

Distribution: Restricted
Original: English

EB 2006/88/R.9/Add.1
Agenda Item 8

23 August 2006
English Only



INTERNATIONAL FUND FOR AGRICULTURAL DEVELOPMENT
Executive Board – Eighty-eighth Session
Rome, 13-14 September 2006

**PRESIDENT'S REPORT ON THE IMPLEMENTATION STATUS OF EVALUATION
RECOMMENDATIONS AND MANAGEMENT ACTIONS**

VOLUME II

**AGREEMENT AT COMPLETION POINT RECOMMENDATIONS
AND FOLLOW-UP ACTION TAKEN BY THE
PROGRAMME MANAGEMENT DEPARTMENT**

ADDENDUM

For: Information

*Due to resource constraints and environmental concerns, IFAD documents are produced in limited quantities.
Delegates are kindly requested to bring their documents to meetings and to limit requests for additional copies.*

Note to Executive Board Directors

This document is submitted for information to the Executive Board.

To make the best use of time available at Executive Board sessions, Directors are invited to contact the following focal point with any technical questions about this document before the session.

Shyam Khadka

Senior Portfolio Manager

tel.: +39-06-5459-2388

e-mail: s.khadka@ifad.org

Queries regarding the dispatch of documentation for this session should be addressed to:

Deirdre McGrenra

Governing Bodies Officer

tel.: +39-06-5459-2374

e-mail: d.mcgrenra@ifad.org

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS	iii
CATEGORIES USED TO ANALYSE AGREEMENT AT COMPLETION POINT RECOMMENDATIONS	iv
INTERIM EVALUATIONS	1
Ethiopia: Special Country Programme – Phase II	1
Gambia: Rural Finance and Community Initiatives Project	4
Jordan: Agricultural Resource Management Project – Phase II	7
Lao People’s Democratic Republic: Northern Sayabouri Rural Development Project	13
Senegal: Rural Micro-Enterprises Project	17
Tunisia: Integrated Agricultural Development Project in the Governorate of Siliana	19
Viet Nam: Agricultural Resources Conservation and Development Project in Quang Binh Province	23
Viet Nam: Ha Giang Development Project for Ethnic Minorities	27
COMPLETION EVALUATIONS	32
Paraguay: Peasant Development Fund Credit Project – Eastern Region of Paraguay	32
COUNTRY PROGRAMME EVALUATIONS	38
Bolivia	38
Egypt	41
THEMATIC EVALUATIONS	45
IFAD’s Performance and Impact in Decentralizing Environments: Experiences from Ethiopia, Uganda and the United Republic of Tanzania	45
Organic Agriculture and Poverty Reduction in Asia: China and India Focus	47

ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS

ACP	agreement at completion point
AFD	French Agency for Development
AWP/B	annual workplan and budget
COSOP	country strategic opportunities paper
CPC	commune people's committee
CPE	country programme evaluation
DPMU	district project management unit
IFI	intermediary financial institution
LDB	local development budget
M&E	monitoring and evaluation
MFI	microfinance institution
MoA	Ministry of Agriculture
MTR	mid-term review
PDF	Peasant Development Fund
PMU	project management unit
PPMU	provincial project management unit
RIMS	results and impact management system
SMB	self-management board
SME	small and medium-sized enterprise
TA	technical assistance
UNCDF	United Nations Capital Development Fund
UNOPS	United Nations Office for Project Services
VMG	village management group
WUA	water users' association

**CATEGORIES USED TO ANALYSE AGREEMENT AT COMPLETION POINT
RECOMMENDATIONS**

LEVEL

CI	cooperating institution
CTRY	IFAD-country level
GOV	country governmental authorities
IFAD	IFAD-corporate level
PROJ	project
REG	IFAD-regional level

NATURE

OPER	operational
PLCY	policy
STRAT	strategy

THEME

ADV	implementation advice
BEN	beneficiary participation
DEC	decentralization
ENT	enterprise development
EXI	exit and handover strategy
GDR	gender
HR	human resources management
INR	innovation, replication and knowledge management
IME	information, communication and monitoring and evaluation
MKT	market development
NRM	natural resource management
ORG	rural poor people's organizations
PDM	project design and management
PPD	partnership-building and policy dialogue
RFI	rural finance
STR	strategy
SUP	supervision
TCB	training and capacity-building
TGT	targeting

AGREEMENT AT COMPLETION POINT RECOMMENDATIONS AND FOLLOW-UP ACTION TAKEN BY THE PROGRAMME MANAGEMENT DEPARTMENT

INTERIM EVALUATIONS

Country	Serial N°	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at Completion Point Recommendation	Programme Management Department Follow-up
Ethiopia	1.	CTRY	STRAT	STR	Continue work started on sharing good practice and experience among regions and districts (<i>woredas</i>), with regular workshops involving members of water users' associations (WUAs), donors and invited guests.	The United Nations Office for Project Services (UNOPS) and IFAD have ensured necessary budgetary allocations for study tours and knowledge sharing symposiums within the annual workplan and budget (AWP/B). IFAD actively participated in a national workshop on small-scale irrigation (SSI) development held earlier in the year to share experience among donors.
Ethiopia	2.	CTRY	PLCY	PPD	Further extend project experience by developing policy dialogue with Government and donors on topics such as water resource management at the catchment level; adaptation of national water resource policies and legislation to the regional level; marketing and price regulation; policies on WUAs and irrigation cooperatives; policies and practices relating to land title; and understandings and practices in relation to post-construction maintenance and rehabilitation.	As set out in the inception memorandum for the proposed Participatory Small-scale Irrigation Development Programme, lessons learned under phase II of the Special Country Programme will be used to inform and influence public strategies and policies governing SSI development in Ethiopia, particularly with regard to use of indigenous knowledge to improve catchment-area planning and management; scheme construction, operation and maintenance; improve water management practices; and empowering communities so as to minimize conflicts among water users.
Ethiopia	3.	CTRY	STRAT	STR	Work to minimize the impact on the project of organizational restructuring within the Government.	IFAD is supporting the Government's initiatives to decentralize and devolve powers and authority to local institutions at the district and commune levels, as these are less prone to such frequent reorganization and restructuring as those at the regional and federal levels.
Ethiopia	4.	CTRY	STRAT	PPD	Develop a partnership among donors, the cooperating institution and Government characterized by trust, constructive support and continuity of relationships. In addition to external supervision the project needs continuity of constructive support from IFAD or UNOPS, together with national consultants, to assist in overcoming problems identified by project stakeholders.	This action has been completed. Joint UNOPS/IFAD follow-up missions have visited the programme, with support from national experts. Currently, a national consultant is working with government counterparts to critically examine and respond to key issues raised by the interim evaluation, specifically with regard to internalizing the comparative advantages of traditional irrigation organizations and structures. The findings and recommendations of the study will contribute to enhancing programme design.
Ethiopia	5.	CTRY	STRAT	PDM	Carry out formulation in a fully participatory manner, drawing on lessons of experience learned by stakeholders at all levels, particularly those with detailed knowledge of both the field and the farmers.	This will be reflected in the inception memorandum and terms of reference for the formulation mission, and include consultation workshops to improve engagement with stakeholders.
Ethiopia	6.	CTRY	STRAT	PDM	Develop an intervention that is both long-term, to reflect the time needed to achieve full impact, and flexible, to allow for future learning and change.	With duration of seven years, the design of the proposed Participatory Small-scale Irrigation Development Programme will allow for learning-from-doing and for internalizing experiences and lessons learned. This will be achieved by ensuring that the monitoring and evaluation (M&E) system (already designed) is fully operational within the first year of implementation.
Ethiopia	7.	CTRY	STRAT	STR	Develop an intervention that fits well with other projects funded by the Government and donors in the SSI sector, given that the regions and <i>woredas</i> are also engaged in programmes dealing with SSI development.	The Government has requested IFAD to take the lead in developing a model for SSI in Ethiopia, for adoption by rural households irrespective of the source of financing. The African Development Bank and the French Agency for Development (AFD) are using participatory methodologies initiated under the Special Country Programme – Phase II.

Country	Serial N°	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at Completion Point Recommendation	Programme Management Department Follow-up
Ethiopia	8.	PROJ	OPER	ADV	Recognize the importance of farmers and irrigation authorities sharing responsibility for maintenance; a distinction will need to be made between minor maintenance (can be carried out by farmers), major maintenance (beyond the capacity of farmers but within the mandate of regional authorities), and rehabilitation of physical and social infrastructure (requires significant external funding).	The M&E system was designed (in January 2006) to capture operation and maintenance cost data for each scheme to ensure that any cost-recovery or -sharing arrangements are not unduly excessive.
Ethiopia	9.	PROJ	OPER	IME	Agree on a complete and detailed logical framework or equivalent expression of the hierarchy of goals and activities, together with indicators of achievement, means of verification, and risks and assumptions. This should form the basis of a simple monitoring system to be developed prior to implementation of Phase III.	The terms of reference for the programme formulation mission will include instructions for developing a logical framework.
Ethiopia	10.	PROJ	OPER	IME	Work to produce a clear, concise but very limited volume of project documentation that is accessible to all stakeholders. All new project documentation of any significance should be presented to stakeholders at a national- or regional-level workshop.	Programme documents will be consistent with IFAD's guidelines on project design and key file tables.
Ethiopia	11a	PROJ	OPER	NRM	Conduct participatory stakeholder reviews of: - good practices developed within the regions for integrated management of catchment water resources with a view to minimizing conflict among upstream and downstream water users. The study should include a review of existing legal instruments and their enforcement;	Formulation report will include specific modalities for improving catchment-area planning and management; and use of indigenous knowledge to minimize conflict.
Ethiopia	11b	PROJ	OPER	TGT	- selection processes for SSI schemes to be improved and extended, with a view to sound targeting in relation to vulnerability and adequate proximity to markets;	At least 33% of beneficiaries will be woman-headed households, landless households and unemployed youth.
Ethiopia	11c	PROJ	OPER	MKT	- ways in which input and output markets and market access can be developed for SSI schemes.	Scheme design will henceforth include provision for market access roads. Output marketing will be supported within the framework of the ongoing IFAD-financed Agricultural Marketing Improvement Programme. Input marketing is currently being improved with World Bank support. Input and output marketing are effectively coordinated under the leadership of the Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development.
Ethiopia	12a	PROJ	OPER	ORG	Conduct participatory stakeholder reviews of: - social organization of farmers within SSI schemes, with due attention to traditional water management organizations, WUAs and cooperatives;	The findings and recommendations of the ongoing study by IFAD and the Government will contribute to enhancing water management based on indigenous knowledge. The study was completed in June 2006.
Ethiopia	12b	PROJ	OPER	NRM	- the performance, strengths and weaknesses of unassisted traditional irrigation schemes, in order to better focus improvements delivered by the project; and	- ditto -
Ethiopia	12c	PROJ	OPER	NRM	- the full range of technologies suitable for community-level, farmer-managed irrigation.	These will be examined at formulation.
Ethiopia	13a	PROJ	OPER	ADV	Conduct participatory stakeholder reviews of:	- ditto -

Country	Serial N°	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at Completion Point Recommendation	Programme Management Department Follow-up
					- current extension methodologies and practices with a view to emphasizing the use of non-traditional methods such as farmer-field visits, local fairs and competitions; the benefits of carrying out trials and demonstrations on farmers' fields should be taken into account; and	
Ethiopia	13b	PROJ	OPER	ADV	- with regard to the curriculum of the development assistants (DAs), reconsider the usefulness of proposed three-pronged specialization; review and replicate the experience of master farmers (volunteers) (<i>hirsha kadres</i>) in Tigray.	- ditto -
Ethiopia	14a	PROJ	OPER	TCB	Conduct participatory stakeholder reviews of: - financial procedures at the district (<i>woreda</i>), regional, programme coordination unit (PCU), Ministry of Water Resources and donor levels, with a view to achieving simplification and acceleration without loss of accountability and transparency. Emphasis on financial management capacity-building should rest particularly at the <i>woreda</i> level. Regional financial accountants and other staff should work more closely with counterparts in order to develop their reporting and financial accounting capacity; and	Financial management capacity at the <i>woreda</i> level is being improved by appointing accountants to the districts.
Ethiopia	14b	PROJ	OPER	ADV	- the true capital and recurrent costs of SSI schemes, with particular emphasis on identification of real maintenance and rehabilitation costs.	The Government has agreed in principle to establish a scheme-based M&E system capable of capturing and reporting on relevant data in this regard.
Ethiopia	15.	PROJ	OPER	STR	In order to complete the remaining activities without undue haste and corresponding loss of quality, and in light of the accelerated AWP/B in place as at February 2005, consideration should be given to requesting an extension of the programme.	Loan agreement already amended to extend the completion and closing dates, as appropriate.
Ethiopia	16.	PROJ	OPER	ADV	The audit scheme already under way should be completed to a high standard, the data validated and the findings collated and analysed.	Completed.
Ethiopia	17.	PROJ	OPER	IME	Simple, consistent progress report and final report formats should be agreed between the PCU and the regions, and implemented with the immediate purpose of fulfilling the requirements of end-of-programme reporting.	This is well under way.
Ethiopia	18.	PROJ	OPER	ADV	In the final months of the programme every effort should be made to redress the imbalance between activities in engineering and agricultural support arenas. In particular significantly more work is needed with regard to soil conservation, women's vegetable gardens and agricultural support services.	This is reflected in the latest AWP/B.
Ethiopia	19.	PROJ	OPER	ADV	The start that was made in 2004 to share organizational learning through programme workshops and other relevant means should be continued.	Appropriate budgetary allocations have been made for this purpose.

Country	Serial N°	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at Completion Point Recommendation	Programme Management Department Follow-up
Ethiopia	20.	PROJ	OPER	IME	Specialist expertise in M&E (either from a retained consultant or full-time specialist) should be put in place at the PCU level, to facilitate the development of regional and <i>woreda</i> -level skills in M&E and to coordinate overall project monitoring.	This has been done with the support of national consultants. A programme M&E officer is also being recruited outside the civil service salary structure.
Gambia	1.	CTRY	STRAT	PPD	There is a need to radically rethink the project concept and reflect on the choice of partner agencies in the country; further interventions should take account of national development and poverty reduction strategies.	To be undertaken in the framework of the Rural Finance Project (RFP) by using a standalone microfinance programme.
Gambia	2.	CTRY	STRAT	STR	Three options were considered by stakeholders: (i) a standalone microfinance sectoral programme; (ii) microfinance twinned with agricultural support but with genuine synergies in targeting and implementation and matching geographical areas for main components; and (iii) microfinance backed up by infrastructural investments.	A standalone rural finance project has been selected.
Gambia	3.	CTRY	STRAT	PDM	Clearer articulation of project objectives and synergy of components should be provided in the inception/formulation papers.	The project aims at reducing rural poverty and improving livelihoods in rural areas of the Gambia through better access to sustainable financial services. The project will ensure the viability of microfinance institutions (MFIs) by: (i) direct support; (ii) building up a national expertise; and (iii) linking MFIs to regional networks.
Gambia	4.	CTRY	STRAT	INR	Hold detailed discussions with partners within the country and make an analysis of “good practices” that might be taken on board.	Good practices include: issuing shares; establishing an effective, high-level steering group to ensure better management and training for staff. Strategic partnerships have been established with other donors, e.g. with the World Bank, complementary M&E systems).
Gambia	5.	PROJ	STRAT	RFI	In the rural finance sector, devise a long-term process to support regulatory and supervising bodies (including the Central Bank of the Gambia [CBG] and the Microfinance Promotion Centre) and cooperate in revising/updating rural finance policy documents. A microfinance policy study should be conducted to enhance the regulatory framework.	RFP contains a component for the support of the CBG and MFCP. Within the framework of the Rural Finance and Community Initiatives Project, IFAD has supported the formulation of a national microfinance policy constituting the basis of RFP implementation.
Gambia	6.	PROJ	STRAT	PPD	Performance-based memoranda of understanding should be signed with partners, including NGO service providers.	Performance contracts will be used for NGO service providers.
Gambia	7.	PROJ	OPER	RFI	Summary recommendations on rural finance: - adopt a more programmatic/sectoral approach, inter alia, supporting a centre of expertise in microfinance good practices; and	Contract an external training services provider (TSP) and support the Microfinance Promotion Centre with a view to creating an in-country centre of expertise.
Gambia	8.	PROJ	OPER	RFI	- key actors in microfinance, rather than only village-based savings and credit associations (VISACAs), should be supported, and group lending promoted alongside the development and expansion of the VISACA concept.	Other MFIs, such as Gambia Women’s Finance Association, National Association of Cooperative Credit Unions of the Gambia and Gamsavings, have been included in the RFP.
Gambia	9.	PROJ	OPER	RFI	Groups should have access to credit on the understanding that a savings discipline is established.	Included in the recommendations for better focus on microfinance technologies (see paragraph 61, page 17, of the formulation report).

Country	Serial N°	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at Completion Point Recommendation	Programme Management Department Follow-up
Gambia	10.	PROJ	OPER	RFI	Loan guarantees may take the form of peer pressure, collective group guarantees or other innovative approaches, provided the poor are not excluded.	Innovative guarantees such as peer pressure and collective group guarantees have been taken into account in the recommendations for better focus on microfinance technologies (see paragraph 61, page 17, of the formulation report)
Gambia	11.	GOV	OPER	ADV	For the time being, the CBG should continue its supervisory role vis-à-vis VISACA (alternative proposals to be studied).	Under RFP, the CBG will continue its supervisory role; the project will also support the building up of an apex body with a supervisory role for VISACAs.
Gambia	12.	GOV	OPER	ADV	Membership criterion for ratings should be reviewed.	Has been reviewed with RFP.
Gambia	13.	PROJ	OPER	TCB	More intensive training should be provided for VISACA management committees and cashiers and for TSPs.	The aim of the project is to reinforce the capacity of stakeholders in view of the increasing viability of MFIs. More training will be provided under RFP
Gambia	14.	PROJ	OPER	RFI	Stronger incentives should be provided for loan repayments, e.g. interest rebates.	Different types of incentives will be put in place under RFP.
Gambia	15.	PROJ	OPER	EXI	Exit strategy, deadlines and performance incentives for service providers should be included in project design and subsequently built into the relevant contracts/agreements.	A new microfinance exit strategy and incentives have been discussed with the United Nations Capital Development Fund (UNCDF) and will be included in RFP.
Gambia	16.	PROJ	OPER	ADV	Cost of service provision and remuneration for committees and cashiers to be progressively borne by VISACAs.	Starting with RFP, TSPs should specify goals to be achieved within a given period of time, and VISACAs should progressively contribute to their fees so that the cost of service provision is borne entirely by the VISACAs and TSPs.
Gambia	17.	PROJ	OPER	ADV	Support to under-performing VISACAs should be discontinued after a predetermined period of external assistance.	TSPs will be recruited to assist VISACAs to avoid them closing down.
Gambia	18.	PROJ	OPER	ORG	A zonal network of VISACAs should be created, to operate concurrently with the strengthening of individual VISACAs; institutionalization strategy should be outlined at the project design stage.	New design included in RFP; the apex is the link with the national rural microfinance policy.
Gambia	19.	PROJ	OPER	RFI	Current terms and conditions of VISACA loans and savings should be reviewed.	Terms and conditions have been reviewed under RFP.
Gambia	20.	PROJ	OPER	ADV	Extension services should be motivated and strengthened through performance-based incentives.	A voucher-based system has already been implemented under RFP.
Gambia	21.	PROJ	OPER	INR	The village auxiliary (VA) system should be replicated countrywide.	No longer applicable as the RFP is a standalone microfinance project; therefore, the agricultural component is no longer included.
Gambia	22.	PROJ	OPER	HR	Recruitment of a single VA per village; training in crop production and animal husbandry; provision of needed inputs to VAs; remuneration in kind or labour, to be determined and provided by the communities; duties to include vaccination of small ruminants and poultry.	N/A - see above (21).
Gambia	23.	PROJ	OPER	ADV	Extension agents and VAs should be helped to familiarize themselves with new technologies through networking, visits and Internet access.	N/A - see above (21).
Gambia	24.	PROJ	OPER	ADV	Continue support for research in on-farm testing and dissemination of new technologies.	N/A - see above (21).
Gambia	25.	PROJ	OPER	TCB	Training programmes should be drawn up in	N/A - see above (21).

