Key messages from the Annual Report on Independent Evaluation (ARIE) 2022

September 2022
20th anniversary ARRI → renamed ARIE

IOE Multi-year Evaluation Strategy 2022-2027, repurposing the ARIE are to:

- Present a more comprehensive account of IOE evaluation work
- Contribute to learning by extracting findings and lessons from the evaluations in a context of institutional change

Follows examples in other IFIs

ARIE 2022 presents summary of key findings from 2021 CLE / TE / SRE / ES and common lessons drawn from CSPEs and PPEs

Analysis of ratings remains; structure / contents of chapters may change in the future
Majority of projects have criteria rated positively
(Projects completed 2018-2020)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Criteria</th>
<th>Rating</th>
<th>Rating</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ENRM</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Innovation</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relevance</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adaptation to climate change</td>
<td>81</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GEWE</td>
<td>76</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rural Poverty Impact</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Effectiveness</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scaling-up</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sustainability</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Efficiency</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall project achievement</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IFAD performance</td>
<td>81</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Government performance</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Percentage of projects rated moderately satisfactory or better
- Percentage of projects rated moderately unsatisfactory or worse
## Four patterns in rating trends (completion: 2011-2020)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Trend pattern</th>
<th>Related criteria</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Overall constant across the period</td>
<td>Relevance; Effectiveness;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Drop in performance in 2013-2017, have exhibited a partial recuperation</td>
<td>Efficiency and sustainability (among the lowest performing but on an improving path), innovation, scaling up and government performance.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Drop in the performance from 2013, then plateau</td>
<td>Rural poverty impact, Gender equality and women’s empowerment; Performance of IFAD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Increasing path</td>
<td>Environment, natural resource management; Climate change adaptation</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Proportions of projects rated moderately satisfactory or better in rural poverty impact and other selected criteria, projects completed in 2011-2020 (Data in percentage, N=284)

- Rural poverty impact rated 4+ and scaling up rated 4+: 81%
- Rural poverty impact rated 4+ and sustainability rated 4+: 70%
- Rural poverty impact rated 4+ and efficiency rated 4+: 61%
- Rural poverty impact rated 4+ and scaling up rated 4+ and sustainability rated 4+ and efficiency rated 4+: 56%

Source: IOE evaluation database (PCRV/PPE/I), February 2022
Performance trends on the increase for non-lending activities

Source: country-level evaluations

Caveat: smaller number of annual observations compared to projects
Insights on two criteria through recent evaluations

TE CCA: **performance of ENRM and climate change** benefited from institutional investments: strategies, technical tools, climate financing and dedicated unit

Areas for improvement: clear corporate-level conceptual framework and operational guidance on strengthening smallholders’ climate, environmental and socio-economic resilience

Recent Evaluation Synthesis: **Performance of the government** is linked to government ownership, leadership and accountability

- Dip in gov performance (2013-2017) may in part be linked to challenges faced by Ministries of agriculture in implementing more complex projects (e.g., value chain).
- IFAD country presence is important but not panacea. IFAD can identify capacity gaps, support to filling gaps. Need to pay attention to decentralized governments
Insights on non-lending activities through recent evaluations

Recent CSPEs on KM (dedicated CLE forthcoming)

- Supporting factors to KM: (i) earmarking financial resource, (grants, loan components); (ii) leadership of government agencies
- Constraints: (i) weak M&E systems; (ii) communication ≠KM; (iii) no dedicated human resources within government or ICO

Joint CLE with FAO & WFP on RBA collaboration, as a case of partnership

- In the domains of gender, nutrition, and emergency response, RBA collaboration helped share knowledge & good practice
- In other areas, limited progress in reducing overlap, competition
- Uneven views and support to RBA collaboration from donors and RBA Mgmt
*Sub-regional evaluation in WCA*

Countries with fragility situations

**Country strategies and portfolios** focused on selected drivers of fragility (poverty, climate), less so on weak public institutions and conflicts.

**Overall effective interventions** at addressing poverty and environmental threats: mix of income-generating activities, capacity building for CBOs, soil and water conservation practices.

**Corporate issues:** (i) limited loan flexibility to adapt to escalating fragility / conflict; (ii) grants more flexible but small amounts; (iii) in-country presence of country director.

**Community driven development.** CDD operations require time to build sustainable organisations but in fragile contexts outperform other intervention types.

**Recent Eval Synthesis and projects evaluations**
Insights on post-disaster

Post-Tsunami response (2005)
(Eval Synthesis on fisheries and coastal area development, selected project evaluations)

Strong pressure from members on IFAD to intervene

Attempt to react in ‘quasi-real time’

Insufficient design preparation and incorrect assumptions → Weak implementation readiness and long time for project start-up

Good example in India-Tamil Nadu

Project remained relevant in a changing context and devoted attention to building community resilience by diversifying income sources through financial instruments, particularly for women