

---

## **President's Report on the Implementation Status of Evaluation Recommendations and Management Actions (PRISMA)**

### **Volume II**

### **Recommendations and follow-up actions taken by Management**

### **Addendum**

---

Document: EC 2022/118/W.P.5/Add.1

Agenda: 6

Date: 5 August 2022

Distribution : Public

Original: English

**FOR: REVIEW**

**Useful references:** IFAD Revised Evaluation Manual [EC 2022/116/W.P.5](#)

**Action:** The Evaluation Committee is invited to review the 2022 President's Report on the Implementation Status of Evaluation Recommendations and Management Actions (PRISMA)

---

---

#### **Technical questions:**

**Chitra Deshpande**  
Lead Advisor, Results and Resources  
Operational Policy and Results Division  
e-mail: [c.deshpande@ifad.org](mailto:c.deshpande@ifad.org)

**Dimitra Stamatopoulos**  
Policy and Results Specialist  
Operational Policy and Results Division  
e-mail: [d.stamatopoulos@ifad.org](mailto:d.stamatopoulos@ifad.org)

---

---

## **President's Report on the Implementation Status of Evaluation Recommendations and Management Actions (PRISMA)**

### **Volume II**

## **Recommendations and follow-up actions taken by Management**

### **Addendum**

---

Document: EB 2022/136/R.18/Add.1

Agenda: 11(a)

Date: 5 August

Distribution : Public

Original: English

**FOR: REVIEW**

**Useful references:** IFAD Revised Evaluation Manual [EC 2022/116/W.P.5](#)

**Action:** The Executive Board is invited to review the 2022 President's Report on the Implementation Status of Evaluation Recommendations and Management Actions (PRISMA)

---

---

#### **Technical questions:**

**Chitra Deshpande**  
Lead Advisor, Results and Resources  
Operational Policy and Results Division  
e-mail: [c.deshpande@ifad.org](mailto:c.deshpande@ifad.org)

**Dimitra Stamatopoulos**  
Policy and Results Specialist  
Operational Policy and Results Division  
e-mail: [d.stamatopoulos@ifad.org](mailto:d.stamatopoulos@ifad.org)

---

## Contents

<b>Categories used for the classification of actions/ recommendations</b>	<b>II</b>
<b>Country Strategy and Project Evaluations (CSPEs)</b>	<b>1</b>
Ecuador - Country Strategy and Programme Evaluation	1
Sudan - Country Strategy and Programme Evaluation	5
Madagascar - Country Strategy and Programme Evaluation	11
<b>Project Performance Evaluations (PPEs)</b>	<b>20</b>
Uganda - Agricultural Technology and Agribusiness Advisory Services Project	20
Dominican Republic - Rural Economic Development Project in the Central and Eastern Provinces	22
Tajikistan - Khatlon Livelihoods Support Project	26
Bangladesh - Coastal Climate-Resilient Infrastructure Project	30
Türkiye - Ardahan-Kars- Artvin Development Project	33
China - Hunan Agricultural and Rural Infrastructure Improvement Project	37
India - Tejaswini Women's Empowerment Programme	43
<b>Corporate-Level Evaluations (CLE)</b>	<b>47</b>
Corporate-level evaluation on IFAD's support to innovations for inclusive and sustainable smallholder agriculture	47
<b>Historic Follow Up: Project Performance Evaluations (PPEs)</b>	<b>55</b>
Sierra Leone - Rehabilitation and Community-based Poverty Reduction Project	55
<b>Historic Follow Up: Country Strategy and Project Evaluations (CSPEs)</b>	<b>61</b>
Sierra Leone - Country Strategy and Programme Evaluation	61
United Mexican States - Country Strategy and Programme Evaluation	66

## Categories used for the classification of actions/ recommendations

SN Serial Number

### Type of evaluation

CLE Corporate Level Evaluation  
CSPE Country Strategy and Programme Evaluation  
PPE Project Performance Evaluation

### Level

IFAD IFAD Corporate Level  
CTRY IFAD Country Level  
GOV Government Authorities (national, local level and institutions)  
PROJ Project

### Nature

PLCY Policy  
STR Strategy Development, including COSOPs and Projects  
OPER Operational and Implementation

### Themes

DEC Decentralization  
ALL Allocations  
ASR Analysis, studies and research  
BEN Beneficiaries and stakeholders' participation and consultation  
CCA Climate change  
COS Country Strategic Opportunities Programme (COSOP)  
DES Project Design  
ENG Policy engagement  
FA Financial architecture  
FRG Fragility  
GDR Gender (including targeting to women)  
GOV Governance  
GRT Grants/ grants financing policy  
INF Infrastructure  
INN Innovation  
KM Knowledge Management  
LTR Land tenure  
MVC Markets and value chains  
NLA Non-lending activities  
NRM Natural resource management  
NTR Nutrition  
ORG Organization development  
PAR Partnerships  
PMA Project management and administration (incl. financial management)  
PVT Private sector  
REPL Replenishments  
RFI Rural finance  
RME Results monitoring, evaluation  
RST Restructuring  
SCA Replication and scaling up  
STRA Strategy  
SUP Supervision  
SUS Sustainability  
TCB Training, capacity-building  
TGT Targeting

YTH Youth

**Status**

F	Fully followed-up
NA	Not applicable
NAG	Not agreed upon
NYD	Not yet due
O	Ongoing
PA	Partially followed up
PD	Pending

**Criteria:**

- **full follow-up:** recommendations fully incorporated into the new phase/design of activities, operations or programmes, and the relevant policies or guidelines;
- **ongoing:** actions initiated in the direction recommended;
- **partial:** recommendations followed up partially, with actions consistent with the rationale of the recommendation;
- **not yet due:** recommendations that will be incorporated into projects, country programmes or country strategic opportunities programmes (COSOPs) or policies still to be designed and completed;
- **not applicable:** recommendations that have not been complied with because of changing circumstances in country development or IFAD corporate governance contexts, or for other reasons;
- **pending:** recommendations that could not be followed up; and
- **not agreed upon:** recommendations that were not agreed to by Management or the respective country team or government

## Country Strategy and Project Evaluations (CSPEs)

Country	Region	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-Recommendation	2022 - FollowUp	Status
<b>Ecuador - Country Strategy and Programme Evaluation</b>										
Ecuador	LAC	CSPE	1	CTRY	STR	DES	Reinforce the differentiated territorial approach to project implementation. With experience it has accumulated, IFAD is in a position to design and implement lending operations that take into account the different socioeconomic, environmental and cultural dynamics that can be influenced in order to transform and better link them. To this end, a territorial approach should be taken, with the participation of local stakeholders and value chains that afford access to differentiated markets and that value the country's biocultural heritage.		Since 2017, approximately, the country team has sought a route to work directly with Decentralized autonomous governments (GADs). Given their many areas of authority, these institutions are the suitable to integrate IFAD's cross-cutting themes, and themes related to production and market access, through a territorial approach (although GADs are not responsible for access to credit, for example). The Rural Development: Sustainable and Appropriate Development Project in Rural Territories (DESATAR) project (in negotiation) includes a differentiated territorial approach that considers the dynamics, potential and needs of the diverse groups involved. The new design, Strengthening the productive capacities of rural entrepreneurs in the territory (EMPRENDER) also takes into account the diversity of the territories covered and contemplates an effective linkage mechanism with the GADs, as key allies for implementation. The greater participation of the GADs will take advantage of their potential to transform the rural reality, and will take into account the social and cultural conditions of the different target groups.	○
Ecuador	LAC	CSPE	2	CTRY	OPER	MVC	Promote sustainable enterprises. Since enterprises are one of the cornerstones of the Fund's portfolio in the country, it is recommended		As part of the COSOP consulting process in Nov. 2021, a dialogue on "sustainable entrepreneurship" was conducted together with public and	○

						<p>that they be provided with greater support by promoting market studies during the design phase and by updating those studies during implementation. The studies should, among other things: (i) identify the training required to ensure the sound management of the enterprises; (ii) identify the most relevant partners; and (iii) clarify the most appropriate exit strategy to ensure the sustainability of the enterprises beyond project closure.</p>		<p>private actors. The DESATAR project, which is pending to be approved by June 2022, will promote smallholders' adoption and appropriation of innovations and best practices (technical, technological and socio-cooperative). Additionally, the new design, called EMPRENDER aims to Strengthen the Productive Capacity of Rural Entrepreneurs in the Territories. This project will include the development of Local Economic Development Centers aimed to provide training on productive activities, business management and marketing for agribusiness.</p>	
--	--	--	--	--	--	---	--	--	--

Ecuador	LAC	CSPE	3	CTRY	OPER	ENG	<p>Strengthen capacity for policy dialogue with the Government of Ecuador in order to position IFAD as a recognized partner in the implementation of policies, strategies and plans related to rural transformation of small producers. Under the new cooperation framework between the Government of Ecuador and IFAD, it is important to strengthen the Fund's specific niche in relation to the country's development objectives. In order to implement this recommendation, and following the example of the Rural Dialogue Group, it is recommended that the work done by this Group be enhanced or that support be provided for a similar mechanism. This mechanism would play a more proactive role at the IFAD portfolio level by strengthening monitoring and evaluation of the country programme in a more strategic manner.</p>		<p>The Country Strategy Note (CSN) expected to be approved in May 2022, includes a policy dialogue element. It suggests that IFAD's policy engagement will focus on specific areas where its thematic expertise is well-recognized, such as strengthening of the policy and regulatory framework for Farmer organizations and rural MSMEs; and inclusive rural finance. Policy dialogue will be carried out as part of project activities, through consistent dialogue with relevant Ministers and through involvement in the United Nations Country Team (UNCT) and other relevant stakeholder fora. Moreover, to influence public policies, IFAD aims to strengthen the Projects' monitoring and evaluation and knowledge management systems. This is an area that will be strengthened in the new design, including support for the development of institutional monitoring and evaluation (M&amp;E) systems and partnerships with research centres or policy think tanks to develop studies, data analysis and staff training. To this end, it will use all the country programme's instruments, interconnect loans and grants and non-loan activities in general, as long as the necessary resources are available. There has not been available budget for another donation with Delivery Associate and Grupo de Dialogo Rural. However, both remain as country partners for other initiatives.</p>	O
---------	-----	------	---	------	------	-----	--	--	---	---



Ecuador	LAC	CSPE	4	IFAD	OPER	DEC	<p>Strengthen IFAD’s presence in the country. In order to improve the effectiveness, efficiency and targeting of the loan portfolio and of nonlending activities, it is recommended that the IFAD team in Ecuador be strengthened. Increased technical and administrative support will help introduce measures to rectify delays and strengthen the monitoring and evaluation system. It should also facilitate greater dialogue with the Government to generate more impact. This will mean establishing contacts beyond traditional rural sector partners, including the Ministry of Production, Foreign Trade, Investment and Fisheries and the autonomous decentralized governments, as well as civil society groups, universities and the private sector.</p>		<p>The country team of Ecuador has a Country Director based in Lima and a liaison person based in Ecuador. The Country Director (CD) also have the support of the Programme Officer (PO)/ Country Programme Officer (CPO) based in Lima.</p> <p>The possibility of having a staff in Quito is being evaluated based on positive progress of the portfolio in Ecuador. This decision will have to be endorsed by the Associate Vice-President (AVP) and Executive Board (EB).</p> <p>The CSN to be approved in May 2022 proposed using all the country programme’s instruments, and interconnect loans and grants and non-loan activities in general, as long as the necessary resources are available.</p> <p>During the COSOP consulting progress, 6 roundtables were promoted in diverse topics, in order to receive inputs from diverse public and private actors, as well as to create and strengthen relationship with other partners.</p> <p>As suggested, the new project’s counterpart will be the Ministry of Production (MPCEIP) and will contemplate an effective linkage mechanism with the GADs, as key allies for implementation.</p>	O
---------	-----	------	---	------	------	-----	--	--	---	---

Ecuador	LAC	CSPE	5	CTRY	OPER	COS	<p>Reconsider the timing of the design of the next COSOP. More in-depth analytical work should be undertaken for the next COSOP, including an analysis of possible synergies and linkages within the portfolio and with other partners, beyond the formulation and implementation of individual projects. The new document should take account of the electoral cycle at the national level in order to contribute to the dialogue on rural development policies in the country and propose a programme focused on the areas in which IFAD has added the most value, based on the successes achieved.</p>		<p>The request for the extension of the COSOP until December 2021 considering the electoral cycle was approved by Programme Management Department (PMD) on 04/08/2020.</p> <p>In 2021 a COSOP consultation process was conducted. However, given that Ecuador does not have a Borrowed Resource Access Mechanism (BRAM) allocation for the IFAD12 cycle, the Country team and the Regional Director proposed to replace the COSOP with a two-year Country Strategic Note (CSN). A 2-year Country Strategy Note will allow to monitor the evolution of the country's situation, assess the Government's commitment with IFAD's projects and gauge opportunities for continued engagement.</p> <p>The purpose of this CSN is to bridge the gap between the previous COSOP and the next, allowing the design of the new COSOP under a clearer panorama of Ecuador's future opportunities. It will allow IFAD to consolidate its ties with the Government of Ecuador (GOE), redefine IFAD's value added in the changing financial, political and fiscal setting; and assess the implementing partners' commitment and capabilities to plan, execute and monitor projects.</p>	F
<b>Sudan - Country Strategy and Programme Evaluation</b>										

Sudan	NEN	CSPE	1	CTRY	STR	PAR	Identify opportunities for partnerships and cofinancing to scale up achievements in key areas and generate greater impact, including the following:	(i) Explore options to mobilize resources for integrated programmes, including basic infrastructure interventions. The rural infrastructures funded by IFAD's portfolio, such as rural roads and water provision (for humans and animals), have proven effective and often necessary interventions to address rural poverty, complementing productive activities (crop and livestock production, forestry) and natural resource management. IFAD should explore options for mobilizing cofinancing resources for this purpose so as to facilitate enabling conditions for rural communities to be engaged in productive activities and to reduce the risk of a more commercialized approach favouring the betterresourced and more accessible communities. At the same time, there should also be policy engagement with the Government to develop and operationalize a strategy and mobilize resources for adequate operation and maintenance. Support for water provision (for humans and animals) is key in rainfed areas and needs to be integrated into	This is on-going. Cofinancing opportunities were pursued with the World Bank and African Development Bank but were inconclusive and the two International Financial Institutions (IFIs) have now paused their programme in Sudan as well as design/ approval of new operations. In 2022, the IFAD Country Office (ICO) Sudan with assistance from Near East, North Africa and Europe Division (NEN) and Global Engagement, Partnership and Resource Mobilization Division (GPR), will focus on Arab Funds, although prospects may be limited as Sudan is in arrears with these funds.	O
-------	-----	------	---	------	-----	-----	---	--	---	---

