

Document: EB 2020/130/R.11/Add.1
Agenda: 7
Date: 5 August 2020 **E**
Distribution: Public
Original: English



Investing in rural people

President's Report on the Implementation Status of Evaluation Recommendations and Management Actions (PRISMA)

Volume II

Recommendations and follow-up actions taken by Management

Addendum

Note to Executive Board representatives

Focal points:

Technical questions:

Thomas Eriksson
Director
Operational Policy and Results
Tel.: +39 06 5459 2425
e-mail: t.eriksson@ifad.org

Dispatch of documentation:

Deirdre Mc Grenra
Chief
Institutional Governance and
Member Relations
Tel.: (+39) 06 5459 2374
e-mail: gb@ifad.org

Queries with respect to the response of the Independent
Office of Evaluation of IFAD to the report should be
addressed to:

Fabrizio Felloni
Interim Officer-in-Charge
Independent Office of Evaluation of IFAD
Tel.: +39 06 5459 2361
e-mail: f.felloni@ifad.org

Executive Board — 130th Session
Rome, 8-11 September 2020

For: Review

Contents

Abbreviations and acronyms	ii
Categories used for the classification of actions/ recommendations	vi
Corporate Level Evaluation: Corporate-Level Evaluation on IFAD's Engagement in Pro-poor value chain development	1
Corporate Level Evaluation on IFAD's Engagement in Pro-poor value chain development	1
Country Strategy and Project Evaluations (CSPEs)	5
Burkina Faso - Country Strategy and Programme Evaluation	6
Georgia - Country strategy and programme evaluation	9
Kenya - Country Strategy and Programme Evaluation	13
Democratic Socialist Republic of Sri Lanka - Country Strategy and Programme Evaluation	17
Tunisia - Country strategy and programme evaluation	21
Impact Evaluations (IEs)	24
Kenya: Smallholder Horticulture Marketing Programme	24
Project Performance Evaluations (PPEs)	27
Belize Rural Finance Programme	28
Côte d'Ivoire - Agricultural Rehabilitation and Poverty Reduction Project	30
Eswatini - Rural Finance and Enterprise Development Programme	32
Mexico - Community-based Forestry Development Project in Southern States (Campeche, Chiapas and Oaxaca)	35
Moldova - Rural Financial Services and Agribusiness Development Project	37
Nepal - Western Uplands Poverty Alleviation Project	39
Rwanda - Kirehe Community-based Watershed Management Project	41
Sri Lanka - Smallholder Plantations Entrepreneurship Development Programme	43
Historic Follow up from 2018	46
Corporate Level Evaluations	46
Corporate Level Evaluation: IFAD's Decentralization Experience	46

Abbreviations and acronyms

AFD	Agence Française de Développement
AGRA	Alliance for a Green Revolution
AMMAR	Agriculture Modernization, Market Access and Resilience Project
ASHA	Adaptation for Smallholder in Hilly Areas Project
AWMP	Agricultural Water Management Platform
AVANTI	Advancing Knowledge for Agricultural Impact
AWPBs	Annual Work Programme and Budget
BADEA	Banque Arabe pour le Développement Economique de l'Afrique
CAF	Development Bank of Latin America
CAR	Central African Republic
CATIE	Tropical Agricultural Research and Training Center
CD	Country Director
CABEI	Central American Bank for Economic Integration
CIAT	International Centre for Tropical Agriculture
CLAR	comités locales de asignacion de recursos
CPE	Country Programme Evaluation
CPM	Country programme manager
CPO	Country Programme Officer
CSOs	Civil Society Organizations
CSPE	Country Strategy and Programme Evaluation
DANIDA	Danish International Development Agency
DARD	Department of Agriculture and Rural Development
DiMMA	Dairy Modernisation and Market Access Programme
DoNRE	Department of Natural Resources and Environment
(DEM)	Development Effectiveness Matrix
DID	Développement International Desjardins -
DFIs	Development Finance Institutions
DPA	Partner services
DRC	Democratic Republic of Congo
DSF	Debt Sustainability Framework
EB	Executive Board
ECD	Environment and Climate Division
ECG	Environment, Climate, Gender and Social Inclusion Division
EMC	Executive Management Committee
ESA	East and Southern Africa Division
EU	European Union
FAO	Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations
FINCLUDE	Financial Inclusion and Cluster Development
FIPS	Faster Implementation for Project Strat-up Facility
FFS	Farmers Fields Schools
FMD	Financial Management Services Division
FOD	Financial Operations Department
GC	Governing Council

GEF	Global Environment Facility
MERESE	economic compensation mechanisms for environmental services
GIBADER	Inter-Donor Group for Agriculture and Rural Development
GIE	groupement d'intérêt économique
GIZ	Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit
GNIS	Geographic Names Information System
GOE	Government of Egypt
GOI	Government of India
GRIPS	Grants and Investment Projects System
IBRD	International Bank for Reconstruction and Development
ICBA	International Center for Biosaline Agriculture
ICO	IFAD Country Office
ICRAF	Ailene Florece of the World Agroforestry Center
ICT	Information and communication technology
IDB	Inter-American Development Bank
IED	Independent Evaluation Department
IFAD11	IFAD's Eleventh Replenishment
IFPRI	International Food Policy Research Institute
IOE	Independent office of evaluation of IFAD
IsDb	Islamic Economics and Finance Research
JICA	Japan International Cooperation Agency
KelCoP	Kenya Livestock Commercialization Programme
KfW	Kreditanstalt für Wiederaufbau
KIIWP	Kayonza Irrigation and Integrated Watershed Management Project
KM	Knowledge Management
KWAMP	Kirehe Community-based Watershed Management Project (Rwanda)
LENAFU	Lesotho National Farmer Union
LICs	low-income countries
LMIC	lower-middle-income country
MOSEDP	Market Oriented – Socio Economic Development Plans
MBFIs	member-based financial institution
AMEXCID	Mexican Agency for International Development Cooperation
MFNs	microfinance networks
MFIs	microfinance institutions
MICs	middle-income countries
MOA	Ministry of Agriculture
FONCODES -MIDIS	Ministry of Social Inclusion and Development's Social Development and Compensation Fund
MIS	Management Information Systems
MoFA	Ministry of Food and Agriculture
MTCP 2	Medium Term Cooperation Program Phase 2
MTR	Mid-term review
NGO	Non-governmental Organisation
SDR	special drawing right
WASH	nutrition and hygiene training
OPEC	Organization of the Petroleum Exporting Countries

OPR	Operational Policy and Results Division
OSC	Orientation and Supervisory Committee
ORMS	Operational Results Management System
PAFA-4R	Agricultural Value Chains Project in the Southwest, Hauts-Bassins, cascades and Boucle du Mouhoun Regions
PADFA	Agricultural Value Chains Development Programme
PAPFA	Projet d'appui à la promotion des filières agricoles
PBAS	Performance-Based Allocation System
PCR	Project Completion Report
PCU	Project Coordination Unit
PDR	Project Design Report
PIU	Programme Implementation Unit
PMI	Sustainable Production, Markets and Institutions Division
PMU	Programme Management Unit
PO	Professional Officer
PoLG	programme of loans and grants
PPE	Project Performance Evaluation
PPPPs	public-private-producer partnerships
PRAREP	Agricultural Rehabilitation and Poverty Reduction Project (Cote D'Ivoire)
PRiME	Programme in Rural M&E
PRM	Partnership and Resource Mobilization Office
PROFIT	Program for rural outreach of financial innovations and technologies
PROPACOM	Support to Agricultural Production and Marketing Project-Western Expansion
PO	Producer Organizations
PSC	Project Steering Committee
PTA	IFAD Technical Advisory Division
QAG	Quality Assurance Group
RAPID	Rural Agro-enterprise Partnership for Inclusive Development
RBA	Rome-Based Agency
RFSADP	Rural Financial Services and Agribusiness Development Project (Moldova)
RFEDP	Rural Finance and Enterprise Development Programme (Eswatini)
RFP	Rural Finance Programme (Belize)
RRP	Rural Resilience Project
RSP	Rural Sector Performance
RSPA	Rural Sector Performance Assessment
SARP	Smallholder Agribusiness and Resilience Project
SEDP	Socio-Economic Development Plan
SME	Small And Medium Enterprise
SPEnDP	Smallholder Plantations Entrepreneurship Development Programme (Sri Lanka)
STARR	Smallholder Tea and Rubber Revitalization Project
e-SISTAFE	Online State Financial Management System
SKD	Strategy and Knowledge Department
SSTC	South-South and Triangular Cooperation
SIP	Strategic Investment Plans
TAPS	Technical Assistance for Project Start-up

PDT	Project Delivery Team
TRE	Treasury Services Division
UNCT	United Nations Country Team
UNDAF	United Nations Development Assistance Framework
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNICEF	United Nations Children's Fund
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
VB/NSO	Village Bank and Network Support Organisation
WB	World Bank
WCA	West and Central Africa division
WFP	World Food Programme
WUPAP	Western Uplands Poverty Alleviation Project (Nepal)

Categories used for the classification of actions/ recommendations

SN Serial Number

Type of evaluation

CLE Corporate Level Evaluation
CSPE Country Strategy and Programme Evaluation
ESR Evaluation Synthesis Report
PPE Project Performance Evaluation
IE Impact Evaluation

Level

IFAD IFAD Corporate Level
CTRY IFAD Country Level
GOV Government Authorities (national, local level and institutions)
PROJ Project

Nature

PLCY Policy
STR Strategy Development, including COSOPs and Projects
OPER Operational and Implementation

Themes

DEC Decentralization
ALL Allocations
ASR Analysis, studies and research
BEN Beneficiaries and stakeholders' participation and consultation
CCA Climate change
COS Country Strategic Opportunities Programme (COSOP)
DES Project Design
ENG Policy engagement
FA Financial architecture
FRG Fragility
GDR Gender (including targeting to women)
GOV Governance
GRT Grants/ grants financing policy
INF Infrastructure
INN Innovation
KM Knowledge Management
LTR Land tenure
MVC Markets and value chains
NLA Non-lending activities
NRM Natural resource management
NTR Nutrition
ORG Organization development
PAR Partnerships
PMA Project management and administration (incl. financial management)
PVT Private sector
REPL Replenishments
RFI Rural finance
RME Results monitoring, evaluation
RST Restructuring
SCA Replication and scaling up
STRA Strategy
SUP Supervision
SUS Sustainability

TCB	Training, capacity-building
TGT	Targeting
YTH	Youth
F	Fully followed-up
NA	Not applicable
NAG	Not agreed upon
NYD	Not yet due
O	Ongoing
PA	Partially followed up
PD	Pending

Criteria:

- **full follow-up:** recommendations fully incorporated into the new phase/design of activities, operations or programmes, and the relevant policies or guidelines;
- **ongoing:** actions initiated in the direction recommended;
- **partial:** recommendations followed up partially, with actions consistent with the rationale of the recommendation;
- **not yet due:** recommendations that will be incorporated into projects, country programmes or country strategic opportunities programmes (COSOPs) or policies still to be designed and completed;
- **not applicable:** recommendations that have not been complied with because of changing circumstances in country development or IFAD corporate governance contexts, or for other reasons;
- **pending:** recommendations that could not be followed up; and
- **not agreed upon:** recommendations that were not agreed to by Management or the respective country team or government.

