, particularly grass-roots NGOs such as SUARA, which supported IFAD in documenting, through videos and pictures, its design work with internally displaced persons in their camps after the Tsunami. This material was used by the Government to advocate for IFAD's approach to the recovery from the Tsunami within its task forces for the development of recovery strategy. IFAD's approach, key design concerns and the implementation arrangements for the Tsunami recovery have been fully internalized in the master plan of the Ministry of Agriculture and that of the National Development Planning Agency. International NGOs have come onto the scene through the Nusa Tenggara Association (Indonesia-Australia) and the Foundation for Development Cooperation (Australia), and, for Tsunami-related activities, Care International may come into the picture in the near future. Phase II of PIDRA will maintain the partnership with the NGOs of Phase I, improved through different contractual arrangements and accountability frameworks, as suggested in the CPE. The Asian Development Bank has requested that IFAD participate in the design of its Tsunami project, and IFAD has contributed by drafting the operational manual for the USD 300 million Earthquake and Tsunami Emergency Project, thus sharing the knowledge on community empowerment strategies and implementation arrangements learned through PIDRA and applied in the recently designed Aceh Recovery Programme developed in response to the Tsunami and as an adaptation of PIDRA. IFAD will look for additional areas of collaboration with the Asian Development Bank, such as joint development of respective COSOPs,</p>

CO	EV	No.	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Actions	PMD Follow-Up Action
							consultations on the performance-based allocation system, knowledge sharing, performance monitoring and policy dialogue, as well as the sharing of management systems and tools.
ID	CPE	4	PROJ	OPER	M&E	IFAD should provide greater support during implementation and secure better supervision and better M&E in the operations it supports. To capture the knowledge generated by learning, while also “doing” requires appropriate and participatory project M&E and more intensive implementation support. Similarly, log frames need to be revised and updated to help improve strategic management, and more attention must be given to outcome monitoring and impact evaluation.	Baseline surveys are regularly undertaken by PIDRA, as recommended by CPE, and will be undertaken for the Central Sulawesi programme and the East Kalimantan Local Communities Empowerment Programme. PIDRA experiences will be documented in the replication manual. RIMS integration is aimed at strengthening the entire M&E system; the regional grant for capacity building on RIMS will benefit PIDRA, the East Kalimantan programme and READ. The Income-Generating Project for Marginal Farmers and Landless, Phase III was not included in the projects for which RIMS implementation was mandatory since it will close in December 2005 in all provinces except Aceh and North Sumatra, where it will support Tsunami-affected communities in early livelihood rehabilitation until June 2007.
ID	CPE	5	CTRY	STRAT	ADV	IFAD and its partners should define objectives in its next COSOP for Indonesia in accordance with the resources that can be allocated. The COSOP should include a coherent hierarchy of objectives for both lending and non-lending operations and should be time bound. It should contain performance indicators to monitor the implementation of the strategy that will serve eventually to measure the performance and outcomes of the COSOP. The preparation of the COSOP should be based on a thorough analysis of the inputs, processes and activities required to achieve the objectives, as well as include a prioritization and a time plan for the delivery of the expected outputs.	Recommendations will be included in the next COSOP, and national consultations held on the occasion of strategic framework development for COSOP formulation have confirmed the intention of applying the recommendations. In particular, the COSOP will be integrated within the framework of the PRSP and the Government’s own medium term development strategy, with clear indicators of performance and success under the various policy change and results objectives jointly identified and agreed upon.
ID	CPE	6(a)	CTRY	STRAT	PART	The COSOP should articulate IFAD’s comparative advantage in Indonesia and its complementarities with other international financial institutions and UN agencies working in agriculture and rural development.	Will be addressed in the next COSOP and as integrated in the newly developed UN Development Assistance Framework.
ID	CPE	6(b)	CTRY	STRAT	TRGT	IFAD activities should also cover the rural poor in coastal areas who are engaged in agriculture and fisheries.	Addressed by the READ programme in Central Sulawesi, in part, PIDRA Phase II, the expansion of the Income-Generating Project for Marginal Farmers and Landless, Phase III in the Tsunami affected areas, and in the future COSOP.
ID	CPE	6(c)	CTRY	STRAT	TRGT	The Fund should allocate greater resources to agriculture so as to ensure increased productivity that would lead to increased income. Agriculture and off-farm economic activities should be given emphasis at least equal to that of social capital formation.	Addressed both by READ and PIDRA Phase II. COSOP will also cover this recommendation.
ID	CPE	6(d)	CTRY	OPER	INNOV	There is need to devote greater attention in IFAD operations to	Addressed by both READ and PIDRA Phase II.

CO	EV	No.	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Actions	PMD Follow-Up Action
						promoting pro-poor, low-cost technical change in on- and off-farm activities using local knowledge and as identified by the poor.	
ID	CPE	6(e)	CTRY	STRAT	NRM	Forestry and promoting access to forest lands should be included as part of IFAD's natural resource management agenda in the next COSOP.	Addressed by READ in Central Sulawesi (including and especially the policy development grant), PIDRA Phase II, the East Kalimantan Local Communities Empowerment Programme and the next COSOP.
ID	CPE	6(f)	CTRY	STRAT	ADV	IFAD's lending and non-lending (e.g., policy dialogue, research funded through grants, and knowledge management) activities should be linked in a mutually reinforcing and strategic manner.	Three country grants link experimental projects on the ground through a policy development window.
ID	CPE	7(a)	CTRY	STRAT	PLCY	IFAD should seek the contribution of national stakeholders to the identification of policy dialogue objectives and the commitment of these stakeholders to the achievement of these objectives during the next COSOP formulation. The next COSOP should consider policy dialogue as an integral dimension of IFAD activities in Indonesia. Policy dialogue activities should have measurable objectives, components, outputs, resource allocations and performance indicators.	Already addressed by the national consultations on COSOP formulation; based on the performance-based allocation system scoring and identification of key policy areas in which the Government sees the promotion of change as important, there is the opportunity to pilot test the policy change within IFAD financed projects and make it national policy if proven successful.
ID	CPE	7(b)	CTRY	STRAT	REPL	Resources need to be earmarked to identify, document and communicate local policy changes promoted in the context of IFAD operations that could have potential for scaling-up and replication at a higher level beyond the operation under consideration.	Will be addressed in the next COSOP.
ID	CPE	7(c)	CTRY	STRAT	PLCY	IFAD should improve its efforts in promoting dialogue among national stakeholders on policy changes identified in IFAD operations. In this regard, IFAD should strengthen its partnership with the National Development Planning Agency ( <i>Bappenas</i> ) in order to promote the discussion on policy issues of mutual concern with IFAD.	Addressed by the Policy Action Initiative Grant to the Ministry of Agriculture, within the READ Programme in Central Sulawesi, as requested by the National Development Planning Agency. Will be also addressed in the next COSOP.
ID	CPE	7(d)	CTRY	STRAT	PLCY	The Fund should review and intensify its engagement and participation in selected national and thematic policy dialogue fora on rural and agriculture development.	Will be addressed in the next COSOP.
ID	CPE	7(e)	CTRY	STRAT	PLCY	The preparation of the next Indonesia COSOP should be used as an opportunity for engaging the Government, the donor community and other national stakeholders in a policy dialogue on issues of pressing concern.	Already addressed within the national consultations on COSOP development. Will be further addressed during the COSOP drafting.
ID	CPE	8(a)	PROJ	OPER	PART	There is need to promote a stronger partnership between the Government and NGOs at the project level. This can be achieved, inter alia, through a clearer definition of the objectives, roles and responsibilities of NGOs in project design and implementation and clarity about the resources allocated and	See above comments on partnerships with NGOs.

CO	EV	No.	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Actions	PMD Follow-Up Action
						funding mechanisms among NGOs for implementation purposes.	
ID	CPE	8(b)	PROJ	OPER	PART	Priority should be given to working with committed NGO partners with a good track record and adequate institutional capacity. Moreover, NGOs should be entrusted with responsibilities commensurate with their capacities and outreach.	See above comments on partnerships with NGOs.
ID	CPE	8(c)	CTRY	OPER	PART	IFAD should proactively engage and intensify its cooperation and coordination with the Asian Development Bank, the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations, the UN Development Programme, the World Bank and other international development organizations in developing and implementing projects and programmes, policy dialogue, knowledge sharing and other activities.	Tsunami related activities have paved the way for the greater engagement of IFAD with other partners such as the Asian Development Bank. The World Food Programme will cofinance PIDRA, particularly in addressing malnutrition among children and lactating mothers, and would like to cofinance any IFAD activity in the Tsunami affected area. The Asian Development Bank has benefited from IFAD's knowledge as shared in the preparation of the operational manual of their Earthquake and Tsunami Emergency Project. The World Food Programme offered country office space. The World Bank offered the same, along with replication possibilities of successful IFAD projects. PIDRA would be the ideal candidate to experiment with the replication effort. The Netherlands would like also to cofinance the READ Programme. Care International expressed the same intention and would like to be an implementing partner or cofinancier (for which it has already obtained European Commission financial support for the READ Programme), support IFAD's project implementation and offer its services as cooperating institution. Many of these actions, however, will depend on management's approval and IFAD policies.
ID	CPE	9(a)	CTRY	STRAT	TRGT	Within a programme-oriented approach, there is need to focus on smaller geographic areas in future operations and ensure appropriate integration among different project sub-activities.	Addressed through Central Sulawesi and Tsunami related design activities.
ID	CPE	9(b)	PROJ	OPER	PART	The need to strengthen multi-stakeholder participation in project design and institute discussion fora (virtual and non-virtual) during design as a means to stimulate debate is important.	In the future, IFAD intends to experiment, with the next investment, a new design process whereby local design processes will be sanctioned by an IFAD mission and not the contrary, as the usual practice has been.
ID	CPE	10(a)	IFAD	OPER	SUPER	Better supervision in general is essential for improving implementation performance. In this regard, supervision (particularly of processes related to performance assessment and improvement, as well as learning) needs to be adapted to the evolving nature of IFAD operations. For this purpose, additional resources are required to enhance supervision quality.	Supervision and implementation support approaches and objectives will be inserted in the COSOP, with appropriate resource allocations.
ID	CPE	10 (b)	PROJ	OPER	SUPER	More use of local experts should be made for direct supervision and for supervision through cooperating institutions.	Will be implemented as of 2005 for direct supervision; for projects supervised by cooperating institutions, additional funds have been provided to the UN Office for Project Services for this purpose.