								IFAD investment or complementary interventions.		
Sudan	NEN	CSPE	2	CTRY	STR	PAR	Identify opportunities for partnerships and cofinancing to scale up achievements in key areas and generate greater impact.	(ii) Identify and strengthen partnerships with non-state actors and development agencies fundamental to the achievements of the projects and the COSOP. IFAD needs to be more inclusive and gain from the comparative advantage of other organizations and institutions with complementary expertise (e.g. academic and research institutions, civil society organizations, Non Governative Organizations – (NGOs), bilateral and multilateral development agencies and international agricultural research centres). This is important to strengthen: poverty, food and nutrition analysis and assessments; conflict analysis; agricultural research; community development; natural resource governance; agriculture policy dialogue; technology transfer; and innovation.	This is on-going. Currently the partnerships with Microfinance Institutions are yielding good results for scaling up and sustainability.	0

Sudan	NEN	CSPE	3	CTRY	STR	ENG	Identify opportunities for partnerships and cofinancing to scale up achievements in key areas and generate greater impact.	(iii) Refocus attention on institutional and policy influence to promote inclusive finance. IFAD should, in collaboration with (Community-Based Organizations (CBOS) and other partners, identify opportunities to address policy-level and systemic issues to develop an enabling environment for inclusive finance. This should build on the experience on the ground in Sudan, as well as IFAD corporate experience and knowledge elsewhere. Support may be within the project framework as well as by mobilizing technical assistance or a grant. Furthermore, the relationship with Agricultural Bank of Sudan Microfinance Initiative (ABSUMI) and (Agricultural Bank of Sudan (ABS) should be revisited to clarify a long-term vision and the scope for reinforcing the strategic partnership.	This recommendation was fully followed up. Inclusive rural finance is part of the policy dialogue specified in the COSOP. Moreover, Sudan has now a new microfinance strategy 2021-2026 that will guide the implementation of on-going and future interventions in this area. Based on several assessment studies and design of (Inclusive Green Financing initiative 2 (IGREENFIN 2), an institutional approach - rather than project approach- to microfinance is taking shape.	F
Sudan	NEN	CSPE	4	CTRY	STR	TGT	Ensure an inclusive and differentiated targeting strategy. In particular, greater attention is needed to more effectively engage mobile pastoral communities as well as vulnerable households based on sound diagnostic analyses, and to monitor their participation and outcomes, while building on the solid achievements made in promoting gender equality and women's empowerment and		Completed and this is under implementation in Sustainable Natural Resources and Livelihoods Programme.	F

							reinforcing support for the rural youth.			
Sudan	NEN	CSPE	5	CTRY	OPER	TCB	Support the institutional capacity development of key government counterpart agencies at local and state levels, while building stronger links with IFAD-financed projects, to enhance sustainability. IFAD needs to adopt a strategy of closer integration with relevant line ministries and agencies at a decentralized level (especially those responsible for agriculture, animal resources and range, and water). Key entry points for support could be in the areas of essential functions of these institutions – for example, data collection and collation (e.g. agricultural statistics), the development of M&E systems for government and non-government interventions in the sector(s), shared extension services, and the formulation of strategies and policies.		This is fully followed up. Since 2021, the Sustainable Natural Resources and Livelihoods Programme (SNRLP) is incorporating capacity building on M&E in its Project year annual workplan and budgeting (AWPB) and delivering training in this area to federal and state ministries of agriculture and finance.	F

Sudan	NEN	CSPE	6	CTRY	OPER	DES	Better articulate the theory of change in country and project strategies that underlines the expected poverty impact. Greater attention is required at the level of project conceptualization to identify the pathways through which the project goals (e.g. reduced poverty, food insecurity and malnutrition) will be attained, with relevant and consistent indicators to measure the effectiveness and impact of project interventions along those same pathways. This will contribute to more effective monitoring and analysis of the activities, leading to a scaling-up of good practices that bring fundamental changes to rural communities engaged in different livelihoods in different contexts.		This is fully followed up and already being reflected in the mid-term review of the Integrated Agricultural and Marketing Development Project and the supervision of the Sustainable Natural Resources and Livelihoods Programme which are complex thinly spread projects. Better articulation of Theory of Change (ToC) is assisting with prioritizing and focusing activities and geographic spread.	F
Sudan	NEN	CSPE	7	CTRY	OPER	KM	Strengthen the (Knowledge Management (KM) platform for IFAD-financed projects to foster information-sharing across the projects and partnership, as well as to bolster effective monitoring of the IFAD portfolio. The strategy for KM is ambitious and well intentioned, but without sufficient resources, technical support and leadership it will not be realized. It is important that IFAD, the Government of Sudan and other development partners benefit from the rich experience of the IFAD portfolio in the country, including good practices and lessons learned.		The KM strategy was formulated in line with the new COSOP 2021-2027 and an action plan developed. Resources are being mobilized from the ICO, country programme and regional grants. More efforts still required to share knowledge within the country programme and with other partners.	F

Sudan	NEN	CSPE	8	CTRY	OPER	SUP	Strengthen IFAD’s capacity to be better engaged in project supervision and reviews, KM, coordination across strategic partnerships (especially on natural resource management), and policy dialogue. This could involve human resource and technical capacities (e.g. staffing at the country office, technical support from headquarters or the subregional hub), as well as resource allocation to upgrade non-lending activities (e.g. grant funding to pilot innovative approaches and/or to engage strategic partners; analytical studies). It is important that the country office be more actively engaged in project oversight, supervision and conceptualization to ensure consistency in approach. This in turn needs to draw upon an effective and informative knowledge platform. Furthermore, the country office, in collaboration with relevant partners, should be more active in policy engagement in the new political environment emerging in Sudan.		This is fully followed up on. Budget allocated for supervision is sufficient. Project Development Team (PDT) and ICO Sudan exerting more efforts in supervision and implementation support and keeping regular interaction with the projects and the project lead agencies. Policy engagement is pursued with focus on key themes like seed policy and several rounds of follow-up have already taken place with the Ministry of Agriculture on this topic. Frequent changes in senior leadership of the Ministry is stalling progress in policy engagement.	F
-------	-----	------	---	------	------	-----	--	--	--	---

**Madagascar - Country Strategy and Programme Evaluation**



Madagas car	ESA	CSPE	1	CTRY	STR	COS	Maintain the COSOP orientation axes while refining approaches by implementing them more synergistically.	(a) Development hubs. Concentrate project interventions within a limited geographical area to develop farmers' productive capital and capacities for production and adding value to their products. Within these hubs, strengthen the value chain, PO and microfinance approaches.	"The main recommendations have been taken into account in designing the COSOP 2022-2026, which is in line with the previous one. The areas of intervention are currently concentrated in the South of the island, within the poorest regions and also most vulnerable to the impact of climate change. Ongoing projects, including Inclusive Agricultural Value Chains Development Programme (DEFIS) and Support Development in Menabe & Melaky (AD2M-II) have invested in inclusive value chains within development hubs, in partnership with POs and rural financial institutions. RPSF funds are also mobilized to improve productive capital and access to financial services and support. This recommendation will also be taken into account for the two upcoming new designs in the country. The upcoming Soil and Water Management Programme (PROGRES), for instance, will be focused on three regional groupings - groupings where IFAD-project are already operating as part of a coordinated and long term approach to development in these specific geographic areas. These are regional groupings with particularly high exposure to food insecurity in (i) the "southern belt" (regions of Androy, Atsimo-Andrefana, Anosy, Atsimo-Atsinanana, Vatovavy and Fitovinany); (ii) the West (Bongolava, Melaky and Menabe); (iii) and in the central highlands (Ihorombe, Haute Matsiatra and Amoron'i Mania)."	F
----------------	-----	------	---	------	-----	-----	--	--	--	---

Madagas car	ESA	CSPE	2	CTRY	OPER	COS	Maintain the COSOP orientation axes while refining approaches by implementing them more synergistically.	(b) Value chains. Interventions upstream of value chains should work to improve access by small-scale farmers to various inputs. Similarly, greater attention should be paid to marketing for food products with actions on a larger scale and mechanisms to enable the most vulnerable people to access markets (e.g. by employing a warrantage system).	Ongoing projects have facilitated producers' access to inputs and markets through contract farming promotion and enhanced partnerships with private operators. Projects AD2M-II and DEFIS have supported upstream actors, such as seed producers, local input stores and small manufacturers of agricultural equipment. In addition, IFAD's investments contribute significantly to the financing of grassroots agricultural advisory services in the areas of intervention. The DEFIS programme supports MINAE in updating the national strategy for agricultural services (draft version was shared with partners) and setting up legislation on agricultural aggregation system, which is expected to be enacted in July 2022. This recommendation will also be taken into account for the two upcoming new designs in the country. The upcoming PROGRES will incorporate support to pro-poor value chain development including improvement of access to young women and men to inputs as well as infrastructure and facilitation services for better access of the most vulnerable to markets.	O
----------------	-----	------	---	------	------	-----	--	---	--	---

Madagas car	ESA	CSPE	3	CTRY	OPER	COS	Maintain the COSOP orientation axes while refining approaches by implementing them more synergistically.	(c) Producer organizations. IFAD and the Government should continue to consolidate POs, specifically in terms of managing infrastructure and collective facilities and setting up working capital for group purchases of inputs. With respect to contract sales, support for POs should encourage the conclusion of longer-term contracts between POs and MOs, and stronger commitment by both parties to compliance with contract provisions. It is important to contribute specific sustained support for apex organizations to develop their capacities for negotiation with the Government – and with MOs – to defend the interests of producers, particularly the poorest producers.	Ongoing IFAD projects supported and strengthened the capacities of Producer Organizations (POs) at all levels. POs play an important role in providing services to their members and are key partners in project implementation. The DEFIS programme specifically supported 1 779 producer organisations providing services to more than 49 588 poor rural households; the programme also supported the reform process of the Chamber of Agriculture in order to strengthen its position in policy dialogue in favor of smallholder producers. The revision of their statuts is expected to be finalized in June 2022, elections at different levels will be organized later this year. The Vocational Training and Agricultural Productivity Improvement Programme (FORMAPROD) programme promotes the integration of youth into POs and has supported the establishment of a rural youth network in 2021. This organization aims to facilitate exchanges between youth across the country and to strengthen youth engagement in policy dialogues in the agricultural and rural sector. This recommendation will also be taken into account for the two upcoming new designs in the country; the upcoming PROGRES will include capacity building of POs in order to facilitate access to advisory services, inputs as well as markets through aggregation.	F
----------------	-----	------	---	------	------	-----	--	---	---	---

Madagas car	ESA	CSPE	4	CTRY	OPER	COS	Maintain the COSOP orientation axes while refining approaches by implementing them more synergistically.	(d) Financial inclusion. Explore two ways of reaching the most vulnerable population groups: deepen financing for producers with government support such as subsidies from the Agricultural Development Fund and lines of credit funded by the national budget; and involve MFIs more closely to serve all categories of family farmers. Reflections on improvements to MFI services for the most vulnerable could pursue the following three directions: (i) have projects include financing lines earmarked for the most vulnerable; (ii) develop and formalize partnerships between Microfinance institutions (MFIs) and community-based mutual aid groups; and (iii) explore the electronic currency sector to consolidate alternative approaches to financial inclusion.	Activities of the projects are aligned with the two recommended ways. Inclusive Agricultural Value Chains Development Programme (DEFIS) has supported more than 104 000 poor rural households with subsidies through the Agricultural Development Fund (FDA). DEFIS has also provided technical support for the development of new services by the FDA. The FDA's new funding mechanism is composed of two windows, one for grant funding including Window 1 "Direct Funding" for structuring investments, support for economic integration, financial inclusion and capacity building (in the form of grants) and Window 2 to "co-finance" cost-effective projects by partnership with financial institutions (in the form of matching grants and credit lines). This new financing mechanism of FDA has been validated by the Ministry of Agriculture. Nearly 17,000 vulnerable households supported by DEFIS and FORMAPROD are currently involved in community-based mutual aid groups (GVEC). They benefit from financial education programme in order to engage with MFIs in the future. Discussions on digital finance services are also underway with MFIs. In addition, the operationalization of a revolving fund (570 000 USD) managed by FDA is now underway through the Agricultural Marketing Support Project (PACPA) project (Poor Stimulus Facility - RPSF grant). This will be part of the new services to producers and their organizations.	F
----------------	-----	------	---	------	------	-----	--	---	---	---