Country	Serial N°	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at Completion Point Recommendation	Programme Management Department Follow-up
					consultation with communities.	
Gambia	26.	PROJ	OPER	TCB	Emphasis should be placed on simple processing techniques for areas where markets for fresh produce do not exist.	N/A - see above (21).
Gambia	27.	PROJ	OPER	TCB	Training should match local resources and market opportunities.	N/A - see above (21).
Gambia	28.	PROJ	OPER	MKT	Both the private sector and government agencies such as the department of planning should be involved in providing market information.	N/A - see above (21).
Gambia	29.	PROJ	OPER	MKT	Producers should be put in contact with hotels and tourism outlets.	N/A - see above (21).
Gambia	30.	PROJ	OPER	ADV	Findings of previous participatory rural appraisal exercises and rural surveys should be made available at convenient locations.	N/A - see above (21).
Gambia	31.	PROJ	OPER	IME	A brief term of international technical assistance (TA), with very specific objectives, is likely to be necessary at the outset. This should include preparing a summary of the functions and purpose of M&E, to be drawn from IFAD's Guide for Project M&E. Arrangements for continuous support (e.g. training) should be made with local institutions (e.g. the University of the Gambia) and regional IFAD networks. The same institutions and networks may help identify and train business graduates in basic M&E techniques.	International TA will be recruited under a grant and an M&E system for RFP designed with other projects in the Gambia (e.g. the World Bank's Community Driven Development Programme) to provide for more effective monitoring and for reducing the duplication of effort.
Gambia	32.	PROJ	OPER	IME	The M&E function is crucial and no curtailment of it should be allowed.	Due to the importance of M&E, the proposed system will be both participatory and conventional to ensure best follow-up on the implementation of activities.
Gambia	33.	PROJ	OPER	ADV	Due emphasis must also be placed on essential management functions such as smooth accounting, disbursement and procurement procedures, and to effective auditing.	More experienced management will be recruited; a greater number of staff will be literate; and training will be offered.
Gambia	34.	PROJ	OPER	HR	The M&E officer should enjoy a degree of autonomy within the project management unit (PMU), although the extent of such autonomy will need to be determined with the PMU.	The M&E officer will monitor project activities daily and report directly to the PMU. He/she will also prepare quarterly, biannual and annual progress reports covering all aspects of the project, including financial aspects, based on the management information system.
Gambia	35.	PROJ	OPER	IME	Participatory M&E should be promoted as a tool for cost-benefit analysis by the beneficiaries but should not be regarded as a substitute for a centralized system; training should be provided for extensionists and beneficiaries to improve effective participatory monitoring.	Outcomes will be provided from both participatory and conventional M&E activities.
Gambia	36.	PROJ	OPER	TCB	Training of project M&E officers in the relevant departments of the University of the Gambia might be directly funded by IFAD and other international donors, with appropriate linkages with regional support networks.	Contracts will be signed with the University of the Gambia for external audit and training.

Country	Serial N°	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at Completion Point Recommendation	Programme Management Department Follow-up
Gambia	37.	IFAD	OPER	SUP	The composition of supervision missions should ensure adequate coverage of expertise areas from the outset.	This has been implemented since the sixth supervision of the Rural Finance and Community Initiatives Project and will be maintained in RFP supervision.
Gambia	38.	IFAD	OPER	HR	In case of direct supervision, changes in the country programme manager should be kept to a minimum and his/her participation in field activities increased.	No portfolio redistribution is foreseen and the country programme manager will attempt to visit the country more often.
Gambia	39.	IFAD	OPER	SUP	The mid-term review (MTR) should constitute a rigorous exercise even if it leads to radical reorientation of the project.	The MTR will assess the results of the first three years and reorient the intervention strategy for coming years.
Gambia	40.	PROJ	OPER	HR	Staff continuity at all levels is desirable during project implementation	Contracts of key PMU personnel will be performance-based to ensure best management.
Gambia	41.	PROJ	OPER	PPD	Joint investments should be made with the Government and other donors and development partners for upgrading roads and telecommunications.	Done.
Gambia	42.	PROJ	OPER	PDM	A strong and dynamic project steering committee must be put in place to effectively guide project implementation.	The project steering committee will be reorganized and staffed with more rural finance experts.
Gambia	43.	PROJ	OPER	DEC	Relocation of the PMU to the central province is a desirable goal but will require prior infrastructural investments in both the main and subsidiary field offices and in the training headquarters; such a move should form part of the wider measures of decentralization now being pursued by the department of state for agriculture.	The PMU will remain in Banjul while the community mobilization officer will be decentralized to the central area of the country. No support will be given to decentralizing the department of state for agriculture.
Jordan	1.	CTRY	OPER	TCB	In future, IFAD should help the Ministry of Agriculture (MoA) to mainstream participatory approaches throughout the ministry. This might include funding a series of workshops and a sensitization campaign (similar to that conducted when establishing the gender and development unit), and providing TA for training trainers in MoA's training department.	<p>MoA has integrated new participatory approaches into its work through the Agricultural Resource Management Project – Phase II (ARMP-II), in which programming is based on community action plans (CAPs) established in a participatory manner. ARMP-II is also involved in introducing a participatory M&E mechanism into its management approach.</p> <p>The upcoming review of the Yarmouk Agricultural Resources Development Programme will also cover approaches adopted by ARMP-II. Together, these two interventions constitute mainstream MoA investment operations.</p> <p>In addition, a local training-of-trainers programme has been conducted, providing MoA management with access to suitable training in participatory approaches.</p> <p>IFAD will continue to sensitize the Government on this issue as part of its ongoing discussions, dialogue and support to rural poverty reduction efforts.</p>
Jordan	2.	PROJ	OPER	BEN	An analysis should be made, within the designated project areas, of arrangements for and the impact of traditional village development committees and more recent community associations; mechanisms that have proved effective for the mobilization and participation of rural poor communities should be identified.	A review of experience in community participation resulted in a four-step participatory planning process to ensure full mobilization and participation of rural poor communities in establishing CAPs. This included: (i) preparatory activities-orientation meetings and the establishment of a local community committee (LCC); (ii) participatory diagnosis involving the community and facilitated

Country	Serial N°	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at Completion Point Recommendation	Programme Management Department Follow-up
						by trained project staff; (iii) participatory planning, including the establishment of an action plan by the LCC and its adoption by the community as a whole, and the preparation of a plan of work for PY1; and (iv) implementation and monitoring, drawing on the LCC and community stakeholders.
Jordan	3.	PROJ	OPER	TCB	Training should be provided for PMU staff in community development and group formation, including study visits to other IFAD projects where community participation and organization have been successful.	ARMP-II supported two intensive training sessions in project year 1 (PY1) for local planning teams, including PMU's community development staff and local unit directors; the second session will be conducted in both the classroom and in three of the pilot cluster villages.
Jordan	4.	PROJ	OPER	ADV	A specialized and experienced NGO should be contracted to backstop, train and monitor implementation of the community participatory approach.	An experienced NGO has initiated support to project staff in community development and capacity-building. The project allocated a lump sum of approximately US\$28,400 (JD 20,000/year) for PYs 1, 2 and 3.
Jordan	5.	PROJ	OPER	TCB	Beneficiaries should receive training in community participation and be helped to form village development committees. Consideration should be given to providing community development funds.	To ensure that local groups and associations play a significant role in project implementation, local capacities will be reinforced — particularly in the areas of planning, negotiation, management and M&E. This will be achieved through: (i) on-the-job training during participation in the planning process, implementation and M&E; (ii) technical and logistic support; and (iii) complementary training courses. ARMP-II also supports targeted training sessions to strengthen community-based organizations in areas such as organization and management, local development planning, communications and group conflict management, programming activities and follow-up. Altogether, 1,200 training days will be organized by the end of the project, involving some 220 associations and informal group leaders, in addition to four study tours for 60 persons to be undertaken with those for project agents.
Jordan	6.	PROJ	OPER	IME	Steps should be taken to ensure beneficiary participation as a feature of the monitoring of project activities.	A workshop on participatory planning and M&E was organized following project start-up, detailing a participatory M&E strategy and future steps. These included further definition of the logframe with stakeholders and development of an M&E plan.
Jordan	7.	PROJ	OPER	ADV	The design principle adopted during the second phase should be to ensure that farmers' supplementary irrigation requirements can, in a normal year, be met by harvested run-off water only.	Planning of agriculture and water-harvesting activities has been integrated in the design, in order to ensure that farmers' supplementary requirements can be met from harvested run-off water alone.
Jordan	8.	PROJ	OPER	ADV	The project should start taking steps to estimate cistern capacity based on more precise information on water requirements.	Cisterns are being provided for individual and collective farms, in accordance with farm sizes and farm plans.
Jordan	9.	PROJ	OPER	TCB	The project should ensure that all growers are informed about, and receive guidelines on, supplementary irrigation practices for olive and other fruit trees, so as to ensure an optimum economic balance between yield and water use. These guidelines should be quantified for trees at different stages of maturity on the various soils in the project area, based on a normal season.	Training and refresher courses are being held on various aspects of water management for leaders and members of WUAs, together with field days to demonstrate efficient use of cisterns. Training and TA will be based on the delineation of clear guidelines for supplementary irrigation and efficient water use for different trees, crops and soils in the project area.

Country	Serial N°	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at Completion Point Recommendation	Programme Management Department Follow-up
Jordan	10.	PROJ	OPER	ADV	In the absence of guidelines applicable to project circumstances, or if existing ones need revising, the project should enlist the help of the National Centre for Agricultural Research and Technological Transfer to formulate and develop such guidelines.	While TA for the development of guidelines has been included under the project, no provider has yet been selected.
Jordan	11.	PROJ	OPER	ORG	More attention should be paid to and resources allocated for the formation and structure of WUAs on communal irrigation schemes that have benefited or will benefit from project support in the form of spring and canal rehabilitation.	The project is providing TA to promote and form WUAs to participate in rehabilitation works, and to train them in planning, design, selection and installation of equipment, routine maintenance, etc. Training is also being provided for off-farm reservoir users' groups formed by the communities for operation and maintenance of the facilities. Field days are being organized to demonstrate efficient use of cisterns.
Jordan	12.	PROJ	OPER	EXI	Consideration should be given to formalizing procedures for handing over: completed areas to the respective directorates of agriculture (DAs); and structures to the appropriate agencies for management and maintenance.	The project seeks to improve the organization and outreach of extension as main objectives. This will enable it to better service small farmers in the project area and strengthen the implementation capacity of the DAs to provide efficient extension services that meet new project commitments to agricultural development. DAs at both the governorate and district levels are responsible for agriculture and livestock extension through their existing organizational structure and technical units. They will be strengthened with staff to support and implement joint extension interventions.
Jordan	13.	PROJ	STRAT	ADV	Consideration should be given to providing support from project funds for extension agents in the field and DAs concerned with the project.	The DAs in Karak, Tafila and Ma'an are crucial to the project both as sources of extension staff and as partners in project implementation. The project is strengthening DA capacities to provide extension to farmers. Provision has been made for capital and recurrent costs for the purchase of three four-wheel-drive pickups and three computers. Furthermore, the involvement of the directorate of extension, rural development and environmental protection is needed to assist in the training of extension agents. Some 14 sessions are being financed by the project on the basis of two sessions per year (PYs 1-7). The objective is to upgrade extension agents' competencies in relation to methodologies and tools, and to provide training specific to agriculture and livestock topics of interest to the project. In addition, one computer and some training supplies have been provided to the directorate of extension, rural development and environmental protection.
Jordan	14.	CTRY	STRAT	PPD	Further policy dialogue is needed between IFAD and the MoA to identify the extent to which the extension service's current shortfall could have a bearing on achieving the overall poverty reduction aims in rural areas and to reach agreement on medium-term measures to address the issue.	Dialogue is going forward with the MoA and United States Agency for International Development on drawing up a broader extension strategy, with the objective of rationalizing service provision and focusing government efforts on poorer farmers.
Jordan	15.	PROJ	OPER	RFI	A minimum of 10-15% of credit allocations should be designated to test pilots of alternative mechanisms of group credit provision suitable to the socio-economic conditions of the rural poor. This should be	The development of microfinance in the project area is based on the institutional strengthening and capacity-building of different types of legal institutions, such as cooperatives supported by the German Agency for Technical Cooperation, Ministry of Planning

Country	Serial N°	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at Completion Point Recommendation	Programme Management Department Follow-up
					administered by the Agricultural Credit Corporation (ACC) but channeled through appropriate local-level rural organizations, e.g. <i>Sanadiq</i> if found suitable. Advantage should be taken of successful regional experience in this regard, for example, in Syria. The new mechanism should be created in the project area for the specific purpose of providing loans to the most disadvantaged households that are unable to meet present collateral requirements. The arrangements should be established by the project's credit unit and operate under joint PMU/ACC supervision.	<p>(MoP)-supported associations/societies and other legal entities, through training of staff and governing body members, and study tours. The objective is to create and/or reinforce a network of sustainable financial intermediaries refinanced by three project-area branches of ACC for on-lending to their clients.</p> <p>The project will finance the institutional strengthening of legal entities through the provision of TA and training, subject to eligibility and performance criteria. In addition, the project will assist both ACC and the legal entities to enter into a financial relationship whereby ACC uses the legal entities as financial intermediaries (ACC extending a refinancing loan to the entities for on-lending to their members, thus increasing the global outreach of ACC in rural areas to the poor population).</p> <p>The budget allocated for institutional and financial strengthening of cooperatives and other legal entities in the project area amounts to US\$218,000 (JD 154,000), made available to the Government by the MoP from IFAD loan funds. The budget provides for: (i) recruitment of one international expert for a maximum of three months and recruitment of local training institutes for a maximum of 330 days over the first seven years; and (ii) two study tours in Egypt for members of governing bodies of the legal entities. Once cooperatives and legal entities have been strengthened by the project, the latter will ensure that part of MoP's subsidiary loan to ACC of approximately US\$1.6 million (JD 1.1 million) is used to finance their activities in the form of a revolving credit line.</p>
Jordan	16.	PROJ	OPER	RFI	Consideration should be given to establishing a credit unit within the project organization to ensure continuous, effective coordination and endow future projects with 'credit expertise' so that they play a more effective role with regard to credit outreach and monitoring of income-generating activities (IGAs). The project should meet the costs of a full-time officer seconded from ACC to head the unit and for the training, in assessing credit needs, of all extension officers involved in the project.	Following careful assessment of this recommendation, IFAD considered the strengthening of capacities and best practices of financial intermediaries to be more worthwhile, as this would ensure a more sustainable contribution to improving the access of rural poor to financial services.
Jordan	17.	PROJ	OPER	RFI	In order to reinforce the overall participatory approach in the project, consideration should be given to the possibility of using the services of an NGO prominent in the field of microfinance to provide skills not currently available, such as drawing up institutional arrangements for establishing credit groups.	Two NGOs have been selected by the MoP to provide training and capacity-building assistance to local associations/societies and to assume responsibility for following up their development projects. Training and TA is expected to be provided to around 30 associations/societies, of which one third may drop out. The NGOs are also responsible for channeling a grant to each association/society to finance their development projects, with grant ceilings of approximately US\$71,000 (JD 50,000).
Jordan	18.	PROJ	OPER	RFI	ACC should take steps to establish a clear, consistent relationship between the size and duration of loans on the one hand, and, on the other hand, the purposes for which they are to be used.	Contrary to current ACC practice, loans extended from the project credit line will be mostly short-term (up to 18 months) in order to match the production cycle of the activity financed. The duration of loans will not be based on the capacity of the guarantor to repay the

Country	Serial N°	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at Completion Point Recommendation	Programme Management Department Follow-up
						loan from salary deductions but on overall beneficiary cash flow (including that generated by the activity financed) and repayment capacity.
Jordan	19.	PROJ	STRAT	GDR	The design of future interventions should be based on the gender mainstreaming approach that is now a core aspect of IFAD interventions and support, although it is recognized that such mainstreaming must be adapted to local cultural circumstances.	The project aims at strengthening women's role in livestock and microenterprise development, and is creating channels and organizations that enable women to voice their opinions and play an active role in community management. These measures go hand-in-hand with raising awareness and training for women beneficiaries in the project area. The project approach and strategies for improving women's living conditions and social status are as follows: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - sensitization of decision-makers and field implementers on gender issues relevant to agricultural and rural development; - research and extension to identify and respond to women's needs; - promotion of on- and off-farm IGAs, including financial and marketing support; - advocacy in relation to girls' education, women's literacy and women's access to land and land titles; and - strengthening of women's organizations and their integration into the various phases of decision-making.
Jordan	20.	PROJ	OPER	ENT	The range of IGAs should be expanded following feasibility and marketing studies to identify products for which there is market demand and that are financially viable. These studies should be wide-ranging and include small-scale group production. There will probably be a need for some form of TA, both for the studies and to continue backstopping the activities identified.	The project has adopted a more comprehensive approach to IGAs thanks to similar IFAD experiences in the region. It is assisting the target group, especially women, to establish, finance, market and manage financially-rewarding small income-generating enterprises, to be undertaken in or near the home. TA is being provided for a feasibility study to identify a range of suitable income-generating opportunities for possible investment by beneficiaries. The project also offers a package of services addressing women beneficiaries' needs during each step of the development of their IGAs.
Jordan	21.	PROJ	OPER	TCB	Future interventions should place more emphasis on capacity-building for beneficiaries, including training in the organization of collective working, administration and marketing skills.	The package of services includes orientation programmes for the development of ideas and IGA choices, managerial and technical training, financial assistance and IGA monitoring and follow-up. Women attend orientation sessions aimed at helping them to identify feasible and profitable IGAs and make conscious choices. The orientation phase offers a clear explanation on how to distinguish between the different types of activities, for instance, whether a certain project is survivalist and seasonal or value-added and permanent; whether it requires a low or high level of start-up capital, etc. After orientation, women attend a basic management training course aimed at verifying the feasibility of the projects chosen and to prepare a basic feasibility study. The course includes sessions on financial management, marketing, project management and business plans. After attending managerial training and preparing business plans, women receive relevant technical training (if needed). The project then provides women borrowers with marketing assistance and technical and managerial follow-up.

