

Document: EB 2011/102/R.47/Rev.1
Agenda: 5(c)
Date: 11 May 2011 **E**
Distribution: Public
Original: English



Enabling poor rural people
to overcome poverty

Terms of Reference and Rules of Procedure of the Evaluation Committee of the Executive Board

Note to Executive Board representatives

Focal points:

Technical questions:

Rutsel Martha
General Counsel
Tel.: +39 06 5459 2457
e-mail: r.martha@ifad.org

Dispatch of documentation:

Deirdre McGrenra
Governing Bodies Officer
Tel.: +39 06 5459 2374
e-mail: gb_office@ifad.org

Executive Board — 102nd Session
Rome, 10-12 May 2011

For: Approval

Recommendation for approval

The Executive Board is requested to examine the draft Terms of Reference and Rules of Procedure of the Evaluation Committee, take note of the transmittal notes (attachment I), and adopt the Terms of Reference and Rules of Procedure.

Terms of Reference and Rules of Procedure of the Evaluation Committee of the Executive Board

I. Introductory note

1. The Evaluation Committee has undertaken a review of its Terms of Reference and Rules of Procedures. In order to assure a uniform procedure for the different committees of the Executive Board, the general rules of procedures hereby proposed have been structured along the lines of those prevailing for the Audit Committee. Accordingly, the first two sections contain common provisions concerning the establishment and composition (section 1), the role and the conduct of business (section 2), and their relationship with the Rules and Procedures of the Executive Board (section 4). Most of the distinctive features relate to the responsibilities and are set forth in section 3.
2. After extensive review and due diligence process, the Committee reached consensus on the text of the draft Terms of Reference and Rules of Procedure of the Evaluation Committee at its sixty-seventh meeting. The final version is hereby presented and recommended for approval by the Executive Board. The current Terms of Reference and Rules of Procedure are set out as attachments II and III respectively for comparison purpose.

II. Terms of Reference and Rules of Procedure of the Evaluation Committee

1. Establishment and composition
 - 1.1. The Executive Board, acting under rule 11 of the Rules of Procedures of the Executive Board, hereby establishes the Evaluation Committee.
 - 1.2. The Evaluation Committee shall be composed of nine Executive Board members or alternate members appointed by the President pursuant to rule 11 of the Rules of Procedures of the Executive Board, as follows: four members from list A, two members from list B and three members from list C. The term of office of the Evaluation Committee shall be three years.
 - 1.3. The Committee shall elect its chairperson from list B and C Committee members. In the absence of the chairperson during a schedule meeting of the Committee, the Chair shall be temporarily assumed by another member from list B and C selected by the Committee.
 - 1.4. The Secretary of the Fund serves as the Secretary of the Committee. The Director of the IFAD Office of Evaluation¹ (hereafter referred to as the "Office") serves in a technical support function.
2. Role and conduct of business
 - 2.1. As a subsidiary body of the Executive Board, the role of the Evaluation Committee is to assist the Executive Board in discharging its responsibilities

¹ To reflect the role of IFAD's Office of Evaluation and to be consistent with the nomenclature used in other IFIs, the revised IFAD Evaluation Policy states that the Office will henceforth be called the "Independent Office of Evaluation".

with regard to the evaluation functions in the Fund for which the Executive Board is responsible under the Agreement Establishing IFAD.

