Document: EB 2008/93/R.30/Rev.1

Agenda: 12(c)

Date: 25 April 2008

Distribution: Public

Original: English



Lifting of Restriction of Executive Board papers EB 2000/70/R.9 and EB 2000/70/R.27 in line with IFAD Policy on the Disclosure of Documents

Executive Board — Ninety-third Session Rome, 24-25 April 2008

For: Approval

Note to Executive Board Directors

This document is submitted for approval by the Executive Board.

To make the best use of time available at Executive Board sessions, Directors are invited to contact the following focal point with any technical questions about this document before the session:

Theo van Banning

Executive Board Director for the Netherlands

Convenor of List A

telephone: +39 06 574 0305

e-mail: theo-van.banning@minbuza.nl

Elizabeth Nasskau

Executive Board Director for the United Kingdom

Co-Convenor of List A

telephone: +39 06 684 0091 e-mail: <u>e-nasskau@dfid.gov.uk</u>

Queries regarding the dispatch of documentation for this session should be addressed to:

Deirdre McGrenra

Governing Bodies Officer telephone: +39 06 5459 2374 e-mail: d.mcgrenra@ifad.org

Recommendation for approval

The Executive Board is invited to lift the restriction on the papers attached: EB 2000/70/R.9 and EB 2000/70/R.27.

Lifting of Restriction of Executive Board papers EB 2000/70/R.9 and EB 2000/70/R.27 in line with IFAD Policy on the Disclosure of Documents

- 1. In the year prior to the election of the President of IFAD at the Governing Council in February 2001, membership representatives considered the subject of the appointment of the President.
- 2. At its Seventieth Session in September 2000, the Executive Board discussed two documents.
- 3. The first, EB 2000/70/R.9 "Appointment of the President", proposed, inter alia, recommendations on a process to meet nominated candidates prior to the Governing Council taking a decision on the appointment. It also provided information from a number of organisations regarding procedures in nominating and electing executive heads.
- 4. The second, EB 2000/70/R.27 "Appointment of the President", was a personal proposal of the Chairperson of the Governing Council. This proposed, inter alia, to extend the term of the then-incumbent President of IFAD to allow for a smooth handover of the office of the President. It also included draft terms of reference for the office of the President of IFAD for consideration by the Executive Board.
- 5. Further consultation took place and in December 2000 at the Seventy-First Session of the Executive Board, a further paper by the Convenors of IFAD's Lists was considered (EB 2000/71/R.36/Rev.1). This established a transitional period for handover to the newly appointed President. This paper is available on the IFAD web site with all other Board documents from that Session.
- 6. The first two documents (EB 2000/70/R.9 and EB 2000/70/R.27), however, are currently restricted to the Executive Board. In order to lift the restriction, the Secretary of IFAD has explained that permission should be sought from the Board.
- 7. On behalf of List A, we would like to propose that the Board lift the restriction on these documents. This would be in line with IFAD's disclosure policy.
- 8. List A would like to underline that we are not seeking a resolution for approval but simply agreement to make these past papers available for transparency, allowing all members to have access.
- 9. For ease of reference, the papers are attached as annexes.