Corporate Level Evaluation: Corporate-Level Evaluation on IFAD's Engagement in Pro-poor value chain development

Corporate Level Evaluation on IFAD's Engagement in Pro-poor value chain development							
Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	2020 Follow Up	Status
CLE	1	IFAD	STR	DES	<p>Adopt a programmatic approach to value chain development. Value chain development requires long-term engagement and multiple-phase support. Project designs should systematically assess the degree of preparedness for value chain support, taking into account the local context and previous experience of the government, IFAD and other partners. Based on this, project designs should focus priorities and approaches for value chain strengthening.</p>	<p>As indicated in the Management response. Management agrees that the approach to value chain development is context specific and believes this would require differentiated support at the country and regional level. While overall Management is adopting a programmatic approach at the country level in line with the transition framework approved by the Executive Board, Management believes that this may not necessarily be the case for specific value chain development interventions. In certain countries, the VCD approach has become a familiar topic in project implementation and the capacity already exists to do more in this area. Therefore, a multiple-phased approach may not be needed in these contexts. In other countries, where capacity is still weak and the VCD approach is still not very well understood or there are many constraints in implementation, a phased approach may be more appropriate, but will be again context specific. With IFAD's strive to diversify its instruments to contribute more effectively to SDGs 1 and 2, it would seem more relevant to focus for example on tailored packages of policy-based or results-based lending,</p>	0

Corporate Level Evaluation on IFAD's Engagement in Pro-poor value chain development							
Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	2020 Follow Up	Status
						loans and/or grants to governments and NGOs, and direct support to VC actors through new financial products targeting the private sector, rather than on traditional multi-phased approaches which take a long time to come to fruition. Follow up for this recommendation would be on a country or project basis.	
CLE	2	IFAD	OPER	TGT	<p>Promote outreach to poor and very poor groups and gender equality.</p> <p>Project designs should lay out a theory of change explaining how benefits will reach very poor groups (including through wage employment generation), and identify the major barriers and how to overcome them.</p> <p>Project designs need gender analysis for the proposed value chains, specifying the strategies and measures for promoting gender equality, and affirmative action to enable women to take on new roles.</p>	<p>A theory of change is now a requirement for all IFAD projects. Management also agrees that it is important that projects describe how each category of poor groups will be reached by specific activities and VCD interventions, including women and youth. However, it should be noted that there may be tension between reaching the poorest groups and having a feasible and sustainable VCD intervention, which depends on reaching a certain level of market standards and good access to infrastructure. In fact, a VCD intervention is not always the most appropriate or relevant intervention to reach the poorest groups. In such cases, project design teams should be able to do the analysis and focus accordingly on other activities to reach the poorest (such as community development, capacity-building and training, nutrition and livelihood improvements, etc.). At the same time, IFAD's quality review mechanisms (such as the OSC, DRM and QAG) also play a role in reviewing project designs and making</p>	0

Corporate Level Evaluation on IFAD's Engagement in Pro-poor value chain development							
Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	2020 Follow Up	Status
						sure that targeting aspects are appropriately covered in all projects. The quality at entry ratings for projects designed in 2019 are positive and show that projects now have strong theories of change. Again, while at the corporate level guidance on ToCs and the quality assurance mechanisms to assess the robustness of ToCs has been put into place, this recommendation needs to be followed up on an individual project level	
CLE	3	IFAD	OPER	BEN	Promote inclusive value chain governance and an inclusive policy and regulatory environment, by establishing or strengthening multi-stakeholder platforms and interprofessional associations that provide small-scale producers and other value chain stakeholders with: (i) information on prices and markets; (ii) a venue for dispute resolution; and (iii) a voice in discussing the policy and regulatory system.	Management fully supports this recommendation as it has also observed that multi-stakeholder platforms have played a major role in promoting inclusive value chains and are a great venue for brokering partnerships with the private sector and other VC stakeholders. Almost all new IFAD projects with a substantial VCD component support the establishment or strengthening of multi-stakeholder platforms when appropriate. Project design teams and IFAD's quality review process will ensure that this continues to be the case for future VCD projects.	O
CLE	4	IFAD	OPER	PAR	Strengthen partnerships to enhance market intelligence throughout the project cycle. IFAD should collaborate systematically with organizations that have strong value chain expertise to ensure that projects are based on thorough analysis of commodity market structure, demand and	Management agrees with this recommendation, however, there could be certain limitations to this in practice as (a) expert VCD organizations and partners are not available in all countries where IFAD works, and one may need to call on international experts to transfer the expertise to these countries; and (b) partnering with expert organizations often	O

Corporate Level Evaluation on IFAD's Engagement in Pro-poor value chain development							
Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	2020 Follow Up	Status
					supply, price level and volatility, and barriers facing small producers.	means hiring them as service providers or as grant recipients, and resources are not always available to implement these partnerships. Therefore, while Management agrees to strengthen these partnerships, it is important to note that this would have resource constraints.	
CLE	5	IFAD	OPER	MVC	Sharpen approaches to value chain financing. IFAD needs to collaborate with organizations and impact investors with proven record in this area. A specific action plan on value chain financing could be based on a review of experiences in both borrowing and nonborrowing member countries.	One major reason why real VC finance instruments have been limited is because these instruments are mostly in the realm of the private sector, and governments are reluctant to use project resources to finance VC actors, while IFAD has so far not been able to finance the private sector directly. This is the one of the reasons why the ABC Fund was created to fill this "missing middle" financial gap. IFAD's Private Sector Engagement Strategy envisages more collaboration with impact investors, financial intermediaries and other development partners that can support VC financing. This collaboration will be based on a review of the supply and demand for VC financing in the markets where the collaboration will take place. A specific action plan for value chain financing across various countries, would be too general a document and would be easily become out-dated as market trends and financial dynamics change very quickly. This analysis is much better placed at country-level, when it is done on a time-	O

Corporate Level Evaluation on IFAD's Engagement in Pro-poor value chain development							
Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	2020 Follow Up	Status
						specific basis in the context of specific projects and initiatives.	
CLE	6	IFAD	OPER	TCB	Develop the capacity of project management teams and of IFAD staff through: (i) capacity-building partnerships with specialized international agencies and service providers, including training programmes for project managers and IFAD staff; (ii) institutionalized peer-mentoring between project management teams; (iii) a web-based knowledge platform to exchange information and establish a reference pool of expertise; and (iv) adjusting the requirements for the recruitment of project management teams, as well as for certain IFAD operational or technical staff.	Management had proposed the IFAD operations academy as an entry point for IFAD staff capacity building. However, with the COVID19 pandemic, IFAD has not been able to hold the operations academy sessions as planned. At the project level, IFAD is working on sensitizing Government counterparts during design and implementation on the need for VCD expertise.	0

Country Strategy and Project Evaluations (CSPEs)

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	2020 Follow Up	Status
Burkina Faso - Country Strategy and Programme Evaluation									
Burkina Faso	WCA	CSPE	1	CTRY	OPER	RME	Given the Fund's acknowledged comparative advantages, the Government and IFAD should concentrate future (medium-term) interventions in three or four priority regions, setting up an effective M&E system with good indicators for expected outcomes and underlying intermediate changes, based on the theory of change. Rigorous methods should be used for the collection of baseline data at the start, periodic collection of data on outcome indicators during implementation and impact measurement on completion.	PAFA-4R is only in 4 regions and these have also originally benefitted from former IFAD interventions. Support is being provided for the establishment of the M&E system, and the new core indicators will be fully integrated in this system. Adjustments are being made to the PAPFA baseline survey to align with the core indicators, so that the project is able to report on the core indicators. A focal point to support M&E at the Ministry of Agriculture has been designated by government, and will also be the contact person for AVANTI in strengthening the M&E aspect.	F
Burkina Faso	WCA	CSPE	2	CTRY	OPER	MVC	The Government and IFAD should pursue the value chain approach, include crops that benefit the poorest rural people in the interventions and cover the different links (production and post-production), while guaranteeing smallholders' and poor farmers' access to the various support mechanisms and services, ensuring they are not monopolized by certain stakeholders. Thus, identifying mechanisms for	As indicated in the new COSOP, the country programme places emphasis on value-chain development, with the enhanced role of the private sector and farmer organisations. PAFA-4R which became effective in February 2020 and was launched end of April is a fully-fledged value chain approach project that complements the PAPFA project focusing on rice, horticulture, beans and sesame, as well as aquaculture, and non-timber forest products development. In	O

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	2020 Follow Up	Status
							sustainable smallholder access to credit should be a priority.	2020, focus is on the production aspect of the VC to mitigate food insecurity in response to the covid-19 crisis. One project (Neer-Tamba) is establishing storage facilities for rice and horticulture products. As per the COSOP commitment, the targeting strategy focuses on supporting rural micro-enterprises to ensure that the rural small scale farmers benefit from the value chain interventions under implementation. Discussions are ongoing with financial services identified at design stage to avail access to credit for small scale farmers	
Burkina Faso	WCA	CSPE	3	CTRY	OPER	CCA	IFAD and the Government should pursue and emphasize interventions for the sustainable management of crop production resources in the selected priority regions and consider action in connection with other resources (grazing land, forests, aquifers), in collaboration with the other TFPs, to reduce the vulnerability of rural communities to climate change.	Sustainable management of crop production resources currently undertaken as soil and water management activities such as hydro-agricultural infrastructure and boreholes to provide water for horticulture and livestock; as well as mechanised cultivation (use of tractors). Working through local partners to provide training sessions for the beneficiaries on environment and climate change; and composting for improved soils quality. To address the climate change challenges (identified in the COSOP as a major challenge in the country) and alongside the	0

