

Document: EB 2017/122/R.38
Agenda: 12
Date: 13 November 2017
Distribution: Public
Original: English

E



Investing in rural people

Report of the Governing Council Bureau on the Review of the Established Practice for the Process Leading to the Appointment of the President of IFAD

Note to Executive Board representatives

Focal points:

Technical questions:

Emmanuel Maurice
Interim General Counsel
Tel.: +39 06 5459 2457
e-mail: e.maurice@ifad.org

Dispatch of documentation:

William Skinner
Chief
Governing Bodies
Tel.: +39 06 5459 2974
e-mail: gb@ifad.org

Executive Board — 122nd Session
Rome, 11-12 December 2017

For: Approval

Contents

I.	Background	1
	A. Mandate of the Governing Council Bureau	1
	B. Deliberations of the Governing Council Bureau	1
II.	The appointment of the President	2
III.	Review process	2
	A. The nomination process	2
	B. The campaign process	5
	C. The appointment process	8
IV.	Conclusion	11
Annexes		
Annex I		
	Summary of the recommendations of the Governing Council Bureau	12
Annex II		
	Resolution --/XLI Approval of the recommendations of the Governing Council Bureau	14
Annex III		
	Benchmarking questionnaire (table)	15
	Results of the benchmarking exercise	35
Annex IV		
	Extract of provisions of the Agreement Establishing IFAD, the By-Laws for the Conduct of the Business of the Fund and the Rules of Procedure of the Governing Council relating to the appointment of the President of IFAD	38

Abbreviations and acronyms

AfDB	African Development Bank
AsDB	Asian Development Bank
EBRD	European Bank for Reconstruction and Development
FAO	Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations
IDB	Inter-American Development Bank
UNWTO	United Nations World Tourism Organization
UNESCO	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization
WHO	World Health Organization

Recommendation for approval

The Executive Board is invited to approve the transmittal of the Report of the Governing Council Bureau, including the draft resolution contained in annex II, to the forty-first session of the Governing Council in February 2018 for adoption.

I. Background

A. Mandate of the Governing Council Bureau

1. In February 2013, by resolution 176/XXXVI, the Governing Council of IFAD endorsed the established practice for the process leading to the appointment of the President of IFAD (as described in document GC 36/L.5) and the proposal contained therein that this practice be reviewed from time to time by the Governing Council Bureau (the Bureau), as appropriate.
2. At its fortieth session in February 2017, the Governing Council, taking into consideration the recommendation made by the Executive Board at its 117th session in April 2016,¹ by resolution 197/XL tasked the Bureau to review the established practice for the process leading to the appointment of the President of IFAD and make proposals in order to enhance such practice for future appointments.
3. The Bureau was requested to submit a report on the result of its review and any recommendations thereon to the Executive Board in December 2017, for submission to the Governing Council for endorsement at the forty-first session in February 2018.
4. As stipulated in resolution 197/XL, the Executive Board is hereby invited to consider this final report, including the draft resolution contained in annex II, and to recommend its submission to the Governing Council at its forty-first session in February 2018, for adoption.

B. Deliberations of the Governing Council Bureau

5. The members of the Bureau, elected by the Governing Council at its thirty-ninth session in February 2016 and comprising the Governors of the Republic of India (Chairperson), the Republic of Finland and the Republic of Indonesia (Vice-Chairpersons), were assisted in their task by IFAD's Secretariat (the Office of the Secretary and the Office of the General Counsel).
6. The Bureau held four meetings between March and October 2017. At its first meeting, the Bureau tasked the Office of the General Counsel, in collaboration with the Office of the Secretary, with reviewing the current process for selecting the President of IFAD, and preparing a briefing paper setting out the good practices in place and identifying key issues and areas for improvement.
7. In addition, following the feedback received from the Bureau on the review presented at the second meeting, the Secretariat carried out a benchmarking exercise on the procedures for the appointment of executive heads in nine comparator institutions.² The benchmarking consisted in the submission of a questionnaire agreed by the Bureau to selected institutions, including multilateral

¹ At the 117th session of the Board, an item on non-binding criteria for the selection and appointment of the President of IFAD was introduced and a proposal was made, which was approved by the Executive Board, that it be recommended to the Governing Council to task the Governing Council Bureau with developing draft terms of reference or selection criteria for consideration by the Governing Council at its forty-first session to be held in 2018.

² The benchmarking questionnaire and synthesis report are attached as annex III.

development banks as well as United Nations specialized agencies.³ The results of the benchmarking exercise helped the Bureau to discuss and agree on the outstanding issues discussed at its third meeting.

8. At its fourth meeting, the Bureau reviewed and agreed on a draft report reflecting the outcome of its discussions. As requested by the Bureau, the draft report was shared for feedback with the List Convenors prior to its submission to the 122nd session of the Executive Board.

II. The appointment of the President

9. The rules governing the appointment of the President of IFAD are laid out in the:
 - (a) Agreement Establishing IFAD (the Agreement), in particular article 6.8(a);
 - (b) By-Laws for the Conduct of the Business of IFAD (the By-Laws), in particular section 6.2; and
 - (c) Rules of Procedure of the Governing Council, in particular rule 41.

For these and other relevant provisions, see annex IV.

III. Review process

10. The review carried out by the Bureau covered three main areas, which are described in detail in the following sections:
 - (a) The nomination process
 - (b) The campaign process
 - (c) The appointment process

A. The nomination process

- (i) Terms of reference/criteria for candidates
11. Regarding the nomination process, the Bureau first considered whether or not IFAD should adopt terms of reference for the position of President, or criteria for candidates nominated for the post.
12. Currently, there are no terms of reference for the President of IFAD other than those provided in IFAD's basic documents, and no qualification criteria are currently established for the candidates running for the presidency. Terms of reference were developed in 2000 but were never formally adopted.⁴ This matter was again considered by the Executive Board at its 115th and 116th sessions, but no consensus was reached among the members. At its 117th session, consensus was reached to recommend to the Governing Council that it task the Bureau with developing draft terms of reference or selection criteria for consideration by the Governing Council at its forty-first session (2018).
13. The benchmarking exercise shows that, while the majority of organizations surveyed have no terms of reference for the position of executive head other than the functions set out in the basic documents, all organizations except for IFAD and Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO) have criteria for candidates running for presidency. These vary from two to four criteria in the case of the African Development Bank (AfDB), Asian Development Bank (AsDB), European Bank for Reconstruction and Development (EBRD), Inter-American

³ The comparator organizations were selected on the basis of the following criteria, which were agreed upon with the Bureau: (1) intergovernmental organization; (2) mandate of the institution is project finance; (3) dual character of the executive head (both the head of the organization and the chairperson of the executive board); (4) appointment/election of executive head by members or board where members are represented; and (5) weighted votes (as opposed to one-member- one-vote); in addition to the availability of information/willingness to share relevant information. The questionnaire was shared with AfDB, AsDB, EBRD, FAO, IDB, UNESCO, UNWTO, World Bank Group and World Health Organization (WHO).

⁴ Minutes of the seventieth session of the Executive Board ([EB/70](#)) and [EB 2000/70/R.27](#).

Development Bank (IDB), United Nations World Tourism Organization (UNWTO) and United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO), and reach five and nine criteria in the case of the World Bank Group and WHO respectively.

14. The Bureau recommended that the terms of reference for the President embedded in IFAD's basic documents be considered sufficient and that, in addition to such terms of reference, broad criteria be established for candidates running for presidency in future appointment processes. The Bureau further recommended the following criteria for inclusion in the call for nominations issued by the Secretariat to all Member States (as explained in paragraph 16):

CRITERIA FOR THE APPOINTMENT OF THE PRESIDENT OF IFAD

- (a) Strategic leadership skills based on knowledge and experience on development issues;
 - (b) Strong demonstrated commitment to all the objectives of the Fund;
 - (c) Communication and advocacy skills to influence decision makers at the highest level, including ministers and heads of other development agencies;
 - (d) Ability to build and maintain a cohesive and effective top management team;
 - (e) Experience in managing substantial financial resources.
- (ii) Call for nominations
15. The Bureau considered the process of the call for nominations, in particular whether the current practices regarding announcements and communications of nominations should be maintained or modified.
16. Section 6.2 of the By-Laws requires that nominations for the office of the President be submitted to the Secretary of the Fund by Members, along with a curriculum vitae. To this end, the practice as per resolution 176/XXXVI has been that a call for nominations is issued by the Secretary of IFAD to all Member States, advising of the timeline for receipt and communication of nominations. The call is published as follows:
- "a. An information note on the relevant procedures and modalities for the appointment of the President of IFAD is posted on IFAD's publicly accessible website;
 - b. A notice on the forthcoming consideration of the appointment of the President by IFAD's Governing Council is issued and posted on IFAD's publicly accessible website;
 - c. A press release on the IFAD Governing Council's forthcoming consideration of the appointment of the President is issued to IFAD's standard network of contacts (covering all media types – print, radio, TV, Internet, through newspapers, news agencies, online media, independent journalists, etc.), providing a global perspective with global coverage, which is posted on IFAD's publicly accessible website. Additionally, and as per standard practice, the press release is sent to the United Nations Information Centre, which circulates it to its network;
 - d. A dedicated web page is set up on IFAD's publicly accessible website to provide all information relative to the procedures and modalities for the appointment of the President of IFAD;
 - e. Both the notice and the press release on IFAD's Governing Council's forthcoming consideration of the appointment of the President are sent to Governors under cover of a separate letter for any communication purposes that Member States may wish to initiate;

- f. Both the notice and the press release on the forthcoming consideration of the appointment of the President by IFAD's Governing Council are sent to other United Nations agencies, organizations and international financial institutions;⁵
17. The Bureau, having considered the number and timing of announcements made, recommended that no changes be made to the current practice.
- (iii) Written questions for candidates
18. The Bureau considered whether nominated candidates should continue to be invited to answer questions in writing and whether answering such questions should be mandatory.
19. For the recent 2017 appointment process, a new practice was introduced by the Executive Board at its 117th session whereby the call for nominations was accompanied by a list of questions, to which candidates for the IFAD Presidency were invited to respond in writing, if they so wished.⁶ These questions were framed by the List Convenors and reviewed by the Bureau.
20. In this regard the benchmarking exercise showed that, except for IFAD and WHO, candidates are not invited or required to answer questions in writing. In some cases, a written statement outlining their vision for the organization may be required (AfDB, AsDB, EBRD). In the case of WHO, a password-protected web forum open to all Member States is created for questions and answers and candidates wishing to participate in the forum are invited to answer in writing to the questions posted.
21. The Bureau recommended that the current practice be continued. Thus, candidates should be invited but not required to answer the questions framed by the List Convenors and reviewed by the Bureau.
- (iv) Internal candidates
22. The Bureau considered whether internal candidates should be expected to take leave without pay earlier than the date on which nominations are communicated to all Member States (e.g. as soon as he/she receives confirmation that he/she will be nominated by a Member State); and whether an internal candidate should be expected to resign from the Fund if he/she has failed to win the Presidency.
23. During the 2017 appointment process, IFAD's President provided guidance to staff members in relation to the appointment of the President. In the case of a staff member being nominated by a Member State, the candidate is expected to take leave without pay from the date that nominations are communicated to Member States, until the Governing Council has appointed the President. This is to ensure that the candidate clearly separates his/her role as a staff member working in the best interest of the institution from the promotion of his/her candidacy. No resources of IFAD should be used in furthering the candidacy of a candidate and, more generally, candidates may not take, or attempt to take, advantage of their position as staff members to advance their candidature.
24. Results from comparator organizations show that in only a few cases (IFAD, AfDB and WHO) is internal guidance provided on internal candidates running for the post of President. For example, in the case of AfDB the Staff Rules provide that internal candidates seeking nomination for the post of President are required to inform the President of the Bank and apply for leave with pay for a period not exceeding three months. If his/her Government assents to his/her nomination, the staff member shall immediately inform the President and apply to go on leave without pay. Where such assent is refused, the staff member will also immediately inform the

⁵ GC/36/L.5. Established good practice for the process leading to the appointment of the President of IFAD.

