

Document: EC 2021/114/W.P.5/Add.1
Agenda: 6
Date: 4 August 2021
Distribution: Public
Original: English

E



President's Report on the Implementation Status of Evaluation Recommendations and Management Actions (PRISMA)

Volume II

Recommendations and follow-up actions taken by Management

Addendum

Note to Evaluation Committee members

Focal points:

Technical questions:

Lauren Phillips
Lead Adviser, Policy and Results
Operational Policy and Results Division
Tel.: +39 06 5459 2877
e-mail: l.phillips@ifad.org

Dimitra Stamatopoulos
Policy and Results Specialist
Tel +39 06 5459 2128
e-mail: d.stamatopoulos@ifad.org

Queries with respect to the response of the Independent
Office of Evaluation of IFAD to the report should be
addressed to:

Indran Naidoo
Director
Independent Office of Evaluation of IFAD
Tel: +39 06 5459 2274
e-mail: i.naidoo@ifad.org

Dispatch of documentation:

Deirdre Mc Grenra
Chief
Institutional Governance and
Member Relations Office
Tel.: +39 06 5459 2374
e-mail: gb@ifad.org

Evaluation Committee – 114th Session
Rome, 1 September 2021

For: Review

Document: EB 2021/133/R.18/Add.1
Agenda: 12(a)
Date: 4 August
Distribution: Public
Original: English

E



President's Report on the Implementation Status of Evaluation Recommendations and Management Actions (PRISMA)

Volume II

Recommendations and follow-up actions taken by Management

Addendum

Note to Executive Board representatives

Focal points:

Technical questions:

Lauren Phillips
Lead Adviser, Policy and Results
Tel.: +39 06 5459 2877
e-mail: l.phillips@ifad.org

Dimitra Stamatopoulos
Policy and Results Specialist
Tel.: +39 06 5459 2128
e-mail: d.stamatopoulos@ifad.org

Dispatch of documentation:

Deirdre Mc Grenra
Chief
Institutional Governance and
Member Relations Office
Tel.: +39 06 5459 2374
e-mail: gb@ifad.org

Queries with respect to the response of the Independent
Office of Evaluation of IFAD to the report should be
addressed to:

Indran Naidoo
Director
Independent Office of Evaluation of IFAD
Tel.: +39 06 5459 2274
e-mail: i.naidoo@ifad.org

Executive Board — 133rd Session
Rome, 13-16 September 2021

For: Review

Contents

Abbreviations and acronyms	ii
Categories used for the classification of actions/ recommendations	iv
Country Strategy and Project Evaluations (CSPEs)	1
United Mexican States - Country strategy and programme evaluation	1
Federal Republic of Nepal - Country Strategy and Programme Evaluation	4
Sierra Leone - Country Strategy and Programme Evaluation	8
Impact Evaluations (IEs)	13
Niger: Food Security and Development Support Project in the Maradi Region	13
Project Performance Evaluations (PPEs)	18
Botswana Agriculture Services Support Project	18
Haiti Small-scale Irrigation Development Project – Phase II	19
Liberia Smallholder Tree Crop Revitalization Support Project	20
Malawi Rural Livelihoods Economic Enhancement Programme	24
Sierra Leone Rehabilitation and Community-based Poverty Reduction Project	28
Historic Follow up: Corporate Level Evaluations	32
Corporate Level Evaluation on Replenishments	32
Corporate Level Evaluation: PBAS (2016)	34
Corporate-Level Evaluation: IFAD’s financial architecture	34

Abbreviations and acronyms

ADB	Asian Development Bank
ALM	Asset and Liability Management
APR	Asia and the Pacific
ARRI	Annual Report on Results and Impact of IFAD Operations
ASDP	Agriculture Sector Development Programme
BRAM	Borrowed Resources Access Mechanism
CB	Community Bank
CBO	Community based organization
CENRAT	National Representation and Technical Assistance Unit
CD	Country Director
CLE	corporate-level evaluation
CONAFOR	National Forest Committee
COSOP	country strategic opportunities programme
CPA	country program assistant
CU	Credit Union
CSPE	country strategy and programme evaluation
DEF	Development Effectiveness Framework
DSF	Debt Sustainability Framework
EB	Executive Board
EC	Evaluation Committee
ESA	Eastern and Southern Africa
ESR	evaluation synthesis report
FMD	Financial management Department
FO	Farmer Organization
FOD	Financial Operations Department
FSA	Financial Service Association
GALS	Gender Active Learning System
GAP	good agricultural practice
GIZ	German Society for International Co-operation
GC	Governing Council
GCF	Green Climate Fund
GIE	Economic Interest Group
HG	Hadin Gwiwa (traditional institution for joint decision making among different interest groups)
HRD	Human Resource Department
IA	Irrigation users Association
ICO	IFAD country office
IE	impact evaluation
IOE	Independent Office of Evaluation of IFAD
KM	knowledge management
LAC	Latin America and the Caribbean
LIC	lower income country
LMIC	lower and middle income country
MARNDR	Ministry of Agriculture, Natural Resources and Rural Development
M&E	monitoring & evaluation
MEAL	monitoring, evaluation, adaptation and learning
NEN	Near East, North Africa and Europe
MoA	Memorandum of Agreement
MoU	Memorandum of Understanding
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
NO-C	National Officer, C-level
NPCU	National Programme Coordination Unit
ORMS	operational results management system

PASADEM	Food Security and Development Support Project in the Maradi Region
PBAS	performance-based allocation system
PDE	economic development pole
PoLG	programme of loans and grants
PPE	project performance evaluation
PRECIS	Project to Strengthen Resilience of Rural Communities to Food and Nutrition Insecurity
PRISMA	President's Report on the Implementation Status of Evaluation Recommendations and Management Actions
PRODAF	Family Farming Development Programme in Maradi, Tahoua and Zinder Regions
PRODEZSA	Project for sustainable development of rural communities in semi-arid zones
PPI-3	Small Irrigation and Market Access Development Project in the Nippes and Goavienne Region
PRRIA	Project to reinforce resilience to food insecurity
PSU	project supervision unit
PURRACO	Project for Strengthening the Resilience of Small Farmers to the consequences of the COVID-19 pandemic
QAG	Quality Assurance Group
RAC	Resources available for commitment
RERP	Samriddhi - Rural Enterprises and Remittances Project
RFCIP2	Rural Finance and Community Improvement Programme - Phase II
RIDE	Report on IFAD's Development Effectiveness
RLEEP	Rural Livelihoods and Economic Enhancement Programme
RMF	Results Management Framework
RTA	Reimbursable Technical Assistance
SDR	Special Drawing Rights
SSTC	South-south triangular cooperation
STCRSP	Smallholder Tree Crop Revitalization Support Project
TCEP	Tree Crop Extension Projects
TFP	technical and financial partner
TRADE	Transforming Agriculture through Diversification and Entrepreneurship Programme
UMIC	upper middle income country
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
URGP	Regional Unit for programme Management
USAID	US agency for international development
VC	Value Chain
VITA	Value chains for Inclusive Transformation of Agriculture Programme.
VSLA	Village and Savings and Loans Association
WCA	Western and Central Africa

Categories used for the classification of actions/ recommendations

SN Serial Number

Type of evaluation

CLE Corporate Level Evaluation
CSPE Country Strategy and Programme Evaluation
ESR Evaluation Synthesis Report
PPE Project Performance Evaluation
IE Impact Evaluation

Level

IFAD IFAD Corporate Level
CTRY IFAD Country Level
GOV Government Authorities (national, local level and institutions)
PROJ Project

Nature

PLCY Policy
STR Strategy Development, including COSOPs and Projects
OPER Operational and Implementation

Themes

DEC Decentralization
ALL Allocations
ASR Analysis, studies and research
BEN Beneficiaries and stakeholders' participation and consultation
CCA Climate change
COS Country Strategic Opportunities Programme (COSOP)
DES Project Design
ENG Policy engagement
FA Financial architecture
FRG Fragility
GDR Gender (including targeting to women)
GOV Governance
GRT Grants/ grants financing policy
INF Infrastructure
INN Innovation
KM Knowledge Management
LTR Land tenure
MVC Markets and value chains
NLA Non-lending activities
NRM Natural resource management
NTR Nutrition
ORG Organization development
PAR Partnerships
PMA Project management and administration (incl. financial management)
PVT Private sector
REPL Replenishments
RFI Rural finance
RME Results monitoring, evaluation
RST Restructuring
SCA Replication and scaling up
STRA Strategy
SUP Supervision
SUS Sustainability

TCB	Training, capacity-building
TGT	Targeting
YTH	Youth
F	Fully followed-up
NA	Not applicable
NAG	Not agreed upon
NYD	Not yet due
O	Ongoing
PA	Partially followed up
PD	Pending

Criteria:

- **full follow-up:** recommendations fully incorporated into the new phase/design of activities, operations or programmes, and the relevant policies or guidelines;
- **ongoing:** actions initiated in the direction recommended;
- **partial:** recommendations followed up partially, with actions consistent with the rationale of the recommendation;
- **not yet due:** recommendations that will be incorporated into projects, country programmes or country strategic opportunities programmes (COSOPs) or policies still to be designed and completed;
- **not applicable:** recommendations that have not been complied with because of changing circumstances in country development or IFAD corporate governance contexts, or for other reasons;
- **pending:** recommendations that could not be followed up; and
- **not agreed upon:** recommendations that were not agreed to by Management or the respective country team or governme

Country Strategy and Project Evaluations (CSPEs)

