

Document: EB 2017/121/R.11/Add.1
Agenda: 7
Date: 8 August 2017
Distribution: Public
Original: English

E



Investing in rural people

President's Report on the Implementation Status of Evaluation Recommendations and Management Actions (PRI SMA)

Volume II

Recommendations and follow-up actions taken by Management

Addendum

Note to Executive Board representatives

Focal points:

Technical questions:

Lisandro Martin
Chief
Operational Programming and Effectiveness Unit
Programme Management Department
Tel.: +39 06 5459 2388
e-mail: lisandro.martin@ifad.org

Raniya Khan
Results Specialist
Tel.: +39 06 5459 2954
e-mail: r.sayedkhan@ifad.org

Queries with respect to the comments of the Independent
Office of Evaluation to the report should be addressed to:

Oscar A. Garcia
Director
Independent Office of Evaluation of IFAD
Tel.: +39 06 5459 2274
e-mail: o.garcia@ifad.org

Dispatch of documentation:

William Skinner
Chief
Governing Bodies
Tel.: +39 06 5459 2974
e-mail: gb@ifad.org

Executive Board — 121st Session
Rome, 13-14 September 2017

For: Review

Contents

Abbreviations and acronyms	ii
Categories used for the classification of actions/ recommendations	vi
Corporate level evaluations (CLEs)	
CLE: PBAS (April 2016)	1
Evaluation Synthesis Reports (ESRs)	
ESR: Non-Lending Activities in the Context of South-South Cooperation	4
ESR: Environment and Natural Resource Management	8
ESR: IFAD's Engagement with Indigenous Peoples	13
ESR: FAO's and IFAD's Engagement in Pastoral Development	24
Country Programme Evaluations (CPEs)	
CPE Brazil	29
CPE Bangladesh	35
CPE Turkey	40
Project Performance Assessments (PPAs)	
PPA Brazil	48
PPA Lao People's Democratic Republic	53
PPA Nigeria	57
PPA Kyrgyz Republic	58
PPA China	61
PPA Djibouti	66
PPA Ethiopia	68
PPA Mauritania	73
Impact Evaluations (IEs)	
IE India	75
Historic Follow up from 2016	79
CLE: Fragile and conflict-affected states and situations	79
CLE: Replenishments	89
Historic Follow up from 2015	96
CLE: IFAD Supervision and Implementation Support Policy	96

Abbreviations and acronyms

ABC	Brazilian Cooperation Agency
ACPO	Associate Country Programme Officer
ADB	Asian Development Bank
ADDS	Agence djiboutienne de développement social (Djibouti)
AGPO	Association de Gestion participative des Oasis (Mauritania)
APIU	Agricultural Projects Implementation Unit
APR	Asia and the Pacific Division
ARIS	Agency for Community Development and Investment
ARPP	Annual Review of Regional Portfolio Performance
ARRI	Annual Report on Results and Impact of IFAD Operations
ASAP	Adaptation for Smallholders Agriculture Programme
ASPIRE	Agriculture Services Programme for Innovation Resilience and Extension Project (Cambodia)
ATMP	Access to Market Project (Kyrgyz Republic)
AWPB	Annual Work Programme and Budget
BB	Bank of Brazil
BFE	Batwa Forest Experience
BNDES	Brazil's National Economic and Social Bank
CADA	Commodity Apex Development Association (Nigeria)
CADFund	China-Africa Development Fund
CAF	Latin American Bank
CAFER	Centre for Support to Women and Rural People
CAR	Bahia Development and Regional Action Company (Brazil)
CASP	Climate Change Adaptation and Agribusiness Support Programme (Nigeria)
CASS	Chinese Academy of Social Sciences
CAU	China Agricultural University
CBARDP	Community Based Agricultural Rural Development Programme (Nigeria)
CDA	Community Development Association
CDD	Community driven development
CDSP IV	Char Development and Settlement Project – Phase IV (Bangladesh)
CIF	Community Investment Fund
CIPO	Cambodia Indigenous People Organization
CLEAR	Center for Learning on Evaluation and Results
COM	Communications Division
COOPERCUC	Cooperativa Agropecuária Familiar de Canudos, Uauá e Curaçá (Brazil)
COP	Conference of Parties
COSOP	Country Strategic Opportunities Paper
COSTAB	
CPE	Country Programme Evaluation
CPEC	Caisse populaire d'épargne et de crédit (Djibouti)
CPIA	Country Policy and Institutional Assessment (World Bank)
CPM	Country programme manager
CPMP	Community Pasture Management Plan
CPMT	Country Programme Management Team
CSB	network of credit and savings banks (Djibouti)
CSN	Country Strategy Note
CSRA	Surul Centre for Services in Rural Area (India)
DDP	Drylands Development Programme
DEF	Development Effectiveness Framework
DPSIP	Disaster preparedness strategic investment program (Ethiopia)
DSF	Debt sustainability framework
EB	Executive Board
ECD	Environment and Climate Division
ECPRPNS	Environment Conservation and Poverty Reduction Programme in Ningxia and

	Shanxi (China)
EGDF	Ethnic Groups Development Framework
EMC	Executive Management Committee
ENRM	Environment and Natural Resource Management
ESA	East and Southern Africa Division
ESMF	Environmental and Social Management Framework
FADES	Fonds arabe de développement économique et social (Mauritania)
FAO	Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations
FECC	Foreign Economic Cooperation Center (China)
FIMI	International Indigenous Women's Forum
FNML	Southern Laos Food And Nutrition Security And Market Linkages Programme (Lao PDR)
FOD	Financial Operations Department
FPIC	Free, prior and informed consent
FSU	Field support unit
GALS	Gender Action and Learning System
GAP	Southeastern Anatolia Project (Turkey)
GCF	Global Climate Fund
GDF	General Directorate of Agrarian Reform (Turkey)
GEF	Global Environmental Facility
GIZ	German Corporation for International Cooperation
GKS	Global Engagement, Knowledge and Strategy Division
GLF	Grant life file
GoB	Government of Bangladesh
GOE	Government of Ethiopia
GRIPS	Grants and Investment Projects System
GTWDP	Goksu-Taseli Watershed Development Project (Turkey)
HCA	Host Country Agreement
HH	Households
HQ	Headquarters
HRD	Human Resources Division
HTDN	How to do note
ICO	IFAD Country Office
ICT	Information and communication technology
IGA	Income-generating activities
ILC	International Land Coalition
ILRI	International Livestock Research Institute
IOE	Independent office of evaluation of IFAD
IP	Indigenous Peoples
IPAF	Indigenous Peoples Assistance Facility
IPC	International Policy Centre for Inclusive Growth
IPO	Indigenous Peoples' Organization
IPPF	Indigenous Peoples Planning Framework
IPRCC	International Poverty Reduction Center in China
IPS	Inter Press Service Agency from Rome
IPSSDD	Indigenous Peoples' Sustainable and Self-Determined Development
IT	Information Technology
ITFC	Institute of Tropical Forest Conservation
IVI	IFAD Vulnerability Index
IWGIA	International Work Group on Indigenous Affairs
JCTDP	Jharkhand-Chhattisgarh Tribal Development Programme (India)
JES	Joint Evaluation Synthesis
JSIR	Joint Supervision and Implementation Review
JTELP	Jharkhand Tribal Empowerment and Livelihoods Project (India)
KM	Knowledge Management
LAC	Latin America and Caribbean division
LDP	Northern Region Sustainable Livelihoods through Livestock Development

	Project (Lao PDR)
LGA	Local Government Authority (Nigeria)
LGED	Local Government Engineering Department
LGOP	Leading Group Office on Poverty Alleviation and Development (China)
LMDP I & II	Programme Livestock and Market Development Programme I & II
LR	Learning Routes
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation
MANIP	Mongolian Association of Native and indigenous People
MFI	Monetary Financial Institution
MFS	Micro-finance Sector
MFWA	Ministry of Forestry and Water Affairs (Turkey)
MGNREGA	Mahatma Gandhi National Rural Employment Guarantee Act
MGP	Matching Grant Programme
MIC	Middle income countries
MICO	Oases Investment and Credit Association (Mauritania)
MOA	Ministry of Agriculture (China)
MoD	Ministry of Development (Turkey)
MOF	Ministry of Finance (China)
MoFAL	Ministry of Food, Agriculture and Livestock (Turkey)
MoU	Memorandum of Understanding
MRWRP	Murat River Watershed Rehabilitation Project
MSD	Ministry of Social Development (Brazil)
MTR	Mid-Term Review
NEN	Near East, North Africa and Europe division
NRM	Natural Resource Management
NSLCP	Northern Smallholder Livestock Commercialization Project (Lao PDR)
NSLCP-RFSP	Northern Smallholder Livestock Commercialization Project – Financial Services Programme (Lao PDR)
NSO	Network Support Organizations
O&M	Operation and Maintenance
OMC	Operations management committee
OPE	Operational Programming and Effectiveness Unit
OPELIP	Odisha Particularly Vulnerable Tribal Groups Empowerment and Livelihood (India)
OSECCPA	
PBAS	Performance based allocation system
P4D	Pastoralist driven data management system project
PAA	Food Procurement Programme (Programa de Aquisição de Alimentos) (Brazil)
PACE	Promoting Agricultural Commercialization and Enterprises
PAD	Performance and Disbursement Variable (for PBAS)
PAD	project appraisal document
PAF	Poverty Alleviation Fund Project (Nepal)
PASK II	Projet de lutte contre la pauvreté dans l'Aftout Sud et le Karakoro Phase II (Mauritania)
PCDP II & III	Pastoral Community Development Project II & III
PCR	Project Completion Report
PDDO	Programme de Développement Durable des Oasis (Mauritania)
PDMM	Projet de développement du microfinancement et de la microentreprise (Djibouti)
PIM	Project Implementation Manual
PKH	Pastoral Knowledge Hub
PKSF	Palli Karma-Sahayak Foundation
PLIMP	Pasture and Livestock Improvement Project (Kyrgyz Republic)
PMD	Programme Management Department

PMU	Programme Management Unit
PNAE	National School Lunch Programme (Programa Nacional da Merenda Escolar) (Brazil)
PPP	Potential Problem Project
PRAREV	Programme d'appui à la réduction de la vulnérabilité dans les zones de pêches côtières
PRM	Resource Mobilization and Partnership Office
PRODEFI	Projet de Développement de Filières Inclusives (Mauritania)
PRONAF	National Programme for the Strengthening of Family Agriculture (Brazil)
PRT	Portfolio Review Team
PSR	Project Status Report
PTA	IFAD Technical Advisory Division
PUU	Pasture Users Union
QA	Quality Assurance
QE	Quality enhancement
RBA	Rome-Based Agency
RBM	Résau Billital Maroobe
RIA	Research and Impact Assessment Division
RIMS	Results and impact management system
RLIP	Rural Livelihoods Improvement Programme in Attapeu and Sayabouri (Lao PDR)
RMF	Results measurement framework
RSP	Rural Sector Performance
SACP	Smallholders Agriculture Competitiveness Programme
SECAP	Social, Environmental and Climate Assessment Procedures
SETAF	Territorial Service for Family Farming (Brazil PPA)
SF	Strategic Framework
SIPs	Strategic Investment Plans
SIS	Supervision and implementation support
SKD	Strategy and Knowledge Department
SLMP	Sustainable land management flagship programme (Ethiopia)
SLPMG	Smallholder livestock production and marketing groups
SSC	South-South Cooperation
SSTC	South-South Triangular Cooperation
TCI	FAO Investment Centre
TOR	Terms of Reference
UCRT	Ujamaa Community Resource Trust
UN	United Nations
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNDRIP	United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples
UNFCC	United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change
UNGC	United Nations Global Compact
UNMICO	Union nationale des mutuelles d'investissement et de crédit oasien (Mauritania)
URDP	Uplands Rural Development Programme (Turkey)
UWA	Uganda Wildlife Authority
VAC	Village Administration Committee (Lao PDR)
VCDP	Value Chain Development Programme
WB	World Bank
WCA	West and Central Africa division
WFP	World Food Programme
WGG	Working Group on Governance

Categories used for the classification of actions/ recommendations

SN Serial Number

Type of evaluation

CLE Corporate Level Evaluation
 CPE Country Programme Evaluation
 PPA Project Performance Assessment
 IE Interim Evaluation

Level

IFAD IFAD Corporate Level
 REG IFAD Regional Level
 CTRY IFAD Country Level
 GOV Government Authorities (national, local level and institutions)
 PROJ Project

Nature

PLCY Policy
 STR Strategy Development, including COSOPs and Projects
 OPER Operational and Implementation

Themes

ALL Allocations
 ASR Analysis, studies and researches
 BEN Beneficiaries and stakeholders' participation and consultation
 COS Country Strategic Opportunities Programme (COSOP), also including country strategy
 DEC Decentralization
 DES Project design
 DIA Policy dialogue
 EFF Efficiency
 GDR Gender (including targeting to women)
 GOV Governance
 GRT Grants/ grants financing policy
 HR Human resources (management, recruitment)
 ICT Information and communication technology
 INF Infrastructure (construction, contracting, management, supervision)
 INN Innovation
 KM Knowledge management
 NRM Natural resource management and environment
 ORG Organizations, groups, institutions and collective approaches
 PAR Partnership
 PRM Private sector, market and enterprise development, value chains
 PMA Project management and administration (incl. financial management)
 REPL Replenishment
 RFI Rural finance
 RME Results monitoring, evaluation
 SCA Replication and scaling up
 SOU South-south and triangular cooperation
 STRA Strategy
 SUP Supervision and implementation support
 SUS Sustainability
 TCB Training, capacity-building
 TGT Targeting

Corporate Level Evaluation: PBAS (April 2016)

Corporate level evaluation: PBAS (April 2016)								
Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme		Recommendation	2017 Follow Up	Status
CLE	1	IFAD	PLCY	ALL		Enhance the PBAS's design. IFAD Management should propose necessary enhancements to the PBAS design for approval by the Executive Board. In doing so, specific attention should be devoted to: (a) Strengthening the rural poverty focus of the country needs component of the formula, in particular by assessing how measures of vulnerability and fragility, income inequality and non-income poverty can be included;	IFAD has enhanced the PBAS rural poverty focus through the inclusion of the IFAD Vulnerability Index (IVI) in the needs component of the formula. The IVI is made of a set of twelve indicators that reflect countries' vulnerability, inequality, food security and nutrition situation.	F
CLE	2	IFAD	PLCY	ALL		(b) Further sharpening the PBAS objectives and overall specifications, also ensuring that IFAD's core mandate of promoting food production and food security is adequately reflected;	The proposed changes to the PBAS formula are aligned with IFAD's Strategic Framework 2016-2025, as this reflects the priority areas for IFAD's work as determined by its Member States.	F
CLE	3	IFAD	PLCY	ALL		(c) Refining the RSP variable by revisiting the underlying indicators and questions; and	The RSP questionnaire has been revised in two ways: i) by incorporating the macro-level questions formerly in the CPIA, which is no longer part of the formula; and ii) through the review of the questionnaire in order to better align it with IFAD's mandate and current priority areas. Guidance on the indicators related to each question has been provided.	F
CLE	4	IFAD	PLCY	ALL		(d) Reassessing the balance between the country needs and country performance components of the PBAS formula.	While the finalisation of the PBAS formula is ongoing, all scenarios proposed by Management show an increased balance between the needs and performance components of the formula.	F
CLE	5	IFAD	PLCY	ALL		Streamlining processes for better effectiveness. Given the unavailability of the CPIA score for numerous countries, Management and the Board should reflect on whether to retain the CPIA variable in the country performance component of the PBAS formula.	The inclusion of the CPIA in the PBAS formula has been discontinued and its relevant elements have been included in the revised RSP.	F
CLE	6	IFAD	OPER	ALL		With regard to the RSP, due attention should be devoted to systematising and strengthening the RSP scoring and quality assurance processes and viewing them as an opportunity to strengthen partnerships at the national level, knowledge management, and policy dialogue.	As mentioned above, the RSP questionnaire has been revised and guidance on the indicators related to each question has been provided. In addition, Management is developing a quality assurance system that will facilitate ratings standardisation across divisions. The enhanced RSP ratings will offer robust analytics for the formulation of IFAD country strategies, and providing an input for conducting more evidence-based country level policy	O
CLE	7	IFAD	OPER	ALL		Moreover, ways should be explored to capture IFAD's	Management has proposed to substitute the current	NAG

Corporate level evaluation: PBAS (April 2016)							
Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	2017 Follow Up	Status
					performance at the country programme level, beyond the PAR.	PAR with a performance and disbursement (PAD) variable. Similarly to the PAR, the PAD builds on the number of projects at risk in any given country and to it a disbursement dimension. The PAD diverges from the current methodology in three aspects: (i) it excludes potential problem projects (PPPs) from the calculation; (ii) it includes a measure of disbursement performance at the portfolio level, so that a low disbursement rate will result in a lower PAR value; and (iii) it takes into account the age of individual projects in the portfolio, as we know that the pace of disbursement of younger projects is slower, and that it increases as projects age. PPPs are excluded so as not to penalize early identification of potential challenges and to incentivize mobilization of additional operational support before projects become an actual risk. The inclusion of a disbursement measure underlines the ability to disburse resources promptly and efficiently, to finance project implementation, as a predictor of project success. Thus the PAR rating for portfolios that lag behind in disbursing their financing will be reduced. In doing this, the age of the portfolio will be taken into consideration. The proposed methodology ensures objectivity in the calculation process, as it is based on a formula. In line with the current methodology, the three-year PAR average will be used in the PBAS formula to reduce volatility in year-on-year allocations.	
CLE	8	IFAD	PLCY	ALL	Improving efficiency. Based on a more robust and participatory process, it is recommended that the RSP score be done less frequently, rather than annually as is current practice.	Starting in IFAD10, RSP scores are done once per replenishment cycle.	F
CLE	9	IFAD	PLCY	ALL	Moreover, specific measures should be introduced to formally collect feedback on the proposed RSP and PAR scores from in country authorities, before the scores are confirmed and fed into the PBAS.	RSP: Management will collect in-country authority feedback on the RSP assessment as part of the QA process. PAR: As the PAR is an internally calculated indicator and as per best practices amongst other organizations, Management does not agree to formally collect in country feedback before finalizing the rating	NAG
CLE	10	IFAD	PLCY	ALL	Reallocations should be formally done earlier in any three year allocation cycle than the current practice.	Management is developing a methodology to formally reallocate resources earlier in the cycle, to be tested during IFAD10.	O
CLE	11	IFAD	PLCY	ALL	And finally, efforts need are needed to ensure a better spread of the total annual commitments across the three years of any allocation cycle. This will require	Undertaking reallocations earlier in the cycle, as per the response above, will facilitate the spread of commitments across the three years as per this	O

Corporate level evaluation: PBAS (April 2016)							
Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	2017 Follow Up	Status
					tightening forward planning processes, in particular by ensuring better linkages among project pipeline development, country allocations and administrative budget earmarking.	recommendation.	
CLE	12	IFAD	PLCY	ALL	Management and Governance. IFAD should take a more corporate approach to the PBAS in general. In this regard, one measure is to establish a standing inter-departmental committee on the PBAS, inter alia, to discuss RSP scores, the list of countries to be capped, reallocations and lessons in implementation of the PBAS. This committee would make recommendations to the Executive Management Committee for any adjustments deemed necessary.	For the sake of efficiency and appropriate mainstreaming of PBAS decision-making into corporate decision-making processes, Management has committed to seeking guidance more systematically on PBAS from the two existing interdepartmental bodies in IFAD, i.e., the Operational Management Committee (OMC) and the EMC. Both bodies have full interdepartmental representation and decision-making authority, and have cleared all Management proposals for changes to the PBAS proposed in the course of 2016-2017, prior to presentation to the EB.	NAG
CLE	13	IFAD	PLCY	ALL	Moreover, to enhance the transparency of the system, progress reports should be more comprehensive and should include information on reallocations, capping and any strategic and systemic issues warranting guidance from the Board.	Starting in 2016, Management reports to the EB on the PBAS have been enriched with additional information regarding minimum and maximum allocations, capping, the inclusion of new countries after the start of the cycle, and other methodological issues.	F
CLE	14	IFAD	PLCY	ALL	Generating learning. Implementation of the system should receive more explicit monitoring and should generate continuous learning and cross-fertilization of experiences across CPMs, regional divisions and countries.	Explicit and systematic monitoring of the system is undertaken by Management through the yearly allocation exercise, the process of reallocation, and the regular pipeline monitoring. As regards learning, the technical working group on PBAS established to review the PBAS following the CLE has been instrumental to furthering IFAD staff knowledge and learning on PBAS. Moreover, in December 2016 Management organized the first learning event on PBAS for IFAD staff. Once the review process has been completed, Management will develop a PBAS manual for internal and external dissemination to enhance transparency in and knowledge of PBAS allocations and the management process. Additionally as part of IFAD Operations Academy, staff will receive further sensitization to the PBAS.	F
CLE	15	IFAD	PLCY	ALL	A consolidated review or evaluation of the PBAS should be planned for six years after the revised PBAS design document is adopted by the Board, and the introduction of a periodic review process should also be considered.	This recommendation may be addressed to IOE.	NA