Annex I EB 2008/93/R.30/Rev.1

Distribution: Restricted EB 2000/70/R.9 26 July 2000

Original: English Agenda Item 5 English



IFAD

INTERNATIONAL FUND FOR AGRICULTURAL DEVELOPMENT

Executive Board - Seventieth Session

Rome, 13-14 September 2000

APPOINTMENT OF THE PRESIDENT

- 1. The term of office of the current President of IFAD, Mr Fawzi H. Al-Sultan, will expire on 20 February 2001. Article 6, Section 8(a), of the Agreement Establishing IFAD stipulates, *inter alia*, that "The Governing Council shall appoint the President by a two-thirds majority of the total number of votes. He shall be appointed for a term of four years and shall be eligible for re-appointment for only one further term."
- 2. The only other procedures for the appointment of the President of IFAD contained in the basic legal texts of the Fund are set out in Section 6, paragraph 2, of the By-laws for the Conduct of the Business of IFAD, which reads as follows:
 - "When the term of office of the President is due to expire, the appointment of a President shall be placed on the agenda of the annual session of the Governing Council immediately preceding the expiry of the term of office; whenever, for other reasons, the office of President becomes vacant or a vacancy is due to occur, the Executive Board shall request that the Governing Council be convened in special session for the purpose of appointing the President. Members may submit nominations for the office of President to the Secretary of the Fund, along with a curriculum vitae. Except as the Bureau of the Council may decide otherwise, all nominations shall be submitted no less than 60 days before the opening of the session at which the appointment of the President is to be decided. The President shall communicate timely nominations to all Members and the Bureau no less than 40 days prior to the session of the Council."
- 3. Nominations must therefore be received by 22 December 2000 and communicated by the President to all Members and the Bureau of the Governing Council no later than 11 January 2001.
- 4. At the moment, there is no process whereby the nominated candidates are interviewed or their qualifications and experience assessed prior to the Governing Council taking a decision on the appointment. Article 6, Section 2(c), of the Agreement Establishing IFAD and Section 7 of the By-Laws for the Conduct of the Business of IFAD stipulate that decisions on the appointment and remuneration of the President cannot be delegated by the Governing Council. However, in order to examine the candidates, the Governing Council could, through a vote by correspondence, decide to establish a committee, composed of representatives of the three Lists, and authorize it to assess the candidates, their qualifications and experience on the basis of terms of reference describing the work/functions of the President. To assist in its work, the committee may set up a panel of

A INTERNATIONAL FUND FOR AGRICULTURAL DEVELOPMENT

independent, high-level experts, representative of the Fund's membership. The panel would carry out a technical review of the candidates, assess their qualifications and prepare a shortlist of candidates for the use of the committee in deciding on candidates to interview. On the basis of the technical assessment and the interviews, the committee would submit a report to the Twenty-Fourth Session of the Governing Council on recommendations it deems appropriate. The Council would then proceed with the appointment of the President with the benefit of the assessment and recommendations provided by the committee on the candidates.

5. Details on the practices of other organizations have been collected informally, and are attached as information and background.

Timing of the Assumption of Office

6. The practice throughout IFAD's history has been that the new President assumes office on the day after the expiry of the previous President's term of office. In the current case, that date would be 22 February 2001, the day after the end of the Twenty-Fourth Session of the Governing Council. Nothing in the basic legal texts precludes the Governing Council from establishing a later date than the one currently envisaged for the hand-over of authority, particularly in the light of Article 6, Section 8(b) of the Agreement Establishing IFAD which allows the Governing Council to extend the term of the President of IFAD by up to six months under special circumstances. That would allow sufficient time for a proper hand-over to be made, and for the new President to make arrangements of a personal and official nature and familiarize him/herself with IFAD. Any extension of the President's term of office and the hand-over date would call for the adoption of a resolution by the Governing Council.

Recommendation

- 7. The Executive Board is invited to consider both the proposals contained in the present document and the submission of a draft resolution to the Governing Council for adoption through a vote by correspondence, in accordance with Rule 39 of the Rules of Procedure of the Governing Council.
- 8. Should the Executive Board so agree, an appropriate draft resolution would be tabled during the current session of the Board. It is also anticipated that the Bureau of the Governing Council will review the matter, in consultation with the Convenors of IFAD's three Lists of Member States, and that the views of the Bureau thereon will be made available at the time of the Board session.

INTERNATIONAL FUND FOR AGRICULTURAL DEVELOPMENT

ATTACHMENT

EXECUTIVE HEAD NOMINATION PROCEDURES

- 1. IFAD informally obtained varying degrees of information from a number of organizations regarding the procedures followed by them in nominating and electing their executive heads. The most comprehensive information received was that from the **World Health Organization** (WHO), which appears to have the most specific terms of reference for its executive head and the most clearly elaborated selection procedures.
 - (a) In synthesis, the WHO terms of reference contain seven criteria. The prospective director-general should have:
 - (i) a strong technical and public health background and extensive experience in international health;
 - (ii) competency in organizational management;
 - (iii) a proven historical evidence for public health leadership;
 - (iv) sensitiveness to cultural, social and political differences;
 - (v) a strong commitment to the work of WHO;
 - (vi) the good physical condition required of all staff members of the Organization; and
 - (vii) sufficient skill in at least one of the official and working languages of the organization's Executive Board and Health Assembly.
 - (b) Interviews form part of WHO's pre-selection process, which proceeds as follows:
 - (i) At least six months before the date fixed for the opening of a session of the Executive Board at which a director-general is to be nominated, the Director-General of WHO informs Member States and members of the Board that they may propose persons for nomination by the Board for the post of director-general. Such proposals must reach WHO headquarters not less than two months before the date fixed for the opening of the Executive Board session.
 - (ii) The Executive Board should be provided with all relevant documentation on the proposed candidates, including their curriculum vitae, and participate in the initial screening; the Executive Board determines the shortlist of five candidates.
 - (iii) The Executive Board interviews shortlisted candidates. The duration of individual interviews is limited to one hour, divided equally between an oral presentation by the candidate and a question-and-answer period.
 - (iv) The Executive Board votes on the candidates. Its decision has always been final, as no Board nomination to the Assembly has ever been overturned.