⁶ List of questions and answers from the 2017 candidates is available in document GC 40/L.4.

President and request to resume duty. FAO is planning to establish rules for internal candidates in 2018.

25. The Bureau recommended maintaining the current practice of requiring internal candidates to take leave without pay as soon as he/she receives confirmation that he/she will be nominated by a Member State. In addition, the Bureau also recommended that an internal candidate should not be required to resign from the Fund if he/she has failed to win the Presidency.
- (v) Submission, vetting and announcement of nominations
26. The Bureau considered the process for submission, vetting and announcement of nominations.
27. The submission of nominations is governed by section 6.2 of the By-Laws, which states that unless the Bureau decides otherwise, nominations must be submitted no less than 60 days before the opening of the Governing Council session at which the appointment of the President is to be decided.
28. On receipt by the Fund, nominations are vetted by the Office of the Secretary, which verifies that the nominations have been submitted by a validly authorized representative of the Member.
29. In accordance with section 6.2 of the By-Laws, nominations must be communicated by the President to all Members and the Bureau of the Governing Council no less than 40 days prior to the session of the Governing Council. For each candidate, the communication includes the letter of nomination and the candidate's curriculum vitae as submitted by the Member, together with any written replies to the questions. All documents are provided in the four languages of IFAD. In accordance with established practice, the President's communication to Members is made available to the public through posting on the Fund's website.
30. The Bureau recommended that the current practice related to the submission, vetting and announcement of nominations be continued. In particular, the President's communication to Members should continue to be made public through posting on the Fund's website.

B. The campaign process

- (i) Guidelines concerning the campaign of candidates
31. The Bureau considered whether guidelines or rules should be adopted to regulate the campaigns of candidates.
32. While some guidance has been provided by the President with regard to the campaign of internal candidates (see paragraph 37), there are no guidelines in place concerning the campaign of external candidates.
33. The benchmarking exercise showed that WHO is the only organization that sets out principles and requirements for electoral campaign activities. In none of the remaining surveyed organizations are guidelines, regulations or rules to govern the candidates' campaigns in place.
34. The Bureau recommended that guidelines be developed for all candidates (internal and external) for the purpose of identifying unethical practices on the part of candidates or their supporting governments during the campaign/appointment processes. The Bureau further recommended that the following guidelines for the campaign be included in the call for nominations issued by the Secretariat to all Member States (as explained in paragraph 16):

GUIDELINES FOR THE CAMPAIGN

These guidelines relate only to the campaign leading up to the appointment of the President of IFAD. Their aim is to promote an open, fair, equitable and transparent electoral process among candidates who are running for the office of President of IFAD.

From the date on which nominations are announced and during the entire campaign process, Member States and candidates should:

- (a) Act in good faith and with mutual respect towards one another, bearing in mind the shared objectives of promoting equity, openness, transparency and fairness throughout the appointment process;
 - (b) Refrain from:
 - disrupting or impeding the campaign activities of other candidates and generally campaigning in an improper manner against other candidates;
 - making any oral or written statement or other representation that could be deemed slanderous or libellous;
 - making promises or commitments (other than as considered generally acceptable in diplomatic and international negotiations) that could undermine, or be perceived as undermining, the integrity of the appointment process or the governance of IFAD;
 - attempting to influence the appointment process in an improper manner.
- (ii) Obligation of impartiality of staff members vis-à-vis candidates
35. The Bureau also considered the obligation of staff members to remain impartial vis-à-vis all candidates.
 36. All IFAD staff members must comply with the provisions of the Code of Conduct, established by the President, which sets out guiding principles for staff members to conduct themselves at all times in a manner befitting their status as staff of an international organization.
 37. During the last appointment process, guidance was provided by the President to staff members as to the conduct to observe during the appointment process. Staff members must behave impartially with respect to all candidates for the Presidency of IFAD, and neither publicly express their views concerning any candidate, nor work in support of any candidacy.
 38. The obligation of a staff member to remain impartial is also shared by the comparator organizations, none of which allows staff members to express their support or to campaign for a candidate.
 39. The Bureau considered that the Code of Conduct of IFAD staff members should clearly provide that a staff member's assistance to a candidate be made an explicit case of misconduct, thereby leading to the institution of disciplinary proceedings and the imposition of disciplinary measures. The Bureau recommended that Management take appropriate action in this regard.

(iii) Membership meeting

40. The Bureau considered the format of the meeting of the candidates with IFAD's Membership.
41. In accordance with a practice introduced in 2008, and codified through Governing Council resolution 176/XXXVI, an informal Membership meeting between representatives of IFAD Member States and the candidates is held prior to the Governing Council session at which the appointment of the President is to be considered. The purpose of the meeting is to provide the candidates with an equal opportunity to introduce themselves, present their ideas and views and respond to questions from the Members' representatives.
42. In preparation for the Membership meeting for the 2017 appointment process, several informal meetings were held between representatives of the Bureau and List Convenors on the one hand, and staff of the Office of the Secretary and the Office of the General Counsel on the other. The following decisions were made:
 - a. The letter of invitation to the candidates would be signed by all Convenors, Co-Convenors and sub-List Convenors; once confirmations were received from the candidates, a second letter would be issued by the Secretary of IFAD, specifying details of the procedures and arrangements for the meeting.
 - b. The meeting would last two days, given that there were eight candidates.
 - c. Each Member State would be allowed up to two representatives in the meeting room, while additional delegation members could follow proceedings in a *salle d'écoute*. Delegations of Member States with candidates would be permitted in the *salle d'écoute* only when their own candidate is being interviewed.
 - d. List Convenors, Co-Convenors and sub-List Convenors would have a right to attend the meeting *ex officio*.
 - e. The meeting would be chaired by members of the Bureau on a rotation basis, with the exclusion of any representative of a Member having nominated a candidate.
 - f. On the staff side, only the Secretary and two messengers would attend the meeting. The incumbent President would not attend the meeting (unless he or she is a candidate).
 - g. The sequence of interviews would be determined by drawing a letter by lot and beginning with the country name in English that was closest to that letter and thereafter by English alphabetical order by country. This would be done at a meeting of Convenors and Bureau a month before the date.
 - h. Each candidate would be accorded an interview of one hour and 30 minutes, comprising three phases: (i) the candidate introduces him/herself, (ii) the candidate responds to three pre-agreed cross-List questions posed to all candidates, and (iii) the candidate responds to three open questions from the floor.
 - i. There would not be a panel discussion, nor would candidates interact among themselves.
 - j. Three cross-List questions would be posed by List representatives to all candidates, providing 45 minutes for answers (15 minutes per question). These questions would be shared with candidates in early January as part of the second communication from Convenors specifying the details for the meeting. Convenors would send the questions to the Office of the Secretary

as soon as possible through the dedicated e-mail address:
elections2017@ifad.org.

- k. Following the cross-List questions, open questions would be allowed from the floor for 30 minutes. Sets of three questions would be taken, ensuring balance among the three Lists. Member States that had nominated candidates would refrain from asking questions.
 - l. Convenors would inform their respective Lists that it would not be possible for all Members to ask questions.
 - m. The hearings would be video-recorded and shared within a week on IFAD's Member States Interactive Platform only with IFAD Governors, their copy recipients and participants at the hearings. Candidates' agreement to be recorded would be sought in the invitation letter on a no-objection basis; should any of them not agree, they would not be recorded.
43. The benchmarking exercise shows a consistent approach in all organizations with regard to the possibility for the Membership to meet the candidates before the session for the election of the President is held. For instance, in the case of WHO, Member States meet with the candidates at the candidates' forum that precedes the Executive Board session at which the nomination takes place. After the forum, Member States meet candidates on two occasions: at the Executive Board session at which the nomination takes place and at the World Health Assembly session at which the appointment takes place. In the case of EBRD, two hearings are conducted prior to the election. The first is attended by members of the Board of Directors, meeting in executive session format. The second is chaired by the Chair of the Board of Governors and attended by the Governors. Members of the Board of Directors and their Alternates are also admitted.
44. The Bureau considered possible changes to the format of the Membership meeting: e.g. a panel discussion with a moderator in addition to individual interviews; the number of participants in the meeting, including participation of civil society representatives; and webcasting of the proceedings of the meeting to the public.
45. The Bureau recommended that the existing format be maintained.

C. The appointment process

- (i) Credentials of Governors and Alternates
46. The Bureau considered the credentials of Governors and Alternates.
47. Before the opening of any session of the Governing Council, Members must, for the purposes of quorum and voting, provide IFAD with the credentials of their respective Governors and Alternates. In this regard, rule 11 of the Rules of Procedure of the Governing Council states as follows:

"Credentials and Notifications

- 1. The credentials of Governors and alternates shall be issued by, or on behalf of, the Head of State or of Government or by the Minister or Secretary of Foreign Affairs, or by another person notified by the Member so having authority to do so. These credentials and the notifications of the names of advisers shall be submitted to the President at least one week before the opening of the first session the designated persons are to attend. Unless otherwise specified, such credentials and notifications shall be considered valid for subsequent sessions until withdrawn by a notification to the President.
- 2. The Bureau shall examine the credentials and, if any member thereof considers it necessary, report thereon to the Governing Council.
- 3. [...]"

48. Pursuant to rule 11 of the Rules of Procedure of the Governing Council, the Bureau is in charge of examining such credentials. As for communications between the Fund and a Member, any notification of credentials must be made through the official entity that the Member has designated as its official channel of communication pursuant to section 2.1 of the By-Laws, which provides as follows:

“Channel of Communication, Depositaries

1. Each Member shall designate an appropriate official entity for communication between itself and the Fund in connection with any matter arising under the Agreement. A communication between the Fund and such entity shall constitute a communication between the Fund and the Member.
 2. [...]“
49. If the Member has not designated a channel of communication, the notification must be provided in accordance with rule 11 of the Rules of Procedures of the Governing Council.
50. Since not all Members have designated a channel of communication, and to facilitate the collection and examination of the Governors’ and alternates’ credentials, the Bureau agreed to the proposal that the Permanent Representation of a Member State in Rome or, in the absence thereof, the Permanent Representation of a Member State to IFAD, shall be deemed to be its channel of communication, unless the Member has expressly designated another official entity. In the latter case, the designation of such other official entity must be notified to the Fund by the Member’s Head of State, Head of Government, or Minister or Secretary for Foreign Affairs.
51. In order to implement the above recommendation by the Bureau, an amendment of section 2.1 of the By-Laws is required. According to section 14 of the By-Laws, the authority to amend the By-Laws lies with the Governing Council and a two-thirds majority of the total number of votes is required.
52. The Bureau recommended that section 2.1 of the By-Laws be amended as set out below. The text to be added is underlined.