CO	EV	No.	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Actions	PMD Follow-Up Action
ID	CPE	10 (c)	PROJ	OPER	SUPER	Coordination, synergies and feedback between the IFAD-led implementation support activities and the supervision exercises should be clearly defined.	Implemented beginning in 2005.
ID	CPE	10(d)	CTRY	OPER	SUPER	There is a need to streamline and improve coordination, communication and follow-up among supervising institutions and agencies responsible for project audits.	The issue will be inserted in the COSOP to identify the appropriate mechanism to address the issue. Implemented beginning in 2005.
ID	CPE	11(a)	CTRY	STRAT	STAKE	In close cooperation with concerned stakeholders, including the Government and NGOs, the new COSOP should appropriately analyse and pay due attention to the issue of corruption in, inter alia, the selection of partner institutions and programme provinces/districts.	Will be included in the COSOP.
ID	CPE	11(b)	CTRY	OPER	STAKE	There is a need to establish a dialogue with national counterparts on ways to incorporate proactive and preventive anticorruption measures in all future projects and programmes.	The READ programme has inserted a communication policy and strategy, accepted by the Government, whereby all financial documents, from audit reports to bidding documents, etc., will be published and discussed in fora where the media, NGOs and broader civil society organizations will be present. Additional financial monitoring and strengthening mechanisms will be discussed during COSOP consultations.
ID	CPE	11(c)	CTRY	OPER	PART	It is recommended that NGO capacity be strengthened as partners who could play a greater role in monitoring and reporting on financial matters.	Already applied in PIDRA and the East Kalimantan Local Communities Empowerment Programme, this will be continued in new investments.
ID	CPE	11(d)	PROJ	OPER	STAKE	Provide more responsibility for the implementation and management of corresponding resources for community-based organizations as a means of combating corruption.	The Small Holders Livestock Rehabilitation Project was completed, and the IFAD loan closed three years ago. As a good indication of government ownership and an appropriate exit strategy, the project is still fully operational, using local resources of government and implementing the same activities through the same approach.  Among the activities promoted by the project, rural finance (for the purchase of cows) and the provision of extension and veterinary services to farmers and rural women have been adopted by the similar project financed by the US Agency for International Development in South, North and Mountain Lebanon.  The other recommendations are not applicable because the only two ongoing projects (due to close this year) deal exclusively with infrastructure (land reclamation, water harvesting and rural roads). It is unlikely that the Government of Lebanon would borrow from IFAD in the future.
LB	CE	1	PROJ	OPER	ORG	Where cooperatives are to be utilized in future IFAD supported projects, great care needs to be exercised in their selection, effective management and equity in the distribution of benefits to their members. When cooperatives are required to provide specific services, for example, milk collection, they should be established for this purpose only, and their charters should fully reflect the interests of their members, most of whom should be small milk producers. Membership also needs to be based on contributory shares, so that each member has a financial interest in the success of the cooperatives. In addition, such cooperatives need to have sufficient working capital so as to pay their producers on time, and they need exclusive collection areas, allocated on the basis of milk production density. The starting point for addressing the problem of marketing for small-scale milk producers is the promotion of the establishment of reliable milk collection cooperatives; only then may these milk collection cooperatives have a role.	
LB	CE	2	PROJ	OPER	GNDR	While the women's self-help cooperatives have demonstrated their ability to promote development activities and gender equality, they are still in the early stages of development and require longer term assistance to ensure they can "graduate" to	

CO	EV	No.	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Actions	PMD Follow-Up Action
						full independence. Lessons from this successful experience should be replicated where appropriate in the PN region and incorporated in respective IFAD country strategies.	
LB	CE	3	CTRY	OPER	PRIV	If the government wishes to encourage private sector activities in the provision of artificial insemination, then it needs to limit its role to regulating the service and ensuring that technicians are properly trained and work to industry standards. Equally, for vaccinations, the Government should regulate and control vaccine quality and type and identify and restrict itself to supplying only vaccinations as a public good.	
LB	CE	4	PROJ	OPER	CRED	In future projects, the credit needs of smallholders should be considered in the wider view of rural financial services, following IFAD's policy guidelines (which had not been developed at the time of the original design). Rather than place the emphasis on how quickly loans are provided and, ultimately, on how many loans are disbursed, emphasis should be placed on creating a system which, regardless of how gradual or how modest in terms of absolute loan numbers, has the potential to grow incrementally and to be self-perpetuating on the basis of the resources it generates. The mechanism also needs to be managed by the beneficiaries, so that they have the major responsibility for loan usage and repayments.	
LB	CE	5	PROJ	PLCY	CRED	In future, the design and implementation of credit systems need to avoid enforcing a particular economic activity. Project beneficiaries should have the freedom (within limits) to embark on economic activities that are consistent with market demand.	
LB	CE	6	PROJ	OPER	M&E	The more flexibility to be built into the design, the more emphasis needs to be given to ensuring the establishment of an effective, participatory M&E system, including adequate beneficiary assessment and feedback, as well as impact monitoring and assessment.	
LB	CE	7	PROJ	OPER	M&E	Changes in design during implementation need to be associated with careful assessment of coherence with project objectives and poverty targeting.	
LB	CE	8	IFAD	OPER	POST	Future IFAD and partner interventions in post-conflict situations should be speedily implemented so as to restore production and should be followed by consideration for the enhancement of continuous developmental impact and sustainability.	
NP	IE	1	CTRY	PLCY	NRM	The outstanding anomalies concerning the transfer and inheritance of entitlements to lease forest land, the recognition of individual leaseholders and the legal status of leasehold groups must be addressed. The definition of the legal status of leasehold	The leasing of land with degraded forest to poor households on 40-year renewable leases has been proven to provide poor households with security of tenure and the confidence to develop the land; this then enables these households to generate income

CO	EV	No.	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Actions	PMD Follow-Up Action
						groups under existing laws requires clarification. The process of granting leasehold certificates needs to be accelerated; the granting of leasehold certificates by district forest offices, when approved by Parliament, will address this concern. All these issues should be reflected in future policies and amendments of forestry laws.	and other benefits and so to move out of poverty. In terms of policy support, there is little risk; leasehold forestry for poverty reduction now has the highest possible priority in the PRSP. The Department of Forests has proposed addressing the main legal issues related to leasehold forestry through revisions to the Forest Act and associated rules; however, this initiative awaits the reinstatement of Parliament. Orientation training includes courses for forest and livestock officers, forest rangers, junior technicians and junior technical assistants, accountants and forest guards and covers policy, rules, regulations and procedures for leasehold forestry.
NP	IE	2	PROJ	OPER	ADV	Building a strong and effective project management structure is a priority. Any future technical assistance component should aim at this objective and be given very specific goals to be achieved over a precisely defined time period. The strengthening of the PMU should be a component of the future project.	The second phase design for the Leasehold Forestry and Livestock Programme has made leasehold forestry a simpler and more sustainable programme within the implementing capacity of government services and the programme management structure. International consultants may be hired from time to time through implementation support provided by IFAD. Furthermore, unallocated local consultancies or research contracts are to be awarded to appropriate institutions, e.g., the Nepal Agricultural Research and Development Fund, the Nepal Agricultural Research Council and universities, to address key issues. Because leasehold forestry is now a national priority programme, the Department of Forests is planning to establish a leasehold forestry division within the department, without increasing the number of department posts; there is no separate PMU.
NP	IE	3	PROJ	OPER	M&E	Strengthen the M&E functions at the project and district level. At the project level, a mix of smaller-size surveys, case studies and participatory analyses, with photographic documentation, should be conducted in two or three cycles over the life of the project. For surveys, it will be important to focus on key impact indicators, to be identified through multi-stakeholder consultations, and to keep questionnaires short. Equally important will be to train inter-groups and cooperatives to conduct self-evaluation workshops to be used as an input for M&E at the district level. The recently launched IFAD M&E Guide can be adopted as a useful reference for M&E planning.	In the Leasehold Forestry and Livestock Programme, the M&E is simple and cost effective, includes the standard financial reporting requirements of the Department of Forests and the Department of Livestock Services. In addition, the M&E system will focus on: (a) relevant indicators specified in the IFAD RIMS; (b) simple data from each leasehold group related to the functioning of the group, the development of their leasehold plots and savings and credit activities, and the performance of the livestock of the members during annual participatory impact assessments; (c) similar simple annual performance data from the village finance associations (VFAs); and (d) external assessments of poverty reduction at impact based on a baseline survey and two further assessments in PY3 and PY8.
NP	IE	4	CTRY	OPER	PART	Strengthen IFAD's policy dialogue with other donor agencies and support supervision. This is a fundamental element in the process of replication and the scaling-up of innovations such as	The project design for the Leasehold Forestry and Livestock Programme was discussed with the local donor group on forestry. A meeting was organized by the International Centre for



CO	EV	No.	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Actions	PMD Follow-Up Action
						<p>leasehold forestry. First, IFAD and the Government should consider organizing a roundtable meeting with other donor agencies before the end of the year 2003 to initiate a process aiming at reducing tension and improving collaboration between proponents of leasehold forestry and community forestry approaches. Second, in its future interventions, IFAD should include an interagency dialogue component to improve awareness among other development agencies active in Nepal about the Fund's activities and results. In particular, IFAD should consider the appointment of a local facilitator in charge of maintaining dialogue with all the partners concerned, including the donor community.</p>	<p>Integrated Mountain Development, the German Agency for Technical Cooperation, Swiss Development Cooperation and the Regional Community Forestry Training Centre, with the participation of the Ministry of Forests and staff from the Leasehold Forestry and Livestock Programme, in January 2005. It specifically discussed learning on leasehold forestry and community forestry. In 2004, a national workshop was convened by the Society for Partners in Development and the Ministry of Forests and Soil Conservation that drew attention to gender issues and, particularly, the gender impact of leasehold forestry. More generally, IFAD has also been supporting policy advocacy workshops on issues related to the PRSP, including a major workshop convened jointly by the National Planning Commission and Support Activities for Poor Producers (a major national NGO) that drew attention to upland areas in the formulation of the PRSP and to the importance of NGOs as service providers. In the Leasehold Forestry and Livestock Programme, interagency coordination is simplified because the number of implementing agencies has been reduced from four to two. Coordination mechanisms used successfully during the Hills Leasehold Forestry and Forage Development Project have been strengthened from the field level to the central level. In terms of coordination at the national level, the programme will finance the costs of: (a) meetings of the programme coordination committee whenever necessary, but at least once annually, three working group meetings a year and an annual planning workshop and (b) the cost of six monthly coordination meetings in each of the five development regions and five annual regional review and planning workshops. At the district level, the district forest coordination committee and associated working group coordinate all forestry sector activities, including those of the programme. With reference to plans for a local facilitator, given the fluidity of the conflict situation, IFAD will stay engaged with the country on a timely and relevant basis through a number of reviews and assessments pertaining to the fragile context. There is a core team of persons with whom the country programme manager consults with regard to these reviews, and there is also the International Centre for Integrated Mountain Development technical assistance grant coordinator, who is to provide implementation support to IFAD projects in the region and who, because the coordinator is based in Nepal, can flag issues of importance.</p>

CO	EV	No.	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Actions	PMD Follow-Up Action
NP	IE	5	PROJ	OPER	TRGT	<p>The identification of potential leasehold household clusters is to be conducted simultaneously with the selection of appropriate leasehold sites. Poor household clusters and hamlets should be identified in consultation with the concerned communities according to a mutually agreed wealth-ranking system, with government staff and NGOs acting as facilitators. Relevant experience in wealth-ranking and community mapping in other programmes should be taken into consideration. The focus on clusters and hamlets will contribute to reduced project unit costs, lay the groundwork for the federation of groups into inter-groups and leasehold cooperatives and help reduce conflicts. It is not appropriate first to identify suitable sites and then to look for individual households to join the groups and manage the land.</p>	<p>The planning exercise involves four steps. First, an analysis of district maps and statistics can give an indication upon which an initial list can be prepared of potential target village development committees (e.g., excluding those in the mountains and the Terai region). Second, within the potential target committees, the use of simple mapping techniques can help identify areas of degraded forest covering at least 10 ha and located within 3 km of the nearest community in 16 programme districts. Third, a district-level planning exercise organized by the district forest office and assisted by the district livestock services office, chaired by the district development committee, will prioritize and select target village development committees, with the participation of those normally attending the district coordination committee and including representatives of the village development committees that are the most obvious candidates for leasehold forestry. Fourth, within priority village development committees, the next step is to identify the priority target sites and communities for leasehold forestry group formation. Wherever possible all households of a particular community will be included (i.e., there is sufficient land and virtually all inhabitants are poor). If there is insufficient land or if significant numbers of households are too wealthy to qualify, wealth-ranking exercises (e.g., based on household food security) will be carried out to determine in a participatory way which households to include. Under such circumstance and so as to avoid conflicts with those in the community who will not be included in the leasehold forestry groups, the district forest office should form community forestry user groups in the same community as part of a coordinated approach to forest management. Once the target sites and the communities have been identified, leasehold forestry groups will be identified. As leasehold groups have been formed in all 22 districts, there will be opportunities to strengthen existing clusters by forming new groups in the same locality provided that the community concerned is overwhelmingly poor, thereby enabling the inclusion of all households without violating the targeting criteria. Site- and community-specific group identification will be undertaken by the forest rangers.</p>
NP	IE	6	PROJ	OPER	LCLCAP	<p>All leasehold groups should be progressively evolved into inter-groups, and the creation of cooperatives should be actively encouraged through training and support. Cooperatives require training in leadership, management, bookkeeping, savings and</p>	<p>The leasehold groups will evolve into VFAs. VFA facilitators, assisted by rural finance officers and the M&amp;E officer, will provide most of the training and advice to the leasehold groups regarding the formation and operation of a VFA. The non-formal</p>