Madagas car	ESA	CSPE	5	CTRY	STR	TGT	Reinforce the inclusion of very poor and highly vulnerable rural people in the country programme and improve the consolidation of results by concentrating the geographical area of interventions.	(a) The portfolio coverage should be reduced to concentrate on the country's poorest regions with the potential to develop production hubs. Interventions should be identified and validated by agreement with the responsible parties for regions taking on decision-making authority under the new decentralized development policy.	As mentioned above, the recommendation about portfolio coverage have been addressed in the new COSOP 2022-2026, and will be integrated into the two upcoming project designs. Projects interventions are always aligned specific priorities (areas and value chains), defined by regional Governors and local authorities. Communities and authorities are also frequently consulted in the participatory evaluation and planning sessions conducted annually by the projects.	F
Madagas car	ESA	CSPE	6	CTRY	OPER	TGT	Reinforce the inclusion of very poor and highly vulnerable rural people in the country programme and improve the consolidation of results by concentrating the geographical area of interventions.	(b) At design, projects should provide for appropriate ways and means to reach the most vulnerable people, such as projects targeting the vulnerable and subsidies for start-ups of reliable income-generating activities, or credits to POs to enable them to help the most vulnerable people participate fully in their activities (social credit, advance financing for the agricultural season, purchasing harvests to avoid dumping).	This recommendation is already partially applied by the ongoing projects: 70 000 rural youth to be provided with start-up kits by FORMAPROD, 4 700 vulnerable households to be supported through microprojects by AD2M-II, 23 500 households to be provided with recovery kits by Recovery and Resilience of Rural Households in the South (PA2R) Moreover, this issue will be given special attention in the design of the new project PROGRES.	O
Madagas car	ESA	CSPE	7	CTRY	OPER	GDR	Reinforce the inclusion of very poor and highly vulnerable rural people in the country programme and improve the consolidation of results by concentrating the geographical area of interventions.	(c) The project gender strategy should go beyond quotas for women's participation and move towards operationalizing approaches and actions that directly address gender inequality, to break down the socio-economic and cultural barriers to women's empowerment. Scale up approaches to raise awareness among	The GALS approach is now integrated into the FORMAPROD programme with almost 3200 youth trained in 2 years. The training has been enhanced with lessons of environmental protection and resilience to climate change, nutrition and food security as well as empowerment of vulnerable groups. The DEFIS programme has also started training of GALS trainers. This should lead to a larger scale development starting this year. The ongoing and upcoming projects	O

								young people around sharing household roles, such as the Gender Action and Learning System (GALS), or facilitate access by women and young people to land or financial services.	(PROGRES) will continue with relevant actions to facilitate access by women and young people to land and financial services.	
Madagascar	ESA	CSPE	8	CTRY	OPER	TCB	Pursue and reinforce capacity-building for support services to producers and producer competencies to improve the sustainability of results. The Government and IFAD, in consultation with other technical and financial partners, should further streamline: (i) capacity-building for arrangements to operationalize the agricultural services strategy under a sustainability-based perspective; (ii) support for the private sector involved in agricultural extension, and technical and management advisory assistance; and (iii) support to regional chambers of agriculture by providing them with the appropriate status and assisting them in seeking out long-term sources of financing.		The portfolio pursues and effectively strengthens these supports to build producers capacity and sustainability of benefits. As mentioned above, support for the national agricultural services strategy, the legislation on agricultural aggregation system and the reform within the Chamber of Agriculture are ongoing. However, it should be noted that these are long processes that involve many actors at the national and local levels. As an innovative operation in Madagascar, IFAD also granted a non-sovereign loan to the Smallholder farmer value chain inclusion (SOAFIARY) company to support its growth and to extend their activities in partnership with 4000 smallholder farmer households in the intervention regions.	O
Madagascar	ESA	CSPE	9	CTRY	OPER	NRM	Reinforce actions in natural resource management and adaptation or mitigation of the effects of climate change on smallscale producers. Introduce natural resource management as a major theme in the next COSOP to scale up activities to preserve natural resources tested by the IFAD portfolio in Madagascar. The recommendations made in the evaluation of the last COSOP continue to be valid: (i) downstream hydro-agricultural improvements should be		Adaptation to climate change has indeed been introduced as a key theme in the new COSOP 2022-2026. The IFAD Country Team and the Government are currently working together to mobilize additional resources from climate finance to strengthen actions on the ground (53.8 M USD expected from Green Climate Fund - GCF for DEFIS+). This will also be the case for the design of the new PROGRES project which will integrate aspects of natural resource management and climate change adaptation.	O

							<p>accompanied by upstream soil restoration, seeking partnerships with donors involved in watershed management; and (ii) collaboration with the Ministry of the Environment, and involvement of the Ministry's regional technical services, should be strengthened. It is also recommended that actions be stepped up around reforestation, agroforestry and reduction of deforestation.</p>			
Madagascar	ESA	CSPE	10	CTRY	STR	PAR	<p>Strengthen the effectiveness of non-lending activities and improve the monitoring of results and impact.</p>	<p>(a) Partnerships. Financial partnerships should be sought to combat the isolation of rural areas and provide access to basic services, one of the major constraints on the impact of development programmes in rural areas. This includes building roads and providing access to water and healthcare services. The partnership with national research should be strengthened, particularly in isolated areas, to test production technologies and techniques adapted to the most vulnerable. In addition, synergies and coordination should be developed between development projects and humanitarian interventions.</p>	<p>The government, in partnership with the EU (European Union) and the World Bank, is working to opening up the Grand Sud with projects to rehabilitate the main national roads. As a contribution to these efforts, 52 km of rural roads were constructed by DEFIS with Labour-intensive modality; underground water tanks were also constructed to contribute to improvement of availability of water. The portfolio continues and develops partnerships with research institutions such as National Center for Applied Research on Rural Development, (FOFIFA) International Crops Research Institute for the Semi-Arid Tropics (ICRISAT) and Consultative Group for International Agricultural Research Consultative Group for International Agricultural Research (CGIAR) research centers. IFAD actively contributes to the different thematic groups for the coordination of development actions in the areas of intervention. Collaborations are particularly strengthened with the Rome-based Agencies (RBAs) in the South.</p>	0

Madagas car	ESA	CSPE	11	CTRY	STR	GRT	Strengthen the effectiveness of non-lending activities and improve the monitoring of results and impact.	(b) Grants. It is recommended that: (i) grants be better integrated with the project portfolio; and (ii) information on grants be centralized at the country office.	Ongoing grant projects are effectively linked to the investment projects in the portfolio. The country office manages the information on grants. For instance, a grant from the Rural Poor Stimulus Facility titled Agricultural Marketing Support Project (PACPA) was anchored to DEFIS and designed to improve producers' access to markets, as a complement to ongoing investments in the portfolio. Moreover, PACPA incorporates joint activities with PROSPERER, DEFIS and FORMAPROD.	F
Madagas car	ESA	CSPE	12	CTRY	STR	DEC	Strengthen the effectiveness of non-lending activities and improve the monitoring of results and impact.	(c) Country office. IFAD should reinforce country office human resources by posting the country programme manager to Antananarivo. This will enable the country programme manager to participate more, and more effectively, in high-level policy dialogue and in mobilizing co-financing partnerships – a shared effort between IFAD and the Government.	IFAD has already strengthened the country team by recruiting two Country Programme Analysts in September 2021. A Programme Officer will also be deployed later this year 2022. The Country office is already CD-led. The Country Director who will be recruited will be based in Antananarivo, Madagascar later this year. In the meantime, the Country Director a.i. is in Nairobi with frequent travel to Madagascar.	F
Madagas car	ESA	CSPE	13	CTRY	STR	KM	Strengthen the effectiveness of non-lending activities and improve the monitoring of results and impact.	(d) Knowledge management. The Government should provide Cellule d'appui au programme FIDA (CAPFIDA) with more human resources so that it can fulfill its important role in results capitalization, specifically by analysing factors leading to the success or failure of interventions.	Discussions and reflections regarding CAPFIDA are ongoing. Madagascar's Ministry of Agriculture and Livestock (MINAE) recently confirmed its willingness to strengthen the unit to maintain its performance, particularly in knowledge management.	O



Madagas car	ESA	CSPE	14	CTRY	STR	RME	Strengthen the effectiveness of non-lending activities and improve the monitoring of results and impact.	(e) Monitoring and evaluation. The projects should have strategies to monitor results and impact based on a unified methodology so that the results of different projects can be aggregated cumulatively.	The projects are currently applying the IFAD methodology for COI (Core Outcome Indicators) measurement. However, this conceptual work for the unified methodology on results and impacts monitoring at country level has not yet been initiated. This is planned to be launched in collaboration CAPFIDA during this year.	O
-------------	-----	------	----	------	-----	-----	--	---	--	---

## Project Performance Evaluations (PPEs)

Country	Region	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-Recommendation	2022 - FollowUp	Status
<b>Uganda - Agricultural Technology and Agribusiness Advisory Services Project</b>										
Uganda	ESA	PPE	1	CTRY	OPER	DES	Even where IFAD is a minor contributor in large projects, it should ensure that its comparative advantage is adequately leveraged and its target group is sufficiently and effectively reached. Even where IFAD has a smaller funding role to play in a project, it should ensure that certain conditions are present. It should have a clear comparative advantage in the activities it funds, including building the capacity of farmer groups and institutions, productivity and market participation of rural people. Further, it should ensure that there is sufficient vulnerability mapping and needs assessment at design to allow its target group of smallholder farmers, women and youth to be reached effectively. Some other dimensions to pay attention to in such cases include the availability of sufficient supervisory resources to ensure that its interests are followed through in implementation, the possibility of scaling up of results so that it can leverage its resources and		No project has since been designed with IFAD as a minor contributor. In the new design for the the National Oilseeds Project (NOSP), the Project Design Team followed a detailed targeting process to ensure the target group is effectively reached, and designed activities to leverage IFAD's comparative advantage.	F

Country	Region	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-Recommendation	2022 - FollowUp	Status
							partnerships to deliver larger results, and "ring-fencing" funding through grants in specific areas of support, particularly for the provision of services that form a public rather than a private good.			
Uganda	ESA	PPE	2	CTRY	OPER	DES	Pay greater attention to political drivers in project design, especially when projects are largely funded from government resources. This implies conducting a thorough political economy analysis for projects being prepared in sensitive sectors and/or in states where governance issues could be a known risk. Depending on the level and significance of the political obstacles/risks to achievement of a project's objectives identified through such an analysis, solid and relevant risk mitigation measures should be proposed, or the project should even be redesigned.		Full attention to political drivers and thorough political economy analysis has been done in the Country Strategic Opportunities Programme and recent design of NOSP, and mitigation measures proposed, making full use of the Integrated Project Risk Matrix (IPRM) tool. The NOSP design has focused more on a private sector-led approach, which is less prone to political interference.	F

Country	Region	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-Recommendation	2022 - FollowUp	Status
Uganda	ESA	PPE	3	CTRY	OPER	PMA	Ensure that in complex projects with a multiplicity of implementation actors, there is a single project management unit for sound coordination, M&E and administrative efficiency. Under Agricultural Technology and Agribusiness Advisory Services (ATAAS), (National Agricultural Research Organization (NARO) and (National Agricultural Advisory Services (NAADS) at the start were jointly responsible for component 2 and research and extension interfaces. However, an explicit coordination unit was not created within (Ministry of Agriculture, Animal Industry, and Fisheries (MAAIF) and this made implementation and M&E difficult. While it may be useful to create decentralized units to manage implementation and monitoring, particularly in complex projects with a wide geographic spread, IFAD should advocate that the overall coordination and oversight of the project in such cases be vested in an apex Project Coordinating Unit (PCU). This can free up considerable time and monetary resources and, in principle, lead to more efficiency gains.		Noting this recommendation, though the NOSP design has provided for 2 implementing agencies belonging to 2 different ministries (and with 2 Project Management Units (PMUs)), M&E reports will be consolidated and submitted by only the PMU in the Ministry of Agriculture. Recognising the value of a streamlined implementation structure, the project will also be overseen by a single steering committee.	F
<b>Dominican Republic - Rural Economic Development Project in the Central and Eastern Provinces</b>										
Dominican Republic	LAC	PPE	1	CTRY	OPER	TGT	Develop and implement adequate mechanisms to ensure inclusion of the poorest in projects based on the value chains approach. The Asociación Boliviana para el Desarrollo Rural (PRORURAL) experience in the Dominican Republic shows that to ensure true social inclusion in value chains it is necessary to plan for: (i) proper scaling of geographic targeting, based on activating a dynamic of local economies and		The stronger focus on inclusion of vulnerable groups has been central to the intervention strategy of the PRORURAL (Productive Inclusion and Resilience of Poor Rural Youth Project) Inclusivo y Resiliente, which specifically targets small-scale producers and landless families with high levels of multidimensional and monetary poverty. For the geographic	O

Country	Region	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-Recommendation	2022 - FollowUp	Status
							building the capacities of the different target groups; (ii) incorporating implementation times that allow for processes to mature, in particular market access and permanence, and not just production and productivity improvements and the installation of infrastructure and equipment; (iii) an expanded vision of the value chains and market differentiation, including domestic and local markets; (iv) building capacities adapted to the skills of different beneficiaries, including weaker organizations; (v) using a set of relatively simple instruments to verify effective targeting, make the needed adjustments, and monitor and report progress to national systems combating poverty and inequality, such as the targeting instrument SIUBEN (Unified Beneficiaries System).		targeting, a "Territorial Opportunities Index" was developed to classify rural areas according to indicators relating to socioeconomic risk factors (poverty levels) and opportunities. Specific mechanisms have been developed: i) to ensure inclusion of three differentiated target group (small scale producers, landless families and youth) each one with a tailored approach to facilitate their participation in the project; ii) to build capacities of producer organisations through the development and implementation of Business Plans; and iii) to collaborate with SIUBEN to ensure an effective targeting of the poorest population groups. Similarly, the PRORURAL Joven, whose beneficiaries are 100% youth, incorporates a direct targeting mechanism to identify the most vulnerable and marginalised youths through existing, recognised and credible local institutions.	
Dominican Republic	LAC	PPE	2	CTRY	OPER	DES	Perform territorial diagnostics and adopt a more flexible approach and tools in connection with business plans. The business plans are a good tool, but require previous work and effective dialogue with the actors involved to identify their perspectives and priorities. This implies working not only under a logic of economic enterprise and market analysis, but also food security and empowerment of family farming based on multifunctionality and multiple activities, not confined to crop and livestock farming alone. Both the		The PRORURAL Programme (composed of PRORURAL Inclusivo y Resiliente and PRORURAL Joven) is based on the rural family resilience model, which goes well beyond the economic empowerment approach. The resilience model stems from the identification and clustering of factors (economic, social and environmental factors) that, on one hand, contribute to improving families' conditions and strengthening their capacity to respond to shocks to decrease	F

Country	Region	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-Recommendation	2022 - FollowUp	Status
							<p>participatory process of business plan preparation and the amount of the investment plan must be adapted to the capacities of Rural Entities and Organizations (REO) members to ensure the inclusion of the most vulnerable groups. IFAD has accumulated extensive experience in various types of business plans adapted to poor smallholder producers, and this should be analysed in the light of the Dominican context.</p>		<p>their impacts, on the other hand, enhancing their ability to recuperate quickly so as to avoid enduring adverse effects. PRORURAL Inclusivo y Resiliente is currently undertaking territorial diagnostics to inform business plan development, which in this project are called inclusion and resilience plans (PIRs) in line with the focus of the project. In addition, the programme includes differentiated PIRs for each target group (small producers/REO, landless families and youth), tailoring these to the capacities, strengths and needs of each group. The formulation of these inclusion and resilience plans will rely on the application of a resilience scorecard that will assist in identifying the main vulnerability factors, and define specific interventions to address them through the PIRs.</p>	
Dominican Republic	LAC	PPE	3	CTRY	STR	PAR	<p>Explore the possibility of expanding partnerships to implement and support rural organizations. In view of the good performance of the public-private partnership for supporting the investment plans of specific types of producers organizations in the Dominican context, several private partners could support the implementation of IFAD projects going forward. This support could be contingent upon targeting, sector, value chains and markets, among other factors. In this sense, strengthening is needed not only for more traditional sales agreements between economic organizations and enterprises but also various kinds of technical assistance for innovative</p>		<p>The public-private partnership with the Dominican Agri-business Board (JAD) has been reactivated in the PRORURAL Inclusivo y Resiliente, given the excellent results from the previous project. Nonetheless, both PRORURAL Inclusivo y Resiliente and PRORURAL Joven have broaden the range of parnters that support plan development and implementation, to ensure relevant expertise is brought in particularly in areas that are outside of JAD's traditional expertise (off-farm enterprises, youth empowerment, tourism, etc). In PRORURAL Joven, the</p>	O