Proposed changes to section 2.1 of the By-Laws

Channel of Communication, Depositaries

1. Each Member shall designate an appropriate official entity for communication between itself and the Fund in connection with any matter arising under the Agreement. Where a Member has not designated an appropriate official entity for communication between itself and the Fund, the Permanent Representation of the Member State in Rome or, in the absence thereof, the Permanent Representation of the Member State to IFAD, shall be deemed to be its channel of communication. A communication between the Fund and such entity shall constitute a communication between the Fund and the Member.
- (ii) Private meeting
53. The Bureau considered the privacy of the Governing Council meeting at which the appointment of the President takes place.
54. While rule 23 of the Rules of Procedure of the Governing Council provides that the meetings of the Governing Council must be held in public, an exception is made by rule 41.1 of the same document, which provides that the appointment of the President of IFAD is to be considered “at a private meeting”. This requires that the meeting is held exclusively in presence of the Governors, their alternates and essential staff, from the beginning of the item relating to the appointment of the President to its end, including during the announcement of the results of each ballot.

55. With the exception of FAO, the benchmarking exercise showed a unanimous approach among the organizations surveyed in having the appointment of the executive head take place at a private meeting.
56. The Bureau recommended that the current rule of holding a private meeting to consider the appointment of the President of IFAD be continued.
- (iii) Secret ballot
57. The Bureau considered the voting by secret ballot.
58. The voting for the appointment of the President must be conducted in accordance with rule 38.1, which stipulates that:
- “Except as provided otherwise in respect of elections pursuant to Rule 40, all elections shall be held by secret ballot unless the Governing Council decides otherwise in an election where the number of candidates does not exceed the number of elective places to be filled.”
59. In order to ensure the secrecy of the ballots, each Governor is, pursuant to rule 35.3 of the Rules of Procedure of the Governing Council, provided with:
- “...one or more ballot papers each indicating a specific number of votes, which shall be so distributed that: (i) papers specifying any particular number of votes shall be received by at least four Governors, and (ii) the total number of votes specified on the papers received by any Governor shall equal the number of votes he is entitled to cast; each Governor may indicate his vote on all the papers he receives and deposit them in ballot boxes from which they shall be taken and counted by tellers appointed by the Chairman.”
60. The benchmarking shows that voting for the appointment of the executive head is held, except for the WBG, by secret ballot.
61. The Bureau recommended that voting for the appointment of the President continue to be held by secret ballot.
- (iv) Ballot counting
62. The Bureau considered the ballot counting system.
63. Under the established practice, ballot counting takes place in a special room designated for that purpose. The counting is done by three tellers: usually one from each List, as appointed by the Chairperson of the Governing Council. The three tellers are supported in their work by a task force appointed by the Secretary of IFAD and composed of IFAD staff members, under the supervision of a coordinator and with the involvement of a staff member from the Office of the General Counsel. When the counting of the votes is complete, the totals received by each candidate are entered on a tally sheet that is signed by each teller, sealed and hand-delivered to the Bureau Chairperson by one of the tellers.
64. The Bureau considered the suggestion by some Members that IFAD’s external auditors, in addition to (or in lieu of) the tellers designated by the Chairperson of the Governing Council, be involved in the supervision of the ballot counting. The members of the Bureau, however, decided that there was no need to involve external auditors in addition to the tellers.
65. The possibility of introducing an automated system was also discussed to expedite the ballot counting process and increase workforce efficiency. The preparation of the anonymous ballot papers required by rule 35.3 of the Rules of Procedure of the Governing Council for each of the ballots is a complex process, entailing the involvement of approximately 20 staff members in the days preceding the Governing Council meeting at which the President will be appointed. On the day of the Governing Council meeting, the process also requires the presence of a large number of essential staff to: (a) distribute the respective ballot papers to each of the Governors; (b) record each Governor’s confirmation that they have received

their full entitlement of ballot papers; (c) direct Governors to the voting booths where they are invited to stamp the ballot papers with a stamp bearing the name of the candidate they wish to vote for; (d) ensure that each Governor deposits his/her ballot papers in the ballot box; and (e) after the vote is closed, count the ballots. On average, a minimum of 20 staff members are needed for at least two hours to complete each ballot from the beginning of the proceedings to the announcement of its results.

66. The benchmarking shows that voting is presently conducted by most organizations through a paper-based system. AsDB is the only organization that has an electronic voting system in place. WHO and IDB are exploring the possibility of having an automated system. More specifically, in AsDB the election process does not traditionally take place during the annual meeting of the Board of Governors of the Bank, thus the voting process is carried out remotely via e-mail. Each Governor receives an e-mail from the secretariat containing a link to the ballot. The vote cast is then tallied automatically at headquarters. WHO has already tested two electronic voting systems and has found them to be insufficiently secure. IDB is currently exploring the possibility of using a fully online anonymous voting platform. During the last election, in 2015, paper ballots were used to cast the votes and an electronic system tallied up the results in real-time.
67. The Bureau recommended that the Secretariat explore electronic voting or other forms of automated processes and report to the Executive Board for possible submission of recommendations to the Governing Council in 2019. The Bureau noted that, if an appropriate replacement were to be found, an amendment to rule 35.3 of the Rules of Procedure of the Governing Council would be necessary. A two-thirds majority of the total number of votes is required to amend rule 35.3 of the Rules of Procedure of the Governing Council.

IV. Conclusion

68. A summary of the recommendations of the Bureau is provided in annex I.
69. The Bureau recommends that the Executive Board take note of this report and approve its transmittal, including the draft resolution contained in annex II, to the forty-first session of the Governing Council in February 2018 for adoption.

Summary of the recommendations of the Governing Council Bureau

A. The nomination process

1. After reviewing the current established practice for the process leading to the appointment of the President of IFAD, the Bureau recommends the following improvements to guide the nomination process:
 - Terms of reference/criteria for candidates. The Bureau recommends that the terms of reference for the President embedded in IFAD's basic documents be considered sufficient and that, in addition to such terms of reference, broad criteria be established for candidates running for presidency in future appointment processes. The Bureau further recommends the criteria, proposed in paragraph 14 of the main report, for inclusion in the call for nominations issued by the Secretariat to all Member States (as explained in paragraph 16 of the main report).
 - Internal candidates. The Bureau recommends maintaining the current practice of requiring internal candidates to take leave without pay as soon as he/she receives confirmation that he/she will be nominated by a Member State. In addition, the Bureau also recommends that an internal candidate should not be required to resign from the Fund if he/she has failed to win the Presidency.
2. No changes are recommended with respect to :
 - Call for nominations. The Bureau, having considered the number and timing of announcements made, recommends that no changes be made to the current practice reproduced in paragraph 16 of the main report.
 - Written questions for candidates. The Bureau recommends that the current practice be continued. Thus, candidates should be invited but not required to answer the questions framed by the List Convenors and reviewed by the Bureau.
 - Submission, vetting and announcement of nominations. The Bureau recommends that the current practice related to the submission, vetting and announcement of nominations be continued. In particular, the President's communication to Members referred to in paragraph 29 of the main report, should continue to be made public through posting on the Fund's website.

B. The campaign process

3. After reviewing the current established practice for the process leading to the appointment of the President of IFAD, the Bureau recommends the following improvements to guide the campaign process:
 - Guidelines concerning the campaign of candidates. The Bureau recommends that guidelines be developed for all candidates (internal and external) for the purpose of identifying unethical practices on the part of candidates or their supporting governments during the campaign/ appointment processes. The Bureau further recommends that the guidelines for the campaign, proposed in paragraph 34 of the main report, be included in the call for nominations issued by the Secretariat to Member States (as explained in paragraph 16 of the main report).
4. Obligation of impartiality of staff members vis-à-vis candidates. The Bureau considered that the Code of Conduct of IFAD staff members should clearly provide that a staff member's assistance to a candidate be made an explicit case of misconduct, thereby leading to the institution of disciplinary proceedings and the

imposition of disciplinary measures. The Bureau recommends that Management take appropriate action in this regard.

5. No changes are recommended with respect to:
 - Membership meeting. The Bureau recommends that the existing format of the Membership meeting as explained in paragraphs 41 and 42 of the main report, be maintained.
- C. The appointment process
6. After reviewing the current established practice for the process leading to the appointment of the President of IFAD, the Bureau recommends the following improvements to guide the appointment process:
 - Credentials of Governors and alternates. The Bureau recommends that section 2.1 of the By-Laws be amended as proposed in in paragraph 52 of the main report.
 - Ballot counting. The Bureau recommends that the Secretariat explore electronic voting or other forms of automated processes, and report to the Executive Board for possible submission of recommendations to the Governing Council in 2019. The Bureau notes that if an appropriate replacement were to be found an amendment to rule 35.3 of the Rules of Procedure of the Governing Council would be necessary. A two-thirds majority of the total number of votes is required to amend rule 35.3 .
7. No changes are recommended with respect to:
 - Private meeting. The Bureau recommends that the current rule of holding a private meeting to consider the appointment of the President of IFAD be continued.
 - Secret ballot. The Bureau recommends that the voting for the appointment of the President continue to be held by secret ballot.

Resolution --/XLI

Approval of the recommendations of the Governing Council Bureau

The Governing Council of IFAD,

Taking into account article 6.8(a) of the Agreement Establishing IFAD, section 6.2 of the By-Laws for the Conduct of the Business of IFAD and rule 41 of the Rules of Procedure of the Governing Council;

Recalling resolution 176/XXXVI and the endorsement by the Governing Council of the established good practice for the process leading to the appointment of the President of IFAD and the proposal that this practice be reviewed from time to time by the Governing Council Bureau as appropriate;

Taking into consideration the recommendation made by the Executive Board at its 117th session thereon and the proposal regarding the "Revision of the established good practice for the process leading to future appointments of the President of IFAD" contained in document GC 40/L.10;

Further recalling resolution 197/XL by which the Governing Council tasked the Governing Council Bureau "to review the established practice for the process leading to the appointment of the President of IFAD and make proposals in order to enhance such practice for future appointments. The Bureau shall submit a report on the result of its review and any recommendations thereon to the Executive Board in December 2017, for submission to the Governing Council for endorsement at its forty-first session in February 2018."

Having considered the Report of the Governing Council Bureau contained in document GC 41/L.... and the recommendation of the Executive Board [EB 2017/122/R.....];

Decides:

1. That the current established practice for the process leading to the appointment of the President of IFAD be continued subject to the improvements recommended by the Bureau, which Management is hereby tasked with implementing; and
2. That section 2.1 of the By-Laws for the Conduct of the Business of IFAD be amended to read as follows (the text to be added is underlined):

Channel of Communication, Depositaries

1. Each Member shall designate an appropriate official entity for communication between itself and the Fund in connection with any matter arising under the Agreement. Where a Member has not designated an appropriate official entity for communication between itself and the Fund, the Permanent Representation of the Member State in Rome or, in the absence thereof, the Permanent Representation of the Member State to IFAD, shall be deemed to be its channel of communication. A communication between the Fund and such entity shall constitute a communication between the Fund and the Member.