CO	EV	No.	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Actions	PMD Follow-Up Action
						credit activities. NGO services should be used to facilitate the creation of and strengthen inter-groups and cooperatives. Training by NGOs should be complemented with technical modules provided by government field staff. The ultimate goal should be the federation of groups at the national level through an apex organization.	training courses provided to the VFAs will cover: (a) orientation; (b) office-holder training; (c) loan management; (d) accounts closing; and (d) advanced loan management. One VFA facilitator can support 5-10 VFAs simultaneously depending on whether the district has adequate roads. As the assistance and supervision of the rural financial institutions service provider winds down, the association, if it borrows from external sources, will receive ongoing technical assistance and oversight from that institution.
NP	IE	7	PROJ	OPER	LCLCAP	<b>Provide training for project field staff, group promoters and livestock promoters.</b> This is in response to the need for group and livestock promoters and project field staff to improve their community mobilization, facilitation and gender sensitization skills. NGOs should be selected as training providers, while government field staff may complement them with ad hoc technical training modules.	The programme will hire service provider/s (social mobilization service provider/s) to supply women group promoters, who will be the main agents of social mobilization. The promoters will build links between the groups and communities and the district forest office and other line agencies, assist in the monitoring of leasehold plots, help illiterate group members gain access to adult literacy training furnished by other programmes and help future leasehold group members without citizenship documents acquire the necessary certificates. The number of promoters required increases from 88 in PY1 to a maximum of 154 in PY3-6. The number of leasehold groups per group promoter will average less than 20 during the first six years and increase to 23 in PY7, before declining to 21 in PY8. A promoter will provide intensive support to a group for up to three years, after which time occasional support may continue for a maximum of another two years. After the end of the programme period, the leasehold groups will no longer require the services of the women group promoters and the employment of the promoters by the programme will be discontinued. Group capacity building by the promoters will cover decision-making procedures, meeting management, record keeping and linking the groups to form VFAs. Each leasehold group will elect a chairperson, a secretary and a treasurer who will receive training in leadership, record keeping and accounting.
NP	IE	8	PROJ	OPER	GNDR	The participation of women and disadvantaged groups requires more active promotion. This can be achieved through the provision of appropriate sensitization training to all project staff, as well as to members of communities where leasehold forestry is introduced. The transfer of the lease from men to women should be encouraged in cases where the men leasehold group members are inactive.	The Leasehold Forestry and Livestock Programme will mainstream gender among the leasehold groups and service providers. The approach will include: (a) employing promoters who are women; (b) issuing leasehold certificates to the groups that include the names of the wives, as well as the names of the husbands, and involve opening joint savings and loan accounts in the names of the husband and wife; (c) including woman headed households as leaseholders; (d) providing land development training on site to a woman from each family, as well as to a man; (e) focusing on livestock for which women are usually responsible;

CO	EV	No.	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Actions	PMD Follow-Up Action
							(f) training women to become village livestock assistants who can work on a fee-for-service basis; (g) including gender awareness training for forestry and livestock staff and leaseholders; and (h) where appropriate, disaggregating the monitoring indicators in the logframe by gender.
NP	IE	9	PROJ	OPER	ADV	Review the effectiveness of livestock promotion packages (buffaloes and goats).	To use fodder to boost the incomes of the leasehold groups and so reduce the poverty of the groups, the programme will provide all eligible member households with two mature female goats vaccinated (against the peste des petites ruminantes) and drenched. The programme will also supply one buck (also vaccinated and drenched) to each of the qualifying leasehold groups. One member of the group will assume responsibility for the management of the buck and will receive some compensation from the other group members, e.g., service fees (in cash or in kind). Every year, the leasehold groups will exchange or replace the buck to avoid inbreeding.
NP	IE	10	PROJ	OPER	LCLCAP	Training programmes should focus on practical techniques and information.	Leasehold farmers (men and women) will receive on-site non-formal training to enable them to develop fully the leasehold forest and benefit from its productive capacity; the training will include at least one full day on gender awareness. Other non-formal training will include farmer study visits (within the district) and forest management training. Group prizes will be awarded every year in every district in a competition to reward the best and second-best leasehold forestry group. Formal training for farmers will comprise one nursery management course per district per year.
NP	IE	11	PROJ	OPER	ADV	Income-generating activities other than livestock rearing and the sale of forage and forage seeds should not be overemphasized in the early stages of the project. The demand for training should precede the provision of training, and the preferences of group members should be respected.	The Leasehold Forestry and Livestock Programme focuses the provision of inputs on the rapid development of primarily livestock-based income-generating activities. Poor farmers prefer goat keeping, because: (a) it requires low investment, low risk and little space; (b) goats can be stall fed; (c) most farmers are familiar with goat production; (d) there is a rapid return; and (e) there is a large demand for goats, which is often met by imports from India, and goats can be trekked to market even from remote areas.
NP	IE	12	PROJ	OPER	CRED	Avoid subsidized and user-unfriendly credit programmes. Subsidized credit schemes have proved unsustainable and have often failed to reach the poor. The first goal of a microfinance component should be to support the creation of sustainable village organizations (such as inter-groups and cooperatives) that mobilize savings. If providing credit, they should be allowed to apply interest rates sufficient to cover operating and financial	VFAs will largely follow the cooperative structure with regard to the rights and responsibilities of the annual general meeting, the board and management. The joint husband-wife accounts will continue. Interest on savings will be credited quarterly to the accounts. Within the former savings and credit groups, members will provide mutual guarantees for loans from the VFA. The VFAs will appoint staff paid through a performance-related

CO	EV	No.	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Actions	PMD Follow-Up Action
						costs, loan loss provision and a margin of profit.	remuneration system and gradually diversify the financial products, especially with regard to deposit mobilization and the accessibility of deposits. Each VFA will operate a double entry accounting system, make loan loss provisions and have their accounts audited by an external auditor. Staff will be appointed by the VFAs, and the VFA members will continue to make regular monthly savings at a rate to be agreed by the membership. Members will be able to access up to 50% of their accumulated savings (but not the time deposit from the goat pledges) once per annum at the financial year-end, commencing after the deposits from the goat distribution scheme have been received. Members who fail to honour their goat pledge will be unable to borrow from the VFA, but will not forfeit their savings. Interest on the savings and time deposit (6% per year) will be calculated and credited annually and will be available for withdrawal thereafter. The term-deposits made from the goat grants are an innovative internal financing mechanism for the VFAs.
NP	IE	13	PROJ	OPER	CRED	Future projects should emphasize the collection of savings among members in groups, inter-groups and cooperatives with possible linkages to external microfinance institutions (if applicable). Existing savings schemes based on rotating savings associations should be encouraged and developed into inter-groups and cooperatives.	In the Leasehold Forestry and Livestock Programme, the rural financial services component of the programme is savings based, and the programme will not provide a line of credit. The programme will support the leasehold groups in the establishment of savings and credit activities and subsequently help the groups establish and then support the development of VFAs, previously known as leasehold cooperatives. However, where suitable financial institutions already exist, leasehold members will be encouraged to become members rather than start a new institution. The VFAs will only access external funds when their lending activities can no longer be financed from the savings mobilized and they meet the eligibility criteria of financing agencies such as the Nepal Rastra Bank Rural Self-Reliance Fund or the Rural Microfinance Development Centre. These agencies have adequate funds available and appropriate lending procedures, including regular oversight of their borrowers.
NP	IE	14	PROJ	OPER	ADV	Funds granted for community development require clearer objectives.	In the Leasehold Forestry and Livestock Programme, village infrastructure was not included. Village-level infrastructure was not included for two reasons. First, during the Hills Leasehold Forestry and Forage Development Project, infrastructure investments were included to provide some benefits to those households in the village that were not members of the leasehold groups. The investments were really aimed at buying their cooperation. Under the new programme, the focus is on poor

CO	EV	No.	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Actions	PMD Follow-Up Action
							communities, and the intention is that virtually all members would be members of leasehold groups; therefore, such investments were no longer necessary. Second, it was felt that the Department of Forests is not the appropriate agency to handle village-level infrastructure, and programme implementation and coordination would have been complicated by the inclusion of a third implementing agency.
NP	IE	15	PROJ	OPER	ADV	Public schools should be chosen to serve as the focal point for project activities.	The programme design team did not think this was a practical recommendation.
PE	TE	1	IFAD	OPER	M&E	Continued analysis and evaluation of innovative experiences: It is recommended that the results obtained through the Development of the Puno-Cusco Corridor Project and the new Marketing Strengthening and Livelihood Diversification in the Southern Highlands Project (Sierra Sur) be closely observed and that the elements presented in this TE be defined, revised, corrected, or complemented on the basis of continued observations. There should be ongoing evaluation of innovative experiences, with appropriate procedures for doing so.	The Sierra Sur project will be closely observed as activities are initiated immediately after starting operations.
PE	TE	2	IFAD	OPER	ORG	Rural development projects in the Andean highlands and projects implemented in similar contexts should consider the strengthening of families, organizations and, especially, communities as vital.	This process begun with the Management of Natural Resources in the Southern Highlands Project; the Puno-Cusco Corridor Project is continuing the process, and the Ministry of Agriculture would apply the methodology of the former project as rural policy.
PE	TE	3	IFAD	STRAT	LCLCAP	It is recommended that future projects in the region continue to introduce mechanisms for the transfer of decision-making power to communities and families.	This is the methodology applied in designing new operations in Andean countries. The Sierra Sur project will apply it after the project start-up. The launching workshop will be in May or June 2005.
PE	TE	4	IFAD	STRAT	ADV	It is recommended that, if future IFAD interventions in the region include a component for the strengthening of technical-assistance-service markets, they should start by evaluating: (a) the existence of a demand for technical services that can be met on local markets; (b) the level of producer awareness of a demand for such services; (c) the willingness of users to invest additional funds; (d) the usefulness of competitive systems in allocating resources with a view to promoting local investment; and (e) the importance of the role played by organizations as intermediaries between projects and beneficiaries.	The development of a local service market is successfully evolving through the Puno-Cusco Corridor Project.  The Promotion of Technology Transfer to Peasant Communities in the Highlands Project (closed December 1999) was the first project to apply the methodology of directly transferring funds to be managed by users.  Applied in the Management of Natural Resources in the Southern Highlands, the Puno-Cusco Corridor and the Sierra Sur projects.
PE	TE	5	IFAD	OPER	PRIV	It is recommended that projects incorporate flexible approaches and methodologies and function as instruments for public investment that facilitate private initiatives. Projects should have small implementation units that focus on stimulating processes and creating a normative framework designed to ensure	The methodology started with the Promotion of Technology Transfer to Peasant Communities in the Highlands Project, after its proven success, has been applied on the Management of Natural Resources in the Southern Highlands, the Puno-Cusco Corridor and the Sierra Sur projects.