Country	Serial N°	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at Completion Point Recommendation	Programme Management Department Follow-up
Jordan	22.	PROJ	OPER	GDR	Future interventions should consider funding women's centres, the need for which is twofold: first, they would be more cost-effective for poor women working collectively by sharing equipment, supplies and storage space, rather than working separately (e.g. from home, where space and resources are limited for larger-scale production); second, women's centres would assist in institutionalizing women's groups.	The project will work with women's groups in support of IGAs and literacy programmes. However, the establishment of women's centres was considered complex at this stage of development.
Jordan	23.	PROJ	OPER	ADV	An experienced local NGO should be contracted to train women development programme officers to apply participatory approaches methodically; and help establish women's groups for small enterprises. This might be the same NGO contracted to assist in introducing participatory approaches (see the section on participation in volume I)	<p>In order to train, support and empower the PMU's women-in-development (WID) team in gender dynamics in project planning and implementation, community participation and development, an NGO is providing both theoretical and on-the-job training by means of a gender-sensitive participatory needs assessment and by identifying women target groups, their capabilities, needs, priorities and aspirations. This training will enable the WID team to mainstream gender in the elaboration, implementation and M&E of community action plans and annual workplans</p> <p>More specifically, the project provides, through the above-mentioned specialized NGO, a capacity-building programme that targets the community development/WID team/extension agent and gender focal points in addressing the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - gender-sensitive needs assessment through participatory approaches; - project activity management and implementation, through participatory approaches; and - gender-sensitive M&E/impact assessment through participatory approaches.
Jordan	24.	PROJ	OPER	TCB	An appropriate package of institutional strengthening should be included in future projects, covering the technical training requirements of both beneficiaries and MoA staff, and sufficient to allow for the sensitization in, and introduction and adoption of, the suggested participatory methods. In addition assurances should be sought that identified staff needs and planned training activities will be fully funded during implementation.	The project provides significant training inputs for project staff and beneficiaries in relation to agricultural practices, soil and water conservation management and coordination, participatory processes, M&E and rural finance.
Jordan	25.	PROJ	OPER	PDM	The role of the regional agricultural coordination committee should be more clearly defined as an ongoing responsibility for the project's work programme. This might, for example, involve the approval of all areas to be developed and quality control of the project's construction activities.	A regional coordination committee will coordinate project activities at the governorate and district levels. Membership will include the heads of the directorates of agriculture in Karak, Tafila and Ma'an Governorates; ACC regional director; assistant to the secretary-general, southern region; representatives of the ministries of social services and environmental protection; Union of Voluntary Societies; and three beneficiaries, one a woman. The project manager will run day-to-day project activities and will also sit on the committee. The regional coordination committee chairperson will be selected by the members. Other members might include representatives of participating NGOs and staff of similar

Country	Serial N°	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at Completion Point Recommendation	Programme Management Department Follow-up
Jordan	26.	PROJ	OPER	ADV	The project should make wider use of assistance available in other departments of the MoA, both to address strategic issues (e.g. the marketing of olive oil) and to obtain technical support (e.g. by arranging training).	projects in the area. MoA's reorganization and decision to decentralize agricultural support services is expected to provide new opportunities for improved services. However, the relevant procedures have yet to be formulated. The project provides an opportunity to help MoA move towards decentralization while at the same time responding to requirements of policy reform, serving the project's field implementation needs and strengthening existing technical support services. Linkages will be finalized as part of ongoing implementation support and through the MTR.
Jordan	27.	PROJ	OPER	IME	Care should be taken also to link with MoA's M&E department in order to harmonize reporting on overall project progress.	The project provides an opportunity to help MoA move towards decentralization while at the same time responding to requirements of policy reform, serving the project's field implementation needs and strengthening existing technical support services. Linkages will be finalized as part of ongoing implementation support and through the MTR.
Jordan	28.	REG	OPER	IME	Consideration should be given to adopting the same M&E system devised for the Agricultural Resource Management Project in the Governorates of Karak and Tafila (ARMP) but in a wider context as there is potential for extending the methods used to many projects in the region. With appropriate support, ARMP-II could provide a local "centre of excellence" for training in M&E.	IFAD has designed and appraised a regional grant for developing local capacities and experiences in managing results and impact. This programme will draw on ARMP-II as a case study and resource for project M&E.
Lao People's Democratic Republic	1.	CTRY	STRAT	STR	A better qualitative poverty analysis and understanding of the livelihoods of the target beneficiaries should be developed to refine the project strategy for poverty reduction.	A livelihoods analysis was undertaken during preparation of the country strategic opportunities paper (COSOP) and the design of the Rural Livelihoods Improvement Programme in Attapeu and Sayabouri. Two livelihood studies have been undertaken in the project provinces: the first as part of COSOP preparation; the second prior to programme formulation. Programme design reflects the studies' findings.
Lao People's Democratic Republic	2.	CTRY	STRAT	TGT	The number of target villages should be realistic, based on lessons learned and the level of resources available. The number should not be so high as to risk favouring quantitative over qualitative achievements.	The interim evaluation report puts this figure at 30-100 villages per province. In the Northern Sayabouri Rural Development Project (NSRDP), 116 villages had at least three project activities and 72 villages had at least five over a six-year period. Therefore, the targeting of 114 villages in Sayabouri and 93 in Attapeu over eight years should not be too ambitious. The use of simple community mobilization and village-level planning procedures will also help ensure that the programme has the maximum coverage and poverty reduction impact.
Lao People's Democratic Republic	3.	CTRY	STRAT	TGT	The categorization <i>Lao Loum</i> (lowland), <i>Lao Theung</i> (midland) and <i>Lao Soung</i> (highland) should be abandoned and replaced with a strategy based on more recent poverty analysis and criteria.	The wording <i>Lao Loum</i> , <i>Lao Theung</i> and <i>Lao Soung</i> is no longer used for targeting purposes. In both the COSOP and the design of the Rural Livelihoods Improvement Programme in Attapeu and Sayabouri, area-based targeting criteria have been used, based on the Government's National Strategy for Growth and Poverty Eradication.
Lao People's	4.	CTRY	STRAT	ADV	Better planning is needed at the district level in order to	In the design of the Rural Livelihoods Improvement Programme in

Country	Serial N°	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at Completion Point Recommendation	Programme Management Department Follow-up
Democratic Republic					minimize the adverse impact of village migration (voluntary/involuntary) on livelihoods and project achievements.	Attapeu and Sayabouri, the issue of village migration was addressed in district-level planning. The programme will target villages where 30% or more of households are poor, in both the highlands and the lowlands. The programme will not target by ethnic group. The district AWP/Bs will ensure that programme interventions are properly planned. The subcomponent “strengthening the capacity for policy analysis” will help ensure that lessons learned from IFAD and other donor interventions are documented, disseminated, analysed and used to inform policy formulation.
Lao People’s Democratic Republic	5.	CTRY	STRAT	PPD	Better policy dialogue is needed between the Government and IFAD.	A policy unit has been set up in the Ministry of Foreign Affairs with support from IFAD and the Government of Germany to analyse lessons learned and feed policy proposals into government policy-making systems.
Lao People’s Democratic Republic	6.	CTRY	STRAT	ADV	New approaches to certain components and activities must be identified or developed to ascertain that they are usable and beneficial to the poorest.	The design of the programme included new approaches to addressing local constraints and needs for livelihood improvement.
Lao People’s Democratic Republic	7.	PROJ	OPER	PPD	In order to improve project interventions aimed at stabilizing shifting cultivation systems and practices, the latter should be analysed and documented further, possibly in collaboration with academic or research institutions in the Lao People’s Democratic Republic.	While research should continue, there is a sufficient mass of quality knowledge to form the basis for interventions in the highlands.
Lao People’s Democratic Republic	8.	PROJ	OPER	ADV	Before introducing new cash crops, a study should be made of marketing channels, market structures and prospects for new products.	For villages that are already integrated into the market economy, studies of marketing channels and value-added chains, and regular provision of price information will be part of the programme’s marketing activities. New products will not be introduced without ascertaining the availability of markets at attractive prices. For villages still largely outside the market economy, the programme will focus on improving household food security by increasing the productivity of their existing farming systems and diversifying crop and livestock production.
Lao People’s Democratic Republic	9.	PROJ	OPER	STR	The development of new approaches and strategies for sloping agriculture and stabilization of shifting cultivation should be pursued, using lessons from the National Agriculture and Forestry Research Institute (NAFRI) workshop in Luang Prabang Province held in early 2004. For non-timber forest products (NTFPs), this could be done by drawing on NAFRI/Ministry of Agriculture and Forestry (MoAF) experience regarding sustainable NTFP management at the community level and by organizing a study tour in Oudomxai and other provinces.	Programme design incorporates the findings of the Luang Prabang workshop. The proposed upland on-farm demonstrations are based on proven technologies for upland agriculture presented during the workshop. Proposals for natural resources management include introduction of sustainable village-level NTFP management.
Lao People’s Democratic Republic	10.	PROJ	OPER	ADV	Regarding livestock, the project should consider introducing improved animal feed management activities in collaboration with MoAF, NAFRI and the International Centre for Tropical Agriculture. These might include testing new pasture varieties and	Inclusion of fodder production in upland crop rotations with the objective of improving soil fertility, reducing erosion and improving animal nutrition is one of the technologies under consideration for inclusion in the participatory upland farming system demonstrations.

Country	Serial N°	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at Completion Point Recommendation	Programme Management Department Follow-up
					techniques that combine villages that have reduced access to grazing land with others pursuing intensified livestock production.	
Lao People's Democratic Republic	11.	PROJ	OPER	RFI	Lending services to remote, under-served areas and poorest households should be increased, just as loan procedures and requirements should be made easier. A wider range of savings and credit options that better match the different needs of poorer households should be considered, including short-term emergency loans.	With the ongoing reform of the banking system, IFAD funds can no longer be channelled through it to the programme area. Because the performance of the NSRDP credit component has been unsatisfactory in terms of repayment rates and reaching the poor, the programme will establish savings and credit societies in the villages to mobilize savings and loans. Such an approach will help meet the needs of the target group for investment and emergency loans. The programme will help capitalize these societies by providing matching grants.
Lao People's Democratic Republic	12.	PROJ	OPER	RFI	As for the high level of non-performing loans, an in-depth study should be conducted prior to continuing with credit activities.	As noted above, market studies will be carried out before supporting new income-generating activities.
Lao People's Democratic Republic	13.	PROJ	OPER	ADV	More comprehensive/specific market studies should be conducted before introduction or development of activities such as weaving, cash cropping, livestock and NTFPs for commercial use.	For the roads to be upgraded, the design document includes the classes to which they are to be upgraded. This will avoid the problems that plagued NSRDP.
Lao People's Democratic Republic	14.	PROJ	OPER	ADV	Supervision of civil works should be reinforced to ensure proper implementation.	The unit costs include a percentage for supervision of construction; if necessary, consultants will be hired to supervise construction.
Lao People's Democratic Republic	15.	PROJ	OPER	ADV	It is important to involve the beneficiaries fully in the infrastructure schemes (except major roads); and, at a different level, more attention should be paid to infrastructure software.	The programme design includes proposals for beneficiary participation in all infrastructure investments (except major roads) and provides funds for the training required.
Lao People's Democratic Republic	16.	PROJ	OPER	BEN	The central government will ensure proper policy guidance and coordination through participation in provincial steering committee meetings. Sufficient technical backstopping will also be ensured. Furthermore, a mechanism to ensure synergy, coordination and harmonization of policy guidance and technical support should be established, including the committee for planning and cooperation, Ministry of Foreign Affairs (MoFA), Ministry of Communication, Post, Transport and Construction, and MoAF. The mechanism will also ensure that there is a clear division of labour and responsibility between these institutions.	The department for international cooperation of MoFA will continue to be responsible for overall monitoring of the IFAD portfolio. The programme will help MoFA strengthen its capacity for policy analysis with inputs from MoAF and the committee for planning and cooperation. In addition, the programme includes a budget for national ministries to participate in meetings of the provincial social and economic development coordination committee and provide technical backstopping to their respective provincial departments.
Lao People's Democratic Republic	17.	GOV	PLCY	STR	The M&E system will be revised to include indicators of changes in living conditions, as per IFAD requirements.	The M&E system will include results and impact management system (RIMS) anchor indicators, designed to indicate changes in living conditions within the areas of intervention.
Lao People's Democratic Republic	18.	PROJ	OPER	IME	To sustain institutional capacity at the provincial and district project management unit (PPMU/DPMU) levels, it is essential to develop report-writing capacity through training and coaching.	Coaching from international TA should help improve the report-writing skills of programme management and coordination staff.
Lao People's Democratic Republic	19.	PROJ	OPER	TCB	Before initiating a new programme phase, IFAD should:	Programme design includes: (i) a training needs assessment to guide proposals for training the
Lao People's Democratic Republic	20a	PROJ	OPER	TCB		

Country	Serial N°	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at Completion Point Recommendation	Programme Management Department Follow-up
Republic					- ensure that programme design contains a more elaborate strategy for institutional strengthening, capacity-building and human resources development;	staff of the provincial agriculture and forestry office/district agriculture and forestry office and provide a coherent and appropriate approach to capacity-building;
Lao People's Democratic Republic	20b	PROJ	OPER	ADV	- ensure better integration of watershed management concepts in the livelihood analysis;	(ii) the natural resource management subcomponent includes land-use planning/land allocation activities and subsequent proposals for sustainable management of forestry and NTFP resources;
Lao People's Democratic Republic	20c	PROJ	OPER	IME	- ensure that greater emphasis is placed on M&E aspects in project design;	(iii) the programme plans to use the M&E database of the Oudomxai Community Initiatives Support Project (CISP), by which it will integrate the planning, budgeting, financing, reporting and M&E functions into a single system, thereby ensuring timely and effective M&E;
Lao People's Democratic Republic	20d	PROJ	OPER	PDM	- ensure better phasing of activities in project design;	(iv) the programme design includes careful phasing of activities, taking account of the need for capacity-building and the time required to introduce sustainable activities;
Lao People's Democratic Republic	20e	PROJ	OPER	PDM	- take steps, in cooperation with the Government, to improve the flow of funds;	(v) the fund flow procedures require no change, as shown by the CISP experience, since no delays have been encountered;
Lao People's Democratic Republic	20f	PROJ	OPER	PPD	- allocate more time for liaising with the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) as a project partner; and	(vi) there is no need to allocate time for liaising with UNDP as it will not be a cofinancier;
Lao People's Democratic Republic	20g	PROJ	OPER	TCB	- assist the local authorities with improved strategies and interventions to minimize the adverse social impact of village migrations.	(vii) regarding the programme's focus on the recently resettled/merged villages, e.g. for bush clearance and land development in Attapeu, support to activity groups will help minimize the adverse impact of village migration and reduce poverty among this particular group.
Lao People's Democratic Republic	20.	CI	OPER	SUP	Missions by UNOPS should be more frequent and focus on the appraisal report and annual workplans. They should also follow up more on the findings and recommendations of previous missions (preferably by sending the same persons) and be timed to coincide with the Lao People's Democratic Republic's fiscal year. UNOPS should send more of its own staff rather than contracted TA, and missions should include more agriculture and gender expertise.	These recommendations are entirely appropriate but their implementation requires a change in the contractual arrangements between IFAD and UNOPS, as this will increase supervision costs.
Lao People's Democratic Republic	21.	PROJ	OPER	HR	UNDP should explore ways of speeding up recruitment procedures for technical advisors.	As UNDP will not be providing any assistance to the programme, this recommendation is no longer applicable.
Lao People's Democratic Republic	22.	PROJ	OPER	SUP	UNDP should commit to more continuous monitoring of project activities, including regular field visits.	
Lao People's Democratic Republic	23.	PROJ	STRAT	PPD	Because NGOs are more "process-oriented" than "investment-oriented" and have gained valuable experience in participatory development approaches, collaboration with such entities should continue, including proper coordination with the Cooperative for Assistance and Relief Everywhere (CARE) and other NGOs operating in the project area.	As there are no national NGOs in the Lao People's Democratic Republic, programme design includes collaborative arrangements with international NGOs. In Sayabouri, the programme will provide investments that complement those of CARE in Sayabouri district. Parallel funding arrangements with the United Nations Fund for Population Activities for supporting dispensary construction with equipment, training and drug revolving funds, are

Country	Serial N°	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at Completion Point Recommendation	Programme Management Department Follow-up
Senegal	1.	CTRY	STRAT	STR	Review experience with a view to designing a second phase of the Rural Microenterprises Project (PROMER) that would cover the same project area.	proposed for Attapeu. A second phase of PROMER was recommended by the country programme evaluation undertaken in 2003 and confirmed in the COSOP of 2004. Following the interim evaluation, which paved the way by providing much useful information, the Promotion of Rural Entrepreneurship Project – Phase II (PROMER-II) was developed during the course of 2004, appraised in January 2005 and approved by the April 2005 session of the Executive Board with cofinancing from the West African Development Bank (BOAD). In addition to the four regions covered under the first phase (Fatick, Kaolack, Kolda and Tambacounda), phase II will extend geographical coverage to the four other regions where IFAD operations are ongoing (Matam, Louga, Diourbel and Thies). The total cost of the second phase amounts to US\$18.8 million. The IFAD and BOAD loans amount to US\$13.08 million and US\$2.03 million, respectively. Effectiveness was declared in January 2006 and the project was expected to become operational by July 2006.
Senegal	2.	PROJ	STRAT	ENT	Review experience in using the overall strategy that was developed based on the training/coaching (advisory support)/credit model at the rural microenterprises' location and with externalization of the financing function. The approach followed should not be exclusive with regard to the types of enterprises to be supported, whether in terms of sectors of activity or size, but should be differentiated as follows: single-person microenterprise, artisanal enterprise or enterprise with a vocation and potential to develop into small and medium-sized enterprises (SMEs).	PROMER-II will support the establishment/strengthening of a network of public and private advisory services for sustainable rural micro and small enterprises to replace PROMER business advisors: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Service providers to strengthen the capacities of rural micro and small enterprises, entrepreneurs and innovators in the areas where economic activities are more concentrated. - International Labour Organization (ILO) (specialized TA) to provide methodological support for capacity-building of service providers. - Periodic quality control of strengthened service providers ensured through: (a) each unit's M&E officer; (b) ILO's M&E unit; and (c) an ad hoc committee comprising representatives of beneficiaries, service providers, MFIs and the project, mandated to decide on the renewal of the yearly authorization to access project support funds. - Future financial sustainability of service providers ensured by: (a) project-supported rural micro and small enterprises, entrepreneurs and innovators; and (b) strengthening of their capacities.
Senegal	3.	PROJ	OPER	TGT	Interventions during the second phase should not be directed exclusively to SMEs at the risk of directly or indirectly excluding poor categories in the communities involved.	The approach adopted under PROMER-II is differentiated according to types of enterprises, so to avoid excluding the poorest categories: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Awareness-building of target populations by local NGOs to take advantage of their proximity; focus on the poorest. - Three types of services offered by non-financial service providers: (a) general advisory support: rapid project or enterprise assessment to define a development and training plan; (b) specific

Country	Serial N°	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at Completion Point Recommendation	Programme Management Department Follow-up
						(and punctual) support: adapted to the needs of each entrepreneur and facilitating the development and sustainability of the enterprise/activity; and (c) follow-up support: creation of an advice-oriented culture at the enterprise level. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - General advisory support for all entrepreneurs, specific support and follow-up on demand. - Policy dialogue to amend the official definitions of enterprises (<i>Charte des entreprises</i>) with a view to refining the definition of micro and small entrepreneurs.
Senegal	4.	PROJ	OPER	TGT	In selecting project areas, priority will be given to a pragmatic approach that should not oppose village or <i>département</i> seat location. The geographic positioning of the intervention in a region should be based on a combination of certain minimum criteria: availability of raw materials, accessibility, actual or potential presence of financial services and outlook for a cost-effective advisory support service due to the existence of a potential for developing economic activities.	The strategy adopted by PROMER-II is to concentrate interventions on areas characterized by strong development potential for rural micro and small enterprises. These high-potential areas are to be identified during a study carried out at project start-up.
Senegal	5.	PROJ	OPER	TGT	The extension zones for PROMER activities should correspond to the intervention zones of other projects funded by IFAD so as to maximize complementarities and synergies that will require effective coordination of interventions.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Extension of PROMER-II to the four regions covered by ongoing IFAD agricultural development interventions in the country. - Rural finance support unit (SAFIR) to serve all ongoing IFAD projects. - Specific memorandum of understanding to be signed between PROMER and individual projects.
Senegal	6.	PROJ	OPER	ENT	The funding question is central to the problem of emergence and consolidation of rural microenterprises. PROMER's vocation to intervene in zones covered by other IFAD-financed projects will facilitate its ability to integrate a TA service into the projects. This service could be delivered by an internal cell with the necessary skills, but priority should be given to contracting an external specialist. International TA could complete the scheme.	<p>PROMER-II will outsource financial services by setting up a special service mechanism to support rural finance – SAFIR, in the context of this project and of other ongoing IFAD interventions in Senegal. The setting up and running of SAFIR will be entrusted to a specialized operator, the regional rural finance unit of UNCDF. Signing of the TA contract is a condition for loan disbursement.</p> <p>SAFIR's role is to: (a) establish contracts among all IFAD projects and one or more MFI to ensure sustainable access to financing for beneficiaries; (b) develop new products and services adapted to beneficiary needs; (c) strengthen the capacity of MFIs based in the project area; (d) create new credit unions in the groups of MFIs selected on the basis of calls for bids; (e) strengthen the capacity of partners such as the National Organization of Microfinance Institutions and the Ministry of Economy and Finance's TA support unit.</p> <p>PROMER-II will also provide support to MFIs to ensure financing for rural micro and small enterprises, entrepreneurs and innovators. A medium-term credit line, financed by BOAD, is to be implemented exclusively for MFIs, allowing for the financing of their medium-term clients (rural micro and small enterprises in particular, as well as other projects' producer groups/associations).</p>