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-recommendation	2021 Follow Up	Status
United Mexican States - Country strategy and programme evaluation										
United Mexican States	LAC	CSPE	1	CTRY	STR	TGT	Adjust programme geographical and agro-ecological targeting in the country. The evaluation recommends maintaining the programme's socio-economic targeting on the poorest population groups and emphasis on natural resources and adaptation to climate change. Within this framework, it is advisable that the Government and IFAD collaborate with national socio-economic statistics and research institutes to build a more accurate poverty mapping and identify priority geographical and agro-ecological areas for intervention during the next strategic cycle. In this sense, it is important to establish an integrated shared strategy together with public programmes and international organizations on natural resource management, environmental management and adaptation to climate change. IFAD should share its experience around the formulation and use of operating guidelines (to reach the poorest groups) with other partners.		Taking into account the priorities of the National Development Plan for 2019-2024, the new COSOP focuses primarily on the rural poor and vulnerable population in federal entities and municipalities in the south and south-east areas of the country, where the majority of the rural poor live. IFAD's new operation in Mexico is located in la Cuenca del Balsas which includes the hydrological administrative area of Balsas (RHA IV) and part of the hydrological administrative area Pacífico Sur (RHA V), and includes the States of Guerrero, Jalisco, Estado de México, Michoacán, Morelos, Oaxaca, Puebla and Tlaxcala, covering 695 municipalities in the south of México. In the Cuenca del Balsas region, poverty, social disparities and vulnerability to climate change are among the highest in the country. This translates into significant gaps in terms of health, food security, education, social security, acces to adequate dwelling and basic water and sanitation, income, access to employment and productive opportunities.	F
United Mexican States	LAC	CSPE	2	CTRY	OPER	INN	Improve the technical quality of design and contribution of innovations by projects. In a country context where the principle of non-additionality of resources prevails, IFAD needs to provide more advanced technical inputs for project design and promote innovative solutions. This could be achieved through cooperation with partners (public organizations, international organizations, NGOs, the private sector, etc.) possessing technical capacity and knowledge of the most advanced practices in Latin America, particularly in connection with: (i) training and technical guidance for primary producers and their organizations; (ii)		The new COSOP 2020-25 for México, approved by IFAD's EB in April 2020, offers a wider and more diversified range of operational and financial instruments, as well as tools for KM and SSTC activities to address the specific challenges that Mexico is facing. The new strategy testifies to how IFAD can work with UMICS through a mix of instruments and an adaptable program to achieve shared objectives in common with national plans. According to QAG, the new COSOP represents a new standard for IFAD to work with UMICs. With the approval of the COSOP, IFAD positions itself as a strategic ally of the Mexican Government to deepen the impact and	O

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-recommendation	2021 Follow Up	Status
							financing for rural microenterprises (both agricultural and non-agricultural); and (iii) access to markets and linkages to value chains (the conceptual tools developed with ECLAC could provide methodological guidance). The foregoing can be leveraged by better integrating loan and grant activities.		sustainability of prioritized public programs, starting with the adoption and scaling up of innovations and solutions generated through the interventions financed by IFAD, thus supporting transition towards a more productive inclusion of youth, women and indigenous people in the areas with the greatest marginalization levels in the country. Given the considerable level of public funding to rural areas, one of the challenges is to achieve better efficiency in terms of quality and results through the different priority programs which channel the greatest share of public funding to rural areas. This is the strategic objective pursued with the new Cuenca del Balsas operation by IFAD and GCF.	
United Mexican States	LAC	CSPE	3	CTRY	OPER	KM	Improve monitoring and capitalization of lessons learned. IFAD and the Government need to learn from the projects they fund. In particular, M&E systems should be strengthened and, where warranted, technologies such as georeferencing and remote sensing should be used. To this end, IFAD could work with entities such as CONEVAL (for methodological support) and other national centres of excellence such as universities and the Centre for Economic Research and Teaching (CIDE), and take advantage of other IFAD initiatives (such as the PRIME grant in support of project M&E). To avoid the loss of lessons learned, a system needs to be set up to collect, manage, systematize and analyse information generated during preparation and execution of each project. This information should be made available in an easily accessible place (website) so that it can be consulted by those responsible for designing and executing projects, as well as technical specialists wishing to know about such experiences.		Among the priority areas in its country portfolio, IFAD is pursuing the integration and continuity of the units responsible for project coordination, as a technical, multi-disciplinary group for strategic guidance, the analysis and use of data generated by projects for monitoring and evaluation, and the internalization of lessons learned in close interaction with the executing agency and its operational branches. To implement actions agreed and identify responsibilities for follow up, it is key to ensure a basic level of continuity and capacity in the technical team of projects. For the new IFAD11 operation in Mexico, one of the executing agencies (CONAFOR) is building on its 10+ year experience with IFAD, improving its own processes, the way it operates and the management of the knowledge accumulated throughout the implementation period. Part of the Mexico technical team participating in the design of the new operation was in charge of implementing PRODEZSA, thus building on the lessons learned generated by the project.	0

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-recommendation	2021 Follow Up	Status
United Mexican States	LAC	CSPE	4	CTRY	STR	GRT	Better integrate loan and grant activities. To date, grant-funded activities have been poorly linked to those of the loan portfolio. Going forward, a grants programme needs to be developed with a clear strategy and objectives, for the main purpose of leveraging the impact of the loan portfolio and strengthening the policy dialogue.		The lessons learned stemming from IFAD's regional grants where Mexico was among the prioritized countries (such as: Territorios Productivos, UNIANDES I and UNIANDES II) are being adopted for the high-level dialogue in the country (Presidencia de la Republica), with the objective of shaping public policies and prioritizing the productive inclusion of rural population in the areas with the highest level of marginalization. In the case of grants awarded to the executing agencies, loan funded activities and grant funded activities have been aligned towards the expected operation results, and both contributed to the achievement of objectives established at design. Within this context, mixing the two financing sources has allowed for the necessary flexibility to overcome operational restrictions on external credit sources and the no-additionality principle.	O
United Mexican States	LAC	CSPE	5	IFAD	STR	DEC	IFAD needs to prioritize and strengthen its capacity to provide the programme with operational and strategic support. As part of the current decentralization process, IFAD needs to strengthen its capacity to support the programme and interact with its partners in Mexico, which could be done through the subregional office in Panama whereby: (i) an IFAD officer visits Mexico frequently and devotes a substantial portion of time to the country; and (ii) IFAD's technical advisors and external thematic specialists collaborate more systematically not only on programme support but also knowledge management and public policy dialogue.		IFAD acknowledges the need to strengthen its presence in the country. Beyond any doubt, the ongoing decentralization process helps facilitating the dialogue with SRE, SHCP and sectorial institutions as well as the partnership with strategic allies such as other UN agencies in the country. However, a stable presence in the country, with the opening of an IFAD office, would boost dialogue with Mexican authorities. In addition, it would also help scaling up interventions funded by IFAD through BRAM resources and the use of new financial instruments such as policy-based lending within the framework of the Government's efforts to overcome poverty. The possibility to strengthen IFAD's presence in the country will be carefully considered in the context of the Decentralization 2.0, currently ongoing. The country team will keep supporting the portfolio, catalyzing the support from IFAD technical specialists to those areas that are of interest to the Government, and ongoing	PA

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-recommendation	2021 Follow Up	Status
									projects. In the case of PRODEZSA IFAD is providing support through specialists and consultant in the areas of semi-arid, gender and small scale livestock raising.	
United Mexican States	LAC	CSPE	6	GOV	OPER	BEN	In order to improve the programme results, greater commitment and involvement in project design and execution is needed on the part of all actors and national organizations. Public agencies need to have an active and integral role in the preparation of IFAD-funded projects and make adequate budget allocations for project implementation, strengthen their M&E systems and hold joint learning workshops with IFAD to capitalize on experiences. In addition, it is important for the governments of the states where projects are taking place to participate in design and execution to enable them to take ownership of the projects and contribute to the sustainability of benefits and scaling up using local resources and development initiatives.		The principle of no-additionality for projects financed with external sources and the uncertain availability of budgetary resources for project implementation which occurs every year, will continue to be a challenge for IFAD's country program in Mexico. On the other side, even if IFAD projects do not raise the budget of executing agencies, there are priorities in terms of what to finance, how, and where. For this reason, the principle of no-additionality makes it necessary for IFAD to demonstrate the credibility and quality of the results generated by its programs, to capture the budgetary allocation necessary for their implementation. Moreover, within the policy dialogue, it is necessary to prioritize the allocation of budgetary resources with a vision that is both strategic and regulatory and encompasses a multi-annual period. To do this, an agreement is needed among the Public Credit Union, the Directorate for International Financial Institutions, and the Sub-secretariat of expenditure of the Secretariat of Finance and Public Credit. For the new IFAD11 project, various state agencies have been involved (CONAFOR, Bienestar, Sader, INPI, CONAGUA, FIRA) etc., led by the Advisory Coordination for the Presidency ("Coordinación de Asesores de la Presidencia"). Moreover, the project will benefit from resources of the Green Climate Fund, with the Secretariat of Finance and Public Credit prioritizing the project within its national program for the use of resources from the Green Climate Fund.	O
Federal Republic of Nepal - Country Strategy and Programme Evaluation										
Nepal	APR	CSPE	1	CTRY	STR	COS	Support federalization as an integral part of the preparation of the new COSOP and		The Strategic Objective 3 under the COSOP 2021 - 2026 is the following:	F

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-recommendation	2021 Follow Up	Status
							project design. The focus should not only be on how to adapt the project architecture (e.g. budgeting, transfer of funds, monitoring and evaluation, fiduciary controls) to the new system, but also on how to support local governments in promoting rural development, including local infrastructure, extension and advisory services, and economic opportunities. IFAD will need to collaborate with other like-minded development agencies.		“Strengthened rural and community institutions to effectively meet development needs under federalism”. Future, IFAD supported operations will support provincial and local governments, building on positive experiences of the Agriculture Sector Development Programme (ASDP) and the Rural Enterprises and Remittances Programme (RERP). Currently, the federalisation process is being supported in three ways: i) the new project, Value Chains for Inclusive Transformation of Agriculture (VITA), channels funding directly to Provincial governments for infrastructure development; ii) The Agriculture Sector Development Programme (ASDP) and Rural Enterprise and Remittances Programme (RERP), respectively support formulation of agriculture development laws and regulations, and formulation of commodity cluster development procedures, at the municipal level; and iii) all value chain projects work together with municipalities in identifying and developing a commodity cluster for VC development. In its capacity as Co-Chair of the Donor Food Security Working Group, IFAD engages with other development cooperation partners on strengthening the process of decentralisation.	
Nepal	APR	CSPE	2	CTRY	OPER	MVC	Continue the support to value chain development, with a renewed emphasis on inclusiveness. IFAD and the Government need to continue emphasizing the inclusion of poor and very poor small-scale producers (e.g. the Dalit, the Janajati, women) and youth by making special provision for them in the project design. The current prefinancing requirements for beneficiaries, which create disincentives for very poor producers, need to be revisited. Another priority is to strengthen the consultation forums between value chain stakeholders (e.g. multi-stakeholder		The targeting of very poor smallscale producers (dalits, indigenous and women) is taking place with regard to the on-going RERP and ASDP projects; a significant increase in numbers is being recorded. Activities are being tailored to suit the specific needs of these groups. For example, the “Dream Support Fund Guidelines” prepared and implemented by RERP seeks to address these needs. Under VITA an explicit focus on these marginalised groups is reflected in the design. The IFAD 12 project to be designed in 2022/23 will seek to systematically	F