Evaluation Synthesis Report: Non-Lending Activities in the Context of South-South Cooperation

Evaluation Synthesis Report: Non-Lending Activities in the Context of South-South Cooperation								
Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme		Recommendation	2017 Follow Up	Status
					Recommendation 1: Provide conceptual clarity and practical guidance at corporate level for IFAD's support to SSC.			
ESR	1	IFAD	STR	SOU		A short document should be developed to clarify objectives, financing, operational pathways and staff incentives for integrating SSC, focused on knowledge-sharing in IFAD country programmes, and with a differentiated approach (possibly reflecting the three-tier approach described in section III.C). The document should also clarify what is considered to be SSC in the IFAD context and which support options the Fund will offer. Such clarification would be helpful given the strong push from Member States to do more on SSC and the varying expectations of those Member States.	In 2016 GKS prepared and received the Executive Board's endorsement of a new corporate approach for South-South and Triangular Cooperation (SSTC). The document articulated the various definitions of SSTC, how they relate to IFAD's mandate and comparative advantage, and how the new approach is aligned to IFAD's 2016-2025 Strategic Framework and also spelled specific domains of activity	F
ESR	2	IFAD	STR	SOU		Since SSC is not an end in itself, based on its comparative advantage it is vital for IFAD to articulate what sort of SSC can enhance the impact of its portfolio and contribute to its mandate, and which areas are less important, or should even be avoided. This is also important in order to clarify the types of SSC support that should be reported on.	The new corporate approach articulates two domains of activity for IFAD: technical cooperation and investment promotion. For each domain, a variety of instruments and activities were also identified that would be of focus and interest to the Fund over the near-term.	F
					Recommendation 2: Better mainstream SSC into country programming through a structured approach.			
ESR	3	IFAD	STR	SOU		This may involve more systematic and proactive assessments of countries' interest in sharing knowledge, as well as exchanging with and learning from others regarding	Beginning in 2016, GKS began organizing support missions to provide SSTC technical assistance to IFAD country programme managers designing	O

						solutions to common development challenges in the context of country programmes.	new COSOPs. Two pilot missions (India and Indonesia) were undertaken in 2016. Four missions (Mozambique, Armenia, Dominican Republic and Benin) will be undertaken in 2017.	
ESR	4	IFAD	OPER	TCB		Such efforts should be accompanied by staff capacity building to enhance their understanding of SSC and approaches to mainstreaming SSC.	A specific capacity building program has not yet been developed. However, under the IFAD Operations Academy training on SSC for IFAD staff is planned.	O
ESR	5	IFAD	STR	SOU		For instance, COSOPs might identify key areas of demand by the respective countries for South-South learning, and potential Southern partners that may be able to share relevant experience and knowledge. This identification process could cut across different aspects of COSOPs, from key thematic areas covered in strategic objectives, to the policy agenda, to an indicative pipeline of projects. Investment projects could consider opportunities for mutual learning from the design stage, while leaving room for needs that may emerge during implementation.	As noted in response to ESR 3, COSOP support missions are being undertaken to scope and identify opportunities, lessons learned, and gaps in order to embed SSTC activities at the programmatic and project-level in a manner that aligns with each country's respective needs and interests. Furthermore, IFAD has a corporate commitment to ensure that SSC is embedded in 50% of new COSOPs.	O
ESR	6	IFAD	STR	SOU		South-South exchange, which may be supported through regional and global grants, can be linked to the country-level policy engagement agenda.	GKS is in continuous contact with the IFAD divisions in order to contribute to regional and global grants, which include SSTC components, on an ad hoc basis. Moreover, the SSTC and Global Engagement teams are working together to find synergies between the respective work programs.	O
ESR	7	IFAD	OPER	SOU		IFAD might reflect on guidance for mainstreaming a cross-cutting theme (for example, gender) within institutional processes, which emphasizes the importance of "drivers" such as organizational culture/leadership, human resources capacity/training, staff incentives, dedicated financial resources, as well as organizational standard setting and reporting procedures.	The paper IFAD's Approach to South-South Cooperation includes an entire section dedicated to mainstreaming the approach, including incentives, financial resources, and organizational infrastructure (such as monitoring and reporting).	F
ESR	8	IFAD	OPER	SOU		In this connection, IFAD may explore possibilities for allocating funds to create conditions for mainstreaming SSC. Funding may be used, for example, during the project design stage to assess the	In 2017, and as outlined in the corporate approach to SSTC, GKS is preparing a SSTC Fund Mechanism concept note which will outline the need for a pool of supplementary, in-kind and staffing	O

						knowledge needs that other Southern countries could respond to. Linking South-South knowledge-sharing with investments and concrete actions or policy engagement does not necessarily require substantial resources. What counts is the flexibility and timeliness of financing.	resources which IFAD could use to fund SSTC activities at the corporate level as well as to provide incentives for mainstreaming SSTC activities into the Fund's portfolio.	
ESR	9	IFAD	OPER	RME		IFAD should also track and monitor SSC activities and initiatives in grants and investment projects more systematically and with a stronger results orientation.	In 2017, IFAD will prepare and launch IFAD's first-ever SSTC flagship report which will provide both a quantitative and qualitative stock-taking of IFAD's SSTC activities to date. The report will serve as a first step in developing a database and methodology for monitoring and reporting on IFAD's SSTC activities.	O
ESR	10	IFAD	STR	SOU		Such information could be fed into the Secretary-General's annual report on SSC in the United Nations System (expected in the second half of 2016), where IFAD support to SSC will become visible.	GKS is in regular contact with the UN Office for South-South Cooperation and will provide inputs into its annual publications in order to contribute to efforts to report on SSTC activities at the pan-UN level.	O
					Recommendation 3: Systematically build up a catalogue of rural development solutions and provide a platform to make them accessible			
ESR	11	IFAD	OPER	KM		IFAD's role as a rural knowledge broker can be strengthened by enhancing the quality, quantity and accessibility of the knowledge it offers, in particular based on the wealth of experiences and solutions generated from Southern partners of IFAD financed investment projects. This requires a solid operational framework, as well as enhanced staff capacity, for capturing, validating, packaging and making knowledge available in ways that ensure quality, relevance and adaptability. The catalogue should be a "living" repository, updated and enriched regularly, and can build upon ongoing knowledge management efforts by PMD.	In 2016, GKS submitted and received approval for a proposal to use Capital Budget funding to create an online web platform for promoting and sharing rural development solutions. In 2017, GKS is leading the internal team tasked with developing the web platform as well as creating a mechanism for identifying and vetting rural development solutions drawn both from IFAD's portfolio as well as the portfolio of various partners.	O
ESR	12	IFAD	STR	SOU		Identification and validation of knowledge might also be accelerated by closer collaboration with Southern providers	In 2017, GKS is developing a grant concept to identify and validate rural development solutions emerging from	O

					(including MIC development agencies, ministries of agriculture and grassroots organizations) through grants, and on-sistent mapping within investment projects.	the South with a particular focus on ICT. The grant concept will be open for awarded on a competitive basis with selection criteria that benefit from close collaboration and partnerships with institutions from the global south.		
					Recommendation 4: Give consideration to greater in-house coordination arrangements and inter-divisional collaboration			
ESR	13	IFAD	OPER	SOU		Currently SKD is mandated to promote the SSC agenda in collaboration with PMD. PRM also has a role to play in terms of resource mobilization to support SSC mainstreaming, particularly through COSOPs. Given that PMD is the key player in mainstreaming SSC into country programmes and capturing knowledge from the field, consideration should be given to how SKD and PRM could best support such efforts.	In 2017, GKS launched a new coordination mechanism at IFAD called the "inter-departmental working group on SSTC". The body has representatives from each regional division as well as PMD front office, PRM, COM and ICT. The working group meets every six weeks and discusses topics both at the corporate and regional level.	F
					Recommendation 5: Continue pursuing opportunities for collaboration with the RBAs in a practical manner at corporate and country levels.			
ESR	14	IFAD	STR	PAR		Continued interaction with FAO and WFP focal points for SSC could focus on quick wins, for instance through joint staff training, in-country pilots to capture knowledge, and information sharing on strategic and operational approaches.	RBA collaboration is a key pillar of IFAD's new corporate approach to SSTC. Given this, in 2017, GKS/PMD Front Office and FAO are developing a partnership to make use of \$50 Chinese trust fund administered by FAO to fund design and implementation support activities in IFAD projects.	F

Evaluation Synthesis Report: Environment and Natural Resource Management

Evaluation Synthesis Report: Environment and Natural Resource Management								
Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	2017 Follow Up	Status	
					Recommendation 1. IFAD should explore options to continue and broaden the use of grant finance to boost the integration of ENRM, not just climate change adaptation, into its future operations.			
ESR	1	IFAD	STR	GRT	Although, there is undoubtedly some understatement as indicated above, the data on ENRM funding appears to be quite low in the context of IFAD's ENRM policy commitment and its efforts to mainstream ENRM into its investment portfolio. Without ASAP the level of funding looks even lower. Also, GEF funding plays a large role in relative terms, certainly in the adaptation arena. In fact, ASAP and GEF combined are almost equivalent to ENRM lending over the period 2010-2015. There is significant value in IFAD's continuing efforts to mainstream ENRM. However, if IFAD is really to implement the goal of "sustainable intensification", it needs a means to generate substantial incentives, preferably financial, within the organization to make this happen. While there are disadvantages to relying on supplementary funding instruments, there is clearly an imbalance at present, leaving the challenge of mainstreaming ENRM effectively under resourced. IFAD should therefore pursue options for grant finance to galvanize efforts to balance the incentives already in place to tackle adaption and global environmental issues by supporting the innovative approaches to improving poor farmers' livelihoods through sustainable management and use	IFAD intends to strengthen its effort to mainstream ENRM. There is an internal discussion within PMD on how to strengthen mainstreaming of Environmental sustainability during IFAD11. 15 IFAD grants with ENRM components and 5 ASAP projects have been approved. There were 3 new GEF IAP projects (Kenya, Swaziland and Niger) endorsed. IFAD is actively participating in the GEF& replenishment process and some relevant priority areas for IFAD are related to sustainable food systems, land degradation and ecosystem management. On Climate, a mainstreaming paper was submitted for review to the Board in September 2016, and modified to reflect the comments received for the December Board in 2016. The first phase of ASAP will be closing in September 2017 thus a new Trust Fund for ASAP 2 was approved by the Board in December 2016. The aim is to finance technical assistance to IFAD investments whereas climate change adaptation activities will be financed by the loan. IFAD was accredited to GCF in October 2016 and has already started to build its portfolio.	F	

						of natural resources. This is IFAD's comparative advantage. (Para 206-209, 212, 215).		
					Recommendation 2. IFAD should strengthen its efforts to foster demand for greater integration of ENRM at the country level.			
ESR	2	IFAD	STR	BEN		To complement the policy direction and the financial and technical resources that IFAD can provide for ENRM, there is significant scope for addressing demand at the country level for more ENRM integration. While recognizing that IFAD has recently adopted a specific focus on better treatment of ENRM during COSOP preparation, the value of strong engagement with country level sector planning processes, building on their policy and strategy initiatives, and engaging with a wider set of partners at government and non-government levels is essential if agriculture sector strategies are to embody an "evergreen revolution" approach to which IFAD is committed. A good number of recent CPEs make this recommendation. The demand from some countries for ENRM interventions is constrained by traditional approaches to the agriculture and natural resources sectors and poor coordination among different government agencies when developing sector strategies and especially budget allocations through conventional government processes. IFAD, in its specialized role, can help to shape agriculture sector strategy, building on existing strengths, and promote greater coordination between government bodies to ensure an improved level of priority for ENRM issues.	Through SECAP, which entered into force in January 2015, IFAD is mainstreaming environment and climate from the early stage of COSOPs planning and project design. After the lessons learned during the last two years of implementation and taking into account new requirements from the international community, the procedures are being updated for finalization late 2017. Governments are more aware of the importance of environmental sustainability and natural resource management to guarantee the success of the operations in the sector and increase production. In particular, land and water resources management for multiple uses for poor communities is now a concern for many IFAD partners and solutions are starting to be incorporated in project designs. Even though there are now some good examples, more needs to be done in improving IFAD projects support for wider ENRM in catchments to protect soil and the water source when investing in infrastructures for increasing access to water (irrigation, rainwater harvesting facilities, wells and ponds). Two How-to-do notes, one on watershed management and one on irrigation, are under preparation and both will contribute to demonstrate concrete solutions to addressing this issue and the importance of cross sector and multi stakeholder engagement for success of landscape	O

							level ENRM conserving ecosystem services, sustaining rural livelihoods and promoting sustainable agriculture production.	
ESR	3	IFAD	STR	COS		Clearly, the most feasible entry point is COSOP preparation, but IFAD can play an important role in following up commitments in the COSOP through support to partners to ensure mainstreaming of an ENRM focus, especially for the rural poor living in difficult environmental conditions. (Para 204, 211).	As mentioned above through SECAP, IFAD is mainstreaming environment and climate from the early stage of COSOPs planning and project design.	F
					Recommendation 3. IFAD should enhance its focus on the contribution of ENRM activities to poverty reduction.			
ESR	4	IFAD	STR	DIA		IFAD's ultimate goal is to improve the livelihoods and wellbeing of the rural poor. The investment in sustainable agriculture production and natural resources management is designed to contribute to livelihoods enhancement and poverty reduction for the rural poor, especially the smallholder farmer, as well as to improve sustainability overall. IFAD's ENRM agenda is a key element of this mission. IFAD should increase its, and its country partners', understanding of how ENRM interventions contribute to poverty reduction and upgrade its knowledge management and communication strategy for this issue. This is important both for enhancing the incentives for integrating ENRM within the organization as well as shaping policy and strategy at the country level. This can be especially powerful in promoting a "mainstream" value for ENRM among decision makers dealing with budgets and setting priorities for investment.	IFAD is continuing to advocate ENRM importance in poverty reduction in international fora. In 2016, IFAD participated the UNFCCC COP22 in Marrakesh and in the Convention on Biological Diversity COP13 in Cancun. IFAD is also an active member of the UN Environment Management Group, and through it, UN agencies are discussing how to promote the implementation of Agenda 2030, from the environmental sustainability dimension.	O
ESR	5	IFAD	OPER	KM		Among the options for action are knowledge products designed to "make the case" for better integration of ENRM in the agricultural sector and guidance	Communication and knowledge products have been published. Advantage series: The Economic Advantage, the Drylands Advantage,	F

					materials on how to estimate the value of natural resources assets for the livelihoods and incomes of poor farmers. (Para 217, 218).	the Biodiversity Advantage, How to-do-Note: Conservation Agriculture in sub-Saharan Africa. IFAD has produced a web tv series of "Recipes for Change". The World Environment Day was celebrated with a climate change lecture and announcement of the last Recipe for change. IFAD also offers regular outreach seminars to international organisations and IFAD as well as Climate cinemas. Four safeguards webinars have been developed and four SECAP awareness training events have been held (88 IFAD staff at regional learning events, 87 IFAD staff attended PMD learning days). SECAP e-learning was launched in April 2016 and 27 people registered. There have been 4 workshops introducing the GEF Integrated Approach for Food Security in Sub-Saharan Africa. Further, IFAD has conducted climate change trainings in collaboration with the Red Cross using climate games in start-up workshops.	
					Recommendation 4. IFAD should enhance its data management and monitoring of ENRM projects.		
ESR	6	IFAD	OPER	RME	Despite corporate initiatives to strengthen the integration of ENRM, it is disappointing that the ENRM impact domain ratings remain low. Addressing this requires better data. First, IFAD is currently unable to account accurately for the level of investment in ENRM projects. This is despite an increasing emphasis on this domain in the SF and the Replenishment process. IFAD should take measures to track ENRM investments better, taking account of the nature of much of IFAD's ENRM focus, especially ENRM activities that are part of integrated packages of measures aiming at improved livelihoods. This implies a focus on how IFAD project	An analysis of the ENRM tracking and how to improve ENRM tracking in the project portfolio shows that there is a need to categorize project activities. Even at early design phase in the Project Design Report and also in the COSTAB it would be valid to incorporate some categories for ENRM activities in order to monitor and track investments in this field. There have been some initiatives to respond to this issue. There are for example Environment and Social classification as well as a climate change classification in GRIPS. IFAD is currently developing a tracking system for the SECAP,	O

						fund allocations are classified and tracked to ensure that ENRM interventions can be monitored.	including its studies, to enable closer monitoring and respond to environmental and climate change challenges arising in the project cycle.	
ESR	7	IFAD	OPER	RME		Second, in terms of measuring, monitoring, and indeed evaluating ENRM performance and in order to better understand the causes of weak performance, it will be important to get a better grasp of what can be understood to be specific to this type of projects and how the results of ENRM projects are best measured and monitored. It should be noted that IFAD is currently strengthening its Result Impact and Measurement framework to integrate environmental sustainability and climate resilience indicators and more can be done to enhance the monitoring of ENRM activities through this initiative. In doing so, focus should be on providing more data on direct environmental benefits but equally on indirect benefits that arise from diversification of production or adoption of more sustainable options which have contributed to better use of natural resources thereby to better livelihoods of farmers. Given that many of the more innovative ENRM projects depend on a package of measures, including ENRM, combined to bring about improvements income and livelihoods, it is important to monitor and evaluate the results with an integrated approach rather than with a traditional perspective that separates income, social, institutional, productivity criteria from ENRM. Good use of results frameworks that reflect the important contribution of ENRM activities to poverty alleviation is needed. Such an approach might require the use of indicators of how better natural resources management measures contribute to income and livelihoods or to reduced pressure on the resource base. (Para 208, 213, 218, 220).	The RIMS revision has included more robust ENRM indicators and the document was approved in December 2016. RIA is analysing in collaboration with other divisions like ECD, what kind of categorization can be used to track ENRM in order to monitor and evaluate climate change adaptation and environmentally sustainable activities. SKD is conducting an impact assessment including ENRM projects and how they contribute to sustainable livelihoods.	F

Evaluation Synthesis Report: IFAD's Engagement with Indigenous Peoples

Evaluation Synthesis Report: IFAD's Engagement with Indigenous Peoples								
Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme		Recommendation	2017 Follow Up	Status
					Recommendation 1: Revisit the main objectives and strategies of IPAF.			
ESR	1	IFAD	OPER	ORG		The key, and not mutually exclusive, contributions and roles of IPAF could be: (i) finance small projects designed and implemented by indigenous peoples' communities to promote indigenous peoples' well-being and empowerment; and	(i) The small projects approved under the IPAF 2015 cycle are being implemented by indigenous peoples' communities and their organizations in 23 countries, with the support of IPAF co-managers at the regional level. The main intervention areas of the projects include the support to processing and commercialization of indigenous products (e.g. in Botswana, Democratic Republic of Congo, Ecuador, Ethiopia, Malaysia, Nicaragua, Paraguay) with a focus on women economic empowerment (Morocco); the promotion and preservation of traditional crops (e.g. in Bangladesh and Mexico) and access to and use of natural resources, with a particular emphasis on land (e.g. in Cambodia, Cameroon, Philippines, Tanzania, Thailand).	O
ESR	2	IFAD	OPER	PAR		(ii) identify potential credible partners for IFAD or country programmes;	(ii) Through the IPAF, organizations such as the Cambodia Indigenous Peoples Organization (CIPO), have been identified as credible partners who have supported the organization of the regional consultation in preparation of the third global meeting of the Indigenous Peoples Forum at IFAD. CIPO has subsequently supported the country programme in Cambodia (for the very first time working directly with an indigenous peoples organization) in designing a tailored strategy with indigenous peoples' communities in the	F

						ongoing Agriculture Services Programme for Innovation Resilience and Extension project (ASPIRE) with the support of a technical specialist on indigenous peoples. Surul Centre for Services in Rural Area (CSRA) in India: supervision mission of this IPAF funded project was undertaken jointly with the staff of the “Jharkhand Tribal Empowerment and Livelihoods Project” (JTELP). PTA Senior Technical Specialist on IPs will follow up during the supervision mission with JTELP scheduled in May 2017. International Indigenous Women’s Forum (FIMI), the IPAF regional implementer in LAC, is currently supporting the project design in Guatemala. Supervision of the IPAF funded project in Guatemala was jointly undertaken with staff from IFAD Loan projects in the country. Coordination between FIMI and IFAD country managers in LAC is ongoing for joint supervision missions aimed at linking the small IPAF projects with the country portfolio in Colombia, Guatemala, Paraguay, Nicaragua, El Salvador, Ecuador y México. IPAF partner in Tanzania (UCRT), Uganda (ITFC), Cameroon (CAFER) and Rwanda (OSECOPA) would be key partners in country programmes in their respective countries.	
ESR	3	IFAD	STR	INN	(iii) promote innovations to be scaled up in investment projects;	(iii) Methodology of the IPAF being adopted in IFAD-funded demand driven projects, e.g. Brazil. The ongoing IPAF project in Tanzania implemented by Ujamaa Community Resource Team (UCRT) has an innovative approach to land and resources management and has potential for scaling up through the IFAD Country’s new Drylands Development Programme (DDP); discussions are underway on linking relevant components of the small IPAF project with this IFAD project. The same	F

							organization is an ILC partner, which in turn is implementing a grant from IFAD and linking the dots through the ICO. The project in Morocco focuses on building the capacity of indigenous women to utilize ICT to market indigenous products beneficial for food, health and the environment. This project has a high potential for developing a value chain for these products and to link with IFAD portfolio. The Batwa Forest Experience-BFE in Uganda is innovative in its governance and collaboration structure that enables the communities to stay connected to their cultural systems and beliefs, allows both partners (UWA and the Batwa) to collaborate on conservation of the forest and its wildlife using traditional and scientific knowledge and finally provides an economic empowerment component for the communities.	
ESR	4	IFAD	OPER	TCB		(iv) build capacity of regional indigenous peoples' organizations in project management and strengthen their networks. IPAF's strategy, instruments and operational modalities would need to be adjusted depending on which of these roles should receive the greatest attention.	(iv) Tebtebba: Managing the IPAF for Tebtebba has been an opportunity to link the global UN processes with the ground/grassroots level. Being connected to local communities allowed the organization to see how the gains achieved at the international level, like the adoption of the UNDRIP, translate in actions on the ground. At the same time, the direct engagement with local communities through IPAF is resulting in concrete operationalization of the Indigenous Peoples' Sustainable and Self-Determined Development (IPSSDD) which Tebtebba has been developing and it serves as framework for its projects. Kivulini Trust: The direct engagement and supervision of IPAF-funded projects by Kivulini Trust has enabled them to better understand and be more conversant with the challenges and aspirations of indigenous peoples in the region and how and what are	F