CO	EV	No.	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Actions	PMD Follow-Up Action
						contractual compliance, while avoiding offering services directly.	
PE	TE	6 (a)	IFAD	OPER	KMGMT	The innovations proposed should have a prior “validation” and seek legitimacy in the degree of acceptance and adoption by beneficiaries. In this regard, families and communities, with their strategies, aspirations and expectations, should hold a central place in project proposals.	Applying the lessons learned from previous projects, one develops new project designs through thematic public consultation workshops. The possible project users (beneficiaries), initiatives and ideas are covered in the final document.
PE	TE	6 (b)	IFAD	OPER	BENE	The recognition of communities and small farmers as partners in dialogue and not simply as beneficiaries is essential for the consolidation and sustainability of interventions. Communities see IFAD’s proposals as an important contribution inasmuch as the Fund’s presence means that the control of the process lies in the hands of the small farmers and their organizations.	Applying the lessons learned from previous projects, one develops new project designs through thematic public consultation workshops. The possible project users (beneficiaries), initiatives and ideas are included in the final document.
PE	TE	7	IFAD	OPER	STAKE	Project designs should be based on an open process of consultation with all stakeholders; consultation with the beneficiaries is essential for the introduction of innovations. The staff of project implementation units should be selected through competition and receive support for the introduction of innovations. In addition, the presence of IFAD in the country should be encouraged, as it fosters the adoption of innovations.	All these good practices are being introduced in the design and implementation of all projects.
PE	TE	8	IFAD	OPER	ADV	<p><i>In synthesis, the following methodologies and tools are recommended:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• the transfer of financial incentives in amounts adequate for the levels of activity of the beneficiaries, together with the power to decide how such resources are to be spent;</li> <li>• competition systems;</li> <li>• demand planning processes and the definition of priorities by user organizations;</li> <li>• practical training and the stimulation of contact among peers;</li> <li>• the incorporation of social entities that should act as intermediaries (associations, communities, etc.);</li> <li>• the delegation to beneficiaries of responsibilities for decision-making and the definition of rules;</li> <li>• flexibility, allowing the incorporation of beneficiary requests and suggestions as to how to proceed;</li> <li>• respect for the local culture and the incorporation of the culture into the processes that are to be galvanized;</li> <li>• the use of contracts in relations between users and projects;</li> <li>• the transfer of funds through a formal financial system;</li> <li>• the requirement of a counterpart contribution from the beneficiaries; and</li> </ul>	<p>All these tools were used in the design of the Management of Natural Resources in the Southern Highlands, the Puno-Cusco Corridor and the Sierra Sur projects. They are foreseen for the design of every new operation.</p> <p>These recommendations will be included in the first supervision mission to Sierra Sur project (cooperating institution, December 2005 approximately).</p> <p>These recommendations shall be included by the project development team for the new initiative in Peru (15 May 2005).</p>

CO	EV	No.	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Actions	PMD Follow-Up Action
						<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>an increase in the flow of information, with a resulting impact in terms of reducing transaction costs and expanding the supply of services.</li> </ul>	
PI	TE	1	IFAD	STRAT	PLCY	<p>There is need for PI to articulate in its regional and country strategies a clear commitment to the topic under consideration. In addition, it will only be possible to translate this commitment through an adequate allocation of resources at the regional, country and local level.</p>	<p>The regional strategy for Asia and the Pacific has assigned priority to the development and dissemination of sustainable or regenerative agricultural technologies uniquely suited to the complex and diversified agricultural systems of less favoured areas. It also specifically mentions that support will be provided for the development of water management techniques that can improve use efficiency and conservation technologies based on indigenous knowledge.</p> <p>More emphasis will be given to this aspect in the update to the regional strategy in 2005/06 in formulating new COSOPs and in the design of new projects.</p> <p>In regional grant-funded projects for technology development and dissemination that are being implemented by international centres such as the International Rice Research Institute (on upland rice), the International Centre for Integrated Mountain Development (on technologies for upland areas in the Hindu Kush Himalayan region) and the Centre for International Forestry Research (on forestry), the promotion and utilization of local knowledge and innovations have been emphasized.</p>
PI	TE	2	IFAD	STRAT	KMGMT	<p>Recognizing the primacy of local knowledge systems in project design is the first step towards promoting these systems. This means that the process of knowledge generation and use must be clear spelled out in project design. In this context, a shift from “problem solving” mode to “augmenting solutions” has been suggested. This shift would also imply that there are already existing solutions that can be augmented. In this regard, a key element in project design is to build a “knowledge generation phase” into the project cycle.</p>	<p>New projects have started to recognize and emphasize the value of local knowledge systems. For example, in the Livelihoods Improvement Project in the Himalayas in India, an important element of the project’s gender strategy will be to introduce both indigenous and mechanized technologies that will improve efficiency and reduce the workload of women.</p>
PI	TE	3	IFAD	OPER	KMGMT	<p>Concerns relating to the use and promotion of local knowledge must also be translated into essential facilitation processes in project design, and this should be reviewed and monitored regularly. In larger projects, the development and systematization of appropriate facilitation processes are important. Furthermore, sensitizing project facilitators and managers on the relevance of local knowledge systems and building their capabilities is the foundation upon which the participatory processes for the generation of new knowledge is built. Similarly, experimentation</p>	<p>Sensitizing project managers and staff about the relevance of indigenous and local knowledge systems is a challenging proposition, given the general perception about the superiority of externally introduced technologies. Through work with scientists involved in national research systems and extension officials, efforts will be made to sensitize all stakeholders on this crucial aspect.</p>



CO	EV	No.	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Actions	PMD Follow-Up Action
						and validation through experience are key to the adoption and development of local knowledge systems. External ideas and solutions should also go through such a process of validation. Processes relating to documentation and communication strategies that help in the sharing of knowledge and innovations among communities are important elements in these facilitation processes.	
PI	TE	4	IFAD	OPER	KMGMT	<p>The actual utilization and practice of a solution is the ultimate test of validation for local knowledge. An appropriate timeframe is therefore critical for such a validation process to take place in communities. The following elements are suggested for inclusion in project design and implementation for the promotion and development of local knowledge and innovation:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• provision for an intensive knowledge generation phase;</li> <li>• provision of resources for experimentation by communities and innovators and the generation of experience;</li> <li>• back-up for formal science establishments;</li> <li>• reward systems for successful innovators and facilitators;</li> <li>• venture capital as an instrument in promoting local innovations, particularly for those solutions that have enterprise potential;</li> <li>• capacity building among project managers and facilitators; and</li> <li>• inputs to communities and specific innovators in terms of interaction with formal science establishments and exposure visits to other 'successful' communities.</li> </ul>	The Livelihoods Improvement Project in India has made a provision for a social venture capital company with broadbased capability of promoting business development and will provide equity funding to companies and individuals interested in establishing enterprises.
PI	TE	5	IFAD	STRAT	BENE	Participatory management needs to be much more well addressed in all projects. In fact, there is a need to develop a comprehensive framework on participation, where participation is considered a partnership among key stakeholders and includes, among other aspects, the provision of adequate time and budget to build participation and capacity building to promote and monitor the participation of people. Participation should be viewed and practiced as a continuous process built into all stages of the project cycle.	Apart from the use of participatory rural appraisal exercises, which has become a standard practice to solicit the participation of farmers and beneficiaries in project design and group formation, the Asia Division pilot tested participatory impact monitoring methods in Viet Nam, Cambodia, India and Bangladesh in the recent past. There is a need to integrate similar participatory mechanisms into the new RIMS methodology of impact monitoring.
PI	TE	6 (a)	IFAD	OPER	ORG	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Existing informal and formal organizations should be taken into account before new organizations are promoted.</li> </ul>	When new projects are designed, existing formal and informal organizations are considered before new organizations are proposed. In many projects, self-help groups have formed the basis for other social initiatives such as campaigns against alcoholism, female infanticide, etc. A regional grant-funded project being implemented by the Centre for Integrated Rural
PI	TE	6 (b)	IFAD	STRAT	ORG	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Self-help groups should be used as a basic social foundation to organize other groups, such as user groups, functional groups, livelihood groups, etc. They also form the basis for constituting management bodies, such as village</li> </ul>	

CO	EV	No.	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Actions	PMD Follow-Up Action
						organizations and project committees.	Development in Asia and the Pacific and the Asian NGO Network is documenting the experience of IFAD projects and those of others in promoting organizations of the rural poor (primarily self-help groups) with a view to sharing experience and preparing a resource book to facilitate training in new IFAD projects for capacity building.
PI	TE	6 (c)	IFAD	OPER	ORG	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Community-based organizations should be involved in management and ownership.</li> </ul>	
PI	TE	6 (d)	IFAD	OPER	KMGMT	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>A forum for scouting, learning and sharing is required at the appropriate levels among different partners.</li> </ul>	
PI	TE	6 (e)	IFAD	STRAT	TRGT	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Empowerment of the poorest of the poor, such as agricultural workers, rural persons with disabilities, woman-headed households, etc., into separate self-help groups, and federating them at the village level through village organizations.</li> </ul>	
PI	TE	7	IFAD	OPER	ORG	The flow of funds and decision-making: The evaluation recommends that innovative solutions be found by the Fund to transfer the resources directly to local communities, which would allow them to control the finances and consequently have a greater say in the choice of technologies and development approaches promoted in the projects.	A number of projects in the region have introduced the concept of community development funds to enhance the role of communities in decision-making with respect to the use of project funds. For example, in the Decentralized Programme for Rural Poverty Reduction in Ha Giang and Quang Binh in Viet Nam approved in 2004, it is estimated that well over 50% of the total programme funding will be under the direct control of target communities. This flexibility will be achieved through the establishment of highly flexible local development budgets under the direct control of target communities. In the Rural Income Diversification Project, Tuyen Quang, Viet Nam, a women's livelihood fund has been established to implement activities that women have identified as improving their living conditions. The necessary training is also provided to women through this fund.
PI	TE	8	IFAD	STRAT	LCLCAP	The use of a contributory approach and mechanisms for corpus and revolving funds. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Project funds should be directly released to community-based organizations for the implementation of the development works in which they have a managerial role. Only then do their active participation in the programme and their empowerment truly become possible. This should become a formal requirement in project and programme design.</li> </ul>	Under the Rural Income Diversification Project, Tuyen Quang, described above, a village infrastructure development fund has been established so that project communes can finance village schemes such as the upgrading of small irrigation projects, the construction of small bridges, etc. The villagers are responsible for deciding how their funds are to be used, and at least 80% of poor households are required to participate in reaching such decisions.
PI	TE	9	IFAD	OPER	KMGMT	<b>Process-oriented implementation with a focus on building peoples' institutions and human resource development.</b> Process-oriented implementation is required for the sustainability of a development that would also foster the emergence of local knowledge and innovations. In this regard, the following are selected aspects that need to be addressed on a priority basis in future projects and programmes.	In 2003/04, PI prepared its agricultural grant strategy, which has identified measures to make technology development more participatory and based on local and indigenous knowledge. It recognizes that, even in participatory research, the dominant members of the community may easily monopolize the process. Researchers must therefore devise innovative approaches to reach and work with the poorest people in order to address the highly

CO	EV	No.	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Actions	PMD Follow-Up Action
						<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Building peoples' institutions to manage projects. The projects should become self-managed peoples' movements in which government participates, not a government programme executed for the benefit of the people.</li> <li>• The primary focus should be on human resource development through capacity building among institutions established for the purpose and among all agencies implementing the programme.</li> <li>• Operational flexibility should be fostered in running the projects, keeping in view that normal departmental rules and norms militate against this flexibility. While a strategy can be top down, the tactics for implementation must be bottom up.</li> <li>• Technology should be demystified through participatory local technological development and the avoidance of high-cost, sophisticated technologies.</li> <li>• Projects with platforms for participatory development should be used to promote convergence by all line and technical departments, as well as other service providers.</li> </ul> <p>The scientific establishment should recognize their social responsibility and make their research relevant to the needs of the communities. Development administrators should enhance their expertise in managing a multidisciplinary creative endeavour instead of administering rigid rules and guidelines. An intensive capacity building process among project designers, managers and facilitators is required. This capacity building process needs to be separate and occur previous to the main implementation process.</p>	specific needs of these people. This implies that the research establishment should form partnerships with local organizations and relevant support groups (such as NGOs or farmer networks) in order to capitalize on the respective contributions of these organizations and groups. This grant strategy will guide IFAD's work on agricultural research in the region, in collaboration with international and national research systems.
PI	TE	10	IFAD	OPER	ADV	<p><b>Operational flexibilities for technology options and modifications.</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• the documentation of technological options, including local and exogenous solutions;</li> <li>• the orientation of the community towards unknown options through exposure visits to successful example sites;</li> <li>• the selection of technological options and their placement;</li> <li>• the preparation and scrutiny of selected proposals in a participatory manner based on agreed parameters;</li> <li>• the preparation of designs and evaluations of proposed structures and measures following close scrutiny;</li> <li>• the technical certification of the designs and evaluations of the agreed proposals;</li> <li>• the consolidation of proposals into an annual action plan;</li> <li>• the facilitation of the social approval of the consolidated</li> </ul>	In the new grant-funded projects such as those on upland rice (being implemented by the International Rice Research Institute) and mountain-specific technologies (being implemented by the International Centre for Integrated Mountain Development), efforts will be made to follow similar steps to promote the integration of local knowledge in the development of appropriate technologies for small scale producers.

