

Document: EC 2021/114/W.P.9  
Agenda: 10  
Date: 4 August 2021  
Distribution: Public  
Original: English

**E**



## **Annex I of the Revised IFAD Evaluation Policy**

### **Procedures Followed by International Financial Institutions for the Selection and Appointment of the Director of Independent Evaluation**

#### **Note to Evaluation Committee members**

##### Focal points:

##### Technical questions:

**Indran A. Naidoo**  
Director  
Independent Office of Evaluation of IFAD  
Tel.: +39 06 5459 2274  
e-mail: i.naidoo@ifad.org

**Fabrizio Felloni**  
Deputy Director  
Tel.: +39 06 5459 2361  
e-mail: f.felloni@ifad.org

##### Dispatch of documentation:

**Deirdre Mc Grenra**  
Chief  
Institutional Governance and  
Member Relations  
Tel: +39 06 5459 2374  
e-mail: gb@ifad.org

Evaluation Committee —114<sup>th</sup> Session  
Rome, 1 September 2021

---

**For: Review**

1. At its 132<sup>nd</sup> session in April 2021, the Executive Board approved the Revised IFAD Evaluation Policy and tasked the Evaluation Committee with reviewing annex I of the policy, based on a benchmarking exercise to be conducted by the Independent Office of Evaluation (IOE) with members of the Evaluation Cooperation Group (ECG) of the Multilateral Development Banks.<sup>1</sup> The revised annex would be submitted for consideration to a future session of the Executive Board.
2. IOE requested information from members of the ECG and obtained relevant data from the African Development Bank (AfDB), the Asian Development Bank (ADB), the European Bank for Reconstruction and Development (EBRD), the International Monetary Fund (IMF) and the World Bank Group.
3. Taking into account the discussion at the Executive Board, IOE's review focused on: (i) the level of detail provided in the evaluation policy or other relevant documents on the selection and appointment of the director of independent evaluation; (ii) the role of the Evaluation Committee (or equivalent) and Executive Board (or equivalent) in the process; (iii) the composition of the selection panel; (iv) the prescriptions on gender balance in the panel; and (v) the role of the President of the organization in the selection.
4. While most of the evaluation policies mention the process for selecting and appointing the director of independent evaluation, the most detailed descriptions by far are those of IFAD and AfDB. The World Bank Group has no formal evaluation policy but its Board adopted ad hoc procedures in 2018 for the selection of the Director-General, Independent Evaluation Group.
5. In all the surveyed organizations, only the Executive Board can appoint and dismiss the director of independent evaluation.
6. Although not mentioned in all the evaluation policies, the use of a consulting firm for identification/background check of candidates is a common practice among the organizations.
7. The evaluation policies of IFAD and AfDB explicitly foresee the presence of external evaluation specialists in the selection panel. The policy of AfDB is clear in stating that this is to ensure that candidates have the required skills in methodology and evaluation management experience, and that there are no conflicts of interest.
8. A Management representative is foreseen in the selection panel in the case of IFAD, EBRD and the World Bank Group.
9. Formal consultation with the President of the organization on the selection of the director of independent evaluation is foreseen in all organizations. This consultation takes place once in all organizations (at the time of Board approval) except IFAD, where it happens twice (first with the Chair of the selection panel and subsequently with the Board during their consideration of the appointment).
10. Selected members of the Evaluation Committee (or equivalent) are part of the selection panel in all organizations, except at IFAD where they are excluded because the IFAD Evaluation Committee reviews the selection process and provides a report to the Executive Board.
11. No policy explicitly requires gender balance in the selection panel.

---

<sup>1</sup> Members of ECG are: AfDB, ADB, Black Sea Trade and Development Bank, EBRD, European Investment Bank, Inter-American Development Bank, IFAD, IMF, Islamic Development Bank, World Bank Group.

Table 1

**Comparison of the process to select and appoint the director of independent evaluation**

Item	IFAD	AfDB	EBRD	ADB	IMF	World Bank
Description of the recruitment process in the evaluation policy	Yes	Yes, with additional notes issued for members of the Board	Yes	Yes	Not very detailed	The World Bank has no formal evaluation policy. Ad hoc procedures to select the Director-General, Independent Evaluation Group were issued in 2018
Gender balance in the recruitment panel composition	Not mentioned	Not mentioned	Not mentioned	Not mentioned	Not mentioned	Not mentioned
External evaluation specialists as members of the recruitment panel	Yes, as panel members	Yes, as panel members, with specific requirement to ensure that candidates have required skills in methodology and evaluation management experience, and that there are no conflicts of interest	Not explicitly mentioned	Not explicitly mentioned	Not explicitly mentioned	Not mentioned
Panel includes members of Evaluation Committee/Executive Board (or equivalent)	Board members that are not Committee members	A combination of members of Committee on Operations and Development Effectiveness and Board of Directors	A combination of Committee and Board members	Development Effectiveness Committee drives the process	Committee drives the process	Chair and Vice-Chair of the Committee on Development Effectiveness, Dean of the Board, Board of Directors, Chair of Budget Committee
Management representative in the panel	Yes, without voting power	No	Yes, Vice-President Human Resources	No	No	Yes
Evaluation Committee (or equivalent) role in the process	The Committee reviews the selection report but is not part of the selection panel. It is involved in the interviews and related report preparation.	Committee members involved in interviews along with Board members that are not Committee members	Committee members involved in interviews along with Board members that are not Committee members	Committee leads the process	Committee leads the process	Chair and Vice-Chair of the Committee on Development Effectiveness are members of the selection committee
Use of consulting firm for identification/background check of candidates	Yes	Yes	Not required explicitly	Yes	Not required explicitly	Yes
When does the President (or equivalent) of the organization consult with the governing bodies on the selection of the candidate	Twice: (i) with the Chair of the recruitment panel; and (ii) with the Board	Once: with the selection panel	Once: with the Executive Board	Once: with the Executive Board	Not detailed explicitly	Once: with the Selection Committee
Approval of the appointment	Board	Board	Board	Board	Board	Board