- 2.2. The quorum for any meeting of the Evaluation Committee shall be constituted when representatives of a majority of its members are present.
 - 2.3. The Evaluation Committee shall not vote but shall set out the views expressed by its members in the reports it submits to the Executive Board. Notwithstanding the foregoing, the chairperson shall attempt to secure consensus in order to present in its reports to the Board, as far as possible, the unanimous views of the Evaluation Committee. In the absence of consensus, the minority views and opinions shall be reflected in the reports.
 - 2.4. The evaluation Committee shall hold regular meetings. The date of each meeting shall be determined by the Committee at each preceding meeting, unless otherwise decided by the Committee. Meetings can also be convened by the chairperson at any other time required. Notwithstanding rule 3² of the Rules of Procedure of the Executive Board, the Evaluation Committee may undertake field visits organized by IFAD; Executive Board members, not members of the Evaluation Committee, may also take part in said field visits.
 - 2.5. The official record of the discussion and recommendations adopted during Evaluation Committee meetings shall be the Evaluation Committee minutes. The minutes shall be approved by all participating members and may be submitted to the Executive Board. The chairperson will report to the Board on the deliberation of Evaluation Committee meetings.
 - 2.6. The meetings of the Evaluation Committee shall be open to the Director of the Office and such staff members of the Fund as the President may, from time to time, designate, as well as other staff of the Office when its Director decides that they should attend as resource persons, except in relation to the matters foreseen in paragraph 3.1(k) below.
 - 2.7. Executive Board members who are not members of the Evaluation Committee may also, as observers, attend meetings except when matters foreseen in paragraph 3.1(k) below are discussed.
 - 2.8. In line with IFAD disclosure policy, the Evaluation Committee's minutes and its reports will be disclosed to the public through the IFAD website.
3. Responsibilities
- 3.1. The Executive Board may refer to the Evaluation Committee any question related to the evaluation functions in the Fund, for which the Executive Board is responsible under the Agreement Establishing IFAD. In addition, the Evaluation Committee should have the following permanent responsibilities:
 - (a) Ensure the full implementation of and compliance with the IFAD Evaluation Policy, whose overarching objective is the assessment of IFAD's results and impact in order to improve the Fund's operations and policies, by reporting and making recommendations to the Executive Board;
 - (b) Contribute to IFAD's learning loop by reporting and making recommendations to the Executive Board on the evaluations it considers;
 - (c) Every year, review and report on the Office's annual work programme and draft budget;

² Place of Sessions – All sessions of the Board shall be held at the seat of the Fund, except for sessions held in conjunction with a session of the Governing Council held elsewhere.

- (d) Every year, review and report on the Annual Report on Results and Impact of IFAD Operations and the Management's comments on this report;
- (e) Every year, review and report on the President's Report on the Implementation Status of Evaluation Recommendations and Management Actions, together with the Office's comments on the same subject;
- (f) Discuss and report on the draft approach paper for corporate level evaluations;
- (g) Discuss and report on all the Office's corporate-level evaluations and related Management's comments;
- (h) Select, discuss and report on country programme, thematic and project evaluation reports, together with IFAD Management's response to the evaluation reports;
- (i) Discuss and report on the following reports, including the Office's related comments, prior to their consideration by the Executive Board:
 - (i) The Report on IFAD's Development Effectiveness,
 - (ii) Any possible future revision made by the Management to the Results and Impact Management System;
- (j) Review and report on those draft operational policies and strategy proposals stemming from evaluations conducted, including the Office's comments and Management's responses on the proposals, before they are considered by the Executive Board. This review will focus on the internalization of evaluation-based lessons and recommendations;
- (k) In accordance with the IFAD Evaluation Policy, assist the Executive Board in the selection, appointment, performance review and termination of the Director of the Office; and
- (l) Recommend the revision of the Evaluation Policy when needed.

4. Final provision

4.1. The Terms of Reference and Rules of Procedure of the Evaluation Committee of the Executive Board contained in document EB 2004/83/R.7/Rev.1 are hereby voided and superseded by the Terms and Reference and Rules of Procedure of the Evaluation Committee of the Executive Board as set out in this document. In conformity with rule 11.3 of the Rules of Procedure of the Executive Board and with exception of rule 25 and 29 of the same, unless otherwise determined in the present Terms of Reference, the said Rules of Procedure of the Executive Board should apply, mutatis mutandis, to the proceedings of the Evaluation Committee.