Country	Region	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-Recommendation	2022 - FollowUp	Status
							value chains that require new installed capacities (e.g. for organic production and certification, rural tourism development and other rural initiatives). In addition, the division of labour among actors involved in business plan preparation should be established in greater detail to differentiate between those evaluating feasibility and those supporting and monitoring results.		partnerships with of Instituto Nacional de Formación Técnico Profesional (INFOTEP) (vocational training), Promotion of Micro and Small Enterprises (MIPyME) Centers (MSMEs) and Innovation Centers will build youth capacities to engage not only in entrepreneurship/business ventures, but also access better employment opportunities.	
Dominican Republic	LAC	PPE	4	CTRY	STR	PAR	Raise the visibility of the contribution made by the project approach within PRORURAL and promote synergies with other interventions to address the multiple factors underlying rural poverty in the Dominican Republic. Communication efforts by IFAD and the executing agency should be reinforced, especially in terms of the approach and results obtained. In order to work with the most vulnerable people, the projects must complement and be part of more comprehensive strategies favouring the poorest. On one hand, the existence of PRORURAL as a platform for territorial integration should be leveraged within a logic of rural economic development in line with the decentralization and land use efforts being made by the country. On the other, agreements should be explored with programmes such as the FAO and World Food Programme (WFP) nutrition and resilience interventions and the IDB agricultural health programmes, to avoid dispersion and oversized expectations based on a single project. This kind of		The PRORURAL Program, which promotes productive inclusion of vulnerable groups, is designed to complement Government's social policies for multidimensional poverty reduction, specially SUPERATE <sup>1</sup> , the main social protection program in the country. The second component of PRORURAL is fully devoted to policy dialogue, aiming to raise the profile and scale up the intervention and targeting model of PRORURAL through an interdisciplinary platform for public policy dialogue. Additionally, the implementation of the project relies strongly on partnerships, not only with private sector actors (such as JAD), but also with Government agencies and programmes such as SIUBEN, SUPERATE, Ministerio de la Mujer, Ministerio de Agricultura, etc. These alliances will be essential to collaborate with and leverage the results of other public programmes at territorial level, under the Governments	F

<sup>1</sup> The Dominican government's programme, Supérate, facilitates the incorporation of participants into the labour market to obtain a decent, quality job that guarantees exit from poverty. It also offers a cash transfer voucher. Supérate reaches one million households, categorised as vulnerable according to the Quality of Life Index (ICV) of the Single System of Beneficiaries (SIUBEN).

Country	Region	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-Recommendation	2022 - FollowUp	Status
							perspective could take on even greater relevance in the context of multidimensional measures to mitigate the effects of the COVID-19 pandemic on agriculture		current decentralisation focus. In terms of nutrition, a food security and nutrition strategy for PRORURAL is underway, with support from FAO and WFP.	
<b>Tajikistan - Khatlon Livelihoods Support Project</b>										
Tajikistan	NEN	PPE	1	CTRY	STR	TCB	Devise a strategic and long-term approach to building the capacities of community organizations, in partnerships with like-minded development partners. First and foremost, the approach to community-based organizations needs to be aligned with ongoing initiatives supported by other development partners and the government agenda, and it needs to take a longer term perspective to make a sustainable contribution to the emerging institutional framework in the rural areas. Capacity-building for village organizations and community organizations should incorporate financial, legal and technical aspects, such as the operation and maintenance (O&M) of infrastructure projects. IFAD should continue the successful cooperation with Aga Khan; it should also strengthen partnerships with international partners (e.g. CARITAS) working with community-based organizations within the same area, to ensure the coherence and sustainability of the approaches promoted.		To follow up on this recommendation, IFAD country team has deployed efforts to make sure all subsequent interventions remained well aligned with the Tajik government national development strategies as well as policies for agricultural and rural development. The operations, which succeeded to Khatlon Livelihoods Support Project (KLSP), include Livestock and Pasture Development Project I (LPDP1) and LPDP2, Climate Change Adaptation and Agribusiness Support Programme (CASP) and CASP Plus. Lessons learned from KLSP have been used to make sure all other projects continue to support and strengthen capacities of communities and community-based organizations in the framework of the implementation of the CASP, and design of CASP+. Dedicated technical components are included in each operation to mainly focus on establishing community organizations such as Pasture User Unions (PUUs), Common Interest Groups (CIGs) and Women Income Generating Groups (WIGGs). These	F

Country	Region	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-Recommendation	2022 - FollowUp	Status
									<p>organizations then continue to receive support and or training under other components in accordance with their specific needs. The community-based organizations are established and supported with the assistance of local Service Providers (NGOs including Aga Khan Foundation), who adhere to the pre-set guidelines in order to establish groups, elect and reinforce their governance body. By the time LPDP1 and LPDP2 closed, PUUs already constituted key implementing partners for any other projects including CASP. A total of 180 PUUs exist as of date, adequately trained and legally registered as entities to operate businesses and accumulate savings. In 2021, the Pasture User Unions (PUU) board counted 1,632 members of which 489 women. Besides the PUUs, Common Interest Groups (CIGs) as well as Women Income-Generating Groups (WIGGs) were established and continue to be supported and to collaborate with ongoing projects. The LPDP projects have established 173 CIGs for crop production, with 3,586 members, 146 CIGs for small ruminants with 9,413 members, and 261 WIGGs with 1,559 members. In 2022, all of these groups continue to work with ongoing projects to contribute in the sustainability of achievements.</p>	
Tajikistan	NEN	PPE	2	CTRY	STR	INF	Allocate sufficient resources to ensure a pro-poor and gender-focused approach to address the need for		As a key follow up measure to this recommendation, IFAD projects successors to KLSP,	F



Country	Region	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-Recommendation	2022 - FollowUp	Status
							<p>water in an efficient and sustainable way. The rural poor and women are in dire need of clean water for human and livestock consumption. Instead of providing basic water supply systems, IFAD should shift to multi-use water supply schemes. Local communities often end up using drinking-water access points for irrigation and livestock water supply purposes. Projects would need to learn from these experiences and secure sufficient funding for multiple-use water schemes (for both domestic needs and agricultural production, including livestock) which are low-cost and equitable.</p>		<p>have included activities related to access to water under multi-use scheme in specific components. In particular, the LPDP projects have integrated water issues with the implementation of the Community Level Pasture Management Plans (CLPMPs). Within CLPMPs, 600 sub-projects have been implemented. About 5% of these sub-projects were for water supply lines, watering points, and wells for animal and human drinking, and food production. Within this framework, 52 structures for drinking water lines and watering points for livestock, 9 bridges to pasture, and numerous vertical wells. The water programme has been upscale and expanded by CASP. Nowadays, the supervision and maintenance of water infrastructures lays with PUUs. Additionally, to improve the quality of the pastures and restore ecosystems within the framework of climate change, PUUs have received from LPDP 20,850 Waterboxx containers with modern water-saving technology, and training on the proper use of these Waterboxxes. With this water-use efficient equipment, PUUs will continue to grow and produce fruits and shade trees throughout the dry seasons and even in dry areas. The Waterboxx technology is simple, affordable, and easily taken over by communities after the period of assistance.</p>	

Country	Region	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-Recommendation	2022 - FollowUp	Status
Tajikistan	NEN	PPE	3	CTRY	OPER	INF	<p>Complement the technical capacities of project management units with qualified staff to support implementation quality and a pro-poor and gender focus. Subject-matter experts/consultants are needed to oversee all phases of the infrastructure project's life cycle, such as planning and subproject proposal clearance, selection of service providers (including assessment of technical proposals and financial proposals against the baseline costs), construction processes (including quality checking of materials used by the provider) and final handover of the project. There should be a separate engineer assigned to water support and wastewater infrastructure, and another focused on other types of infrastructure projects such as road and bridge construction or construction of electricity grids. IFAD should closely supervise and monitor the procurement and quality of infrastructure subprojects through supervision and/or local consultants reporting to IFAD. A social inclusion and gender specialist could provide advice and ensure that gender-focused approaches are incorporated in a meaningful way into the design, implementation and monitoring of the intervention/project. Advancing the pro-poor and women's empowerment agenda will require consistent focus and follow-up by project management and supervision.</p>		<p>For the proper implementation of its projects, IFAD has supported the government in recruiting and adequately staffing the State Enterprise "Project Management Unit - Livestock and Pasture Development" (SEPMU), which is the main implementing agency placed under the oversight of the Ministry of Agriculture. SEPMU has been implementing all IFAD funded projects in Tajikistan as a centralized management unit for years. It has remained adequately staffed and managed pro-actively with excellent track-record in terms of administrative and financial management in addition to sound project implementation. To complement SEPMU, IFAD recruits on retainer contracts technical-matter experts to participate in supervision and to provide advisory services for the proper management of infrastructures. This includes civil engineers specialized in water and water infrastructures, bridges, dams and roads. Other qualified consultants are regularly outsourced from partner organizations such as FAO, to work on the portfolio by looking into aspects agricultural mechanization. IFAD continues further to hire the services of gender and social inclusion specialists from SECAP in particular, to participate in supervisions and to provide advisory services as well.</p>	F

Country	Region	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-Recommendation	2022 - FollowUp	Status
<b>Bangladesh - Coastal Climate-Resilient Infrastructure Project</b>										
Bangladesh	APR	PPE	1	CTRY	OPER	INF	Investments in infrastructure should be accompanied by broader support for climate-resilient livelihoods tailored to the project area context, and that include activities to enable value chain development and enhance women's participation in labour markets. Although this was (partially) recognized when Coastal Climate Resilient Infrastructure Project (CCRIP) was designed, there were inadequate measures put in place to ensure that anticipated complementarities with other funding agencies and other IFAD-funded projects materialized and were optimized. In future, IFAD should design projects in such a way as to ensure that a holistic package of support is provided to targeted communities. This should be achieved either by funding the complete package within the project itself, or by ensuring good coordination with partner projects and agencies, and institutional accountability for delivery of anticipated linkages, efficiencies and results. The first step is to ensure that opportunities for, and potential barriers to, coordination are explored during the design process and are adequately reflected in project design. Partnerships with NGOs or other local organizations with recognized expertise in gender and social inclusion should also be included in project design, to develop and apply contextually relevant and effective approaches for addressing barriers to women's participation in markets.		The lessons learned from the Coastal Climate Resilient Infrastructure Project (CCRIP) project has already been incorporated in the Promoting Resilience of Vulnerable through Access to Infrastructure, Improved Skills and Information project (PROVATi3). The project is now providing vocational training to 30,000 youths to generate off-farm employment and also implementing Gender Action Learning System (GALS) for more than 8,500 participants from the labour contracting societies (LCS) groups where most of the participants are women. The project is also developing a flood early warning system which will support the livelihoods of population in 174 unions under the project districts by providing accurate flood forecasting.	F

Country	Region	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-Recommendation	2022 - FollowUp	Status
Bangladesh	APR	PPE	2	CTRY	OPER	CCA	In infrastructure-development projects, IFAD should ensure that conditions for mainstreaming a comprehensive and learning approach to climate resilience are in place. This includes ensuring that climate science informs the design of climate resilience features, and that adequate focus is given to the “soft” side of infrastructure management as well as sustainability. In the case of Bangladesh, for Local Government Engineering. Department (LGED), this approach could be facilitated through Climate Resilient Local Infrastructure Center (CReLIC), so long as the focus of knowledge generation and learning is not narrowly defined. It is further recommended that IFAD engage proactively with CReLIC to co-fund training and research on areas of interest, for example in relation to testing and implementing technologies and systems for sustainable waste management in markets. Beyond CReLIC, IFAD should aim to support the development of a national climate-resilient infrastructure policy with different stakeholders and ministries, using the lessons learned from CCRIP and other such projects.		The PROVATi3 project, which is a follow up project of CCRIP and targeted towards the climate vulnerable north western part of Bangladesh, has already completed three researches which are helping the project to determine the exact location and design specifications of climate resilient infrastructures. During the supervision and implementation support missions, the infrastructure specialist also regularly reviews the infrastructure construction and provides training to relevant LGED engineers based on his observations. A total number of 136 engineers have already been trained so far based on the outcomes of these researches and mission reviews. Regarding national climate-resilient infrastructure policy, IFAD is not the right agency for developing national policies in Bangladesh as there are other development partners who have more experience and is more preferred for this kind of work by the Government of Bangladesh.	F

Country	Region	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-Recommendation	2022 - FollowUp	Status
Bangladesh	APR	PPE	3	CTRY	STR	ENG	<p>IFAD should engage with central and local government to enable the development of a policy response and strategy to deal with systemic issues related to market leasing and market maintenance, and to ensure the long-term sustainability and viability of market infrastructure. The PPE findings related to market leasing and funding of market maintenance are not new; indeed, they informed the design of CCRIP and the focus that was placed on establishing and building the capacity of market management committees (MMCs) and requiring local authorities to commit to allocating funds for market maintenance prior to developing markets. The 2017 CCRIP policy study on market leasing provided further evidence on the nature and extensiveness of these issues. Although CCRIP has shown that engaging with local authorities and building the capacity of MMCs can improve the situation, a more sustained and systematic approach coming from the Government is needed. On the one hand this means taking steps to enforce Government regulations on market management and on the allocation of lease values for market maintenance. On the other hand, it involves developing an ongoing training programme for MMCs to prevent capacity declining over time, possibly with donor support.</p>		The Bangladesh ICO is working with the LGED to see how the MMCs' capacity can be further strengthened to ensure future sustainability of the markets.	O