							<p>perspectives on development for grassroots organizations. The capacity gained from this experience has improved Kivulini's project design when engaging with indigenous peoples and improved the fundraising strategies. The IPAF has also raised Kivulini Trust's profile in the region. FIMI: one of the key indicators to measure the improvement in management capacity of FIMI as a regional partner is the trust of other donors. FIMI was entrusted with a project of USD 10 million by the Government of the Netherlands for a grant making process worldwide. The monitoring and evaluation system developed by FIMI for the IPAF is being applied to this new grant making programme they are implementing.</p>	
ESR	5	IFAD	PLCY	ORG		<p>If IFAD intends to continue supporting IPAF in the a medium term, opportunities for increasing and stabilizing funding for IPAF need to be explored, including the possibility of mobilizing supplementary financing through IFAD or catalysing direct contributions to IPAF regional partner organizations by other financiers.</p>	<p>Several organizations are joining hands in the next IPAF Cycle expected to be launched towards the end of the year, pending approval of a USD 2 Million grant from IFAD. The organizations who have expressed interest to support the IPAF are two US foundations, Christensen Fund and Tamalpaís. These two organizations wish to contribute resources for institutional support to the regional partners directly to them. In LAC, The Fondo para el Desarrollo de los Pueblos Indígenas en America Latina y el Caribe is interested to contribute to IPAF funded projects directly through the implementing partner FIMI. The International Work Group on Indigenous Affairs (IWGIA), one of IFAD's strategic partner in working with indigenous peoples, is interested to contribute to the IPAF 2017 through linking the grassroots organizations to the global level and covering the costs of their travels to global events. While in terms of resources the amounts may not be high, expected around USD 350,000, the partnership with the IPAF is highly</p>	O

							valuable. In order to increase resources for the IPAF with the support of the Partnership and Resource Mobilization Office (PRM), it is suggested that this is included among the priority areas for mobilizing supplementary funds within IFAD.	
					Recommendation 2: Pay greater attention to key project design elements and provide adequate implementation support (especially for investment projects), ensuring effective participation of indigenous peoples throughout, supported by a team member with an understanding of and skills in working with indigenous peoples' issues			
ESR	6	IFAD	OPER	DES		The key project design elements would include: Institutional analysis and measures to ensure sufficient implementation capacity, duly recognizing the time and resources required in project implementation and the need for flexibility.	Progress has been made in project design through the following actions: social assessment and institutional and governance assessment included in project design (e.g. Brazil, Lao PDR, Vietnam, Argentina); work with national agencies/ institutions which have a special mandate on IPs issues (e.g. Brazil, Philippines); trainings for project staff delivered by experts on ethnic groups' self -driven development, identity and socio-cultural characteristics of different indigenous peoples (e.g. Ecuador, Lao PDR, China); hiring of project staff with knowledge on IPs issues and local/district staff who have command of local/ethnic languages (e.g. Argentina, Guyana, Lao PDR, India); trainings to Programme beneficiaries are delivered in local ethnic languages (e.g. Lao PDR). One of the most important results in including experts in designing projects with indigenous peoples and linking them with country organizations has positioned IFAD as a facilitator in policy engagement and dialogue between	F

							indigenous peoples' country institutions and governments.	
ESR	7	IFAD	OPER	TGT		Targeting strategies and approaches in the design with: (i) sound sociocultural and vulnerability analysis of different social groups; and	i) Improved quality in project design through social assessments to gain in-depth understanding of indigenous peoples and their situation in the country and project areas. Examples: ARGENTINA (assessment of the governance and land tenure system, highlighting challenges faced by indigenous peoples in accessing their land); ECUADOR (social, economic and cultural characterization of the smallholder farmers in identified commodities based on ethnic diversity in the country, prepared by an indigenous consultant who was hired as part of the design team); INDIA (social assessment on tribal peoples, providing an in-depth analysis of the tribal peoples in Orissa).	F
ESR	8	IFAD	OPER	TGT		(ii) tailored and differentiated approaches to build on the culture, identity and knowledge of the indigenous peoples' communities.	ii) Tailored strategies and activities to support the empowerment of indigenous peoples are being systematically designed in projects, particularly in LAC, potential for improving in APR and Africa regions. Examples: PERU (co-financing of the "Planes de Vida" developed and managed by indigenous peoples' communities themselves); BOLIVIA (strengthening production units of traditional local organizations applying a participatory approach and recognizing the value of ancestral knowledge); Lao PDR and FIJI (production/marketing of traditional herbs and indigenous food/crops); INDIA (registration of intellectual property rights; securing land tenure rights for tribal people; giving priority to indigenous crops over the introduction of new crops); ECUADOR (differentiated strategy that applies to indigenous peoples in terms of financing); EL SALVADOR (project includes policy engagement with the	O

ESR	9	IFAD	OPER	GDR		Focus on gender issues in indigenous peoples' communities to tailor the design to their specific needs, priorities and potential.	government focusing on youth). "Economic empowerment of indigenous peoples, with a focus on women and youth", was the overall theme for the third global meeting of the Indigenous Peoples Forum at IFAD held in February 2017. 61% of indigenous peoples' representatives attending this meeting were women with highest % for LAC and Asia (more effort required to increase women's participation for Africa and the Pacific). With reference to gender equality and women's empowerment, the Forum's synthesis of deliberations and the regional action plans 2017-2019 recommend IFAD to: Adopt specific strategies to support consultation with and participation of indigenous women and youth; Develop a holistic approach to supporting indigenous peoples' economic empowerment taking into account the specific needs and priorities of women and youth (both in ongoing and new projects); in defining targeting strategies in IFAD programmes, recognize that women and youth are not homogenous groups and identify different women and youth categories and specific modalities to engage them. • 2015 IPAF cycle: out of a total of 25 approved projects, 9 directly target women (Cameroon, Ethiopia, Morocco, India, Indonesia, Colombia, Ecuador, Mexico and Paraguay) with an emphasis on women rights, capacity building focusing on women's groups and economic empowerment of indigenous women.	F
ESR	10	IFAD	OPER	RME		Solid basis for monitoring disaggregated data in design (by social groups and by gender), also incorporating specific indicators that can better capture the results and outcomes related to indigenous peoples' well-being.	During the regional workshops held in 2014 in preparation for the second global meeting of the Indigenous Peoples Forum at IFAD, a list of specific indicators on the well-being of indigenous peoples was proposed in three areas: Free, Prior and Informed	F

							<p>Consent; traditional knowledge; and land, territories and resources. These indicators, together with data disaggregation at project level, have been considered by IFAD in reviewing its Results and Impact Management System (RIMs). IFAD's revised core indicators now include data disaggregation by indigenous peoples and make reference to specific indicators for indigenous peoples.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Good examples in terms of the inclusion of outcomes and output indicators in the log frame disaggregated by ethnicity (Argentina, India, Lao PDR and Peru), by indigenous/non-indigenous and of specific indicators on the well-being of indigenous peoples (e.g. in Paraguay). • Although progress was recorded in IFAD-supported projects, the systematic adoption of data disaggregation and the inclusion of specific indicators is an area that needs further development, in close consultation with indigenous peoples. Refinement of a list of specific indicators for each RIMS indicator will need to be done in the course of 2017. 	
					Recommendation 3: Provide guidance on how FPIC can be best operationalized.			
ESR	11	IFAD	OPER	TCB		<p>Clarification is needed on implementation of the FPIC requirement, both at the design stage and during implementation. It is fundamental to emphasise that FPIC is in essence about effective beneficiary participation throughout the project cycle (project design, implementation, monitoring and evaluation) and enhancing project results and impact.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • FPIC is among the mandatory elements set out in the Social, Environmental and Climate Assessment Procedures (SECAP), whenever IFAD-funded projects are likely to affect land access and use rights of local communities. In 2015 IFAD developed the How to do Note on Seeking Free, Prior and Informed Consent in IFAD-funded projects which offers a practical guidance for IFAD staff, consultants and in-country partners for soliciting FPIC in the design and implementation of IFAD-funded projects, in compliance with IFAD policies and recognizing the 	F

							diversity of situations and contexts; <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In 2015-2016 FPIC implementation plans were annexed to the design documents of projects in Argentina, Brazil, Ecuador, El Salvador, Guatemala, Guyana, India, Lao People's Democratic Republic (Lao PDR), Myanmar, Paraguay and the Philippines. FPIC implementations plans in IFAD-funded projects in support of indigenous peoples is becoming systematic as a tool in support of indigenous peoples, not simply as a safeguard, do-no-harm approach. 	
ESR	12	IFAD	OPER	TCB		It is also important to increase staff understanding of how to approach this in a practical and pragmatic manner and in what contexts, and how the design can facilitate effective participation and the application of FPIC during project implementation.	Capacity of IFAD and project staff in engaging with indigenous peoples has been improved at the country level through FPIC trainings/awareness sessions delivered to more than 300 staff through SECAP. A key factor in the improvement of the quality of project and COSOP design was not only the consultation with indigenous peoples' communities and organizations, but the participation of indigenous experts, or consultants with an expertise on indigenous peoples (e.g. Brazil, Colombia, Ecuador, Guyana, Paraguay, Peru and Tanzania) in the design teams. This participation enabled indigenous peoples' priorities, concerns and opportunities to be integrated into project design, as well as tailored activities and implementation arrangements that respond to indigenous peoples' specificities and an opportunity for IFAD staff and consultants to learn about indigenous peoples' issues directly from indigenous experts. More needs to be done at implementation and supervision support, which is the opportunity to work with project staff and do on the job training, rather than class format trainings.	0
					Recommendation 4: Enhance			

					staff understanding of indigenous peoples' issues.			
ESR	13	IFAD	OPER	TCB		It is important to ensure that country programme managers responsible for relevant countries are familiar with indigenous people's issues and IFAD's policy. A change of staff can have a significant impact on the nature and orientation of the country programme, depending on the knowledge and experience of new staff. It is fundamental that incoming country programme managers without much exposure and understanding of the topic become acquainted with indigenous peoples' issues and their social and cultural values. Systematic and stronger partnerships with incountry partners – including indigenous peoples' organizations – would contribute to this process and facilitate continuity. In this regard, the Indigenous Peoples Forum is the instrument to build and strengthen in-country partnerships. In countries where indigenous peoples' issues are significant and relevant but the term "indigenous peoples" is not used or the government does not recognize the concept, the responsible staff should understand that it is possible to engage with those who self-identify as indigenous peoples following the spirit and principles of IFAD's policy on indigenous peoples by using national and local terms and applying context-specific approaches.	While trainings were provided through SECAP trainings on FPIC, more needs to be done with IFAD staff on IFAD policy on engagement with indigenous peoples and the work we do. The indigenous peoples' Forum and the regional workshops which are held in preparation of the Forum are a key opportunity of training, and so it is the inclusion of indigenous experts in the design teams, which is resulting in building and strengthening the capacity of IFAD's staff and consultants. Particular attention should be devoted to consultants who lead design and implementation support and supervision missions. Stronger partnership with IPOs at the country level is happening through the IPs forum, the IPAF and the policy engagement at the country level that IFAD is financing with other partners. Regional portfolio reviews are good opportunities for trainings staff and using the IPs forum and regional consultations as opportunities in the future. Instead of a room training, the best way of training IFAD staff and project staff is to facilitate meetings with indigenous peoples' organizations working directly on ongoing projects.	O
					Recommendation 5: Strengthen knowledge management, taking advantage of IFAD's substantial experience, lessons and knowledge on engagement with indigenous peoples.			
ESR	14	IFAD	STR	ASR		Based on IFAD's rich experience with indigenous peoples, there is scope	In 2016 a publication on Indigenous Peoples' Knowledge in climate change	O

					<p>for undertaking a study to review and analyse best practices and lessons in a comprehensive manner, to be widely shared as an IFAD's flagship publication. Capturing the perspective and voices of indigenous peoples in this process would be crucial. The study should also include an analysis of experience and lessons on value chain projects involving indigenous peoples, given the increase in "value chain projects" in recent years.</p>	<p>adaptation and mitigation strategies was published and very well received particularly on the international arena. During the last Conference of the Parties (COP22), IFAD was invited to several meetings to share the experience from IFAD-funded projects featured in the publication. The fourth global meeting of the Indigenous Peoples' Forum at IFAD expected for February 2019 will correspond to the 10th anniversary of the approval of the IFAD Policy on Engagement with Indigenous Peoples. A study and publication is expected to be prepared for this occasion. Meanwhile a publication on IFAD's engagement with indigenous peoples in the past decade has been prepared in occasion of the XVI Session of the UN Permanent Forum on Indigenous Issues (April-May 2017) as an advocacy tool for celebrating the tenth anniversary of the adoption by the UN of the Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples. This publication tells the evolution of IFAD's engagement with indigenous peoples in the past decade from the voices of the protagonists, the indigenous peoples' representatives. The publication also provides a short summary on IFAD's instruments in place that are supporting development effectiveness in IFAD.</p>	
--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--

Evaluation Synthesis Report: FAO's and IFAD's Engagement in Pastoral Development

Evaluation Synthesis Report: FAO's and IFAD's Engagement in Pastoral Development								
Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme		Recommendation	2017 Follow Up	Status
					Recommendation 1. FAO and IFAD should equip themselves with a policy of engagement in pastoral development.			
ESR	1	IFAD	PLCY	STRA		Supporting pastoral development is relevant to IFAD's and FAO's fundamental mandate and goals. They cannot achieve their strategic objectives without programmes of pastoral development and this is a good moment to draft such a policy or policies. The new understanding of pastoral systems has not yet been fully translated into development practice, from project design, to implementation, and evaluation. A policy would be a useful way to guide the adaptation of new concepts of pastoralism to realities on the ground. The first recommendation of the JES is therefore that FAO and IFAD both develop policies for their work in pastoral development. These policies should not be developed in isolation from one another and should stress coordination within and between the two agencies. In developing these policies, the long-term economics of preventing and managing conflict and avoiding encouraging unsustainable rural to urban migration should be carefully considered. Exploring opportunities in this direction is likely to be a major area of demand in the future (para 243, 247, 249).	PTA is in the process of finalizing a "How to do Note" on Pastoralism. Internal and external peer reviewers (especially from FAO) will soon be given the opportunity to review and comment on the 3rd version of this HTDN. The document would represent a first step towards developing a coordinated IFAD/FAO approach for an effective engagement with pastoral communities.	O
					Recommendation 2. Build and adapt capacity in IFAD and FAO			

Evaluation Synthesis Report: FAO's and IFAD's Engagement in Pastoral Development								
Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme		Recommendation	2017 Follow Up	Status
					for systemic engagement in pastoral development.			
ESR	2	IFAD	OPER	TCB		<p>Pastoral development interventions take place on the back of a problematic legacy. Misleading and counterproductive ideas from the past permeate the entire learning process. Thus 'reading the context' correctly, learning, and adapting, are crucial to effectiveness and efficiency of impact. IFAD's and FAO's capacities to achieve their goals with regard to pastoral systems need to be expanded and adapted. This includes developing a better understanding of pastoral systems, their operational logic, and their relation to dryland economies generally. But it also includes capacity development of desk and project staff to systematically track engagement with pastoral development as well as conducting evaluations with the right composition of the evaluation team. Building capacity means that staff should develop understanding about pastoral poverty, its shape, causes and remedies and how it differs from agricultural or urban poverty.</p>	<p>IFAD is an active member of the FAO-led initiative named "Pastoral Knowledge Hub (PKH) which aims at bringing together pastoralists and the main actors working with them to join forces and create the synergies for dialogue and pastoralist development.</p> <p>PTA has and continues to support the organization of learning routes (LR) (eg: in Kenya/Tanzania and in Sudan) with several country teams and IFAD supported projects and programmes, along with other stakeholders to build both capacity and strengthen advocacy. A LR is currently being planned for 2017 for the Nigeria team to visit Tanzania to look at approaches for resolving conflicts between pastoralists and crop farmers.</p>	O
ESR	3	IFAD	OPER	ASR		<p>It also means commissioning research to define, measure and reach pastoral poverty more accurately and effectively. Mobility and gender will be key concepts in theoretical discussions and practical application. A major goal should be that project and HQ staff understand better the concepts of resilience and variability. The links between fragility and conflict need to be identified and the practical conclusions drawn.</p>	<p>IFAD is funding a "Pastoralists driven data management system (P4D) project" which is going to be implemented by three national umbrella organisations, namely the Mongolian Association of Native and Indigenous People (MANIP), Redes Chaco and Réseau Billital Maroobe (RBM) under the overall coordination of FAO PKH. The main purpose would be to strength capacities of civil society organisations for pastoral data collection and information to facilitate evidence-based policy decision</p>	O

Evaluation Synthesis Report: FAO's and IFAD's Engagement in Pastoral Development								
Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme		Recommendation	2017 Follow Up	Status
ESR	4	IFAD	OPER	ASR		Work needs to be done to enable both organizations to identify and draw conclusions about the outcomes of projects, not just outputs. Comparative advantage suggests that IFAD and FAO should continue to specialize, FAO on the technical and policy side and IFAD on the development-programme side. IFAD is tied to work with individual governments while FAO has institutional capacity precisely for the kind of intergovernmental activity at regional level that is crucial to the next generation of pastoral development work (para 246, 250).	PTA plans to organise "brown bags" seminars and/or specific one-day events to present successful examples and best practices in designing and implementing pastoral development projects/initiatives as a mean to raise IFAD's staff capacity. FAO experts and ICO colleagues will be invited to attend and provide	O
						Recommendation 3. Manage, rather than avoid, key dimensions of risk.		
ESR	5	IFAD	STR	STRA		Structural to the pursuit of IFAD's and FAO's fundamental goals are dimensions of risk which need to be acknowledged and managed when engaging with drylands and pastoral development: (i) the risk inherent to environments where variability is structural; (para 28-29); (ii) the risk of operating with a problematic legacy of counterproductive policy environments; (para 40-42); (iii) the risk of increasing exclusion on technical bases, either by following an unchecked logic of comparative advantage (e.g. drifting away from thinly populated areas lacking infrastructures), or by implementing a technical approach in contexts with a history of neglect and misunderstanding, where technical packages are easily manipulated by national qualifications of problems and theories of change (para 40-42).	Designs of project targeting pastoralists and drylands are including analysis of these risks which are required both in the IFAD Indigenous Peoples Policy and Targeting Policy. There are good examples in the IFAD portfolio of IFAD support in solving conflicts, joint land use planning between pastoralists, agro pastoralists and crop farmers and access to water along transhumance routs to insure pastoralists mobility as a risk management strategy (i.e. Tanzania and Chad). Also more effort is done in project design to understand and meet pastoralists technology needs for better products and access to markets.	O