Transmittal notes to the Executive Board

1. **Scope of the Terms of Reference (TORs)**

The Executive Board's power to set up subsidiary bodies is regulated in rule 11 of the Rules of Procedure of the Executive Board. According to rule 11.3 the Rules of Procedure of the Executive Board apply to these subsidiary bodies unless it is decided otherwise. Accordingly, the addressee of the TORs is therefore the Evaluation Committee. The TORs cannot regulate the conduct of other bodies of the Fund. This explains why the draft does not contain directives to other bodies of the Fund (i.e. Governing Council and President).
2. **Composition**

Paragraph 1.2 of the draft TORs codifies the current practice as reflected in the Rules of Procedure of the Evaluation Committee contained in document EB 2004/83/R.7/Rev.1, which provides that the Evaluation Committee shall be composed of nine Executive Board members or alternate members appointed by the President in pursuant to rule 11 of the Rules of Procedure of the Executive Board in accordance with the following: four members from List A, two members from List B and three members from List C.
3. **Term of office**

The term of office of the Evaluation Committee members shall be three years. The term of office should be aligned with the one of the Executive Board, in order to assure that all members of the Committee are also members of the Executive Board, as required by rule 11 of the Rules of Procedure of the Executive Board.
4. **Selection criteria**

The second sentence of rule 11.1 of the Rules of Procedure of the Executive Board provides that the President shall appoint the members of subsidiary bodies, with the approval of the Executive Board. In appointing the members of the Evaluation Committee to be approved by the Executive Board, the President may not prescribe any criteria or conditions, because neither the Agreement Establishing IFAD nor the Rules of Procedure of the Executive Board prescribe anything with regard to any code of conduct or professional qualification for membership in any of the governing bodies. Accordingly, the general principle enshrined in the 1975 Vienna Convention on the Representation of States in their Relations with International Organizations of a Universal Character, i.e. the freedom of the sending State in the composition of its delegations to the organs of the organization, applies.
5. **Chairperson**

As prescribed by rule 14.2 of the Rules of Procedure of the Executive Board, paragraph 1.3 of the draft TORs envisages that the Committee shall elect its own chairperson. The chosen wording allows continuation of the practice that the Committee shall elect its chairperson from List B and C Committee members if it is so wished. If that practice is continued, in the absence of the chairperson during a scheduled meeting of the Committee the Chair will be temporarily assumed by another member selected by the Committee.
6. **Nature of the Evaluation Committee**

Paragraph 2.1 reflects the fact that by virtue of rule 11 of the Rules of Procedure of the Executive Board, the Evaluation Committee is a functional body, which is also referred to as a preparatory body. That means that it acts exclusively in the preparation of decisions in a given field by the Executive Board and does not itself exercise decisional authority. For that reason, rule 11.2 of the Rules of Procedure of the Executive Board provides that the subcommittees and other subsidiary bodies of the Executive Board "shall not vote but shall submit reports setting out the different views expressed in the body." For the sake of clarity this is restated in paragraph 2.3 of the draft TORs.

The preparatory nature of the Evaluation Committee also has implications for the scheduling of its sessions. It is therefore expected to meet regularly, but is left free to time those meetings (paragraph 2.4). It has been the practice of the Evaluation Committee to meet before each regular session of the Executive Board. There is no compelling reason to make that mandatory.