Country	Region	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-Recommendation	2022 - FollowUp	Status
<b>Türkiye - Ardahan-Kars- Artvin Development Project</b>										
Türkiye	NEN	PPE	1	IFAD	OPER	DES	IFAD guidance for operations should include quality standards for key elements of the design and implementation of its operations that ensure evaluability, reflect local knowledge and context and are demand-driven:	(a) The evaluation takes note of the many improvements introduced by management since the project closed to improve the quality of design, including the Project Design Guidelines (2020), the Development Effectiveness Matrix Plus (DEM+) as a design quality and effectiveness review tool, and new technical guidance notes on theory of change, logframes, project exit strategies, the integrated project risk matrix, and others.	Nothing to add and this is of corporate relevance.	F
Türkiye	NEN	PPE	2	IFAD	OPER	DES	IFAD guidance for operations should include quality standards for key elements of the design and implementation of its operations that ensure evaluability, reflect local knowledge and context and are demand-driven:	(b) In addition to broad guidance, IFAD should provide clear quality standards for results frameworks and monitoring systems, including baseline surveys and terminal impact assessment surveys. IFAD should ensure that project implementation manuals fully reflect the improved corporate guidance and tools and provide adequate guidance and training to implement the project.	To enhance results management from start up to completion, the Division organized a sub-regional M&E training with the participation of project M&E specialists and government representatives. An action plan was agreed and followed up. Additionally, for completion a joint impact assessment (NEN, Research and Impact Assessment Division – (RIA), Government) is piloted in Türkiye and learning and best practices will be shared with other countries. The ToRs of the impact assessment were prepared by the government and inputted by RIA and NEN. RIA will provide capacity building to the firm in data sampling, collection and analyses. NEN and	F

Country	Region	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-Recommendation	2022 - FollowUp	Status
									RIA will do quality control of the process.	
Türkiye	NEN	PPE	3	IFAD	OPER	DES	IFAD guidance for operations should include quality standards for key elements of the design and implementation of its operations that ensure evaluability, reflect local knowledge and context and are demand-driven:	(c) NEN (and the Programme Management Department) must assess the present systems of quality assurance and quality enhancement to ensure that they will be able to prevent the recurrence of Ardahan-Kars-Artvin Development Project (AKADP) design flaws, specifically in identifying and managing risks related to weak absorption capacity for loan services in project areas and other recurring issues in the country portfolio.	This is of corporate relevance. To note that the IPRM was introduced at the corporate level and is used in a practical way by country teams to identify and monitor the risks.	F
Türkiye	NEN	PPE	4	CTRY	OPER	TGT	IFAD should clarify guidance on the targeting approach as well as the gender strategy to include the following:	(a) Targeting approach. The PPE endorses the current practice of geographic targeting to identify the poorest provinces, districts and villages along with relevant agro-ecological considerations. However, this approach should be	Most vulnerable were excluded because they were not in the registry system of the Ministry of Agriculture and Forestry and could not receive public financing. The national policy for access to public financing in Türkiye was found to be not fully pro poor. Indeed, access to project funds through matching	F

Country	Region	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-Recommendation	2022 - FollowUp	Status
								combined with a simple and verifiable direct targeting of households that avoids ill-defined categories, such as "economically active poor". Projects should keep records of the minimum qualifying assets necessary to receive the loan as well as the baseline of assets of all beneficiaries. If a project chooses to pursue labour creation, it should ensure that evidence was available to show that the project had the desired effect on increasing rural employment. To this end, the project will track the assets of the beneficiaries and provide the statistics of this distribution to establish the extent to which the project targeting was pro-poor at the beginning, and if poverty was being reduced.	grants is conditioned by the farmer's registration in the registry held by the Ministry of Agriculture. Such eligibility criteria was found challenging to the most vulnerable who cannot afford registration costs plus the annual payment of contributions for pension. Building on this recommendation and also on findings of supervision missions, the country office generated evidence, and successfully carried out a high level policy dialogue and advocacy to bring the Ministry to accept flexibilities in the policy. Since, the access of public funds under IFAD funded projects is a reality for the most vulnerable thanks to a new mechanism we introduced to direct -target such category.	



Country	Region	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-Recommendation	2022 - FollowUp	Status
Türkiye	NEN	PPE	5	CTRY	OPER	GDR	IFAD should clarify guidance on the targeting approach as well as the gender strategy to include the following:	(b) Gender strategy. Future projects in Türkiye that aim to promote women empowerment and gender equality should have clear, gender-disaggregated results in the logframe. The PMUs must develop and implement a gender strategy at the beginning of new projects. The gender strategy will assess the risks of low participation of women and identify gender- and context appropriate activities to enhance their participation. To implement this strategy, IFAD country office should require PMUs to include a dedicated gender specialist with a dedicated budget to implement this gender strategy. As part of this gender strategy, IFAD should engage in policy dialogue at the local and national levels, partnering with other actors, to ensure that laws and regulations do not pose barriers to women accessing public finances to farming activities.	IFAD Gender specialist worked with all ongoing projects on a gender strategy and action plan. Implementation of the plan is assessed during each supervision missions. Additionally, gender training was provided to all gender specialists in the projects. One of the projects also won in 2019 the IFAD Gender Award.	F

Country	Region	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-Recommendation	2022 - FollowUp	Status
Türkiye	NEN	PPE	6	CTRY	STR	PAR	<p>IFAD country office should broaden its partnerships to include the Ministry of Family and Social Policies, the Ministry of Youth and Sports, and key organizations (think tanks, academia, local NGOs) promoting youth development as well as empowerment of women in rural areas. A partnership strategy needs to be in place that identifies actors, their relevance to achieving project outcomes and the mechanisms to engage them. This strategy and the partners it identifies would help enhance the reach and appropriateness of IFAD's activities to local contexts, and strengthen knowledge creation, codification and transmission of knowledge emerging from the project. It will also facilitate more effective non-lending activities such as advocating for scaling up and replicating successful projects within Türkiye and abroad.</p>		<p>A Steering Committee was established in consultation with the Borrower and the lead agency. The other stakeholders like Ministry of Family and Social Policies, Ministry of Youth and Sports and other key organizations are members of the committee to meet once every year as a strategic entity in addition to the monthly portfolio meetings with implementing entities.</p>	F
<b>China - Hunan Agricultural and Rural Infrastructure Improvement Project</b>										
China	APR	PPE	1	PROJ	OPER	MVC	<p>Continue to support diversified agricultural production investments of appropriate scale through IFAD's follow-up project in Hunan Province. Hunan Province has taken a leading role in the rural revitalization initiative in China. The new project is an opportunity to continue to explore various options for value chain development, within and outside farmer cooperatives as recommended in the 2016 COSOP. The experience gained through Hunan Agricultural and Rural Infrastructure Improvement Project (HARIIP) shows how active engagement with rural entrepreneurs will be critical, whether they operate</p>		<p>IFAD's follow-up project in Hunan - Hunan Rural Revitalization Demonstration Project (H2RDP) - was designed after the PPE and entered into force in Feb 2021. H2RDP fully incorporates the PPE recommended two priorities for IFAD's engagement in the context of rural development in Hunan and more broadly in China.</p> <p>- The project interventions further explore potentials of economic gain from value chains of local specialities for vulnerable rural people, particularly youth</p>	F

Country	Region	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-Recommendation	2022 - FollowUp	Status
							under a farmer cooperative or lead farmer status. HARIIP's experience points to two priorities for this engagement: resolving remaining obstacles in community infrastructure, and supporting linkages between these entrepreneurs and vulnerable people.		and women, while increasing their resilience to the impacts of climate change and by investing in public and productive infrastructures; - H2RDP well aims to build sustainable linkage of smallholders with agro-entities including farmer cooperatives along the value chains through joint investment based on competitively selected business plans and mutually beneficial contractual arrangements.	

Country	Region	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-Recommendation	2022 - FollowUp	Status
China	APR	PPE	2	PROJ	OPER	ENG	<p>Develop operational tools to increase poor households' access to project activities, aligned with the national poverty reduction programme. The follow-up Hunan project and other IFAD activities in China should closely interact with the Poor Areas Development Office (PADOs) regarding China's post-2020 poverty reduction programme, when its detailed features become available. Project designs should be adjusted accordingly in order to ensure consistency and propose added value from IFAD presence. HARIIP's experience points to the importance of operational tools and processes in this regard. Towards this end, future IFAD projects need to directly access the national poverty reduction programme database and monitoring tools, which may require PADO to be a formal partner, as well as use good practices from the programme, such as ceilings in the value of project support to individuals (or individual proportion of shares in the case of farmer cooperatives). Given IFAD's strong engagement on value chains in China, a new tool to assess and monitor the pro-poor orientation of the value chains being researched and supported could be developed in partnership with the national programme.</p>		<p>H2RDP aims to serve as a pilot in the context of the government's rural revitalization strategy, where those recently graduated from poverty and other vulnerable groups can continue increase income thus "sustaining poverty eradication efforts" as a key priority in the strategy. The project will demonstrate, on a pilot basis, that economic opportunities in rural areas can continue to be explored to benefit the vulnerable groups and attract investment back into the rural areas;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- PADO is integrated into the Department of Agriculture and Rural Affairs being the implementing agency of the new project. The previously registered poor households and counties remain focus target group of the H2RDP and will be monitored using the national database and monitoring tools.</li> <li>- Value chain Business Plans are competitively selected with poverty inclusion and outreach being the primary consideration of eligibility.</li> </ul>	F

Country	Region	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-Recommendation	2022 - FollowUp	Status
China	APR	PPE	3	CTRY	OPER	GDR	<p>Redefine the approach to gender equality and women’s empowerment which is pursued through IFAD projects in China.</p> <p>The 2016 COSOP confirmed that women are a target group for IFAD in China, and highlighted the strengthening of women’s economic power as a means to build gender equality awareness. The experience of HARIIP shows a need for more detailed guidelines for individual projects. Three areas of attention are proposed for these future guidelines: (i) principles for economic empowerment of poorer women (for example, promoting and monitoring a reduction of the gap between men and women wages in agriculture); (ii) identification of a supportive institutional setting, which could be a partnership with (All-China Women's Federation (ACWF) in some cases provided the agency’s scope of work in the project is clearly defined, or gender focal points within Departments of agriculture and rural affairs, or alternative options; and (iii) minimum good practice to ensure effective participation of women in project activities (e.g. appropriate training schedules and childcare during training). Defining a process taking into account provincial specificities is recommended, rather than the definition of a national strategy. When a project supports champions for gender equality, care should be given to include cases in which poor women have been promoted.</p>		<p>— The two projects in China approved during IFAD 11 (designed after PPE), namely Yunnan Rural Revitalization Demonstration Project (Y2RDP) and H2RDP Rural Revitalization Demonstration Project (H2RDP) were designed as ‘gender transformative’ projects.</p> <p>—Both Y2RDP and H2RDP projects adopt similar approaches pursuing gender equality and empowerment in the rural economy, including (i) creating new employment opportunities, with a priority on women; (ii) providing business services and stimulating women entrepreneurship potential and capacities; and (iii) enhancing the participation of women farmer in the national professional farmer training program;</p> <p>—For H2RDP, to increase the percentage of women beneficiaries, incremental number of women completing the New Professional Farmer Development training program is set as one of the indicators to trigger disbursement of IFAD financing, according to the proposed result-based lending approach.</p> <p>—A supportive institutional setting is ensured through Women’s Federation (WF)’s full involvement in project management and equipped gender focal point at all levels. A partnership with UNWomen to jointly support gender mainstreaming and empowerment for H2RDP is</p>	F

Country	Region	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-Recommendation	2022 - FollowUp	Status
									<p>established by Memorandum of Understanding (MOU). A letter of intent (LoI) between IFAD and Youcheng Foundation is to be signed in 2022, where gender equity and women empowerment is one of the key thematic area for collaboration.</p>	

Country	Region	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-Recommendation	2022 - FollowUp	Status
China	APR	PPE	4	CTRY	OPER	INN	<p>Orient innovations in IFAD projects in China towards project implementation processes. The launch of rural revitalization in China is an opportunity for IFAD to support, in partnership with provincial project stakeholders, new approaches to agricultural and rural development in line with the 2016 COSOP and the new demand from IFAD's partners in China. IFAD should make full use of the presence of experienced provincial PMOs to adjust project implementation processes and innovate in that field, starting with the follow-up project under preparation in Hunan (e.g. results-based disbursement). Better defined monitoring indicators and new templates for knowledge sharing will be useful for such innovations. Whenever feasible, these tools should take into account the PMOs' needs in their own work as technical assistants in China's international cooperation projects.</p>		<p>Both Y2RDP and H2RDP were conceived as "demonstration" projects, which introduce several innovations, e.g. inclusive private sector investment models, business incubation centers, disbursement against results, climate-proofed design of infrastructure, etc., to test their applicability in the project context, learn lessons, and promote replication of the models and approaches that demonstrate themselves successful.</p> <p>—Learning and policy impact is an important focus of the new project. IFAD and a national research institute has established partnership through an LoI to support monitoring and evaluating, extracting relevant knowledge from IFAD portfolio, and utilizing it to inform policy making.</p>	F

Country	Region	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-Recommendation	2022 - FollowUp	Status
<b>India - Tejaswini Women's Empowerment Programme</b>										
India	APR	PPE	1	CTRY	OPER	GDR	<p>Future Self Help Groups (SHG) programmes should be designed around women-led, self-financing apex organizations, with continuing support for women's social and political empowerment. Anchoring SHG programme interventions around apex organizations that earn income based on the services they provide, and that are governed by the women that they serve, creates a sustainable and empowering structure for delivering social and economic benefits to poor women. In the drive towards developing the financial and economic aspects of SHG programmes, it is critical that programmes such as Nav Tejaswini and the National Rural Livelihoods Mission (NRLM) do not lose sight of the need to simultaneously support women's social and political empowerment through a holistic, gender-transformative approach. This includes building women's and men's capacity to critically analyse and reflect on the structures, norms and values that underpin gender inequality and constrain women's participation in the economy and in society. It also involves enabling women to identify and strategize around their needs and priorities, both individually and collectively, and facilitating networks of SHG apex organizations at district, state and national levels to engage in policy dialogue.</p>		<p>The design of Nav Tejaswini project which was a follow up to Tejaswini in Maharashtra was completed in 2020 and the loan agreement was signed in Jan 2021. This design has fully incorporated recommendations of the PPE regarding strong community institutions, engagement of men, all round empowerment of women etc. In line with the Eleventh Replenishment of IFAD's Resources mainstreaming commitments, the project has been validated as Gender Transformative. Accordingly the project endeavours to address root causes of gender inequalities, by consolidating the gains and expanding the successes of the previous project in: i) work-load reduction through machinery and women friendly technologies; ii) legal rights awareness training on gender responsive legislations including domestic violence, dowry, sexual harassment etc.; iii) women's participation in public spaces and institutions such as local governance, markets and government bodies; iv) promoting joint titling of land and property; v) decision making at community, group and household levels; vi) gender sensitization and orienting services, including specific men's sensitization workshops. The implementation of these activities is already underway. No further follow up is required.</p>	F