ATTACHMENT

- (v) With regard to timing, the Executive Board session involved in the selection procedure meets in January, but the decision on the successful candidate is not official until the WHA meets the following May. The new incumbent takes up office at the end of the last term of his/her predecessor, which most recently occurred on 21 July.
- 2. IFAD has received information regarding the three organizations headquartered in Washington, D.C. Although it was not possible to obtain terms of reference for the President of the **World Bank**, it is well known that the President of the United States and the Treasury Department de facto nominate the executive head of that organization. The Executive Board of the World Bank subsequently reviews the merits and qualifications of the nominee.
- 3. The International Monetary Fund (IMF) has no terms of reference for its executive head, as they are determined on a case-by-case basis in informal negotiations. A new Managing Director was recently appointed following a very disputatious process, partly because the appointment process was/is not well defined. The Executive Board of the IMF agreed that the qualifications required should include 'leadership and the ability to manage a large institution'. It released a statement to the effect that all Member States, and not just those from Europe, were to be involved in selecting a new executive head. According to the Office of the Secretary of the IMF, the final decision is reached by consensus and there is no formal process for narrowing down the field of candidates; consequently, the timing of the process varies considerably. It is IFAD's understanding that, following the IMF's most recent experience, a group may be set up to review the appointment process.
- 4. The procedure followed by the **Inter-American Development Bank (IDB)** is that the executive head is elected by a majority of the voting power of the members of the Board of Governors. In the past, consensus on the new executive head has always been reached following negotiations, before being rubber-stamped by the Executive Board. That process took place over a period of one to two months before the present executive head of IDB was selected. There is no written information on this process.
- 5. The **World Intellectual Property Organization** (**WIPO**) requires a majority of two thirds of the votes cast at its General Assembly to elect its executive head. There are no provisions in the WIPO Convention or General Rules of Procedure requiring Member States to be notified of the candidates. However, in practice, circular letters are addressed to Member Sates three-to-six months before the convening of the Coordination Committee (comprising 66 Member States) which nominates a candidate to the WIPO General Assembly for appointment to the post of Director-General of WIPO. Candidates are not required to satisfy any predetermined criteria.
- 6. The **United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (Unesco)** informed IFAD that the terms of reference of its recently elected executive head were included in his contract. The Fund has been promised a copy of that contract. The 58-Member Executive Board of Unesco requested candidates to submit his/her opinion on the organization and invited them to attend an interview during the session of the Board prior to the election. After the Executive Board had voted (several times) and reached agreement on a candidate, his name was submitted to the General Conference held immediately after the Executive Board and the newly elected incumbent took up office at the beginning of the following year.
- 7. The **Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO)** has no formal post description for its executive head. The FAO Council sets a deadline for the submission of candidatures of not less than 30 days before the session of the Council, which in turn must be held no

INTERNATIONAL FUND FOR AGRICULTURAL DEVELOPMENT

ATTACHMENT

less than 120 days before the FAO Conference. The Conference then elects the Director-General and the new term of office of the Director-General-elect starts on 1 January of the following year.

- 8. The **International Labour Organization (ILO)** requires that candidatures be submitted at least one month prior to the date set by the Governing Body for the election.
- 9. The International Atomic Energy Agency (IAEA) appears to have the longest lead-time for its selection procedures. It does not have specific terms of reference or a job description for its executive head. The process is started a year before the expiry of the current executive head's mandate, and the term of office of a new executive head normally commences on 1 December. Nominations are received early in the year, and the Board of Governors attempts to reach consensus on the matter during its meetings in March or June. If no consensus is reached by June, the matter is referred to the September meeting of the Board of Governors which immediately precedes the General Conference. Therefore, in most cases, the Director-General-designate knows in September that the term of his/her office will start on 1 December.
- 10. The **United Nations Industrial Development Organization (UNIDO)** has no job description or terms of reference for its executive head and no interview or pre-selection procedure exists. However, past practice has been that candidates would organize meetings with representatives of some of the Member States in their capitals and/or in Vienna. The Executive Board of UNIDO (53 Members) is required to receive nominations at least two months prior to its last regular session before the session of the Conference which appoints the new Director-General. As a general rule, the Board meeting in June votes on the candidates. The candidature of the person who receives the most votes is presented to the UNIDO Conference in November, and the official date for the new Director-General to take office is 1 January of the following year.
- 11. The **International Telecommunication Union (ITU)** provided little information on the aspects being researched other than on its voting procedures, which are rather similar to those of IFAD.
- 12. The **World Trade Organization** (WTO) has no terms of reference or job description for its executive head. Member States submit the names of candidates, after which the Chairman of the General Council arranges for consultations and meetings between the candidates and Council Members. The process is not delegated to a subsidiary body. The Council's decision on the successful candidate has always been reached by consensus. The successful candidate is expected to take office at the expiry of his/her predecessor's term of office (similar to WHO). It may be recalled that the recent nomination of the new Director-General of WTO was a very lengthy process. A deadlock developed and there was a three-month interregnum because there was no consensus on the new Director-General.