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	2020 Follow Up	Status
								<p>PAPFA project, a proposal has been submitted to GCF for funding of USD30M, that will be utilised for agricultural insurance, specifically, climate-related insurance.</p> <p>IFAD already collaborates with GEF and the Neer-Tamba project is benefitting from GEF funds for support to activities to address environment and climate change challenges, and to strengthen natural resource management initiatives.</p>	
Burkina Faso	WCA	CSPE	4	CTRY	OPER	ENG	<p>IFAD should be more effective in policy dialogue. To this end, it should support the Government with its policy of promoting value chains that benefit poor people and with ensuring the access of disadvantaged groups to production resources, primarily land.</p>	<p>Discussions undertaken with government to repurposes operations in response to the covid-19 crisis, and in line with fast-tracking value chain activities (production) to support local food production.</p> <p>Ongoing study undertaken by government to assess the impact of covid-19 on the agricultural sector and smallholder farmers, which will serve as a basis for dialogue on possible IFAD support to mitigate the identified impacts.</p> <p>Country team works in collaboration with other UN agencies in the context of the UNCT, and we have active partnerships with the AfDB, WFP, PARM, and FAO. An MoU with FAO to support knowledge</p>	0

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	2020 Follow Up	Status
								management is currently under development.	
Burkina Faso	WCA	CSPE	5	CTRY	OPER	KM	IFAD should prepare and implement its operational plan for capitalizing on and managing the knowledge gained from the portfolio interventions. Moreover, the Government, with IFAD support, should upgrade its national systems for knowledge management and the monitoring of all rural interventions.	IFAD programmes Knowledge fare planned for early 2020 but has been postponed due to insecurity concerns in the country, as well as the covid-19 crisis. Through the AVANTI and HELEVITAS initiative, IFAD will support government to strengthen knowledge management and monitoring of all rural interventions. A national focal person has been designated by government and a meeting will be organised once the covid-19 crisis is over.	O
Georgia - Country strategy and programme evaluation									
Georgia	NEN	CSPE	1	IFAD	STR	DEC	Establish some form of country presence or limit IFAD's engagement to cofinancing operations led by other development partners. Without a country presence IFAD cannot maintain the required flexibility, and at the same time consistency, in its engagement with a country such as Georgia, that is changing at such a fast pace and that is becoming increasingly demanding in terms of the kind of assistance it requires. For IFAD to play to its comparative advantage and add value, it has to leverage influence through	Increasing country presence in any country is guided by IFAD's corporate decentralization approach. Nonetheless, the Georgia portfolio is managed out of the Istanbul hub that has been strengthened with technical expertise to support.	N/A

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	2020 Follow Up	Status
							partnerships. A consistent strategy for policy engagement and KM - yet to be developed - will require dedicated resources and solid expertise on the ground. If IFAD cannot establish a country presence, it should confine its engagement to cofinancing operations led by other development partners. Past experience with cofinanced projects has shown that IFAD can achieve good results through strong partnerships. This would enable IFAD to focus its resources on critical areas where it can add value through lending and non-lending activities.		
Georgia	NEN	CSPE	2	CTRY	STR	RFI	Establish a strategic focus on rural finance and rural institution building, in line with Government priorities. Rural finance is an area where IFAD has built up a body of experience due to experimentation with different access-to-finance models. No other development partner in Georgia has similar experience and IFAD should continue to pursue this niche. Furthermore, now that Government is showing an increasing interest in grassroots institutions and the EU (through ENPARD) and the World Bank are supporting them, grassroots institutions can be the conduits for the financial products	Under the ongoing projects in Georgia (AMMAR and DiMMA) IFAD is involved in rural finance through the provision of matching grants to smallholders. The purpose of these grants is to improve the access to finance for smallholders, with special focus on youth and women. Moreover, and with the support from DANIDA, IFAD is also provided accessible finance/matching grants to young entrepreneurs.	F

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	2020 Follow Up	Status
							supported by IFAD. In this regard, IFAD should graft upon the work of others; there is no need to create parallel institutions unless absolutely necessary. It can also build on its successful relationship with MFIs. In the upcoming livestock project, MFIs should be used to target farmers and livestock cooperatives in the lower mountain regions.		
Georgia	NEN	CSPE	3	CTRY	OPER	TGT	Radically revise the targeting approach, to adopt an explicit strategy targeting those at risk of poverty and social exclusion within the rural population, in close cooperation with other development partners. IFAD has an important role to play in Georgia if it focuses clearly on the poorer parts of the rural population and in particular women and youth. For this, IFAD needs to do more to reach out to those parts of the rural population that are economically active, but at risk of poverty and social exclusion. Simply targeting entrepreneurial farmers and assuming that the rest will benefit indirectly will not be sufficient. IFAD has to adopt a differentiated targeting strategy that will support direct benefits for the relatively poorer parts of the population. Therefore, it is recommended that in	In DiMMA project IFAD's targeting approach is radically revised. The project will focus on the poorest farmers in the mountainous areas of the most disadvantaged regions in Georgia. During the implementation of DiMMA, we will make sure that this recommendation is fully implemented.	O

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	2020 Follow Up	Status
							<p>preparation for the new country strategy, and in cooperation with like-minded partners, IFAD should conduct robust poverty and gender analysis to provide the basis for identifying and reaching out to those groups that are at risk of poverty and social exclusion in rural development interventions, with a specific focus on women and youth. The outcome of the consultation would be to identify actionable strategies and, where possible, agree on coordinated interventions specifically targeted to rural youth and women, including single women and women-headed farming households. These strategies should inform IFAD's future project designs. Furthermore, any intervention supported by IFAD should ensure that women and youth from poorer households benefit equally. Interventions targeted at entrepreneurial farmers should ensure that entrepreneurial women are mobilized and benefit equally. Every project targeting value chains should include a commensurate set of activities that will give the private sector incentives to include smallholder farmers and also monitoring to ensure that the active poor benefit.</p>		

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	2020 Follow Up	Status
Kenya - Country Strategy and Programme Evaluation									
Kenya	ESA	CSPE	1	CTRY	STR	NLA	<p>Consistent with the importance and size of the Kenya portfolio, commit sufficient effort and resources to non-lending activities. In line with the recommendations from the last CPE, this CSPE highlights the need for engagement beyond lending, recognizing the significance of Kenya as a hub for international development partners and the size of IFAD's investment in the country. The next COSOP should define specific areas for policy engagement together with an actionable strategy and dedicated (financial and human) resources. This means that additional staff with relevant technical skills will need to be added to the ICO. Areas for policy engagement need to build on IFAD's comparative advantage in the rural sector and its long-standing experiences on the ground. It is expected that policy engagement will also benefit from the expertise available within the new Eastern Africa and Indian Ocean Hub of IFAD, based in Nairobi. Greater investment from loans and grants is needed in carrying out stocktaking of experiences and analysis of successful models that can effectively inform the lending operations. In addition,</p>	<p>The recently approved COSOP 2020-25 defines specific areas for policy engagement for the PDT to support the government of Kenya. Moreover, with decentralization, additional staff from technical departments is now available within the Hub to support non-lending activities. Concerning knowledge management, the Country Team continues to actively participate, as a member of the Agriculture Rural Development Donor Group to address various policy subject matters. In addition to discussing policy support to the country, experiences are shared, to better-inform project designs and implementation. Furthermore, the Kenya Hub Office is benefiting from the expertise of two officers, recently recruited to coordinate Knowledge Management and Communication. In October 2019, the EAIO Hub organized a knowledge exchange and learning event for East and Southern Africa region. Nairobi hosted an event that brought together staff from 24 IFAD-financed projects from 11 countries and covered wide range of thematic areas, including access to technologies for crop and livestock</p>	F

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	2020 Follow Up	Status
							mechanisms for cross-learning between projects and non-lending activities should be adopted as part of the annual portfolio review. More active contribution to and use of knowledge-sharing platforms (within IFAD and with other development partners) should be pursued, and IFAD should work to better integrate its M&E systems with national systems (NIMES, CIMES) as well with close partners such as FAO.	production, linkage to markets, access to rural finance, environment and climate change, gender, and youth. Participant to the event show cased and shared innovative approaches, tools and promoted joint learning among IFAD-funded projects (in EAIO, SA and SSTC hubs). They identified innovations through videos and documented cases for scaling-up, globally in IFAD, promoted inclusive transformation of the rural poor people in ESA and identified mechanisms to support continued knowledge and innovation sharing in the future.	
Kenya	ESA	CSPE	2	CTRY	OPER	TGT	Build on IFAD's comparative advantage and retain focus on selected themes and geographic areas. There is still "unfinished business" in the areas where IFAD has successfully worked in the past. IFAD's programme should continue its focus on NRM and climate change, value chains and rural finance. It should concentrate on consolidating its achievements (e.g. by strengthening market access), identify and strengthen linkages (e.g. between rural finance and value chains), and deepen inclusive outreach (e.g. to youth). Geographic stretch should be reduced through greater focus on selected counties in semi-arid areas. IFAD should build on places where it has established good relations and the CIDPs can	The portfolio remains and continues to focus on NRM, rural finance, market access, including in the Kenya Livestock Commercialization Project (KeLCoP) project currently under design (pending IFAD EB and Government approval). The Aquaculture Development Programme (ABDP), which was approved by IFAD's Executive Board in December 2017, focuses on expanding market access. In December 2018 IFAD's Executive Board approved an Additional Financing to scale up the Upper Tana Natural Resources Management Project (UTaNRMP). The Nairobi Water Fund is an innovative partnership supported by the Global Environment Facility (GEF) involving IFAD, The Nature Conservancy, the Coca-Cola	F

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	2020 Follow Up	Status
							integrate IFAD activities. To ensure stringency in its selectivity, IFAD should dialogue with the Government on aligning its requests with IFAD's comparative advantage in Kenya.	Company and the Government, with other parts of the country looking at possible replication. The Kenya Cereal Enhancement Project-Climate Resilient Livelihoods Window is implementing an innovative e-voucher scheme, with strong interest from the Government and other partners to scale-up. IFAD is also discussing with the Government on a possible future rural finance operation, building on the experiences of the recently closed Programme for Rural Outreach of Financial Innovations and Technologies (PROFIT).	
Kenya	ESA	CSPE	3	CTRY	OPER	DES	Address recurrent design and institutional issues undermining programme efficiency within the context of the ongoing devolution process. Lessons from over-ambitious and overly complex project designs have yet to be learned. Designs need to be realistic and implementable, supported by sound technical and institutional analysis. Given the complexity of the portfolio and the limited resources of IFAD's country office, inefficiencies in project management should be addressed by more realistic timeframes and better sequencing of activities. This would allow sufficient time to establish partnerships, recruit staff and conduct baselines. From IFAD's side, it should aim to reduce loan disbursement delays; from the Government's side, it should recruit project staff and set up AIEs in a more timely manner. Fiduciary controls should be retained in small but capable PMUs while at the same time seeking	Implementing arrangements of all ongoing projects strongly involve county governments and this will also be ensured in the new KeLCoP project under design. Operations Manuals of all projects have been designed accordingly. More systematic approaches for capturing counterpart and beneficiary contributions are also being implemented. Staffing of PCUs is increasingly being done through competitive recruitment involving specialized HR firms.	O