Table

Benchmarking questionnaire

A. The nomination process

	1. Does the organization have a job description/terms of reference for the President/Chief Executive? If so, who prepares it and who approves it?	2. Are candidates required to have certain competencies, qualifications and experience? If so, who decides?	3. Do candidates have to be nominated by Members? If so, can a Member nominate more than one candidate?	4. Does a candidate have to be a national of the Member nominating him or her?	5. Are there other limitations applicable to candidates?	6. Are candidates invited or required to answer questions in writing at the time of their nomination or at any time before the appointment process? If so, who prepares and who approves the questions?	7. Are there established procedures for internal candidates, as distinct from external candidates? E.g. are they required to take unpaid leave or resign?
IFAD	There are no terms of reference for the President. However, the role and responsibilities are set out in the Basic Documents.	No.	Candidates are nominated by Members. Although not explicitly stated in the rules, it is appropriately understood that only one candidate may be nominated per Member State.	No. Nothing is provided in the Rules.	Although not provided in the Basic Documents, candidates have to be nationals of an IFAD Member State.	Yes. These questions are framed by the List Convenors and reviewed by the Governing Council Bureau.	Guidance has been provided with respect to the nomination of internal candidates. In the case of a staff member being nominated by a Member State, the nominee will be expected to take leave without pay from the date that nominations are communicated to all Member States until the Governing Council has appointed the President.
AfDB	The powers, functions and responsibilities of the President are set out in the Agreement Establishing the Bank and the General Regulations of the Bank. These documents are prepared by Subsidiary Organs of the Board of Governors and approved by the Board of Governors.	The eligibility criteria are set forth in the Agreement Establishing the Bank. These criteria are decided by the Board of Governors. Article 36 of the Agreement Establishing the Bank states that the President shall be "a person of the highest competence in matters pertaining to the activities, management and administration of the Bank and shall be a national of a regional member state".	Candidates have to be nominated by Members (Governors). A Member can nominate only one candidate.	Yes.	The candidate may not seek a third consecutive term as the term limit is two successive terms of five years each.	Candidates are not required to answer specific questions in writing. In the last election of the President in 2015, candidates were requested to submit a written statement outlining their vision for the Bank.	The Staff Rules provide that internal candidates seeking nomination for the post of President are required to immediately inform the President of the Bank and apply for leave of absence for a period not exceeding three months with pay. If his/her Government assents to his/her request, the staff member shall immediately inform the President and apply to go on leave of absence without pay. Where such assent is refused, the staff member will also immediately inform the

	1. Does the organization have a job description/terms of reference for the President/Chief Executive? If so, who prepares it and who approves it?	2. Are candidates required to have certain competencies, qualifications and experience? If so, who decides?	3. Do candidates have to be nominated by Members? If so, can a Member nominate more than one candidate?	4. Does a candidate have to be a national of the Member nominating him or her?	5. Are there other limitations applicable to candidates?	6. Are candidates invited or required to answer questions in writing at the time of their nomination or at any time before the appointment process? If so, who prepares and who approves the questions?	7. Are there established procedures for internal candidates, as distinct from external candidates? E.g. are they required to take unpaid leave or resign?
							President and request to resume duty. In addition, a staff member who has been nominated by his/her Government for the post of President may choose to leave the service of the Bank under the regime of an agreed separation concluded in accordance with the applicable Staff Regulations.
AsDB	The job description of the President is stated in AsDB's Charter.	The President of AsDB must be a person of highest competence possible and a national of a member country in the region. Such qualifications were decided by the Members themselves during the establishment of the Bank.	Candidates must be nominated by Members. There is no rule preventing a Member from nominating more than one candidate.	No.	No.	No. However, nominees are asked to prepare a vision statement.	No.
EBRD	There are no terms of reference for the President. The role and responsibilities of the President are set out in the Agreement Establishing the EBRD.	The eligibility requirements are set out in the Rules for the Election of the President, which are approved by the EBRD Board of Governors. The requirements are as follows: A candidate must: be a national of an EBRD member country as of the date of nomination; have appropriate qualifications and experience for the role; be an individual of high standing and good reputation; and if elected, comply with the highest standards of integrity and ethical conduct in accordance with the Bank's Code of Conduct. The Governor is required to confirm in the nomination letter that the nominated candidate meets the above requirements.	Candidates are nominated by Members (Governors). A Governor may nominate only one candidate.	No.	No.	Candidates are not required to answer specific questions in writing. All candidates are required, however, to submit to the Secretary-General a written statement on their vision for the Bank, no later than 30 calendar days prior to the date on which the election has been scheduled. All written statements are also made publicly available.	No. The only restriction in the Rules is that the serving President, even if he/she is not seeking re-election, shall not attend the closed session of the Board of Governors where the election takes place.

	1. Does the organization have a job description/terms of reference for the President/Chief Executive? If so, who prepares it and who approves it?	2. Are candidates required to have certain competencies, qualifications and experience? If so, who decides?	3. Do candidates have to be nominated by Members? If so, can a Member nominate more than one candidate?	4. Does a candidate have to be a national of the Member nominating him or her?	5. Are there other limitations applicable to candidates?	6. Are candidates invited or required to answer questions in writing at the time of their nomination or at any time before the appointment process? If so, who prepares and who approves the questions?	7. Are there established procedures for internal candidates, as distinct from external candidates? E.g. are they required to take unpaid leave or resign?
FAO	The organization does not have a job description/term of reference for the Director-General of the organization. However, rule XXXVIII of the General Rules of the Organization describes in some detail the generic functions of the Director-General.	There is no guidance that details specific competencies, qualifications and experience.	Candidates are nominated by the government of a Member Nation or by its delegate or representative. There is no reference in the Basic Texts regarding the number of candidates a Member Nation can nominate. However, in FAO's practice up to now a Member Nation has only nominated one candidate.	This is not addressed in the Basic Texts of the organization. So far in practice candidates were always nationals of the nominating Member.	A candidate may only serve for two terms of office of four years. Aside from this, the Basic Texts of the Organization do not establish any limitations.	No.	The Basic Texts do not address this issue. However, it is planned to establish rules whereby an internal candidate will go on special leave and will be required to resign if not elected. Details will be worked out in 2018 and referred to the Governing Bodies for approval.
IDB	The terms of reference of the President are prescribed by the Agreement which states that the President shall conduct the ordinary business of the Bank and shall be chief of its staff. He or she also shall be the presiding officer at meetings of the Board of Executive Directors, as well as the legal representative of the Bank. There are no other terms of reference.	According to IDB's Regulations, in nominating a candidate, Governors shall take into consideration the candidate's knowledge of the region's development challenges, experience working with Latin American and the Caribbean countries and competence in matters pertaining to the activities, management and administration of national or international financial and/or development institutions.	Candidates are nominated by Members (Governors). No Governor may present more than one nomination.	No.	The Regulations do not address nor provide for additional limitations. Historically, the President has been a national of a member country; however, this is not a written requirement. By Bank policy, all (other) employees are member country nationals.	Candidates are not required to answer specific questions in writing.	The Regulations do not address this issue.
UNESCO	Yes, a draft contract establishing the terms of appointment, salary, allowances and status is prepared by the Executive Board and approved by the General Conference.	In the last appointment process (2016), the letter sent by the Chairperson of the Executive Board to Member States as approved by the EB stated: "Member States are particularly invited to submit candidates for this post with the following qualifications: (i) extensive experience in the conduct of international relations, (ii) demonstrated commitment over time to the objectives and purposes of UNESCO, (iii) proven leadership ability	Candidates are nominated by Members. No limit is specified on the number of candidates a member can nominate but that has never happened.	No.	No.	Candidates are not required to answer specific questions in writing.	No established procedures, only various precedents.

	1. Does the organization have a job description/terms of reference for the President/Chief Executive? If so, who prepares it and who approves it?	2. Are candidates required to have certain competencies, qualifications and experience? If so, who decides?	3. Do candidates have to be nominated by Members? If so, can a Member nominate more than one candidate?	4. Does a candidate have to be a national of the Member nominating him or her?	5. Are there other limitations applicable to candidates?	6. Are candidates invited or required to answer questions in writing at the time of their nomination or at any time before the appointment process? If so, who prepares and who approves the questions?	7. Are there established procedures for internal candidates, as distinct from external candidates? E.g. are they required to take unpaid leave or resign?
		and managerial skill, including experience in modern management methods and a commitment to transparency and ethics, (iv) strong communication skills".					
UNWTO	The organization does not have a job description or terms of reference for the post of Secretary-General.	The Candidacy Note for the post of Secretary-General states the following regarding the competencies and skills of the candidates: "The position of Secretary-General is one of great importance, requiring the highest standards of efficiency, competence and integrity, as well as firm commitment to the values and principles of the Organization. Candidates presented should have proven leadership and managerial abilities, extensive experience in international relations, and strong diplomatic and communication skills".	Candidates shall be formally proposed to the Council, through the Secretariat, by the governments of the Member States of which they are nationals. Although it is not explicitly stated in the rules, it is appropriately understood that only one candidate may be endorsed per Member State.	Yes.	In line with the JIU [Joint Inspection Unit] recommendations relating to the selection and conditions of service of Executive Heads in the United Nations System Organizations, each applicant is requested to attach a certificate of good health signed by a recognized medical facility to the presentation of her/his candidature.	Nothing in the rules prevents candidates to be invited or required to answer questions in writing. However, to date, the Executive Council has not deemed it necessary to do so.	No.
WBG	Yes, there are terms of reference. In 2011, the Board approved principles to guide open, merit-based and transparent Presidential selections (Selection Principles). The Selection Principles include the processes and terms for qualification.	Yes, these are set out in the Selection Principles, approved by the Board of Executive Directors. Qualification criteria include: (i) a proven track record of leadership; (ii) experience managing large organizations with international exposure, and a familiarity with the public sector; (iii) ability to articulate a clear vision of the Bank's development mission; (iv) a firm commitment to and appreciation for multilateral cooperation; and (v) effective and diplomatic communication skills,	Candidates are nominated by Members (Executive Directors, or by Governors through the Executive Directors). There is no prohibition against the nomination of more than one candidate by a member.	No.	Candidates have to be nationals of Bank Members.	Candidates are not required to answer specific questions in writing.	The Bank's Articles prescribe that the President may not be a Governor, an Executive Director or an Alternate. There are no additional procedures for internal candidates.