CO	EV	No.	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Actions	PMD Follow-Up Action
						annual action plans; and <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>administrative and financial approval of the action plans.</li> </ul>	
PI	TE	11	IFAD	OPER	M&E	Process indicators are largely absent in M&E. Even if it is not considered feasible to redesign the entire system of M&E for ongoing projects, it may be useful to introduce process indicators into the monitoring systems and evaluation procedures.	As mentioned above, PI has pilot-tested innovative methods of participatory impact monitoring and assessment in selected projects in Bangladesh, Cambodia, India and Viet Nam. Such a process has been institutionalized in some projects. For example, in the Rural Income Diversification Project, Tuyen Quang, Viet Nam, each year, the village development board, supported by community organizers, assesses the impact of the project. The challenge is to mainstream these participatory approaches in a cost-effective manner and to integrate them in the new RIMS framework of impact monitoring.
SN	CPE	1	IFAD	PLCY	TRGT	Enhance the performance of the project as an instrument of development and enhance the effectiveness of action vis-à-vis the rural population.	The COSOP provides for the strengthening of the project as an instrument for effective <b>targeted</b> action in rural poverty alleviation not in isolation, but within a coherent country programme approach, where complementarities and synergies among different projects are optimized. The impact will then be enhanced through strengthened project M&E systems and the setting up of an overall country programme M&E system, increased coordination and reinforced implementation support. Supervision arrangements with the West African Development Bank are being reviewed in order to concentrate the bank's supervision responsibilities to fiduciary aspects, while untrusting the methodological and technical backstopping to specialized partners. The upcoming, albeit delayed recruitment of the field presence officer is part of the preparations for the improved and proximate follow-up of the overall programme, as well as individual projects.
SN	CPE	2	CTRY	OPER	EXIT	<b>Institutional setting and disengagement strategy.</b> The respective roles of PMUs, operators, economic actors and local organizations need to be revisited and more well defined in order to adopt, without further delay, an approach that includes the planned disengagement from the projects. By transferring the function of the PMUs to contracted operators, the <i>faire-faire</i> approach represents a step in this direction. But the time has come to provide greater support for initiatives and for activities directed and driven by sustainable local actors (rural communities, farmer organizations, local undertakings). PMUs need to have an explicit exit strategy, and operators should not view their role as permanent, inasmuch as the purpose of the interventions is to create operational autonomy among	As per the CPE and COSOP recommendations, a wide stakeholders consultation was started in 2004 so that IFAD and its partners could jointly develop a harmonized institutional framework for intervention at the local, regional and national levels. The document resulting from this process was endorsed during a workshop in September 2004. The proposed approach entails: (a) strongly anchoring projects within the existing institutional environment so as to be coherent with the country's political, legal and institutional framework and prepare and empower those structures and players that are to be responsible for certain functions actually to take on those responsibilities by the time the projects are over; (b) clarify the role and responsibilities of the different players at the various

CO	EV	No.	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Actions	PMD Follow-Up Action
						farmer organizations and local actors.	<p>territorial levels by building on their mandates and defining the necessary accompanying measures to be provided by PMUs; and (c) harmonize modes of project intervention in order to strengthen the internal coherence and increase the efficiency of IFAD programmes, thereby ensuring that the most pertinent institutional approaches become general.</p> <p>The approach is based on the principles of flexibility in adapting to changes in external circumstances and fostering the sustainability and complementarity of project actions, subsidiarity and clear and upfront project exit strategies.</p> <p>Hence, whenever a consultation mechanism or arena exists at the local level, projects should anchor structures rather than create new artificial structures bound to end with the project. For all productive activities, IFAD projects should collaborate with fora of farmer organizations that already exist at the local (Local Consultative Mechanisms for Farmer Organizations, <i>Cadres locaux de concertation des organisations paysannes</i>) and regional (Regional Consultative Mechanisms for Farmer Organizations, <i>Cadres régionaux de concertation des organisations paysannes</i>) levels.</p> <p>A first study was carried out and then discussed during a workshop in September 2004, with the participation of central and local government representatives, farmer organizations, IFAD financed projects and other donors (the European Union, the World Bank, the West African Development Bank, the German Agency for Technical Cooperation). A formal "agreement statement" was issued that entails the preparation of an implementation plan for the agreed framework and that requires the development of an individual plan of action for each IFAD project so as to adapt the project <i>modus operandi</i> to the agreed framework. These plans are currently being designed with the support of IFAD and should be finalized by May 2005. Once validated, their implementation should begin shortly thereafter.</p>
SN	CPE	3	CTRY	OPER	M&E	<p>Strengthening the PMU strategic guidance tools is crucial to ensuring flexibility and autonomy in management:</p> <p>M&amp;E, especially of effects and impacts, should occupy a central position and should be part of a participatory framework (including tools for self-evaluation by farmer organizations). The strategic project guidance should be geared towards and driven by impact monitoring.</p> <p>A surveillance function is necessary in order to foresee and</p>	<p>A diagnostic study of the M&amp;E systems in IFAD ongoing projects was carried out in November -December 2004, including a look at the compatibility of current systems and RIMS requirements. A plan of action was designed to strengthen the overall M&amp;E function; it is to be financed through a small country grant.</p> <p>Final arrangements for implementation are pending, awaiting agreement on the global country programme M&amp;E system currently being designed, as per the CPE recommendation, which</p>

CO	EV	No.	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Actions	PMD Follow-Up Action
						prepare for major institutional, economic and social changes (e.g., the groundnut production chain). A common programme of M&E support, training and advice for all projects under the programme, based on IFAD's M&E guidelines, will be carried out during 2004.	will provide for clear direction in terms of the information requirements to be supplied by individual project M&E systems. Full implementation of the action plan is to begin late 2005. A regional technical assistance grant to strengthen M&E is also under development.
SN	CPE	4	CTRY	OPER	ORG	The roles of the rural community authorities (village development committees and rural councils) and the professional groups (economic interest groups, cooperatives, federations of farmer organizations) complement each other, but must be clearly defined. Failure to distinguish among these categories poses potential risks to the organizations and to their members.	This was set as the highest priority in the COSOP with the objective of enhancing the efficiency and impact of IFAD in the country, increasing IFAD visibility and providing for pragmatic areas of harmonization and policy dialogue (e.g., the level of contribution of the population, the level of project staff salary) favouring local entrepreneurs). This is being addressed in detail for every type of structure in the institutional framework of all ongoing projects and is being systematically included in the design of new projects.
SN	CPE	5	IFAD	OPER	ORG	In all cases, the projects should acknowledge and promote the autonomy of farmer organizations and the sustainability of the networks of relationships of these organizations. They should work to ensure that farmer organizations are not simply outgrowths of the projects, foster horizontal exchanges and local federative processes along functional lines and encourage independent and direct relations with economic actors and local services. The Ministry of Agriculture and Water Resources should organize a workshop bringing together all actors in the field with a view to gaining a better understanding of the place and role of each actor. The strengthening of the relationships between farmer organizations and the services that provide advice and support for agricultural innovation is necessary to make these relationships more effective and more operational. In this area, the procedures used by local projects should be harmonized with those defined by national programmes such as the National Agricultural Services and Producer Organizations Programme ( <i>Programme des services agricoles et des organisations de producteurs</i> , PSAOP). In particular, a single procedure should be set up along the lines of the local consultative mechanisms for farmer organizations as part of the national policy. Farmer organizations should create the conditions for their own autonomy in terms of resources.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Efforts at more effective, closer cooperation between project staff and official farmer organizations, albeit with some resistance, are ongoing.</li> <li>• Information and coordination meetings were held twice in 2004.</li> <li>• The implementation of the individual project plans of action for the implementation of the institutional framework will begin by the end of 2005.</li> </ul> <p>The workshop took place in September 2004</p> <p>A coherent salary scale was adopted in April 2005. The harmonization of the contribution of populations to investments within the IFAD country programme as a first step is part of the institutional framework principles; discussions are ongoing with other donors and the Government for overall harmonization.</p> <p>There are examples in several projects of farmer organizations that are able to mobilize contributions supplied by other sources (other donors, NGOs).</p>
SN	CPE	6	CTRY	OPER	TRGT	Project interventions should be <b>recentred on contiguous geographic areas</b> so as to avoid the dispersion that arises through village-based targeting and to create synergy and	The CPE recommendation is included in the institutional framework for ongoing projects and incorporated in the design of the recently approved Rural Microenterprise Project, Phase II

CO	EV	No.	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Actions	PMD Follow-Up Action
						economies of scale at the territorial level. If the village or grass-roots group is to remain the principal venue of action, <b>the rural community must be fully recognized as the area of intervention and planning for public service actions</b> (especially for infrastructure development).	( <i>Projet de développement de la micro-entreprise rurale, PROMER II</i> ).  (See above.)
SN	CPE	7	IFAD	OPER	STAKE	Within their areas of intervention (e.g., rural community, department), IFAD projects should intensify cooperation and coordination with other local development actors and projects. The search for local complementarity and collaboration should become systematic, beginning with the other projects financed by IFAD and the World Bank (PROMER, PSAOP, the National Rural Infrastructure Project); spatial overlapping will also be cultivated among these projects. The effort should include as well the various public and private operators and NGOs.	Foreseen in the institutional framework.  (See above.)
SN	CPE	8	CTRY	OPER	ORG	Projects should <b>encourage and facilitate autonomous interaction and collaboration between existing farmer organizations and their sustainable local partners, both public and private</b> . PMUs and operators should avoid becoming a surrogate for local service providers or setting up farmer organizations or cooperation networks where they already exist.	Meant here is a true cultural change in some instances, which obviously cannot be accomplished overnight. There is, however, the strong commitment within most projects and by the Government to move in this direction. Close follow-up and support (sometimes pressure) from IFAD will continue to be needed.  In the second phase of PROMER, the project will support the consolidation of private-sector service providers for non-financial business advisory services rather than having business advisors as part of the project staff, as was the case during the first phase of PROMER.
SN	CPE	9	CTRY	OPER	PRIV	Projects should play a <b>more active role in supporting initiatives to bring</b> producers and producer organizations <b>into the market</b> in the project area, in conjunction and synergy with the national programme to support the marketing of agricultural products currently in preparation.	PROMER II is aiming at creating the missing link between agricultural projects and the market, with emphasis on local, national and regional markets. The area covered by PROMER II has been extended to all zones of intervention of other IFAD projects in order to facilitate the building of complementarities and synergies in this area. The national marketing project under preparation by the World Bank is not targeting small producers or entrepreneurs and is geared more towards export markets. Exchanges of information and coordination are ongoing.
SN	CPE	10	CTRY	OPER	PRIV	At the local level, the projects should systematically promote the integration of small enterprises into structured subsectors upstream and downstream of agricultural activities with the dual objective of facilitating market access and enhancing local added value. PROMER and the local projects should reinforce their collaboration in this sphere.	This recommendation is one of the pillars of the COSOP. It was concretely translated as an important objective of PROMER II, which is to promote the local development approach. In addition, the second project foreseen within the COSOP (2006) is specifically geared at supporting market access through a product production and marketing chain approach.