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	2020 Follow Up	Status
							greater integration with devolved government planning, financial procurement and M&E systems. Greater ownership at county level is desirable and could be fostered through participation right from project design and start-up (e.g. inclusive project launches). IFADsupported projects should make sure that they are included in the CIDPs and that county government budgets assume an appropriate level of cofinancing. IFAD and the Government should assess economic return and value for money more rigorously, particularly for value chain projects.		
Kenya	ESA	CSPE	4	CTRY	STR	PVT	In line with the Government's strategic planning, create space and opportunities for engaging the private sector. The success of the value chain and rural finance projects will to a large extent depend on the involvement of private sector players. Within the Government strategy (Big Four Agenda), the private sector is expected to contribute significant financing to drive the rural economy. In the value chain projects, the role of the private sector could be enhanced through improved supply of inputs, credit and market-related infrastructure (e.g. warehouses). IFAD will have to play a stronger brokering role between farmer groups and private sector partners. The public-private-producer partnerships will require	Both ABDP and the value chain project under design (KeLCoP) has a strong private-focus. ABDP supports the expansion of the aquaculture subsector by promoting the establishment and scaling up of agribusiness enterprises of all sizes, including rural groups that "graduate" to a more advanced and stable business model. The KeLCoP design proposes to foster partnerships between smallholder livestock farmers and enterprises, especially those investing in processing and adding value.	F

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	2020 Follow Up	Status
							strategies to identify and mitigate the risks and transaction costs for all stakeholders.		
Democratic Socialist Republic of Sri Lanka - Country Strategy and Programme Evaluation									
Sri Lanka	APR	CSPE	1	CTRY	STR	SUS	Sharpen the strategic focus and coherence of the country programme for stronger and more sustainable impact. The next COSOP should provide more guidance on what the country programme intends to focus on in terms of sectoral and thematic areas, geographical areas, targeting group and types of investments. Geographical focus may not need to be rigid and exclusive. But more reflection is needed to address the geographical disparities and "poverty pockets" as well as to improve the synergy and demonstrable impact of the country programme. In so doing, the country strategy and programme should better address and mainstream key priorities in the Sri Lankan context, i.e. climate resilience, nutrition and youth. In particular, in order to support climate-smart agriculture, IFAD and the Government may consider investing in climate-resilient infrastructure and improved/innovative technologies.	The COSOP CCR has been done, report reviewed and forwarded to government for revision. The review examined the validity of the strategic objectives and the degree of achievement of these objectives. For SARP design (approved by December 2019 EB), external groups (universities, research institutes, development partners, NGOs) were involved with Government agencies in the identification and prioritization of geographic areas vulnerable to climate, gender, youth and nutrition-sensitive issues, and the evaluation of the possible effects of ethnic division on the livelihoods of smallholder farmers. The Government and IFAD worked together with the UNDP, WFP, UNOPS to strengthen partnerships and mobilized cofinancing for SARP. IFAD brought to Sri Lanka portfolio targeting expertise that closely liaise with Government agencies for area specific knowledge, for the SARP design and ensured that vulnerable groups within smallholder farmers will effectively reap the benefits of SARP.	F
Sri Lanka	APR	CSPE	2	CTRY	STR	TGT	Strengthen the poverty orientation and develop a strategy for inclusive – but sufficiently discriminating – targeting. The COSOP and project	Although poverty in Sri Lanka is decreasing, income inequality has been a significant issue for the last few decades. The richest 20 per cent enjoy	O

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	2020 Follow Up	Status
							designs should provide a clear target group definition and targeting strategy relative to the strategic and geographic focus of the country programme. Given the low and decreasing poverty rate in Sri Lanka, the target group should inevitably be inclusive of those rural households marginally above the national poverty line but vulnerable to natural disaster and other shocks. To ensure outreach to the intended beneficiaries and to safeguard against elite capture, the strategy should be accompanied by a plausible screening mechanism for selection that caps the support provided to individual households. The strategy should be based on adequate assessment of the poverty reality and the constraints that the rural poor and near-poor face, and specific targeting measures to facilitate their participation. Targeting performance should be monitored during implementation.	more than half the total household income of the country, whereas the poorest 20 per cent get only 5 per cent. The situation of the poorest 10 per cent is worse, with the share of household income being 1.8 percent or less. Based on this, during SARP design sociologist and economist worked together to identify the distribution of poorest smallholder farmers and those most vulnerable to climatic events and incorporated the findings in project designs. Under SARP, a strategy to prevent elite capture and monitor targeting performance has been designed.	
Sri Lanka	APR	CSPE	3	CTRY	STR	SCA	Given IFAD's relatively small resource envelope, the IFAD-supported operations should aim at better "value for money" based on a more focused programme and a clear scaling-up pathway. For this, IFAD should invest more in analytical work, knowledge management and policy engagement at the country programme level and beyond the project level, which may be supported through the investment projects, by more effectively using	The SARP design is based on EFA, which takes into account the value for money of IFAD investments. The next COSOP will also include analytical work to be done with national institutions and development partners to find a better formula for estimating and verifying the value for money and the significance of future IFAD investments in Sri Lanka. This will also need to be streamlined with government input and IFAD's internal review	O

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	2020 Follow Up	Status
							grants and/or working with other like-minded partners.		
Sri Lanka	APR	CSPE	4	CTRY	STR	GRT	Furthermore, IFAD should be more aggressive in pursuing concessional or grant cofinancing in order to offer competitively priced financing packages to the Government. Not only in financial terms but also for strategic and technical collaboration, IFAD should do more to reach out to other development partners, increase in-country visibility and presence and inputs in development partners' forums and working groups.	SARP design built on past and ongoing IFAD-supported projects which offer enormous potential for scaling up IFAD's strategic work and future investments such as community mobilization, value chain development, the Private, Public, Producer Partnership (4P) model, the commercialization of agriculture and microcredits. IFAD team managed to mobilize cofinancing from UNDP, WFP and UNOPS for SARP and also identified specific activities to be implemented by these partners to compensate for the lack of capacity of MoA with respect to specific areas like community mobilization, mainstreaming and last mile infrastructure. The SAPP and STaRR programmes are developing knowledge management products to increase the visibility of IFAD cooperation with Sri Lanka. Under the roof of MoA, SARP and SAPP will cooperate with other donor-supported projects, namely those financed by the WB and EU.	F
Sri Lanka	APR	CSPE	5	CTRY	OPER	PVT	Strengthen the strategy and operational frameworks to enhance and ensure additionality of partnerships with the private sector. IFAD and the Government should explore opportunities for public/project support for risk-sharing and cost-sharing to leverage private-sector investment and	While significant steps have been taken in ongoing initiatives to leverage private sector investment and this has noticeably improved market linkages, further opportunities will be pursued to build on the 4P model to increase risk and cost sharing thereby reducing the burden on smallholder farmers. IFAD	O

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	2020 Follow Up	Status
							innovations which are less likely to occur without public investment. A more rigorous and transparent mechanism is necessary to assess additionality, before and after the investment.	is working with the government agencies to make every effort to increase transparency, identify areas for private sector involvement, and readily share information to achieve national objectives of rural poverty alleviation. At the MTR of the SAPP programme (June 2020), IFAD will evaluate the method of assessing additionality and liaise with experts to develop transparent and more structured assessment mechanisms. SAPP builds on and fine-tune existing private-public partnerships where applicable to ensure successful achievement of objectives.	
Sri Lanka	APR	CSPE	6	CTRY	OPER	RFI	Revisit the approach to rural finance support, sharpen the focus, and explore opportunities to innovate. IFAD should, in collaboration with the Government, CBSL and other development partners, critically analyse and reflect on the bottlenecks for the target group in the rural finance sector and opportunities for its support and investment to leverage more systemic improvement. This may include, for example, how best to facilitate the development of new financial products (not limited to credits) that meet the needs of the target group, how to address the issue of guarantors of defaulted loans, or how to strengthen financial literacy of the borrowers and enable them to manage their household finances better.	IFAD conducted an implementation support mission (January 2019) for rural finance initiatives for the two PMUs (SAPP and STaRR). The mission included meetings with commercial banks, microfinance association, private business partners, cooperatives and other civil society organisations and concluded with several recommendations for the short and medium term for the PMUs and relevant Government agency support. As a result, STaRR RF activities started late 2019 and a number of small loans were released to beneficiaries. The capacity of ongoing projects at the central and district levels to facilitate the establishment of a rural finance component were critically appraised during STaRR MTR and SAPP supervision mission. The 4P tripartite agreement will be simplified at SAPP MTR. The CBSL guidelines covering the direct line of credit	F

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	2020 Follow Up	Status
								and those regulating access to the Revolving Fund will be reviewed in a working group to reflect the financing of a wide variety of different value chains and production systems together with youth involvement in the loan contract components such as grace periods, loan tenor, etc.	
Tunisia - Country strategy and programme evaluation									
Tunisia	NEN	CSPE	1	CTRY	OPER	TGT	The Government and IFAD should ensure that in targeting financing and interventions, priority is given to the poorest and most vulnerable economically active populations, especially extremely poor family farmers, women and young adults. While geographic targeting should be based on poverty criteria, it should also be based on the rural economy's development potential in terms of agro-pastoral activities or economic activities connected with crop and livestock production. Social targeting should be geared more to the poorest and most vulnerable social groups, with a special focus on extremely poor family farmers, rural women and young adults. Furthermore, it should be based on tailored criteria identified through a more detailed analysis of the causes of poverty and the social context of targeted regions, closely monitoring them as part of the project monitoring and evaluation system. It is therefore recommended that IFAD adjusts its financing in favour of support that directly	A specific SO dedicated to the rural poor in the COSOP, particularly in response to the new Organic Law (29 January 2019) El Amen is specifically dedicated at combatting poverty (SO 3: Economic and social empowerment of vulnerable rural women and youth) Mapping of pockets of poverty in the poorest regions (Centre West) is planned in the new IESS project More support in terms of IGAs particularly dedicated to women and youth is planned in the new IESS project and introduced in PROFITS Household approaches to better target women and youth through specific approach as Graduation and GALs e.g. (Gender Action Learning System) in which all the members within the households will be considered. Specific indicators have been introduced in the logframes.	F