Evaluation Synthesis Report: FAO's and IFAD's Engagement in Pastoral Development								
Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme		Recommendation	2017 Follow Up	Status
						The main adaptive livelihood and production strategy consists in harnessing variability as distinct from avoiding it (para 29-30). While these categories of risk are different and concern different levels of operation, they are all structural. In engaging with pastoral development, IFAD and FAO should assume that such risks are the rule rather than the exception, and embed measures to manage them as standard practice at all levels of operation, starting from the corporate level, when developing the policy of engagement in pastoral development, but also down to the operational level and the learning process (for example project preparation, the design of evaluations, procedures, training, guidelines).		
ESR	6	IFAD	STR	STRA		A contextual risk-management and resilience strategy should be prepared for every pastoral programme or project in pastoral development, and, by extension, in dryland areas. This should include a clear conceptual and operational distinction between risk management and risk reduction. The FAO Resilience Index Measurement and Analysis model provides a possible framework for such work. (Para. 247).	IFAD continues to support several projects and programmes aimed at strengthening contextual risk-management and resilience strategies (eg: Mongolia and Tanzania).	O
					Recommendation 4. Support advocacy by and on behalf of pastoralists and people whose livelihoods depend on pastoral systems			
ESR	7	IFAD	STR	DIA		IFAD's and FAO's significant influence in the international and national arenas represents an invaluable asset in the ongoing global effort to update the public perception of drylands and	As mentioned above, IFAD is already an active member of the Pastoralist Knowledge Hub. However, IFAD is recognised at global level for the advocacy work done together with	O

Evaluation Synthesis Report: FAO's and IFAD's Engagement in Pastoral Development							
Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	Recommendation	2017 Follow Up	Status
					<p>pastoral systems and come to terms with the legacy of misunderstanding and technical exclusion that today represents perhaps the major obstacle to the development of resilient livelihood systems in the drylands. Work in this direction contributes to the long-standing strategic commitment to advocacy by both agencies (para 55, 60, 64, 67). The relatively small amount of advocacy promoted by IFAD represents an important dimension to the agency's work in support of its technical projects. The new Pastoralist Knowledge Hub project, building on FAO's intergovernmental dimension, is a potential platform for stepping up evidence-based advocacy work. Advocacy is a crucial complement to today's engagement with pastoral development, but steps should be taken to keep it within a systemic approach, subject to critical scrutiny and carefully targeted in light of the new understanding of drylands and pastoralism. (Paras 242, 243).</p>	<p>representatives of pastoral CSOs and indigenous populations in support of the "ongoing global effort to update the public perception of drylands and pastoral systems and come to terms with the legacy of misunderstanding and technical exclusion that today represents perhaps the major obstacle to the development of resilient livelihood systems in the drylands" by organizing two specific Fora, namely the Farmers' Forum and the Indigenous People Forum.</p> <p>In addition to this, IFAD is collaborating closely with the ILC Secretariat and other members of the ILC (including FAO and ILRI) in the "Rangelands Initiative" which aims at securing land and natural resource rights for all rangeland users, in particular pastoralists and agro-pastoralists. As part of this, partners lobbied for a focus on pastoralism at the March 2017 annual World Bank "Land and Poverty" conference, at which IFAD and the project it supports presented several experiences on its support for securing pastoralist land and NR resource rights, including an overview paper on lessons learnt. The rangeland initiative is also supporting country level multi-stakeholder policy engagement in Tanzania.</p> <p>Likewise IFAD is including successful examples of how pastoral development can be approach when giving presentations in international events and fora on drylands, water scarcity and management such as in the World Water Week in Stockholm in August 2016</p>	

Country and project evaluations

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2017 Follow Up	Status
Brazil - Country Programme Evaluation										
							Recommendation 1: Focus and priorities of the country strategy and operations.			
Brazil	LAC	CPE	1	CTRY	STR	STRA		The CPE recommends that the country strategy and projects devote more explicit attention to smallholder agricultural activities, which is at the core of IFAD's mandate and comparative advantage, as a vehicle for improving incomes and rural livelihoods. This would include priority to agriculture and food production and productivity enhancements through investments in adaptive research and extension to address climate change issues, water resources management and irrigation development, value chain development with appropriate linkages to input and output markets, greater engagement of private sector actors (for instance, in value addition and agro-processing) and the promotion of financial inclusion of the poor. IFAD investments should continue to provide essential rural support services to promote family farming, but a better balance between agricultural and non-agricultural activities should also be pursued.	IFAD two new projects in Brazil (Maranhão designed in 2016 and Pernambuco under design in 2017) and mid-term reviews of the ongoing portfolio give greater attention to agricultural activities including priority accorded to food production through productive investment at the community level and also through economic organizations. Links with the private sector have been enhanced through alliances with agro-processing cooperatives and this has paved the way to linkages to markets. Small-scale irrigation and water-related investments have also been underscored in the new projects and the ongoing operations such as with the Paraíba project supporting the water emergency plan of the state. Non-lending activities have provided a specific focus on commercialization and marketing with due consideration towards meeting the requirements of institutional markets and private markets. The top-up of the Bahia project will mainly focus on water-related activities and access to markets. Cooperation with the UN Global Compact (UNGC) has initiated IFAD dialogue with private corporations in the country.	F
Brazil	LAC	CPE	2	CTRY	STR	TGT		Opportunities for working in the	The recommendations has been fully	F

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2017 Follow Up	Status
								north of the country – with a primary focus on indigenous people – on a pilot basis is worth exploring in the next COSOP and lending cycle. Similarly, opportunities of working in other uncovered states and regions of the non-semi-arid regions of the north-east may be considered, given the poverty profile of rural people who live there. The opportunities and challenges of possible expansion to geographic areas beyond the current states covered should be carefully studied.	integrated as IFAD two new projects expand beyond the semi-arid and include a focus on indigenous people. The project in Maranhao expands IFAD operations to the Amazon transition area and Pernambuco will expand IFAD work to the Zona da Mata and Agreste. All are areas in which IFAD was never present. Both projects have very strong focus on indigenous populations, in Pernambuco with the Xucuru community (30% of the indigenous population of the state), and in Maranhao there will be a specific project area and dedicated intervention to indigenous communities. Both projects are also the first time IFAD works at the state level being Maranhao the first ever operation of IFAD in the state.	
Brazil	LAC	CPE	3	CTRY	STR	COS		The country strategy should be costed and include an estimate of all types of resources (for investments, grants, non-lending activities, South-South and Triangular Cooperation, and administrative resources) needed to achieve COSOP objectives.	The country strategy was not costed. However, the COSOP included the concept notes of the two new projects and the new grant (Semear International) includes very clear and earn market cost for activities on South South Cooperation and Triangular Cooperation.	F
Brazil	LAC	CPE	4	CTRY	STR	COS		Its results measurement framework should include measurable indicators that can be tracked during implementation and evaluated periodically, including at completion.	This was fully implemented as a country-based M&E system was developed and its fully operational with periodically tracking and monitoring indicators for the IFAD portfolio in the country. Baseline of all projects are finalized or about to be finalized and in this regard a framework baseline questionnaire was developed by IFAD Brazil to allow for alignment of data and information.	F
Brazil	LAC	CPE	5	CTRY	STR	COS		The COSOP should also clearly specify the time frame it will cover.	The new COSOP approved in 2016 covers the period 2016-2021	F
							Recommendation 2:			

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2017 Follow Up	Status
							Strengthen engagement in non-lending activities including South-South and Triangular Cooperation.			
Brazil	LAC	CPE	6	CTRY	OPER	KM		Building on the good work done since 2008, IFAD should devote even more attention to non-lending activities, including South-South and Triangular Cooperation, in the future country programme. This will require enhanced work in capturing project experiences and a more systematic way of disseminating lessons learned and good practices, also to strengthen IFAD's visibility and brand. The lending programme would mainly be the basis for learning lessons and identifying good practices in promoting poverty reduction in remote rural areas. A programme of knowledge cooperation would include attention to documenting and sharing experiences and lessons from Brazil that can help towards scaling up success stories in the country and elsewhere, as well as proactively supporting activities and organizing events that will promote the transfer of IFAD's accumulated knowledge, good practices, and lessons in smallholder agriculture and rural development from other countries to Brazil. With regard to the latter, one concrete area is indigenous peoples' development, where IFAD's rich experience in other countries could be of use in supporting the development of indigenous peoples in the north and north-east of the country.	This was integrated by the design of the new grant in Brazil (Semear Internacional) which will pay due attention to South-South and Triangular cooperation. In addition, current non-lending activities emphasised the systematization of experiences, lessons learnt and good practices and these has been captured by a series of publications/documentation helping scaling up of success stories. Specific field exchange visits, fairs, workshop and events were conducted to facilitate this process. They have also integrated projects under design and other partners. Such process has contributed to a higher recognition of IFAD visibility and brand. A web-based portal was designed to enhance dissemination through Semear and has become a major KM exchange platform. Finally, IFAD central role in the establishment	F

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2017 Follow Up	Status
Brazil	LAC	CPE	7	CTRY	STR	DIA		In addition to maintaining a close dialogue with the Ministry of Planning, Budget and Management and the Ministry of Agrarian Development, strengthening partnerships and policy dialogue with a wider range of federal agencies should be actively pursued.	IFAD has enhanced partnership and adjusted to the rapid changing scenario at the federal level (the Ministry of Agrarian Development was abolished, for example). IFAD has developed cooperation with the Ministry of Home Affairs through the newly established Special Secretariat of Family Agriculture and Agrarian Development; held greater interface with the Ministry of Agriculture and also initiated conversations with the Ministry of Finance and the Ministry of External Affairs through the Brazilian Cooperation Agency (ABC). In addition, IFAD has played an important role in the start-up operations and strategy of the newly established Federal Agency for Rural Extension (ANATER) in which IFAD federal project PDHC will play an important role.	F
Brazil	LAC	CPE	8	CTRY	STR	PAR		Concrete partnerships with multilateral and bilateral development organizations should be developed, for instance, in the areas of co-financing operations, knowledge-sharing, policy dialogue, scaling up and South-South and Triangular Cooperation.	Partnerships have been developed with the National Economic and Social Bank (BNDES) and a co-financing arrangement has been finalized put into place in the Maranhao Project. Additional partnerships are being explored with Bank of Brasil (BB). Also, greater cooperation has been established with the World Bank team (for example, through joint supervision missions) and also with the Latin American Bank (CAF).	F
Brazil	LAC	CPE	9	CTRY	OPER	PAR		Greater engagement of private sector actors and academic and research institutions would also add value to the activities supported by IFAD in Brazil.	Engagement with the private sector has been actively pursued through project productive investments mainly through cooperatives also reinforcing market linkages. Dialogue has been established with the UN Global Compact to reach a variety of major private sector partners in Brazil. Research institutions, mainly Embrapa, remain an important	F

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2017 Follow Up	Status
									partner of IFAD and closer interface with universities have been sought through project design. In addition, IFAD has initiated an important cooperation with UNDP's IPC (International Policy Centre for Inclusive Growth) leading to publication of research studies on specific themes to orient IFAD operations and also on M&E and the base line surveys of projects.	
Brazil	LAC	CPE	10	CTRY	STR	SOU		South-South and Triangular Cooperation should be a key objective in the new country strategy, in cooperation particularly with the Rome-based agencies dealing with food and agriculture and other development partners working in agriculture in the country. IFAD South-South and Triangular Cooperation activities should be anchored in the Fund's investment operations and focussed on few topics, such as promotion of family farming, an area in which IFAD has gained quite a bit of experience in the past decade in Brazil. The COSOP should clearly articulate the specific objectives, focus and measures of success for South-South and Triangular Cooperation.	South-South and Triangular Cooperation will become a major part of the non-lending country operations as the Semear International initiates its activities in 2017. In addition, other cooperation in the area have been done trough IFAD engagement with the Africa-Brazil Institute and IFAD major role in the Africa Brazil Forum held in November 2016. A book with good practices including success stories of IFAD operations has been published with FAO and will be distributed in Africa in English and French. In addition, a cooperation has been established with the ICO Mozambique in which IFAD project staff have connected to Mozambique for knowledge management and dissemination of tested good practices and innovations (IFAD project staff will travel to Mozambique twice in 2017 supported by a KM programme in Mozambique).	F
Brazil	LAC	CPE	11	CTRY	OPER	RME		All this will require strengthened M&E systems, both at the project level and the country level.	A country-based M&E system has been developed and is fully operational. Workshops and training events have been conducted to reinforce capacity at state level on M&A. A partnership with the UNDP's IPC (International Policy Centre for Inclusive Growth) led to building capacity on M&E and proper scrutiny	F

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2017 Follow Up	Status
									of base line surveys. Furthermore, systematic training provided under the IFAD CLEAR initiative to project staff is expected to further strengthen project and country level M&E.	
							Recommendation 3: Further adjustments to IFAD's operating model for greater development effectiveness.			
Brazil	LAC	CPE	12	CTRY	OPER	DEC		<p>Attention needs to be devoted to consolidating activities related to the six on-going operations to ensure desired results, which will require continued focus and support by the IFAD country team working on Brazil. Moreover, there is need for a better balance between lending and non-lending activities including enhanced national policy dialogue with federal agencies for scaling up impact and knowledge sharing.</p> <p>In order to effectively realize the above, the CPE recommends the out-posting of the IFAD country programme manager to Brazil. The recommendation of out-posting the country programme manager is primarily aimed at enhancing the broader impact of the important IFAD-Brazil partnership in promoting better rural livelihoods, recognizing the possible cost implications this might have for the Fund.</p>	Efforts have been made towards the consolidation of the six ongoing projects in Brazil by which disbursement levels have increased considerably and implementation advanced. This was possible mainly because constant contact with state partners, implementation support and supervision missions. With the substantial investment portfolio reaching beneficiaries in the field, the major challenge now is to supervise and follow-up investments and activities in such vast area. The fact that projects started to bear fruits and generate results, has also contributed in elevating IFAD role and status as a reliable partner. As a result, IFAD had a pivotal role in the establishment of the Forum of State Secretaries of Northeast States and Minas Gerais, which has become the most important policy dialogue platform on issues related to family agriculture in northeast Brazil and has become an important vehicle for KM and scaling-up impact.	O
Brazil	LAC	CPE	13	CTRY	OPER	DEC		Under the broader guidance of the country programme manager, the IFAD Country Office staff should	The CPM has provided important strategic guidance and orientation to the operations of the ICO Brazil. His	F

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2017 Follow Up	Status
								continue to provide timely supervision and implementation support to IFAD investment operations. In addition to supervising its staff, the country programme manager would take the lead in high-level policy dialogue, identifying opportunities for strategic and institutional partnerships (especially beyond the project level), South-South and Triangular Cooperation, and knowledge sharing. The country programme manager would also devote time to enhancing IFAD's visibility and brand.	presence in Brasilia has been constant and this has enhance IFAD high-level policy dialogue while at the same time maintained the country's interface with HQ, which is critical to ensure Brazil's institutional communication with HQ. At the same time, ICO staff have devoted greater attention to the consolidation of the portfolio and are fully involved in implementation support, supervision, identification and design of new projects. The CPM strategic direction is reflected in the fact that now IFAD is widely recognised as a reliable and major player in development in the country and one of the most important actors in rural development in northeast Brazil and therefore positioning IFAD brand in the country. Remarkably, this has been achieved during turbulent times with major changes at the federal level.	
Brazil	LAC	CPE	14	CTRY	OPER	DEC		Finally, the country programme manager should have exclusive responsibilities for Brazil, and not be concurrently responsible for other IFAD country programmes.	Since January 2016, the CPM for Brazil has exclusive responsibility for this country programme.	F
Brazil	LAC	CPE	15	CTRY	OPER	DEC		The out-posting of the CPM would require a professional-level staff member at headquarters to be assigned on a part-time basis to the Brazil programme to follow-up on day-to-day operational matters requiring attention at headquarters.	As agreed with the federal government, the CPM has enhanced his presence in Brasilia during frequent field missions. This arrangement is working well and also guarantees the necessary CPM-level interface related to Brazil at HQ which has increased with the relevance of non-lending activities, especially Brazil role in major corporate discussions and South South and Triangular cooperation.	PA
Bangladesh - Country Programme Evaluation										
							Recommendation 1: Stronger			

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2017 Follow Up	Status
							focus on agriculture.			
Bangladesh	APR	CPE	1	CTRY	STR	STRA		In future COSOPs, IFAD should consider a more clear-cut focus on agriculture (including fisheries and livestock) and related issues. To support government objective of achieving far reaching reduction in rural poverty, IFAD should focus on some important aspects of agriculture e.g. strengthening investment in extension and research, supply chain development, intensification, diversification, livestock, and particularly inland fisheries which is a major and growing export commodity.	Each ongoing project has an agriculture component with other complementary activities. At the end of 2016, with adoption of new pipeline, the design of a dedicated project to Ministry of Agriculture was launched: the SACP (Smallholders Agriculture Competitiveness Programme) which is planned to be presented to EB Dec 2017 or April 2018.	O
							Recommendation 2: Access to credit should remain a priority for the IFAD portfolio in Bangladesh.			
Bangladesh	APR	CPE	2	CTRY	STR	RFI		Despite significant advancement over the last two decades, there are still gaps in the microfinance sector that IFAD, with its knowledge and resources is well-placed to support. The unevenness of microcredit market saturation and the remaining risks, gaps and opportunities within the sector offer imperatives for further IFAD involvement. If new projects are designed to link with the existing portfolio with export led value chains, more specific mechanisms and further capacity development of the functionaries as well as specialized credit products and services is required in e.g. debt management, technology, business and marketing capacity development and this may require identification of	Results are being collected from the project dedicated to Rural Finance, i.e. PACE with PKSF institution. On this basis, knowledge will be analysed and disseminated. Rural Finance is already a very strong sector in Bangladesh and IFAD objective is more to link to existing national initiatives. In addition, new LGED project under design (CRCD) will have linkages with PKSF.	O

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2017 Follow Up	Status
								new partners.		
							Recommendation 3: Environmental protection as a priority in the face of emerging challenges.			
Bangladesh	APR	CPE	3	CTRY	STR	NRM		In addition to maintaining its current effort in climate change adaptation the future programme will have to carefully balance two competing priorities of environmental protection and poverty reduction in the context of two confronting realities of increasing agricultural intensity and population pressure. The program will require careful assessment of the potentials and risks and have to track the extent to which the short term gains are being achieved for the communities at a cost of longer term resource depletion.	These aspects are being covered under the two on going designs, with environmental scoping, SECAP as well as Economic and Financial Analysis. Results will be closely monitored and used in the next upcoming COSOP to be designed in 2018 for the period 2019-2025.	O
Bangladesh	APR	CPE	4	CTRY	OPER	NRM		All Project Implementation Plans should include environmental assessment processes and put in place activities to ensure that environmental objectives are achieved and risks are mitigated.	This is covered in ongoing AWPB generally and more specifically in assessment and impacts studies.	O
							Recommendation 4: Broadening policy and institutional support for the programme.			
Bangladesh	APR	CPE	5	CTRY	STR	DIA		To push for more lasting and longer term reform in policies and legislation, IFAD needs to engage more proactively with the Ministries at the central level (e.g ministries of Agriculture, Fisheries and Livestock, Food, Water Resources, Land) to	Ongoing projects are already partnering with these concerned ministries, some with outstanding results like CDSP IV. In addition, the new SACP design with MoA will contain elements of policy dialogue. Finally, annual portfolio review will	O

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2017 Follow Up	Status
								leverage their expertise and experience to focus on some of the important areas of intervention. These agencies also play an important role in national policy formulation, legislation, coordination as well as in designing and financing important national programmes, a broad based partnership with Ministries would offer IFAD an opportunity to be a partner in wider national policy processes and contribute towards shaping them.	be revived together with in country CPMT and IFAD participation into sector development groups, all these facilitating the scaling up of our operations.	
							Recommendation 5: Further investment in knowledge management.			
Bangladesh	APR	CPE	6	CTRY	STR	KM		The country office and the Asia and the Pacific Division should develop a clear and thorough knowledge management strategy along with a plan for generating specific knowledge products, sponsoring knowledge sharing events, developing platform for periodic facilitated interactive discussions on emerging agriculture and rural development issues among project professionals, research organizations and the academia. Experience of other United Nations agencies in Bangladesh could be tapped or partnership secured in developing such a strategy. A dynamic knowledge management effort requires active interaction with national research organizations, think tanks and academia, which currently seems to be very weak or non-existent. Such an effort could be introduced in a phased way with due allocation of time, resources and accountability from the headquarters and the CPO.	A first Knowledge workshop was organised in December 2016 with IPS (Inter Press Service Agency from Rome) to all projects to help them in producing KM activities and work plan. A second workshop is being called on 10-11 April to refine these plans and incorporate them into new AWPBs of each project. All projects are now committed to publish regularly press articles, case studies and organize KM events (K fair, etc...). With the upcoming EB visit end 2017, documents will be elaborated covering the 40 years partnership between IFAD and GoB. The newly reinforced country office (CPO+KM consultant) is supporting this overall effort and ensuring linkages with development partners and UN agencies.	O