	1. Does the organization have a job description/terms of reference for the President/Chief Executive? If so, who prepares it and who approves it?	2. Are candidates required to have certain competencies, qualifications and experience? If so, who decides?	3. Do candidates have to be nominated by Members? If so, can a Member nominate more than one candidate?	4. Does a candidate have to be a national of the Member nominating him or her?	5. Are there other limitations applicable to candidates?	6. Are candidates invited or required to answer questions in writing at the time of their nomination or at any time before the appointment process? If so, who prepares and who approves the questions?	7. Are there established procedures for internal candidates, as distinct from external candidates? E.g. are they required to take unpaid leave or resign?
		impartiality and objectivity.					
WHO	The functions and duties conferred upon the Director-General are set out in the WHO Constitution, the Rules of Procedure of the governing bodies, the Financial Rules and Regulations, and the Staff Rules and Regulations. Duties may also be assigned to him/her by the World Health Assembly (WHA) or by the EB. The specific terms and conditions of appointment, salary and other emoluments attached to the office are decided by the WHA through the approval of the contract of appointment, which is signed jointly by the Director-General and the President of the WHA.	The WHA decided in resolution WHA65.15 that: "the Executive Board should ensure that the nominated candidates fulfil the following criteria, while underscoring the paramount importance of professional qualifications and integrity and the need to pay due regard to equitable geographical representation, as well as gender balance in the process leading to the nomination of the candidate(s) that should be submitted to the Health Assembly: he or she should have: (1) a strong technical background in a health field, including experience in public health; (2) exposure to and extensive experience in international health; (3) demonstrable leadership skills and experience; (4) excellent communication and advocacy skills; (5) demonstrable competence in organizational management; (6) sensitivity to cultural, social and political differences; (7) strong commitment to the mission and objectives of WHO; (8) good health condition as required of all staff members of the Organization; (9) sufficient skill in at least one of the official working languages of the Executive Board and the Health Assembly." During the first stage of the nomination process, the EB undertakes an initial screening of all	Candidates have to be nominated by Members. A Member State can propose more than one candidate.	No. Nothing is provided in the Rules.	The Director-General is eligible for reappointment once only.	Candidates are not required to answer specific questions in writing. The Code of Conduct requires the Secretariat to open on the WHO website a password-protected forum for questions and answers, open to all Member States and to candidates who request to participate in such a forum, after the Director-General has dispatched all proposals, curricula vitae and supporting information to Member States. Candidates wishing to participate in the forum are therefore invited to answer in writing all the questions posted by Member States. There is no validation process of questions and answers.	The Code of Conduct provides guidance on internal candidates for the post of Director-General. The Health Assembly or the Executive Board may call upon the Director-General to apply Staff Rule 650 concerning special leave to staff members who have been proposed for the post of Director-General. Furthermore, the EB at its session in January 2016 was informed about the Director-General's intention "to request internal candidates to exhaust their annual leave entitlement, beginning on the date of the publication of the list of candidates, before placing them on special leave with half pay until the end of the 140th session of the Executive Board, in January 2017. If one or more internal candidates are nominated by the Board, the Director-General intends to place them on special leave with full pay until the Seventieth World Health Assembly. Notwithstanding the above, WHO staff members who are elected WHO officials (e.g. WHO

	1. Does the organization have a job description/terms of reference for the President/Chief Executive? If so, who prepares it and who approves it?	2. Are candidates required to have certain competencies, qualifications and experience? If so, who decides?	3. Do candidates have to be nominated by Members? If so, can a Member nominate more than one candidate?	4. Does a candidate have to be a national of the Member nominating him or her?	5. Are there other limitations applicable to candidates?	6. Are candidates invited or required to answer questions in writing at the time of their nomination or at any time before the appointment process? If so, who prepares and who approves the questions?	7. Are there established procedures for internal candidates, as distinct from external candidates? E.g. are they required to take unpaid leave or resign?
		candidatures in order to eliminate those candidates not meeting the criteria.					Regional Directors who are at the same time WHO staff members and elected officials) would not be required to take special leave in view of their status and functions."

B. The Campaign

	1. Are there guidelines, regulations or rules governing the candidates' campaign?	2. Are staff members allowed to express their support or to campaign for a candidate?	3. Does the Membership meet formally with the candidates? (if not, skip the questions 4-8)	4. Is it a meeting of the same body who has the power to appoint/elect the President/Chief Executive? Or an ad hoc meeting of Members' representatives ?	5. Is there a common set of questions asked of all candidates? If so, who prepares and approves the questions? Is the floor open for questions?	6. Is this meeting webcast in real-time and, if so, to whom? Is it interactive ?	7. Are the meeting proceedings made available to the public after the meeting? If so, when?
IFAD	No	No	An informal Membership meeting between representatives of Members and the nominees is held prior to the Governing Council session at which the appointment of the President is to be considered.	No. It is an informal Membership meeting between representatives of Members and the nominees.	Each nominee is asked to respond to three pre-agreed cross-List questions which are framed by the List Convenors and reviewed by the Bureau. Three open questions from the floor are also required to be answered.	No	No.
AfDB	No. The Rules of Procedure governing the election of the President are silent on the candidates' mode of campaign.	No.	In the last two competitive elections, the Board of Governors conducted an informal "dialogue" with the candidates.	Yes. This session involved the entire Board of Governors.	Yes. Candidates were asked the same set of questions. In 2015, all Governors were requested to propose questions to pose to the candidates. The Chairperson and the First Vice-Chairperson of the Board of Governors, assisted by the Secretary-General and the	No.	There are no records kept of this session.

	1. Are there guidelines, regulations or rules governing the candidates' campaign?	2. Are staff members allowed to express their support or to campaign for a candidate?	3. Does the Membership meet formally with the candidates? (If not, skip the questions 4-8)	4. Is it a meeting of the same body who has the power to appoint/elect the President/ Chief Executive? Or an ad hoc meeting of Members' representatives ?	5. Is there a common set of questions asked of all candidates? If so, who prepares and approves the questions? Is the floor open for questions?	6. Is this meeting webcast in real-time and, if so, to whom? Is it interactive ?	7. Are the meeting proceedings made available to the public after the meeting? If so, when?
					General Counsel, then finalized the set of questions, from which three were selected at the start of the session. The floor was not open for questions; the only questions posed to the candidates were those pre-selected.		
AsDB	No. There is no campaign among the candidates for presidency. However, nominees are asked to prepare a vision statement that sets forth the candidate's vision for AsDB over the course of the President's term of office.	No. Only the Board of Governors is involved in the election process.	Following the receipt of the candidates' vision statements an informal meeting with Executive Directors and Alternative Executive Directors is organized.	No.	There are no set rules of procedures for a questions-and-answers period for the candidates.	No.	No.
EBRD	No. Only the time frame for submission of a written statement and hearings with candidates is fixed.	No.	Two hearings are conducted prior to the election. The first hearing is attended by Members of the Board of Directors; the meeting is in Executive session format. The second hearing is chaired by the Chair of the Board of Governors and attended by no more than one representative of each member of the Bank (namely the Governor or another person appointed by the Governor for the purpose). Members of the Board of Directors and their Alternates shall be admitted.	The second hearing is generally with the Members of the body that has the powers to elect the President, i.e. the EBRD Board of Governors.	No. There is no common set of questions. The floor is open for questions.	No. The hearings and the whole election process are confidential.	No. They are not made available to the public at any time.
FAO	No.	No.	There is a two-step process for the candidates to make formal presentations to the FAO Council and the	Yes, the election of the Director-General takes place during the	The General Rules of the Organization (GRO) provide for the Member Nations and Associate Members to put	No. The sessions of the Conference	Yes. The verbatim records of the Conference

	<p>1. Are there guidelines, regulations or rules governing the candidates' campaign?</p>	<p>2. Are staff members allowed to express their support or to campaign for a candidate?</p>	<p>3. Does the Membership meet formally with the candidates? (if not, skip the questions 4-8)</p>	<p>4. Is it a meeting of the same body who has the power to appoint/elect the President/ Chief Executive? Or an ad hoc meeting of Members' representatives ?</p>	<p>5. Is there a common set of questions asked of all candidates? If so, who prepares and approves the questions? Is the floor open for questions?</p>	<p>6. Is this meeting webcast in real-time and, if so, to whom? Is it interactive ?</p>	<p>7. Are the meeting proceedings made available to the public after the meeting? If so, when?</p>
			<p>Conference and respond to questions prior to elections.</p>	<p>Conference – the organization's supreme Governing Body – which has the authority to elect the Director-General.</p>	<p>questions to candidates. The content of the questions is not predefined. According to rule XXXVII.1(c) of the GRO, "[...] candidates shall address the session of the Council which will be scheduled not less than 60 days before the session of the Conference and respond to such questions as may be put to them by Member Nations and Associate Members of the Organization. There shall be no debate and the Council shall not draw any conclusion or recommendation from any of the statements or interventions made". Rule XXXVII.1(d) of the GRO further specifies that "candidates shall address the Conference and respond to questions that Member Nations and Associate Members may put to them, subject to such arrangements as the Conference may make consistent with these Rules aimed at ensuring equality among candidates".</p>	<p>are not webcast.</p>	<p>session are posted in-session on the password-protected Members Gateway, and are published on the FAO website approximately one month after the end of the session.</p>
<p>IDB</p>	<p>No. The Regulations do not address campaigns.</p>	<p>No. The Regulations do not provide for this possibility.</p>	<p>Prior to the first voting session, candidates shall have the opportunity to make a presentation to the Board of Governors.</p>	<p>Yes, it is the Board of Governors.</p>	<p>There is no requirement for uniformity in questioning. The Governors may pose their own questions to the candidates.</p>	<p>The Regulations do not provide for webcast of the meeting.</p>	<p>The Office of the Secretary shall hold the electronic records of the election in custody as confidential Bank documents.</p>

	1. Are there guidelines, regulations or rules governing the candidates' campaign?	2. Are staff members allowed to express their support or to campaign for a candidate?	3. Does the Membership meet formally with the candidates? (if not, skip the questions 4-8)	4. Is it a meeting of the same body who has the power to appoint/elect the President/ Chief Executive? Or an ad hoc meeting of Members' representatives ?	5. Is there a common set of questions asked of all candidates? If so, who prepares and approves the questions? Is the floor open for questions?	6. Is this meeting webcast in real-time and, if so, to whom? Is it interactive ?	7. Are the meeting proceedings made available to the public after the meeting? If so, when?
UNESCO	No.	No.	Yes, interviews by the Executive Board.	No. The Executive Board submits a nomination for approval by the General Conference.	No common set of questions. The floor is open for questions.	The meeting is webcasted in real-time on the UNESCO website.	Yes, the meeting is part of the official session of the Executive Board (EXB) and is included in the Summary Records of the session of the Executive Board to be approved at the next session of the Executive Board, available on the EXB website.
UNWTO	No.	No.	Yes, the Member States do formally meet with the candidates put forward by the respective states. This is done during the Executive Council session, in which the candidates are given the possibility to present their statements of intent in front of the Council.	No, the selection of the nominee for the post of Secretary-General is performed by the Executive Council. The actual appointment of the nominee proposed by the Council is decided by the General Assembly.	No. The practice of the Council has been to proceed to a debate on the candidates after their presentations, without addressing any questions to the candidates.	No, the meeting takes place in private with no webcast coverage.	Details and specifics of the proceedings that take place are not made public. However, the results of the voting with the selection of the nominee by the Council are announced publicly through the publication of the decisions of the Governing Bodies on the UNWTO website. In addition, a press release is issued informing of the results.