CO	EV	No.	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Actions	PMD Follow-Up Action
SN	CPE	11	CTRY	OPER	ADV	The regulatory framework and project procurement procedures should be adjusted with an eye to promoting local preference in tenders, while respecting the need for competitive products from a price and quality standpoint.	This is a specific recommendation included in the institutional framework to be implemented in the project action plans.
SN	CPE	12	CTRY	OPER	CRED	Similarly, local microfinance institutions should be encouraged to form networks. These institutions need urgently to become more professional so as to make them attractive and trustworthy to banks. Banks and networks need to establish closer ties for the better articulation of their respective roles. Such support to institutional development can be provided immediately by the projects through appropriate protocols with the local microfinance institutions. The timeliness of a national programme to develop rural financial services with support from IFAD should be examined within the COSOP framework.	This issue was specifically addressed in the COSOP. Given the complexity of the issue and the number of stakeholders (more than 700 local microfinance institutions currently operating in Senegal), there was general consensus that IFAD did not have a comparative advantage in leading such a national programme. However, in order to address the constraints faced by ongoing projects, a technical assistance component was built into the new PROMER to serve all projects in the country programme. This rural finance support unit will concentrate on facilitating contacts and cooperation between: (a) the local microfinance institutions and the projects so as to ensure that the project target groups have access to financial services and (b) the target population (small farmers and entrepreneurs) and the local microfinance institutions so as to help adapt the financial products supplied by the institutions to the actual needs of smallholders. The management of the rural finance support unit will be contracted out to a specialized agency, the UN Capital Development Fund regional window based in Dakar.
SN	CPE	13	CTRY	OPER	BENE	Farmer participation rates need to be adapted to the capacity of beneficiaries and harmonized across national programmes and projects.	See above. It was agreed within the institutional framework that the rate of contribution be harmonized at the level of the country programme. However, discussions continue with the Government and other donors in order to ensure further harmonization with other development partners.
SN	CPE	14 (a)	CTRY	STRAT	EXIT	IFAD's programme in Senegal should be structured around a few key operating principles that apply to all projects: <i>Planned disengagement.</i> The project structure is temporary. One of the priorities should thus be to work towards establishing autonomous, sustainable relationships between farmer organizations and their permanent development partners.	These are the principles set in the COSOP and endorsed by the Government and other stakeholders.
SN	CPE	14 (b)	CTRY	OPER	STAKE	<i>The concept of local development.</i> Projects should explore spaces for complementarity and synergy with other stakeholders – public services, private operators, NGOs – working in the same geographic areas.	These are the principles set in the COSOP and endorsed by the Government and other stakeholders.
SN	CPE	14 (c)	CTRY	OPER	PART	<i>Local and global linkages.</i> By drawing on well-formed partnerships, the strategies of projects and of farmer organizations should overlap in the respective spheres.	These are the principles set in the COSOP and endorsed by the Government and other stakeholders.
SN	CPE	15 (a)	CTRY	STRAT	PART	The projects can and should capitalize on their areas of complementarity, develop a common approach and equip	The role of the Field Presence Pilot Programme is essential in this set-up. However, due to delays in finalizing arrangements



CO	EV	No.	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Actions	PMD Follow-Up Action
						<p>themselves with the organizational means to enhance their interaction.</p> <p>With an eye to setting up a coherent, effective programme of cooperation, the following recommendations are made:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Organize a workshop for all IFAD projects, their partners and their line agencies so that they can formulate a strategic framework to serve as a platform for the programme and to define modalities for work in common.</li> </ul>	with the UN Development Programme for the housing of the individual, the position will become operational this year (2005).
SN	CPE	15 (b)	CTRY	OPER	PART	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Hold regular meetings with partners on topics of common interest and create a dynamic of partnership.</li> </ul>	COSOP validation workshop (December 2003) and institutional framework validation workshop (September 2004).
SN	CPE	15 (c)	CTRY	OPER	KMGMT	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Set up a mechanism to ensure supervision and tap achievements and the lessons learned, promote cross-project relationships and foster dialogue among national partners, IFAD and other donors and lenders.</li> </ul>	IFAD has joined the donors thematic group on rural development and food security ( where the COSOP was presented in February 2004) and donors thematic group on microfinance. (IFAD participated in the recent meeting and presented the rural finance support unit.)
SN	CPE	16 (a)	CTRY	OPER	FIELD	<p>The evaluation recommends the implementation of a small monitoring and coordination unit for the IFAD programme in Senegal, to be located under the Ministry of Agriculture and Water Resources. The unit would have four functions:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Facilitate interaction among all projects in the programme and organize regular meetings on topics of common interest, bringing together the officers in charge of the IFAD financed projects, the officers responsible for other national programmes that are directly complementary and the representatives of line agencies, IFAD and the IFAD cooperating institutions.</li> </ul>	<p>See above. The Field Presence Pilot Programme representative is a crucial and indispensable element of the strategy and is awaited. The representative will be organizing regular thematic and coordination meetings with the IFAD country programme implementation team.</p> <p>The Ministry of Agriculture and Water Resources nominated an IFAD focal point in September 2004. This focal point is coordinating the work on the design of a country programme M&amp;E system, which will be managed by the ministry's Department of Analysis, Planning and Statistics.</p>
SN	CPE	16 (b)	CTRY	OPER	ADV	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Serve as the chair for all the steering committees of IFAD projects under the aegis of the Ministry of Agriculture and Water Resources and serve as the sole point of liaison with the chairpersons of the steering committees of projects under other ministries.</li> </ul>	<p>The steering committee of PROMER includes all other IFAD project directors.</p> <p>The focal point of the Ministry of Agriculture and Water Resources is now presiding over all IFAD project steering committees.</p>
SN	CPE	16 (c)	CTRY	OPER	PART	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Facilitate project relations and the relations of the programme overall with national and international partners active in the agricultural and rural sector.</li> </ul>	<p>Capitalization of the Complementary Groundnut Producers Support Programme experience that has been jointly carried out with farmer organizations (the National Council for the Dialogue and Cooperation of Rural People, <i>Conseil national de concertation et de coopération des ruraux</i>), which will lead the related dissemination and promotion effort.</p> <p>Collaboration with the Fidafrique West and Central Africa Network on Rural Development and Poverty Reduction for the capitalization of project experiences with farmer organizations.</p>

CO	EV	No.	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Actions	PMD Follow-Up Action
							<p>A related article will be published in a specialized French-language review.</p> <p>IFAD is to participate in and support the farmer organization pre-forum of Dakar Agricole conference. Farmer organizations from around the world convened in order to make specific recommendations to inform decision-makers and feed into the discussion at the formal Dakar Agricole conference.</p> <p>IFAD was present at the highest level and highly visible at the Dakar Agricole in February 2005, lead by the head of state, President Wade, and in the presence of eight other heads of state, including President Jacques Chirac of France and President Obasandjo of Nigeria.</p>
SN	CPE	16 (d)	N/R	OPER	M&E	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Monitor, evaluate and capitalize on the achievements and lessons learned under the programme and provide input for a joint reflection on the effectiveness of collaboration, the validity of the shared objectives and the pertinence of the methods. This function would call for the presence of one or two highly qualified officers, and it would enable the programme to equip itself with a single unit for monitoring impact, for critical reflection and for policy dialogue with the line ministries and with other development partners.</li> </ul>	See SN CPE 3.
SN	CPE	16 (e)	CTRY	STRAT	M&E	The new COSOP should set specific targets, expressed in terms of figures and dates, for the Senegal-IFAD cooperation programme and should contain performance indicators as well.	Quantifiable targets and a time bound programme of work are included in the COSOP. It is further foreseen jointly to review implementation progress at mid-term in 2006.
SN	CPE	16 (f)	CTRY	STRAT	BENE	A steering committee should be set up immediately for the preparation of the COSOP and should include the various national partners, particularly farmer and women's organizations, local authorities and the ministries. A national workshop to discuss and validate the COSOP should be organized before the end of 2003.	A steering committee with representatives of farmer organizations was set up for the preparation of the COSOP. After a series of drafts, a final version, including the point of view of farmer organizations, was presented and endorsed at a workshop held in December 2003.
SN	CPE	17	CTRY	STRAT	FIELD	A more frequent presence of the IFAD programme officer in the country is also necessary. Options should be explored during the preparation of the COSOP and the pilot programme to strengthen IFAD's presence in the field.	The Field Presence Pilot Programme is designed to respond fully to these preoccupations. However, because of budgetary and other difficulties, the recruitment for the programme has been delayed to mid-2005.
SN	CPE	18 (a)	CTRY	STRAT	PLCY	The COSOP should embody the strategic framework for cooperation between Senegal and IFAD, the joint result of close cooperation among all stakeholders. This framework for Senegal-IFAD cooperation should be squarely framed within the PRSP, the agricultural sector policy and the recommendations of the programme evaluation validation workshop.	See above.
SN	CPE	18 (b)	CTRY	OPER	M&E	The new COSOP should set specific targets, expressed in terms	See above.

CO	EV	No.	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Actions	PMD Follow-Up Action
						of figures and dates, for the Senegal-IFAD cooperation programme and should contain performance indicators as well..	
SN	CPE	18 (c)	CTRY	OPER	STAKE	A steering committee should be set up immediately for preparation of the COSOP and should include the various national partners, particularly farmer and women's organizations, local authorities and the ministries. A national workshop to discuss and endorse the COSOP should be organized before the end of 2003.	After a participatory process for the development of the COSOP that gave IFAD significant visibility and allowed it to build and strengthen partnerships, particularly with farmer organizations and other donors, the timing has been fully respected, with country validation in December 2003 and approval by the IFAD Executive Board in April 2004.
SN	CPE	19	CTRY	OPER	ADV	In the local sphere, work should concentrate on successfully completing the four operations under way in the Groundnut Basin and in the Matam region. In the Groundnut Basin, the achievements and lessons learned under the Complementary Groundnut Producers Support Programme should be integrated into the Village Organization and Management Project, the Diourbel agroforestry project (the Agroforestry Project to Combat Desertification) and the Village Management and Development Project.	The Agricultural Development Project in Matam, Phase II was launched in May 2004. PROMER II was approved by the IFAD Executive Board in April 2005. To ensure a smooth transition between Phase I and II, the Government is financing, through its own resources, a small management team. Implementation of the second phase should begin in October 2005. The Complementary Groundnut Producers Support Programme is being evaluated with a view to mainstream its approach to all projects, with the support of official farmer organizations (the National Council for the Dialogue and Cooperation of Rural People) once sceptical about the pertinence of the approach.
SN	CPE	20	CTRY	STRAT	REPL	In the short and medium term, new loans should support cross-cutting projects or programmes that are national in scope, complementary and linked to existing local projects, beginning with the second stage of PROMER at the national level.	PROMER II is one of the important steps towards the integration of the country programme activities from a thematic as well as geographic angle. (From four regions in Phase I, PROMER II will be covering four additional regions where the area-based projects are operating.)
SN	CPE	21	CTRY	STRAT	CRED	The COSOP should examine the advisability of a national programme to develop rural financial services with support from IFAD in partnership with other stakeholders in the sector.	See above.
SN	CPE	22	CTRY	STRAT	DECNT	With regard to possible second phases of the National Rural Infrastructure Project and PSAOP, the COSOP should assess the value added that could be provided by IFAD cofinancing, as compared with external support in the form of strengthened coordination and cooperation at the local level.	IFAD was invited by the National Council for the Dialogue and Cooperation of Rural People to participate in the self-evaluation they are currently carrying out in the framework of the end of the PSAOP first phase. IFAD awaits the recommendations of the evaluation of two consultants it is financing to examine the opportunities for an eventual IFAD cofinancing of the second phase with the World Bank. As indicated in the CPE, however, collaboration with PSAOP, albeit necessary, might be more efficient outside the actual project and through more effective and closer collaboration between IFAD ongoing projects and PSAOP.  The National Rural Infrastructure Project is now going to become an all-encompassing National Programme of Local Development (cost: USD 300 million) covering not only