7. Default position regarding the applicable rules of procedure
In conformity with rule 11.3 of the Rules of Procedure of the Executive Board, unless otherwise determined in the TORs, the said Rules of Procedure of the Executive Board shall apply, *mutatis mutandis*, to the proceedings of the Evaluation Committee.
8. Meetings
Although paragraph 2.4 is articulated in a different way than in the current text, it is not the intention for the Committee to change its practice to set the dates of its meetings in the last session each year.
9. Attendance at Evaluation Committee meetings
As a consequence of the default position regarding the applicable rules of procedure, it follows from rule 8 of the Rules of Procedure of the Executive Board that the sessions of the Evaluation Committee shall be open to such staff members of the Fund as the President may, from time to time, designate for that purpose, as well as other staff of the IFAD Office of Evaluation (IOE) designated by its Director to attend as resource persons, except for meetings concerning the selection, appointment, performance review and termination of the Director of IOE.
10. Responsibilities
Based on rule 11.1 of the Rules of Procedure of the Executive Board, it is the Executive Board that defines the scope of the responsibilities of the Evaluation Committee. Being a subsidiary body of the Executive Board, it can only be tasked with matters that are within the competence of the Executive Board. With respect to evaluation matters the Board is *inter alia* empowered to:
 - (a) Oversee IFAD's independent evaluation and assess the overall quality and impact of IFAD programmes and projects as documented in evaluation reports;
 - (b) Approve policies aimed at enhancing the independence and effectiveness of the evaluation function;
 - (c) Receive directly from IOE all evaluation reports, including the Annual Report on Results and Impact of IFAD Operations;
 - (d) Endorse the appointment and removal of the IOE Director; and
 - (e) Approve the IOE's annual work programme and recommend to the Governing Council the approval of IOE's budget.

Paragraph 3.1 of the draft TORs reflects the above and articulates the framework of reference for the Evaluation Committee, by stating that its tasks relate to evaluation function in the Fund for which the Executive Board is responsible under the Agreement Establishing IFAD.

The subsequent subparagraphs of paragraph 3 detail this general role of the Evaluation Committee by listing its specific and permanent tasks. Those tasks correspond to the responsibilities attributed to the Committee in the revised IFAD Evaluation Policy.

Current Terms of Reference of the Evaluation Committee

Terms of reference

Mandate

The Executive Board has established the Evaluation Committee to enhance and fortify its role in operations evaluation. It relies on the Evaluation Committee to provide it with advice on matters related to IFAD's independent and self-evaluation activities as well as selected operation policy documents. Recognizing that the Evaluation Committee is an advisory body, the Committee will make recommendations on evaluation matters as part of its reporting to the Executive Board.

Objectives

In order to assist the Executive Board in discharging its oversight function, the Committee has the following main objectives:

- (i) to ensure the full implementation of and compliance with the IFAD Evaluation Policy, whose overarching objective is the assessment of IFAD's results and impact in order to improve the Fund's operations and policies;
- (ii) to satisfy itself that the formulation and implementation of OE's annual work programme and budget are in line with the Evaluation Policy;
- (iii) to satisfy itself that OE's independent work and IFAD's self-evaluation activities, embodied in two management reports (the Progress Report on the Project Portfolio and any further revisions to the Results and Impact Management System), are relevant and carried out effectively and efficiently; and
- (iv) to contribute to IFAD's learning loop by reporting and making recommendations to the Board on the independent evaluations it considers and on the two management reports mentioned in the previous bullet point, as well as on any operation policies it decides to review.

Scope of Work

The Committee will undertake the following activities:

- (i) Review on a standing basis the OE annual work programme and budget, the Annual Report on the Results and Impact of IFAD Operations, and the Report of the President on the Status of Implementation of Evaluation Recommendations, together with the OE report on the same subject;
- (ii) Discuss all OE corporate-level evaluations and selected country programme, thematic and project evaluation reports together with their ACPs, and management's comments on the respective reports;
- (iii) Discuss the following reports, including OE's comments on same, prior to their consideration by the Executive Board: (a) the Progress Report on the Project Portfolio; and (b) any possible future revision made by management to the Results and Impact Management System
- (iv) Review operation policy proposals arising from evaluation lessons and recommendations, including OE's comments on the proposals, before they are considered by the Executive Board. This review will focus on the internalization of evaluation-based lessons and recommendations; and
- (v) Undertake collectively field visits, as and when appropriate, to observe key evaluation activities, which will assist the Evaluation Committee in conducting its duties more efficiently and effectively.