Country	Region	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-Recommendation	2022 - FollowUp	Status
India	APR	PPE	2	CTRY	OPER	GDR	<p>Adopt a market-aware approach to women's economic empowerment that is driven by analysis of what would be most economically empowering for different groups of women. More focus should be placed on marketing and value chain development, but taking a market-aware rather than market-driven approach, as the selection of subsectors should take into consideration the viability of different economic activities and women's control over income from those activities. To ensure that livelihood activities are transformative for rural women, interventions should be based on thorough analysis, including analysis of intrahousehold dynamics and the distribution of resources and labour, and gendered market and value chain analysis for key subsectors. This should take into consideration the needs, capacities and interests of different groups of women, including women entrepreneurs, women without access to land, women with child and elder care responsibilities, unmarried women, women in geographically remote areas, and women in the most socially and economically disadvantaged castes. Alongside support for microenterprises and smallscale agriculture, waged employment opportunities should be pursued, such as through agroprocessing and value chain development. In doing so, attention should be paid to internationally agreed standards for decent work and living wages. There should also be a concerted drive towards joint ownership of land and other productive assets.</p>		<p>The design of Nav Tejaswini has fully incorporated these recommendations. The new project proposes to (i) leverage the institutional and capacity gains made under the Tejaswini programme to promote women's enterprise in rural Maharashtra; (ii) build on the successful model of community-managed resource centres (CMRCs) to enable women themselves to transform their initiatives into profit-making and profit-sharing enterprises; (iii) leverage successful partnerships with commercial banks to provide microenterprise loans for women entrepreneurs; and (iv) build on past convergence with government schemes to leverage greater benefits for communities and establish sustainable solutions. The Nav Tejaswini project is undertaking Market-driven enterprise development, including provision of technical services to women and women's groups to develop farm, manufacturing and service enterprises; provision of an enabling environment at enterprise level for women to access financial services; mentoring ultra-poor and vulnerable households to seek pathways out of extreme poverty. Analytical studies related to value chains are planned/ underway. No further follow up required.</p>	F

Country	Region	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-Recommendation	2022 - FollowUp	Status
India	APR	PPE	3	CTRY	OPER	CCA	<p>Include an explicit focus on climate change resilience and sustainable natural resource management in future programmes. Given the high dependence of rural livelihoods on natural resources, and as a result, the high vulnerability of such livelihoods to climate change, it is critical that future programmes, at their core, include an explicit and intentional focus on sustainable natural resource management and climate change adaptation in the design of their components and activities. Such climate-resilient activities should be explicitly incorporated into the logframes of future programmes, allowing for the measurement and tracking of achievements in this domain.</p>		<p>Climate is integrated into the ToC, design and budget of Nav Tejaswini. The project is designed to enhance climate resilience through the adoption of climate smart technologies and good agronomic practices that are climate smart and locally adapted. The project has integrated climate resilience measures through climate-smart agricultural strategies, strong collaboration with extension and weather/climate monitoring institutions for regular agro-climatic information and use of appropriate crops and breeds. All programme components (1,2,3) are computed in part as climate finance. The total amount of IFAD climate finance for this project is calculated on a preliminary basis as 52 per cent of the IFAD financing, equivalent to US\$20.6 million. The project has on-boarded a Social, Environmental and Climate Assessment Procedures (SECAP) Focal point to follow up on all SECAP related recommendations of the design. The project has integrated climate resilience measures through climate-smart agricultural strategies, strong collaboration with extension and weather/climate monitoring institutions for regular agro-climatic information and use of appropriate crops and breeds. No further action is needed.</p>	F

Country	Region	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-Recommendation	2022 - FollowUp	Status
India	APR	PPE	4	CTRY	OPER	PMA	Ensure consistency in senior project management, delegating decision-making authority when necessary to ensure smooth implementation. Appropriate measures need to be agreed between IFAD and government upon the signing of new projects, to ensure that the turnover of project directors is minimized. In situations where positions become vacant, swift action needs to be taken to ensure that sufficient decision-making authority is delegated to relevant personnel to ensure continuity and minimize gaps in implementation, until such time that the positions are filled.		MAVIM, the lead implementing Agency for Nav Tejaswini has a cadre of staff led by the General Manager (Programmes) who are long term employees of the Corporation (MAVIM) and do not face any significant movement. At the level of Managing Director (MD), while Tejaswini project witnessed frequent changes, Nav tejaswini, from before the start of the design in 2019 has had the same MD. The state government is currently also considering an extension for her in view of her good performance and the positive feedback provided by IFAD. In any case there is high level of Delegation of Authority and decision making between the MD and the Global Mechanism (GM) which ensures that project activities are not impacted with the change of the MD, if/when it happens. No further action is needed.	F

## Corporate-level evaluations (CLE)

Country	Region	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-Recommendation	2022 - FollowUp	Status
<b>Corporate-level evaluation on IFAD's support to innovations for inclusive and sustainable smallholder agriculture</b>										
		CLE	1	IFAD	STR	INN	IFAD should set clear corporate/strategic goals for its innovation agenda, and develop and implement operational frameworks, aligned with its 2016-2025 Strategic Framework and the 2030 Agenda. The framework should provide an appropriate definition of innovation in line with IFAD's operational context, and include specific objectives and priority result areas, as well as guiding principles and actions over a limited period (similarly to the KM theme).		Following an 18-month consultation process spearheaded by Change Delivery and Innovation Unit, (CDI), IFAD adopted in March 2022 a new definition of and approach to innovation. The new definition and approach were communicated by the Office of the Vice-President to all OMC members, to all IFAD employees via the Intranet and to the public via the Innovation at IFAD website. In collaboration with the Commission on Sustainable Agriculture Intensification (CoSAI), IFAD (CDI) is assessing the adoption by IFAD of the Principles and Metrics for Innovation in Sustainable Agri-Food Systems. CDI and Environmental, Climate, Gender and Social Inclusion Division (ECG) are currently exploring the possibility to run a pilot to test Key Performance Indicators (KPIs) of the Principles in IFAD's funded projects.	O

Country	Region	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-Recommendation	2022 - FollowUp	Status
		CLE	2	IFAD	STR	INN	<p>IFAD should improve the operating model that supports its innovation processes. Relevant guidelines should be developed to provide orientation on methodologies (along the project cycle), aiming to: (i) incorporate innovations as key outputs that lead to higher-level results; and (ii) adopt a holistic systems approach to innovations. The guidelines should be less prescriptive, to suggest tools and/or frameworks for monitoring and evaluating innovation processes (linked with existing tools), as well as for assessing their contribution to projects' outcomes and impacts.</p>		<p>In the current context, the new approach to innovation approved by management will be implemented by IFAD by adopting the United Nations (UN) Innovation Toolkit as the guidelines to mainstream innovation at IFAD and by applying the Silicon Valley lean and agile approach to entrepreneurship. The UN Innovation Toolkit provides the methodology, guidelines and tools to guide all IFAD employees in their innovation journey. One of the key elements of the toolkit is the 27-question diagnostic process, which then provides insight regarding users "readiness to innovate" across five critical pillars for innovation: Strategy; Partnerships; Architecture; Culture; and Evaluation: Strategy, Partnerships, Architecture, Culture, Evaluation (S.P.A.C.E). Model. While the Silicon Valley lean and agile approach to entrepreneurship is been applied and included in the coaching services offered to winning teams of the 2022 IFAD Innovation Challenge. Teams who participate in the Challenge receive training in lean innovation, behavioural design and coaching on the adoption of the UN Innovation Toolkit. This approach will be reviewed on an ongoing basis as tools and guidelines in this area are expected to evolve over time.</p>	F

Country	Region	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-Recommendation	2022 - FollowUp	Status
		CLE	3	IFAD	STR	INN	<p>IFAD should dedicate greater attention to bundles of innovations that are transformative. The more transformative innovations are, the more sustainable and amenable to scaling up they will be. Orientations should be provided on key methodological steps that favour the identification, at the planning stage, of innovations that can work in synergy with one another, to be clustered or bundled at the implementation stage, leading to packages with transformative features. Guidelines or frameworks suggested in the previous recommendation should allow measuring of results achieved through transformative innovations.</p>		<p>The Architecture and Partnerships pillars of the S.P.A.C.E. Model in the UN Innovation Toolkit present tools and guidelines on how to design operating models that integrate innovation into normal business operations, define a value proposition, identify new partners to improve innovation outcomes, design and manage partnerships, manage risk and prioritise partners through the creation of an evaluation framework. CDI advocates continuously for the adoption of the UN Innovation Toolkit and its systematic use to promote good practices, manage risk more effectively and deliver more impactful results.</p> <p>In addition, teams receiving seed funding through the Innovation Challenge are also encouraged to seek strategic co-funding partnerships, and CDI supports partnerships efforts by establishing connections and sharing knowledge and use cases through learning events and leading inter-agency dialogues.</p>	F

Country	Region	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-Recommendation	2022 - FollowUp	Status
		CLE	4	IFAD	STR	INN	IFAD should enhance the innovation culture within its business model to steadily and effectively support its innovation agenda. This should be accomplished through an ongoing implementation of specific funding initiatives (such as the Innovation Challenge) to elicit an appetite for innovation, and to encourage risk-taking initiatives associated with genuinely novel solutions and approaches addressing important smallholder agriculture challenges. It is also essential to: (i) strengthen internal capabilities (relevant staff required and their skills) for that purpose; and (ii) support emerging innovation champions across the organization by promoting incentive mechanisms (e.g. financial or nonfinancial rewards).		The culture pillar in the S.P.A.C.E. Model provides guidelines and tools on ways to support the celebration of learning through failure, creating incentives and opportunities to identify desired behaviours to incentivize, defining strategic risks and risk tolerance and engaging governing bodies to gain buy-in CDI and the UN System Staff College established a partnership in 2020 that is currently being formalised contractually to identify innovation champions within the organisation and recognise them through public events (learn more here: <a href="https://www.unssc.org/feature-d-themes/unssc-live-ifad-un-innovation-toolkit">https://www.unssc.org/feature-d-themes/unssc-live-ifad-un-innovation-toolkit</a> ). In 2022, the partnership between IFAD and UN System Staff College (UNSSC) has been strengthened by including a new member, the UN-ITC, to organise an annual End-of-the-Year award ceremony to recognise champions at IFAD and other UN agencies with the support and recognition of the Office of the UN Secretary General and the UN Chief Executives Board (UN-CEB). Also in 2020, IFAD and UNSSC launched a research initiative with academia to capture and document the ability of the UN Innovation Toolkit to transform the work of UN organizations and draw attention to examples of positive change leadership. The joint research	F

Country	Region	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-Recommendation	2022 - FollowUp	Status
									<p>project built upon the strong relationship between IFAD and UNSSC in the effort to advance and promote innovation in the UN system (read more here: <a href="https://www.unssc.org/news-and-insights/news/unssc-partners-ifad-research-impact-un-innovation-toolkit">https://www.unssc.org/news-and-insights/news/unssc-partners-ifad-research-impact-un-innovation-toolkit</a>)</p> <p>As part of these efforts, IFAD and UNSSC established in 2021 a mentoring programme to pair young innovators with senior innovators and promote learning, cross-generational collaboration and the origination of novel ideas (learn more here: <a href="https://www.unssc.org/ifad-unssc-mentoring-partnerships">https://www.unssc.org/ifad-unssc-mentoring-partnerships</a>).</p>	



Country	Region	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-Recommendation	2022 - FollowUp	Status
		CLE	5	IFAD	STR	PAR	<p>IFAD should increase funding and operational partnerships that contribute to the support of its innovation agenda. Strategic co-funding opportunities should be boosted with partners (e.g. bilateral with governments, and multilateral with other IFIs) that share similar innovation goals. The aim should be to enhance operational synergies for piloting, uptake, dissemination and scaling up of innovations, especially those addressing issues pertaining to inclusiveness, NRM and adaptation to CC. IFAD's grant programme should be better leveraged for the development of effective innovations addressing smallholder agriculture challenges. Therefore, priority and flexibility should be given to grant proposals that plan on: (i) strengthening capabilities of national players of IFAD-supported innovation processes; (ii) scouting for novel solutions; and (iii) enhancing the effectiveness of partnerships and synergies at the national and regional levels.</p>		<p>Since its establishment in 2019, the Change, Delivery and Innovation Unit (CDI) has led the establishment of the UN-Rome Based Agencies innovation team and contributes to the design and implement of the action plan for RBA collaboration among FAO, IFAD and WFP on innovation. CDI is also a core member of the Moonshots for Development (M4D) working group of the innovation branches/units of the International Financial Institutions and hosts annually the quarterly meetings aimed to identify synergies and co-funding opportunities of scalable ideas. In early 2022, CDI led, funded and got approved the new brand identity of the group which will be used for all M4D funded investments and initiatives. CDI is also currently leading the design and delivery of a Moonshots for Development technical note on "Lessons learned from designing and implementing prize competitions for sustainable development". In addition to the above, CDI contributes quarterly to the UN Innovation Update with news on IFAD's work on innovation (read an example here: <a href="https://www.uninnovation.net/work/assets/BeSci/UNIN_Quarterly_Update_Q3_2021.pdf">https://www.uninnovation.net/work/assets/BeSci/UNIN_Quarterly_Update_Q3_2021.pdf</a>) and to technical compendiums such as the UN Climate Change</p>	O