	1. Are there guidelines, regulations or rules governing the candidates' campaign?	2. Are staff members allowed to express their support or to campaign for a candidate?	3. Does the Membership meet formally with the candidates? (if not, skip the questions 4-8)	4. Is it a meeting of the same body who has the power to appoint/elect the President/ Chief Executive? Or an ad hoc meeting of Members' representatives ?	5. Is there a common set of questions asked of all candidates? If so, who prepares and approves the questions? Is the floor open for questions?	6. Is this meeting webcast in real-time and, if so, to whom? Is it interactive ?	7. Are the meeting proceedings made available to the public after the meeting? If so, when?
WBG	There is no campaign as such; therefore, the Selection Principles do not set out guidelines, procedures, regulations or rules governing the candidates' campaign.	No.	Yes. Interviews of shortlisted candidates are conducted by the Board of Executive Directors.	Yes, it is the same body that is authorized under the Articles of Agreement to appoint the President.	The Selection Principles provide that issues to be covered during the interview are prepared in advance by the Corporate Secretariat on behalf of the Board of Executive Directors. The preparation of issues to be covered during the interviews is determined by the Board and the relevant circumstances of a particular selection process.	No.	No.
WHO	Yes. The Code of Conduct sets out principles for the election process and the electoral campaign activities, as well as requirements for the electoral campaign activities.	No.	Yes. WHO Member States meet formally with the candidates at the candidates' forum that precedes the EB session at which the nomination takes place. After the forum, Member States formally meet candidates on two occasions: At the EB session at which the nomination takes place and at the WHA session at which the appointment takes place.	No. The candidates' forum is not the same body that has the authority to nominate candidates and appoint the Director-General. It is a non-decision-making platform open to all Member States.	No. There is no common set of questions asked of all candidates. Member States and Associate Members participating in the forum are invited to prepare questions for each candidate. Questions to be addressed to each candidate are drawn by lot by the Chairperson.	The sixty-ninth World Health Assembly decided that the candidates' forum would be webcast in all official languages on the WHO website. The web streaming of the candidates' forum that took place on 1-2 November 2016 is still available at the following	Yes.

	1. Are there guidelines, regulations or rules governing the candidates' campaign?	2. Are staff members allowed to express their support or to campaign for a candidate?	3. Does the Membership meet formally with the candidates? (if not, skip the questions 4-8)	4. Is it a meeting of the same body who has the power to appoint/elect the President/ Chief Executive? Or an ad hoc meeting of Members' representatives ?	5. Is there a common set of questions asked of all candidates? If so, who prepares and approves the questions? Is the floor open for questions?	6. Is this meeting webcast in real-time and, if so, to whom? Is it interactive ?	7. Are the meeting proceedings made available to the public after the meeting? If so, when?
						link: http://www.who.int/dg/election/candidates-forum/en/ .	

C. The appointment/election process

	1. Who appoints/elects the President/ Chief Executive?	2. Do members/ representatives each have one vote or a different number of votes?	3. Does the appointment/ election process take place in a closed meeting? If so, who is allowed to attend?	4. Is the appointment/ election held by secret ballot?	5. Is there an automated voting system? If so, please describe.	6. Are there rules to reduce the number of candidates after each ballot? E.g., is the candidate that has received the least votes in a ballot eliminated from the next ballot?	7. Does the Chair of the meeting have power to propose an appointment/ election by acclamation (rather than proceeding with another ballot)? If so, is the exercise of such power subject to certain conditions?	8. Are the results of each ballot made public? If so, during the process or after completion of the appointment process?	9. What is/ are the majority/ majorities required to elect a candidate?	10. Are there tellers designated to oversee the voting process? If so, who designates them and on what basis?
IFAD	The President is appointed by the Governing Council.	Different number of votes.	Yes. Process takes place at a private meeting. Only the Governors, their Alternates and essential staff are admitted.	Yes.	No.	Yes. In the case of more than one nominee, if no nominee receives the required number of votes on the first ballot, a second ballot shall be taken in which the nominee who received the fewest votes shall not participate. This procedure shall be repeated until one nominee receives at least two thirds of the total number of votes or the Council decides that such balloting be discontinued and the decision be taken on another date.	Basic documents are silent on this point. However, IFAD has in the past appointed its President by acclamation.	No.	Two-thirds majority of the total number of votes.	Three tellers, usually one from each List, are appointed by the Chairperson of the Governing Council. The three tellers are supported in their task by a task force appointed by the Secretary of IFAD and composed of some IFAD staff members, under the supervision of a Coordinator and with the involvement of a staff member from the Office of the General Counsel.
AfDB	The President is elected by the Board of Governors of the Bank.	Different number of votes.	Yes. Only Governors, Alternate Governors and members of the Board of Directors and their	Yes.	No.	Yes. If no candidate obtains the requisite majorities in the first ballot, further ballots are conducted until one of the candidates obtains the requisite	Yes. The Chairperson of the Board of Governors can, in the event of a lone candidature for the office of	No. The only requirement in the applicable rules is for the Chairperson to announce the results after each ballot to the	Majority of the total voting power of the members, including a majority of the total voting	The Steering Committee on Elections for the Presidency – a subsidiary organ of the Board of Governors –

	1. Who appoints/elects the President/ Chief Executive?	2. Do members/ representatives each have one vote or a different number of votes?	3. Does the appointment/ election process take place in a closed meeting? If so, who is allowed to attend?	4. Is the appointment/ election held by secret ballot?	5. Is there an automated voting system? If so, please describe.	6. Are there rules to reduce the number of candidates after each ballot? E.g., is the candidate that has received the least votes in a ballot eliminated from the next ballot?	7. Does the Chair of the meeting have power to propose an appointment/ election by acclamation (rather than proceeding with another ballot)? If so, is the exercise of such power subject to certain conditions?	8. Are the results of each ballot made public? If so, during the process or after completion of the appointment process?	9. What is/ are the majority/ majorities required to elect a candidate?	10. Are there tellers designated to oversee the voting process? If so, who designates them and on what basis?
			Alternates are admitted.			majorities. In each of the subsequent ballots, the candidate who received the lowest number of votes of Member States in the preceding ballot is eliminated.	President, request that the vote be conducted by acclamation. In a multiple candidate election, if no candidate obtains 50.01 per cent of the total voting power in the first round of balloting, further ballots are required to be conducted until one of the candidates obtains the requisite majorities.	session of the Governors at which the elections are held.	power of the regional members.	administers the electoral process. It: (a) verifies and publishes the list of persons eligible to contest the election and who fully satisfy the criteria and the conditions for the deposit of candidatures; and (b) designates three Governors to act as Returning Officers for the election. Returning Officers are assisted by the Secretary-General, General Counsel and one or more staff members capable of computing the votes.
AsDB	The President is elected by the Board of Governors of the Bank.	Different number of votes.	Not applicable. The election process traditionally does not take place during the annual meeting of the Board of Governors. Votes	Votes cast are not disclosed.	Yes. According to the e-voting system in place at AsDB, an e-mail is sent to all Governors with a link to the ballot. Once the ballot is completed	Yes. The procedure for the election of the President states that if no candidate receives the majority required in the first ballot, successive ballots shall be conducted until one of the candidates	No.	No.	Majority of the total number of Governors, representing not less than a majority of the total voting power of the Members.	The Office of the Secretary (OSEC) manages the electoral process of selecting the President. OSEC is responsible for providing strategic and

	1. Who appoints/elects the President/ Chief Executive?	2. Do members/ representatives each have one vote or a different number of votes?	3. Does the appointment/ election process take place in a closed meeting? If so, who is allowed to attend?	4. Is the appointment/ election held by secret ballot?	5. Is there an automated voting system? If so, please describe.	6. Are there rules to reduce the number of candidates after each ballot? E.g., is the candidate that has received the least votes in a ballot eliminated from the next ballot?	7. Does the Chair of the meeting have power to propose an appointment/ election by acclamation (rather than proceeding with another ballot)? If so, is the exercise of such power subject to certain conditions?	8. Are the results of each ballot made public? If so, during the process or after completion of the appointment process?	9. What is/ are the majority/ majorities required to elect a candidate?	10. Are there tellers designated to oversee the voting process? If so, who designates them and on what basis?
			are cast by Governors by post or electronically.		each Governor's vote is tallied at HQ automatically.	receives such majority. In successive ballots, if there are more than two candidates, after each ballot, the candidate with the smaller number of votes shall be excluded from the next ballot.				operational support to the AsDB, the Board of Governors and the Board of Directors.
EBRD	The President is elected and appointed by the Board of Governors.	Each member has a number of votes proportional to its contributions to the capital.	Yes. The election process takes place in a closed session of the Board of Governors, at which only Governors and Alternate Governors of the Bank, and Members of the Board of Directors and their Alternates are admitted. The serving President, even if he/she is not seeking re-election, is not permitted to attend this closed session.	Yes.	No.	Yes. Where there are more than five candidates at the time of the election, a first round of balloting is conducted, following which only the five candidates with the highest number of votes proceed to the next rounds of balloting. Where, in any round of balloting, no candidate attains the required majorities, the candidate who has received the least support (as defined below) is eliminated from the next round. The candidate with the least support is the one who has obtained the lowest sum of (i) the votes of Governors who voted for him/her, computed as a	No. Where there is only one candidate, an election is still held. In the event that the candidate does not receive the majority required, new Elections for the President would need to be organized and conducted in which such candidate would not be eligible for nomination.	No.	Majority of the total number of Governors, representing not less than a majority of the total voting power of the Members.	The Secretary-General appoints members of staff to count the votes and supervises the counting process. The number of staff so appointed by the Secretary-General is limited to the minimum necessary. The process of counting of the votes is observed by the Chief Evaluator, the General Counsel and the External Auditors, or their respective representative.

	1. Who appoints/elects the President/ Chief Executive?	2. Do members/ representatives each have one vote or a different number of votes?	3. Does the appointment/ election process take place in a closed meeting? If so, who is allowed to attend?	4. Is the appointment/ election held by secret ballot?	5. Is there an automated voting system? If so, please describe.	6. Are there rules to reduce the number of candidates after each ballot? E.g., is the candidate that has received the least votes in a ballot eliminated from the next ballot?	7. Does the Chair of the meeting have power to propose an appointment/ election by acclamation (rather than proceeding with another ballot)? If so, is the exercise of such power subject to certain conditions?	8. Are the results of each ballot made public? If so, during the process or after completion of the appointment process?	9. What is/ are the majority/ majorities required to elect a candidate?	10. Are there tellers designated to oversee the voting process? If so, who designates them and on what basis?
						percentage of the total number of Governors, and (ii) the voting power of the Governors who voted for him/her, computed as a percentage of the total voting power of the Members. Where two candidates have the same lowest score, both are eliminated from the next round. However, no candidate would be eliminated in a round if such elimination would result in there being only one candidate in the next round, in which case all remaining candidates proceed to the next round.				
FAO	The Director-General of the organization is appointed by the Conference for a term of four years.	Each Member Nation has one vote.	The election process takes place during the FAO Conference in the Plenary Hall at FAO headquarters, which is attended by all Member Nations and invited Observers. Under rule V.2 of the GRO, the	Yes.	No.	Rule XXXVII.2 of the GRO states that "the Director-General shall be elected by a majority of votes cast. Until a candidate obtains the required majority, the following procedure shall apply: (a) two ballots shall be held among all candidates; (b) the candidate	The Chairperson of the Conference may propose to appoint/elect by acclamation but this is not applicable for the post of the Director-General.	Yes. The Chairperson announces the results of each ballot to the Plenary immediately after the election round has taken place and the count of votes has been completed by the tellers.	The Director-General shall be elected by a majority of votes cast. Rule X11.3(a) of the GRO states that the required majority for any decision or for any election shall be more	The Chairperson appoints two tellers from among the delegates or representatives, or their Alternates, who are not parties directly interested in the election.