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-recommendation	2021 Follow Up	Status
							platforms), so that they can become instruments to improve value chain governance in a more inclusive manner.		dismantle all barriers to engagement of these groups.	
Nepal	APR	CSPE	3	CTRY	OPER	INF	Bring back, to the spectrum of IFAD funding, support to community development, basic infrastructure and services as a preparatory step for further economic opportunities. In areas where commercialization of agriculture has not yet emerged, working on local infrastructure (e.g. feeder roads, bridges, potable water), services and functional literacy can create the basis for further economic development. These can be further built upon through a more pronounced market and value chain orientation in a follow-up project phase.		The VITA project's Component 3 focuses on last mile infrastructure, with an allocation of about USD 27.00 million. The ASDP also supports community and public infrastructure. The IFAD 12 project will be designed keeping this recommendation in focus.	F
Nepal	APR	CSPE	4	CTRY	OPER	NRM	Integrate natural resource management and climate change adaptation in all project designs. The Government and IFAD can build upon their experience in leasehold forestry and low external input agriculture. It may be more effective and efficient to include climate change-proofing elements in all projects, rather than funding a single dedicated project on this topic. Given the portfolio's ubiquitous investment in livestock, the environmental consequences on forests and grasslands need to be monitored systematically.		The VITA project has mainstreamed climate resilience building and environmental conservation in its design. The programme will help to reduce climate related risks and impacts by: improving farmers' understanding of climate risks to their farm business (Sub-component 1.1); increase availability and access to climate resilient technologies and advice to implement climate adaptation measures (through Support Market Development under Sub-component 1.2); providing loans to finance climate adaptation investments (Component 2.1); and invest in multi-use water systems and small scale irrigation to respond to water stress, and upgrade farm access roads to facilitate mobility during heavy rains (Component 3). The project to be developed under IFAD 12 will also focus on building climate resilience in the agriculture and rural development sector.	F
Nepal	APR	CSPE	5	CTRY	STR	PAR	Strengthen partnerships for specialized technical support and for cofinancing. IFAD should explore further cooperation opportunities with development agencies, NGOs and other development partners that have demonstrated technical experience in crucial portfolio areas (e.g. value chain development, support to		Through the Donor Food Security Working Group, Agriculture Development Strategy Joint Sector Review Committee, where IFAD is a member, and other fora, IFAD is continuing its dialogue with development cooperation partners and NGOs to build partnerships for technical expertise and cofinance. With regard to co-financing,	F

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-recommendation	2021 Follow Up	Status
							decentralization, community-based development). This would enhance the quality and innovativeness of project design and implementation, but also open opportunities for policy engagement and for scaling up of results.		Heifer International is co-financing VITA with USD 6.0 million and will provide its technical expertise with implementation of the value chain development component and community mobilization. Currently, discussions are underway with The Netherlands Agriculture Enterprise Agency (RVO) for co-financing of approximately USD20 million, for building a state-of-the-art market under VITA. It is envisaged that under the IFAD 12 project, the permaculture sub-component under ASHA will be scaled up using the already tested consortium of local service providers.	
Nepal	APR	CSPE	6	CTRY	OPER	STRA	Enhance portfolio management and implementation preparedness. IFAD could aim to approve a single new project (excluding loans for project top-up) in any given performance-based allocation cycle, so as to keep the number of ongoing projects in check. Project design will require a more proactive role for the Government in the formulation process and in validating the technical proposals. In order to enhance implementation preparedness, IFAD could make use of its newly introduced instruments for prefinancing project implementation and for building capacity for implementation.		VITA was the only project designed under IFAD 11. The project concept and design was developed together with a multi-stakeholder committee formed by the Ministry of Finance. The pre-financing instrument will be used for jump-starting project implementation. Project start-up is scheduled for Q4 2021. Regardless of the size of financing envelope for IFAD 12, a single project will be designed in 2022/23. This will be done with the active participation of Government at all levels and local communities. The pre-financing instrument will be used more strategically for boosting implementation preparedness.	F
Nepal	APR	CSPE	7	IFAD	STR	DEC	IFAD needs to strengthen its Country Office in Nepal and its corporate support to the country programme. The staffing of the Country Office needs strengthening and, preferably, should include a resident country director. In addition, thematic support from the subregional hub and headquarters, combined with country-specific grants, could help IFAD engage in higher-level knowledge management and policy engagement.		Under Decentralisation 2.0, the ICO has been converted to a Country Director-led ICO. The CD is scheduled to relocate to Kathmandu before end-2021. FSU is currently identifying additional office space for housing the country team. HRD is launching the recruitment process for the replacement of the current NO-C as well as for recruiting a new CPA. Initiatives are underway in partnership with HQ and the Subregional Hub in relation to improving policy engagement. Some of this work is aligned with the Food Systems Summit (FSS). Currently, action research is being undertaken with regard to the permaculture sub-component under ASHA,	F

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-recommendation	2021 Follow Up	Status
									and a national policy dialogue will be convened to share the results. It is also anticipated that policy dialogue on migrants and remittances, and digitization, will be undertaken in 2022/23.	
Sierra Leone - Country Strategy and Programme Evaluation										
Sierra Leone	WCA	CSPE	1	CTRY	STR	MVC	Deepen the developmental impact of agricultural growth by focusing more on strengthening linkages along the value chain. Horizontal and vertical linkages should be strengthened all along the value chain in order to facilitate sustainable pro-poor development in a fragile context. In this regard, the new COSOP should focus on improving relationships among the stakeholders, including buyers, sellers, service providers and regulatory institutions. Multi-stakeholder forums should be established that will bring together value chain actors in order to foster dialogue, improved communication and mutual trust. Knowledge and information about prices and other market conditions should be provided to poor producers and their groups. The focus of future projects should also be on developing systematic partnerships with private sector actors and creating incentives for their participation, including risk- and cost-sharing mechanisms. A rigorous technical analysis of value chain viability must be undertaken early on in the project design stage, and the findings should be shared with all stakeholders. At the policy and regulatory level, IFAD must assist the Government in creating an enabling environment for private sector participation and for public-private partnerships, ideally in collaboration with other development partners.		The new COSOP focuses on improving relationships among stakeholders, including buyers, sellers, service providers and regulatory institutions. Through the AVDP Project, Multi-stakeholder forums are being established along the rice, cocoa, oilpalm, and vegetables value chains, to bring together value chain actors in order to foster dialogue, improve communication and mutual trust; exchange knowledge and information about prices and markets. Along with the current Government policy shift to focus on private sector engagement in the Agric Sector, IFAD-supported projects are developing partnerships with private sector actors. IFAD is currently supporting government to create an overarching agricultural sector strategy, and its new direction to focus on private sector-led agricultural sector.	F
Sierra Leone	WCA	CSPE	2	CTRY	STR	NTR	Pursue diversification more vigorously as a strategy for improving nutrition and building economic resilience. The focus of the portfolio has primarily been on crop production. This has meant that		Diversified value chains have been strengthened – a mix of tree crops, rice and vegetables to support nutrition and economic resilience of smallholder farmers. Furthermore, in addition to supporting	O

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-recommendation	2021 Follow Up	Status
							beneficiaries' incomes remain exposed to climate- and market/price-related shocks. Furthermore, while nutrition has been emphasized in the COSOP, the assumption has been that increases in income (which depend on crops alone) will drive improvements in nutrition. The new COSOP should put the spotlight on resilience and nutrition based on a more emphatic approach to diversification. Thus, the scope of future projects should be expanded to include not only crop production but also other subsectors (e.g. livestock) as a pathway to increased economic benefits, improved resilience and better nutrition. Livestock is also a thrust area of the Government's development plan and has a proven potential in rural development. As women traditionally tend smaller animals, activities should be specifically targeted in that direction		production and productivity, a more comprehensive value chain approach has been adopted - value addition and marketing through agricultural business centres, adaptation to climate change are all important aspects of focus in the AVDP project, for example. Multi-stakeholder platforms are emphasized and are intended to strengthen value chain dynamics. The current COSOP focuses on resilience and nutrition, and support to vegetable production is an important aspect of the projects.	
Sierra Leone	WCA	CSPE	3	CTRY	OPER	RFI	Elevate the level of engagement in rural finance by building on existing structures and on the increased awareness of rural finance in the country. IFAD should continue to engage with rural finance in Sierra Leone but should pay greater attention to the underserved farming community. Apart from the achievements of its rural finance projects and the structures that they have helped to create, future interventions will also benefit from the increased awareness in rural communities of financial products and their potential. IFAD should focus on making the Apex Bank a competent, profitable and professionally managed umbrella organization capable of serving the CB/FSA network through the design of an appropriate, comprehensive strategy and business plan. The design of a system for implementing a modern, flexible agricultural lending policy for CBs and FSAs needs to be finalized. IFAD must support the development of CB/FSA		IFAD continues to be an important player in enhancing access to financial services for rural small holders in Sierra Leone. IFAD is supporting the Apex Bank to develop a new model that is aimed at ensuring it is sustainable after the completion of the RFCIP2 project. A strong and sustainable Apex Bank will ensure continued services to the 76 Rural Financial Institutions (CBs and FSAs) established with IFAD support. An Agricultural Finance Facility, specifically aimed at agricultural lending was established and has contributed to increased lending to small holder farmers. Furthermore, a Technical Investment Facility to support capitalisation of the RFIs is also under implementation and is aimed at enhancing sustainability of the RFIs and thereby to sustainable access to financial services for the members. With support of the Apex Bank, the CBs and the FSAs are using financial software to ease business and guard against fraud. The Apex Bank is	O