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2017 Follow Up	Status
							Recommendation 6: Enhancing IFAD presence and capacity in the country including outposting the Bangladesh CPM.			
Bangladesh	APR	CPE	7	CTRY	OPER	DEC		The recent appointment of the CPO is a welcome step in strengthening IFAD's in-country presence and role. But considering the size of the Bangladesh programme (the third largest IFAD programme) and the volume of in-country interactions between and among the development partners and the government, there is a need to further strengthen IFAD's in-country profile in Bangladesh. In particular, the CPE recommends that the Bangladesh CPM be outposted from Rome to Dhaka as soon as possible. The high level public officials and other development partners met during the CPE all expressed similar views. More effective participation and achievement of deeper results in policy dialogue and partnership-building requires a different configuration of IFAD's representation, at an equivalent level with other multilateral banks or UN system agencies. A strengthened country office with an outposted CPM would improve opportunities for policy dialogue, enhance project supervision and implementation support, strengthen cooperation and harmonization with other donors, and further facilitate follow-up on supervision, mid-term review decisions and CPE recommendations.	Since CPE in 2015, Bangladesh CPO was recruited by IFAD and left Dhaka in June 2016 leaving the office unoccupied. A knowledge consultant supported the country program in country up to December when the new CPO was recruited in January 2017. A new interim CPM as well as part time Program Officer were designated in September and handled pipeline mission in October and initiated 2 designs in early 2017. Recruitment for CPM was launched in October but did not result in new recruitment. Status quo will remain for a while with no out posting foreseen in the near future. Efforts are being made on recovering from 2016 delays in terms of designs and strengthening the country office. New partnerships and enhanced CPMTs are being setup. It should be noted that Bangladesh is a highly performing portfolio and the first one in IFAD in terms of disbursements (USD 60 million in 2016).	O

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2017 Follow Up	Status
Turkey - Country Programme Evaluation										
							Recommendation 1: Prepare a new IFAD country programme opportunities programme (COSOP) for Turkey.			
Turkey	NEN	CPE	1	CTRY	STR	COS		There is a need to improve the strategy formulation process so as to enable a proper analysis of IFAD's strengths and limitations in Turkey and the opportunities and threats it faces in building a more effective partnership with the Government of Turkey and other potential partners. While a process that follows past practice - involving key government entities - is necessary, it is not sufficient for addressing the diversity and depth of challenges that confront IFAD in Turkey today. The CPE makes it clear that past approaches to issues such as SSTC, partnerships, the participation of the rural poor, women and youth in project activities and benefits, new technology for resource-poor farmers, commercialization of agriculture and knowledge management (including monitoring and evaluation [M&E] contributions, in particular) need fresh perspectives. It is imperative, therefore, to engage relevant national and international resource persons from both within and outside the public sector and the donor community in developing strategic directions that are robust and likely to work in the country context.	This recommendation has been incorporated in the RB-COSOP approved in Sept 2016. The latter acknowledged the limitations highlighted by the CPEs regarding IFAD's strategy in Turkey and as such, included a specific outcome for Partnerships Strengthening. The development of stronger linkages between lending and non-lending activities will be a key element of the Fund's engagement approach in the country and is expected to contribute to the promotion of development synergies as well as to the improvement in overall development effectiveness. Non-lending activities portfolio would include knowledge management, policy engagement, partnership building, and South-South Triangular Cooperation (SSTC). Considerable efforts are being made in order consult and work with new partners from both public and private sectors, at the national and international level in the framework of the pipeline programme "Uplands Rural Development Programme" (URDP).	F
							Recommendation 2: Improve			

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2017 Follow Up	Status
							targeting in terms of scope and accessibility to project benefits			
Turkey	NEN	CPE	2	CTRY	STR	TGT		<p>Improve targeting in terms of scope and accessibility to project benefits particularly for poorer farmers and specific target groups including women and youth. Turkey is a country experiencing growing income disparity, and so poverty reduction efforts need to identify and recognize disparities, that may exist even within rural communities.</p> <p>Inclusiveness is placed high in the government agenda to ensure that the benefits of growth and prosperity are shared by all segments of the society. Improved targeting approaches can be achieved through various methods, which should include several key aspects. Firstly, future programming should be more precise in identification of target groups and use participatory processes to ensure inclusion of these groups in project decision-making.</p>	<p>The Government of Turkey and IFAD are in agreement that IFAD exclusive niche in terms of geographical targeting would be the uplands of the mountain zones where the highest concentration of rural poor is registered. Future programmes in these areas would address the constraints faced by the productive rural poor, women and youth. Therefore, IFAD's more nuanced approach to targeting focusing on the "productive poor" small producers, women and youth, would be adopted.</p>	F
Turkey	NEN	CPE	3	CTRY	STR	TGT		<p>Secondly, there is a need to introduce specific initiatives and new partners to make sure that the more disadvantaged are not left out. These may include Ministry of Youth and Sports to help design appropriate approaches to attract and retain young farmers, Chambers of Commerce as mentors or area-based non-governmental organizations that work with culturally and linguistically diverse communities.</p>	<p>Institutional mapping for Farmer and Rural Based organisations is taking place.</p>	F
Turkey	NEN	CPE	4	CTRY	OPER	RME		<p>This improved targeting will also require better definition at the design phase of who will benefit and how in</p>	<p>Explicit identification of the target groups and approaches for inclusiveness have already been</p>	F

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2017 Follow Up	Status
								M&E systems, as well as detailed indicators to track participation and benefits.	carried out as for the recently launched Goksu-Taseli Watershed Development project (GTWDP) as well as for new projects. Additionally, with the revision to the RIMS and other initiatives including two complementary grant funded initiatives; the development of a tool that will be able to assess in country M&E systems and capacities and identify the gaps and develop action plans for strengthening the capacities and providing systematic capacity building in countries on M&E in rural development through the Centres for Learning on Evaluation and Results (CLEAR) are working on improving M&E systems, indicators and results measurement.	
							Recommendation 3. Strengthen IFAD's non-lending activities and ensure synergies with the portfolio.			
Turkey	NEN	CPE	5	CTRY	STR	STRA		Non-lending activities (knowledge management, policy dialogue and partnerships) have been a low performing area of the country programme. Strengthening IFAD's non-lending activities in Turkey will be essential for scaling up impact and rural transformation. Ensuring adequate links between non-lending activities with the investment portfolio would contribute to synergies and improve development effectiveness. The CPE recommends in particular strengthening and diversifying partnerships and further investment in knowledge management. IFAD	Through the new RB-COSOP, specific efforts are being made in this direction even though external circumstances are not always conducive to the achievement of this objective.	F

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2017 Follow Up	Status
								also needs to take advantage of opportunities to support South-South Cooperation in Turkey. (details are provided below)		
Turkey	NEN	CPE	6	CTRY	STR	GRT		The possibility of mobilizing country-specific grants and or participation in regional grants to support non-lending activities in Turkey should be explored.	To respond to this recommendation, a USD 1 million grant for SSTC is going to feature in the design of the URDP.	F
Turkey	NEN	CPE	7	CTRY	STR	PAR		First, IFAD needs to strengthen and diversify partnerships in Turkey. IFAD's relatively minor investment must be applied strategically, being viewed within the wider framework of key development partners' ongoing operations and Government of Turkey's commitment to the adoption of measures contributing towards reducing inequalities. In this regard, IFAD needs to strengthen and diversify its partners in Turkey to enhance its ability to leverage its programme in the country, both in policy dialogue and on the operational/financial front, including cofinancing with international donors, such as the European Union, the World Bank, the United Nations Development Programme, and partnering with technical services providers (e.g. Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations). Moreover, IFAD needs to ensure strong coordination with national institutions and explore collaboration with new Turkish partners such as Regional Development Agencies. At the operational/local level, inclusion of non-governmental organizations and private sector with relevant skills such as participatory village mobilization, inclusive development, environment and niche markets merits consideration. In particular IFAD would benefit by engaging	Specific efforts are being made in this direction even though external circumstances are not always conducive to the achievement of this objective. In the design of the URDP, partners such as WB, FAO and UNDP are being involved in order to explore areas of collaboration. The establishment of the ICO is believed to facilitate IFAD's participation in the donor coordination. Possible partnerships will be explored with MoFAL, MoD, and the Ministry of Forestry and Water Affairs (MFWA); national institutions such as the Turkish Cooperation and Coordination Agency (TIKA), the Southeastern Anatolia Project (GAP), Konya Regional Development Agency, KOP, (for Konya Basin), DOKAP (for Eastern Black Sea), DAP (for Eastern Anatolia); and private actors, community-based organizations and donors. Future operations under the RB-COSOP will address the lack of private investment in value chains in the uplands by encouraging entrepreneurs through the matching grant programmes; thus, fostering PPPs, up-front capacity-building and training at the producer level.	F

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2017 Follow Up	Status
								suitable selected private sector entities and also experienced donors directly at an early stage.		
Turkey	NEN	CPE	8	CTRY	STR	KM		Second, strengthen knowledge management. A key dimension of IFAD's value added in Turkey will be linked to its capacity to further strengthen the generation and sharing of lessons from the programme in order to improve performance and to support scaling up. IFAD needs to enhance knowledge management in Turkey, partaking its international and country experience, its technical expertise and its knowledge in involving the rural poor in design and implementation of rural investment projects, M&E, targeting and technical solutions in rural development. IFAD needs to make use of its capacity as knowledge broker, to be able to respond to demand on state of the art knowledge products and services, and prove global reach to mobilize required expertise. A dynamic knowledge management effort requires active interaction with national research organizations, think tanks and academia, which currently seems to be limited.	In line with the actions highlighted above as for the strengthening of the linkages between the lending and non-lending activities, the SSTC will feature strongly in the new programmes. The establishment of Turkey's Country Office and its role as a regional hub and knowledge broker, will further strengthen this agenda. Stakeholder workshops and consultation meetings are mainstreamed in the design and operations of the new projects/ programmes.	O
Turkey	NEN	CPE	9	CTRY	STR	SOU		Third, IFAD needs to facilitate exchange of knowledge and experience between Turkey and other IFAD countries, furthering current efforts within the framework of SSTC initiatives as an integral part of the IFAD-Turkey partnership. This transfer of successful ideas from one country to another can lead to considerable development impact. As a broker, IFAD can engage Turkish government organizations (e.g. General Directorate of Agrarian	Under the RB-COSOP for Turkey, two knowledge products will be developed. Drawing from experiences from IFAD-supported projects in Morocco and Turkey, the first of the KM products will be a thematic study on sustainable development and poverty alleviation in mountainous ecosystems. The second knowledge product involves IFAD aiding the Government in generating a knowledge product on the impact of matching grants and	O

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2017 Follow Up	Status
								Reform, GDF) and appropriate research and private sector entities in facilitating transfer of knowledge and technical expertise to IFAD operations in other countries in the region (Central Asia, the Balkans, North Africa and the Middle East), in areas in which Turkey has particular strengths, such as e.g. food processing and food safety.	subsidies.	
Turkey	NEN	CPE	10	CTRY	STR	SOU		IFAD and the Government of Turkey would benefit from a well-articulated approach to SSTC that includes TIKKA as the main partner and the direct coordinator of Turkish solution providers from the public and also private sectors.	Collaboration with TIKKA has started. In 2015, IFAD partnered with TIKKA to strengthen the capacity of technicians of project staff from four IFAD-financed projects in Sudan, Morocco, Tunisia and Yemen. By building on this success, the IFAD-TIKKA cooperation is going to be expanded also to other countries.	F
Turkey	NEN	CPE	11	CTRY	STR	DEC		Enhancing IFAD presence in Turkey through a country office - to capitalize Turkey's experience and knowledge to provide support to other countries – could contribute in this direction.	Signing of HCA is imminent and establishment of the ICO is underway	F
Turkey	NEN	CPE	12	CTRY	STR	SOU		Opportunities to partner with the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO) and the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) current cooperation programmes on SSTC should be explored.	In the design of the URDP, partners such as WB, FAO and UNDP are being involved in order to explore areas of collaboration.	F
							Recommendation 4: Emphasis on innovation and scaling up as two key strategic priorities			
Turkey	NEN	CPE	13	CTRY	STR	SCA		IFAD and the Government of Turkey are fully aware that financing for investment projects is not the major justification to borrow from IFAD and it is not an effective single vehicle to	This recommendation has been incorporated in the framework of URDP whereby a 2 PBAS lending approach will be applied. Drawing on the latter, 2 sub projects will be	F

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2017 Follow Up	Status
								eradicate rural poverty in the country. This is particularly relevant in Turkey in view of relatively limited availability of performance-based allocation system (PBAS) resources for the programme. IFAD needs to further demonstrate value added in Turkey beyond projects. In this context promoting innovation and pursuing scaling up (two poor-performing areas in the programme) need to be regarded as strategic priorities in the future country programme. (Details are provided below)	developed. However, it is worth mentioning that the adoption of such an approach depends also on the interest and request by Government.	
Turkey	NEN	CPE	14	CTRY	STR	INN		Promoting innovation. First, a closer review of mechanisms for innovation is required to reduce public dependency and build sustainable institutional support. IFAD has knowledge and experience in appropriate technology and local institutional development that could assist in scaling of pro-poor interventions that would be more consistent with the portfolio's strategic objectives of empowerment and sustainable pathways out of poverty. Concerted efforts are required to find new mechanisms to strengthen collective farming and marketing initiatives to create economies of scale and value adding opportunities in relation to market demand.	As a follow up to this recommendation, innovative instruments for accessing finance such as credit guarantee mechanisms as well as platforms for linking production with market bases are going to be key features in the design of the URDP. Projects will capitalize on innovations introduced by IFAD: SIPs, pro-poor MGPs and climate-smart agriculture (such as integrated pest management, vegetable production under cover, renewable energy, drip irrigation, participatory rangeland management and tailored IT-based weather forecasts for better real-time planting and harvesting).	F
Turkey	NEN	CPE	15	CTRY	STR	INN		There is a need to explore, in addition to better access to new markets, alternative sources of investment capital such as Islamic financing models and to build coordinated support services and local business services within the project areas that will provide both improved local economies and establish strong platforms for future	Even though the introduction of Islamic financing products is not feasible in the Turkish context, different modulations of financing are being explored.	PA

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2017 Follow Up	Status
								growth. There are some promising examples of small women producer groups and farmer-led initiatives such as family farm consolidation and joint marketing that could be studied and further developed. This would be of benefit in the Turkey programme and also support South-South and Triangular Cooperation initiatives.		
Turkey	NEN	CPE	16	CTRY	STR	SCA		Scaling up. Second, building on additional efforts to strengthen policy dialogue and knowledge management, the IFAD-supported programme needs to shift from a project-centric approach to one aimed at influencing other partners (government, donors, private sector) including leveraging policies, knowledge and resources. This will require the adoption of a programmatic approach to scaling up in Turkey and a shifting from scaling up IFAD projects to scaling up results. Potential scaling up pathways (through projects, policy dialogue, knowledge management) need to be explored from the beginning and throughout the project cycle and will need to be supported over a longer time horizon, typically much longer than a one-time IFAD intervention. New ideas can be tested through pilot projects, as the basis of a scaling-up model.	The government has committed in scaling up sustainable development models for pockets of poverty (with a focus in the uplands) by adopting a programmatic approach to IFAD investment and through scaling up two ongoing IFAD investment programmes with similar characteristics – the Murat River Watershed Rehabilitation Project (MRWRP) and Göksu Ta eli Watershed Development Project (GTWDP) – as well as the Uplands Rural Development Programme (URDP) currently in the pipeline.	F
							Recommendation 5: Strategic focus on women and youth.			
Turkey	NEN	CPE	17	CTRY	STR	TGT		Additionally, the CPE recommends that IFAD support the portfolio more strongly with non-lending activities (knowledge management, policy dialogue and partnerships) with a	Please refer to response to recommendation No. 2 above.	F

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2017 Follow Up	Status
								particular focus on gender mainstreaming and on targeting of women and youth, ...		
Turkey	NEN	CPE	18	CTRY	OPER	SUP		... as well as more regularly deploy gender and youth experts on supervision missions to ensure that projects are supported to achieve gender equity in implementation and respond to youth specific needs.	This recommendation has been taken into account in the design for the new project as well as supervision of ongoing portfolio.	F
Turkey	NEN	CPE	19	CTRY	OPER	RME		Finally, logical frameworks for future projects should include indicators, targets and means of measurement relating to the participation of and expected outcomes relating to gender and the involvement of youth.	Agreed and is done for GTWDP and to be done for URDP. Youth and gender disaggregated data and indicators have been included in the revised RIMS which was approved by the EB in April 2017	F
Brazil: Rural communities development project in the poorest areas of the state of Bahia - Project Performance Assessment										
Brazil	LAC	PPA	1	CTRY	STR	DES		Need for a longer time frame for pro-poor development with demand driven participatory approaches. The project's strategy to empower the beneficiaries and their organizations to effectively participate in their social and economic development has proved its worth. However, the time frame of six years is insufficient to complete and consolidate the project activities which might have required some ten-twelve years. While "stretching" the duration of implementation of a single project phase is unlikely to be an acceptable option at IFAD (inter alia due to cash flow issues), the Fund should coordinate between two project phases so that an assessment and consolidation plan is prepared in view of a follow-up phase. Depending on the availability of funding, the second phase may be cofinanced by IFAD and the state government or by the latter on its own if IFAD can not	It was agreed with CAR, the Gente de Valor and Pró-Semiarid Project Implementation Agency, that the government of Bahia would finance the long-term provision of specialized technical assistance on project management and marketing to all families benefitting from the Gente de Valor Project. The funds for this programme are entirely made of counterpart contribution from the State's government budget. In addition, the government of Bahia has also agreed to finance exchange programmes between beneficiary communities of the Gente de Valor Project and new beneficiaries of the Pró-Semiarid Project, in order to ensure continuity and sustainability of all IFAD financed activities. These exchange programmes are not only of a technical nature, but also encompass a social dimension. An example are the successful activities involving the Kiriri indigenous	F

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2017 Follow Up	Status
								commit further resources. It will be important for the state government to commit to future support (including financial support). IFAD may help prepare a consolidation needs analysis and a support plan.	community, which are now a showcase for rural development work with indigenous communities in the Northeast as whole, and in Bahia in particular.	
Brazil	LAC	PPA	2	PROJ	OPER	SUS		Concrete plan for the consolidation of productive activities. The CAR personnel of Pró-semiárido in collaboration with IFAD could help by elaborating a detailed plan for the consolidation of the productive activities implemented by Gente de Valor. While this plan should include smaller- scale activities such as the horticulture productive backyards and small ruminants raising, it should have special emphasis on larger processing plants. 1) This plan should include an assessment of the needs in terms of training, access to financial services, for the consolidation of the main productive activities. 2) For the processing plants it should include a business case analysis, identifying the requirements for economic profitability and the conditions for reaching a break-even point. This would help focus efforts and resources where there are chances to succeed as profitable enterprises.	All sub-projects financed by Gente de Valor and Pró-Semiárido Projects have now been incorporated into the government's new rural development sustainability programme. Those already financed by Gente de Valor have also received special PMU attention during the first couple of years of the PróSemiárido implementation, in order to help to implement the strategy. This strategy includes 3 components: a social, an environmental and an economic one. The social one includes activities such as a refresher capacity building training programme in management with beneficiaries and an update on trade and public policy access, with renewed attention to women and youth empowerment. The environmental one includes production techniques to upgrade to agroecological systems, in the context of climate change. The economic one ensures that project beneficiaries have renewed access to institutional markets, such as PAA and PNAE as well as to register them on the local fairs through a listing produced by CAR.	F
Brazil	LAC	PPA	3	CTRY	OPER	ORG		Enhance institutional connectivity of IFAD-supported interventions in the State of Bahia. This concerns not only the support to the sustainability of results of Gente de Valor, but also ongoing and future interventions (such as Pró-semiárido). There are three dimensions to this: 1. There needs to be better	The special technical assistance programme gives beneficiaries special training on access to public policies, including PRONAF, commercialization (PAA and PNAE) and crop insurances programmes, as well as seed and tractor financing programmes. For the water access programmes, the government has	F