	1. Who appoints/elects the President/ Chief Executive?	2. Do members/ representatives each have one vote or a different number of votes?	3. Does the appointment/ election process take place in a closed meeting? If so, who is allowed to attend?	4. Is the appointment/ election held by secret ballot?	5. Is there an automated voting system? If so, please describe.	6. Are there rules to reduce the number of candidates after each ballot? E.g., is the candidate that has received the least votes in a ballot eliminated from the next ballot?	7. Does the Chair of the meeting have power to propose an appointment/ election by acclamation (rather than proceeding with another ballot)? If so, is the exercise of such power subject to certain conditions?	8. Are the results of each ballot made public? If so, during the process or after completion of the appointment process?	9. What is/ are the majority/ majorities required to elect a candidate?	10. Are there tellers designated to oversee the voting process? If so, who designates them and on what basis?
			Plenary meetings of the Conference are public unless the Conference decides otherwise.			having received the smallest number of votes in the second ballot shall be eliminated; (c) thereafter, successive ballots shall be held and the candidate having received the smallest number of votes in any one of these ballots shall be eliminated, until only three candidates remain; (d) two ballots shall be held among the three remaining candidates; (e) the candidate having received the smallest number of votes during the second ballot referred to in subparagraph (d) above shall be eliminated; (f) a subsequent ballot, or successive ballots if necessary, shall be held among the two remaining candidates until one candidate obtains the required majority”.			than one half of the votes cast.	
IDB	The President is elected by the IDB Board of	Different number of votes. Each Member Country	The election takes place in a closed meeting. Each	Yes.	During the last election (2015), paper ballots	Yes. If no candidate receives the required majority during the	The Regulations do not address this possibility;	No, results of each ballot are not made public. The	Majority of the total voting power of the	The voting system is supervised by

	1. Who appoints/elects the President/ Chief Executive?	2. Do members/ representatives each have one vote or a different number of votes?	3. Does the appointment/ election process take place in a closed meeting? If so, who is allowed to attend?	4. Is the appointment/ election held by secret ballot?	5. Is there an automated voting system? If so, please describe.	6. Are there rules to reduce the number of candidates after each ballot? E.g., is the candidate that has received the least votes in a ballot eliminated from the next ballot?	7. Does the Chair of the meeting have power to propose an appointment/ election by acclamation (rather than proceeding with another ballot)? If so, is the exercise of such power subject to certain conditions?	8. Are the results of each ballot made public? If so, during the process or after completion of the appointment process?	9. What is/ are the majority/ majorities required to elect a candidate?	10. Are there tellers designated to oversee the voting process? If so, who designates them and on what basis?
	Governors.	shall have 135 votes plus one vote for each share of ordinary capital stock of the Bank held by that country.	Bank Member shall be represented at the meeting by its respective delegation, which may include the Governor, the Alternate Governor or the Temporary Alternate Governor, as well as the Executive Director, the Alternate Executive Director and Counsellors. Members of the Bank's administration also attend; including the Secretary of the Bank, the General Counsel and such other officers as may be needed.		were used to cast the votes and an electronic system tallied up the results in real-time. For the next election, the IDB shall have an anonymous voting platform.	first voting session, successive voting sessions shall be held until a candidate receives the required majority. If the President is not elected during the second voting session, the third voting session shall be limited to the three candidates (if three candidates remain) who have obtained the largest number of votes during the second voting session. If the President is not elected during the third voting session, the fourth voting session shall be limited to the two candidates who obtained the largest number of votes during the third voting session. If after a fourth voting session no candidate has been elected President, the Chairperson of the Board of Governors shall determine, in consultation with the Board of Governors, the procedures to be	however, in practice certain appointments have been held by acclamation at the request of a Governor and with the agreement of the Board of Governors.	Secretary of the Bank informs the Members of the voting session of the final result. After the election, the Office of the Secretary shall hold the electronic records of the election in custody as confidential Bank documents.	member countries, including an absolute majority of the Governors of regional Members (Member Countries of Latin America and the Caribbean, the United States, and Canada).	three Members of the Administrative Tribunal of the Bank randomly selected for the purpose of validating the system and the results of the election. The Chairperson of the Board of Governors, assisted by the IDB Secretary and General Counsel, shall oversee the conduct of the election.

	1. Who appoints/elects the President/ Chief Executive?	2. Do members/ representatives each have one vote or a different number of votes?	3. Does the appointment/ election process take place in a closed meeting? If so, who is allowed to attend?	4. Is the appointment/ election held by secret ballot?	5. Is there an automated voting system? If so, please describe.	6. Are there rules to reduce the number of candidates after each ballot? E.g., is the candidate that has received the least votes in a ballot eliminated from the next ballot?	7. Does the Chair of the meeting have power to propose an appointment/ election by acclamation (rather than proceeding with another ballot)? If so, is the exercise of such power subject to certain conditions?	8. Are the results of each ballot made public? If so, during the process or after completion of the appointment process?	9. What is/ are the majority/ majorities required to elect a candidate?	10. Are there tellers designated to oversee the voting process? If so, who designates them and on what basis?
						followed subsequently.				
UNESCO	The Director-General is appointed by the General Conference on the recommendation of the Board.	One vote.	Yes. Participation is restricted to Member States and authorized members of the Secretariat.	Yes.	No.	Not at the General Conference since the General Conference votes on the candidate nominated by the Executive Board.	No.	Yes, after the completion of the appointment process.	Simple majority of the Members present and voting (Members casting an affirmative or negative vote).	Yes, tellers are designated by the President of the General Conference.
UNWTO	The Secretary-General is appointed by the UNWTO Assembly on the recommendation of the Council.	One vote.	Yes. The appointment of the Secretary-General by the General Assembly is conducted at a private meeting at which Full Members, Associate Members, Affiliate Members and Observers can be present.	Yes.	No.	Yes. During the Executive Council, if no candidate receives the required simple majority in the first ballot, the two candidates who have received the highest number of votes will hold as many ballots as necessary until one of them receives the said majority.	Yes, in the General Assembly, appointment of the Secretary-General (only one nominee presented) has taken place by acclamation. However, there must be consensus from all Full Members present and voting.	The results are made public after completion of the selection/ appointment process.	Two-thirds majority of Full Members present and voting.	Yes. Two tellers are designated by the Chair/President from among the delegates that volunteer.
WBG	The President is appointed by the Board of Directors.	Different number of votes. When voting, Executive Directors cast the number of votes within their constituency.	Yes. The Board meets to appoint the President in a restricted Executive session. Attendance is limited to Executive Directors only.	No.	No.	No.	No.	No.	The Board has always selected the President by consensus. When a formal vote is required, a candidate would be appointed by a	No.

	1. Who appoints/elects the President/ Chief Executive?	2. Do members/ representatives each have one vote or a different number of votes?	3. Does the appointment/ election process take place in a closed meeting? If so, who is allowed to attend?	4. Is the appointment/ election held by secret ballot?	5. Is there an automated voting system? If so, please describe.	6. Are there rules to reduce the number of candidates after each ballot? E.g., is the candidate that has received the least votes in a ballot eliminated from the next ballot?	7. Does the Chair of the meeting have power to propose an appointment/ election by acclamation (rather than proceeding with another ballot)? If so, is the exercise of such power subject to certain conditions?	8. Are the results of each ballot made public? If so, during the process or after completion of the appointment process?	9. What is/ are the majority/ majorities required to elect a candidate?	10. Are there tellers designated to oversee the voting process? If so, who designates them and on what basis?
									Simple majority vote.	
WHO	The Director-General is appointed by the World Health Assembly on the nomination of the Executive Board (EB).	One vote.	Yes. Both the nomination of candidates by the Executive Board and the appointment by the World Health Assembly take place in a private meeting. Unless otherwise decided by the WHA, attendance at private meetings is open to the delegations of Members, the representatives of Associate Members and the representative of the United Nations.	Yes.	No. The most recent election (2017) was conducted through a paper-based system, since two electronic voting systems had been tested and found to be insufficiently secure.	Yes. Rules are in place to reduce the number of candidates after each ballot at the nomination process by the EB and at the appointment process by the WHA. With regard to the appointment by the WHA, and provided that the EB has nominated three persons, if in the first ballot no candidate obtains a two-thirds majority or more of the Members present and voting, the candidate having received the least number of votes is eliminated. If two candidates tie for the least number of votes, a separate ballot is held between them and the candidate receiving the least number of	No.	No. The results of each ballot are not made publicly available.	Clear and strong majority of the Members present and voting. If the EB nominates three persons, this is defined as amounting to a two-thirds majority or more of the Members present and voting in the first two ballots; a majority of WHO Member States or more in the third ballot; and a majority or more of the Members present and voting in the fourth ballot. A	Yes. Two or more tellers appointed by the President of the WHA from among the delegations present assist in the counting of votes.

	1. Who appoints/elects the President/ Chief Executive?	2. Do members/ representatives each have one vote or a different number of votes?	3. Does the appointment/ election process take place in a closed meeting? If so, who is allowed to attend?	4. Is the appointment/ election held by secret ballot?	5. Is there an automated voting system? If so, please describe.	6. Are there rules to reduce the number of candidates after each ballot? E.g., is the candidate that has received the least votes in a ballot eliminated from the next ballot?	7. Does the Chair of the meeting have power to propose an appointment/ election by acclamation (rather than proceeding with another ballot)? If so, is the exercise of such power subject to certain conditions?	8. Are the results of each ballot made public? If so, during the process or after completion of the appointment process?	9. What is/ are the majority/ majorities required to elect a candidate?	10. Are there tellers designated to oversee the voting process? If so, who designates them and on what basis?
						votes is eliminated.			clear and strong majority of the Members present and voting is defined differently if the EB nominates two or one person(s).	