Country	Serial N°	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at Completion Point Recommendation	Programme Management Department Follow-up
Senegal	7.	PROJ	OPER	ENT	Creation of a sustainable advisory service for rural microenterprises should be one of the objectives of the second phase. The process of withdrawal and empowerment of this service should be provided for at project design and planned for in the time allotted. Right from the outset, the principle of progress billing for services, particularly for commercial and training functions, which the entrepreneurs seem to be ready to take over when quality services are provided and the positive impacts are clear, should be adopted in a modular manner. The cost of the coaching services cannot be borne solely by the beneficiaries but must also be seen from the perspective of subsidy and duration, especially considering contributions from the State and local collectives.	PROMER-II foresees the progressive, differential financing of service costs by users, based on their ability to pay (per category of entrepreneurs, to be assessed at implementation start-up) and the type of services involved: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - general advisory support paid at 100% by the project; - specific advisory support paid at a maximum of 90% by the project and by government support funds; beneficiaries to contribute a minimum of 10% of service costs; - follow-up support paid by the project at 66% during the first year and 34% during the second (difference taken care of by rural micro/small enterprises supported under the project); and - specific innovation support paid at 50-100% by the project, depending on the type of support and beneficiaries involved. Specific mechanisms are proposed to ensure the sustainability of government contributions to the various funds, but feasibility will be further assessed during the MTR in light of the rapidly changing environment in Senegal (e.g. other funds are to be set up by the Government, which could also include those established under PROMER-II).
Senegal	8.	PROJ	OPER	IME	It would be appropriate from the outset to establish an M&E and indicator system to take account of all the characteristics of rural microenterprises. The annual audits on accounting, financial and procedural matters should also be able to intervene in the internal information system.	Strong emphasis has been placed on the development of a functional M&E system compatible with IFAD's results and impact management system and the establishment of a well-thought-out baseline situation. This will make it possible to monitor and evaluate impact on the different categories of rural enterprises and entrepreneurs. <p>Funds were allocated for this activity during the first six months of implementation. Methodological support will also be provided by partners in the project (ILO and UNCDF).</p>
Tunisia	1.	CTRY	STRAT	STR	It is recommended that a second-phase intervention be financed to consolidate project results and deepen their impact.	Follow-up in ACP. The partners agreed that a second phase should be formulated along two major lines: (i) to maximize agricultural and non-agricultural value-added; and (ii) to safeguard natural resources. <p>Action. The second phase was approved by the December 2005 session of the Executive Board. Furthermore, Project Development Facility B (PDF-B) resources under the Global Environment Facility (GEF) are being used to institutionalize more sustainable land management practices as part of the second phase.</p>
Tunisia	2.	CTRY	STRAT	STR	The project should adopt a truly participatory approach in the context of a local government in which agrosylvo-pastoral and off-farm activities coupled with proximity services will have a strategic scope for and impact on local development dynamics. This implies strategic choices in terms of instruments and modes of intervention, as well as efficient institutional arrangements that can better reconcile the dynamics of local actors and institutions.	Follow-up in ACP. The partners agreed that, in formulating the next project phase, the Governorate of Siliana, the Government, IFAD, AFD and other partners, should ensure that the content and financial/institutional scope of the proposed approach encompasses: (i) multisector development; and (ii) improving the capacity of the population, technical services, NGOs, etc., through a participatory approach to planning and local programming. <p>Action. These principles were adopted in the appraisal of the</p>

Country	Serial N°	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at Completion Point Recommendation	Programme Management Department Follow-up
Tunisia	3.	CTRY	STRAT	STR	To this end, IFAD should support government efforts to accelerate the development process and reduce rural poverty in the Governorate of Siliana. The approaches proposed should have the potential to reconcile the imperative of conserving natural resources with the need to diversify revenue sources and improve living standards for poor populations, particularly in micro zones (generally sub-watersheds), where concentrated interventions should be capable of bringing about change and generating multiple and lasting socio-economic effects. Support instruments should be also adapted to the diversity of local development actors to ensure basic investments and promotion of local private initiatives.	second phase.
Tunisia	4.	PROJ	STRAT	NRM	Ensuring the permanence of soil and water conservation work will require support to gradually develop a sense of ownership among farmers involved in maintenance and development. The future support strategy for conservation work should be based on a more participatory approach, using techniques adapted to the environment. Such a strategy should be reflected in an overall soil and water conservation plan that is both consistent and precise in terms of financing and implementation arrangements, in accordance with specific conditions in place in the various sub-zones of the governorate.	<p>Follow-up in ACP. In preparing for a second phase, IFAD will obtain TA for the Regional Agricultural Development Commission (CRDA) to design soil and water conservation measures based on an overall programme. This will include implementation plans for each micro basin following a participatory approach that involves farmers and takes account of specific land conditions. The departments of the Ministry of Agriculture, Environment and Water Resources, including CRDA, will endeavour to take innovative technical and normative initiatives that reflect the participatory approach to planning and programming, in accordance with the Soil and Water Conservation Code of 1995. They will also favour the creation of conditions that ensure permanence for farmer organizations and local consultative bodies, encouraging them to take increased responsibility for maintenance and sustainable development of the infrastructure established.</p> <p>Action. A preliminary study was completed on the technical and socio-economic impact of soil and water conservation works. This study provided a number of alternatives for decreasing the establishment and maintenance costs of these techniques, thereby rendering them more affordable to producers, and for tailoring selected techniques to producers' production systems. A more participatory approach to soil and water conservation will be piloted using GEF/PDF-B resources and subsequently institutionalized within the operations of CRDA.</p>
Tunisia	5.	PROJ	OPER	NRM	CRDA should address the consolidation of pasture improvements and application of proper management methods, focusing on the following: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - diversifying the standard model for pasture improvements implemented to date; and - providing training to technicians and promoters of the animal husbandry and pasture agency and CRDA to familiarize them with methods for sustainable management of pasture improvements introduced on 	<p>Follow-up in ACP. The partners agreed that CRDA will refer to integrated forestry management projects in formulating participatory management plans for communally-owned forests, involving neighbouring residents in the protection, conservation, development and sustainable use of resources. CRDA will endeavour to develop non-timber forest products (rosemary, Aleppo pine nuts [zgougou], acorns, mushrooms, medicinal plants) and refine methods both for sustainable participatory management and for assisting residents to enter local, regional and national</p>

Country	Serial N°	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at Completion Point Recommendation	Programme Management Department Follow-up
					private, collective and communal land.	markets. The partners agreed that CRDA will promote the organization of residents into forestry groups with the status of microenterprises working in partnership with the forestry service, to ensure sustainable participatory management of forests, guarantee their permanence and improve their production potential. The partners agreed that CRDA, with TA support, will work to develop and realize the foraging potential of communally-owned forest lands as well as private and collective territory in the project area, and will formulate ways of enabling sustainable development and responsible participatory, use of such areas for pasture improvement. Action. The lead implementing agency for the second phase will use GEF/PDF-B resources to assess the feasibility of participatory forestry development and the profitability/environmental sustainability of forestry-related enterprises.
Tunisia	6.	PROJ	OPER	NRM	Wooded areas are large in size and suitable for forestry, and, given their social, economic and environmental importance to the region, the forestry development component should occupy a much larger place than it did during the first phase. The creation of forestry groups will be extended to all parts of the project area suitable for forestry, and their status as microenterprises in partnership with the forestry service will be strengthened to increase their involvement in forestry and pasture improvement.	
Tunisia	7.	PROJ	OPER	INR	The experience with participatory development in the forest clearings of Bargou will be consolidated and replicated in other areas of the region that are suitable for forestry.	
Tunisia	8.	PROJ	OPER	INR	Given the relevance of the research and development approach and themes, these activities have shown results that warrant being capitalized, consolidated and	Follow-up in ACP. The partners agreed that the Government, IFAD, AFD and other partners will ensure that substantial human, financial and material resources are allocated to consolidate

Country	Serial N°	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at Completion Point Recommendation	Programme Management Department Follow-up
					extended by the Siliana CRDA. Additional budgetary and human resources should be allocated to this activity.	research and development activities and extend the findings of the first phase of the project (reference groups, Bargou peach, feed blocks, direct seeding), while concentrating themes of subsequent research in micro zones upstream of hill reservoirs.
Tunisia	9.	PROJ	OPER	ADV	It would be preferable and more effective, in carrying out research activities, to use flexible financial arrangements that take account of the real needs of researchers and institutions called upon to provide follow-up and training of beneficiaries. Research and development, which was initially organized around the two major pillars of support and outreach, should be expanded. This will include establishing experimental protocols on plots, research for extension and dissemination to spread research and development findings.	Action. The research and development activities conducted in the first phase will be continued in the second phase through piloting a privatized extension and technical advisory service. These technical advisory services will also include the dissemination of market information.
Tunisia	10.	PROJ	OPER	GDR	The wide discrepancy between women's development issues as diagnosed and the measures proposed to solve them should be narrowed down. It is recommended that the consultative approach proposed for the project as a whole be applied through a participatory procedure to target beneficiaries and plan for interventions.	Follow-up in ACP. The partners agreed that any future project should devote more attention to rural women and their main agricultural activities. CRDA and the second-phase project will adopt, together with local authorities, a participatory approach to targeting beneficiaries and planning interventions. This will involve supporting consultative bodies and working towards transforming them into true forums for discussion and negotiation at the level of each <i>imada</i> . The most vulnerable areas within the Governorate of Siliana, mainly those in the south, will be targeted.
Tunisia	11.	PROJ	OPER	ORG	Support should continue to be provided for consultative bodies such as those created by the project, and for work on transforming them into true forums for discussion and negotiation at the level of each district (<i>imada</i>).	Action. Adopted in the appraisal of the second phase.
Tunisia	12.	CTRY	STRAT	ENT	It is clearly crucial, based on diagnostic studies, to support local initiatives to develop microenterprises in the project area. It is also essential to develop a regional operating strategy to promote local entrepreneurship in the form of a pool providing a wide range of services to guide small projects through their development to completion.	Follow-up in ACP. The partners agreed that diagnostic studies will be financed by IFAD. These studies will be specific to the advantages and limitations of local initiatives in the Governorate of Siliana, particularly in disadvantaged micro zones, with the objective of identifying financial, institutional and economic factors that impede the development of microenterprises. The studies should also provide several options (Environmental Development Action in the Third World, among others) to create, using decentralized micro lending and medium-sized loans, true opportunities for sustainable development of local initiatives. Action. The diagnostic studies so far financed have led to the forging of partnerships with institutions responsible for assisting job seekers and promoting private investments in Siliana Governorate, and have been discussed with concerned agencies. These institutions have more institutional linkages to rural finance agencies and should thus facilitate access to credit for producers and entrepreneurs.
Tunisia	13a	PROJ	OPER	ADV	In order to capitalize on experience gained under the first phase, the Office of Evaluation recommends that CRDA should: - make every effort, and as a matter of urgency, to establish a dynamic data base, lacking during the first	Follow-up in ACP. The partners agreed that CRDA will receive support in the form of external expertise financed by IFAD. Such expertise will guide CRDA in capitalizing on best practices for managing the natural environment and in community-based research and development, to be documented in the form of

Country	Serial N°	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at Completion Point Recommendation	Programme Management Department Follow-up
					phase, which would enable integrated development programmes to be prepared for each micro basin;	manuals and reference materials for use by the regional and national institutions concerned.
Tunisia	13b	PROJ	OPER	ADV	- create technical references and document major experiences and lessons learned with regard to agro-sylvo-pasture and community development, research and development, and soil and water conservation;	Action. The PMU has made a first attempt at capitalization with the production of a comprehensive completion report. Design of the second phase also makes provision for the dissemination of documentation and information.
Tunisia	13c	PROJ	OPER	IME	- put in place a suitable M&E system and assign staff with the necessary skills, particularly in data processing and analysis over space and time; and	
Tunisia	13d	PROJ	OPER	IME	- set up a communications unit within the M&E system to be responsible for the dissemination of experience and lessons learned during the course of project implementation, both at the regional and national levels.	
Tunisia	14.	CTRY	OPER	SUP	Periodic evaluations and technical reviews of project interventions should be conducted by the Government, IFAD, AFD and their partners, with support from consultants and independent experts, and be organized on the basis of technical and financial project reports. This would enable adjustments to be made to human and financial resources and introduce needed flexibility for sound project implementation and for supporting new initiatives.	
Tunisia	15.	PROJ	OPER	NRM	For the second phase, the partners have agreed to include a land regularization component for rainfed land, in conjunction with the Agricultural Land Agency.	This component has been included in the second phase and will be funded under the sustainable land management component (GEF).
Tunisia	16.	PROJ	OPER	TCB	The partners have agreed to support training for PMU and CRDA technicians and to provide TA to the latter organization.	Training will commence with project start-up and focus mainly on the participatory approach. Such training has been budgeted for under the GEF/PDF B.
Viet Nam Quang Binh	1.	PROJ	STRAT	PDM	Project components should be linked and mutually reinforcing.	The provincial programme steering committee is responsible for coordinating project activities with provincial development plans. The PPMU is responsible for coordinating AWP/B activities at the provincial level through monthly, quarterly and annual meetings involving activity managers (AMs) and other contracted service providers. A project coordination committee has been established within the PPMU for this purpose. Membership involves AMs and other key staff from implementing agencies, together with sectoral heads/coordinators from within the PPMU. The committee meets on a quarterly basis to finalize relevant workplans/budgets, and every month to review progress against the quarterly workplans. A similar committee formed within the DPMU will be responsible for coordinating and monitoring inputs at the district level. The community programme management units (CPMUs) are

Country	Serial N°	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at Completion Point Recommendation	Programme Management Department Follow-up
						responsible for coordinating project activities at the commune level. The CPMUs hold monthly planning/review meetings attended by village management group/self-management board (VMG/SMB) heads from target villages. The project-funded community facilitators (CFs) are responsible for coordinating all participatory processes during implementation. Village-level activities are coordinated by the VMGs (Ha Giang) and SMBs (Quang Binh) on behalf of their villages.
Viet Nam Quang Binh	2.	PROJ	STRAT	PDM	Project design should be sufficiently flexible to allow for modification during implementation, in response to changes in the operating environment.	Project financing is substantially decentralized through the establishment of commune-level local development budgets (LDBs) to finance capacity-building and infrastructure development priorities. The LDBs are directly controlled by the communes. The establishment of these budgets, together with a development reserve fund to be reallocated between components by the MTR, provides a considerable degree of flexibility to allow the project to respond directly to the demands of target communities. Participatory needs assessments carried out in project villages on an annual basis will determine which activities will be supported in individual villages.
Viet Nam Quang Binh	3.	PROJ	STRAT	TGT	All project components and activities should be implemented across all project sites and not selectively targeted to individual districts and communes.	This has been done to a greater extent; however, activities under the production support component are area-specific.
Viet Nam Quang Binh	4.	PROJ	STRAT	PDM	Project design should be simplified, with fewer components and activities.	The project has been greatly simplified to include three components; however, the production support component involves many activities.
Viet Nam Quang Binh	5.	PROJ	OPER	ADV	Recent measures enabling property titles to be issued jointly to husband and wife should be actively propagated through country-wide organizations like the Women's Union (WU).	Done.
Viet Nam Quang Binh	6.	CTRY	OPER	SUP	Arrangements for supervision and loan administration need improvement and continuity to provide for more regular support and prompt follow-up.	IFAD's field presence is helping in this regard.
Viet Nam Quang Binh	7.	CTRY	OPER	PPD	Further resources should be allocated to promote IFAD's influence on policy dialogue, better cooperation with other development organizations and follow-up on implementation issues.	Emphasis is placed on a province-led process of policy dialogue and project development with linkages to national policies and programmes so that the project can function as a "laboratory" for the Government's decentralization and targeted rural development initiatives.
Viet Nam Quang Binh	8.	PROJ	STRAT	TGT	Activities under phase II should focus on fewer communes, mainly those located in the disadvantaged coastal regions and in the remoter hilly regions of the interior.	Whereas the first-phase Agricultural Resources Conservation and Development Project (ARCDP) in Quang Binh Province covered all province communes, the Decentralized Programme for Rural Poverty Reduction (DPRPR) in Ha Giang and Quang Binh Provinces focuses on the 45 poorest communes in the interests of better integration of components and impact.
Viet Nam Quang Binh	9.	PROJ	OPER	PDM	Specific, achievable and measurable objectives need to be set for each project component and activity.	An M&E system is being set up. The M&E section of each PPMU is responsible for establishing a project M&E system, based on IFAD's framework for its RIMS.
Viet Nam	10.	PROJ	OPER	ORG	Project-specific institutions should be created at the	The commune people's committee (CPC), through the CPMU, is

Country	Serial N°	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at Completion Point Recommendation	Programme Management Department Follow-up
Quang Binh					grass-roots level as and when essential; relations between existing institutions and project-specific institutions should be clearly articulated.	responsible for coordinating, implementing, monitoring, supervising and reporting on project activities at the commune/village level. Village meetings are the main forums for key decision-making at the village level. Representative structures will take the form of VMGs in Ha Giang and SMBs in Quang Binh. These institutions comprise the village head; head of the WU; village extension worker(s); village teacher and two representatives from poor households (one woman and one man) elected every year from each hamlet/village.
Viet Nam Quang Binh	11.	PROJ	OPER	ORG	The project should aim to strengthen existing institutions and mass organizations in terms of awareness, capacity and transparency; their role in participatory processes should be formalized.	Key CPMU staff seconded from the CPC is entitled to a project allowance. A small allowance from the commune budget is provided to each VMG/SMB to cover the costs of routine village meetings and of attending CPMU meetings.
Viet Nam Quang Binh	12.	PROJ	OPER	RFI	The rural credit component should be thoroughly redesigned to take account of existing sources of credit, prevailing interest rates and realistic incentives for financing institutions.	The project promotes: (i) credit and savings groups, self-financed and self-managed institutions formed by poorest, poor and average households to provide savings opportunities and loans that match members' needs, on terms and conditions that allow them to finance the start-up or development of an income-generating activity to increase their incomes; (ii) capacity-building of group members as well as the Viet Nam Bank for Social Policies (VBSP) and of country-wide organizations to upgrade their capacity to provide financial and non-financial services to group members and to form, train, monitor and supervise such groups; and (iii) institutional strengthening and policy dialogue with VBSP at the provincial and national levels.
Viet Nam Quang Binh	13.	PROJ	OPER	TGT	Special provisions may be necessary for remote communes in hilly areas.	The project also supports various forms of in-kind credit schemes for remote villages/hamlets for which logistical difficulties inevitably increase transaction costs to an unsustainable level.
Viet Nam Quang Binh	14.	PROJ	OPER	ADV	The allocation of commune development fund resources should be based on clearly established criteria such as village sizes and numbers of poor households, and on the institutional capacity of the community development boards.	The total amount allocated to an individual commune is weighted to take account of its total population and distance to the district centre. The CPMU allocates village infrastructure development budget funds to individual villages using a similar demographic formula based on the number of households in the village as a proportion of total households in the commune.
Viet Nam Quang Binh	15.	PROJ	OPER	MKT	Small enterprise and market-information systems should be established to help farmers and fishers market their produce without recourse to middlemen.	The capacity of selected farmers is to be developed to enable them to operate as traders. This should help households to market their produce locally and obtain information on market prices.
Viet Nam Quang Binh	16.	PROJ	OPER	GDR	For women in rural areas, support should be provided for on-farm and off-farm employment opportunities and the introduction of labour-saving technologies.	The focus in Quang Binh would be to provide support for small-scale off-farm enterprises, including value addition to agricultural produce at the household level.
Viet Nam Quang Binh	17.	PROJ	OPER	IME	Effective M&E and management information systems should be put in place, with clarification of decision-making functions and information needs at various levels, and matching reporting procedures.	The system is based on four different levels of monitoring: inputs; outputs; outcomes; and impact. For the first three, the main sources of information will be AWP/Bs, district and commune plans, and the quarterly and annual physical and financial progress reports consolidated by PPMU. Information on outcomes will come largely from targeted evaluations carried out by M&E staff of the PPMU. Participatory impact assessment (PIA), successfully tested under