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2017 Follow Up	Status
								coordination with publicly supported programmes. As an example, other public programmes provide water tanks (for human consumption and production) and, in the future, IFAD-supported programmes could rely more on these for improving access to water.	liaised with two key Federal initiatives: ii) the MDS (Ministry of Social Development) 1 million cisterns, for both production and consumption; ii) the Agua Doce programme (Ministry of Environment), which ensures that water for production is extracted from deep wells in the semiarid regions.	
Brazil	LAC	PPA	4	CTRY	OPER	PAR		2. It is necessary to enhance synergies of IFAD-funded interventions with state service delivery services, such as Bahiater (for agricultural extension) as well as programmes funded by other donors (such as Bahia Produtiva – World Bank);	The regional office of the Pro-Semiarid Project in Juazeiro, Bahia, shares the same building of the local SETAF (Territorial Service for Family Farming in the State) office, allowing for all rural development projects in the State to interact and seek common ground and synergies, and it includes projects funded by other agencies such as the World Bank. In addition, the World Bank and IFAD, whose projects in Bahia are implemented by the same agency, CAR, have agreed to conduct joint supervision missions, in order to share methodologies, best practices and results and scale-up success cases. The first joint supervision mission took place in 2016 involving World Bank and IFAD staff for over a week of work, which kick started at the Bahia edition of the Forum of Secretaries of Family Farming of Northeast Brazil and Minas Gerais, attended by policy makers, development project managers and civil society leaders from the whole of Northeast Brazil and IFAD's intervention area.	F
Brazil	LAC	PPA	5	CTRY	OPER	ORG		Better coordination is necessary with local level governments, such as municipalities. Some of these are elaborating local development plans (in which project-driven development plans need to be better inserted) and	The work with municipalities has strengthened on several fronts: i) organization of commercial fairs of agroecological products from IFAD beneficiaries, for which several municipalities agreed to provide free	F

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2017 Follow Up	Status
								many have local extension services (although under-funded). Linkages with local government plans can enhance the availability of critical funding for maintenance of infrastructure and also help imbue the modus operandi of local governments with the innovations promoted by the projects.	space; ii) cooperation between production groups and the municipal secretariats of education for the purchase of food for school meals; iii) coordination and cooperation with the municipal secretariats for the environment for the provision of technical assistance to IFAD Project beneficiaries; iv) provision of machinery by the municipalities for the construction of water access infrastructure (small and medium-size, such as dams) to reach IFAD beneficiary areas and increase the potential of agricultural production volumes.	
Brazil	LAC	PPA	6	CTRY	OPER	ASR		Systematization of innovations and best practices for their scaling-up. It is recommended to IFAD in collaboration with the state government of Bahia to carry out an in- depth analysis and review of the innovations and best practices of the project, including the following activities: focalization, establishment of sub-territories and associations with a participatory approach; water saving productive backyards, management of small ruminants in "fundo de pasto", innovative value-added productive chains (umbu, ouricuri, and cassava), installation of simple desalinization plants, safe soil conservation practices (mixed cropping), sisal manufacturing and other environmentally sustainable techniques adapted to the caatinga. This analysis should be based on the following questions: What worked well and what did not? What were the key success factors? What could have been done differently and how? Knowledge and learning resulting from these best practices and innovations can contribute to	Several activities were organized to better systematize information and knowledge, as well as best practices from the Projects. Both Gente de Valor and Pro-Semiariid Project Staff have intensively interacted with staff of Semear Programme, benefitting from exchange programmes, and receiving support for the production of publications, booklets and bulletins, e.g. a book on the impact of production backyards on the lives of women etc. In addition, information was also systematized to be included in the very products sold by the beneficiary communities, such as the narrative labels and packaging now used by COOPERCUC, a beneficiary of the Pro-Semiariid Project, with a partnership with Slow Food. This cooperation with Slow Food and the IFAD-supported cooperative for product labelling and packaging includes narrative on the history of the community, maps of the region and images on the family farming way of life. It has greatly enhanced the visibility and the appeal of the family farming products	F

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2017 Follow Up	Status
								institutional decisions regarding new and ongoing public policies and programmes, not only in the Bahia State but also at the country level.	coming from IFAD intervention areas. The products are geared to enter high-level national and export markets niches.	
Brazil	LAC	PPA	7	IFAD	OPER	RME		Improvement of the M&E and reporting systems. The implementation of the RIMS M&E system had some constraints related to the limited scope of the data, which did not capture relevant project outputs and outcomes. This will require from IFAD's side a revision of the RIMS system and of its operationalization in order to make it more flexible and better adapted to demand-driven projects.	Since mid-2015, the IFAD ICO Office, under the CPM's guidance and in co-operation with the Semear Programme, devised a framework to establish an online, real-time M&E system to assist rural development project managers in enhancing the effectiveness in reporting results, comparing impact assessment data and planning project activities, based on state projects' AWPB. The first version of the system was designed in a generic enough way to allow for its use not only by IFAD, but rather by any rural development project currently under implementation in Northeast Brazil. The system was launched successfully during the 1st IFAD Brazil Workshop in M&E in April 2016. In June 2016, a new partnership was established with UNDP's International Policy Centre for Inclusive Growth, to further strengthen Semear's contribution in the field of M&E, in particular with regards to evaluation and impact assessment of rural development policies in Northeast Brazil and Minas Gerais. Additionally, IFAD has revised its RIMS framework.	F
Brazil	LAC	PPA	8	PROJ	OPER	RME		In addition to the RIMS, the CAR personnel of Pró-semiárido could also collect and analyze comprehensive data (e.g. gender disaggregated data, average costs of activities) that would facilitate a better understanding of the project progress and impact. IFAD could support CAR by promoting exchange visits with other projects where analytical work has been conducted	Gente de Valor was chosen by IFAD (RIA/SKD) for a joint post-impact assessment work, which will be conducted in several stages, including remote exchange of databases and analysis, but also new field visits, with the participation of project staff, IFAD staff and technical specialists. In addition, the new baseline for the Pro-Semiárido Project is being finalized with the support of	F

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2017 Follow Up	Status
								at a satisfactory level.	UNDP-led IPC think-tank, in order for the data to be fully comparable and cross-checked with the other 4 baseline databases that have recently been produced for the ongoing IFAD projects in the States of Paraíba, Ceará, Piauí and Sergipe. This will allow the project management in Bahia to have a clear X-ray of the beneficiary communities and particularly their positioning relative to the project design targets, to aid planning and future M&E work. In this regard, IFAD involved project directors and M&E staff in two major M&E workshops during 2016, with the participation of all service providers involved in data collection and analysis for all IFAD-financed state-based projects, to present methodologies and results and exchanging views, key conclusions and agreeing on the way forward.	
Lao People's Democratic Republic: Rural livelihoods improvement programme in Attapeu and Sayabouri - Project Performance Assessment										
							Only recommendations specifically addressed to IFAD have been listed below. Recommendation 1 Institutionalize a participatory approach for local development planning has not been			

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2017 Follow Up	Status
							considered because addressed to the Government of Lao People's Democratic Republic.			
Lao People's Democratic Republic	APR	PPA	1	CTRY	OPER	TCB		Address institution-building and training. There is a need to build long-term capacities through the strengthening of village community workers and management committees in order to ensure sustainable community development. There is also a need to promote farmers' organizations and strengthen their negotiating power. These organizations could serve to strengthen maintenance and cleanliness systems for sustainable use of all types of rural infrastructures. In the future it may be necessary to set up strong institutions with clear mandates for O&M activities. Although several committees were set up for O&M activities, they lacked statutory status, mainly because these committees functioned under the supervision of VACs and village heads. It would be useful to consider recruiting a full-time staff person to work on forming farmer groups. With regard to training, sessions should be participatory and very practical, addressing community needs, and suitable for women with a limited level of education as well as time/family/mobility constraints. Training sessions should include an assessment to document training quality, beneficiaries, levels of	Ongoing projects and especially the recently approved project NSLCP - RFSP focusses on capacity and institutional building to address concerns related to sustainability , poverty and gender focus and be inclusive for the various ethnic groups in the project area. NSLCP assist the livestock development groups formed under the LDP, now closed. The project assistance focusses on technical aspects such as veterinary services and livestock fodder production at the farmer level, as well as the service provider at all levels. Assistance to farmer groups is refocused on technical, organisational and market aspects. Farmer to Farmer extension known as the most effective extension model, has been strengthened.	O

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2017 Follow Up	Status
								satisfaction and outcomes of the training itself (adoption rate, increased yields, production, income, literacy rate, quality of services, etc.)		
Lao People's Democratic Republic	APR	PPA	2	CTRY	STR	RFI		Strengthen microfinance as a means of easy access to credit. With many avenues for diversification of economic activities, demand for credit has increased. It is important to emphasize the complementarity of instruments to ensure that the supply of financial services meets the diversified demand of the various target groups. The existing VB system is unable to meet such requirements and the members still look for other avenues. It is advisable to support VBs to develop financial products which are more suitable for IGAs and agricultural activities. With private investments growing in the area and also family members working outside the area, VBs should be capable of attracting the growing family remittances. It would be useful to consider establishing strong linkages with the formal banking sector.	The IFAD portfolio is looking at revising its rural finance approach. All projects will be affected. The new NSLCP-RFSP (ADB/IFAD funded) will pave the way forward: It will recruit an international, specialised TA in microfinance, partnered by national rural finance experts to finalise the re-design of the NSLCP livestock credit scheme and to empower District Lao Women's Unions (LWU) to responsibly manage livestock development credit to livestock market group members. The Bank of Laos, with GIZ support, is establishing Network Support Organizations (NSO) at provincial level to facilitate the extraordinary growth of savings-driven Village Funds. NSLCP-RFSP will assist the GoL to establish a national ARF, to catalyse the participation of registered private banks and MFIs in agricultural and rural development finance operations in Lao PDR. The ARF will apply those funds to refinance a portion of lending by prudentially-approved commercial banks and MFIs to targeted agriculture sectors, in line with the national agricultural development strategy.	O
Lao People's Democratic Republic	APR	PPA	3	CTRY	OPER	KM		Facilitate knowledge management and support the development of systems to better measure results and impact. IFAD should plan regular information and knowledge-sharing events (workshops, field visits, training sessions, etc.) among the province/district coordination units. The agency should coordinate	Knowledge management will be strengthened in all projects and at country programme level .To enable effective knowledge management and sharing, results and lessons from the Programmes are documented systematically through special studies and knowledge products commissioned by the programme	O

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2017 Follow Up	Status
								programme action with other donors, and look for complementarity and synergy at grassroots level, especially for investments such as social infrastructures, which are no longer covered by IFAD financing but which have a high level of impact on livelihoods of the target population.	management and with guidance by the IFAD country office. The M&E system will be one of the most important sources of knowledge. In addition, innovations observed during the implementation process will also be documented. The M&E staff will also take the responsibility for disseminating knowledge documents through dedicated websites and occasional workshops and seminars.	
Lao People's Democratic Republic	APR	PPA	4	IFAD	OPER	RME		Furthermore, with regard to M&E, IFAD should pay greater attention and provide support at all stages in this area in collaboration with the government – including proposing a solid basis for M&E in project design reports, providing support and guidance to project management in strengthening the M&E system and carrying out regular impact surveys.	The programmes are guided to follow a standard M&E approach in terms of monitoring output, outcomes and impact. M&E systems shall provide information by poverty status, gender, and ethnicity. Where appropriate, outcome and impact indicators will be disaggregated by poverty quintile. The new NSLCP has an Indigenous Peoples Planning Framework (IPPF)/Ethnic Groups Development Framework (EGDF). Apart from the three levels of monitoring, the Programmes will monitor processes. This will involve monitoring the processes leading to outputs and outcomes. Specific areas where progress monitoring will applied include the provision of technical services, the execution of participatory village SLPMG establishment and execution of group activities. Information on these may be gathered via PME, as well as from village, SLPMG or service provider records. Furthermore, special studies will be undertaken to assess the effectiveness of the approach and its processes and ultimately to make adjustments as required. While programmes have their own M&E, they will be aligned with the evolving governmental MIS system.	F
Lao	APR	PPA	5	CTRY	OPER	KM		It is advisable to organize a learning	The drafting of the new COSOP is	O

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2017 Follow Up	Status
People's Democratic Republic								retreat/workshop to identify RLIP lessons learned, in order to further inform FNML implementation. A practical action and learning approach for FNML implementation should be produced, and reviewed and revised annually.	work in progress and will build on lessons learnt from RLIP and other closed/ongoing projects. These lessons learnt will be presented in the COSOP completion review report and discussed at national levels.	
Nigeria: Community-based agricultural and rural development programme - Project Performance Assessment										
Nigeria	WC A	PPA	1	CTRY	STR	STRA		CDAs. Formalise the role of CDAs. Under CBARDP, social inclusion, transparency and accountability have been enhanced. But at the same time, CDAs maintain poor records, have limited accounting skills and there is limited reflow of assets. In future, greater support for financial management as well as basic literacy and numeracy are needed. For sustainability, there is a case that this '4th Tier' of government should have a budget, salaries and operating costs provided by the LGA, as is found in similar village level administrations elsewhere. In future operations, such as CASP, IFAD should seek to focus on providing greater support for bringing about state legislation to provide a legal basis for CDAs to operate and be sustained.	As CBARD has ended, action is ongoing in CASP. The new investment programme, currently under design, will continue to leverage on the principle of CDD approach by deepening on the use of CADA to facilitate youth involvement and women inclusion in agribusiness, facilitate access to economic opportunities and enhance knowledge sharing among community members. The CDD approach will be adapted for the promotion of rural agribusiness development.	O
Nigeria	WC A	PPA	2	CTRY	OPER	RME		Monitoring and evaluation. Provide appropriate guidance on participatory M&E and impact studies. While routine monitoring and financial reporting has been largely satisfactory, much greater attention should be paid to: (i) proposing a more appropriate participatory approach to M&E at community level, so that it is aligned with local capacities and interests; and (ii) conducting more suitable evaluation	A lot of technical support is being provided to improve the M&E systems and processes of ongoing programmes (VCDP and CASP). At the same time IFAD is supporting the strengthening of the national M&E system for the agricultural sector. IFAD is undertaking two complementary initiatives through establishing partnerships funded by IFAD grants; the development of a tool that will be able to assess in	F

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2017 Follow Up	Status
								surveys that consider the counterfactual, use sound data cleaning and verification, apply statistical tests to explore the meaningfulness of the data, and above all adopt a more objective approach to interpretation of the evidence. In addition, useful thematic studies need to be undertaken to provide insights on programme performance and emerging issues.	country M&E systems and capacities and identify the gaps and develop action plans for strengthening the capacities and providing systematic capacity building in countries on M&E in rural development through the Centres for Learning on Evaluation and Results (CLEAR).	
Nigeria	WC A	PPA	3	CTRY	STR	GDR		Gender. Address power relations and social values through culturally appropriate gender strategies. While important strides have been made in bringing greater equity to women in terms of sharing development resources and being given greater opportunity to manage their own investments, in future greater efforts to bring women into decision making structures such as CDAs are needed, even though this is not straightforward in the more conservative Islamic culture found in northern Nigeria.	Increased attention is being given by ongoing programmes to bring women into decision making structures. As such, VCDP developed a gender strategy which foresees a target of 30 per cent of women in leadership positions. In addition, the upcoming investment programme, LIFE, will adopt and promote the use of Gender Action and Learning System (GALS) which has proven to be successful in promoting the decision-making power of women.	O
Nigeria	WC A	PPA	4	IFAD	OPER	RME		Counting beneficiaries. Provide differentiated guidance on how to categorize beneficiaries and monitor benefits. The IFAD RIMS has encouraged a strong focus on counting different categories of beneficiaries, however there needs to be greater attention given to how beneficiary numbers are defined and counted (to avoid double counting for example). Greater support also needs to be given to balancing the top-down indicator focus with a stronger analysis of who benefits (i.e. targeting).	Ongoing programmes have refined their targeting strategies to allow them to better monitor their targeting practices. At the same time M&E systems are being strengthened. Finally, thematic studies are foreseen to capture the differentiated impact on the target groups. Moreover IFAD revised RIMS was approved by the EB in 2017 and is being rolled out which provides added guidance this.	F
Kyrgyz Republic: Agricultural investments and services project - Project Performance Assessment										
Kyrgyz	NEN	PPA	1	CTRY	OPER	TCB		Build sufficient professional capacity	Under the LMDP 2, PUUs are	F

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2017 Follow Up	Status
Republic								at the local (PUU) level for designing, implementing and monitoring CPMPs so as to address/revert pasture and soil degradation (paragraph 101, 110, 143). The alarming biological (pasture germplasm) and physical (soil, water) degradation of pasture land requires substantial, rapid and continuous efforts for establishing the conditions for sustainable natural resource use. CPMPs which satisfy such conditions, short- and long-term, require advanced technical and logistical skills which need to be available to PUUs on a continuous basis. The creation and provision of respective manpower for all PUUs is suggested to be priority attention of any project follow-up action; the opportunities of local/rayon-level vocational schools for involvement/commitment in such professional education are worth examining.	supported to enhance their pasture management plans in view of increased environmental sustainability and the challenges of climate change. This has improved the PUU capacity to implement and monitor their CPMPs. With project support, the Bishkek university of agriculture has included pasture management into its curriculum, strengthening the cadres of local specialists available in the sector.	
Kyrgyz Republic	NEN	PPA	2	CTRY	STR	PRM		Strengthen the conditions for private veterinary service delivery while focusing the public veterinary authority function on regulatory dimensions (paragraphs 68, 111, 144). The network of private veterinarians needs to be enabled and strengthened (Veterinary Chamber, Veterinary Associations) to undertake fully, in principle on a cost-recovery basis, veterinary support to farmers and enterprises. The national veterinary authority is expected to assist the Veterinary Chamber and Associations in enhancing the professional capacities of private veterinarians; it also establishes the rules for the operation of private veterinarians and for their links to the public services at	The recommendations have been taken fully on board. The ongoing LMDDP 1 and 2 are supporting the build-up of a private veterinary network (support through training, certification, as well as equipment and linkage with PUUs). Under the support of LMDDP 1 and 2, incidence of brucellosis, echinococcus have been significantly reduced. The upcoming ATMP also supports vaccination for PRM.	F

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2017 Follow Up	Status
								national and regional levels. In the response to epidemic disease emergencies and in the context of national disease control programmes in view of disease eradication (e.g. brucellosis, foot-and-mouth disease, peste des petits ruminants [animal disease, also known as "goat plague"], etc.), sufficient state budget (and state-mediated donor support) needs to be made available to the public animal health authority to finance effective vaccination campaigns carried out by private veterinarians.		
Kyrgyz Republic	NEN	PPA	3	CTRY	OPER	RME		Ensure adequate M&E and systematic efforts in ongoing projects to provide data on outcomes and impact (paragraphs 6, 88, 133). In particular, these should include impact on livestock productivity and farm incomes and changes in pasture conditions	Agreed and fully implemented. Ongoing projects have a strong M&E system that regularly collects information on key indicators, such as milk yields, animal weight - that function as a proxy on pasture conditions as well as on impact on HH livelihoods.	F
Kyrgyz Republic	NEN	PPA	4	CTRY	OPER	PAR		Ensure close coordination with the World Bank financed PLIMP to ensure consistency in approaches (paragraph 146). Given that LMDP was designed with the participation of the World Bank and that the all projects are implemented through APIU and ARIS, there is high likelihood that sufficient coordination and consistency are maintained. The World Bank's PAD on PLIMP also indicates that these projects would have common terms of financing for communities and "a common project operating manual as far as possible". Some areas where consistency may be important are: key M&E indicators and approaches to measure them; impact assessment; guidance documents for activities related to community-based pasture management (e.g. social mobilization	IFAD has undertaken in the recent designs (ATMP) robust poverty gender mapping and analysis, resulting in a design which integrates the communities in the forming and participation of value chains in a inclusive manner. IFAD has also been supporting the adoption of the GALs methodology in the portfolio. The aspects are fully followed up on during supervision and implementation. IFAD is undertaking two complementary initiatives through establishing partnerships funded by IFAD grants; the development of a tool that will be able to assess in country M&E systems and capacities and identify the gaps and develop action plans for strengthening the capacities and providing systematic capacity building in countries on M&E in rural	F