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-recommendation	2021 Follow Up	Status
							outreach and impact through the introduction of new services and policies on deposits, loans and dividends using IT-based solutions and linkages with other financial institutions where appropriate. The Fund should explore the possibility of opening a flexible refinancing window for the Apex Bank to attract incremental funding from multiple sources with a view to substantially expanding the rural portfolios in the CB/FSA network and beyond.		also working on a plan to install T24 software.	
Sierra Leone	WCA	CSPE	4	CTRY	OPER	KM	Rebalance the Fund's approach by moving away from an almost exclusive focus on development and oversight of individual projects and towards the management of the country programme as a coherent whole. This should involve mainstreaming non-lending and grants programme instruments as part of a coherent strategy in the next COSOP. The following actions in this regard are recommended:	A well-designed knowledge management strategy should be adopted that facilitates improved M&E systems at the project level (that also feed into national donor-based M&E systems), promotes a deeper understanding of impact pathways in a fragile context and sets out indicators for measuring progress in knowledge management.	A knowledge management strategy has been developed with the two projects, with each project developing a customised action plan. IFAD, through the partnership and Delivery Unit with the Tony Blair Institute is supporting the Ministry of Agriculture to develop an M&E system and database to which all agricultural development projects feed. Building on the RPSF has also contributed to a digital platform to support access to agricultural and market information for small scale farmers.	F
Sierra Leone	WCA	CSPE	5	CTRY	STR	PAR	Rebalance the Fund's approach by moving away from an almost exclusive focus on development and oversight of individual projects and towards the management of the country programme as a coherent whole. This should involve mainstreaming non-lending and grants programme instruments as part of a coherent strategy in the next COSOP. The following actions in this regard are recommended:	IFAD should participate more actively in the United Nations Sustainable Development Cooperation Framework and the coordination groups for agricultural and rural sector donors. In order to shape its policy engagement with the Government of Sierra Leone, IFAD should cease to rely solely on the experience gained	IFAD is taking a leading role in reviving the Agricultural Advisory Group (AAG), which brings all development partners and government (Ministry of Agriculture together) for critical policy discussions. Furthermore, IFAD has taken the lead in pushing for an overarching national agricultural policy, and is working with the Ministry of Agriculture on its push for enhanced private sector participation in the agricultural sector.	O

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-recommendation	2021 Follow Up	Status
								through its own projects and should instead provide a platform for a broader group of stakeholders, including research organizations, NGOs and private sector agencies that are involved in, or are a part of, the rural landscape. This platform could be created by inviting these stakeholders to donor and development partner coordination meetings. Greater efforts should be made to work with other Rome-based agencies on such issues as food security, gender equality and resilience. To achieve a greater impact, IFAD should also increase the scope of its engagement with the Government by working more closely with all ministries involved in rural development.		
Sierra Leone	WCA	CSPE	6	IFAD	STR	DEC	Rebalance the Fund's approach by moving away from an almost exclusive focus on development and oversight of individual projects and towards the management of the country programme as a coherent whole. This should involve mainstreaming non-lending and grants programme instruments as part of a coherent strategy in the next COSOP. The following actions in this regard are recommended:	Increased engagement should be supported by the provision of adequate financial and human resources. Equipping the ICO with additional capacity and relevant technical skills will leave the CPM and the CPO with more time to pursue non-lending activities. Increased proximity will	The Country Officer has benefited from the services of a long-term consultant following up on aspects of Knowledge Management, M&E and Gender Mainstreaming.	F

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	Sub-recommendation	2021 Follow Up	Status
								also facilitate a deeper understanding of the fragility of the situation.		
Sierra Leone	WCA	CSPE	7	CTRY	STR	YTH	Strengthen the targeting focus of the country portfolio by mainstreaming youth into the portfolio through a countryspecific youth strategy. A needs assessment based on a vulnerability analysis must be conducted to identify the needs of the young population in Sierra Leone and to determine which of those needs can best be addressed by IFAD-supported projects. A youth strategy should then be developed on this basis which will help unlock the potential of the nation's youth in the agricultural sector. The strategy should also include suggested activities, linkages to other development partners and suggested responsibilities. The youth strategy and related activities need to be implemented in a structural manner, and the targeting capacity of the NPCU should be strengthened with the addition of dedicated staff who possess youth expertise. Youth participation must be closely monitored, not only in terms of the numbers of young people reached but also in terms of how effectively they are able to participate. Activities should be designed in such a way that there is a considerable likelihood that the young people concerned can sustain those activities without external support.		Through the AVDP NPCU which has been furnished with a gender and youth mainstreaming expert, the youth and gender strategies are under development. These are being developed taking into consideration the existing Ministry of Agriculture Gender strategy, as well as the strategic direction of the Ministry of Gender, Labour and Social Development.	0

Impact Evaluations (IEs)

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	2021 Follow Up	Status
Niger: Food Security and Development Support Project in the Maradi Region									
Niger	WCA	IE	1	CTRY	STR	NTR	Within the framework of the economic development hub approach, substantially increase the size of interventions to improve food and nutritional security for poor and vulnerable households so that no one is left behind. Activities to build food resilience such as cash for work, women-managed lean season grain stores and goat kits have a demonstrated short- and medium-term impact on food security among	To fully understand the level of implementation of the recommendations of the PASADEM Impact Assessment, it should be recalled that it took place on the contextual level with the effectiveness of the deployment of ProDAF which constitutes the continuation of this project as well as other recent interventions financed or co-financed by IFAD in Niger, such as PPI RUWANMU and IRDAR RCI. De facto, this program, which integrated these projects until their closure, dedicated the scaling up of high impact activities for the most vulnerable households. These include this package of	0

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	2021 Follow Up	Status
							<p>the poorest and most vulnerable households. They should continue to be pursued on a large scale. However, better analysis is needed on interactions between different interventions which, when combined, do not always generate additional impact. Awareness raising around nutrition, including through home gardens and home-based nutritional centres, would also appear essential to improve diet diversity and nutrition for children, and should continue to be pursued.</p>	<p>activities known as social safety nets for strengthening household food and nutritional security such as cash for work / asset, the establishment of women's lean granaries, goat kits and Kitchen gardens. Other support in nutrition through the establishment of local information / awareness and even prevention frameworks for child malnutrition, in particular community relays and centers for animation and nutritional recovery (FARN) with targeting focused on women from vulnerable households is the first decisive point for the implementation of this recommendation. Indeed, ProDAF has set up more than 3,380 goat kits for the benefit of women from vulnerable households in the project intervention area, which has geographically extended beyond the area covered by PASADEM. Better still, an evaluation of this activity carried out as part of the mid-term review of ProDAF showed an increase rate of the distributed livestock of 37% and an optimal exploitation of these animals for the purposes of food and nutritional security of households at through the sale of products for the purchase of foodstuffs in the markets and the consumption of goat's milk, recognized as very nutritious for children.</p> <p>Also, 53 women's lean season granaries are built and supplied with stocks of cereals (530 tonnes of millet) for the benefit of more than 12,400 women from extremely vulnerable households in the program area. Better, a plan to reinforce the 72 granaries put in place by PASADEM in stock is envisaged as part of support for vulnerable households to increase their resilience in the face of COVID 19.</p> <p>Other activities falling within the consideration of this recommendation are carried out by ProDAF. We have in particular:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The establishment of 3,220 kitchen gardens to produce plants with high nutritional value such as Moringa, cassia tora and other vegetable plants such as sorrel, okra, etc. • 1,614 Children's nutritional monitoring kits and IEC kits for the benefit of community relays • 276 tonnes of Agricultural-Seed-Fertilizer Kits to the most vulnerable households in the regions of 	

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	2021 Follow Up	Status
								<p>Maradi (Even more inTahoua and Zinder).</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 277 Income Generating Activities promoted for women and young people. <p>In addition, for a better analysis of the interactions between these activities, specific studies will be conducted as part of the preparatory studies for the completion of ProDAF from 2022 in order to improve the implementation of these activities, which are being implemented. Ongoing within ProDAF and PRECIS.</p>	
Niger	WCA	IE	2	CTRY	OPER	MVC	<p>Finalize the full implementation of at least one economic development hub in each region in order to assess their effectiveness and impact as a development model. This would include the development of a critical mass of village markets (satellite collection centres) around a well located quasi-wholesale market and repair of a maximum number of tracks connecting production areas to markets to minimize transport-related transaction costs. Given the very high costs of such investments, it is strongly recommended that the Government and IFAD develop cofinancing partnerships with other international financial institutions.</p>	<p>Three economic development hubs are fully established despite some functioning challenges. Within the framework of this recommendation, the need to consolidate, through the financing of PRECIS, the achievements of the PDE approach initiated by PASADEM, in all these dimensions, in particular the effective functioning of markets and their link with collection canthers and rural roads to open up production basins. An initial assessment of the approach, carried out as part of the mid-term review, revealed all the shortcomings leading to dysfunctions in the relations between the collection centers and the whole sell market (MDGs). These shortcomings concern issues of infrastructure governance, their management and support methods. The implementation of this recommendation will therefore be better taken into account within the framework of the PRECIS, which, through the capitalization of the lessons learned through the finalization of the phasing of the deployment of the approach at the level of certain PDE, will apply a more flexible and focused phasing. on the effective functionality of the socioeconomic dynamics of PDEs. In this sense, an exchange and reflection workshop between URGP and CENRAT agents on the management of economic infrastructure (MDG, PFC and CC of ProDAF) was held to take stock of the current difficulties in the management of MDG and collection centers and improvements to be made in the short, medium and long terms to achieve the expected impacts of these market infrastructures. The overall aim is to improve social engineering and market infrastructure management mechanisms with a view to profitability and sustainability of the investments made by ProDAF</p>	0