Country	Serial N°	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at Completion Point Recommendation	Programme Management Department Follow-up
						ARCDP and the Ha Giang Development Project for Ethnic Minorities (HPM), will be the main tool for assessing project impact.
Viet Nam Quang Binh	18.	PROJ	OPER	IME	Reports should be disseminated electronically and M&E systems digitalized.	The M&E section of the PPMU will develop standard formats for conducting the PIAs. District community facilitators and community facilitators (CFs) will be fully trained in the use of these formats.
Viet Nam Quang Binh	19.	PROJ	OPER	IME	Computer terminals should be located at each technical implementing unit/district implementation unit office and commune served by the project, and linked to a wide-area network.	Done.
Viet Nam Quang Binh	20.	PROJ	OPER	IME	A database should be designed for PMU and technical departments, including appropriate database access systems and security mechanisms.	An M&E system is being developed.
Viet Nam Quang Binh	21.	PROJ	OPER	HR	Under the second phase, consideration should given to deploying technical staff from relevant departments on a full-time basis rather than project-related responsibilities being carried out on a part-time basis.	In Quang Binh, two coordinators have been designated within the departments of agriculture and rural development (DARD) and of fisheries and charged with responsibility for providing technical and material resources needed for successful project implementation. Each coordinator oversees the work of several AMs from relevant technical departments. These AMs will have full authority and responsibility for use of project funds allocated under approved AWP/Bs.
Viet Nam Quang Binh	22.	PROJ	OPER	HR	Field-based CFs should be employed directly by the project.	Suitable persons have been recruited to act as full-time CFs in each commune.
Viet Nam Quang Binh	23.	PROJ	OPER	ADV	Participatory rural assessments (PRAs) should be carried out by specially trained teams under the guidance of the CFs; they should not be sectorally-based.	Village-level PRAs/needs assessments are carried out separately, on an annual basis, to identify infrastructure and extension/production needs.
Viet Nam Quang Binh	24.	PROJ	OPER	TCB	Further investment is required to build up the capacity and outreach of various line agencies, particularly extension services for agriculture and aquaculture, and for equipment and training in the newly established Ministry of Natural Resources and Environment.	The project supports the strengthening of extension services at all levels through provision of training, vehicles, equipment and an operating budget.
Viet Nam Quang Binh	25.	PROJ	OPER	TCB	Two courses of action are needed with regard to training and capacity-building: creation of archives of training manuals and other reference documents; and the institutionalization of regular training within departments.	The project supports the development of improved farmer extension materials and production/updating of extension handbooks covering a range of key production areas, including regenerative agricultural technologies, livestock production, animal health, forest development and management, and aquaculture.
Viet Nam Quang Binh	26.	PROJ	OPER	ADV	The costs of building roads and other infrastructure must be carefully monitored and controlled.	The costs of building roads and other infrastructure will be carefully monitored.
Viet Nam Quang Binh	27.	PROJ	OPER	ADV	The project should consider tarring inter-commune roads from the outset to avoid ongoing maintenance costs. Infrastructural improvements should be part of an overall plan rather than standalone interventions.	This issue may arise during planning exercises.
Viet Nam Quang Binh	28.	PROJ	OPER	TCB	Training in equitable and sustainable water management must be provided.	Immediately after approval of the village infrastructure workplan, user groups/scheme management committees will be established.
Viet Nam	29.	PROJ	OPER	TCB	Further training is required for the establishment of an	The project will also provide the services of national consultants to

Country	Serial N°	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at Completion Point Recommendation	Programme Management Department Follow-up
Quang Binh					effective agricultural extension service, as well as careful screening of staff to assess their motivation and suitability.	fill critical gaps in the skills of the department of agriculture and rural development and FEC.
Viet Nam Quang Binh	30.	PROJ	OPER	ADV	Specific objectives should be established for the extension service, and monitored to ensure that they meet farmer needs.	The project assists in the training of key farmers and developing the farmer-field school concept around demonstrations implemented in the communes.
Viet Nam Quang Binh	31.	PROJ	OPER	NRM	Afforestation of sand dunes should be community-based and targets match community needs rather than (necessarily) following an overall 'chequerboard' plan.	Activities will include: (i) selection of culturally preferred forestry and agro-forestry species, using participatory approaches, in selected communes; (ii) establishment of seedling nurseries in each commune for large-scale production of forestry, agroforestry and forage tree/legume species; and (iii) promotion of tree planting on farms, allocated barren land and allocated forest land.
Viet Nam Quang Binh	32.	PROJ	OPER	BEN	Villagers' experience in afforestation should be exploited by the project through involving communities in setting targets and planning activities.	Afforestation of approximately 3,250 hectares (ha) of unused/degraded upland and 1,500 ha of sandy coastal land is expected, subject to allocation of such land to poor households.
Viet Nam Quang Binh	33.	PROJ	OPER	NRM	New plantations should be included under existing forestry protection schemes to provide a direct incentive to villagers to protect them.	The project will support agroforestry, afforestation and community-based forest management to improve the forest cover and prevent land degradation.
Viet Nam Quang Binh	34.	PROJ	OPER	ENT	Efforts to promote income generation in the coastal communities should concentrate on small-scale activities. In view of the initial investment costs involved, shrimp farming is not appropriate for poor households unless sustainable group-based initiatives can be designed.	Agreed.
Viet Nam Ha Giang	1.	CTRY	STRAT	STR	Given the need to consolidate investments in the less-favoured communes of the former project area, the interim evaluation recommended that there should be a second phase of the IFAD-funded HPM, provided that lessons learned in the first phase and evaluation recommendations are scrupulously applied. IFAD should continue to develop follow-up interventions in line with its current strategy of area-based, multisectoral and single-province projects, promoting good governance and sharing learning with other donors; and concentrate on the provision of productive assets, usable technical know-how and support for infrastructure that will contribute to improving the food security and livelihoods of the poor.	DPRPR is an area-based, multi-sectoral programme that covers two provinces. Particular emphasis is placed on the use of highly decentralized, community-driven development approaches that promote good governance, building on lessons learned during the first phase of HPM.
Viet Nam Ha Giang	2.	CTRY	STRAT	TGT	The impact of project interventions is to be enhanced and activities from the first phase of HPM consolidated, simplified and improved by targeting activities to fewer communes both in an integrated manner and with better inter-component linkages.	Whereas the first phase of HPM covered all the communes in the province, DPRPR activities in Ha Giang province focus on the 48 poorest communes with a view to enhancing impact and effectiveness.
Viet Nam Ha Giang	3.	CTRY	STRAT	IME	IFAD should provide greater support during implementation. This should include, inter alia, improved M&E, constant assessment of results and progress, more effective supervision of its operations,	UNOPS/IFAD have stepped up efforts to ensure implementation support in the initial stages of DPRP. A participatory start-up workshop was held with the participation of commune, district and province-level staff; a programme expeditor has been seconded,

Country	Serial N°	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at Completion Point Recommendation	Programme Management Department Follow-up
					liaison with partners and government.	and a number of TA positions have been filled. The visit of an M&E specialist backed up by policy support is planned. IFAD-supported field presence has greatly contributed to these endeavours.
Viet Nam Ha Giang	4.	CTRY	STRAT	PPD	IFAD is to engage, directly and indirectly, in policy dialogue at the provincial and central levels by playing a catalytic role through the project and in close collaboration and consultation with other international organizations.	Within the overall umbrella of the DPRPR, IFAD is providing a grant of US\$600,000 in support of capacity-building for policy and programme development. Systematic reviews of lessons learned are to be undertaken by key provincial agencies and other donors working in the two provinces, and lesson-sharing will be encouraged with other like-minded donors. Through the policy support grant, policy dialogue between the project and provincial/central government is to be promoted.
Viet Nam Ha Giang	5.	CTRY	STRAT	STR	IFAD should consider using its grant resources in support of loan funding. The Fund could also strive more actively to mobilize funding from other sources, especially TA grant funding. Time, resources and grant financing to facilitate the performance of such activities should be explicitly built into the follow-on project design.	The policy and programme development (PPD) grant comprises five interlinked activities: (i) joint learning of locally-relevant development and poverty reduction priorities; (ii) promotion of best practice/innovations; (iii) policy advocacy through multi-media; (iv) e-networking; and (v) forging of development partnerships. This assistance addresses an important emerging need for learning and building on experience accumulated in the context of the Government's strategy for poverty reduction and rural development that emphasizes decentralized, participative community-based development coupled with targeted support to the poor, minorities and socio-economically weaker sections.
Viet Nam Ha Giang	6.	CTRY	STRAT	PPD	IFAD is to foster strategic partnerships with the Government, building on its good working relations with ministries and departments at the central and provincial levels as well as with project staff, other international development organizations and the NGO sector. It will coordinate with government and donor projects/programmes and identify complementarities, linkages and synergies with stakeholders in pursuit of the objective of reducing poverty through policy dialogue and partnership-building.	The PPD grant is to be used for sharing learning with Government and other donors. Mechanisms will be included to ensure adequate links with central-level agencies responsible for formulating and implementing poverty reduction policies and programmes and with other forums such as the Partnership to Assist Poorest Communes and the Ministry of Planning and Investment's focal point on rural development. This is intended to ensure that the decentralization approaches tested by DPRPR are closely followed at the central level and used to inform the national policy/programme formulation process.
Viet Nam Ha Giang	7.	PROJ	OPER	STR	Facilitate an attitudinal change in district thinking by adopting farmer-to-farmer and village-based communication and extension systems and by allocating resources to small farmer development activities.	Villages are grouped into blocks within communes, and key farmer training initially focused on pilot villages within each block. Considerable emphasis will be placed on the quality of key farmer training, laying the foundation for farmer-to-farmer and village-to-village dissemination of improved production practices.
Viet Nam Ha Giang	8.	PROJ	OPER	TCB	Generate a better understanding of participatory methodologies at all levels of commune and district agencies and focus on building up the capacity for genuine participatory project management.	DPRPR supports routine village needs assessments (and their revision), area-based resource analyses and preparation of village development plans based on such analyses.
Viet Nam Ha Giang	9.	PROJ	OPER	TCB	Increase focus on local capacity-building and the availability of qualified persons for design and supervision of infrastructure.	New norms should be established with regard to the physical and financial management of small, community-identified and implemented initiatives. This will ensure that communities are not over-burdened with procedures more appropriate to large-scale infrastructure works and that the programme has the required

Country	Serial N°	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at Completion Point Recommendation	Programme Management Department Follow-up
						degree of flexibility to respond fully to community-identified needs.
Viet Nam Ha Giang	10.	PROJ	OPER	BEN	Ensure beneficiary involvement in the selection, operation and maintenance and implementation of infrastructure; pre-determined infrastructure activities should be avoided.	DPRPR builds on decentralized infrastructure developed for HPM in direct support of the Government's grass-roots democratization legislation. It will develop a mainstream role for key grass-roots organizations in programme implementation, including CPCs at the commune level and VMGs/SMBs at village level. This role will include the identification of development priorities, implementation and management of funds.
Viet Nam Ha Giang	11.	PROJ	OPER	STR	Ensure that project efforts are aligned with government programmes, where there are complementarities.	The planning approaches adopted for the programme are expected to improve the coordination of project activities with those funded by programmes 133 and 135.
Viet Nam Ha Giang	12.	PROJ	OPER	ADV	Integrate implementation of community mobilization and delivery of goods and services.	Unlike phase I (HPM), under which activities were implemented only by government implementing agencies, in Ha Giang the project aim is to include private-sector service providers when available competitively. In both cases, a memorandum of understanding or contract/agreement will be entered into with the service provider (public or private) involved, stipulating outputs, inputs, specifications, procedures, terms and conditions, exit and penalty clauses, responsibilities, enforcement or compliance mechanisms and costs. The approach is to maximize output with minimum inputs, and to improve accountability and performance.
Viet Nam Ha Giang	13.	PROJ	OPER	ADV	Sustain the work of the commune animal health workers and village health workers through maintenance and continuity of services and support from the district and province levels.	The project will develop a more strategic role for commune workers, using their services for training key farmers in villages and for on-farm demonstrations.
Viet Nam Ha Giang	14.	PROJ	OPER	GDR	Enable conditions for the recruitment and deployment of women as commune animal health workers, and particularly as village health workers, and facilitate interactions of the latter with traditional birth attendants and reputable traditional healers.	The single major constraint to implementation of an effective field extension programme, especially in upland areas, is the limited outreach and capacity of extension services. In upland communes that are particularly poorly serviced by mainstream extension services, for key extension activities use will be made of other government staff located in these communes.
Viet Nam Ha Giang	15.	PROJ	OPER	NRM	Incorporate aspects of use and management of forests as envisaged in the forest protection agreements, which could ensure increased incomes for forest communities.	
Viet Nam Ha Giang	16.	PROJ	OPER	GDR	Address the strategic needs of women and ensure their active participation in decision-making and governance of grass-roots organizations; continue to promote locally- appropriate labour-saving technologies to reduce women's workloads.	The project adopts a specific strategy for women as a target group. Gender will be routinely mainstreamed into all project-related institutions, components and activities. Gender analyses will be carried out together with participatory rural assessments (PRAs), and men's and women's priorities will be identified separately. Both spouses will be invited to public meetings. Practical and strategic gender needs will be addressed and taken into account at every stage of implementation; planning will be gender-sensitive, and the impact of the project on women and men will be assessed separately. Women will have full and equitable access to and control over project resources, activities and training opportunities.
Viet Nam	17.	PROJ	OPER	TGT	Reduce the geographical coverage in order to focus on	Done, as mentioned above.

Country	Serial N°	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at Completion Point Recommendation	Programme Management Department Follow-up
Ha Giang					the poorer and remoter districts and communes.	
Viet Nam Ha Giang	18.	PROJ	OPER	STR	Integrate planning by the communities and limit activities to those that focus on food self-sufficiency and adequacy of cash income generation.	Conduct village-level PRAs/needs assessments. These will be carried out separately on an annual basis to identify infrastructure and extension/production needs. Separate needs assessments will be made for men and women.
Viet Nam Ha Giang	19.	PROJ	OPER	STR	Use CDFs as a major vehicle for project activities. Strengthen commune development fund operations with rigorous testing of micro project feasibility and of financial benefits before approving investments, and ensure thorough oversight of design, quality control and supervision of construction.	A central part of the overall strategy will be the establishment of LDBs for each commune, under the direct control of the CPCs and VMGs/SMBs.
Viet Nam Ha Giang	20.	PROJ	OPER	ADV	Determine the level of investments that communes can handle, preferably according to the Government's decree on commune investments; the decree on programme 135 should be adopted to facilitate investments by CPC.	The degree of decentralization envisaged will call for major project investments in building up the capacity of CPCs and VMGs/SMBs. This capacity-building will be phased to precede the incremental decentralization of management and financial authorities.
Viet Nam Ha Giang	21.	PROJ	OPER	ADV	Ensure that activities under the CDFs reflect the needs of entire communities so that they are owned and managed at the commune level.	The aim is to strengthen the capacity of key grass-roots institutions to enable them to function more effectively in relation to decentralized development processes.
Viet Nam Ha Giang	22.	PROJ	OPER	ADV	Investigate the possibility, where desirable and practicable, for commune-level community development boards and village coordination units to be subsumed under the CPCs; the village chief should act as the head of project-specific structures at the village level.	Mainstreaming of project management structures within the CPCs will facilitate the coordination and understanding of project activities. Implicit in the highly decentralized approach proposed for the project is the need for it to be process-driven and not prescriptive, which will simplify administrative and management procedures as much as possible.
Viet Nam Ha Giang	23.	PROJ	OPER	TGT	New technologies disseminated should be appropriate for the marginal conditions and precarious household finances of upland communes and take account of their indigenous systems and practices.	The project will actively promote the use of local knowledge and genetic resources wherever possible. This will be particularly relevant in Ha Giang, where the project area is nearly all upland and the target group almost entirely ethnic in composition. Crop improvement will focus on the selection of local varieties of maize, which are both preferred and better suited to the conditions of poor households in marginal, upland areas. There is also considerable potential for the selection and promotion of local breeds of livestock (e.g. Meo chickens, and local strains of cattle and buffalo), which are culturally-preferred and, in many cases, command a market premium. A diverse range of indigenous fodders already used for livestock fattening will be systematically assessed, building on the work of HPM. Best-performing varieties will be promoted actively. Similarly, culturally-preferred, socially-selected, forestry and agroforestry species will be identified and actively promoted.
Viet Nam Ha Giang	24.	PROJ	OPER	ORG	Use and strengthen existing institutional structures and grass-roots organizations to ensure wider representation of the poor and more marginalized sections of the community, including women.	The project will involve women's participation in all levels of project management. Specific awareness-raising and capacity-building activities will be targeted to upland ethnic women. The WU will be formally represented in project management structures at all levels and fully involved in assessing the eligibility of activities for funding from the LDBs.

Country	Serial N°	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at Completion Point Recommendation	Programme Management Department Follow-up
Viet Nam Ha Giang	25.	PROJ	OPER	ADV	Ensure that social mobilization and PRAs are used by communities as instruments of change, empowerment and management of internal and external resources.	Comprehensive training will be provided for key provincial and district staff from the PPMU, DPMUs and implementing agencies on core subjects such as PRA, resource assessment, participatory development planning, financial and administrative procedures for decentralized development, PIA, social mobilization/participatory development approaches, and user group formation and operation. This cadre of trained staff will then function as trainers for training commune-level staff.
Viet Nam Ha Giang	26.	PROJ	OPER	ENT	Allow for flexible financing of advisory services for the development of traditional household enterprises through a modified commune development fund approach.	The capacity-building LDB has a flexible fund for training based on demand. Part of the capacity-building LDB will be reserved for the exclusive use of women. Woman-headed households and women's groups will have preferential access to loans.
Viet Nam Ha Giang	27.	PROJ	OPER	RFI	Create linkages between savings and credit, labour-saving technologies and education to ensure household enterprise viability.	The credit component is not prescriptive with regard to loan purposes.
Viet Nam Ha Giang	28.	PROJ	OPER	IME	Simplify the M&E system and report formats, and create a proper socio-economic database; improve the technical databases set up under HPM for roads and bridges, domestic water supply and irrigation, and use them as development planning and monitoring tools; follow-up: second phase project.	A baseline, RIMS survey and M&E system has been set up by DPRPR.
Viet Nam Ha Giang	29.	PROJ	OPER	HR	Ensure that full-time heads and additional technical staff are available, particularly for rural infrastructure, at the DPMU and PPMU level.	There is a designated village infrastructure development engineer at the province level, and district village infrastructure coordinators at district level.
Viet Nam Ha Giang	30.	PROJ	OPER	PPD	Increase inputs devoted to knowledge generation, advocacy and policy dialogue, and partnership-building.	Done through the policy support grant, as mentioned above.

COMPLETION EVALUATIONS

Country	Serial N°	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at Completion Point Recommendation	Programme Management Department Follow-up
Paraguay	1.	CTRY	STRAT	PDM	During project design, consideration should be given to the existing and foreseeable political and technical framework, and actual possibilities of implementing the project as designed. Both the design and implementation must take into account the identity and specificity of the regions and localities concerned.	The new COSOP for Paraguay is aligned with national development policies. The current administration has launched a national strategy for poverty reduction and development (Knowledge Networking for Rural Development in Asia/Pacific Region [ENREP]) headed by the social action secretariat. Such strategic action represents one of the Government's explicit policy priorities for which the social cabinet was created. The new initiative for Paraguay, the Empowerment of Rural Poor Organizations and Harmonization of Investments (Paraguay Rural) Project will be implemented under the framework of ENREP.
Paraguay	2.	GOV	PLCY	STR	A minimum of continuity in institutional and sectoral policy, and in the tenure of project technicians and authorities, must be assured.	
Paraguay	3.	CTRY	STRAT	PPD	The project must be promoted and disseminated within the Government and commitments sought from the public agencies concerned as to its implementation. In particular, the priority of actions addressed to the target population must be substantiated and supported in discussions with the authorities.	Taking into consideration the country's institutional framework, which determines IFAD's institutional strategic niche, a set of potential opportunities for IFAD interventions has been discussed with Paraguayan authorities and international cooperation. According to the COSOP, the main strategic thrusts of potential opportunities for IFAD interventions are: (i) strengthening of social capital; (ii) promoting the diversification of traditional peasant production where clear market opportunities exist; (iii) promoting gender equity in social, economic and commercial participation; and (iv) supporting the design of governmental policies, instruments and mechanisms for the project as designed. The new project initiative incorporates all the above-mentioned aspects.
Paraguay	4.	CTRY	STRAT	PDM	Provision must be made in design and implementation in order that the project has a single implementing authority with full backing and continuity.	The new project will be implemented under the aegis of the Ministry of Agriculture; and responsibility for its implementation and administration will rest with the national directorate for project coordination and administration, a well-known executing agency.
Paraguay	5.	CTRY	STRAT	PDM	Project design must be rigorous in terms of institutional arrangements and capacity, to ensure needed coordination between institutions and actions, and in terms of the viability of activities and targets and of correlating targets and objectives.	
Paraguay	6.	CTRY	STRAT	ORG	In future projects, greater emphasis should be placed on developing institutional and social capital and on active participation by the target group, beginning with project formulation, allowing for the requisite learning period.	The new project will essentially: (i) support the strengthening and creation of social capital through training for beneficiaries and their organizations; (ii) harmonize ongoing poverty reduction investments financed by other organizations – using a demand-driven approach based on direct participation and selection of initiatives by beneficiary organizations; and (iii) establish a forum for policy dialogue between the Government and the donor community for supporting rural development and poverty reduction processes and coordinating activities. The project's main outcome will be to 'graduate' poor smallholders'
Paraguay	7.	PROJ	OPER	TGT	Provisions should be made to ensure that the inclusion of beneficiaries is more in line with the target population as defined.	