Country	Region	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-Recommendation	2022 - FollowUp	Status
									<p>Innovation Compendium and the UN Behavioural Science Report.</p> <p>Demand for the innovation component of CDI to provide services and support to IFAD divisions and to inter-agency initiatives is increasing exponentially; however, the CDI unit is comprised of 3 budgeted staff positions, and there are no prospects of budget increases to allow for the hiring of new personnel. Therefore, the unit is making extraordinary efforts to attract interest and funding from innovative partnerships, which include foundations and the private sector.</p>	
		CLE	6	IFAD	STR	KM	<p>IFAD should streamline KM tools for accessing and sharing innovation related information by limiting their number. One main common platform should be used to promote IFAD-supported innovations and disseminate M&amp;E findings on innovation results and lessons. Opportunities offered by KM events should be used as an occasion to launch and promote the platform on a periodical basis. Communication activities (including social media and internal website alerts) should be used to draw the attention of IFAD staff and other stakeholders to generate and maintain enthusiasm, as well as sustain engagement on IFAD-supported innovation activities.</p>		<p>CDI has initially responded to this recommendation by establishing, in collaboration with the Knowledge Management Coordination Group, an online Community of Practice on IFAD's Dgroups platform known as the IFAD Innovation Network and by working with Communications Division (COM) and Information and Communications Technology Division (ICT) in the design, delivery and maintenance of the Innovation at IFAD website (<a href="https://www.ifad.org/en/innovation">https://www.ifad.org/en/innovation</a>).</p> <p>Due to CDI's resourcing situation, to address this situation and respond to this issue more fully, collaboration with Strategy and Knowledge Department (SKD), COM and ICT is necessary.</p>	O



## Historic Follow up: Project Performance Evaluations (PPEs)

Country	Region	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-Recommendation	2021 - Follow Up	2022 - FollowUp	Status
<b>Sierra Leone - Rehabilitation and Community-based Poverty Reduction Project</b>											
Sierra Leone	WCA	PPE	1	CTRY	OPER	ORG	To promote effective and efficient market participation by smallholder farmers, strengthen equally the institutional expertise and the financial capacity of marketing organizations. Where marketing organizations such as farmers' marketing groups or farmers' cooperatives are important avenues for smallholder farmer commercialization, the focus should not be limited to building their institutional capacities alone. Especially in fragile contexts, the access to longterm, sustainable finance for such organizations is a critical requirement, and linkages with financial institutions a necessity. This is not only necessary for making upfront payments to farmers for procuring produce, but also includes buying equipment and maintaining adequate levels of working capital. IFADsupported interventions should strengthen the institutional and financial capacities of smallholder farmers, with a focus on strengthening their market powe		This is ongoing under the Agricultural Value chain Development (AVDP) project – Agricultural Business Centres (ABCs) are being supported with training, also training is being provided through Farmer Field Schools. The Multi Stakeholder Platforms implemented by AVDP are also a critical point of capacity building and building strong value chain networks.	Under the Rural Finance and Community Improvement Project (RFCIP2), which is an IFAD funded project, 76 Rural Financial Institutions (RFCIs) have been established across 15 districts in Sierra Leone. The rural financial institutions (RFIs) consist of 17 Community Banks (CBs) and 59 Financial Services Associations (FSAs) and are regarded as the most organized players in the rural financial sector in the country. These financial institutions continue to play significant role in linking the agriculture sector to the much-needed financial resources. The RFIs provide loan facilities to Agricultural Business Centres (ABCs) in production, processing and marketing. For ABCs in production, loans are provided in tranches, following production cycles. The	O

Country	Region	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-Recommendation	2021 - Follow Up	2022 - FollowUp	Status
										RFIs are all autonomous and self-sustainable.	

Country	Region	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-Recommendation	2021 - Follow Up	2022 - FollowUp	Status
Sierra Leone	WCA	PPE	2	CTRY	OPER	YTH	In concert with awareness-raising and representation, aim for effective participation of youth and women through specific strategies and needs assessment at the design phase of projects. The marginalization of women and youth is exacerbated in fragile contexts, including in countries with episodes of lengthy civil wars. In such situations, projects should move away from aiming for their mere participation, through outreach percentages or outputs, and awarenessraising to ensuring that women and youth are structurally mainstreamed and that the activities are suitable for them. This should start early, from the design phase, ideally through a needs assessment plan. In the case of women, a logical and more effective approach would be to start with awareness-raising early in the project (through systems such as GALS), followed by a move to empowerment, through well-directed activities.		The GALS household (HH) methodology is a key element of the AVDP, and is reflected in the gender strategy and action plan.	The other IFAD funded project (the Agricultural Value chain Development – AVDP) has a strong focus on gender and youth inclusion in all of its activities. It integrated gender responsive institutional mechanisms, particularly in the ABCs, cooperatives and rural financial institutions (RFIs). The project also has gender sensitization events at community level and knowledge sharing events on best practices. Youth mainstreaming activities are also embedded within the project and these include: the use of the youth contractor service provider model from Smallholder Commercialization Programme - Global Agriculture and Food Security Programme (SCP-GAFSP) for the rehabilitation of Inland Valley Swamps (IVSs) and the provision of targeted mentoring and business development services. These have proven to be the major	O

Country	Region	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-Recommendation	2021 - Follow Up	2022 - FollowUp	Status
										sustainability strategies of the AVDP. A minimum of 40% women and 40% youth will participate in project-sponsored activities	

Country	Region	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-Recommendation	2021 - Follow Up	2022 - FollowUp	Status
Sierra Leone	WCA	PPE	3	CTRY	OPER	SUS	In fragile contexts, make exit strategies a central part of project designs and monitor following the strategies during implementation. Fragile contexts as in Sierra Leone, which often come with low institutional capacities and budgets, have an adverse effect on the sustainability of benefits that flow from IFAD-supported projects. Sustainability of infrastructure is a prime example of an activity that requires funds for regular maintenance. In this regard, adequate attention is to be paid at the design stage through a well-designed and detailed exit strategy. One such strategy can be to formalize activities and responsibilities through memorandums of understanding to ensure that all stakeholders know and execute their roles after the project's end. Other such avenues are partnerships with other development partners or scaling up the activities to ensure sustainability. During implementation, adherence to the planned responsibilities and the likelihood and feasibility of future handover need to be checked and agreed at regular intervals, and changes to the strategy should be made if so required.		Through the planned Multi Stakeholder Platforms, and the capacity building activities, the key messages of sustainability and ownership are incorporated. Project MoUs and Ministry of Agriculture (MoAs) with partner organisations and documentation with ABCs will be checked for clarity on roles and responsibilities, and accountability channels.	In terms of technical sustainability, the AVDP has Memorandum of Understanding with various technical divisions of the Ministry of Agriculture and Forestry. MoUs are signed with the engineering and extension divisions; staff from these divisions are directly involved in implementation of project activities. The sustainability strategy is to integrate project activities into the normative work of the Ministry of Agriculture and Forestry after project closure. Additionally, the technical involvement of the Sierra Leone Agricultural Research Institute (SLARI) in the establishment and management of the cocoa clonal garden enforces the survival of the garden beyond project lifespan. The project will train a critical mass of staff of the Meteorological Agency in the collection, interpretation and dissemination of data	0



Country	Region	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-Recommendation	2021 - Follow Up	2022 - FollowUp	Status
										on weather condition to farmers.	

## Historic Follow up: Country Strategy and Project Evaluations (CSPEs)

Country	Region	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-Recommendation	2021 - Follow Up	2022 - FollowUp	Status
<b>Sierra Leone - Country Strategy and Programme Evaluation</b>											
Sierra Leone	WCA	CSPE	2	CTRY	STR	NTR	Pursue diversification more vigorously as a strategy for improving nutrition and building economic resilience. The focus of the portfolio has primarily been on crop production. This has meant that beneficiaries' incomes remain exposed to climate- and market/price-related shocks. Furthermore, while nutrition has been emphasized in the COSOP, the assumption has been that increases in income (which depend on crops alone) will drive improvements in nutrition. The new COSOP should put the spotlight on resilience and nutrition based on a more emphatic approach to diversification. Thus, the scope of future projects should be expanded to include not only crop production but also other subsectors (e.g. livestock) as a pathway to increased economic benefits, improved resilience and better nutrition. Livestock is also a thrust area of the Government's development plan and has a proven potential in rural development. As women traditionally tend smaller animals, activities should be		Diversified value chains have been strengthened – a mix of tree crops, rice and vegetables to support nutrition and economic resilience of smallholder farmers. Furthermore, in addition to supporting production and productivity, a more comprehensive value chain approach has been adopted - value addition and marketing through agricultural business centres, adaptation to climate change are all important aspects of focus in the AVDP project, for example. Multi-stakeholder platforms are emphasized and are intended to strengthen value chain dynamics. The current COSOP focuses on resilience and nutrition, and support to vegetable production is an important aspect of the projects.	The Sierra Leone ICO, in close consultation with the government and in alignment with the findings of the CSPE and priorities of the COSOP 2020 has agreed to invest in livestock development. IFAD12 performance based allocation system (PBA) will therefore focus on investing in the establishment of the poultry and small ruminant subsectors. The overall goal is to improve on nutrition and livelihood for the rural poor farmers.	F

Country	Region	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-Recommendation	2021 - Follow Up	2022 - FollowUp	Status
							specifically targeted in that direction				
Sierra Leone	WCA	CSPE	3	CTRY	OPER	RFI	Elevate the level of engagement in rural finance by building on existing structures and on the increased awareness of rural finance in the country. IFAD		IFAD continues to be an important player in enhancing access to financial services for rural small holders in Sierra Leone. IFAD is supporting	IFAD in collaboration with the government of Sierra Leone is currently in the process of modifying the Apex business model to make	O

Country	Region	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-Recommendation	2021 - Follow Up	2022 - FollowUp	Status
							<p>should continue to engage with rural finance in Sierra Leone but should pay greater attention to the underserved farming community. Apart from the achievements of its rural finance projects and the structures that they have helped to create, future interventions will also benefit from the increased awareness in rural communities of financial products and their potential. IFAD should focus on making the Apex Bank a competent, profitable and professionally managed umbrella organization capable of serving the Community Bank (CB)/ Financial Service Association (FSA) network through the design of an appropriate, comprehensive strategy and business plan. The design of a system for implementing a modern, flexible agricultural lending policy for CBs and FSAs needs to be finalized. IFAD must support the development of CB/FSA outreach and impact through the introduction of new services and policies on deposits, loans and dividends using IT-based solutions and linkages with other financial institutions where appropriate. The Fund should explore the possibility of opening a flexible refinancing window for the</p>		<p>the Apex Bank to develop a new model that is aimed at ensuring it is sustainable after the completion of the Rural Finance and Community Improvement Programme - Phase II (RFCIP2) project. A strong and sustainable Apex Bank will ensure continued services to the 76 Rural Financial Institutions (CBs and FSAs) established with IFAD support. An Agricultural Finance Facility, specifically aimed at agricultural lending was established and has contributed to increased lending to small holder farmers. Furthermore, a Technical Investment Facility to support capitalisation of the RFIs is also under implementation and is aimed at enhancing sustainability of the RFIs and thereby to sustainable access to financial services for the members. With support of the Apex Bank, the CBs and the FSAs are using financial software to ease business and guard against fraud. The Apex Bank is also working on a plan to install T24 software (Temenos T24 Transact Core Banking Software).</p>	<p>the RFIs competitive and sustainable. The Livestock and Livelihood Development project under IFAD12 has a strong private sector engagement using matching grant as an approach. The matching grant will managed through Rural Financial Institutions.</p>	

Country	Region	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-Recommendation	2021 - Follow Up	2022 - FollowUp	Status
							Apex Bank to attract incremental funding from multiple sources with a view to substantially expanding the rural portfolios in the CB/FSA network and beyond.				
Sierra Leone	WCA	CSPE	5	CTRY	STR	PAR		IFAD should participate more actively in the United Nations Sustainable Development Cooperation Framework and the coordination groups for agricultural and rural sector donors. In order to shape its policy engagement with the Government of Sierra Leone, IFAD should cease to rely solely on the experience gained through its own projects and should instead provide a platform for a broader group of stakeholders, including research organizations, NGOs and private sector agencies that are involved in, or are a part of, the rural landscape. This platform could be created by inviting	IFAD is taking a leading role in reviving the Agricultural Advisory Group (AAG), which brings all development partners and government (Ministry of Agriculture together) for critical policy discussions. Furthermore, IFAD has taken the lead in pushing for an overarching national agricultural policy, and is working with the Ministry of Agriculture on its push for enhanced private sector participation in the agricultural sector.	IFAD, in close collaboration with the EU is in the process to establish an Agricultural Donor Working Group. IFAD already drafted the Terms of Reference and it is being reviewed by the EU. The Country Director also informed the Resident Coordinator and he is willing to do the inaugural meeting of the Donor Working Group.	0

Country	Region	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-Recommendation	2021 - Follow Up	2022 - FollowUp	Status
								these stakeholders to donor and development partner coordination meetings. Greater efforts should be made to work with other Rome-based agencies on such issues as food security, gender equality and resilience. To achieve a greater impact, IFAD should also increase the scope of its engagement with the Government by working more closely with all ministries involved in rural development.			
Sierra Leone	WCA	CSPE	7	CTRY	STR	YTH	Strengthen the targeting focus of the country portfolio by mainstreaming youth into the portfolio through a countryspecific youth strategy. A needs assessment based on a vulnerability analysis must be conducted to identify the needs of the young population in Sierra Leone and to determine which of those needs can best be addressed by IFAD-supported projects. A youth strategy should then be		Through the AVDP NPCU which has been furnished with a gender and youth mainstreaming expert, the youth and gender strategies are under development. These are being developed taking into consideration the existing Ministry of Agriculture Gender strategy, as well as the strategic direction of the Ministry of Gender, Labour and Social Development.	The Agricultural Value Chain Development project has a Youth Empowerment Strategy and action plan. The documents prioritize sustainable activities centred on access by youths to skills, services and assets. This includes capacity enhancement in the use of ICT for agriculture, supporting their innovations as well as sustaining their engagement in	O

Country	Region	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-Recommendation	2021 - Follow Up	2022 - FollowUp	Status
							<p>developed on this basis which will help unlock the potential of the nation's youth in the agricultural sector. The strategy should also include suggested activities, linkages to other development partners and suggested responsibilities. The youth strategy and related activities need to be implemented in a structural manner, and the targeting capacity of the National Project Coordination Unit (NPCU) should be strengthened with the addition of dedicated staff who possess youth expertise.</p> <p>Youth participation must be closely monitored, not only in terms of the numbers of young people reached but also in terms of how effectively they are able to participate. Activities should be designed in such a way that there is a considerable likelihood that the young people concerned can sustain those activities without external support.</p>			<p>agriculture without external support. The successes of these activities require building the capacity of staff and ensuring budget availability for the implementation of appropriate activities across the project cycle. The Gender and Targeting Unit of AVDP is responsible for the implementation.</p>	
<b>United Mexican States - Country Strategy and Programme Evaluation</b>											
Mexico	LAC	CSPE	2	CTRY	OPER	INN	<p>Improve the technical quality of design and contribution of innovations by projects. In a country context where the principle of non-additionality of resources prevails, IFAD needs to provide more advanced technical inputs for</p>		<p>The new COSOP 2020-25 for México, approved by IFAD's EB in April 2020, offers a wider and more diversified range of operational and financial instruments, as well as tools for KM and SSTC activities</p>	<p>Following the measures incorporated in the COSOP 2020-25, IFAD has positioned itself as an ally of the Government of Mexico by promoting synergies with other financing</p>	F