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2017 Follow Up	Status
								strategy, gender strategy, guidelines for pasture use and management planning processes). Participation in each other's supervision missions (between the Bank and IFAD) or at least regular contact and sharing of experience and key issues would be valuable.	development through the Centres for Learning on Evaluation and Results (CLEAR).	
Kyrgyz Republic	NEN	PPA	5	IFAD	STR	TGT		Ensure adequate diagnostic poverty and gender analysis and sound targeting strategies in the design stage, and monitor the implementation of the strategies (paragraph 58, 120-124. 145). This is a broad recommendation presented to IFAD, in particular in cofinanced/co-designed projects with one common and integral design with one project document. It is important that sufficient budget be allocated for IFAD's participation (country programme managers, other IFAD staff or consultants) in design, supervision and implementation support missions, mid-term review and project completion report preparation to ensure that issues of concern to IFAD are addressed and followed up, even in cofinanced projects supervised by another organization.	Project designs now place close attention to targeting and to the risk of leakage of benefits. IFAD project supervision missions now systematically check on the effectiveness of project targeting strategies and recommend remedial action where necessary. Where necessary, capacity building is provided to PMU staff as part of IFAD's implementation support. Additionally, future investments will undertake gender sensitive poverty and livelihoods analysis at design; for ongoing investments, Gender Action Plans have been initiated to better mainstream gender issues and their monitoring during implementation.	F
China: Environment conservation and poverty-reduction programme in Ninxia and Shanxi - Project Performance Assessment										
China	APR	PPA	1	CTRY	STR	TGT		Targeting. Continue focus on chronic poverty and ethnic minorities, but develop more sophisticated strategies to ensure that the economically active poor benefit. With its specific focus on smallholders and ethnic minorities, IFAD has been well placed with ECPRPNS and other programmes that	According to the targeting strategy of the new COSOP 2016-2020 (approved in September 2016), IFAD will focus on poor areas but with a production potential. However, it should be noted that targeting areas that are both potentially productive and environmentally fragile may not be	F

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2017 Follow Up	Status
								target the chronic poor in remote and ecologically fragile areas. The rapidly changing social and economic context means that IFAD has to adjust its approach in targeting the rural poor, building on what has worked well before. Since chronic poverty is persistent, IFAD should maintain a focus on areas that have a potential for agricultural production, but are environmentally fragile and mainly inhabited by ethnic minorities. Targeting of those areas needs to ensure strategic fit with the LGOP's approach of targeting poor areas, to avoid redundancy and to ensure IFAD's added value.	systematically pursuable, as the areas with potential in agricultural production are not necessarily the most remote and ecologically fragile. And, vice-versa, the ecologically fragile areas do not necessarily have a high potential for agricultural production.	
China	APR	PPA	2	CTRY	STR	TGT		For socioeconomic targeting, IFAD should adopt more sophisticated analytical tools that are able to capture the increasing differentiation within the rural population. In the case of a rapidly changing rural population, specific strategies are needed to target unskilled youth, returning migrants and female farmers. IFAD's targeting approach should be informed by the available body of poverty analysis produced by World Bank and national think tanks.	For its targeting strategy, IFAD relies extensively on National Poor Registration System, a national computerized database management system that collects data on all the remaining poor people in the country, and classify them according to the causes of their poverty, thus allowing accurate targeting and tailored poverty reduction measures.	F
China	APR	PPA	3	CTRY	STR	PAR		Partnerships. Stronger engagement in partnerships, to improve performance on the ground and learn from partners' experience. IFAD should not be complacent with what it has achieved in China. This PPA has shown that IFAD needs to strengthen its engagement and presence on the ground, to improve performance and impact of its operations. A more strategic approach partnership will be a key aspect of this engagement. The PPA offers the following three specific	Partnership is recognized as a critical element for successful delivery in the new COSOP (2016-2020). A number of initiatives to enhance the partnership with key in-country partners have been taken in the past 2-3 years (e.g. strengthening collaboration/partnership with IPRCC, increasing engagement with FECC, exploring opportunities for partnerships with the other RBAs, and with universities and research centers (CASS, CAU), etc.). In 2016, a tripartite MoU with MOF and MOA	F

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2017 Follow Up	Status
								recommendations with this regard	<p>has been signed, and a joint MOA-RBA Roundtable has been organized; in 2013, a letter of intent has been signed with CADFund.</p> <p>However - to keep the level of expectations in this area at a realistic level - it is important to highlight that the current capacity of the ICO is one CPO and two ACPOs. The CPM for China (under recruitment) will be out posted as the host country agreement has been signed with China. This is expected to improve partnership building at the country level.</p>	
China	APR	PPA	4	CTRY	OPER	PAR		<p>Beyond programme supervision. Provide adequate levels of technical support and link programme partners for mutual support and learning. Even in a country as large and complex as China, IFAD has to build and maintain a large number of partnerships at national and provincial levels. In the case of ECPRPNS, IFAD has struggled to maintain adequate levels and quality of technical support throughout the implementation period and with regard to specialist issues (e.g. rural credit, cooperatives, participation and M&E). IFAD needs to have sufficient capacity on the ground to engage in a continuous dialogue with provincial-level partners and have a sufficiently large pool of consultants to mobilize appropriate levels of specialist inputs when needed. IFAD should also pay attention to maintaining partnerships that have been built in earlier programmes, such as ECPRPNS, and that could inform ongoing initiatives. It should support networking and exchange among programme partners, for</p>	<p>IFAD has a large pool of both national and international consultants that can be mobilized to provide adequate level of technical inputs, when required. IFAD can also count on increased technical support from PTA, and increased collaboration with FAO/TCI. Over the past couple of years, IFAD has encouraged and facilitated projects' peer-to-peer and mentoring mechanisms, and organized annual events (e.g. workshops and/or portfolio reviews) to facilitate networking and cross-fertilization of experiences and lessons.</p>	F

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2017 Follow Up	Status
								lessons learning and peer support, for example during mission wrap-ups and annual COSOP review.		
China	APR	PPA	5	CTRY	OPER	KM		Learning and knowledge. Critically review and share good practices from ECPRPNS in cooperation with Ministry of Finance, Ministry of Agriculture and LGOP. The programme set out to test new approaches to address critical environmental-poverty linkages. The Ministry of Finance should be encouraged to document and review the unique experiences and practices of ECPRPNS and other projects in cooperation with the Ministry of Agriculture. Furthermore, IFAD should carefully review and evaluate new practices before recommending them for scale up. For example, a number of approaches that were hailed as innovative or successful by the programme, were found to be less effective by this PPA (e.g. the cooperatives, the micro-credit approach and the participatory approach). They should be critically reviewed before disseminating them as good practices. In addition, IFAD should encourage the Ministry of Finance to support the documentation and sharing of programme lessons experiences in cooperation with the Ministry of Agriculture and the International Poverty Reduction Center in China, e.g. through a national workshop or conference.	Lessons and experiences from ECPRPNS, as well as from other past project, are systematically captured in the design of new projects. The results of the PPA were also presented to MOF.	F
China	APR	PPA	6	CTRY	STR	PAR		Strategic partnerships. Build strategic partnerships to (a) ensure strategic fit with what others are doing and avoid duplication; (b) share good practices and learn from what has worked elsewhere; and (c) benefit from specialist expertise.	Partnership is recognized as a critical element for successful delivery in the new COSOP (2016-2020). A number of initiatives to enhance the partnership with key in-country partners have been taken in the past 2-3 years (e.g. strengthening	F

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2017 Follow Up	Status
								Engaging on poverty reduction in a middle-income country provides particular opportunities and challenges. After most bilateral donors have withdrawn their support from China, IFAD, together with the World Bank, has a unique opportunity to become an influential voice for the sustainable transformation of agriculture with a particular focus on smallholders and ethnic minorities. This PPA supports the earlier recommendation of the CPE that IFAD should pursue strategic partnerships with national and international organizations active in the rural sector for knowledge sharing and, where appropriate, for cooperative approaches in implementation (e.g. for supervision) with the purpose of mutual learning and improved flow of information and specialist inputs to IFAD-supported programmes. In particular, the World Bank's current initiative to support cooperatives in rural China will be of interest for IFAD. Furthermore, IFAD should seek strategic fit with the LGOP's Outline (2011).	collaboration/partnership with IPRCC, increasing engagement with FECC, exploring opportunities for partnerships with the other RBAs, and with universities and research centers (CASS, CAU), etc.). In 2016, a tripartite MoU with MOF and MOA has been signed, and a joint MOA-RBA Roundtable has been organized; in 2013, a letter of intent has been signed with CADFund. Furthermore, the COSOP 2011-2015 and 2016-2020 are fully aligned with and support LGOP's Outline 2011-2020.	
China	APR	PPA	7	IFAD	OPER	RME		Monitoring and evaluation. PMD should: (a) design key performance indicators that are linked to the intervention logic at realistic levels and that can actually be monitored and evaluated at programme level; (b) build on national data systems; and (c) secure credible data and statistics at the point of programme completion. The ECPRPNS provides a case for a programme where implementing partners were fully committed to implementing an extensive M&E system which still failed to deliver as a result of new approach (RIMS) being introduced at	As part of the Development Effectiveness Framework, a number of complementary initiatives are expected to improve M&E including (i) upgrading of the Results and Impact Management System (RIMS); (ii) improvement of key tools to measure and manage for results, including logical frameworks; (iii) establishment of processes to track results in real time through IT systems; and (v) use of broader impact assessments of IFAD activities to maximize learning. Under the same framework, IFAD is undertaking two complementary	O

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2017 Follow Up	Status
								an advanced point of implementation. Not only did the RIMS disrupt the existing M&E approach and ignored existing data sources, it also pointed the programme into a direction which made it impossible to evaluate its impact.	initiatives through grant funded programmes; the development of a tool that will be able to assess in country M&E systems and capacities and identify the gaps and develop action plans for strengthening the capacities and providing systematic capacity building in countries on M&E in rural development through the Centres for Learning on Evaluation and Results (CLEAR).	
Djibouti: Microfinance and microenterprise development project - Project Performance Assessment										
Only recommendations specifically addressed to IFAD have been listed below. Recommendation 2: Credit and savings policy has not been considered because addressed to the Government of Djibouti.										
Djibouti	NEN	PPA	1	CTRY	OPER	RFI		CSB financial sustainability. Interventions should focus on strengthening the CSBs so that they can better serve the target group. Capacity-building of the CSBs should be conducted through training, establishing realistic business plans and exchanging experiences on good practices in microfinance and microenterprise. Several factors can ensure financial sustainability, particularly a more framed credit and savings policy, and a more effective communication strategy. Similarly, it is necessary to diversify the financial and non-financial products of CSBs such as micro-insurance and equipment loans, especially for productive value chains. The organization of the CSB network should be gradual before reaching an autonomous apex organization whose legal form should be determined by the CSBs, the Government, the private sector, farmers' organizations and international ethical funds. IFAD needs to continue to invest in microfinance and microenterprise	This recommendation has been taken into account. IFAD has kept investing in microfinance (PRAREV has a specific sub-component), specifically to support the artisanal fishing production sector; IFAD is working through established CEPECs and working through regional networks and strengthening proximity of financial services. The micro-finance component of PRAREV is targeting fisherman but is coupled with a strong capacity building effort that would lead to realistic business plans and reducing the risk for the CPECs while strengthening the capacity of fisherman to pay back the loans and maintain a sustainable business model. PRAREV, is also working towards an increased and effective communication effort and to this effect clear micro-finance products were developed (example, Credit Darek) and are being communicated to fisherman. The PRAREV microfinance component is at pilot stage it will be evaluated at mid-term of the project in July 2017 and is likely to be scaled up.	F

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2017 Follow Up	Status
								because of its pioneering role in this sector, the interest shown by the various PDMM stakeholders, and the response to social demand of the poor.		
Djibouti	NEN	PPA	2	CTRY	STR	PRM		Sustainability of income-generating activities (IGA) and microenterprises. To direct loans to IGA and microenterprises linked to production sectors such as fishing, a pro-poor value chain approach should be encouraged. Cost-effective micro-enterprises that monitor production and marketing processes should be developed, especially for women's groups. Adequate support for IGA/Micro-enterprises is to be initiated in terms of HR, advisory support, training, and information of clients on promising markets. The awareness and communication campaigns to encourage savings towards CSBs must be differentiated by targeted clients. The scope of CSBs must be expanded to cover more beneficiaries and increase the supply of diverse financial services. Moreover, the structural investments made in the PDMM areas (port, railway, and road) should allow the creation of IGA/Micro-enterprises that will use the CSB services.	These recommendations were fully taken on board by PRAREV which is investing in the fisheries value chain in the country - the PRAREV investment targets fisherman associations and cooperatives, investing in infrastructure in Obock and Tadjourah (across the whole value chain from fishing to processing and cooling units etc.). Working with the CPECs the PRAREV is putting in place a pilot micro-credit component for which a detailed study was developed and a range of products are available. PRAREV is undertaking additional communication efforts and working directly with fishermen associations and cooperatives to facilitate access to micro-finance and to establish monitoring mechanisms of their performance.	F
Djibouti	NEN	PPA	3	CTRY	OPER	PMA		Socio-organizational aspects. The approach used by the PDMM to coordinate activities by a light managerial structure is to be replicated. This structure should look primarily to strategic and programming aspects and strategic partnerships to ensure sustainability.	The structure and approach were replicated in PRAREV for the implementation of the fishery micro-credit line. PRAREV is implementing this micro-finance component through the support of the external partner (ADDS) and the CPECs (Caisses populaires d'épargne et de crédit). The development of the credit line was performed by an external micro-credit expert who has undertaken a full assessment of the micro-finance context/market and	F

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2017 Follow Up	Status
									facilitated the development of adequate products (example Produit Darek). This has allowed the PRAREV to concentrate on programmatic and communication aspects in implementing the credit line and to concentrate on improving the managerial and technical capacities of the fishermen cooperatives and associations.	
Djibouti	NEN	PPA	4	CTRY	OPER	ORG		But the coordination of all activities related to microfinance and microenterprise should be strengthened and institutionalized. Viable solidarity groups should be developed in an endogenous and gradual manner to avoid any risk of implosion. Similarly, the grouping of structures (associations, cooperatives) should be gradual.	This was taken into account for the currently ongoing PRAREV project that is working towards the organisation and capacity building of fishermen cooperatives and associations. This entails capacity building in terms of organisation and production technologies. It is also investing in the women associations (such as the "mareyeuses"). PRAREV is helping these groups and training them in cooperatives management, cooperation spirit, equipment maintenance, basic accounting and formulating/implementing viable and simple business plans that can be funded by micro-finance institutions and run sustainably.	F
Ethiopia: Pastoral community development project II - Project Performance Assessment										
Ethiopia	ESA	PPA	1	PROJ	STR	DES		Local knowledge and social aspects. PCDDP III should pay due attention and better take into account local knowledge and social aspects in designing interventions and in adapting interventions to the needs and circumstances of the populations in pastoral areas. [...] Several components have been planned in for PCDDP III and should be duly supervised by IFAD. The Social Assessment Report prepared in 2013 for PCDDP III and the Regional Pastoral Livelihood Resilience Project supported by the World Bank states	PCDDP III is duly taking into account local knowledge and social aspects through its participatory, community-led approach in design and implementation. A social safeguards specialist ensures consistent attention to social aspects during the design and implementation of sub-projects under the CIF component, in line with the ESMF guidance. The community consultation process helps communities in identifying their own problems and prioritizing sub projects. Throughout the community consultation process and sub project	F

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2017 Follow Up	Status
								that a social development/safeguard specialist within the FPCU is required who will inter alia support the inclusion of social issues for both knowledge management and internal learning. The report also states that social ties and inter-ethnic relationship strategies to improve the utilization and management of rangeland should be strengthened. 'Unless there is a clear portfolio of research topics and agendas, professional bias will lead to the neglect of social issues and/or production of studies that have limited relevance for the formulation of new policies, adoption of new strategies and technologies and solving problems'. The PCDP III ESMF relevantly planned for 'a comprehensive social assessment to be carried out to identify specific issues related to land acquisition, loss of assets, loss of means of income and source of livelihoods or restriction of access to resources, and the project-affected people'. It furthermore states that 'to ensure that all environmental and social impacts have been identified and successfully mitigated and that the process for free, prior and informed consent to both Community Action Plans and Community Livelihood Plan has been properly followed'. In addition, this PPA sees possibilities adapting PCDP interventions using local knowledge and participatory approaches.	implementation, due consideration has been given to all sectors of the community (disable, poor, women, youth, pure pastoralist, agro pastoralist, etc). This is regularly checked by the social safeguard specialist recruited at federal level and the four specialists at regional level, and evaluated by Joint Review and Implementation Support Missions conducted by the World Bank, IFAD and the government every six months. In addition, the project facilitates the dialogue between pastoral and agro-pastoral communities with sedentary sections of the society and supported the development of integrated natural resource management plans. Through this process, 40 different medium size NRM sub projects have been completed, benefiting more than 30,000 households. The specific activities of these projects are: (i) Bush encroachment control activities in 16,519 hectares, (ii) Establishment of 15 seed and seedling production centers, (iii) Distribution of 2,665,200 forage tree seedlings; (iv) Integrated Soil & water conservation activities in more than 300 hectares of land, and (v) Conservation of indigenous dry season fodder/food tree/shrubs species mainly Cordeauxia Edulis (Ye'eb) - planting of 4,994 Ye'eb trees on more than 20 hectares of land to benefit 5,000 HHs.	
Ethiopia	ESA	PPA	2	PROJ	OPER	NRM		Environmental effects and climate change. Visits of a representative sample of PCDP interventions by environmental specialists to review positive and negative effects on the environment would be required to	The environmental safeguard specialist reviews the environmental impacts of PCDP interventions as part of his TOR. Under PCDP II, all DPSIP sub projects have impact assessment studies. These have	F

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2017 Follow Up	Status
								have a better view on impacts and decide if more systematic screening is warranted. This will also enable to mitigate possible problems, also in liaison with other public services in charge. The ESMF for PCDP III states that it covers Rural Livelihood Program but 'does not take into consideration impacts that might have occurred because of implementation of large infrastructure development activities related to DPSIP under PCDP II as these activities are no more part of PCDP III. These should, however, be covered by the World Bank-financed Regional Pastoral Livelihood Resilience Programme which scales up the DPSIP.	been subject to review and No Objection by the World Bank.	
Ethiopia	ESA	PPA	3	PROJ	OPER	NRM		Furthermore, to fully take into account effects on the environment, PCDP III should collaborate with and be in line with projects having specific expertise such as the Government Sustainable Land Management Programme which plans to extend its work to the Arid and semi-Arid regions of Ethiopia. As this programme is also supported by IFAD and the World Bank, cooperation should be easier.	The expansion of SLMP has not yet progressed as expected by the IOE mission, in view of concerns by some key donors, regarding adaptation of the approach to the lowlands, and complementarity/possible duplication with the existing programmes in this region. A study has been designed to provide the elements for a decision on the way forward, which is expected to be carried out soon. Hence, so far there was little opportunity for the suggested collaboration between PCDP III and SLMP. In addition to the technical support given by the environment and social safeguard specialists, PCDP establishing a relationship with the respective regional environmental authorities. PCDP III funded sub-projects are small in size and are managed by the communities themselves and hence their adverse effect to the environment is minimal.	O
Ethiopia	ESA	PPA	4	PROJ	OPER	SUS		Sustainability of benefits. To ensure	The sustainability of PCDP sub	F

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2017 Follow Up	Status
								the level of satisfaction of the past beneficiaries is maintained, and to make sure that the interventions undertaken are sustained, PCDP III should systematically revisit PCDP I and II kebeles, together with the concerned local services related to the other Ministries such as the Ministry of Agriculture, Ministry of Education, Ministry of Health etc. to remediate cases where interventions are not used or functioning as they should.	projects is assured through the beneficiary communities' ownership. The project provides the required training for the oversight committee who overlooks the functionality of the sub projects on behalf of the respective communities. Once the sub projects are completed, the project proceeds with an official handover to the respective sector offices at district level which allocate recurrent cost and the required man power. Based on the project's assessment, all PCDP I & II sub projects are delivering the intended services, and the required maintenance is managed by the respective district level sector offices and beneficiary communities.	
Ethiopia	ESA	PPA	5	CTRY	STR	BEN		Ensure that mobility of pastoralists is maintained and not constrained. [...] The PPA's view is that the pastoral populations should have free and informed choice in pursuing a mobile way of life or in settling partially or fully. A basic underpinning of CDD is the choice and decision making process by the concerned communities. PCDP should enhance possibilities which maintain pastoral mobility. The PPA concurs with a two pronged approach, also advocated by others: on one hand facilitating the succession of pastoralism into agropastoral system and non-agricultural activities, on the other supporting mobile pastoralism for situations in which the level of aridity and fragility of the ecology is not suitable for crop farming due to lack of water. This requires delineating pastoral areas along with a dry season grazing territory and clear land policy that ensures collective tenure security.	The community-led approach of PCDP indeed gives a free and informed choice to the benefitting communities, including pastoralists regarding their mobility. While agropastoral farming systems are supported through numerous water-related projects, rangeland management plans have been developed through consultative processes, leading to broad consensus by the affected communities, to ensure sustainable land use in the arid areas. With regard to the need for policies which safeguard pastoralists' entitlement to land, as well as recognizing pastoralism as a legitimate way of life, the Prime Minister emphasized at the recent Pastoral Day, that the GOE has indeed no intention to settle the pastoral community, but to support mobile production systems for greater resilience. Under the policy implementation gap study, the	F