Country	Serial N°	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at Completion Point Recommendation	Programme Management Department Follow-up
						organizations through the accumulation of social capital so that they can participate in project activities and access the services of other investment projects (mainly those funded by the Inter-American Development Bank and World Bank).
Paraguay	8.	PROJ	OPER	HR	To achieve a reasonable degree of political independence, the Peasant Development Fund (PDF) should consider having its board of directors include qualified independent businessmen, well-known/respected personalities, microfinance experts with international experience and bankers. Procedures should be established so that, while allowing for periodic rotation, board members cannot be removed for purely political reasons.	See follow-up to ACP recommendations 10-14.
Paraguay	9.	PROJ	OPER	TGT	PDF should adhere to its mission to provide services to vulnerable poor peasant (<i>campesino</i>) populations first and foremost, without incurring losses for the institution or imposing a financial burden on intermediary financial institutions (IFIs).	Based on new public banking reform law approved by the Paraguayan Congress, new policies, instruments and innovative pilot credit activities are now being defined. IFAD is providing support to the Government, to savings, loans and production cooperatives, and to peasant organizations in the design and application of public policy instruments for the new institutions planned.
Paraguay	10.	PROJ	OPER	DEC	PDF governance should be decentralized from the board of directors to executive management and managers.	The new administration has initiated banking reform legislation in order to eliminate all public financial institutions currently in existence. The National Congress closed some financial institutions (<i>Programa Superior en Dirección Financiera y Control</i> [PDFC], Industrial Development Fund, Microenterprise Fund, Livestock Fund, National Development Bank [BNF], Agricultural Credit for Rehabilitation [CAH] and the Housing Fund), which will be merged to create a second-tier bank operating through IFIs. In parallel, a small first-tier bank will be set up to provide financing for peasants. PDF and TA services unit will continue to deliver one-year transitional services without IFAD's financial support (until December 2005).
Paraguay	11.	PROJ	OPER	INR	PDF should share in the successful experiences of other countries with microfinance for rural areas, and examine the possibility of replicating them in Paraguay (community banks, guarantee funds, etc.).	
Paraguay	12.	PROJ	OPER	SUP	In addition to systematic supervision by IFIs of loans granted to members, PDF should monitor and audit, on a random or selective basis, PDF-financed operations in the field, including methodological, policy and procedural aspects.	
Paraguay	13a	PROJ	OPER	TCB	In strengthening its portfolio of loans, PDF should: - ensure that IFIs receive management training before disbursing loans;	
Paraguay	13b	PROJ	OPER	RFI	- ensure that loans are delivered in a timely manner to coincide with the business cycle of end-users;	
Paraguay	13c	PROJ	OPER	RFI	- enhance supervision after disbursement; and	
Paraguay	13d	PROJ	OPER	RFI	- implement procedures for active recovery of arrears.	
Paraguay	14.	PROJ	OPER	RFI	The inclusion of established IFIs should be encouraged when they comply with PDF objectives and programmes, including the private and official banking sectors.	
Paraguay	15.	PROJ	OPER	ORG	At the same time, emphasis should be placed on encouraging inclusion of the target population in consolidated cooperatives.	
Paraguay	16.	PROJ	OPER	TCB	Training for IFIs. Adequate training and ongoing support should be provided for weaker or incipient IFIs. TA should precede and accompany the lending process.	

Country	Serial N°	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at Completion Point Recommendation	Programme Management Department Follow-up
						organizations in the design and application of public policy instruments for the new institutions planned after closure of PDF and other similar entities.
Paraguay	17.	PROJ	OPER	PDM	There should be greater coordination between IFIs and PDF to ensure information exchanges, which could have taken place through a wider technical team.	Same as above.
Paraguay	18.	PROJ	OPER	IME	Once its lending products have been restructured, PDF should undertake a large-scale information dissemination and promotion campaign.	Same as above.
Paraguay	19.	PROJ	OPER	TCB	Training programmes should be stepped up for IFI managers and members in the management of cooperative organizations and credit management, and in administrative and accounting issues.	Same as above.
Paraguay	20.	PROJ	OPER	RFI	Access to credit should be provided only after TA has been provided in administration and management.	Same as above.
Paraguay	21.	PROJ	OPER	TCB	Greater emphasis should be placed on information, motivation and training for members, in organizational, administrative, financial and technical issues.	Same as above.
Paraguay	22.	PROJ	OPER	RFI	From the outset, the IFIs should contribute to developing a savings mentality among their members and provide related financial services. Members' contributions to capitalization of their cooperatives should also be encouraged. This may be more effective and forge stronger commitments with the institutions than savings deposits.	Same as above.
Paraguay	23.	PROJ	OPER	TGT	IFIs included in IFAD-financed projects should make an effective commitment to addressing their financial services to the project's target population. The organizations' counterparts should be also considered.	Same as above.
Paraguay	24.	PROJ	OPER	RFI	Financing IFIs to provide complementary services for production may be an option to strengthen organization and obtain better economic results for producers.	Same as above.
Paraguay	25.	PROJ	OPER	RFI	In projects designed to address complex situations, the participation of established IFIs should be encouraged, but incipient IFIs can be teamed up with other, more developed, institutions, or several IFIs can be grouped together in a second-tier organization.	Same as above.
Paraguay	26.	PROJ	OPER	RFI	Credit adapted for poor producers should be timely, carry the least possible real cost, and be progressive, controlled and easy to manage. It is recommended that differentiated regulations be established, as well as incentives to stimulate and effectively facilitate the inclusion of rural women and youth. Credit for marketing and for contributing to added value for production should be also considered.	Same as above.
Paraguay	27.	PROJ	OPER	BEN	Effective, responsible participation by beneficiaries in managing their credit should be increased in degree.	Same as above.

Country	Serial N°	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at Completion Point Recommendation	Programme Management Department Follow-up
					Financing projects should promote participation by solidarity groups and facilitate access for them.	
Paraguay	28.	PROJ	OPER	RFI	Applications for credit by IFI members should cover not only production requirements but also marketing plans and requirements for products and inputs.	Same as above.
Paraguay	29.	PROJ	OPER	IME	From the outset, work should be done to disseminate and promote the financial services offered by projects.	Same as above.
Paraguay	30.	PROJ	OPER	TCB	TA for IFIs should emphasize management training for their members and managers, even before they receive financing. Resources should be used to transfer knowledge rather than to finance technicians to take on administrative functions. The IFIs should be strengthened as organizations and as business concerns.	Most of the recommendations regarding TA have been incorporated in the new project. Given the sparse accumulated social capital of rural communities and the deteriorating general situation of very poor families (rural women in particular), it is crucial that IFAD operations apply an integrated strategy to building up this capital, including a gender approach.
Paraguay	31.	PROJ	OPER	TCB	Management and organizational training for IFIs should be extended to all members and support their participation in IFI management and supervision. Members should be strengthened in their ability to manage credit and carry out productive activities. Training and continuous refresher courses for technicians and trainers are also of key importance. Technicians should have training ability and know how to motivate the <i>campesinos</i> with whom they work.	IFAD is supporting the country's existing institutions by promoting concrete policy instruments in agreement with peasant and governmental organizations. Such instruments, reflecting recognition of the disadvantages faced by rural women, should place special emphasis on the identification of production and employment alternatives for women, as well as training for self-management by organizations specializing in gender issues. To reinforce the social capital of poor smallholders implies three different levels of action:
Paraguay	32.	PROJ	OPER	HR	Technicians should be carefully selected and their work continually monitored.	(i) strengthen or create peasant organizations through a clear production and market-oriented approach; improve, through training, their agronomic or artisanal skills and incorporate managerial activities and training for poor smallholder groups;
Paraguay	33.	PROJ	OPER	TGT	TA should be targeted to the rural poor, with priority assigned to training and assistance for groups of women and young people; and microenterprise operations promoted in various productive activities.	(ii) establish new links between local authorities (particularly municipal-level) and smallholder groups organized in social networks; and (iii) establish a policy dialogue between smallholders' organized networks and central authorities to foster regional and subregional rural development processes.
Paraguay	34.	PROJ	OPER	GDR	The importance of having a gender focus and of women's participation in projects should be underscored. It is not sufficient just to make statements; projects should include operational mechanisms and tools to ensure their inclusion, and provide for the use of concrete indicators to measure participation.	
Paraguay	35.	PROJ	OPER	DEC	TA programmes should channel action through regional agencies, providing demand-driven services that can recover part of their costs without undermining contributions from other funding sources.	
Paraguay	36.	PROJ	OPER	RFI	TA and credit should be integrated and complement each other. The selection of IFIs for assistance and lending should take place by common agreement among the institutions concerned.	
Paraguay	37.	PROJ	OPER	TCB	Training should be provided for producers and managers with regard to cropping plans and investment projects based on technical and economic criteria.	
Paraguay	38.	PROJ	OPER	RFI	Given the difficulty of achieving a massive result in titling land for poor farmers, and since it is not considered	

Country	Serial N°	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at Completion Point Recommendation	Programme Management Department Follow-up
					viaible to require collateral security from such borrowers, other types of security should be obtained. New options such as guarantee funds, co-signing and other arrangements should be considered, without affecting the design of formulas to obtain rapid land titling for members.	
Paraguay	39.	PROJ	OPER	GDR	PDF should favour access to credit by women and by young rural entrepreneurs of both sexes, and identify innovative solutions in credit adoption and management and other financial services for producers and the rural poor generally.	
Paraguay	40.	PROJ	OPER	RFI	Continuity in TA services to IFIs and borrowers from the project credit fund is important. Therefore, the necessary provisions and mechanisms should be allowed for.	
Paraguay	41.	PROJ	OPER	IME	Entities involved in project implementation should be rigorous in their performance of M&E activities as well as regularly submitting implementing unit reports and adopting the recommendations thereof. It is important that all those involved in development projects develop a true evaluation culture.	<p>The cooperating institution for the new project will be UNOPS. Arrangements have been made between IFAD and UNOPS to introduce RIMS requirements and determine how best the cooperating institution can provide support. The Programme for Strengthening the Regional Capacity for Monitoring and Evaluation of Rural Poverty-Alleviation Projects in Latin America and the Caribbean (PREVAL), an important partner in Latin America, will be actively engaged in helping develop processes to mainstream RIMS into project management.</p> <p>IFAD's presence will be guaranteed (country programme manager and TA grant (Southern Cone Common Market staff).</p>
Paraguay	42.	CTRY	OPER	SUP	Supervision missions by IFAD or the cooperating institution should carefully examine proposals or needs that might imply changes in the design and planning of project components, subcomponents or activities, and make recommendations to that end. Such missions should also engage in dialogue with implementing institutions and senior government authorities with a view to taking necessary remedial action and following up on agreements.	
Paraguay	43.	CTRY	OPER	IME	The need for constant monitoring is underscored, so that any errors or weaknesses can be corrected during implementation. Monitoring should take into account changes in the country's situation and regional diversity, and provide specific benchmarks for measuring progress.	
Paraguay	44.	IFAD	OPER	IME	Systematic M&E of implementation is of key importance, and results and recommendations should be discussed widely in the various official and private sectors concerned, establishing responsibilities and commitments for each institution. Evaluations should provide for a reasonable period of time to put changes into effect. It has been suggested that results should be discussed informally before being presented at the preliminary results workshop.	
Paraguay	45.	IFAD	OPER	IME	In evaluating the results of the gender component, it is suggested that appropriate benchmarks be established. It was observed that impact should have been measured against the time when activities actually began, not just in	

Country	Serial N°	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at Completion Point Recommendation	Programme Management Department Follow-up
Paraguay	46.	CTRY	OPER	INR	comparison with design objectives. The lessons learned by the project should be used even once it has closed. Considering the project's coverage of Paraguay's rural poor population (10%), perhaps its greatest contribution can be found in lessons learned during implementation that can be applied to future projects.	
Paraguay	47.	CTRY	OPER	SUP	An active and continuous IFAD presence and direct monitoring and control of activities are particularly important in order to withstand the type of instability that beset this project.	

COUNTRY PROGRAMME EVALUATIONS

Country	Serial N°	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at Completion Point Recommendation	Programme Management Department Follow-up
Bolivia	1.	CTRY	STRAT	STR	The core learning partnership (CLP) recommends that any future IFAD interventions be coordinated with other activities being carried out by the Government and international cooperation agencies.	A new initiative is in the pipeline for Bolivia: the Camelid Economy Support Project (VALE). The project area comprises 77 municipalities in the Bolivian highlands (altiplano) in the departments of La Paz, Oruro and Potosí. The project is in line with IFAD's strategy in Bolivia, which identifies the development of the camelid sector as the main option for the country's altiplano – an area that is home to nearly two million people (of these, less than 400,000 are rural), where the possibilities for diversifying productive activities are limited and natural resources are both scarce and poor. PROSAT is becoming a national proposal for the development of a TA market driven by <i>campesinos</i> . The project also responds to the country's strategies on rural development, poverty reduction and environmental conservation. However, given that incremental incomes expected from camelid-sector development will be insufficient to overcome poverty, the project will support the economic diversification strategies of small farmers and microentrepreneurs, particularly activities with high economic potential, such as those relating to tourism.
Bolivia	2.	CTRY	STRAT	STR	It is particularly important that IFAD and the Government agree on the selection and prioritization of regions for intervention.	
Bolivia	3.	CTRY	STRAT	STR	CLP members also recommend that thematic sector projects (e.g. the Camelid Producers Development Project in the Andean High Plateau and the Small Farmers Technical Assistance Services Project [PROSAT]) continue to be undertaken.	
Bolivia	4.	PROJ	STRAT	TCB	To ensure that future interventions are sustainable and effective, it is recommended that the retooling of production and commercial processes be integrated with institution-building through training for and the strengthening of public and private institutions.	
Bolivia	5.	PROJ	STRAT	TGT	Given existing diversity, the need arises for a differentiated approach in order to address the circumstances and constraints of each community, thereby facilitating access by weaker members to project services. This means guaranteeing services in the beneficiaries' languages and providing different support modalities with different timing for each target group. Community participation in project design, implementation, evaluation and reformulation is key to achieving this objective.	IFAD project's training and TA is already hired by the <i>campesinos</i> and microentrepreneurs in the languages they require (more than 50% of training and TA is delivered in <i>aymara</i> and <i>quechua</i>). The target group of the new initiative will consist of llama and alpaca owners and vicuña herders whose livelihoods depend on economic activities related to camelid-based products, especially fibre, meat and hides. Approximately 5 500 households are expected to benefit from the project. Increased access to markets will financially empower women, who play an important role in the camelid sector. A gender approach is an integral part of project design and includes generational issues as well.
Bolivia	6.	PROJ	STRAT	TGT	The CLP also recommends that advances achieved by projects be carried further in order to move towards a "gender and generation" approach that promotes shared responsibility by men and women for tasks and leadership positions in community organizations, including young people and seniors.	IFAD promotes strong participation of beneficiaries at different stages of the project cycle. Projects like PROSAT and the Management of Natural Resources in the Chaco and High Valley Regions Project directly benefit no less than 70% of all women and youth. At least 30% of all TA is provided by women hired directly by <i>campesino</i> organizations.

Country	Serial N°	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at Completion Point Recommendation	Programme Management Department Follow-up
Bolivia	7.	PROJ	STRAT	STR	It is recommended that the new strategy provide for the identification of employment and income opportunities in other economic sectors so that training and support alternatives for off-farm activities can be designed. This will make it possible to support migrants from rural areas to improve their employment and income opportunities by promoting economic links to their communities of origin. It is suggested that consideration be given to existing opportunities to leverage remittances from migrants living both within the country and abroad.	Most of the issues highlighted by the country programme evaluation regarding strategies to raise incomes have been incorporated in the design of the VALE project. The project will have three components: (a) strengthening of public services related to the peasant camelid economy. To improve the business environment for camelid-related activities, the project will strengthen the regulatory and normative framework for public services and provide support in areas related to vicuña management, animal health and production services, organization and management, and policy dialogue; (b) support for the development of business opportunities in the peasant camelid economy. The aim of this component is to improve access to TA and advisory services, and foster business development investments, providing facilities and instruments for microenterprise and small enterprise investments and joint ventures, and improving access to the formal financial market; (c) project management and M&E. The project's administrative and management activities come under this component, including the cost of the project coordination unit. The project has been built on lessons learned from the Development of the Puno-Cusco Corridor Project in Peru, the Small Farmers Technical Assistance Services Project in Bolivia and, in particular, the Camelid Producers Development Project in the Andean High Plateau, also in Bolivia.
Bolivia	8.	GOV	STRAT	STR	To ensure the sustainability of the current approach and prospects for its scaling up, the CLP recommends that the Government, possibly with IFAD support, should design a strategy with a long-term vision for the development of supply and demand for technology in order to bring about systematic increases in productivity and competitiveness for the rural poor. This will entail revising some aspects of the current strategy, such as: (i) the need to supplement it with financing components; (ii) backing it up with medium- and long-term market studies and information systems for products included in subprojects; and (iii) limiting cost increases for poor <i>campesinos</i> .	
Bolivia	9.	PROJ	OPER	MKT	With support from IFAD, local institutions such as municipalities will need to make business facilitation investments to bring direct improvements in markets for goods and services (fairs, abattoirs, health services, Internet access, etc.).	
Bolivia	10.	PROJ	OPER	NRM	The CLP recommends that all future interventions take environmental issues into account in defining baselines, in M&E, and in safeguarding against adverse impact and related mitigation measures, within the framework of Bolivia's current environmental legislation.	
Bolivia	11.	PROJ	OPER	RFI	Strengthening is needed for savings services, opening and providing access to service points in isolated rural locations, and new products such as microinsurance, remittances, trust funds, certificates and financial leasing.	
Bolivia	12.	PROJ	OPER	DEC	The IFAD intervention should provide determined support for decentralization. It should locate resource allocation mechanisms and project technicians in the same territory where they can offer effective proximity to the population and local institutions and at the same time be subject to social control. Eighty per cent of IFAD project staff are located in very remote areas and outside La Paz.	

Country	Serial N°	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at Completion Point Recommendation	Programme Management Department Follow-up
Bolivia	13.	PROJ	OPER	ORG	IFAD funding should complement initiatives by local democratic organizations at the level of communities, traditional organizations and municipalities.	Based on the experience of IFAD in Bolivia, the new project will support local organizations' initiatives at the level of communities, traditional organizations and municipalities.
Bolivia	14.	PROJ	OPER	ORG	Pre-existing rural <i>campesino</i> organizations must be empowered to increase their capacity to influence the design and implementation of public policy. Processes that foresee beneficiary participation within projects and the strengthening of social capital to promote participation at higher levels should be adopted.	All IFAD interventions in the country work through contracts signed with the peasant communities (<i>comunidades campesinas</i>), which are democratic, traditional organizations, as well with voluntary small farmer organizations. The VALE project will do likewise.
Bolivia	15.	PROJ	OPER	STR	The main challenge is to come up with conditionality and instruments to ensure that project resources are used in strict compliance with the terms of loan agreements, while at the same time meshing with relevant public institutions and policies. A periodic evaluation and supervision mechanism is a prerequisite in this respect.	The Latin America and the Caribbean Division at IFAD has no evidence that substantial project resources have been deviated from project objectives or beneficiaries. When problems occur, as in the case of the Sustainable Development Project by Beni Indigenous People during the period of political instability, 100% of ineligible expenditures were reimbursed to the special account.
Bolivia	16.	PROJ	OPER	ORG	Considering the serious drawbacks in public and private institutional structures, the project should include institution-building components for areas covered by future interventions.	The country programme manager outposted to Peru and the field presence officer in Bolivia facilitate institutional coordination among different stakeholders. The revolutionary government of President Evo Morales was elected with 54% of the vote. The new government appears to be fully committed to supporting initiatives in favour of the poorest of the poor in rural areas.
Bolivia	17.	IFAD	STRAT	PDM	The CLP recommends that a better balance be sought between resources used in project identification and design, and those allocated for managing the project cycle during implementation.	Consideration has been given to this recommendation.
Bolivia	18.	PROJ	STRAT	IME	The project cycle should contemplate a dynamic approach to M&E so that the original design can be adjusted to reflect new understandings deriving from changes in economic, social and political realities in the target areas.	Dynamic approaches and mechanisms for M&E are being analysed with PREVAL.
Bolivia	19.	PROJ	OPER	ORG	In view of the foregoing, the design of new interventions calls for a comprehensive assessment of the sustainability of financial support that projects entail at all three levels: microeconomic, local-regional, overall-macroeconomic. If the dynamics of a pre-existing organization unravel as a result of a project achieving its objectives in the short term, there is a risk of limiting sustainability. A rapid return to the baseline situation is likely to occur once external financial support is discontinued. The CLP therefore recommends that the future strategy consider strengthening the beneficiaries' social and economic organizations to help them adapt to the new context and, fundamentally, linking them to the various markets and national policy priorities.	Based on the experience of IFAD in Bolivia, the new project will support economic activities while giving due consideration to the sustainability of proposed initiatives. The project will: (i) rationalize the use of vicuñas; (ii) improve productivity of domesticated camelids (alpacas and llamas) by focusing on specialized primary producers; (iii) promote eco-tourism; (iv) foster local development based on locally perceived cultural identities; and (v) support the secondary and tertiary activities of other poor groups involved in the camelid productive chain. Supporting <i>campesino</i> organizations essentially means empowering them by transferring resources, knowledge and access to new services. That is contained in the VALE project and is on the first strategic lines for a national IFAD strategy discussed recently with the Government.