Results of the benchmarking exercise

1. In order to support the work of the Governing Council Bureau as set out in Governing Council resolution 176/XXXVI, the Office of the Secretary and the Office of the General Counsel of IFAD conducted a benchmarking exercise of other international organizations to acquire information as to the procedures followed in the appointment process of the Executive Heads of their organizations.
2. Nine organizations were selected as comparator organizations for this exercise on the basis of the following criteria: (i) intergovernmental organization; (ii) mandate of the institution is project finance; (iii) dual character of the executive head (both the head of the organization and the chairperson of the executive board); (iv) appointment/election of executive head by members or board where members are represented; (v) weighted votes (as opposed to one-member-one-vote); and (vi) availability of information/willingness to share relevant information. The comparator organizations include the following multilateral development banks: the African Development Bank (AfDB), the Asian Development Bank (AsDB), the Inter-American Development Bank (IDB), the European Bank for Reconstruction and Development (EBRD) and the World Bank Group (WBG) - which is also a United Nations specialized agency; and the following United Nations specialized agencies: the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO), the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO), the World Tourism Organization (UNWTO) and the World Health Organization (WHO).
3. On 21 July, a questionnaire was sent to the participating organizations. It had three sections: (A) the nomination process, (B) the campaign, (C) and the appointment/election process. Nine organizations shared their feedback, which is presented in detail in the table and summarized below.
 - A. Nomination process
4. The first part of the benchmarking shows a consistent approach among most organizations. In particular:
 - Except for a few cases (WBG, UNESCO and WHO), there are no terms of reference for the position of executive head, and his/her powers and functions are usually set out in the constituent instrument of the organization as well as other basic documents.
 - In terms of competencies, qualifications and experience, all organizations – except for IFAD and FAO – have criteria for candidates running for presidency. These vary from two to four criteria in the case of AfDB, AsDB, EBRD, IDB, UNWTO and UNESCO, and reach five and nine criteria in the case of WBG and WHO respectively.
 - In all organizations candidates must be nominated by a member. Only in two cases (AfDB and UNWTO) must the candidate specifically be a national of the member nominating him or her.
 - As to the number of candidates that can be nominated by a member, for the majority of the organizations it is clearly provided (in the rules) or understood that only one candidate can be nominated, except in the case of AsDB, FAO UNESCO and WBG (where there is no rule preventing a member from nominating more than one candidate) and WHO (where the rules envisage the possibility of a Member State proposing more than one person for the post of Director-General).
 - Except for IFAD and WHO, candidates are not invited or required to answer questions in writing. In some cases, a written statement outlining their vision for the organization may be required (AfDB, AsDB, EBRD). In the case of

WHO, a password-protected web forum open to all Member States is created for questions and answers. Candidates wishing to participate in the forum are invited to answer in writing to the questions posted.

- In only a few cases (IFAD, AfDB and WHO) is internal guidance provided on internal candidates running for the post of president. For example, in the case of AfDB, the Staff Rules provide that an internal candidate seeking nomination for the post of the President is required to inform the President of the Bank and apply for leave with pay for a period not exceeding three months. If his/her government assents to his/her nomination, the staff member shall immediately inform the President and apply to go on leave without pay. Where such assent is refused, the staff member will immediately inform the President and request to resume duty. FAO is planning to establish rules for internal candidates in 2018.

B. Campaign process

5. As far as the campaign process is concerned, the benchmarking shows the following:

- In AsDB and WBG, no campaign takes place among candidates.
- WHO is the only organization with set principles and requirements for the electoral campaign activities. No guidelines, regulations or rules to govern the candidates' campaign are in place in the remaining organizations surveyed. However, none of the participating organizations allows staff members to express their support or to campaign for a candidate.
- In all organizations, the membership usually meets with the candidates before the session for the election of the President is held. At WHO, Member States meet with the candidates at the candidates' forum that precedes the Board session at which the nomination takes place. After the forum, Member States meet candidates on two occasions: at the Board session at which the nomination takes place and at the World Health Assembly session at which the appointment takes place. In the case of the EBRD, two hearings are conducted prior to the election. The first is attended by Members of the Board of Directors, meeting in Executive session format. The second is chaired by the Chair of the Board of Governors and attended by the Governors. Members of the Board of Directors and their Alternates are also admitted.
- While in IFAD and AfDB pre-agreed questions are posed to the candidates during the aforementioned membership meeting(s), this is not the case for EBRD, FAO, IDB, UNESCO or WHO.
- The proceedings of the meeting of the membership with the candidates are generally not webcast or made available to the public. Only UNESCO and WHO allow the proceedings of the meeting to be broadcast on their website. In the case of FAO, the verbatim records of the Conference session are made available on the FAO website approximately one month after the session.

C. Appointment process

6. The table shows a consistent practice among the participating organizations as to the body electing the executive head. The president is elected by the plenary organ of the organization. Only in the case of WBG is the President appointed by the executive organ. In particular, it is to be noted that in the United Nations specialized agencies a recommendation is provided by the executive organ to the plenary organ (UNESCO, UNWTO, WHO). In this regard, IFAD follows the structure of the multilateral development banks, since its President is elected by the Governing Council without a recommendation by the Executive Board.

7. The voting system was also considered. While the United Nations specialized agencies have a one-member-one-vote system (FAO, UNESCO, UNWTO, WHO), the

multilateral development banks have a more complex voting structure based on the capital contributions of member governments.

8. The appointment of the executive head takes place in a closed meeting (except for FAO) and voting is held (except at WBG) by secret ballot. For most organizations, the results of each ballot are not made public. It seems from the responses collected that the only three organizations that make such results available to the public are FAO, UNESCO and UNWTO.
9. Voting is presently conducted by most organizations on a paper-based system. AsDB is the only organization that has an electronic voting system in place, and WHO and IDB are exploring the possibility of introducing an automated system. In particular, in the case of AsDB, the election process does not traditionally take place during the annual meeting of the Board of Governors of the Bank, thus the voting process is carried out remotely via e-mail. Each Governor receives an e-mail from the Secretariat containing a link to the ballot. The vote cast is then tallied automatically at headquarters. WHO has tested two electronic voting systems and has found them to be insufficiently secure. IDB is currently exploring the possibility of using a fully online anonymous voting platform. During the last election in 2015, paper ballots were used to cast the votes and an electronic system tallied up the results in real-time.
10. As for the majority required for the election of the executive head: simple majority is required at FAO, UNESCO and WBG; a qualified majority at IFAD, UNWTO and WHO; and a dual majority at AfDB, AsDB, EBRD and IDB.
11. Most organizations have rules in place to reduce the number of candidates after each ballot (only UNESCO and WBG do not have such rules).
12. In addition, appointment by acclamation is possible only at AfDB and UNWTO (in the event of a lone candidature). In IFAD and IDB, although the regulations do not address this possibility, appointments have been held by acclamation.
13. As for the administration of the electoral process, a different approach was noted among the organizations: for example, tellers are only designated at IFAD, FAO, UNESCO, UNWTO and WHO. In addition:
 - At IDB, the Chairperson of the Board of Governors, assisted by the IDB Secretary and General Counsel, oversees the conduct of the election, while the voting system is supervised by three members of the Administrative Tribunal of the Bank randomly selected for the purpose of validating the system and the results of the election.
 - At AsDB and EBRD, the process is managed by the Office of the Secretary which provides support to the Board of Governors; in the case of EBRD the process of counting the votes is observed by the Chief Evaluator, the General Counsel and the External Auditors, or their respective representatives.
 - At AfDB, the electoral process is administered by a subsidiary organ of the Board of Governors (the Steering Committee on Elections for the Presidency), which verifies and publishes the list of persons who fully satisfy the criteria and the conditions for the deposit of candidatures, and designates three Governors to act as Returning Officers for the election. These Returning Officers are assisted by the Secretary-General, the General Counsel, and one or more staff members, for the computation of votes.

Extract of provisions of the Agreement Establishing IFAD, the By-Laws for the Conduct of the Business of the Fund and the Rules of Procedure of the Governing Council relating to the appointment of the President of IFAD

A. AGREEMENT ESTABLISHING IFAD

Article 6, Section 8 - President and Staff

- (a) The Governing Council shall appoint the President by a two-thirds majority of the total number of votes. He shall be appointed for a term of four years and shall be eligible for reappointment for only one further term. The appointment of the President may be terminated by the Governing Council by a two-thirds majority of the total number of votes.
- (b) Notwithstanding the restriction on the term of office of the President of four years, contained in paragraph (a) of this Section, the Governing Council may, under special circumstances, on the recommendation of the Executive Board, extend the term of office of the President beyond the duration prescribed in paragraph (a) above. Any such extension shall be for no more than six months.

B. BY-LAWS FOR THE CONDUCT OF THE BUSINESS OF THE FUND

Section 6 – The President

1. The salary, allowances and other entitlements of the President shall be determined by resolution of the Governing Council. In addition, he shall be entitled to participate in insurance, medical, pension, retirement and other plans as may be established for the employees of the Fund and not otherwise covered by his emoluments.
2. When the term of office of the President is due to expire, the appointment of a President shall be placed on the agenda of the annual session of the Governing Council immediately preceding the expiry of the term of office; whenever, for other reasons, the office of President becomes vacant or a vacancy is due to occur, the Executive Board shall request that the Governing Council be convened in special session for the purpose of appointing the President. Nominations for the office of President may be submitted to the Secretary of the Fund by Members, along with a curriculum vitae. Except as the Bureau of the Council may decide otherwise, all nominations shall be submitted no less than 60 days before the opening of the session at which the appointment of the President is to be decided. The President shall communicate timely nominations to all Members and the Bureau no less than 40 days prior to the session of the Council.

C. RULES OF PROCEDURE OF THE GOVERNING COUNCIL

Rule 26: Quorum

1. A quorum for any meeting of the Governing Council shall be constituted by Governors exercising two-thirds of the total number of votes.
2. ...

Rule 33: Voting Rights

1. Each Member shall have the number of votes distributed to it in accordance with the formulae set out in Section 3(a) of Article 6 of the Agreement and in

the decisions that the Governing Council shall take, from time to time, in accordance therewith.

2. Each Governor shall be entitled to cast the votes of the Member he represents. In his absence, the alternate appointed by that Member or, in the absence of both, a member of their delegation shall be entitled to cast these votes.

Rule 34: Majority Required

1. The following decisions of the Governing Council shall require at least two-thirds of the total number of votes:
...
(c) appointment or termination of the appointment of the President; ...

Rule 35: Method of Taking Decisions

1. At any meeting of the Governing Council, the Chairman should attempt to secure a consensus on a proposal in lieu of taking a vote thereon. However, the Council shall take decisions by vote at the request of any Governor.
2. Roll-call votes shall be taken in the English alphabetical order of the names of the Members, starting with the Member whose name is drawn by lot by the Chairman. The name of each Member shall be called in all roll-calls, and its representative shall reply "yes", "no" or "abstention". Unless otherwise decided by the Council, the vote of each Member participating in roll call shall be recorded.
3. Secret ballots shall be taken by providing each Governor with one or more ballot papers each indicating a specific number of votes, which shall be so distributed that: (i) papers specifying any particular number of votes shall be received by at least four Governors, and (ii) the total number of votes specified on the papers received by any Governor shall equal the number of votes he is entitled to cast; each Governor may indicate his vote on all the papers he receives and deposit them in ballot boxes from which they shall be taken and counted by tellers appointed by the Chairman.

Rule 36: Conduct Relating to Voting

1. The Chairman shall announce the commencement of voting, after which no one shall be permitted to intervene until the results of the vote have been announced except on a point of order in connection with the process of voting.
2. Governors may make brief statements consisting solely of explanation of their votes, before the announcement of the commencement of voting or after the results of the vote have been announced.

Rule 38: Elections

1. Except as provided otherwise in respect of elections pursuant to Rule 40, all elections shall be held by secret ballot unless the Governing Council decides otherwise in an election where the number of candidates does not exceed the number of elective places to be filled.
...

Rule 41: President

2. The appointment of the President shall be considered by the Governing Council at a private meeting, and voting shall be in accordance with Rule 38.1.
3. The Governing Council shall appoint the President by at least two-thirds of the total number of votes. In the case of more than one nominee, if no nominee receives the required number of votes on the first ballot, a second ballot shall

be taken in which the nominee who received the fewest votes shall not participate. This procedure shall be repeated until one nominee receives at least two-thirds of the total number of votes or the Council decides that such balloting be discontinued and decision be taken on another date. Each Governor casting the votes of the Member he represents shall cast them in favour of a single person.