CO	EV	No.	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Actions	PMD Follow-Up Action
							decentralized rural development, but also social safety nets, health and education. There are no incentives for IFAD to be involved in this large programme, but it will be essential for IFAD to ensure harmonization with local development approaches.
TN	CPE	1	CTRY	STRAT	BENE	The new IFAD strategy will define a participatory approach to best define the status of rural poverty, the means of subsistence and the expectations of the most vulnerable target groups, together with the support they feel they need in order to participate in a process of sustainable local development in agricultural and non-agricultural areas. The approach will bring together other local stakeholders such as social and trade associations, decentralized administrations, banks and NGOs, especially in defining specific forms of support.	A more participatory and livelihoods-based approach is being adopted in the preparation and implementation of new and ongoing projects.
TN	CPE	2	CTRY	STRAT	INNOV	IFAD and the Government will clearly define innovation objectives in the next country strategy. They will also define the mechanisms for capitalizing upon and disseminating the results of the new, experimental approaches at the central level. These mechanisms will be based on a better understanding of the institutional environment and better M&E systems created to facilitate the realization of these experimental approaches and the capitalization of the methods used and results obtained.	<p>Areas of innovation and potential replication:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• the management of communal resources (Agropastoral Development and Local Initiatives Promotion Programme for the South-East), for which the institutional framework and monitoring system are currently being developed;</li> <li>• Support for rural enterprise development in the agriculture and non-agriculture sector to stimulate the rural economy and provide economic development opportunities to both women and men. This was piloted to a limited extent in the context of the Integrated Agricultural Development Programme-Siliana, and it is expected to be expanded in the second phase of the programme.</li> <li>• Community organization and empowerment represent a process that involves two levels, a territorial level linked to the sources of community livelihoods and an administrative level linked to economic planning and decision-making. These issues are addressed in the ongoing portfolio and require a learning management function to capitalize on field experiences. This function is addressed through the action-research on the empowerment of the rural poor in a volatile policy environment.</li> </ul>
TN	CPE	3	PROJ	STRAT	TRGT	IFAD and the Government will focus the new strategy on raising incomes among target groups and enhancing the full, available agricultural and non-agricultural potential. In coordination with local stakeholders, they will adopt principles designed to guarantee the flexibility of future interventions and the adaptation of these interventions to local conditions and strategies as outlined above. In formulating each future project,	

CO	EV	No.	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Actions	PMD Follow-Up Action
						IFAD and the Government will undertake a survey to review and pinpoint the strategies and expectations of people in the target area, especially the most vulnerable. They will identify the constraints and opportunities for job and income-generation in all sectors and, in coordination with local stakeholders, will suggest the most appropriate forms of intervention. This survey will be extended to all areas reached through IFAD cofinanced projects so as to identify complementary actions to incorporate this strategy orientation into ongoing projects.	
TN	CPE	4	PROJ	OPER	PRIV	In the formulation of each new project, IFAD and the Government will specifically review the promotion of local initiatives within the zone of intervention and the main stumbling-blocks for rural entrepreneurs in accessing financing and support measures for setting up and implementing projects. The review will also constitute the basis for the design of a support framework for income-generating activities. IFAD and the Government will jointly review with local stakeholders whether or not to develop other support measures for local initiatives and, if so, how.	The inception of the second phase of the Integrated Agricultural Development Programme-Siliana has listed the constraints to the development of local initiatives and proposed a number of options, particularly on the issue of financing. In the ongoing projects, attempts are being made to ensure stronger support for entrepreneurship, with coordinated planning and implementation with vocational training centres, banks and NGOs. This is the subject of two NGO grants in the Agropastoral Development and Local Initiatives Promotion Programme for the South-East and NGO project collaboration financed through the loan proceeds in the Integrated Agricultural Development Programme-Siliana and Zaghouan.
TN	CPE	5	PROJ	OPER	PART	IFAD and the Government will define the new strategy and, to a greater extent, the mechanisms to allow future projects to develop cooperation and partnerships with local stakeholders, strengthen sectoral and trade associations and gain insight into markets, identifying the most promising marketing opportunities. They will look at the conditions and mechanisms needed to involve local development councils in the process of devising, implementing and monitoring local development strategies.	This is actively pursued in the ongoing Agropastoral Development and Local Initiatives Promotion Programme for the South-East, the implementation of which is premised on this wider partnership and coordination and consultation mechanisms. Management practices within the Regional Commission for Agricultural Development have yet to evolve to more firmly support such collaboration.
TN	CPE	6	CTRY	STRAT	PLCY	In preparing the new strategy, IFAD and the Government will define the best institutional arrangements for boosting the participation of local stakeholders, developing local and regional coordination and partnerships and ensuring the capitalization of the new approaches at the national level based on an in-depth institutional review.	This issue has also been raised in the conception of phase two of the Integrated Agricultural Development Programme-Siliana. It nonetheless poses a challenge to the Ministry of Agriculture: is it the most appropriate lead implementation agency to facilitate such collaboration?
TN	CPE	7	PROJ	OPER	STAKE	IFAD and the Government will define the process and outline the broad picture of project formulation so as to ensure full participation by local stakeholders and the best possible adaptation to local conditions. This will include a framework for intervention and a description of the methods and means of intervention.	
TN	CPE	8	CTRY	STRAT	TRGT	In the context of the new country strategy, IFAD, in	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Ongoing projects have specific entrepreneurship activities</li> </ul>

CO	EV	No.	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Actions	PMD Follow-Up Action
						collaboration with the Government and other partners, will devise measures designed to enhance the integration and preparedness of women and young people.	targeted to this socio-economic group. Projects are also taking steps to make these activities relevant and economically viable. This starts with adequate assessment of the needs of youth, their household context and the economic potential available. The Integrated Agricultural Development Programme-Siliana is being trained in this methodology, with assistance from a gender consultant. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The pipeline project phase two of the Integrated Agricultural Development Programme-Siliana) is to address this point as one of its main strategic objectives.</li> </ul>
TN	CPE	9	PROJ	OPER	SUPER	In their future strategy, IFAD and the Government will specifically define the implementation support measures necessary for the new approaches planned for the future projects. IFAD and the Government will include the resources needed to backstop national project implementation capabilities. IFAD will further ensure an appropriate programme of supervision and monitoring for each project and a contribution to support project execution. Specifically, IFAD, in accordance with the cooperating institution, will provide a detailed description of the ground to be covered by supervision, including the methodology and the technical issues, as well as the frequency and duration of supervisory missions.	On an operational aspect, IFAD and the Government are coming to the following agreement: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>IFAD loans should also be complemented by grants either from IFAD, or from other donor agencies to provide the required training and technical assistance;</li> <li>the implementation support and consultancy missions are planned and agreed between the Ministry of Agriculture and IFAD on an annual basis so that the necessary follow-up on the recommendations of these missions can take place.</li> </ul>
VE	IE	1	PROJ	OPER	ADV	It is recommended that the position of the technical teams of the project executing unit be confirmed until completion of the project and beyond, in the event of a transition to a second phase.	At present, the project executing unit teams will remain fully operational, continuing until the transition to the second phase of the project is reached. The teams actively participated in the formulation of Prosalafa II.
VE	IE	2	PROJ	OPER	M&E	For the purposes of closing off the project properly or formulating a second phase, it is extremely important that the M&E unit be fully operational and carry out several activities that are still unfinished. It is especially recommended that the M&E unit be kept fully functioning to complete the project monitoring and impact evaluation reports and to complete the studies that will serve as inputs for the formulation of a second phase, as well as the conceptual inputs for the formulation of future projects in the country. In particular, the preparation of an updated baseline study would be extremely useful for the second phase of Prosalafa.	The M&E unit is fully operational and is in charge of coordinating the aspects related to the evaluation of effects and impacts encountered in Prosalafa I, along with the preparation of an updated baseline study for Prosalafa II.
VE	IE	3	PROJ	OPER	ADV	It is recommended that the adaptation of efficient irrigation technology be extended during the period remaining up to the completion of the project and in any subsequent phase; this would provide the basis for a significant increase in the incomes	Work is being carried out in this area, and its continuation is being considered in Prosalafa II.

CO	EV	No.	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Actions	PMD Follow-Up Action
						of beneficiaries. In the case of ponds for animal watering and mixed use, it is important to consider an effective perimeter fence, as originally planned, so as to restrict access by animals to drinking ponds, prolong the useful life of the ponds and create an anti-parasite barrier.	
VE	IE	4	PROJ	OPER	ADV	It is recommended that the transfer of appropriate irrigation technology be enhanced in order to benefit from investments already made and extend the irrigated areas for production.	The work has aimed at the transfer of appropriate irrigation technology and its continuation is being considered in Prosalafa II.
VE	IE	5	PROJ	OPER	NRM	The project should have undertaken a series of tests to exploit the underground water beneath the beds of streams and rivers through shallow wells and filtration chambers. It is recommended that such experiments, albeit on a pilot basis, be made during the remainder of the project.	Due to high costs, the lack of credit resources and negative environmental impact, the drilling of deep and superficial wells was not implemented. Prosalafa II has considered more integral micro-watershed management, giving priority to the management and storage of surface running water.
VE	IE	6	PROJ	OPER	NRM	The possibility of developing additional irrigated areas, preferably through wells, but also using available resources to continue with cooperatively managed surface sources relying on pipelines could help to improve a distribution that, up to now, has almost exclusively benefited beneficiaries owning land adjoining the existing ponds. It is recommended that trials be carried out with these.	The use of drip irrigation has expanded the efficiency of irrigation systems, allowing for larger irrigated areas. In line with the answer in VE-5, Prosalafa II will improve irrigation efficiency.
VE	IE	7	PROJ	OPER	NRM	It is particularly recommended that a survey of the productive capacity of the existing natural grazing areas be undertaken using satellite techniques that are low cost in relation to the benefits.	At present, work has continued in this area, and a study of the productive capacity of the grasslands is being considered for the initial stages of Prosalafa II once the watersheds and micro-watersheds have been selected.
VE	IE	8	PROJ	OPER	ADV	A study needs to be carried out in the near future on the resilience of feed biomass both in grasslands and natural and introduced woodlands in order to measure the potential support for livestock based on feed balances and consistent with the climatic data collected at the same place.	The realization of a study on the resilience of these topics is being considered in the initial stages of Prosalafa II.
VE	IE	9	PROJ	OPER	ADV	It is important for the project to open up a range of assistance to goat farmers who have not adopted the currently offered intensive or semi-intensive technological package, which, by its nature, concerns only a minority of producers. As well as a vision centred on technical production aspects, an alternative way of managing natural grazing in semi-arid areas should also be provided. By no means should what has been achieved be abandoned, but, at the same time, it is desirable that the approach to technology transfer be redirected to this kind of livestock farming.	At present, together with local investigation institutions, as well as the project with the International Centre for Agricultural Research in the Dry Areas, work is being carried out in the formulation of various alternatives.
VE	IE	10	PROJ	OPER	REPL	The successful experiments in the conservation of micro-watersheds (especially in Falcón) are an achievement the extension and replication of which in other project areas would	Work is continuing in the same areas, and, presently, the delimitation of micro-watersheds is being carried out for all the municipalities.

CO	EV	No.	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Actions	PMD Follow-Up Action
						make the interventions more sustainable. It is recommended that the pilot surface areas be extended by constructing larger water collection zones using rainwater harvesting techniques.	
VE	IE	11	PROJ	OPER	NRM	It is of the utmost importance to involve more social and institutional actors (with the necessary awareness and capacity for action) in the effort to halt and reverse the process of soil degradation. It is recommended that the Ministry of the Environment and Natural Resources and state and municipal authorities be involved in these actions. In particular, it is recommended that: (a) an agreement be concluded within the normal education system, with a student population of over 8 000, to introduce the environment and its protection as a core subject for the youth of the region; (b) the project executing unit and producers should undergo training in basic techniques for the management of natural resources for grazing in the semi-arid areas of Falcón and Lara States; becoming familiar with these aspects is a necessary step in the effort to produce a significant impact in the project area in the next few years; (c) strengthen relations with and request support from specialized international agencies in this field, particularly the Global Mechanism to Combat Desertification, the Global Environment Facility and the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations, drawing on the actions already initiated by the Foundation for Training and Applied Research in Agrarian Reform in this regard.	<p>Cooperation with the Ministry of the Environment and Natural Resources continues. Activities in water conservation awareness in the areas covered by the project have begun and involve educational institutions.</p> <p>At the state level, the committee against desertification was created, and Prosalafa is participating actively.</p> <p>At present, a Global Environment Facility initiative has been approved; Prosalafa II would be the main counterpart. Currently, action has been taken towards implementing the procedures related to a petition for the endorsement of funds for the preparatory phase of this project.</p>
VE	IE	12	PROJ	OPER	LCLCAP	It is recommended that training be reoriented as a modular training process with strategic subject areas, but taking into account both the identified demand and the capacity of existing institutions to provide such training. The identification of the need for training provision should take account the demand in the regional environment and not confine itself strictly to the project areas; this approach would increase the competitiveness of the local labour force, which, inevitably, will migrate temporarily to those destinations. It is recommended that a start be made on designing mechanisms to include these training requirements.	Prosalafa II intends to deal with a reorientation of current training procedures.
VE	IE	13	PROJ	OPER	LCLCAP	With respect to the rural facilitators group, it is recommended that the publication of the rural facilitators journal <i>El Semiárido</i> be strengthened in coordination with the Fundación para el Fomento de la Lectura Fundalectura (Foundation to Promote Reading) and that a similar experiment be undertaken in Lara State. Additional training should also be designed and	Rural facilitators have continued to publish the monthly journal <i>El Semiárido</i> , but now with the support of a social communicator financed through the project. The training programme for rural facilitators has continued as planned.