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	2020 Follow Up	Status
							strengthens the capacities and productive assets of the target households.		
Tunisia	NEN	CSPE	2	CTRY	STR	PAR	IFAD financing should further strengthen and scale up innovative interventions for the reduction of rural poverty, in coordination with a wide range of stakeholders. Projects should pursue support for pro-poor value chains that create large numbers of jobs so as to develop greater local value added, diversify sources of income and multiply employment opportunities in rural areas. Greater private-sector involvement appears key in this regard. To prevent risks to the most vulnerable value-chain stakeholders, it is essential to promote the resilience of the supported value chains to climate and market risks. To support the financing of rural value chains, projects should forge closer partnerships with financial institutions, and if necessary, help strengthen their capacity to expand financial services tailored to the situation and needs of small family farms and rural microenterprises. It is also important to expand partnerships between the projects and academic and research and development institutions to promote methodological and technical innovation, monitoring and evaluation, and recording and disseminating innovations.	It is planned to increase and improve Knowledge Management and promote more rigorous M\$E / control groups in the whole portfolio. In PROFITS, stakeholder platforms within the value-chains are supported and 4Ps are promoted. A specific component is dedicated to this in the new IESS project, to support inclusion of the rural poor in local value-chains and linkages with private entities. In IESS, financial education of the rural poor is planned in order to link them to the existing financial institution and develop specific tools adapted to their needs and resources.	O
Tunisia	NEN	CSPE	3	CTRY	STR	PAR	The Government and IFAD should strengthen their strategic partnerships to promote policy	Collaboration with new partners specialised in social approaches have been developed during	F

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	2020 Follow Up	Status
							engagement that benefits the poorest populations, including women and young adults. IFAD should strengthen its partnerships and engage in more regular exchanges with the country's other development partners to boost the effectiveness of its policy engagement to reduce rural poverty. The future COSOP should indicate areas for engagement that are aligned with the portfolio approaches and results, in addition to the resources that will be mobilized in support of this engagement. A recommended area for policy engagement, which will be based on experiences to come, should be inclusive and sustainable development approaches in agro-pastoral value chains and their associated economic activities in rural areas. More attention should be paid to making women and young adults part of the rural economic fabric.	IESS design (MAS, UTSS) and during COVID response, with a specific focus on women and youth. Involvement in policy dialogue and in donors' group have been increased. IFAD has been active in the reactivation of the donors' group with the WB and FAO. During COVID crisis, IFAD has contributed to the working groups set up by the Government and FAO to develop an Action Plan to mitigate the impacts of COVID 19 at short, medium and long terms.	
Tunisia	NEN	CSPE	4	CTRY	OPER	PMA	The Government and IFAD should consider tailoring the institutional implementation and anchoring of projects to the nature and thematic orientation of future country programme interventions in the context of decentralization. Institutional anchoring of IFAD-financed projects could be expanded in the future if the size and intervention areas of these projects are aligned with the mandate of State entities other than MARHP. At the regional and local level, project planning, implementation and monitoring and evaluation should be anchored in the country's	Extended partnerships with the Ministry of Social Affairs, NGOs and private entities are promoted and will be critical in IESS. The involvement of decentralised institutions in project implementation is implemented to increase the anchoring of the projects: the new project IESS-Kairouan will involve the newly elected local authorities in the project implementation at local level.	O

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	2020 Follow Up	Status
							decentralization process, based on the new Local Collectivities Code, with greater involvement of regional and communal political authorities.		

Impact Evaluations (IEs)

Kenya: Smallholder Horticulture Marketing Programme									
Kenya	ESA	IE	1	PROJ	OPER	MVC	In value chain-related interventions, adopt an integrated approach and a proper sequencing of activities. The successful development of a value chain requires both an integrated design and a proper sequencing of its building blocks or activities. The former entails considering the chain in its entirety, not restricted by internal geographic boundaries, and placing emphasis on upstream, production and downstream	This recommendation is being implemented by the Aquaculture Business Development Programme (ABDP), which supports the expansion of the aquaculture subsector by promoting the establishment and scaling up of agribusiness enterprises of all sizes, including rural groups that "graduate" to a more advanced and stable business model. This recommendation has been taken into account in the design of Kenya Livestock	F

							activities. Further, an integrated approach also requires proper sequencing of value chain interventions. Given the limited duration of IFAD-supported projects, when detailed design of activities is to occur after programme start-up, then meticulous planning and strict timelines become even more important for realizing the intended results.	Commercialization Project (KeLCoP), which proposes a comprehensive and integrated value chain approach. The project is proposed to have two integrated components namely focusing on both production, marketing, and supporting various actors along the value chain.	
Kenya	ESA	IE	2	PROJ	OPER	TCB	When strengthening relationships among value chain actors, allocate sufficient time and support for capacity development and behavioural shifts to take shape. Relationships exist between different groups of actors (e.g. producer and trader) and within the same group of actors (e.g. farmer to farmer). Enhancing and helping coordinate stronger relationships can potentially achieve a number of benefits to make the value chains work more effectively. However, programmes need to factor-in sufficient time and constant support for attitudinal shifts among actors to take effect, especially in contexts where trust among marketing group members can take longer to build. In this regard, training programmes should accord top priority to sensitization and training on group approaches and dynamics.	ABDP will broaden and deepen the aquaculture value chain with a series of strategic Public-Private-Producer-Partnerships (PPPPs) within a robust modern public sector framework as well as support for smallholder farmer groups' business plans. The recommended approaches are also being incorporated in the design of KeLCoP and will be monitored during implementation.	O
Kenya	ESA	IE	3	PROJ	OPER	TGT	Target individual entrepreneurs or smaller enterprises for agro-processing while positioning farmers as suppliers of raw materials. The	Both ABDP and the design of the KeLCoP project, includes sensitization, as well as training, in group approaches and dynamics. The KeLCoP design	F

							quantitative and qualitative results of this evaluation clearly underline three facts: (i) working in groups did not succeed as desired, (ii) the pilot initiatives for value addition did not work as expected and (iii) increases in incomes were mainly from increased production of commodities in primary form. Thus, focusing on a few, individual entrepreneurs or micro, small and medium enterprises and providing them with support for both upstream and downstream activities would have more impact, since farmer groups may lack the necessary capital and entrepreneurial attitude to make small agro-processing enterprises sustainable. This is supported by the results of the evaluation, which demonstrated that production of primary horticultural products was a profitable activity for farmers.	foresees supporting training, peer to peer learning and exposure visits to those participating in the selected value chains, as well as County level multi-stakeholder platforms.	
Kenya	ESA	IE	4	PROJ	OPER	INF	For infrastructure-related interventions, establish mechanisms for collaboration among stakeholders as part of the programme exit strategy. Long-term sustainability of social infrastructure such as markets requires effective mechanisms that establish clear rules of engagement among stakeholders and help imbibe ownership. The point of departure for establishing such mechanisms should be a negotiation of the respective roles and responsibilities of the stakeholders, an area where IFAD programmes can play an important role in facilitating agreement. The collaboration	This recommendation is already being implemented by ABDP. The programme works with rural communities within which aquaculture is being practiced by smallholders, engaging with existing village leadership structures and farmer organisations, and with existing and specially-formed groups with a shared interest in aquaculture production or closely-related support activities. Aquaculture pond construction will be considered only if the site has been selected properly and is intended for a priority Programme target group, with a focus on youth. Support for new facilities will be provided in a manner similar to that for rehabilitation,	F

						<p>should also encompass governance, including a dispute settlement mechanism and risk mitigation measures, and a clear and transparent revenue-sharing mechanism. For mechanisms to be appropriately enforced, it is important that they be institutionalized through a legal framework.</p>	<p>with beneficiaries contributing with labour, earth works and other resources in kind or cash. This valuable lesson has also been taken into account in the design of the KeLCoP project. For example, during implementation it is proposed that emphasis would be made to strengthen the capacity and readiness of entrepreneurs to undertake and sustain proposed enterprises. It is also foreseen that all investments in County infrastructure would be undertaken after ensuring that the County governments have the technical staff and allocated sufficient operating and maintenance funds for these facilities. SECAP procedures will be applied to ensure both environmental and social sustainability, including grievance mechanisms.</p>	
--	--	--	--	--	--	---	--	--

Project Performance Evaluations (PPEs)

Belize Rural Finance Programme									
Belize	LAC	PPE	1	CTRY	STR	RFI	<p>Continue to support the rural financial sector in Belize. The BRFP gave the credit union movement substantial brand visibility as an agent of rural development, reinforcing relationships with the Government and CBB, along with external organizations (including the IADB and the EU). It also established rural markets and credit union technical capacities to serve them. The Government can leverage this visibility, interest, and capacity through modest ongoing policy and programme support. This would include supporting the BCUL events and exchanges as low cost ways of keeping rural markets on the credit union movement agenda, and supporting the IADB Inclusive Savings with Shared Agents programme to expand agent banking in rural Belize. The Government should also work to ensure that the new IFAD Be-Resilient programme connects smallholder value chain actors with credit unions (and other financial institutions).</p>	<p>The most effective way to continue to support the financial sector in Belize is through the ongoing programme "Resilient Rural Belize". While this program does not include a rural finance component, it will involve the Credit Unions to provide loans to producers' organizations (POs), which will be asked to co-finance project investments. Modalities to facilitate POs access to financial services, to enhance CUs capacity to deliver those services efficiently, and required policy engagement, will be defined during the second semester of 2020, as the investment component will hopefully enter active implementation. Possible delays may be due to the COVID emergency and current country lockdown.</p>	O
Belize	LAC	PPE	2	CTRY	OPER	MVC	<p>Be fully market driven, and design incentives to meet expressed beneficiary/stakeholder demand. Both new members and credit unions articulated market-driven needs: beneficiaries wanted loans and credit unions wanted to lend. This was the market context even as good practice inclusive finance suggests</p>	<p>The current program "Resilient Rural Belize" includes a Value Chain market assessment, and a Climate Vulnerability Assessment, as a basis to prioritize project activities. Further plans involving producers organizations input cascade down from these two</p>	O

							saving is key to poverty alleviation. Future programmes working at the micro level must be well-informed of, and respond flexibly to, demand. To be more effective, a programme must use incentives to directly address new member and credit unions market-based interests. To ensure outcome sustainability, credit unions need to be able to calculate the rural member's long-term net business value to prove the market development case.	assessments in order to establish specific plans based on geographic priorities	
Belize	LAC	PPE	3	CTRY	OPER	DES	Undertake foundational market intelligence before substantial activities begin on the ground. BRFP was designed to rely on good practice market and organizational analysis (i.e. credit union diagnostics) to meet performance expectations. Due to delays, the programme was past the mid-term point before these foundational activities were undertaken. Future programmes must resist starting/expanding programme activities before findings from important market and institutional studies (in this case credit union diagnostics) are available.	(same as per previous follow-up on serial number 2) The current program "Resilient Rural Belize" includes a Value Chain market assessment, and a Climate Vulnerability Assessment, as a basis to prioritize project activities. Further plans involving producers organizations input cascade down from these two assessments in order to establish specific plans based on geographic priorities	O
Belize	LAC	PPE	4	CTRY	OPER	PMA	When poor programme leadership is evident, rectify it immediately. IFAD should require an annual, formal evaluation of project staff performance. The Government should empower steering committees to govern to best practice standards and establish their	Performance evaluations are carried out for the "Resilient Rural Belize", at the end of probation periods and before contract renewal, ie every year or every two years	F