With regard to each of the above tasks, the Committee will convey its findings, and provide a summary of the key issues and recommendations to the Board for the latter's consideration.

Current Rules of Procedure of the Evaluation Committee

Rules of Procedure

The Rules of Procedure of the Executive Board shall apply, *mutatis mutandis*, to the proceedings of the Evaluation Committee, except as specified below:

Rule 1: Convening, Timing and Length of Meeting. The Evaluation Committee will hold four sessions in each calendar year. One meeting will be held before each of the (three) sessions of the Executive Board. Another meeting will be held in October with the specific objective of discussing the annual OE work programme and budget. If required, additional special sessions may also be called on an ad hoc basis by the Chairperson of the Committee at any time in the year. The exact dates and length of each meeting in the subsequent year will be fixed during the Evaluation Committee's annual December session.

Rule 2: Notification of Sessions and Agenda. The IFAD Secretariat shall inform each Committee member of the date and place of a session thirty days in advance. During its December session, the Evaluation Committee shall draw up a tentative agenda for all sessions in the subsequent year, taking into consideration the various standing items the Committee must discuss. For this purpose, the Office of Evaluation shall provide the Committee with a proposal for the agenda of its sessions. The Committee retains the prerogative to revise by adding, deleting, defining or amending items on the agenda during the course of the year. The agenda shall be communicated by the Secretariat to all Evaluation Committee members along with the notification of sessions. A notification of each Committee session, together with the agenda, will be sent by the IFAD Secretariat for information to all other Executive Board directors not members of the Evaluation Committee.

Rule 3: Membership and Terms of Office. The composition of the Evaluation Committee shall consist of nine Executive Board members or alternate members: four members from List A, two from List B and three from List C. The term of office of the Evaluation Committee shall be three years and coincide with the term of office of the Executive Board.

Rule 4: Quorum. The quorum for any meeting of the Evaluation Committee shall be constituted by five members.

Rule 5: Chairperson. The Committee will elect its Chairperson from its List B and C Committee members. In the absence of the Chairperson during a scheduled meeting or field visit of the Committee, the Chair shall be temporarily assumed by another member selected by the Committee.

Rule 6: Decisions. The Committee shall make every effort to arrive at decisions by consensus. Where such efforts have been exhausted, the Chairperson's rulings shall stand when supported by four other members.

Rule 7: Attendance at Meetings and Field Visits. In addition to Evaluation Committee members and the Director of the Office of Evaluation, the said Director may designate members of his staff to participate in the deliberations of the Committee. A representative of IFAD management will take part in all Evaluation Committee sessions. Other IFAD staff members may be required to attend Committee meetings and to provide, pursuant to the Committee's request, such information and clarifications as may be required in carrying out the Committee's responsibilities. The Evaluation Committee members will participate as observers in any field visit organized by OE. Other Executive Board members not members of the Evaluation Committee may also attend Committee meetings as observers and participate in field visits.

Rule 8: Documentation and Reports. In line with IFAD's disclosure policy, all reports and documents presented to the Evaluation Committee will be disclosed to the public. The key issues and recommendations of the Committee shall be recorded in a report, which the Chairperson shall prepare after each session and submit for approval to the Executive Board (see Rule 9). This document, too, will be disclosed to the public through the IFAD website. In consultation with ES, OE shall prepare minutes after each Evaluation Committee session and send them in draft form to all participants for their clearance before finalization.

Rule 9: Reporting to the Executive Board. The Committee Chairperson shall provide a written report of its deliberations to the Executive Board after each Evaluation Committee session. The reports will be focused and issues-oriented, and identify the most relevant issues and recommendations for the Board's information and approval, as required. This report should be translated into IFAD's official languages and dispatched to Board members as early as possible for their timely review, ahead of the relevant Executive Board session. The Chairperson may, in addition, provide an oral report during each Board session, as and when s/he considers necessary.