Country	Region	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-Recommendation	2021 - Follow Up	2022 - FollowUp	Status
							<p>project design and promote innovative solutions. This could be achieved through cooperation with partners (public organizations, international organizations, NGOs, the private sector, etc.) possessing technical capacity and knowledge of the most advanced practices in Latin America, particularly in connection with: (i) training and technical guidance for primary producers and their organizations; (ii) financing for rural microenterprises (both agricultural and non-agricultural); and (iii) access to markets and linkages to value chains (the conceptual tools developed with Economic Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean (ECLAC) could provide methodological guidance). The foregoing can be leveraged by better integrating loan and grant activities.</p>		<p>to address the specific challenges that Mexico is facing. The new strategy testifies to how IFAD can work with upper-middle-income countries (UMICS) through a mix of instruments and an adaptable program to achieve shared objectives in common with national plans. According to Quality Assurance Group (QAG), the new COSOP represents a new standard for IFAD to work with UMICs. With the approval of the COSOP, IFAD positions itself as a strategic ally of the Mexican Government to deepen the impact and sustainability of prioritized public programs, starting with the adoption and scaling up of innovations and solutions generated through the interventions financed by IFAD, thus supporting transition towards a more productive inclusion of youth, women and indigenous people in the areas with the greatest marginalization levels in the country. Given the considerable level of public funding to rural areas, one of the challenges is to achieve better efficiency in terms of quality and results through the different priority programs which channel the greatest share of public funding to rural</p>	<p>entities, Rome-based agencies and federal institutions to strengthen the impact of the government priority programmes in coordination with IFAD financing. In relation to improving the technical quality of the design, during the design process of the Balsas programme, QAG exempted the team from the need to hold the final quality control meeting given the high technical quality of the project formulation. In relation to cooperation with partners, within the operation of the Balsas Programme, complementary financing is being designed through the Green Climate Fund, which has also been articulated with the design of the Global Environment Facility (GEF) - Biodifor Project led by FAO and which is expected to be launched by the end of 2022. This project will be funded by a GEF grant of USD 10.1 million with the Mexico's National Forestry Commission (CONAFOR) as the recipient agency. The geographical coverage of Biodifor considers three landscapes: Durango,</p>	



Country	Region	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-Recommendation	2021 - Follow Up	2022 - FollowUp	Status
									areas. This is the strategic objective pursued with the new Cuenca del Balsas operation by IFAD and GCF.	Balsas Basin and Selva Lacandona and its components are similar to the Balsas Project, which can provide complementarities in the approach to climate resilience, methodologies and instruments generated by IFAD in Mexico that support better management practices in capacity building, financial inclusion schemes and linkages to markets for small producers.	
Mexico	LAC	CSPE	3	CTRY	OPER	KM	Improve monitoring and capitalization of lessons learned. IFAD and the Government need to learn from the projects they fund. In particular, M&E systems should be strengthened and, where warranted, technologies such as georeferencing and remote sensing should be used. To this end, IFAD could work with entities such as the National Council for Evaluation of Social Development Policy (CONEVAL) (for methodological support) and other national centres of excellence such as universities and the Centre for Economic Research and Teaching (CIDE), and take advantage of other IFAD initiatives (such as the		Among the priority areas in its country portfolio, IFAD is pursuing the integration and continuity of the units responsible for project coordination, as a technical, multi-disciplinary group for strategic guidance, the analysis and use of data generated by projects for monitoring and evaluation, and the internalization of lessons learned in close interaction with the executing agency and its operational branches. To implement actions agreed and identify responsables for follow up, it is key to ensure a basic level of continuity and capacity in the technical team of projects. For the new IFAD11 operation in Mexico, one of the executing agencies (CONAFOR) is building on	In more than 10 years of work with CONAFOR, integrated learning has been capitalised in the interdisciplinary staff of the different management and coordination departments involved in IFAD projects, for example in the management of environmental restoration, coordination of production and productivity and the general coordination of planning and programming, the staff is the focal point for all IFAD projects. The PRODEZSA project, implemented by CONAFOR, has developed a M&E system which includes geo-	F

Country	Region	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-Recommendation	2021 - Follow Up	2022 - FollowUp	Status
							<p>Program in Rural M&amp;E (PRiME) grant in support of project M&amp;E). To avoid the loss of lessons learned, a system needs to be set up to collect, manage, systematize and analyse information generated during preparation and execution of each project.</p> <p>This information should be made available in an easily accessible place (website) so that it can be consulted by those responsible for designing and executing projects, as well as technical specialists wishing to know about such experiences.</p>		<p>its 10+ year experience with IFAD, improving its own processes, the way it operates and the management of the knowledge accumulated throughout the impementation period. Part of the Mexico technical team participating in the design of the new operation was in charge of implementing PRODEZSA (Proyecto de Desarrollo Sustentable para las Comunidades Rurales de las Zonas Semiáridas), thus building on the lessons learned generated by the project.</p>	<p>referencing of the <i>ejidos</i><sup>2</sup> and communities supported by the project. A baseline survey was carried out and a final survey is under contract that will allow the evaluation of project results, as well as a set of knowledge products on the operation in semi-arid zones, which have been institutionalised through the institution's Rules of Operation in a specific strategy for these zones, sustainable beyond the life of PRODEZSA. In the case of PROECOSOCIAL, with the support of ECLAC, knowledge management products are being developed. These products include the evaluation of project results, success stories of the productive inclusion strategy, gender and financial inclusion strategy implemented by PROECOSOCIAL, which will subsequently be disseminated nationally and internationally at various expert events. On the other hand, IFAD projects report their results through the United Nations System, which in the case of</p>	

<sup>2</sup> Communal farmland of a village, usually assigned in small parcels to the villagers to be farmed under a federally supported system of communal land tenure.

Country	Region	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-Recommendation	2021 - Follow Up	2022 - FollowUp	Status
										Mexico, have been captured by the Geoportal administered by ECLAC for the activities of the Integral Development Plan implemented in the Northern Triangle (Mexico, Honduras and Guatemala).	
Mexico	LAC	CSPE	4	CTRY	STR	GRT	Better integrate loan and grant activities. To date, grant-funded activities have been poorly linked to those of the loan portfolio. Going forward, a grants programme needs to be developed with a clear strategy and objectives, for the main purpose of leveraging the impact of the loan portfolio and strengthening the policy dialogue.		The lessons learned stemming from IFAD's regional grants where Mexico was among the prioritized countries (such as: Territorios Productivos, UNIANDES I y UNIANDES II (Universidad de los Andes) are being adopted for the high-level dialogue in the country (Presidencia de la Republica), with the objective of shaping public policies and prioritizing the productive inclusion of rural population in the areas with the highest level of marginalization. In the case of grants awarded to the executing agencies, loan funded activities and grant funded activities have been aligned towards the expected operation results, and both contributed to the achievement of objectives established at design. Within this context, mixing the two financing sources has allowed for the necessary flexibility to overcome operational restrictions on external credit sources and	IFAD's portfolio with CONAFOR is working with the regional grant Innova Agricultura Familiar, developed in 8 LAC countries with the support of the Inter-American Institute for Cooperation on Agriculture (IICA). For CONAFOR, and in particular for PRODEZSA, this Project provides a Territorial Management Model for semi-arid areas that complements CONAFOR's policy of developing a comprehensive strategy for semi-arid areas. The work with CONAFOR has been articulated with the SEMEAR International Regional Grant, through which a series of exchange activities have been implemented between projects operating in arid zones; together these projects have developed instruments and knowledge routes on exit strategies/sustainability	F

								<p>the no-additionality principle.</p>	<p>of closing projects, generating a series of products that have been capitalised in new designs in Mexico and other countries of the region. This initiative started within a community of practice, dedicated to generating inputs from diverse projects to provide social, political and economic sustainability to IFAD projects once they have been concluded. On the other hand, the grant "Institutional strengthening, systematization and outreach for scaling up the productive inclusion model for the Social Economy in Mexico" implemented by ECLAC has been intrinsically related to the PROECOSOCIAL programme. In fact, through this grant, the evaluation of project results and the systematisation of experiences and lessons learned will be elaborated for the elaboration of the project completion report. Finally, it is expected that the results of the New Ruralities grant (implemented by ECLAC) will be used as inputs for policy dialogue and the revision of rural public</p>	
--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--

Country	Region	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-Recommendation	2021 - Follow Up	2022 - FollowUp	Status
										policies in Mexico, and will provide detailed information for new programme designs in Mexico and other countries in the region.	
Mexico	LAC	CSPE	5	IFAD	STR	DEC	IFAD needs to prioritize and strengthen its capacity to provide the programme with operational and strategic support. As part of the current decentralization process, IFAD needs to strengthen its capacity to support the programme and interact with its partners in Mexico, which could be done through the subregional office in Panama whereby: (i) an IFAD officer visits Mexico frequently and devotes a substantial portion of time to the country; and (ii) IFAD's technical advisors and external thematic specialists collaborate more systematically not only on programme support but also knowledge management and public policy dialogue.		IFAD acknowledges the need to strengthen its presence in the country. Beyond any doubt, the ongoing decentralization process helps facilitating the dialogue with the State Secretariats of External Relations (SRE), Ministry of Finance and Public Credit (SHCP) and sectorial institutions as well as the partnership with strategic allies such as other UN agencies in the country. However, a stable presence in the country, with the opening of an IFAD office, would boost dialogue with Mexican authorities. In addition, it would also help scaling up interventions funded by IFAD through BRAM resources and the use of new financial instruments such as policy-based lending within the framework of the Government's efforts to overcome poverty. The possibility to strengthen IFAD's presence in the country will be carefully considered in the context of the Decentralization 2.0, currently ongoing. The country team will keep supporting the portfolio,	IFAD recognises the need to strengthen its presence in the country. IFAD's decentralisation process, with the new Country Director based in Panama, helps to facilitate dialogue with the SRE, SHCP and sectoral institutions as well as strengthening partnerships with other strategic partners, including the UN country team. The allocation of human resources to the portfolio needs to be increased in order to ensure a more frequent presence in the country, to scale up IFAD's actions with BRAM resources and to explore the deployment of new financial instruments. Strengthening country presence will be further explored in the context of the ongoing Decentralisation 2.0 reforms. With regard to collaboration with technical advisors, the design of the BALSAS programme involved a high and intensive participation of technical specialists from IFAD	F

Country	Region	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-Recommendation	2021 - Follow Up	2022 - FollowUp	Status
									catalyzing the support from IFAD technical specialists to those areas that are of interest to the Government, and ongoing projects. In the case of PRODEZSA IFAD is providing support through specialists and consultant in the areas of semi-arid, gender and small scale livestock raising.	(PMD, PMI and ECG) and the FAO Investment Centre, which was reflected in the high technical quality of the formulation. The close collaboration with technical specialists is being replicated in the design of the Green Climate Fund co-financing to the Balsas programme.	
Mexico	LAC	CSPE	6	GOV	OPER	BEN	In order to improve the programme results, greater commitment and involvement in project design and execution is needed on the part of all actors and national organizations. Public agencies need to have an active and integral role in the preparation of IFAD-funded projects and make adequate budget allocations for project implementation, strengthen their M&E systems and hold joint learning workshops with IFAD to capitalize on experiences. In addition, it is important for the governments of the states where projects are taking place to participate in design and execution to enable them to take ownership of the projects and contribute to the sustainability of benefits and scaling up using local resources and development initiatives.		The principle of no-additionality for projects financed with external sources and the uncertain availability of budgetary resources for project implementation which occurs every year, will continue to be a challenge for IFAD's country program in Mexico. On the other side, even if IFAD projects do not raise the budget of executing agencies, there are priorities in terms of what to finance, how, and where. For this reason, the principle of no-additionality makes it necessary for IFAD to demonstrate the credibility and quality of the results generated by its programs, to capture the budgetary allocation necessary for their implementation. Moreover, within the policy dialogue, it is necessary to prioritize the allocation of budgetary resources with a vision that	The design of the Balsas Project included a rigorous analysis together with the Ministry of Finance and Public Credit (SHCP) of CONAFOR's budgetary availability to operate the project in the target territory, and thus channel the resources allocated by the institution to external credit. This mechanism makes it possible to prioritise the institution's investment in the project, annually committing the budget that allows the IFAD funding source to be exhausted in the years established in the design. The impact demonstrated by IFAD in other projects implemented jointly with CONAFOR, has allowed for a political dialogue with other government	F

Country	Region	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-Recommendation	2021 - Follow Up	2022 - FollowUp	Status
									<p>is both strategic and regulatory and encompasses a multi-annual period. To do this, an agreement is needed among the Public Credit Union, the Directorate for International Financial Institutions, and the Sub-secretariat of expenditure of the Secretariat of Finance and Public Credit. For the new IFAD11 project, various state agencies have been involved (CONAFOR, Secretariat for Wellbeing (Bienestar), Secretaría de Agricultura y Desarrollo Rural (Sader), Instituto Nacional de los Pueblos Indígenas (INPI), National Water Commission (CONAGUA), Fideicomisos Instituidos en Relación con la Agricultura (FIRA)) etc., led by the "Coordinación de Asesores de la Presidencia". Moreover, the project will benefit from resources of the Green Climate Fund, with the Secretariat of Finance and Public Credit prioritizing the project within its national program for the use of resources from the Green Climate Fund.</p>	<p>actors that have generated commitments to invest in the prioritised areas and that constitute a local contribution of public investment that could far exceed IFAD's investment. Currently, the dialogue with the Coordination of Advisors to the President has made it possible to consider resources from other federal agencies such as CONAGUA, which will be translated into inter-institutional collaboration agreements that facilitate the integration of a territorial offer in the form of a menu of public goods and services, whose purpose is to create conditions and incentives that help trigger scalable rural development processes. This project is leveraging GCF resources, prioritised in the SHCP's National Programme before the Fund, as well as GEF funds managed by FAO.</p>	