							mandate to take decisive actions based on demonstrable performance issues, including key staff changes.		
Côte d'Ivoire - Agricultural Rehabilitation and Poverty Reduction Project									
Côte d'Ivoire	WCA	PPE	1	CTRY	OPER	TGT	In interventions involving rehabilitation, IFAD should ensure that training and input distribution take into account the specificities of gender and of the social groups concerned. Free access to agricultural rehabilitation kits should be provided only for the poorest and most disadvantaged groups.	Learning from the past, an external expertise has been carried out during PROPACOM implementation to improve beneficiaries targeting modalities, promote social inclusion and strengthen gender mainstreaming. We fully agree that targeting strategies should be developed with differentiate approaches. In the new project PADFA, the targeting strategy takes into account the differences in terms of needs and constraints of the different categories of target group. An inclusive targeting strategy will be developed to ensure that poorest farmers and vulnerable groups are reached and receive grants to develop their economic activities and increase their resilience.	F
Côte d'Ivoire	WCA	PPE	2	CTRY	OPER	TCB	IFAD and the Government should systematically include capacity-building for farmers' organizations in their interventions (including post-crisis), particularly in food value chains lacking in investments by the private sector or multinational actors. It is important to build-in sustainable arrangements to provide access to input credit at the design stage.	We fully agreed that sustainable approaches based on cooperative or farmer organizations must be developed to supply seeds and inputs. Within the framework of the PROPACOM and PADFA, supports for the structuring and professionalization of producer organizations are prioritized to improve their capacity to provide services to their members, including the provision of seeds and inputs. In order to ensure the sustainability of the supply of inputs, PROPACOM has set up a mechanism to replenish input funds in partnership with microfinance institutions. We agree	F

								also to continue using the ESOP model, which has been consolidated and strengthened by PROPACOM, through capacity building of affiliated cooperatives, particularly in governance and access to credit for working capital needs. Under the recently approved PADFA, capitalizing on the experiences and lessons learned from PROPACOM, IFAD and the Government have opted for the ESOP model in the rice value chain.	
Côte d'Ivoire	WCA	PPE	3	CTRY	OPER	PMA	IFAD and the Government should consider not having two projects managed by a single PMU. In the event that this is the only option available, there should be provision for additional staff cover key functions such as accounting, procurement, M&E and technical aspects.	This recommendation has been taken into account. PADFA, approved by the IFAD Executive Board in September 2017, is managed by a PMU different from the one of PROPACOM. We also agree that the PRAREP suffered for the weaknesses of its monitoring and evaluation system, which has not always functioned as learning tool for future projects. We totally agree that a monitoring and evaluation system needs to continuously and systematically generate knowledge. It needs to be a tool for lessons learned and showcase success stories in to improved project implementation and avoid mistakes made.	F
Côte d'Ivoire	WCA	PPE	4	CTRY	OPER	INN	IFAD and the Government should promote research and development to improve cropping practices (such as the use of pesticides, herbicides, and unbalanced fertilization) which have potential adverse effects on natural resources and support	PROPACOM is currently addressing sustainable land and water management as well as conservation agriculture through the ASAP funding. In this context, the project disseminated information on the misuse of pesticides and their negative effects on food safety. PADFA plans to help farmers define priority actions to strengthen the resilience of their agricultural ecosystems. The technical activities will adopt the	F

							participatory development of sustainable technologies for food cropping systems.	principles of climate-smart agriculture including integrated soil fertility management, crop rotation and association, as well as the rational use of plant protection products.	
Eswatini - Rural Finance and Enterprise Development Programme									
Eswatini	ESA	PPE	1	CTRY	OPER	DES	Future rural finance and/or enterprise development projects in Eswatini should be designed taking into account a detailed diagnostic assessment of the institutional structure in the financial and SME sectors. Such project(s) should formulate designs based on the specific constraints in the context and incorporate interventions which can be realistically undertaken within the rubric of those constraints to ensure that projects can be implemented without the need for substantial adjustment and redesign during implementation, as happened in RFEDP.	The design of the Financial Inclusion and Cluster Development Project (FINCLUDE) is based on a detailed analysis of the policy framework for inclusive rural economic growth and institutional and sectorial analysis. Based on these assessments, FINCLUDE, bring several key elements of these policies to implementation.	F
Eswatini	ESA	PPE	2	CTRY	OPER	PMA	Future projects should exert more direct control over the quality of all aspects of project implementation. This includes M&E, coherence of implementation, and strategic direction of the project, among others. This may take the form of building capacity in the project implementation units and providing dedicated, ongoing technical support. This will enable the implementation team(s) to better set the direction of the project and reach target	One of the major differences between Rural Finance and Enterprise Development Programme (RFEDP) and FINCLUDE is the strong emphasis and systematic strengthening of the M&E systems from the beginning in FINCLUDE. While the RFEDP was relevant, its design underestimated the complexity of Micro, Small & Medium Enterprises (MSME) with finance. Design and early implementation underestimated the interest and/ or capacity of business development service providers and financial institutions to advance the	F

							populations without depending on partners and other implementing agencies to do so, as witnessed in implementation partnership model adopted by RFEDP.	programme's goals in a way that maximized outcome results. These factors compounded a lack of early programme clarity around target beneficiaries and their needs, which was further impeded by a M&E system unable to provide data until late in the programme. The programme did meet or exceed all enterprise training targets, and despite uneven outcome achievements deepened stakeholder understanding of how to stimulate rural enterprise and inclusive financial sector development potential. While lacking some technical assistance and strategic guidance, and despite early capacity issues, programme management was consistently competent and, save for M&E, management issues did not distract from implementation.	
Eswatini	ESA	PPE	3	CTRY	OPER	RFI	Future rural finance projects should consider appropriate mechanisms and institutions to engage target groups, especially survivalists. More specifically, savings and credit groups should be given due consideration as one of the main entry points into the rural finance sector interventions. Such emphasis is especially important given the lack of an enabling environment and institutional matrix in the country and the resultant "missing middle". These groups also have potential for aggregation at various levels in the form of apexes and as future entry points to engage other financial institutions in Eswatini.	One of the key outcomes of the new FINCLUDE is to support the development of savings and credit groups and linking these with Formal Financial Institutions to cater for the financial needs of the survivalist groups. A database of savings and credit groups will be compiled, profiling in detail the users of these informal financial institutions to benefit from the financial education programme designed under FINCLUDE. The project - through the Capacity Enhancement and Policy Development Facility (CEPD) - deliberately purposes to support the establishment and capacity building of an Apex Body to support the graduation of savings groups' beneficiaries to mainstream formal financial institution. The different strata of the beneficiary structure	F

								<p>highlights the need for the different mixes of financial services (asset protection, payment and transaction mechanism, insurance, start-up capital, risk protection, safe saving and remittances). The Financial Education programme which will be mainstreamed in all the activities will be geared towards ensuring that all segments including “the missing middle” able to access and use financial services under the FINCLUDE area.</p> <p>The design document further advocates for proper segmentation of the market, customer service segmentation and data availability addressing density issues, needs, and disparities of the various segments of the rural communities where most of the survivalist groups a located.</p>	
Eswatini	ESA	PPE	4	CTRY	OPER	TCB	<p>Enterprise development activities should be seen as a continuous and iterative process, with ongoing mentoring and coaching being an integral part of trainings. Emphasis in the trainings should be placed on integrating them with rural finance activities. Such integration is important to ensure that project achievements go beyond the output level and result in substantial outcomes and impacts for the target groups</p>	<p>The FINCLUDE design is based on continuous integral coaching and mentoring addressing both the supply and demand side of the rural finance. The assumption is that a change is a process that takes time. It is not achieved by one-off training courses or investment in standalone infrastructure, no matter how important. The transition from subsistence to successful market-oriented farming is a gradual process that takes time. Smallholders need to be mentored through this transition, but in ways which do not create new dependencies. Similarly, relationships and trust between producers, buyers and suppliers also takes time to grow and must be deliberately nurtured</p>	F

Mexico - Community-based Forestry Development Project in Southern States (Campeche, Chiapas and Oaxaca)									
Mexico	LAC	PPE	1	CTRY	OPER	PVT	<p>Involve the private sector in value chain development activities, market linkages and provision of technical assistance</p>	<p>As part of the executing agency' efforts (CONAFOR) in supporting sustainable rural businesses, the current IFAD ongoing project, PRODEZSA, has started to identifying private sector entities that could strengthen the profitability of rural businesses working in semi-arid areas, linking them to markets and/or providing the necessary technical assistance for the rural entities to grow along the chain.</p>	O
Mexico	LAC	PPE	2	CTRY	OPER	SUS	<p>Incorporate an exit strategy permitting sustainability of the long-term benefits, definition of the time periods for incorporation of new actors in the project's activities and plans for uptake and institutional learning from the experiences gained.</p>	<p>CONAFOR (DECOFOS's executing agency) has defined and put in place two key strategies that will support the sustainability of its actions. On the one hand, a territorial strategy that seeks to promote institutional coordination in priority geographical areas with other public entities (CONAZA, SADER). On the other hand, it has developed a strategy that looks at strengthening an extension system that will provide technical support to the targeted rural businesses.</p>	F
Mexico	LAC	PPE	3	CTRY	OPER	CCA	<p>Inclusion of specific plans and strategies for adaptation to climate change within IFAD projects under implementation and in the drawing up of the new COSOP. Given Mexico's high vulnerability and that of the rural population to the effects of climate change, it is recommended that the new generation of IFAD projects have a specific strategy that includes clear targets, activities and impact indicators,</p>	<p>The new 2020-2025 COSOP incorporates a specific objective related to climate change adaptation and mitigation. This will be a starting point to boost projects and strategies for adaptation and mitigation to climate change during this period. Moreover, after DECOFOS' experience CONAFOR has maintained the inclusion of women and people with no agrarian rights within its policies for intervention (Reglas de operación). This has</p>	F

							so as to measure the outcomes of climate change adaptation and mitigation activities. In addition, it is recommended that the innovation promoted by DECOFOS and the inclusion of women and people with no agrarian rights remain among CONAFOR's policies, due to the vulnerability of these groups to the effects of climate change.	generated benefits not only to the ongoing PRODEZSA project, operating in Mexico's semi-arid areas, but also to the whole CONAFOR as institution focusing on forest management.	
Mexico	LAC	PPE	4	CTRY	OPER	KM	Establishment of a system for knowledge management and systematization within IFAD projects. It is recommended that CONAFOR establish a system to manage the knowledge derived from projects, beginning with the establishment of a sound monitoring and evaluation system that allows for impact measurement and the dissemination and transfer of lessons learned to future projects and other institutional actors	Since the implementation of DECOFOS, CONAFOR has incorporated a Monitoring and Evaluation specialist within the PCU of IFAD projects, in order to strengthen the M&E systems that each project uses. This position is key to guarantee coordination and the flow of information with the monitoring system that the institution has for the rest of its activities. The M&E systems of IFAD projects currently (PRODEZSA) have also been strengthened incorporating a historical record of georeferenced productive activities, classified by unit of intervention (ejido, community, participatory group). This information is key to assess where to develop targeted intervention strategies that respond to the needs of vulnerable rural populations, IFAD's target groups. However, CONAFOR is still working on systematizing all the knowledge generated into tangible products for broader diffusion.	O