CO	EV	No.	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Actions	PMD Follow-Up Action
						implemented to qualify rural facilitators so that they are capable of providing services.	
VE	IE	14	PROJ	OPER	ADV	It is important not to leave the different methods of technology transfer without funding. It is recommended that the agreements with the National Agricultural Research Institute, the Lisandro Alvarado Midwest University and other organizations with successful experience in such transfers be renewed up to the end of the period of implementation of this phase of the project and sufficient resources be allocated to allow the activities of the technology demonstration units and local rural research committees to continue.	Through agreements with several local financial institutions and the <i>cajas rurales</i> (rural savings banks) project, financing has been made available to support technology transfer activities.
VE	IE	15	PROJ	OPER	ADV	The adoption of productive technologies has been enhanced where there are sufficient water resources to meet production targets at the individual farm level. In this respect, it is recommended that the transfer of trickle irrigation technology and other water-saving practices be increased.	Work has continued in support of drip irrigation.
VE	IE	16	PROJ	OPER	PRIV	For traditional horticultural products, it is recommended that the project should strengthen its actions to organize producers so as to increase their bargaining power, e.g., the joint purchase of inputs, the sale of larger quantities in strategic outlets, etc.	Work has continued in relation to the strengthening of the marketing capacity and organization of producers. Further work on this issue is envisaged in Prosalafa II within the framework of national and state agricultural and rural marketing policies.
VE	IE	17	PROJ	OPER	PRIV	It is recommended that the project should provide ongoing support to producers on these matters as a permanent management function. In the formulation of the second stage, special attention should be paid to these aspects and consideration should be given to effective options, e.g., the formation of a central marketing unit for the two states, Falcón and Lara, in addition to the responsibilities of the states. In particular, actions should be refocused on the products generated by local microenterprises, and these actions should be reinforced.	The project has provided marketing support for producers. The second phase has considered the creation of a central marketing support unit for the two states.
VE	IE	18	PROJ	OPER	TRGT	It is recommended that a specific study be undertaken on the functioning of this productive and social subsector in order to design more appropriate interventions to combat poverty and promote economic and social development before the conclusion of the project. This study should be entrusted to an institution specializing in the sector. The results of this study should be used as inputs for the formulation of more effective actions in any second phase of Prosalafa, as well as other institutions (e.g., the National Institute of Fisheries and Aquiculture) to allow them to formulate projects and activities specifically designed for the benefit of these groups.	A study of the artisanal fishermen group was conducted with the support of the government of the state of Falcón. The findings of this study and the willingness of the federal and state governments to implement a development programme for artisanal fishermen led to the definition of the activities to be implemented in Prosalafa II.
VE	IE	19	PROJ	OPER	ADV	It is recommended that the actions on land titles in progress be continued and new ones be adapted to the forms of presentation	The land title programme has continued and is also included in Prosalafa II.

CO	EV	No.	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Actions	PMD Follow-Up Action
						proposed by the National Land Institute.	
VE	IE	20	PROJ	OPER	ADV	It is recommended that a moderate amount of the project credit resources be concentrated on external financing for rural banks. This does not mean that the operations of the revolving fund for rural activities should be curtailed, but that they should be linked exclusively to rural banks or the bank associates.	The project has reached an agreement with those <i>cajas rurales</i> willing to obtain external financing to increase their lending capital; 15% of the <i>cajas rurales</i> decided to maintain their capital level and not accept external capital.
VE	IE	21	PROJ	OPER	ADV	With respect to the rates of interest collected for the use of Prosalafa resources, it is recommended that only positive real interest rates be used. No lender should accept the loss of the real value of the resources lent whether inside, or outside the project area.	In line with the recommendation of the IE mission, only positive rates of interest have been used in the project.
VE	IE	22	PROJ	OPER	EXIT	It is recommended that an exit strategy and organizational sustainability strategy be devised by the project executing unit based on the available time and resources, in consultation with producer organizations and involving links with municipal and state governments and institutions. This will mean allocating time and resources to the preparation of a programme of activities to be implemented before the completion of the project. This programme will need to include, as a minimum: (a) bases for establishing relations between producer organizations and municipal, state and national institutions after the project ends in order to obtain commitments to support the population or through other future initiatives; (b) encourage the legalization of civil associations that are still not registered with municipal authorities; and (c) improve mechanisms of coordination, communication and monitoring in the execution of activities carried out under institutional agreements and involving municipal and state governments in community-institutional relations.	Since Prosalafa II has been approved, the exit strategy requested by the IE mission has been included in the project design. Over the last months, the project has been applying a strategy for the transition from Phase I to II.
VE	IE	23	PROJ	OPER	ORG	It is recommended that bases be established for the creation and strengthening of larger organizations for the purpose of: (a) the management of specialist services such as marketing for inputs and products or (b) associations based on economic activity at the community and municipality levels. These tasks should be undertaken in the near future as a crucial input to any second phase of the project. They should include: (a) the contracting of specialist staff; (b) the promotion of better linkages with community bodies (neighbourhood associations) and municipal and state authorities in the formulation of proposals and the management of resources; and (c) more dialogue and advice to state governments to generate institutional collaboration mechanisms between public and private entities in seeking to	The formation of second level organizations has been initiated in order to achieve larger productive and marketing capabilities, as well as for the policy dialog with municipal and state governments. This strategy has been included in the operational design of Prosalafa II.

CO	EV	No.	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Actions	PMD Follow-Up Action
						rationalize provision and channel the demands of the population.	
VE	IE	24	PROJ	OPER	LCLCAP	It is recommended that the strengthening of human resources in existing grass-roots organizations be continued in light of the objectives contemplated. In this respect, the project should take immediate steps to: (a) establish legal and regulatory measures to provide greater opportunities for new community leadership, with an emphasis in training support on those with the least experience in decision-making, including women and young people and (b) equip facilitators with greater knowledge, qualifications and skills, promote networking among them and present them as service-providers to institutional authorities, private organizations, municipalities and state governments.	Strengthening human resources has been one of the pillars of Prosalafa project activities. Activities have continued based on the recommendations of the IE mission. A strong human resource development component has been included in Prosalafa II.
VE	IE	25	PROJ	OPER	GNDR	It is important to correct some of the existing operational weaknesses. In particular, it is recommended that a gender specialist who is expert on standardizing these aspects be engaged in order to introduce a specific gender strategy in Prosalafa during the second phase of execution. This expert should develop methodological mechanisms to reach families and an information system to monitor the participation of women and men.	A gender specialist has been contracted to strengthen project actions. This position has been budgeted in Prosalafa II.
VE	IE	26	PROJ	OPER	GNDR	It is recommended that, in collaboration with the Foundation for Training and Applied Research in Agrarian Reform, the work experience in gender be consolidated by selecting a case study of complementary roles in the family or a line of action (microenterprises or rural banks) and, grounded on this, disseminate the results among those concerned. Standardization could be an area of input in defining a regional gender strategy, establishing the basis for the design of these aspects in a second phase and serving as a lesson that could be valuable for other projects and in other countries.	The Foundation for Training and Applied Research in Agrarian Reform will soon publish a systematic presentation of gender experiences based on selected case studies. A standardized gender strategy (for Venezuela, three ongoing projects) has been completed, with the support of PL's Regional Programme to Consolidate Gender-Mainstreaming Strategies in IFAD-Financed Projects of Latin America and the Caribbean.
VE	IE	27	PROJ	OPER	GNDR	It is important to use successful models of training at the grass-roots level. In this respect, it is recommended that the families of rural facilitators be involved in gender training activities, as some of them are in practice. This would allow the household and the farm to be considered as an illustrative example and permit an analysis of incentives that could benefit all members of a family.	Gender training has been a part of the Prosalafa human resources development strategy. The training of the families of rural facilitators will be undertaken through the Prosalafa II gender-strategic programme.
IFAD	CLE	1	IFAD	PLCY	SUPER	While the process of formulating the new supervision policy has already been started by PMD, the findings and recommendations of the ongoing Independent External Evaluation and the Evaluation of IFAD's Direct Supervision Pilot Programme by OE will have to be taken into consideration	The recommendations of this evaluation have made a useful contribution to the action plan and new operating model.

CO	EV	No.	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Actions	PMD Follow-Up Action
						during full articulation and completion. Period of completion: December 2005.	
IFAD	CLE	2	IFAD	OPER	SUPER	PMD should revise the minimum supervision requirements guided by the evaluation findings and the new policy on supervision. Period of completion: March 2006.	Action will be taken after an agreement on the new operating model.
IFAD	CLE	3	IFAD	OPER	SUPER	Cooperation agreements with cooperating institutions should be revised accordingly. Period of completion: July 2006.	See IFAD COR 2.
IFAD	CLE	4	IFAD	OPER	SUPER	Letter of appointments for cooperating institutions should reflect the new requirement standards. Period of completion: March 2006 and beyond.	See IFAD COR 3.
IFAD	CLE	5	IFAD	STRAT	SUPER	As part of the revision and updating of the minimum supervision requirements, PMD will revisit its implementation support practices with the aim of clarifying the purpose, role and underlying principles, maximizing the project benefits of this support and enhancing effectiveness and relevance through the use of local resources and appropriate experts. Period of completion: March 2006.	See IFAD COR 1.
IFAD	CLE	6	IFAD	STRAT	SUPER	PMD should review the quality assurance schemes for supervision in selected international financial institutions so as to identify best practices and elaborate a suitable supervision quality assurance scheme for IFAD, including budget. Period of completion: June 2005.	Superseded by the recommendations of the independent external evaluation, this will be considered in the elaboration of the new operating model.
IFAD	CLE	7	IFAD	OPER	KMGMT	PMD will institute a mechanism for knowledge sharing and the dissemination of the learning from supervision within IFAD and between IFAD and its cooperating institutions. Period of completion: from 2005 onwards.	Regional divisions routinely participate in supervision missions in order to increase knowledge sharing. Regional workshops are regularly organized to discuss issues related to the cooperating institutions, and cooperating institutions are invited to other operational workshops. The issue is also being addressed in the overall context of improved knowledge management.
IFAD	CLE	8	IFAD	OPER	SUPER	Set up mechanisms for regular briefing and communication with cooperating institutions on corporate-level developments in IFAD. Period of completion: April 2005.	See IFAD COR 8.
IFAD	CLE	9	IFAD	OPER	SUPER	Reflect a clear delineation of the responsibilities of cooperating institutions in revised cooperation agreements. Period of completion: July 2006.	See IFAD COR 2.
IFAD	CLE	10	IFAD	STRAT	SUPER	While maintaining a zero-growth budget, IFAD is in the process of reviewing its supervision requirements and the resulting costs; it is aiming at greater flexibility in the use of existing resources,	See IFAD COR 1. Ongoing, no recommendation.

CO	EV	No.	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Actions	PMD Follow-Up Action
						adapting supervision activities to the specific needs of the projects concerned and identifying cost-effective solutions for implementation support.	