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	2021 Follow Up	Status
								<p>and to capitalize on experiences on behalf of PRECIS.</p> <p>Concrete proposals for improving the implementation of the approach are made and shared with the stakeholders. These include</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The organization of regional workshops / forums and missions at the level of the EDPs to better re-explain the vision, the concept, the objectives and the implications of the EDP approach to the various actors for a better understanding of the approach, in particular the new regional and local authorities resulting from the recent democratic elections organized by the country 2. The training of facilitators of operators on the tools and methodology for diagnosing the actors and the identification of the most influential and their involvement in the social engineering process; 3. The organization of framing workshops and clarification of the roles and responsibilities of the actors (HG, GIE, Unions and town hall) in order to manage relations of conflicts of interest and restore serenity; 4. The intensification of periodic meetings with implementing partners and the organization of training and scoping workshops; 5. The development of technical capitalization notes at each stage of the deployment of Social Engineering <p>A roadmap for the implementation of all these proposals was developed and shared with the Program Management Team.</p> <p>Regarding the need of partnerships with other donors for the construction of markets which constitute significant investments, this recommendation has already started to be implemented with ProDAF as part of the construction of the MdG. of Guidan Roudmji in the Maradi region who received the contribution of PRAC a project financed by the World Bank, it finances the realization of the market platform to allow ProDAF/IFAD to build the other infrastructures in particular the transaction hall, the storage warehouses, the market administration and other amenities such as water</p>	

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	2021 Follow Up	Status
								supply, toilets, etc. This recommendation is also being developed by ProDAF Diffa for the construction of the fish market in synergy with other TFPs such as PRESILAC (ADB financing) and PRRIA (IDB financing). Ongoing within ProDAF and PRECIS	
Niger	WCA	IE	3	CTRY	OPER	TCB	Further strengthen grass-roots farmers' organizations to provide producers with sustainable quality production and postproduction services. FO unions must continue to be supported, and it is also essential through them to strengthen the capacities of grass-roots FOs to ensure that the interests and needs of all their members are taken into account and that their services are accessible to all. The grass-roots FOs should be capable of organizing village-based collection, storage and transport of agricultural products, and organizing village-based sales of agricultural inputs, in order to lower transaction costs with economies of scale. It is also important to continue to pursue professionalization for farmers' advisory assistance groups, which could also be involved in marketing agricultural inputs and in the proximity private veterinary system.	The capacity building of small producers both on production, post-harvest and marketing aspects as well as on aspects of organizational dynamics in order to instill a change in behavior to be viable functional structures have already been taken into account in terms of continuity, within the framework of ProDAF and further strengthened with PRECIS. Multi-year partnership agreements with structures such as Regional Chambers of Agriculture, RECA and many other federations and umbrella organizations are signed by ProDAF and soon by PRECIS to intensify the structuring of FOs, in particular FO unions and, grassroots FOs to better play their role in the PDE approach, which considers them to be essential links to ensure household food and nutritional security and to supply urban and cross-border consumer markets. Financial education and support for the emergence of viable rural businesses including young people and women represent the backbone of the new social engineering strategy to be put in place under PRECIS. So in the region of Maradi for example, ProDAF is working with the umbrella groups FUMA, SA'A, ALbirinkun Manoma and the Fédéartion FCMN-Niyya. They provide training for FOs in management, supply of inputs in grouped orders, support for marketing in collection centers and semi-wholesale markets. They also provide information to small producers on agricultural markets. Ongoing within ProDAF and PRECIS	O

Project Performance Evaluations (PPEs)

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	2021 Follow up	Status
Botswana Agriculture Services Support Project									
Botswana	ESA	PPE	1	CTRY	STR	COS	IFAD should identify its strategic role in the context of Botswana. This may involve an in-depth and realistic analysis of the development challenges that Botswana faces and the nature of interventions that IFAD can realistically undertake to address them. These selected areas of engagement should be reflected in the form of a country strategy note or country strategic opportunities programme (COSOP), as applicable. Some potential areas of engagement that IFAD could consider include backstopping and capacity building of existing flagship Government programmes, testing of low-cost irrigation models and subsidy rationalization models.	The most effective way to continue to support the financial sector in Belize is through the ongoing programme "Resilient Rural Belize". While this program does not include a rural finance component, it will involve the Credit Unions (CUs) to provide loans to producers' organizations (POs), which will be asked to co-finance project investments. Modalities to facilitate POs access to financial services, to enhance CUs capacity to deliver those services efficiently, and required policy engagement, will be defined during the second semester of 2020, as the investment component will hopefully enter active implementation. Possible delays may be due to the COVID emergency and current country lockdown.	F
Botswana	ESA	PPE	2	CTRY	STR	GRT	Make strategic use of the limited IFAD resources and instruments available in Botswana. In the absence of an allocation under the performance-based allocation system, IFAD can operate through regional and country-specific grants or reimbursable technical assistance. Any such instruments should be deployed towards interventions that can have multiplier effects, or those that can be potentially scaled up by the Government using its own funding. To that extent, IFAD should confine its future interventions to a focused scope of activities and pilot initiatives, in line with Government policy priorities and capacities, and IFAD's strategic focus,	The current program "Resilient Rural Belize" includes a Value Chain market assessment, and a Climate Vulnerability Assessment, as a basis to prioritize project activities. Further plans involving producers organizations input cascade down from these two assessments in order to establish specific plans based on geographic priorities	F

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	2021 Follow up	Status
							without engaging in a wide range of activities as in the case of a conventional IFAD investment programme.		
Haiti Small-scale Irrigation Development Project – Phase II									
Haiti	LAC	PPE	1	CTRY	OPER	INF	Pursue the programme to empower IAs to manage irrigation schemes with partner support, develop and implement an action plan that includes a major effort to convert IAs into apex organizations and steadily strengthen their capacities to guarantee real effectiveness and empowerment. The new, recently adopted legal framework on the transfer of management responsibilities is a good foundation. The transfer strategy and its action plan should define the principles, modalities, tools, means and pace of the transfer, based on the hydraulic systems and their specific features.	The programs for reinforcing the capacity of members of irrigation users associations are an essential aspect for the sustainability of the development interventions financed by IFAD in the context of irrigation systems. In this regard, PPI-3 which was closed in 2019 and the emergency project PURRACO approved in 2021, both pursue such approach. Direct investments in the irrigated area will have a minimal impact if they are not linked to an adequate capacity building program for the utilization of the irrigated areas and irrigation associations.	F
Haiti	LAC	PPE	2	CTRY	OPER	INF	Adopt an integrated approach of water resource development and management, for the planning and design of irrigation projects and programmes. The watershed and its micro-basins components should serve as the basic unit for the study, planning, and design of water resource development activities in general, and irrigation development activities in particular (comprised of small- and medium-sized public and private irrigation projects). These principles should be borne in mind from the design phase and followed during the implementation of activities	The integrated water resource management approach for better design and planning of irrigation programmes continues to be used as a valid tool to develop new interventions in this area. The emergency project PURRACO benefited from this approach and its implementation will follow this methodology.	F

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	2021 Follow up	Status
Haiti	LAC	PPE	3	CTRY	OPER	NRM	Pursue support for producers in PPI-2 target areas, particularly those affected by extreme rural poverty, applying an approach that combines the development of value chains with the protection and improvement of natural and hydro-agricultural water resources. Activities to promote agricultural diversification should be part of a strategy to increase the population's resilience to the challenges of climate change and natural disasters	The project PURRACO will target almost all areas covered by PPI-II with the goal of consolidating the work already carried out under the project.	F
Haiti	LAC	PPE	4	CTRY	OPER	NLA	Strengthen IFAD's role in the mobilization and efficient use of resources from the country's development partners, to sustainably boost the institutional capacity of central and devolved MARNDR entities. This should be accomplished through effective functional frameworks for dialogue, which will enable different actors in the rural development sector to learn lessons. Financial management, results-based monitoring and evaluation, and procurement should be among the priorities in capacity building.	IFAD has committed to engage in the relevant technical committees and working groups at country level. Within this context, IFAD and PPI-3 have invested significantly into strengthening the capacity of MARNDR staff, with support from UNDP. Financial management, results monitoring and evaluation, and procurement have been among the priority areas of the capacity building programme within PPI-3. A similar approach, adopting external procurement and fiduciary control has been applied by the PITAG project through the IDB. IFAD will continue to support these initiatives in its portfolio and for future operations. Within this context, the presence of a resident Country Director will help further strengthening this type of dialogue.	F
Liberia Smallholder Tree Crop Revitalization Support Project									
Liberia	WCA	PPE	1	CTRY	OPER	MVC	Future IFAD cocoa value chain development projects should focus on addressing constraints upstream and pay increased attention to nodes downstream of the value chain. Special attention should be paid to shortages of critical inputs (e.g. quality seedlings), poor storage and drying conditions, inadequate warehouse capacity and use,	The current Liberia cocoa value chain development project include TCEP 1 and its extension TCEP2. Key progress to date as follows: - 108 communities in eight districts in Nimba County with high concentration of cocoa farmers mobilized and sensitized to address critical constraints to upstream and	F