Country	Serial N°	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at Completion Point Recommendation	Programme Management Department Follow-up
Bolivia	20.	CTRY	STRAT	STR	The CLP recommends that the new IFAD strategy be linked to an overall rural poverty reduction programme.	Over the last ten years, IFAD has learned to engage in dialogue directly with rural organizations but with fewer intermediaries such as NGOS and other agencies. Community organizations have become stronger as a result of the development and transfer of responsibilities. Today, for example, elected local governments are natural IFAD partners because they progressively take on responsibility for many rural development activities.
Bolivia	21.	CTRY	STRAT	PPD	The Fund should contribute to dialogue between the Government and civil society. In this context, the question then arises as to the best mechanisms, institutions and modalities for IFAD support in the national dialogue process. It is understood that this is a crucial issue that requires careful thought with regard to the drawing up of a concrete plan of action.	A precedent will be created in September 2006, when the national assembly debates such issues as self-determination and autonomy.
Bolivia	22.	CTRY	STRAT	PPD	The CLP recommends that, in future, partnerships with other specialized agencies and institutions be developed under a more proactive strategy, both for area-based operations and centrally in La Paz.	Discussions concerning cofinancing opportunities are under way with the Andean Development Corporation.
Egypt	1.	CTRY	STRAT	PPD	Because IFAD seeks to be a privileged partner in dialogue with the Government and key donors, it must equip itself with relevant knowledge and experience, be present in the appropriate forums, employ its links to leaders and policy-makers, and engage on the development scene. According to the country programme evaluation (CPE), the precursor to developing such partnerships was clearly to identify IFAD's "niche", so that the value-added by cooperating with the Fund could be demonstrated.	An IFAD country office is being established in Cairo. This will provide the means not only for establishing links with other donors but also for enhancing policy dialogue with the Government and for implementation support. For IFAD, this has the potential to bring about a new way of working in Egypt.
Egypt	2.	CTRY	STRAT	PPD	The rationale for having an IFAD presence in Cairo was clearly described in the CPE and endorsed by the workshop held during the evaluation. The Fund's representative should participate in regular government/donor forums that plan, monitor and evaluate donor assistance to the rural sector, and occasionally participate in project supervision missions. The CPE concluded that an enhanced field presence might also help strengthen the Fund's sectoral knowledge base. This could be done through closer associations with Egyptian universities and research organizations, and other relevant multilaterals and bilaterals. The workshop further recommended that IFAD's presence could be made more visible by sponsoring appropriate conferences and seminars and developing contacts with the local media.	

Country	Serial N°	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at Completion Point Recommendation	Programme Management Department Follow-up
Egypt	3.	CTRY	STRAT	PPD	IFAD should engage in dialogue with all relevant agencies in Egypt, be fully involved in development forums, and develop a more proactive approach to publicizing project results and development findings.	
Egypt	4.	CTRY	STRAT	PPD	IFAD should broaden the spectrum of implementation partnerships and intensify implementation support in order to seek the optimization of project and grant impacts. It should also support the development of NGOs as potential partners.	Implementation of the proposed Upper Egypt Rural Development Project calls for in-country partnerships that go beyond the Ministry of Agriculture and Land Reclamation (MALR), which is a technical ministry inasmuch as its role has to do with increasing agricultural production and productivity (farming system approach and livestock development). While implementation experience with MALR has been positive, the involvement of other partners, such as the Ministry of Water and Irrigation, governor's office, NGOs, commercial banks and operators in the private sector is necessary. High complementarities and synergy exist between the intervention proposed by IFAD and those of other United Nations agencies, Italian Cooperation, the World Bank and regional finance institutions such as the Arab Fund for Economic and Social Development, the Organization of the Petroleum Exporting Countries Fund for International Development, the Arab Authority for Agricultural Investment and Development, and the Islamic Development Bank.
Egypt	5.	IFAD	STRAT	INR	IFAD should facilitate the communication of innovative approaches and experiences across projects through regular workshops and field visits. Wider consultation with project users and staff may also facilitate support to innovative approaches.	With regard to agricultural development, there is great potential for replicating best features of the Agricultural Production Intensification Project, i.e. the farming system research approach, but with stronger emphasis on community involvement in planning and implementing activities. The design of the community approach would draw on experience from the Sohag Rural Development Project (SRDP). More attention will be given to identifying and supporting local farmers and beneficiary organizations, through capacity-building, service provision and strengthening local services to meet community needs.
Egypt	6.	IFAD	STRAT	IME	IFAD should insist on better-quality monitoring and impact assessments in order to retain the emphasis on achieving development objectives and to share knowledge across projects. The skills of local project staff should be used for this purpose.	
Egypt	7.	IFAD	STRAT	INR	Project design and implementation processes should be realigned to the needs of promoting innovative approaches. The appropriate mix of instruments (loans and grants) should be used to this effect. Successful innovative approaches in IFAD's current programme should be supported and replicated.	

Country	Serial N°	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at Completion Point Recommendation	Programme Management Department Follow-up
Egypt	8.	CTRY	STRAT	TGT	Shift the geographical focus of IFAD's strategy to Upper Egypt.	Given the strong link between unemployment and rural poverty and the large geographical disparities between Upper Egypt and other parts of the country, a clear niche for IFAD, within the development aspirations of the Government and taking into consideration other donors' activities, is to contribute to creating employment opportunities in Upper Egypt through agricultural development and promotion of SMEs, within an integrated rural development approach.
Egypt	9.	CTRY	STRAT	EXI	Develop an exit strategy for Lower Egypt.	
Egypt	10.	CTRY	STRAT	STR	Examine the need to invest more in, and sequence better, social development activities.	
Egypt	11.	CTRY	STRAT	TCB	Involve governorates, local authorities and local committees in managing and supporting rural development programmes.	
Egypt	12.	CTRY	OPER	RFI	The performance of SRDP should be reviewed and the results of the review disseminated widely.	
Egypt	13.	CTRY	OPER	RFI	The CPE recommended strengthening the Principal Bank for Development and Agricultural Credit (PBDAC) village banking network and to extend its reach to poorer areas and market segments, including women and the landless as future microentrepreneurs. Workshop participants agreed on the need to identify innovative financial instruments relevant to the needs of unserved target groups.	In addition to exploring commercial lending, policy dialogue will also be maintained with PBDAC in order to help in the reform of this institution. It is possible that within the life time of a new programme, sufficient progress can be made by PBDAC so that it becomes the most favoured but not the unique channel for rural financial products. While IFAD will pursue this dialogue it is recognized that pressure for reform must come from within the Government. As geographic targeting by IFAD moves to a sharper focus on the very poor areas of Upper Egypt, more adjustment will be required in the PBDAC lending criteria. The task will thus become more difficult for PBDAC, and until such time as it can demonstrate having developed lending mechanisms appropriate to the rural poor, it should be viewed as a second chance only. Policy dialogue will also be pursued with the Social Fund for Development, which (through its Small Enterprise Development Organization) has the interest and capability to provide credit for SMEs.
Egypt	14.	CTRY	STRAT	PPD	All stakeholders (IFAD, PBDAC and others) should analyse and continue policy dialogue on promoting community-based microfinance institutions and the expansion of the PBDAC village banking network.	

Country	Serial N°	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at Completion Point Recommendation	Programme Management Department Follow-up
Egypt	15.	CTRY	STRAT	PPD	IFAD should enter directly into dialogue with PBDAC, respecting its autonomy as a financial institution, and take an active part in the national policy dialogue on rural finance involving all relevant stakeholders.	
Egypt	16a	IFAD	STRAT	GDR	Increase the emphasis on gender aspects in projects.	With regard to off-farm employment creation, there is a need to assist the land-poor, the landless and rural women through the development of SMEs, export promotion, market linkage and partnership with the private sector. The rural poor need to be equipped for such employment opportunities through pro-poor human capital accumulation brought about by education, training and health care. More importantly, the rural poor need easier access to, and a firmer command of, physical assets and finance. Ways of ensuring easy but sustainable access to rural finance are considered above, and therefore its provision should be a thrust of the new programme. In addition, the provision of technical assistance to SMEs through government institutions and NGOs will help to significantly increase their chances of survival and contribution to poverty reduction. Finally, improved access to local, national and international markets represents another major requirement for the success of SMEs as an anti-poverty mechanism. Because such activities have already received considerable attention, there are agencies with experience and funding able to support such initiatives: therefore, the intention should be to link with these agencies rather than to develop new schemes.
Egypt	16b	IFAD	STRAT	GDR	Use grant mechanisms to promote the empowerment agenda for women.	
Egypt	16c	IFAD	STRAT	GDR	Increase skills and employment opportunities for women through IFAD projects.	

THEMATIC EVALUATIONS

Country	Serial N°	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at Completion Point Recommendation	Programme Management Department Follow-up
Ethiopia Uganda United Republic of Tanzania	1.	REG	STRAT	TCB	It was noted that IFAD increasingly relies on local government as a vehicle for service delivery, and that there is a need for capacity-building at multiple levels. Capacity-building should extend, in particular, to elected representatives, civil servants, communities, the private sector and civil society partners. And it should emphasize relevant aspects of development, administration, fiscal management, policy formulation, enhanced poverty orientation, and community-based training for ensuring sustainability. However, evaluation members cautioned that capacity-building should not be a standalone activity; rather, it should be integrated into long-term national capacity-building plans.	Uganda. Ongoing. Under the District Development Support Programme (DDSP), the Fund has worked to enhance the capacity of district staff and lower personnel levels with regard to development planning and project implementation. Sustained help for capacity-building has been provided, including the training of district staff to proficiency in computer applications, logical framework and M&E. District, subcounty and parish officials have been trained in record-keeping and budgeting. This training is also being provided under the capacity-building component of the multi-donor-supported Local Government Development Programme (LGDP). United Republic of Tanzania: Many of the recommendations will need to be followed up under the national general decentralized system and not in parallel by IFAD as a standalone operation. Therefore, implementation is contingent on the country situation and district preparedness. Under the Agricultural Sector Development Programme (ASDP), civil society and the private sector are the core implementers. IFAD is providing support through two loans: the Agricultural Services Support Programme and the Agricultural Sector Development Programme – Livestock: Support for Pastoral and Agro-pastoral Development (ASDP-L). The Rural Financial Services Programme and Agricultural Marketing Systems Development Programme (AMSDP) work along the same lines.
Ethiopia Uganda United Republic of Tanzania	2.	REG	STRAT	ADV	It was recommended that value-for-money audit should be enforced; mechanisms should be in place for vertical and horizontal accountability; there should be social audits and public displays of financial records to user groups; and greater beneficiary participation in all processes associated with service delivery.	Uganda: Already practised in the country; however mechanisms for vertical and horizontal accountability need to be further strengthened. Initiatives in support of this include LGDP and DDSP. United Republic of Tanzania: Under the Republic of Tanzania's local government reform programme (LGRP), as of FY 2006/2007 decentralization by devolution has started by district and will gradually move to lower levels.
Ethiopia Uganda United Republic of Tanzania	3.	REG	STRAT	DEC	Local governance and poverty alleviation (LGPA) strategies should be prepared in a participatory manner with the stakeholders concerned, and integrated into policy dialogue and regular interface between IFAD and its partners.	Uganda: District local governments in Uganda prepare and implement DDPs in consultation with stakeholders. These plans are also tools for policy dialogue with IFAD and other development partners. United Republic of Tanzania: Decentralization is due to start in FY 2006/2007, with district development plans (DDPs) and strategies to be prepared.
Ethiopia Uganda United Republic of Tanzania	4.	REG	STRAT	DEC	Based on the valuable experience IFAD has gained and feedback provided by the evaluation, it would be appropriate to develop two or three LGPA strategies at a time in selected locations of Ethiopia, Tanzania and Uganda. The LGPA strategies would then feed into the	Uganda: District local governments in Uganda develop DDPs on the basis of locally-determined priorities. IFAD interventions support the Government's poverty reduction strategies and local government poverty reduction plans, e.g. the proposed DLSP is in support of local government development plans.

Country	Serial N°	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at Completion Point Recommendation	Programme Management Department Follow-up
					regional strategy and future COSOPs and projects.	United Republic of Tanzania: Could be followed-up on under the ASDP, if requested by a district.
Ethiopia Uganda United Republic of Tanzania	5.	REG	STRAT	INR	For on-the-ground testing, stakeholders recommend the use of grant funds, as testing new approaches may be considered risky and governments be unwilling to use loan funds for this purpose. But if willing partners can be found and innovations identified, the next challenge will be to inject demonstrated innovations into larger IFAD-assisted and other programmes. These could be area development projects or perhaps specially designed local governance initiatives with particular focus on rural poverty reduction.	Uganda: IFAD's grant programme and the innovation programme constitute suitable instruments for innovation challenges. For example, IFAD is helping the Plan for the Modernization of Agriculture secretariat to develop specific targeting approaches under its various components. United Republic of Tanzania: To be pursued under the larger national decentralization framework and DDPs.
Ethiopia Uganda United Republic of Tanzania	6.	CTRY	STRAT	TCB	Suggestions for LGPA strategies: - The communities should be trained to ask for technical options and technical experts trained to provide options rather than blueprints to the communities.	Uganda: Ongoing under the National Agricultural Advisory Services Programme (NAAS), Area-Based Agricultural Modernization Programme (AAMP) and Rural Financial Services Programme. United Republic of Tanzania: Implemented under the LGRP and ASDP.
Ethiopia Uganda United Republic of Tanzania	7.	CTRY	STRAT	PDM	- Both technical design and institutional arrangements should not be driven by rigid blueprints but by the social, human and financial capital of communities and local governments.	Uganda: This is a key element of all IFAD programmes in Uganda. United Republic of Tanzania: Already practised.
Ethiopia Uganda United Republic of Tanzania	8.	CTRY	STRAT	BEN	- The poor should be consulted by technical experts, and their knowledge and priorities reflected in the design of activities.	Uganda: Already practised as an integral part of programme design, e.g. at formulation, appraisal and implementation. United Republic of Tanzania: Already practised.
Ethiopia Uganda United Republic of Tanzania	9.	CTRY	STRAT	ORG	- Procedures for organizing communities and delivering services should be simplified to the point of being accessible to the poor, instead of insisting that the poor must be educated and trained to comply with unrealistic requirements.	Uganda: Community development initiatives in the various programmes provide a vehicle through which this is promoted. United Republic of Tanzania: Under development by LGRP and ASDP.
Ethiopia Uganda United Republic of Tanzania	10.	CTRY	STRAT	IME	- Projects should be required to practise full disclosure of information to the beneficiaries and mass media.	Uganda: Ongoing. United Republic of Tanzania: Information provided on demand.
Ethiopia Uganda United Republic of Tanzania	11.	CTRY	STRAT	ORG	- Accountability should be increased by strengthening elected institutions to play their role more effectively.	Uganda: Ongoing through the multi-donor supported LGDP. United Republic of Tanzania: Under decentralization, the elected district councils will be/are fully involved in planning and management.
Ethiopia Uganda United Republic of Tanzania	12.	CTRY	STRAT	DEC	- IFAD assistance should also include measures to promote accountability and transparency in service delivery and control corruption	Uganda: Supervision provides a mechanism for addressing these issues. The Fund has also implemented an anticorruption policy that provides a mechanism for reporting irregular practices. United Republic of Tanzania: Covered during supervision.
Ethiopia Uganda United Republic	13.	CTRY	STRAT	STR	- IFAD should be willing to invest in the autonomy of the poor from state actors	Uganda: Capacity-building of community and farmer groups for social and economic empowerment constitutes a key tenet of the IFAD programme in Uganda, as evidenced by the Vegetable Oil

Country	Serial N°	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at Completion Point Recommendation	Programme Management Department Follow-up
of Tanzania						Development Project, NAAS, DDSP and AAMP. United Republic of Tanzania: Farmers are entrepreneurs and mainly operate independently, and the Government is establishing a level playing field and supportive environment.
Ethiopia Uganda United Republic of Tanzania	14.	CTRY	STRAT	ORG	The above proposals lead to a recommendation for independent support organizations that perform as “honest brokers” between rural communities and service delivery organizations, including government agencies and NGOs.	Uganda: Through capacity-building of rural communities and civil society, some emerging rural community organizations/community-based organizations are beginning to perform “honest broker” functions. United Republic of Tanzania: Civil society and farmer organizations are gaining importance, starting with brokering functions; AMSDP has current experience. First farmer organization meeting conducted in January 2006.
Ethiopia Uganda United Republic of Tanzania	15.	CTRY	STRAT	PPD	IFAD should ask stakeholders to participate in the identification of policy dialogue and harmonization objectives and in their achievement during future strategy formulation. Future strategies should consider policy dialogue and harmonization as integral dimensions of IFAD activities in the region. Policy dialogue and harmonization activities should have measurable objectives, components and activities, outputs, resource allocation and performance indicators.	Uganda: Ongoing. Policy dialogue is being strengthened through the Field Presence Pilot Programme; positive results are already evident. United Republic of Tanzania: Policy dialogue on rural finance and marketing policies has involved stakeholders. Project experiences are the basis for continued policy discussions for all IFAD projects. The ASDP-L design process has already resulted in policy debates, based on stakeholder involvement.
Ethiopia Uganda United Republic of Tanzania	16.	CTRY	STRAT	DEC	Resources should be earmarked to identify, document and communicate local policy changes, promoted in the context of IFAD operations that could have potential for scaling up and replication at a higher level, beyond the operation under consideration. This could be done through LGPA strategies and other ways.	Uganda: Covered through various programmes and during supervision and MTR. United Republic of Tanzania: Covered on a project basis and discussed by the in-country management team and policy task force.
Ethiopia Uganda United Republic of Tanzania	17.	CTRY	STRAT	PPD	IFAD should step up efforts to promote dialogue among national stakeholders on policy changes identified in IFAD operations. In this regard, IFAD should further strengthen its partnerships with authorities responsible for decentralization and with associations of local governments (wherever they exist).	Uganda: One of IFAD’s main interlocutors is the Ministry of Local Government, hosting ministry of AAMP and DDSP. Solid partnerships exist with local governments, especially through the directly- supervised DDSP. United Republic of Tanzania: Covered in national policy forums/task force (for ASDP).
Ethiopia Uganda United Republic of Tanzania	18.	CTRY	STRAT	PPD	The Fund should review and intensify its engagement and participation in selected national and thematic policy dialogue forums on local governance and poverty reduction.	Uganda. Ongoing. Policy dialogue is being strengthened through the Field Presence Pilot Programme; positive results are already evident. United Republic of Tanzania: Starting from FY 2006/2007, this can be pursued under ASDP.
Ethiopia Uganda United Republic of Tanzania	19.	CTRY	STRAT	DEC	The preparation of future COSOPs should provide an opportunity for engaging the Government, donor community and other national stakeholders in policy dialogue on issues of pressing concern in the area of local governance.	Uganda: To be undertaken during preparation of the next COSOP. United Republic of Tanzania: The COSOP will be prepared as a joint donor exercise under the joint assistance strategy; preliminary work has started.
China India	1.	IFAD	STRAT	STR	IFAD and its partners should assure that planning and adoption measures are properly sequenced so as to improve the likelihood of success. To be successful, three	No new loan financing proposals have been approved since the thematic evaluation, including that concerning the promotion of organic agriculture. However, an organic agriculture component is