Annex II EB 2008/93/R.30/Rev.1

Distribution: Restricted EB 2000/70/R.27 13 September 2000

Original: English Agenda Item 5 English



INTERNATIONAL FUND FOR AGRICULTURAL DEVELOPMENT

Executive Board – Seventieth Session

Rome, 13-14 September 2000

APPOINTMENT OF THE PRESIDENT

PERSONAL PROPOSAL OF THE CHAIRPERSON OF THE GOVERNING COUNCIL

- 1. The Bureau of the Governing Council met on 6 July and 10 September 2000 with the objective of facilitating the decision-making process for the appointment of the next President of IFAD at the Twenty-Fourth Session of the Governing Council in February 2001. The Bureau also met with the Convenors of the three Lists on 11 September 2000 for the same purpose.
- 2. All three meetings discussed every aspect of the procedures for the nomination of candidates for the Presidency of IFAD, his/her terms of reference and his/her election and appointment, together with related matters. In the time available it was not possible to reach a consensus on any of the above-mentioned matters, but all three lists expressed the unanimous opinion that the Fund deserved the best possible President and unanimously agreed to work together on reviewing the procedures for the appointment of the President of IFAD.
- 3. During the meetings, Ms Kirsti Lintonen, the Chairperson of the Governing Council, personally proposed a course of action, which takes into account some of the suggestions made by other participants in the meetings. Again, time prevented the achievement of a consensus on that proposal. However, the Chairperson informed the Bureau that she would be placing her personal proposal before the Executive Board for its information so as to facilitate its discussion on the matter.
- 4. The Chairperson's personal proposal consists of the following elements:
 - (a) a draft Resolution (attached as Annex I) for consideration by the Executive Board at its Seventieth Session in September 2000 and submission to the Governing Council for adoption at its Twenty-Fourth Session in February 2001 on the extension of the term of office of the current President of IFAD under Article 6, Section 8(b), of the Agreement Establishing IFAD;

Annex II

A INTERNATIONAL FUND FOR AGRICULTURAL DEVELOPMENT

(b) a draft Resolution (attached as Annex II) for consideration by the Executive Board at its Seventieth Session in September 2000 and submission to the Governing Council for adoption at its Twenty-Fourth Session in February 2001 providing a job description and competencies required for the office of the President of IFAD;

EB 2008/93/R.30/Rev.1

- (c) a proposal that the Secretariat prepare a draft document comparing the procedures for the appointment of the head of other specialized agencies of the United Nations and, on the basis thereof, proposing changes to the current procedure applicable to IFAD, together with proposed amendments to the basic legal texts of IFAD (i.e. the Agreement Establishing IFAD and the By-laws for the Conduct of the Business of IFAD). This draft document would then be considered and, if necessary, modified by an *ad hoc* working group to be established by the Executive Board before consideration by the Executive Board at its Seventy-First Session in December 2000. The Board would then transmit the document, together with a draft Resolution thereon, to the Governing Council at its Twenty-Fourth Session in February 2001.
- 5. If the personal proposal of the Chairperson were to be supported by the Board, it would require the Board at its Seventieth Session in September 2000 to consider the draft Resolutions in Annexes I and II hereto for submission to the Governing Council and to agree the composition and terms of reference of the *ad hoc* working group to consider the document referred to in paragraph 4(c) above.