Moldova - Rural Financial Services and Agribusiness Development Project									
Moldova	NEN	PPE	1	CTRY	OPER	TGT	<p>Enhance the targeting approach. IFAD cannot exclusively rely on self-targeting if it wants to reach its intended beneficiaries. For the "trickle down" effect to be effective it needs to be studied carefully ex ante to ensure that support will actually reach poor farmers, or result in the hiring of poor people, and that specific strategies to ensure this are put in place. Moreover, "trickle down" effects have to be monitored and demonstrated concretely with disaggregated data collection on amount and type of waged employment – who is benefiting and how - as well as data on whether the activities contribute to pulling people out of poverty and are attractive enough (e.g. to address youth migration).</p>	<p>The targeting approach for the newly designed project (TRTP) is entirely addressing this recommendation. In line with TRTP strategy, on-going IFAD-funded projects in Moldova have moved from the trickle down approach to an emphasis on direct targeting, with a much higher poverty focus closely and regularly monitored (targeting experts are systematically recruited on Implementation Support or Supervision missions to follow-up on this instrumental dimension to achieve the projects' development objectives). Moreover, the Project Management Unit put in place a performing M&E system (rated satisfactory during supervision missions since 2016) with a disaggregated focus on poverty trend and income generation at beneficiary level.</p> <p>Concretely, targeting rural smallholders, women and youth under on-going projects, is translated through dedicated activities such as:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Micro-lending to Saving and Credit Associations (mainly composed of women); - Young Entrepreneurs Financing to address, among other, youth migration; - SMEs Financing to provide employment opportunities to rural poor. 	F
Moldova	NEN	PPE	2	CTRY	OPER	RFI	<p>Deepen the strategies of the financial sector by diversifying IFAD support to credit lines. The financial sector has been relying on IFAD loans to increase longer-term liabilities for too</p>	<p>The TRTP project has taken into consideration the above mentioned recommendation, by shifting from providing line of credit to SMEs, to support MFIs to provide small size loan.</p>	F

							<p>long. It would be advisable for IFAD to engage with the Government of Moldova and financial sector actors to design exit strategies with concrete time frames to phase out traditional IFAD support (loans to ensure lines of credit) in favour of new rural finance products. IFAD and financial sector stakeholders should be working towards developing deepening strategies. There are large amounts of remittances flowing into the economy that are directed towards consumption rather than to rural investments. Analysis also indicates that a savings culture (especially longer-term) is not well developed in the country. Much of the agricultural production takes place at household level where financial literacy and management are not up to par. The possibilities of directing remittances towards rural investment and supporting savings are opportunities that need to be examined further in future IFAD projects.</p>	<p>Moreover, TRTP intends to support the National Commission for Financial Market (NCFM) to strengthen the Saving and Credit Association (SCA) sector, in particular, through the creation of a Savings Guarantee Fund and Stabilisation Fund, to accompany savings activities from SCAs and create an environment for both bank deposit and savings protection. Furthermore, institutional support to NCFM aims to attract and channel remittances towards rural investments supporting food and nutrition security (through the Financing Facility for Remittances) as well as address financial literacy gaps. On the latter, a guide has been elaborated (https://www.ucipifad.md/wp-content/uploads/2018/12/Ghid_-Educatie-financiara.pdf) to train SCA members on financial topics and 4 video spots have been developed and uploaded on different social media platforms for broader access.</p> <p>With the Rural Resilience Project (RRP), IFAD is supporting the set-up of the Moldova Credit Guarantee Fund for micro, small and medium sized enterprises (MSMEs), for non-banking institutions to provide financial resources to rural economic actors.</p>	
Moldova	NEN	PPE	3	CTRY	OPER	MVC	<p>Apply an agro-business and agro-processing development approach. IFAD has been struggling with articulating an operational approach to value chain development in Moldova. Future projects in Moldova should</p>	<p>Fully Achieved: TRTP takes on board this recommendation by focusing on agro-business/agro-processing activities, on capacity building as well as the provision of technical support to smallholders. The support that the project will provide to existing and new</p>	F

							<p>focus on agro-business and agro-processing development for smallholders enabling them to add value to their primary products, building their capacity to deal with different value chains and to shift swiftly from one value chain to another, as well as providing them with the necessary technical and organizational knowledge/knowhow to efficiently manage their businesses.</p>	<p>cooperatives, and the integration of smallholders in this process will help farmers to add value to their products and ease market access.</p> <p>Accordingly, an Agribusiness Specialist will be hired to reinforce the CPIU to coordinate the agro-business and agro-processing activities in TRTP. The project will also put in place innovative arrangements for investments in collection and grading centres, warehouses, cold storages and agro-processing facilities, refrigeration trucks, branding, marketing as well as providing equipment and materials.</p> <p>Moreover, a consulting firm with strong expertise in business development, will be recruited to provide mentoring and coaching services, establish market linkages and strengthen producer associations. Similarly, a firm will also be hired to provide mentoring coaching and business development services to young entrepreneurs and women who will be assisted to facilitate access to subsidies and interest rate rebates.</p>		
Nepal - Western Uplands Poverty Alleviation Project										
Nepal	APR	PPE	1	CTRY	OPER	DES	<p>Strengthen and replicate the model of social mobilizers from phase III and incorporate it into project designs as a means of building local technical support services and supporting youth employment in remote far- and mid-western districts of Nepal. The successful model of using social mobilizers should be continued in other projects and strengthened</p>	<p>No active project in far-west region currently. ASHA and ASDP are the ongoing projects in mid-west. ASHA has already recruited and ASDP has a plan to recruit social mobilizers in 2020. All social mobilizers are/will school graduate youths, with a priority to women, in agriculture (crop or livestock).</p>	F	

							by targeting women and youth for recruitment to social mobilizer positions. They must be provided with training to improve their service provision as well as support to develop their own career. The training of youth and the creation of local opportunities are especially important given the massive migration in Nepal.		
Nepal	APR	PPE	2	CTRY	OPER	ENG	Further support to WUPAP cooperatives should be incorporated into existing or new IFAD interventions. Former WUPAP beneficiaries and cooperatives that have proven sustainable and are in the same districts and villages as other existing and planned IFAD projects should be considered for inclusion, particularly ones linking smallholders to markets. For example, value chain projects in Dailekh and Kalikot districts could include WUPAPtrained farmers and cooperatives in their market access activities to increase the impact of their improved agricultural productivity and greater assets, while extending their outreach to poorer and more vulnerable groups.	ASDP has invited expression of interest from the interested cooperatives and farmer groups promoted by WUPAP in these districts for three selected supply chains - offseason vegetable, goat and dairy. The proposals received are at various stages of evaluation however has come to a halt due to ongoing COVID-19 situation as the country is in lockdown period currently. ASDP adopts an inclusive approach so that the poorer households are also expected to benefit from this new project.	O
Nepal	APR	PPE	3	GOV	OPER	PMA	Government stakeholders at all levels, but especially local and state, should provide strong and continued engagement in IFAD projects in the mid-and uplands. The full engagement of relevant line agencies and	ASDP has signed MOUs with 21 municipalities and helped them to establish a Municipal Agriculture Committee. The project will support the municipalities in strengthening their capacity in terms of agricultural planning and execution. ASHA has established a very	F

							local authorities in providing services and supporting rural municipalities should be ensured from the start of projects. This can be done, for instance, by drawing up a performance agreement, specifying their engagement and including quality specifications and funding to support their involvement. Qualified government project staff should be deployed to project areas for longer periods, with their presence and involvement guaranteed. Government representatives should participate in supervision missions to ensure project ownership. Local authorities need to be involved in project implementation, particularly when projects are using participatory community development mechanisms such as the CIP for greater sustainability	good coordination mechanism with municipalities where Local Adaptation Plan of Action (LAPA) are endorsed by respective municipalities before implementation. It is interesting to note that some of the municipalities have contributed fund for LAPA implementation. Representatives of federal ministries participated in 2019 supervision of both ASHA and ASDP projects. Supervision mission for both projects are planned in the 2nd half of 2020.	
Rwanda - Kirehe Community-based Watershed Management Project									
Rwanda	ESA	PPE	1	CTRY	STR	DES	Aim for a programmatic approach in area development projects. A greater use of a programmatic approach, covering a longer time frame than the typical five to seven-year project, should be encouraged to not only implement integrated development interventions but also to fully exploit the complementarities and synergies between them. The complexity of such programmatic interventions should be commensurate with the installed capacity and institutional maturity	Building on the lessons learned from the Kirehe Community-based Watershed Management Project (KWAMP), the Kayonza Irrigation and Integrated Watershed Management Project (KIWP), which was approved by the IFAD Executive Board in May 2019, includes elements of a programmatic approach, which are conducive to the replication and scaling up of integrated development interventions in Kayonza as well as in neighbouring districts.	F