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	2021 Follow up	Status
							<p>and lack of motivation among cooperative members. Empowered cooperatives should focus on actions that build household resilience by equipping farmers with GAPs and opportunities to adjust farm management practices to better cope with economic and other risks. Downstream attention should focus on interventions that support farmers and their organizations to add value to their produce, and that promote an equitable share of benefits. Future projects should therefore support the cooperatives in: (i) addressing constraints to credit; (ii) building managerial and organizational capacities and negotiation skills; and (iii) building the capacity of the cooperatives to better serve their members (e.g. inputs, extension, training, collection). Once the cooperatives have been strengthened sufficiently, future projects could consider supporting the formalization of a union of the cooperatives at county level in order for the cooperatives to sell directly on the international market.</p>	<p>downstream nodes of the value chain; and 243 communities in seven districts in Lofa County were mobilized on same;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - A total of 5,299 smallholder cocoa farmers 34% of which are female, identified and registered to benefit from revitalization and new planting of cocoa plantation including production inputs (tools, seeds, agro-chemicals and other materials) in (Nimba County); 5,500 farmers, 28% of which are women in Lofa County. <p>To address constraints to credit, capacity building, along with greater access to inputs for both counties:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Managerial, organizational and negotiation skills are being built through established Farmer Field Schools framework (FFS) conducted on-site with farmers and their relevant association, in the delivery of services, (extension, training etc.); - Village nurseries are being erected (approximately 195 in Nimba county and 220 in Lofa County so far) to address the shortage of seeds and planting materials; - Establishment of 30.4 ha of national seed garden in Nimba county; and 20 ha in Lofa County; - The project is engaged in supporting eight cooperatives in Nimba county, to which farmers are linked, and seven in Lofa county, and strengthening their institutional capacities to better provide technical support to farmers and their organizations. This is being done through signed MOUs and workplan activities covering agribusiness /market linkages with private sector partners. <p>Furthermore, the project is providing</p>	

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	2021 Follow up	Status
								digressive operational support to cooperatives in the tune of \$5,000/year for a period of three years as operational costs, to enable the purchase of farmers' produce.	
Liberia	WCA	PPE	2	CTRY	OPER	PAR	Any future project must address the problems relating to the policy and regulatory environment. Based on the experience gained with STCRSP, IFAD is well positioned to feed lessons into newly established government institutions and processes. In addition, a number of other donors (e.g. World Bank, USAID, GrowLiberia) have been testing different models in the tree crop sector and there is now a need to consolidate this knowledge and ensure that experience informs the development of the sector. The newly established Liberia Agriculture Commodity Regulator would be a natural entry point for IFAD. In addition, IFAD should support forums and other mechanisms that involve farmer unions, civil society and private sector organizations in the cocoa policy processes.	Policy and regulatory environment progress: The TCEP 1&2 have taken some strides on institution building and policy engagement. However, there is room for improvement in the context of apparent limitations on overall capacity for policy work. The project, in collaboration with the Ministry of Agriculture (MoA), has identified a set of policy areas under key institutions with which it has signed MOUs, with plans for regular monitoring and a yearly review; it is anticipated that this action would determine the effectiveness of identified policies for incorporation into the broader agricultural policy framework of Liberia (cocoa value chain development policies), with the scope for continuous refining/targeting. Key areas highlighted for policy development and dialogue include: - Certification – Government / MOA to pilot organic and fair-trade cocoa production in TCEPI & TCEP-II including monitoring mechanisms; - cocoa pricing policy; - policy dialogue on child labour prevention, monitoring and remediation; and - policy for farm and supply chain certification in cocoa amongst others. The Minister will appoint a cocoa specialist in the near future, so that all policy issues may be championed by this person. Furthermore, the TCEP projects has signed an MOU with the Liberia Agriculture	F

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	2021 Follow up	Status
								Commodity Regulatory Authority (LACRA) for the promotion of best agricultural practices in processing and marketing of high-quality cocoa beans, including training of project beneficiaries and certification of farmers produce. LACRA has so far, trained four (4) Quality Control Officers and deployed them to Nimba County.	
Liberia	WCA	PPE	3	CTRY	OPER	GDR	IFAD's projects should enhance support to the development of women's entrepreneurship in both upstream and downstream nodes of the cocoa value chain. This could include support to the formation of women's cooperatives, production of seedlings, drying of beans, and transformation of by-products. Activities should focus on: (i) building bargaining skills; (ii) training women in technical and managerial skills; and (iii) addressing constraints on access to credit. A similar focus should also be applied for the inclusion of youth in cocoa value chain entrepreneurship.	The Gender and Social Inclusion Unit of the TCEP projects has conducted capacity building training workshops for 45 TCEP1 and 58 TCEP2 Project Staff and partners respectively, on issues relating to gender and social inclusion, child labor and gender advocacy in the Projects. The training provided skills that enabled and encouraged project beneficiaries and other community members about citizens' participation and empower beneficiaries to develop and implement plans. In addition, the team conducted a series of four (4) community dialogues in the four project districts in Nimba County, and seven in Lofa county; these dialogues brought together a total of 124 participants comprising 101 adults and 23 youths (TCEPI), and 234 participants comprising 171 adults and 63 youths (TCEPII). The dialogues focused on raising awareness among local authorities, women, and youth along the agricultural production/value chains and discussing traditional beliefs and practices in order to provide insight into how they impact agriculture development and poverty reduction and hinder women and youth participation in community development.	F

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	2021 Follow up	Status
								The Gender Unit oversaw work that conducted a gender analysis and gaps identification in the project locations. As part of awareness raising, the gender unit held more than five radio talk shows to provide public information on the dangers of child labor and gender-based violence; citing some causes of the menaces and how they impact of children, women and girls and other vulnerable groups of people.	
Malawi Rural Livelihoods Economic Enhancement Programme									
Malawi	ESA	PPE	1	PROJ	OPER	BEN	TRADE should adopt an institutional approach to implementation that ensures buy-in by government partners while maintaining autonomous service provision. The PPE supports the continued use of an independent coordination office within a multi-stakeholder implementation structure to enable multiple stakeholder participation and effective service delivery at local level, but with greater focus on implementation quality and sustainability. The RLEEP implementation structure has been effective in delivering selected services and assets. A similar approach could be used for TRADE, with some further fine-tuning. The PSU will require strong capacities for project management and coordination, but also private sector expertise and the technical expertise to guide programme interventions. Dedicated staff for M&E and gender/social inclusion will also be required. The programme will need to strengthen the mechanisms for coordination and support at district level and mobilize government resources to ensure that these are sufficiently linked and sustained. Buy-in from line ministries also needs to be strengthened, and existing coordination mechanisms at district level must be more effectively	The TRADE design framework provides operational space for enhancing stakeholders participation, including private sector, in implementation and service delivery. There is also operational space for working with and strengthening the capacities of districts' staff, and deliver projects through decentralized government structures. The Programme will train districts/EPA staff and other relevant local institutions in various technical and managerial roles related to TRADE. Private service providers including NGOs have been integrated in the programme to facilitate service delivery and capacity building of programme beneficiaries. The capacity of the PSU for project coordination, oversight and monitoring and evaluation will be strengthened.	F

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	2021 Follow up	Status
							used, in particular at decision points and during planning and monitoring. The responsibilities of district councils within the project cycle should be clearly defined. Existing monitoring mechanisms should be enhanced through strengthened technical oversight, timely follow-up and space for adaptive learning, thus improving implementation quality. Consortium arrangements, to streamline the engagement of non-governmental service providers, should be explored.		
Malawi	ESA	PPE	2	PROJ	OPER	PAR	Strengthen principles of complementarity and mutuality through partnerships with international development partners, NGOs and private sector actors. A range of partnerships had been built under RLEEP, but under TRADE, there needs to be greater focus on the synergies and complementarities of different partners. IFAD will need to show greater presence in the agriculture sector working group and make greater use of existing (or emerging) collaborations. Partnerships with international organizations should build on complementarities and combined strengths, in areas such as sustainable service provision and conducive policy frameworks. Partnerships with NGOs are indispensable to support processes of group formation, but they can also offer valuable lessons for IFAD – for example, on targeting, on-farm technology development and pro-poor service provision. Finally, IFAD, in cooperation with agriculture sector partners, should develop a strategic approach, and clear criteria, for engagement with the private sector – for example, in the provision of inputs and services, marketing and processing. Cooperation with the private sector will	Cooperation will be fostered through linking TRADE interventions with WFP's Food Assistance for Assets and Purchase for Progress (P4P) programmes and its goat VC which focus on youth and women. TRADE will draw lessons from FAO initiatives in Malawi and other countries in the region for VC skill development. TRADE will build synergies and complementarities for VC development and commercialization activities implemented by other development partners, such as the Climate Adaptation for Rural Livelihoods and Agriculture (CARLA) financed by AfDB, the UNDP-led Malawi Innovation Challenge Fund (MICF) and the WB-funded Malawi Agricultural Commercialization Programme and Early years programme on nutrition. Other potential partners include the Clinton Foundation's legume VC development programme on VSLAs and youth incubators in all Districts; GIZ's More Income and Employment in Rural Areas project (MIERA) and EU's KULIMA initiative, which support value chains and Inclusive Business Models. Country presence	F

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	2021 Follow up	Status
							require appropriate cofinancing mechanisms (beyond matching grants).	has been improved and participation in Sector Donor Working Group has been strengthened in the past 2 years.	
Malawi	ESA	PPE	3	PROJ	OPER	TCB	Enhance the focus on farmers' empowerment through enhanced capacity-building, access to finance, access to information, and institutional linkages. The support of different value chains and implementation approaches can be beneficial as part of a decentralized implementation approach, but there must be a common orientation towards impact on the ground. For TRADE, there needs to be greater focus on the empowerment of farmers vis-à-vis other value chain actors. Growth and performance of farmer groups require more support and better monitoring. Social accountability and due diligence need to be mainstreamed into the support of associations and cooperatives. Broad-based benefits for farmers must be ensured through appropriate targeting and governance mechanisms. Farmers' access to market information should be supported through innovative communication channels (e.g. Farm Radio) and local commodity platforms. Farmers also require access to a range of financial products to resolve their need for both immediate cash and longer-term investments. While links with complementary IFAD programmes seem like an obvious solution, the practicalities need to be established upfront.	Community-based institutions such as clubs, associations and cooperatives will be supported under TRADE with the objective of enabling CBOs to become commercial entities and serve as dependable entry point for support to smallholder producers. The support will include both training and coaching by specialised business service providers to: (i) strengthen overall business operational and managerial skills; (ii) improve services to their members such as bulk buying of inputs, product bulking for joint marketing, creation of commercial partnerships with private companies, linkages to large commodity traders and increasing capital (shares) and joint investments to increase profits. Initially, TRADE support will be targeted to FBOs in the RLEEP supported districts, especially the cooperatives managing infrastructures such as warehouses for legumes VCs and Milk Bulking Centres. Programme beneficiaries will also be supported to enhance their access to information and trade-related legal services.	F
Malawi	ESA	PPE	4	PROJ	OPER	MVC	Adopt an institutional approach for sustainable service provision through strategic engagement and innovative approaches. Sustainable service provision is a major gap in value chains that needs to be strategically addressed	Building on RLEEP experiences, TRADE will support participation of smallholder farmers to access services and markets through the 4P approach and other innovative	F