Country	Serial N°	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at Completion Point Recommendation	Programme Management Department Follow-up
					steps should be included in all project planning: (a) clarify the specific aims of conversion with the participation of stakeholders; (b) analyse realistic changes needed, requirements and risks; and (c) design a future farming system with organic experts and the full participation of all stakeholders.	expected to be included in the Decentralized Programme for Poverty Reduction Project currently being designed for India. Terms of reference for the formulation of the project will include steps (a) to (c) as listed. On the other hand, in 2005, IFAD developed a COSOP for China, which identified, inter alia, a promising opportunity for organic farming as a tool for poverty reduction. This opportunity has been seized with the formulation of the Modular Rural Development Programme in the Xinjiang Uygur Autonomous Region (MRDP). Steps (a) to (c) identified during the ACP process have been taken duly into account. The aim of converting to organic farming has been made clear to all stakeholders; the analysis already undertaken will be reviewed in more depth during appraisal. Organic experts have been and will be involved in designing an appropriate farming system.
China India	2.	IFAD	STRAT	ADV	It is recommended that IFAD's market-oriented projects also include two pre-assessments. First, a feasibility study of existing market opportunities, costs and risks for the products being considered. This should include a sensitivity analysis for variations in the organic premiums to ensure that project success is not completely dependent on price premiums that are likely to change. Second, a cost-benefit analysis to evaluate expected differences between an organic approach and the current cropping system, in order to properly assess the set of impacts that would result from the potential reduction in yields and change of cultural practices.	The feasibility study on organics has been undertaken by the China formulation mission. Further analysis will be undertaken, preferably with a buyer from the private sector, during the design process. The recommended pre-assessments are also foreseen in the context of the design of the India project and will apply to any future projects that consider the introduction of organic agriculture.
China India	3.	IFAD	STRAT	ADV	It is suggested that for any small farmer project, a study should also be made of the feasibility of adopting organic methods if resource-poor small farm families lack fertilization options such as livestock and green manure.	IFAD's Asia and the Pacific Division (PI) has no record as to whether all small farmer projects have followed this suggestion. However, as IFAD-funded projects usually target marginal areas, the environment is often pristine; hence, they offer a good opportunity for slow-input or even organic farming. In China, an MTR recommended that the West Guangxi Poverty Alleviation Project should pilot organics, as that system worked very well for commodities such as tea. Because conversion to organics is a knowledge-intensive process, it was decided that no conversion should be considered without additional inputs, such as TA, but that environmental-sensitive technologies such as green manure should be promoted.
China India	4.	IFAD	STRAT	ADV	IFAD-funded projects can help farmer groups to establish the necessary strategies to achieve certification and provide information required for farmers to prepare for certification. Similarly, projects can initially cover the cost of certification, especially when high-earning cash crops are not involved.	In China, the MRDP in Xinjiang Uygur Autonomous Region sets out the necessary steps and reflects on approaches such as initial subsidies for facilitating the conversion. In addition, PI arranged a grant-for-work in the amount of US\$200,000 to the International Federation of Organic Agriculture Movements (IFOAM) in the Pacific subregion, to cover activities to disseminate low-cost in-country certification capacity and provide access to developed country certification using locally trained inspectors. The grant also includes a component for

Country	Serial N°	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at Completion Point Recommendation	Programme Management Department Follow-up
China India	5.	IFAD	STRAT	IME	Project designers should propose indicators of success that go beyond common measurements, such as the quantity sold and profits earned, and monitor impact and sustainability to include farmer organization empowerment and capacity-building.	helping obtain sponsorships for certification costs. In China, this is being done as shown in the formulation report for MRDP. In the Pacific, IFOAM will be requested to monitor farmer organization empowerment and capacity-building.
China India	6.	IFAD	STRAT	MKT	A market-oriented value chain should be developed that takes full advantage of each partner's strength, in order to fortify competitiveness while also ensuring a fair share for producers. A critical factor here is the need to integrate marketing support into organic development policies and projects. Organic markets are not always readily accessible. Helping farmers to first assess their market orientation and then access targeted organic markets often requires specialized help.	The appraisal mission for MRDP will invite a potential buyer from the private sector to carry out the assessment of market potential and other essential requirements. The IFOAM grant also includes further work on documenting and disseminating best practices in the region with regard to marketing of organic agricultural products.
China India	7.	IFAD	STRAT	ORG	Since NGOs and farmer organizations often lack the necessary skill to negotiate various aspects of marketing, IFAD-funded projects can help to organize an apex body or a network of organizations that can be subsequently strengthened by professional support and training in order to take advantage of scale economies, improve bargaining and significantly reduce transaction costs. A private-sector partner with such linkages (an NGO or private consultants) can, at least initially, provide marketing services. IFAD and other development agencies have a role to play in supporting this process and in helping to ensure a measure of equity for smaller farmers. It is not necessary to turn a farmer into a trader, but it is important to strengthen a farmer's knowledge and position so that he/she can effectively negotiate with a trader or private-sector partner.	The design of the MRDP recognizes and promotes the formation of groups for organics and natural resource management components. Furthermore, extensive training has been provided and a specialized extension system designed to address pertinent requirements. The IFAOM grant includes activities to analyse current organic agriculture relations with fair trade organizations and to promote private/public partnerships in marketing of organic products.
China India	8.	IFAD	STRAT	ORG	It is useful for IFAD initiatives to encourage farmer organizations to take up as much responsibility as feasible for critical aspects of the supply chain. This includes responsibility for quality management, some extension services, input production (planting material, fertilizer, etc.), internal verification and, most importantly, certification. The ownership of certification will be preferably controlled by the farmers so that they are not forced to sell their produce only to the certificate owner, but have the option to select different marketing opportunities and more effectively negotiate with buyers.	The advice of the evaluation has built up a basis for design and will be closely followed where possible and adjusted as necessary. The design considers various options of certification, including the ownership of certification and control as important elements. As above, for IFOAM, a key element of the grant is that it is designed to enable producers of organic agriculture to obtain the certification of their products at a reduced and affordable cost.
China	1.	CTRY	STRAT	ADV	It is vital that IFAD and the Government's organic strategies build adequate time into the learning process. Initiatives need to be committed to supporting a multi-year process for farmers to test and learn new technology and methods.	The process started in China with the COSOP.

Country	Serial N°	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at Completion Point Recommendation	Programme Management Department Follow-up
China	2.	CTRY	STRAT	ADV	The Government and IFAD should establish adequate time frames of at least five years for organic initiatives	Organics exist and a time frame of five years appears too long.
China	3.	CTRY	STRAT	ADV	The Government and IFAD could work together to ensure the availability and testing of appropriate inputs, such as professionally-bred organic seeds and useful cover crops, particularly in targeted project areas.	IFAD will examine the possibility of joint research.
China	4.	GOV	STRAT	RFI	The Government can provide incentives in the form of limited and/or temporary financial support, particularly for intensive farmers to cover yield declines during the approximately three-year transition period, so that they do not abandon their efforts in mid-stream.	IFAD will assist if so requested.
China	5.	GOV	STRAT	TCB	The Government can serve to integrate broad and relevant knowledge sources into organic initiatives, and not just provide general information. Investment in a knowledgeable extension service is critical.	IFAD will assist if so requested.
China	6.	CTRY	STRAT	TCB	The Government and IFAD should facilitate the acquisition of adequate technology and training, especially for extension service agents and farmer groups.	The design of the MRDP foresees extensive training; a specialized extension system has been designed to address pertinent requirements.
China	7.	GOV	OPER	STR	The Government might wish to consider developing a fund for farmers to cover initial financing needed for certification and for investments required to establish organic systems, i.e. vermin-composting, biopesticide production.	For the MRDP, IFAD suggests setting up a fund for certification.
China	8.	GOV	OPER	INR	Local know-how, especially that of experienced farmers and knowledgeable elders, can smooth transition and reduce risks with their particular crops and agro-ecological conditions. The Government can encourage such sources by formally acknowledging their value as “innovative farmers” and exploring ways to stimulate them, such as offering special training or tax incentives if their properties serve as model farms to teach others. Farmer-to-farmer learning models are well suited for this situation.	IFAD is aware of the knowledge and experience in organic farming in poor communities elsewhere in China. It is planned to tap into this knowledge during implementation through study tours, publication of material and other knowledge tools.
China	9.	GOV	OPER	TCB	It is important for the Government to provide farmers with good access to other external sources of knowledge on the application of organic methods, especially linkages to broader sources of research and knowledge about organic methods from international research institutions and organically-oriented organizations in other countries. These knowledge hubs are facilitated through Internet access and the establishment of farmer-friendly databases through the relevant government agencies.	Access to knowledge is being promoted under the project, for instance, through the Internet.
China	10.	GOV	OPER	MKT	The Government can provide initial impetus to establish organic trade fairs for marketing and the exchange of ideas.	Organic fairs are common in China.

Country	Serial N°	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at Completion Point Recommendation	Programme Management Department Follow-up
China	11.	CTRY	STRAT	ORG	Project designs should address organizational aspects of the targeted farming community. Farmer organizations might be considered as a central aspect of a strategy aimed at using organic agriculture as a tool for rural poverty reduction. However, approaches that target individual farmers should not be neglected. Organic conversion can involve a prolonged agricultural learning process as well as challenges in obtaining certification, meeting standards and marketing; and therefore local organizations are required to maintain such continuity. Addressing these needs both permanently and cost-effectively will require the strengthening of viable field-level organizations representative of their constituents.	Farmer and other 'viable field-level' organizations of various forms are fundamental to most IFAD projects in China. They are also being considered in connection with organics.
China	12.	GOV	OPER	ORG	The Government can facilitate the emergence of farmer organizations by publicly acknowledging their value and supporting their formation.	This is included in the current design of the MRDP.
China	13.	CTRY	OPER	TCB	IFAD can help with capacity-building at the farmer level by strengthening the internal management systems of local farmer organizations, so that they can help provide more local training and advisory services.	This possibility will be explored in the design of MRDP.
China	14.	CTRY	OPER	STR	The Government, IFAD and partner agencies can ensure that contract arrangements include the following conditions: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - equal participation of all parties (minorities, women and small households) should be ensured in decision making around an organic project; - fair share of the economic return for both sides is written into contracts; - responsibilities and obligations of parties involved should be clearly stated in the contract; and - integration of a good internal quality management system to help ensure quality, traceability and organic compliance. 	This will be considered in the context of marketing and possible contract arrangements in the new project.
China	15.	CTRY	OPER	STR	IFAD can be effective in achieving the adoption of organics by identifying leading farmers, preferably from the poorer strata of the target group, who have a personal or professional interest in organic agriculture, rather than trying to convert entire communities if the communities do not have a shared interest and belief in organics. Therefore the focus should be on good extension to teach and support likely converters, instead of general promotion to stimulate conversion.	This possibility will be explored in the design of MRDP.
China	16.	GOV	OPER	STR	The Government could offer incentives such as public purchasing to stimulate a basic market demand for organics and improve public exposure and information for them.	Not considered at present.
China	17.	GOV	OPER	STR	Negative biases in public expenditures that favour	IFAD will assist the Government in this if so requested.

Country	Serial N°	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at Completion Point Recommendation	Programme Management Department Follow-up
					conventional agricultural systems and discriminate against organic systems should be identified and improved alternatives formulated.	
China	18.	GOV	OPER	STR	The Government can identify priority areas in which to craft pilot training projects for extension services and test methodologies for this purpose. It is suggested that relevant parties should be involved in the design stages along with organic experts and farm leaders. Existing poverty mapping systems can be used to ensure that the selection criteria identify areas with smallholders and high poverty levels.	IFAD will assist the Government in this if so requested.
China	19.	CTRY	OPER	STR	IFAD can assist in developing criteria based on its long experience in working with poor communities; its projects can help train local extension services and improve their ability to reach the farmers most in need.	This possibility will be explored in the design of MRDP.
China	20.	GOV	OPER	STR	Systematic assessments of the current agricultural research system, with the support of internationally renowned organic institutions, can serve to rapidly identify research categories that will have the most immediate and important impact and then design a sequenced learning approach that will contribute to key organic improvements. Achieving the goals of the research would require the Government's budgetary commitment for at least five years and possibly the identification of alternative resources, such as international organic institutes to contribute their know-how.	IFAD will assist the Government in this if so requested.
China	21.	GOV	OPER	ORG	The Government can further improve farmers' benefits by establishing a consortium of learning institutions on this topic and funding the secretariat and its database.	IFAD will assist the Government in this if so requested.
India	1.	GOV	STRAT	TCB	The Government can serve to integrate broad and relevant knowledge sources into organic initiatives, and not just provide general information. Investment in a knowledgeable extension service is critical.	IFAD is currently supporting a component for organic agricultural production, formulated prior to the evaluation, in its Livelihoods Improvement Project in the Himalayas. Only one project loan has been made to India since the time of the evaluation. That project concentrated on women and financial services, but IFAD stands ready to support any government-initiated efforts in this area through its loans and grants programme. Indeed, it will be considering the potential for support to organic agriculture in the Rural Poverty Reduction Project for Middle Gangetic Plains currently under formulation.
India	2.	CTRY	STRAT	TCB	The Government and IFAD could join forces to facilitate the acquisition of adequate technology and training, especially for extension service agents and farmer groups.	This is being explored in the context of the ongoing Livelihoods Improvement Project in the Himalayas. It may also be explored during design of the new Rural Poverty Reduction Project for Middle Gangetic Plains, which will study the potential for supporting organic agriculture.
India	3.	GOV	OPER	INR	Local know-how, especially of experienced farmers and knowledgeable elders, can smooth transition and reduce	IFAD stands ready to support any government-initiated efforts in this area, through its loans and grants programme. This proposal

Country	Serial N°	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at Completion Point Recommendation	Programme Management Department Follow-up
					risks with their particular crops and agro-ecological conditions. The Government could encourage such sources by formally acknowledging their value as “innovative farmers” and exploring ways to stimulate them, such as offering special training or tax incentives if their properties serve as model farms to teach others. Farmer-to-farmer learning models are well suited to this situation.	could be considered in the design of the new loan.
India	4.	GOV	OPER	TCB	It is important that the Government consider providing farmers with good access to other external sources of knowledge on the application of organic methods, especially links to broader sources of research and knowledge on organic methods from international research institutions and organically oriented organizations in other countries. These knowledge hubs are facilitated through Internet access and the establishment of farmer-friendly databases through the relevant government agencies.	IFAD is ready to support any government-initiated efforts in this area through its loans and grants programme.
India	5.	GOV	OPER	STR	The Government might wish to consider developing a fund for farmers to provide initial financing needed for certification and for investments needed to establish organic systems, i.e. vermin-composting and biopesticide production.	IFAD is prepared to support any government-initiated efforts in this area through its loans and grants programme, possibly in the new Rural Poverty Reduction Project for Middle Gangetic Plains.
India	6.	GOV	OPER	MKT	The Government can provide initial impetus to establish organic trade fairs for marketing and exchanges of ideas.	IFAD is prepared to support any government requests for assistance in this area.
India	7.	IFAD	STRAT	ORG	Farmer organizations should be a central aspect of any strategy aimed at using organic agriculture as a tool for rural poverty reduction. Organic conversion can involve a prolonged agricultural learning process as well as challenges in certification, meeting standards and marketing. Therefore, local organizations are required to maintain such continuity. Addressing these needs both permanently and cost-effectively will require the strengthening of viable field-level organizations representative of their constituents.	As in China, farmer and other ‘viable field-level’ organizations of various forms are fundamental to most IFAD projects in India. They are also being considered in connection with organics.
India	8.	IFAD	OPER	TCB	IFAD could help support producer group formation among rural communities and help with capacity-building at the farmer level. This could be achieved by strengthening the internal management systems of local farmer organizations so that they can help to provide more local training and advisory services.	This proposal will be considered in the design of the upcoming project.
India	9.	CTRY	OPER	STR	The Government, IFAD and partner agencies could make sure that contract arrangements include the following conditions: - equal participation of all parties (minorities, women and small households) should be ensured in decision making around an organic project;	This possibility will be explored in the design of the new project.

Country	Serial N°	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at Completion Point Recommendation	Programme Management Department Follow-up
					<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - fair shares of the economic return for both sides is written into contracts; - responsibilities and obligations of parties involved should be clearly stated in the contract; and - integration of a good internal quality management system to help ensure quality, traceability and organic compliance. 	
India	10.	IFAD	STRAT	ORG	It is useful for IFAD initiatives to encourage farmer organizations to assume as much responsibility as possible for critical aspects of the supply chain. This includes responsibility for quality management, some extension services, input production (planting material, fertilizer, etc.), internal verification and, most importantly, certification. The ownership of certification shall be preferably controlled by the farmers so that they are not forced to sell their produce only to the certificate owner, but have the option to select different marketing opportunities and more effectively negotiate with buyers.	This will be considered in the context of marketing and possible contractual arrangements in the new project, and for the ongoing Livelihoods Improvement Project in the Himalayas.
India	11.	GOV	OPER	STR	The Government can identify priority areas in which to craft pilot training projects for extension services and test methodologies for doing this. It is suggested that relevant parties should be involved in the design stages along with organic experts and farm leaders. Existing poverty mapping systems can be used to ensure that the selection criteria identify areas with smallholders and high poverty levels.	This possibility will be explored with the Government when designing the new project.
India	12.	IFAD	OPER	STR	IFAD can assist in developing criteria based on its long experience in working with poor communities; its projects can help train local extension services and improve their ability to reach the farmers most in need.	It is not clear which criteria are referred to here.
India	13.	GOV	OPER	STR	The Government could also consider developing a level playing field for farmers engaged in organic agriculture.	IFAD will assist the Government in this if so requested.
India	14.	GOV	OPER	STR	Systematic assessments of the current agricultural research system, with the support of internationally renowned organic institutions, can serve to rapidly identify research categories with the most immediate and important impact and then design a sequenced learning approach that will contribute to key organic improvements. Achieving the goals of the research will require the Government's budgetary commitment for at least five years and possibly the identification of alternative resources, i.e. international organic institutes contributing their know-how.	IFAD will assist the Government in this if so requested.
India	15.	GOV	OPER	ORG	The Government can further improve farmers' benefits by establishing a consortium of learning institutions on this topic and funding the secretariat and its database.	IFAD will assist the Government in this if so requested.
India	16.	GOV	OPER	STR	In recognition of the valuable positive externalities	IFAD will assist the Government in this if so requested.

Country	Serial N°	Level	Nature	Theme	Agreement at Completion Point Recommendation	Programme Management Department Follow-up
					intrinsic to organics, such values ought to be explicitly encouraged and rewarded by the Government wherever possible. The Government's considerable purchasing power could go a long way towards encouraging organic markets with little explicit subsidy. Integrating organics into public purchasing can stimulate a basic market demand for organics and improve public exposure and information for them.	
India	17.	CTRY	STRAT	ADV	It is vital that IFAD and the Government's organic strategies build adequate time into the learning process. Initiatives need to be committed to supporting a multi-year process for farmers to test and learn new technology and methods.	This is recognized by IFAD and any efforts to work with organic agriculture in the new Rural Poverty Reduction Project for Middle Gangetic Plains will take a long-term approach while also building on IFAD's work in the Livelihoods Improvement Project in the Himalayas.
India	18.	CTRY	STRAT	ADV	Such recommendations include: - that the time required for an organic farming initiative is at least five years.	As above.
India	19.	CTRY	STRAT	ADV	The Government and IFAD might wish to consider working together to ensure the availability and testing of appropriate inputs such as professionally-bred organic seeds and useful cover crops, particularly in targeted project areas.	As above.
India	20.	GOV	STRAT	RFI	The Government could provide incentives in the form of limited and/or temporary financial support, particularly for intensive farmers to cover yield declines during the approximately three-year transition period, so that they do not abandon their efforts in mid-stream.	IFAD will assist the Government in this if so requested.
India	21.	CTRY	STRAT	ADV	IFAD could ensure the adoption of organics by identifying leading farmers who have a personal or professional interest in organic agriculture, rather than trying to convert entire communities if the communities do not have a shared interest and belief in organics.	This approach, already adopted in the Livelihoods Improvement Project in the Himalayas, will be taken up in the design of the new Rural Poverty Reduction Project for the Middle Gangetic Plains.