							of the target population and participating implementation partners.		
Rwanda	ESA	PPE	2	CTRY	OPER	GOV	Aim for a better balance between the capacities and resources of fledgling institutions, their level of involvement and the concomitant responsibilities. The empowerment of decentralized district structures and grass-roots organizations by supporting them in assuming responsibility for project activities should be based on a realistic assessment of their initial capacities and the resources at their disposal. Accordingly, the level of responsibility that they can shoulder should be made proportionate to these aspects. If needed, project complexity should be reduced to a degree commensurate with the institutional maturity.	All new IFAD-supported investments in the country focus on building capacities at different levels, including those of farmers and their institutions to enhance the sustainability of projects interventions. In KIIWP, particular focus has been put on strengthening the capacities of District-level institutions as well as water user associations and catchment management committees	F
Rwanda	ESA	PPE	3	CTRY	OPER	KM	Systemize knowledge generated in a single or centralised project management unit for future projects. Besides leveraging the advantages of the single project implementation units (SPIUs), namely, better efficiency and stronger effectiveness, their true potential should be realised in using them as fountainheads of knowledge. They should be able to generate and document knowledge accumulated in the course of implementing the projects, which can be used to more effectively inform subsequent projects. In addition, cross-fertilization of ideas	Over the last year strong focus has been put on strengthening the KM function of the SPIU, and thus promoting cross-learning between projects. A plan for thematic supervision has been launched in coordination with colleagues in PMI/ECG. COM colleagues provided support in December 2019 to identify and document success use of technology in the Rwanda portfolio. The new project on livestock has been designed in close coordination with ENABEL. This will allow a structured approach to development, documentation of practical knowledge	F

							and experiences among the SPIUs of different development partners should be strongly encouraged by IFAD	and know-how, and evidence-based identification of critical areas that require policy focus and support.	
Rwanda	ESA	PPE	4	CTRY	OPER	MVC	Ensure that the value chain development is truly demand-oriented when integrating value chain components in principally supply-side projects. If value chain components are built in projects that invest heavily on the supply side, such as irrigation and natural resource or watershed management, care should be taken that value chain development is truly demandside oriented. This can be done by involving downstream actors of a value chain such as traders, processors or small and medium enterprises. Without the proactive involvement of downstream actors, value may be added, but not along an entire chain.	KWIIP - as well as the other ongoing IFAD-supported projects in the country (i.e. Climate-Resilient Post-Harvest and Agribusiness Support Project/PASP; Project for Rural Income through Exports/PRICE; Rwanda Dairy Development Project/RDDP) - includes strong market approach through business advisory services for farmers to acquire a better understanding of market demands; business development service provision and facilitated exposure of farmers' cooperatives to markets; facilitated marketing arrangements with traders, processors and/or major off-takers; and Public-Private-Producers Partnerships (4Ps). The Partnership for Resilient and Inclusive Small Livestock Markets Programme (PRISM) approved by IFAD's Executive Board in September 2019 (pending Parliament of Rwanda ratification), has been designed also leveraging market assessments conducted by ENABEL and other players. As markets continuously evolve, the design foreseen additional and continuous mechanisms to assess and monitor the market demand.	F
Sri Lanka - Smallholder Plantations Entrepreneurship Development Programme									
Sri Lanka	APR	PPE	1	CTRY	OPER	DES	Project design needs to be supported by a wellarticulated theory of change and targeting strategy. It is paramount to develop a shared	The project recently approved by December 2019 EB, SARP, has clear targeting strategy and graduation paths for all target categories, including youth, women,	F

							understanding among all stakeholders of how impact pathways are expected to be followed and to critically reflect on the targeting strategy and outreach assumptions in the design. Specifically on future investment in smallholder plantations, measures to support plantation (re)establishment, intercropping or income diversification activities need well-defined eligibility criteria (possibly including land-holding size, dependence of household incomes on agriculture), assessment criteria and transparent decision-making processes to avoid mis-targeting and elite capture. This is relevant also because the eligibility criteria for the Government subsidies for (re)planting do not take poverty level into consideration.	people with disabilities, etc. The design achieved the highest IFAD mainstreaming scores according to QAG for 2019. The implementation of the well-articulated targeting strategy must however be supported by adequate involvement of the ECG in the start-up and implementation. The country team plans to do so. On another note, the entire Sri Lanka portfolio should better target capacity development. The first gender integration training patch was delivered to the STaRR PMU in February 2020.	
Sri Lanka	APR	PPE	2	CTRY	OPER	NRM	Ongoing support for the smallholder plantation subsector should pay more attention to post-harvest improvements and environmental issues. Greater care should be taken to avoid subsidizing planting on unsuitable or environmentally fragile lands. Furthermore, along with support to improve production, the opportunities for improving post-harvest activities and returns to the growers should be explored more vigorously.	The SARP design addresses VC from production to market. Current projects are doing the same, STaRR for tea and rubber for local consumption and export and SAPP to link smallholders to private sector chains, including large ones like Hilton and Cargills. The environmental dimension is taken into account either by mitigation measures, or by the disqualification of land for agriculture if it is not suitable for the environment, including in this category forest land.	F
Sri Lanka	APR	PPE	3	PROJ	OPER	BEN	Engage and strengthen existing community-based organizations rather than create new ones. SPEnDP's limited success in the	In the case of FPOs, existing projects do not create new ones and build the capacities of those in place,	F

							creation of sustainable grassroots institutions provides a clear signal that engaging the existing tea and rubber societies would have been more effective and sustainable.	either societies in the case of STaRR, or FOs in the case of SAP. SARP will follow the same approach.	
Sri Lanka	APR	PPE	4	CTRY	OPER	PVT	Adopt a more cautious approach to supporting group/community-owned business ventures. Given the largely unsuccessful experience with business ventures operated by un-incorporated/informal groups, it is important to carefully reflect on the circumstances and conditions in which such group/community-owned business ventures would make sense and would be feasible, and to develop support activities accordingly.	Detailed 4P proposals obtain IFAD no objection only if they demonstrate the presence, functionality and commitment of FPOs, the readiness of the private sector and the economic feasibility of the partnership. This will be followed by SARP.	O

Historic Follow up from 2018 Corporate Level Evaluations

Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme		Recommendation	2018 Follow Up	2020 Follow Up	Status
Corporate Level Evaluation: IFAD's Decentralization Experience									
CLE	4	IFAD	STR	COS		<p>2.a Introduce, in country strategies, greater selectivity in the agenda for nonlending activities, based on consultation with governments, participation in coordination groups with other organization and interaction with non-government actors. Differentiate the non-lending agenda and the expectations by type of country office (e.g. CPO-led, CPM-led, hubs) and according to its resources. As shown by the recent CLE on the Performance-based Allocation System, the annual rural-sector performance assessment can be a tool for articulating non-lending activities.</p>	<p>These recommendations will be included together with the overall IFAD11 commitment to revise the procedures for country strategies, with particular focus on country level engagement and partnerships for non-lending activities. Regarding the “annual rural-sector performance assessment” as part of the approved PBAS reform, this will now be undertaken every three years</p>	<p>The country strategy procedures were revised and have been made operational. All country strategies approved under the new procedures include specific non-lending activities objectives.</p>	F

Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme		Recommendation	2018 Follow Up	2020 Follow Up	Status
CLE	5	IFAD	STR	DEC		<p>2.b Estimate the required resources (staff, type of expertise, financial) for nonlending activities and establish a dedicated budget line for the same in country offices and sub-regional hubs. Enhance collaboration and synergy between PTA, SKD and country offices. Linkages should also be strengthened between country programmes and the grant programme. Allocating a larger share of the grants to country programmes, as already recommended by the CLE on the IFAD Grant Policy (2014), would be an important step forward.</p>	<p>Collaboration between the technical (i.e. ECG, PMI) and regional divisions is expected to increase with the establishment of the Hubs, including joint work on non-lending activities. Country Directors/Country Programme Managers are also expected to dedicate more time on non-lending activities, as they will be supported by additional technical and country program staff for operational work. With greater numbers of outposted staff, the expectation is that country directors will be in a position to perform more nonlending activities. The recently revised "results pillar" budget structure already includes a budget line for nonlending activities. The extent this line will be used by ICO staff will be reviewed as greater decentralization is implemented.</p>	<p>Small budget amounts were made available of regional divisions for non lending activities in the previous cycle. In addition, technical expertise has been decentralized allowing for closer interaction with operational teams and for greater contribution to the non lending agenda. Furthermore, through a further revision of the decentralization metrics the intention is to free up more time of the country directors to engage in non lending activities by having more support available for the operational side. Consolidating portfolios and having fewer larger projects is also expected to help on this front. IFAD's grant policy is currently being revised in light of IFAD's financial architecture reform and emerging priorities.</p>	O
CLE	7	IFAD	OPER	DEC		<p>3.a Based on an assessment of the pilot in Viet Nam, prepare a plan (including provisions for training and internal financial control) for delegating further</p>	<p>The Delegation of Authority for operational and non-operational aspects is currently being revised and is expected to be approved in</p>	<p>Meeting an IFAD11 commitment the delegation of authority framework was approved and has been put into place. The framework has also been revised in light of emerging lessons and the</p>	F

Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme		Recommendation	2018 Follow Up	2020 Follow Up	Status
						budgetholding authority to country directors, particularly when they are also heads of sub-regional hubs, as this entails a higher volume of transactions to be approved.	September 2018. While this more comprehensive exercise is taking place, a process is underway to identify the immediate high priority needs required by hubs and ICOs. These immediate needs will focus on areas like budget authority, recruitment of consultants, low-value procurement. The experience of the pilot in Vietnam will be taken into account during implementation.	updated version has been made effective since June 2020.	
CLE	8	IFAD	OPER	DEC		3.b Define a framework for further delegation of authority to country directors and heads of sub-regional hubs as it concerns communication, as well as for establishing a platform to facilitate access to analytical and knowledge products prepared by country offices and project teams, including material prepared in local languages, which should be easily tracked and retrieved.	The Delegation of Authority for operational and non-operational aspects is currently being revised and is expected to be approved in September 2018. This will include issues related to communication and knowledge considerations.	As above. Meeting an IFAD11 commitment the delegation of authority framework was approved and has been put into place. The framework has also been revised in light of emerging lessons and the updated version has been made effective since June 2020.	F
CLE	12	IFAD	OPER	DEC		5.a Adjust the IFAD accounting system so as to monitor more	The reporting for the recently approved decentralized map is	Changes have been introduced in the way transactions are recorded in IFAD's accounting	F

Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme		Recommendation	2018 Follow Up	2020 Follow Up	Status
						comprehensively the cost of country programme management under different ICO configurations, which to date has been presented in a fragmented manner (e.g. separately for country staff costs, administrative costs, supervision costs) and report on them clearly in the official documentation.	currently being reviewed. The aim is ensure that staff and non-staff costs are identified separately within hubs and standalone offices administered by hubs. Similarly, the aim is also to indicate separately administrative and operational costs (i.e. design, supervision costs).	system to allow for better reporting of costs by ICO location. Costs for supervision and country programme implementation are now managed out of the hubs in line with the IFAD11 targets. Management will monitor the changes introduced and recalibrate if necessary.	