INTERNATIONAL FUND FOR AGRICULTURAL DEVELOPMENT

ANNEX I

DRAFT RESOLUTION ON THE IMPLEMENTATION OF ARTICLE 6.8(b) OF THE AGREEMENT ESTABLISHING IFAD: CONTINUITY IN THE OFFICE OF THE PRESIDENT OF IFAD

Resolution ---/XXIV

Implementation of Article 6.8(b) of the Agreement Establishing IFAD: Continuity in the Office of the President of IFAD

The Governing Council of IFAD,

Having considered document GC 24/L.--- and the proposal therein and the Executive Board's recommendation thereon:

Having noted that the second and last term of office of the incumbent President of IFAD is to expire on 21 February 2001;

Having further noted that the Executive Board has decided to convene the Twenty-Fourth Session of the Governing Council on 20-21 February 2001, at which time the Governing Council is expected to appoint a new President of IFAD;

Bearing in mind Article 6, Section 8(b), of the Agreement Establishing IFAD;

Decides that, in accordance with Article 6, Section 8(b), of the Agreement Establishing IFAD, and in order to ensure a smooth handover of the office of the President of IFAD:

- (a) The incumbent President of IFAD, Fawzi Hamad Al-Sultan, shall continue to perform the duties of his office until [31 May 2001].
- (b) The incumbent President shall perform his duties until the date referred to in paragraph (a) above on the same terms and conditions of service as are applicable to him on the date of the adoption of this Resolution.

A INTERNATIONAL FUND FOR AGRICULTURAL DEVELOPMENT

EB 2008/93/R.30/Rev.1

ANNEX II

DRAFT RESOLUTION ON THE TERMS OF REFERENCE FOR THE OFFICE OF THE PRESIDENT OF IFAD

Resolution ---/XXIV

The Terms of Reference for the Office of the President of IFAD

The Governing Council of IFAD,

Having considered document GC 24/L.--- and the proposal therein and the Executive Board's recommendation thereon;

Having noted that no terms of reference exist for the office of the President of IFAD;

Desirous of ensuring consistency and transparency in the procedures for the appointment of the President of IFAD and that the best possible candidate be so appointed;

Decides that:

- (a) The Terms of Reference, including a job description and a competency profile, for the President of IFAD attached hereto apply to all persons appointed to the office of the President of IFAD after the adoption of this Resolution.
- (b) The Bureau of the Governing Council be requested to review the nominations of all candidates presented to the Governing Council so as to ensure that each complies with the competencies set out therein.

A

INTERNATIONAL FUND FOR AGRICULTURAL DEVELOPMENT

ATTACHMENT

TERMS OF REFERENCE FOR THE OFFICE OF PRESIDENT OF IFAD

Job Description

- 1. In accordance with Article 6, Section 8, of the Agreement Establishing IFAD, the President is responsible for conducting the business of the Fund under the control and direction of the Governing Council and the Executive Board.
- 2. The President's primary task is to sustain and develop IFAD's role as the premier international development agency providing concessional resources for the benefit of the rural poor.
- 3. The President shall:
 - shape a vision and develop a strategy for applying the Fund's financial and intellectual assets to the problems of rural poverty in the twenty-first century;
 - ensure that the Fund has an international profile appropriate to its achievements and potential and which enables it to mobilize funds successfully;
 - maintain effective relationships with the Fund's constituency including, in particular, its resource providers and borrowers, and other multilateral and bilateral and development agencies;
 - deliver the Fund's programme effectively and efficiently;
 - sustain and develop the Fund's knowledge assets, in particular by ensuring that the impact of the Fund's projects is objectively evaluated and that the lessons of experience are used by the Fund and disseminated within the development community;
 - manage the Fund's financial resources prudently and efficiently;
 - manage the Fund's human resources so as to ensure that IFAD can recruit, retain and motivate staff of the highest quality; and
 - report and provide advice to the Fund's governing bodies.

Competency Profile

- 4. The President shall have:
 - intellectual leadership, based on knowledge and experience on development issues, preferably including rural poverty;
 - communication and advocacy skills effective with decision-makers at the highest level, including ministers and heads of other development agencies;
 - experience in managing programmes and projects in development assistance;

Annex II EB 2008/93/R.30/Rev.1

INTERNATIONAL FUND FOR AGRICULTURAL DEVELOPMENT

ATTACHMENT

• experience in managing substantial financial resources at a senior level, preferably in a development banking context;

- skills in staff management, including the ability to build and maintain a cohesive and
 effective top management team and to create a working environment which values and
 inspires IFAD's staff;
- sensitivity to political and cultural factors; and
- fluency in English; knowledge of another IFAD official language desirable