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	2021 Follow up	Status
							in cooperation with other development partners. Various initiatives to address service provision, for example, through public-private partnerships, are ongoing and supported by development partners such as Food and Agriculture Organization, GIZ, Japan International Cooperation Agency (JICA) and others. Innovative approaches for engaging private sector players in service provision are piloted by GIZ and may provide important lessons for TRADE. Another interesting approach is the Smallholder Horticulture Empowerment Promotion, which is an agreed area for cooperation between JICA and IFAD. IFAD should aim to utilize the combined strengths and complementarities wherever possible, to ensure that service provision under TRADE is streamlined and likely to be sustained. Sustainable service provision is a longer-term task that cannot be achieved by IFAD alone within the limited duration of a project.	models developed by other development partners in Malawi.	
Malawi	ESA	PPE	5	PROJ	OPER	INF	Access to infrastructure should be integrated from the outset, starting with a realistic assessment of the needs and absorptive capacities on the ground. Provision of productive infrastructure needs to address actual needs and align with the absorptive capacities of farmer groups. For example, dairy farmers may require storage for feed rather than milk collection centres, which are usually provided by the processors anyway. Smaller and more widely distributed storage facilities might be easier to manage by farmer groups. Studies will need to be conducted during the preparation phase to identify the types and sizes of infrastructure investments together with the institutional arrangements for financing, operating and maintaining the structures. Implementation should be carried out	To reduce bottlenecks to value chains development, TRADE will provide relevant infrastructures based on needs such as roads, warehouse and water points. Community Participatory Approaches will be deployed to identify infrastructure requirement.	F

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	2021 Follow up	Status
							through dedicated implementation units within the government structure, to ensure fiduciary discipline, technical supervision and follow-up maintenance. Since IFAD will not have the capacity to supervise the infrastructure component, partners with technical capacity for supervision (e.g. the United Nations Office for Project Services) need to be identified.		
Malawi	ESA	PPE	6	PROJ	OPER	RME	Enhance the focus on results and impact through a robust and learning-oriented M&E system. TRADE needs to build a robust M&E system tracking the performance and impact of value chains. This requires value chain-specific targets (based on the identified challenges) and impact pathways. The performance of service providers also needs to be monitored. Under RLEEP implementation has been dispersed and overly focussed on achievement of targets and outputs instead of impact. TRADE needs to be able to track capacity-building outcomes, institutional linkages and performance of platforms along the envisaged pathways. The graduation of producer groups (to become associations and cooperatives) also needs to be monitored. Impact studies should be conducted for individual value chains rather than for the entire programme. Feedback mechanisms involving farmers, district-level actors and the private sector should be used to inform the programme about emerging gaps and shortcomings as well as good practices.	The TRADE M&E system is designed to support data collection and data analysis at different levels, which allow tracking of outcome indicators and other critical operational processes. This will allow programme managers to identify implementation bottlenecks, make informed decisions and take timely corrective actions to improve programme performance. M&E functions will be supported by a Management Information System (MIS) integrated with GIS. In addition, TRADE will provide an opportunity for the beneficiaries to directly provide feedback about its services and initiatives through an SMS platform.	F
Sierra Leone Rehabilitation and Community-based Poverty Reduction Project									
Sierra Leone	WCA	PPE	1	CTRY	OPER	ORG	To promote effective and efficient market participation by smallholder farmers, strengthen equally the	This is ongoing under the AVDP project – ABCs are being supported with training, also training is being	O

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	2021 Follow up	Status
							institutional expertise and the financial capacity of marketing organizations. Where marketing organizations such as farmers' marketing groups or farmers' cooperatives are important avenues for smallholder farmer commercialization, the focus should not be limited to building their institutional capacities alone. Especially in fragile contexts, the access to longterm, sustainable finance for such organizations is a critical requirement, and linkages with financial institutions a necessity. This is not only necessary for making upfront payments to farmers for procuring produce, but also includes buying equipment and maintaining adequate levels of working capital. IFADsupported interventions should strengthen the institutional and financial capacities of smallholder farmers, with a focus on strengthening their market powe	provided through Farmer Field Schools. The Multi Stakeholder Platforms implemented by AVDP are also a critical point of capacity building and building strong value chain networks.	
Sierra Leone	WCA	PPE	2	CTRY	OPER	YTH	In concert with awareness-raising and representation, aim for effective participation of youth and women through specific strategies and needs assessment at the design phase of projects. The marginalization of women and youth is exacerbated in fragile contexts, including in countries with episodes of lengthy civil wars. In such situations, projects should move away from aiming for their mere participation, through outreach percentages or outputs, and awarenessraising to ensuring that women and youth are structurally mainstreamed and that the activities are suitable for them. This should start early, from the design phase, ideally through a needs assessment plan. In the case of women, a logical and more effective approach would be to start with awareness-raising early in the project (through systems such as GALS), followed by a move to	The GALS HH methodology is a key element of the AVDP, and is reflected in the gender strategy and action plan.	0

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	2021 Follow up	Status
							empowerment, through well-directed activities.		
Sierra Leone	WCA	PPE	3	CTRY	OPER	SUS	In fragile contexts, make exit strategies a central part of project designs and monitor following the strategies during implementation. Fragile contexts as in Sierra Leone, which often come with low institutional capacities and budgets, have an adverse effect on the sustainability of benefits that flow from IFAD-supported projects. Sustainability of infrastructure is a prime example of an activity that requires funds for regular maintenance. In this regard, adequate attention is to be paid at the design stage through a well-designed and detailed exit strategy. One such strategy can be to formalize activities and responsibilities through memorandums of understanding to ensure that all stakeholders know and execute their roles after the project's end. Other such avenues are partnerships with other development partners or scaling up the activities to ensure sustainability. During implementation, adherence to the planned responsibilities and the likelihood and feasibility of future handover need to be checked and agreed at regular intervals, and changes to the strategy should be made if so required.	Through the planned Multi Stakeholder Platforms, and the capacity building activities, the key messages of sustainability and ownership are incorporated. Project MoUs and MoAs with partner organisations and documentation with ABCs will be checked for clarity on roles and responsibilities, and accountability channels.	O
Sierra Leone	WCA	PPE	4	CTRY	OPER	CCA	Where adaptation to climate change is specifically pursued, treat it as an intrinsic part of the project design and not merely as an accessory. In some countries, such as Sierra Leone, climate change is an issue that is too important to be covered merely by a relatively small component introduced at a later stage of the project. Climate change adaptation should be an intrinsic part from the design phase, designed in such a way so as to blend in with or be of	Adaptation Fund activities are fully integrated/blended in the AVDP project activities. An MoU with the Environment Protection Agency (EPA) for implementation of specific activities and technical backstopping to the project on implementation of some relevant activities is also ongoing and aimed at strengthening the end results.	O

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	2021 Follow up	Status
							consequence to other project activities and appropriately costed. It should form part of the project's theory of change. Moreover, in concert with awareness, the focus should be equally on measures for adaptation and mitigation.		

Historic Follow up: Corporate Level Evaluations

Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	2017 Follow up	2019 Follow Up	2021 Follow Up	Status
Corporate Level Evaluation on Replenishments									
CLE	2	IFAD	STR	REPL	Voice, representation and governance merits further study. The implication of the fact that participation and contribution is delinked merits further thought and study both in terms of financial incentives, visibility, burden-sharing and perceived influence. Gaining insights into this complex field would be highly beneficial to PRM, who should conduct or commission the study.	Voice, representation and governance arrangements are major focus of the Ad Hoc Working Group on Governance Issues. The Working Group has prepared a report with its recommendations and presented to the Governing Council in February 2017. Furthermore, typical composition for IFAD replenishment Consultation has been as follows: all Member States from Lists A and B and 18 Member States from List C, the latter to be appointed by the members of List C and communicated to the President. The Governing Council Resolution on IFAD11 in February 2017 was revised to reflect the Working Group on Governance (WGG) recommendation on representation of List C in Replenishment Consultations. The WCG report, which was considered at the GC meeting, recommended that List A and B cede four seats in the Consultation to List C. As a result the number of List C members participating in the Consultation will raise from 18 to 22, keeping the total number of participating members at 55.	As agreed in GC 194/XL, an assessment of the number of Board seats in light of any transfers that have taken place and the evolving voting power of each list will be prepared and provided to the Membership for review prior to the beginning of the IFAD12 Consultation sessions. This assessment will be undertaken during 2019, alongside consideration of the implications for the composition of the IFAD12 Consultation and achievement of the objectives of the consultation.	For IFAD12, the Governing Council determined that the Consultation would be composed of 57 countries: 25 List A Member States, 10 List B Member States, 22 List C Member States. So rather than List C getting 18 seats, and benefitting from seats "ceded" by other Lists as was the case in IFAD11, List C representation was set at 22 seats from the outset. This meant that the principle that all List A and all List B members were automatically eligible for a seat in the Consultation came to an end. This further strengthens List C voice and representation, and places more onus on List A and List B Members to individually justify their participation in the Consultations. With regard to the follow-up on GC 194/XL, an assessment of the impact of transfers between Lists on representation in the Executive Board was prepared and submitted to the Governing Council (GC-43-L4) and concluding that the transfers between Lists had limited impact on List voting rights and no impact on the number of Board seats allocated to each List. This recommendation is now considered Fully Followed Up. With regard to broader discussions on voice, representation and governance, Management is now exploring	F

Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	2017 Follow up	2019 Follow Up	2021 Follow Up	Status
								opportunities to strengthen engagement with civil society organizations including farmer organizations and indigenous peoples' groups, particularly with regard to the ASAP+ and PSFP.	
CLE	7	IFAD	STR	REPL	As in the past, due efforts, resources and energies must continue to be attributed to mobilize resources through replenishment process that are not earmarked, as these are the most useful type of funds to fulfil IFAD's mandate. While it is critical for IFAD to mobilize additional resources, such resources must be provided so that: they finance activities squarely within IFAD's strategic framework; the governing bodies are able to fulfil their supervisory role vis a vis these resources; they are of a minimum quality, i.e. preferably untied and un-earmarked and subject to IFAD's standard administrative arrangements, rather than requiring burdensome special treatment; and, most important of all, they must be truly additional crowding in new resources, and not displacing regular resources. IFAD Management and Member States should explore what flexibility with respect to existing administrative, legal and governance requirements may be necessary and tolerable to	Following the approval of IFAD's Sovereign Borrowing Framework in 2015 further borrowing has been sought and a borrowing agreement with the Agence Française de Développement for EUR 200 million has been approved by the Board in April 2017. IFAD11 foresees to accept core contributions, DSF compensation contributions and possibly unrestricted complementary contributions. In addition Management will propose the introduction of concessional partner loans made by Member States (the grant element thereof). These contributions will be discussed at the second and third Consultation sessions.	IFAD has continued to focus on mobilizing untied, unearmarked, and truly additional resources. Concessional partner loans were introduced in the IFAD11 Consultation, following approval of the Concessional Partner Loan Framework at a Special Session of the Executive Board in October 2017. The Framework included additionality criteria, and prevented earmarking by ensuring CPL resources are allocated through the PBAS. Article 5, Section 5 of the Agreement Establishing IFAD was then amended (201/XLI) to establish the grant element of a CPL as a form of contribution for the purpose of receiving contribution votes. Furthermore under Resolution 204/XLI the Governing Council has requested that the President take all necessary steps to initiate the process leading to a decision on whether to proceed with market borrowing. The IFAD12 consultation will consider progress and decide upon the Fund's readiness to proceed with, and the appropriateness of undertaking, market borrowing, with its	During IFAD12 earmarking of replenishment contributions was further reduced by restricting the types of contributions accepted as replenishment contributions to forms of financing that are entirely unearmarked – core contributions, CPLs and early encashment credits. UCCs and separate DSF contributions were discontinued. ASAP+ and PSFP contributions were encouraged, but will be accepted as supplementary funds (not "additional contributions"). They have clear governance mechanisms embedded in IFAD's existing structures, and they do not count towards the replenishment contributions or PoLG targets, and do not generate voting rights. In line with the recommendation the aim of these funds is to crowd-in new resources earmarked for climate / private sector activities respectively which could not have been provided as replenishment contributions, and to target a broader range of donors, beyond Member States. This provides additional assurance that they will not displace regular resources. In addition the IBF has been approved which broadens the range of borrowing tools available to IFAD helping to mobilize more un-earmarked financing from a wider range of	F

Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	2017 Follow up	2019 Follow Up	2021 Follow Up	Status
					secure an appropriate level and type of additional financing.		conclusions being included in the final replenishment report that will be submitted to the Governing Council in February 2021 for endorsement.	sources. This recommendation is now considered Fully Followed Up.	
Corporate Level Evaluation: PBAS (2016)									
CLE	11	IFAD	PLCY	ALL	And finally, efforts need are needed to ensure a better spread of the total annual commitments across the three years of any allocation cycle. This will require tightening forward planning processes, in particular by ensuring better linkages among project pipeline development, country allocations and administrative budget earmarking.	Undertaking reallocations earlier in the cycle, as per the response above, will facilitate the spread of commitments across the three years as per this recommendation.	Management developed a methodology for undertaking reallocations earlier in the cycle. The methodology was discussed with and agreed upon by Senior Management. Moreover, all four reallocations undertaken in IFAD10 were cleared by EMC. The EB was also informed on the methodology, rationale and result of reallocations through the Progress report on the implementation of the PBAS submitted to the EB every December session.	In the course of IFAD11 IFAD Management has tightened both pipeline and reallocations management to ensure that both forward planning and any required measures to address unexpected fallouts are targeted through reallocations. Managements reports to Senior Management on forward pipeline planning on a regular basis. Reallocations take place whenever funds become available. As per usual practice, Management will report to the EB on the use of PBAS resources in IFAD11 through the Progress Report on the pBAS that is shared with the EB at a every December session. In addition, in line with IFAD11 commitments, Management will also report on the share of resources reallocated.	F
Corporate-Level Evaluation: IFAD's financial architecture									
CLE	4	IFAD	PLCY	ALL	Revise the financial allocation system. If IFAD substantially increases its leverage through borrowing, it will need to onlend the proceeds for ordinary loans to avoid incurring losses. The current PBAS constrains IFAD's ability to increase ordinary lending relative to other types of lending.		Discussions are continuing internally in the context of the IFAD2.0 with additional borrowed resources and we look forward to external feedback in the May 2019 EB retreat. FOD and OPR are also exploring revisions to the current PBAS to assess whether it is feasible and desirable to integrate a debt component into the	In 2021, the EB has approved [EB 2021/132/R.9/Rev.1] the creation of the Borrowed Resources Access Mechanism (BRAM), a risk-based mechanism which will govern access to borrowed resources. The five principles for the implementation of the BRAM are as follows: (a) country selectivity and eligibility ¹ ; (b) supply of borrowed resources; (c) risk-	F

Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	2017 Follow up	2019 Follow Up	2021 Follow Up	Status
					Thus, IFAD would need to create a second lending window for ordinary loans, to be allocated through a risk-based system.		methodology which recognises the debt status of countries and/ or a financial ceiling to the total grants provided by IFAD in a given replenishment cycle	<p>based country limits; (d) differentiated financing conditions; and (e) demand-based access.</p> <p>In IFAD12, the PBAS will only allocate core resources to LICs and LMICs; it is through BRAM that countries will access most of ordinary lending during the IFAD12 period. Through the creation of BRAM, IFAD will ensure that financial considerations relevant for the prudent use of borrowed resources are accounted for (e.g. credit risk mitigated by the introduction of risk-based country limits etc.). The BRAM will become effective once the relative amendments to the Policies and Criteria for IFAD Financing have entered into force (following approval by the Governing Council in February 2022).</p> <p>1 (a) Strategic Focus – a valid country strategy (COSOP or country strategy note) is available early in the cycle; (b) Ownership - no approved projects are pending signature for more than 12 months; (c) Absorptive Capacity - all projects in a country that have been effective for more than one year must have disbursed funds at least once in last 18 months; and (d) Level of indebtedness – as assessed by FMD.</p>	
CLE	5	IFAD	PLCY	FA	Conduct preparatory work for potential access to capital markets. IFAD needs to review the requirements to obtain a high credit rating, which are likely to include reducing the uncertainty linked to future DSF compensation.		Per the GC resolution on market borrowing, FOD is in progress to conduct preparatory work in relation to the potential access to capital markets. Key policies and processes have been introduced in 2018 and will continue in 2019 from all areas of FOD, with specific	In preparation of the credit rating process started in 2019, IFAD introduced several financial reforms to strengthen its financial architecture. These included fully staffing a Risk Management Office with five key professional positions as well as introducing several financial policies to ensure the optimal	F

Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	2017 Follow up	2019 Follow Up	2021 Follow Up	Status
							<p>focus on risk management and treasury, also in preparation for the envisioned credit rating process. Key positions are being filled both in the revamped Risk Management Unit, Treasury and Controller's Divisions. Many of these new initiatives, policies and processes are also in line with recommendations made by the independent financial risk assessment performed by Alvarez & Marsal, approved by the Board. The DSF mechanism resolution is in progress and is being presented for review at the EB in May 2019. FOD has also initiated a project in coordination with ICT to enhance FOD's IT Landscape to meet current and future operational needs for Treasury, Accounting and Risk Management. Key systems will be implemented in the course of 2019 and 2020. FOD is in the process of preparing for an informal private credit rating assessment to take place in the second half of 2019, in advance of the formal credit rating exercise envisioned in 2020.</p>	<p>level of operational planning vis a vis financial capacity. The main policies, all approved by the Executive Board, are: the DSF Reform, the Sustainable Replenishment Baseline, the ALM Framework, the Capital Adequacy Policy, the Liquidity Policy, the Integrated Borrowing Framework and the new RAC Methodology. The key metrics approved as part of the policies, like the Deployable Capital, the Minimum Liquidity Requirement and the financial ratios are reported periodically to the EB. This transformation underpinned the success of the credit rating process that culminated in two AA+ ratings from Fitch (November 2020) and S&P (December2020).</p>	
CLE	6	IFAD	PLCY	FA	Use hedging instruments to manage foreign exchange risks. IFAD is exposed to foreign exchange risks for the following reasons:(i) most of its loans are denominated in SDR; (ii) some replenishment pledges are denominated in		TRE is currently employing hedging strategies to manage foreign exchange risk to the extent possible for its existing SDR loans. Additionally, IFAD is progressively increasing USD and EUR denominated loans to naturally hedge the balance sheet towards those	The ALM framework presented to the EB in 2019 guides IFAD's overall foreign exchange risk management. In recent years, loans financed by borrowed funds in EUR and USD, have predominantly been denominated in USD and EUR, with the aim of reducing IFAD's	O

Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	2017 Follow up	2019 Follow Up	2021 Follow Up	Status
					currencies other than United States dollars; and (iii) some operational expenses are not denominated in United States dollars. Other DFIs use hedging instruments and IFAD could learn from their practices.		SDR currencies. An updated Asset Liability Management framework will be presented in collaboration between Treasury and the Risk Management Unit in the second half of 2019 to further address asset/liability, currency and interest rate mismatches.	currency exposure. In line with the ALM framework, IFAD is currently using hedging instruments to manage foreign exchange risks. Furthermore, regular updates about IFAD's ALM-related activities are presented to the EB.	