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2017 Follow Up	Status
								There is a need for policies which safeguard pastoralists' entitlement to land, as well as recognising pastoralism as a legitimate way of life that needs support to become more productive and resilient to external shocks. In relation to PCDP interventions, this encompasses solutions such as adaptation of the schooling calendar to match the seasonal needs for children to help in herding; offering the possibility to pursue schooling in different locations during the year; providing similar basic services along well known migration routes; ensuring peace agreements between clans and tribes when migrations involve crossing into other's territory; preservation of nutritive local fodder species that are becoming extinct.	Oromia Region has undertaken a study on "The relevance of primary school calendar in the context of pastoralists: The case of Oromia pastoralists" during the ongoing fiscal year. The study was validated in a workshop and endorsed by the regional steering committee (which includes sector bureau heads, including the Education Bureau).	
Ethiopia	ESA	PPA	6	CTRY	STR	DIA		Engage in an open dialogue and collaboration. The targeted communities and the project impact will also greatly benefit from an open exchange of experiences with other concerned Ministries and departments and stakeholders, on the basis of better evidence and of learning from positive experiences in pastoral development elsewhere. The process of learning visits to pastoral situations in West and East Africa is a case in point. 40 PCDP, with support from the World Bank and IFAD, should pro-actively collaborate with other concerned Government Ministries, researchers, development partners and actors, sharing its wealth of experiences and results. It is also recommended that the Ministry of Agriculture be closely involved in PCDP III. PCDP should also engage openly, based on evidence, in	In December 2016, a member of the PCU of PCDP, and a representative of a local pastoralists' organization attended a Regional Consultation Workshop on Economic empowerment of indigenous peoples, with a focus on women and youth, that was organized under the auspices of the International Work Group on Indigenous Affairs (IWGIA), supported by IFAD. A bi-annual knowledge sharing workshop is organized by the World Bank and IFAD country offices, where all projects/programs working in pastoral areas share their experience. Additionally, the Ministry of Federal and Pastoralist Development Affairs is initiating the establishment of a platform where pastoral issues will be discussed. Currently, the Ministry is developing pastoral development policies and strategies, through a process	O

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2017 Follow Up	Status
								discussing issues which are fundamental to the development of pastoral areas, even if some of the issues are difficult and controversial such as how best to use and manage natural resources in arid and semi-arid environments, and how to ensure security. Enhanced attention on rigorous monitoring and evaluation of effects of interventions will also be helpful and contribute to evidence based decisions. The Pastoralist working group at the Ministry of Agriculture would be one of the ideal forum for discussing and sharing. An enhanced learning attitude and openness will also lead to positive perceptions from development actors not involved in PCDP and better decisions and policies.	involving different government and non-government stakeholders.	
Mauritania: Oasis sustainable development programme - Project Performance Assessment										
Only recommendations specifically addressed to IFAD have been listed below. Recommendation 4: Sustainability of investments in the oases, maintenance and repairs has not been considered because addressed to the Government of Mauritania.										
Mauritania	WC A	PPA	1	CTRY	STR	DIA		Policy dialogue. PDDO took up the critically important challenge of obtaining the legal recognition needed by the AGPOs in order for them to act as the legal representatives of the oasis populations in the Government's process of decentralization to "commune" level. This evaluation mission agrees that it was not possible to address this challenge solely through the Oasis Consultation Forums (Cadres oasiens de concertation) envisaged at design. As a partner of Mauritania, IFAD is well placed to play an advocacy role in policy dialogue with the Government, the aim being to strengthen – both globally and with specific reference to their legal strategic positioning –	As mentioned at the time of the evaluation, IFAD is not working anymore in the North of the country where oasis are the main support of agricultural production. However, in PASK II area, some oasis do exist and as the project is managing a local fund to support collective infrastructures at communal level, AGPOs are involved in the committees wherever possible. In PRODEFI, forthcoming project, policy dialogue will be promoted through inter professional bodies in which Farmer Organisations will be actively involved, and in the case oasis, AGPOs will play a key role.	PA

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2017 Follow Up	Status
								the role of the AGPOs in the process of decentralization to the grass roots level in the oasis environment.		
Mauritania	WC A	PPA	2	CTRY	OPER	TCB		Consolidation of the capacities of the AGPOs. Continuing support is needed in order to strengthen the ability of the AGPOs and reinforce their structure so that they can manage their own development as demanding beneficiaries, rather than receiving beneficiaries.	Support will be provided in the context underlined above within IFAD project and by FADES through the national agency for Oasis Development.	F
Mauritania	WC A	PPA	3	PROJ	OPER	ASR		Knowledge of the water tables in the oases. One of the most crucial post-closure issues of PDDO concerns the need to rationalize the management of scarce water resources in the oases. A better understanding of the underground water resources is urgently needed in order to guide their exploitation and management and also to monitor the impact of drawdowns of water, the pace of which is rising quickly as increasingly powerful pumping systems are being introduced. It is recommended that the financing of pumping systems by FADES be made subject to the prior conduct of an in-depth study of their foreseeable impact on the available underground resources.	This was a recommendation to FADES that is still supporting the oasis development, and the national Agency for Oasis Development.	NA
Mauritania	WC A	PPA	4	CTRY	STR	RFI		Access to financial services. The MICOs are already playing a crucial role as stimulators of agricultural and other economic activities in the oases where they are located. However, their needs in terms of capacity-building remain important both for the individual MICOs and for the apex organization, UNMICO. There is considerable scope for improving the operations of the individual MICOs whose prospects for long-term viability will be heavily conditioned, in the short term, by immediate access to substantial technical and	A new CSN was approved in 2016; the feasibility of a rural finance project was assessed but it was jointly considered by the Mauritanian Government and IFAD that it was better to fund a new Value-chain project, PRODEFI. During PRODEFI design, the question of access to financial services was addressed. The team considered it was not advisable to support the MICOs that are not performing well. However as access to financial services is a key aspect of Value-Chain development, the Project Document includes a support	PA

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2017 Follow Up	Status
								financial support. In the longer term, IFAD and the Government should take the opportunity offered by the new COSOP to envisage support for the drafting of a strategy aimed at promoting access by rural dwellers to financial services and to examine the feasibility of a rural finance project.	to local groups of savings and credit in order to link in a second step producers to the banking system and support their investment in the VC. this approach will be assessed and documented in order to feed the national strategy on rural finance.	
India: Jharkhand-Chhattisgarh tribal development programme – Impact Evaluation										
India	APR	IE	1	CTRY	STR	TGT		Design for context (see paragraphs 316-317). All project designs should include a thorough poverty and institutional analysis, to ensure that objectives and design are commensurate with state-level capacities, systems and processes to ensure timely delivery and better impact. This will also assist in determining adequate targeting approaches which carefully differentiate among diverse poor social groups. For projects designed in fragile situations, a fragility analysis should also be standard practice of design.	Fully implemented. Under COSOP 2011-2016, all project design are based on a poverty and gender analysis to formulate the project poverty targeting and gender mainstreaming strategies, which are then further refined during implementation. The assessment of the State implementation capacities is also done. The JCTDP approach has also proved effective in conflict affected areas.	F
India	APR	IE	2	IFAD	OPER	DES		Moreover, projects should be exposed to continuous adjustments in design taking into account changing context or introduction of any pertinent new operational corporate policy in IFAD to ensure their continued relevance. This should especially be done for projects that have not yet crossed their mid-point in implementation duration.	Such adjustments are being implemented and JTELP, the successor project of JCTDP in Jharkhand, is a case in point. State Govt has requested to prioritize income generating activities and stronger convergence with the State flagship program for financial inclusion.	F
India	APR	IE	3	CTRY	STR	DES		Finally, projects covering two states under one loan should no longer be financed, unless there is a clear strategy for their integration and cross-fertilisation of lessons and enhanced budgets are allocated for supervision and implementation support.	Implementation on-going. A one loan two State project is currently under design for the North East region. It includes strong KM for integration, cross-fertilization and dissemination of good practices in managing shifting cultivation in upland areas in a sustainable manner. The project can subsequently be scaled up into a	O

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2017 Follow Up	Status
									programme for managing shifting cultivation in NE India.	
India	APR	IE	4	CTRY	STR	STRA		Convergence with government programmes (see paragraphs 321 and 322). It is recommended that all projects clarify how they are aligned with key national and state-level programmes in the agriculture and rural sectors. This is essential to ensure sustainability and can provide an opportunity for scaling up after the completion of IFAD-financed operations. The quest for better convergence, sustainability and scaling up will also require that projects implemented at the state level ensure that concerned technical ministries at the central level participate in their design and are involved in an appropriate manner throughout implementation.	This is standard practice under COSOP 2011-2016. This is well illustrated in JTELP, where NRM activities are funded through convergence with MGNREGA. JTELP and MGNREGA developed jointly standard operating procedures for convergence.	F
India	APR	IE	5	CTRY	STR	SUS		Sustainability strategy (see paragraphs 322). All IFAD-financed projects should be designed in such a way to ensure sustainability of benefits. In this regard, all projects in India and elsewhere should include in their financing agreement that an exit/sustainability strategy would be developed well before project closure, which would be agreed by IFAD and the Government. Such a strategy should clarify the roles and responsibilities of national and state governments, IFAD, communities, and other relevant partners. The strategy would also clarify how any needed recurrent costs would be met, to ensure that operations and maintenance especially of public good created during the investment phase are ensured.	The CPE confirmed that recent projects under COSOP 2011-2015, have addressed the social/institutional/economic dimensions of sustainability at the design stage. Each project design has a clear exit strategy and describes the sustainability of benefits. Exit strategy and sustainability are reflected in the PIM and addressed systematically during supervision. The issue of O&M costs is addressed systematically during supervision. The financing and project agreements do not currently include a specific provision for project exit strategy and sustainability. However, sustainability is an integral part of the Central and State Governments' assessment of project performance.	F
India	APR	IE	6	IFAD	OPER	RME		Monitoring and evaluation (see paragraphs 328). It is important that all IFAD supported projects are	IFAD enforced the formulation of the theory of change recently and made it a standard feature of the project	F

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2017 Follow Up	Status
								designed based on a theory of change to ensure better outcomes and facilitate monitoring and evaluation activities.	design report in 2015. All projects designed after 2015 comply with this provision. Through IFADs operations academy, staff have also received training on the theory of change and how to better reflect the theory of change in the design documents.	
India	APR	IE	7	IFAD	OPER	RME		Project should undertake baselines surveys as early as possible, and such surveys should include a properly selected control/comparison group to facilitate impact evaluations in the future. The Strategic Planning and Impact Assessment Division should be involved in the design of such surveys, for instance, by having a chance to comment on their terms of reference.	Currently baseline studies are completed within 3 years from entry into force. For more recent projects, such as OPELIP, the impact assessment is designed by the Research and Impact Assessment Division (RIA) of IFAD and will be completed within 18 months from entry into force. Support from RIA is being sought for the design of impact assessment studies for projects at starting stage and completion stage. Furthermore, with the revision to the RIMS, projects are no longer required to complete the RIMS baseline survey but must collect baselines for all indicators within the first year of project start up. This ensures that baselines are collected for the correct target groups in the areas. RIA is working as part of the interdepartmental/divisional working group on RIMS to roll out the revised RIMS and to work on further developing guidance for baselines.	O
India	APR	IE	8	IFAD	OPER	RME		The terms of reference of a member of supervision missions should explicitly include a comprehensive review of M&E systems and activities and provide recommendations to improve them, as needed.	The M&E is fully reviewed during each supervision mission and support is continuously provided on this subject by the ICO in India. During supervision M&E is assigned a rating which ensures that specific focus is given during supervision towards monitoring the progress of M&E activities and systems in the project.	F
India	APR	IE	9	IFAD	OPER	RME		The project completion report (PCRs) should be prepared in line with IFAD guidelines and the quality of the report and ratings of evaluation	The revised memo issued on project completion reporting in 2015 strengthened the role of internal and peer reviews through the CPMT	F

Country	Reg	Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2017 Follow Up	Status
								criteria covered should be exposed to a systematic peer review within PMD to ensure their objectivity and consistency with the narrative in the PCRs. A representative of the front office of PMD should be included in such peer review process.	(which includes participation from FMD, PTA and OPE) with the responsibility to assign ratings lying with the Divisions. This has resulted in a structured and more consistent quality assurance approach towards project completion reports with a robust self-assessment of project results. Every PCR is reviewed by OPE to ensure consistency and validation between the ratings and the supporting narrative in the document	
India	APR	IE	10	IFAD	OPER	RME		The logical framework should be used more proactively as a basis for ongoing monitoring of achievements, and for introducing any adjustments for better effectiveness.	Under the DEF approved by the EB, Management has initiated a number of reforms to the self evaluation architecture to anchor results throughout the project cycle and more systematically use the LogFrame as a management tool. The new operational results management system that is being developed and will be rolled out by the end of 2017 heavily relies on the more proactive use of the logframe to track progress against results. Additionally in India, the logframe is systematically reviewed in each supervision mission. The supervision missions systematically report against progress in achieving the projects outcomes and outputs.	F

Historic Follow up from 2016

Corporate Level Evaluation - Fragile and conflict-affected states and situations

Corporate Level Evaluation - Fragile and conflict-affected states and situations									
Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme		Recommendation	2016 Follow Up	2017 Follow Up	Status
						Policy and strategy			
CLE	1	IFAD	STR	STRA		<p>Draft an overarching corporate policy statement including a new definition that sets out the principles for IFAD's approach to engagement with fragile and conflict-affected states and subnational situations. As part of the policy, clearly define the development threshold that will assist staff in determining the fragility situation in particular countries or regions, allowing them to design operations using appropriate tools and instruments. This policy statement should be approved by the Board and consider the major issues identified in this evaluation.</p>	<p>This is ongoing: the approach to IFAD's strategy for engagement in countries with fragile situations was presented to the Evaluation Committee in March and the Executive Board in April 2016. The new approach draws on existing strengths and develops differentiated approaches for countries with fragile situations. The final strategy will build on feedback provided by the EC/ EB and be submitted in December 2016 as part of the corporate paper on MICs, PBAS, fragility and decentralization.</p>	<p>The broad recommendation has been addressed. The IFAD Strategy for Engagement in Countries with Fragile Situations was submitted to, and approved by, the December 2016 Executive Board (EB-2016-119-R.4). The strategy included a new definition, guiding principles for IFAD's engagement, a new classification with clear thresholds/ criteria to identify the countries with the most fragile situations, and new operational approaches for addressing fragility in these contexts. Overall, the evaluation recommended differentiated approaches to fragile situations: this was addressed in the strategy, with guiding principles and approaches outlined. In terms of operationalizing these approaches, guidelines will be developed by OPE over 2017. Also in terms of differentiation through financing, the PBAS reforms will ensure enhanced resources (currently the latest PBAS draft version allocates an additional 3-5% resources to countries with the most fragile situations).</p>	F

Corporate Level Evaluation - Fragile and conflict-affected states and situations									
Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme		Recommendation	2016 Follow Up	2017 Follow Up	Status
CLE	2	IFAD	STR	STRA		Adopt a simpler approach to classification of countries with fragile situations, which is specific to IFAD's mandate and priorities. The country's policy and institutional capacity should be among the most fundamental criteria considered in the new classification system.	This has been addressed in the approach paper. IFAD is moving from a harmonized list of 'fragile states' to an IFAD-specific definition and classification of countries with 'fragile situations'. Institutional capacity is a key element of the new index proposed to classify countries with fragile situations (the other two elements being vulnerability and conflict).	This has been addressed. The final strategy includes a new classification to identify the countries with the most fragile situations. The new index covers conflict-related indicators and indicators related to institutional capacity. The index was developed incorporating feedback from the Board and Evaluation Committee.	F
CLE	3	IFAD	STR	COS		Strengthen the fragility and conflict analysis in the COSOP through the provision of greater resources and by building more explicitly on the analysis by partner IFIs and United Nations organizations in these countries. More frequent updating is desirable to enable IFAD to manage the strategy more effectively. Future COSOPs should include budget estimates for achieving agreed-upon objectives.	This has been addressed in the approach paper. The paper suggests fragility analysis in all COSOPs and CSNs. Such analysis will be undertaken for country programmes in the most fragile situations, and draw on assessments undertaken by development partners and governments themselves. For other countries, the extent of fragility analysis undertaken during COSOP/CSN preparation will be determined by the Country Programme Management Team. Pipeline projects expected to be implemented in more fragile situations within less fragile countries will be flagged and deeper analysis undertaken during project design.	This has been addressed. The new strategy suggests fragility analysis in COSOPs and CSNs. As stated earlier, the strategy recommends that such analysis be undertaken for country programmes in the most fragile situations, and draw on assessments undertaken by development partners and governments themselves. As indicated in the strategy implementation plan, this will be integrated into appropriate guidelines by PMD/ OPE. (Overall, the development of specific guidelines for assessments/ integrating fragility in operational tools is being undertaken by OPE, with the process underway.)	F
						Project and programme design			
CLE	4	IFAD	STR	DES		Programme design needs to identify where IFAD can engage and where it cannot. In countries with subnational fragile situations, where basic security requirements do not preclude IFAD's involvement, IFAD needs to decide whether to engage or not based on the potential for impact on rural poverty.	This has been recommended in the approach paper. If approved in the strategy, additional criteria tools will be developed to determine operational engagement or withdrawal. Resilient delivery models – drawing on models that have proved effective in country programmes in fragile situations- will	The issue of sub-national fragility has been incorporated in the strategy, that recognises that social, economic and institutional disruptions at a subnational level may have implications for communities, infrastructure, governance, minority rights and service provision. IFAD will	F

Corporate Level Evaluation - Fragile and conflict-affected states and situations									
Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme		Recommendation	2016 Follow Up	2017 Follow Up	Status
							enable IFAD to stay engaged and continue implementation in difficult contexts. Risk management will also extend to IFAD and project staff and their security, with clear criteria for operational engagement or withdrawal.	conduct fragility assessments in project areas that could experience symptoms of fragility not necessarily faced at the national level. The issue of whether to engage or not in a particular situation (through an assessment of potential benefits and security or other risks) is reviewed by the Country Program Management Teams (CPMT) in CPMT reviews at the different stages of the review process such as concept note submission, QE submission and QA submission.	
CLE	5	IFAD	OPER	DES		Include simple objectives and design, taking into account the country's policy and institutional context, and devote greater attention to ensuring customization of development approaches (e.g. to gender equality and women's empowerment) depending on the context.	This is suggested in the approach paper and will be recommended in the strategy. Following approval of the strategy, a series of knowledge products could be produced, providing guidance to country teams on designing simple, appropriate and resilient projects for fragile situations, as well as to quality enhancement/quality assurance reviewers on key issues.	This has been suggested as a key operational approach in the strategy. This is also in line with recent IFAD thinking on simplification of project design for greater effectiveness. Going ahead, these principles will be considered in IFAD review and monitoring processes. Guidelines will be developed over 2017 by OPE and the Quality Assurance team.	O
CLE	6	IFAD	STR	BEN		In countries experiencing weak institutional capacity and poor governance, IFAD can build on current practices of working with local communities, farmer organizations and lower levels of government dealing with service delivery.	The approach paper has addressed this recommendation, to be finalised in the strategy. IFAD engagement in fragile situations is already oriented towards strengthening community and government institutions, particularly at the local level. These include farmers' organizations, indigenous peoples' organizations, women's associations, water users' associations, and other community-level institutions as well as local government agencies and service providers. The strategy will leverage IFAD's reputation as a trusted partner of governments and rural	This has been addressed in the strategy. A key guiding principle is 'Building institutions, trust and social cohesion'. The approach will cover building accountability and amplifying the voices of women and marginalized groups and their organizations. These include farmers' organizations, indigenous peoples' organizations, women's associations, water users' associations, and other community-level and government institutions. IFAD will work through such trust-building	F

Corporate Level Evaluation - Fragile and conflict-affected states and situations									
Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme		Recommendation	2016 Follow Up	2017 Follow Up	Status
							communities to strengthen social cohesion among different stakeholders across social, economic, ethnic, political and other divides.	institutions in the most fragile situations.	
						Project and Programme implementation			
CLE	7	IFAD	STR	SUP		Expand direct supervision and implementation support in quantity and technical content, ensuring allocation of corresponding budgets based on needs rather than on pre-determined allocations by project. Technical staff from IFAD's Policy and Technical Advisory Division should further expand their participation in such processes as well as in COSOP and project designs.	The approach paper suggests differentiated approaches to supervision/ implementation support. As per the approach paper, '30. Supervision and implementation support are of key importance in fragile situations from a risk management perspective, ensuring that fiduciary safeguards are being implemented, guiding the application of flexible approaches to project management to address dynamic fragility contexts and providing necessary additional support to implementing agencies. They also present key opportunities to build trust with project teams, beneficiaries, partners and government officials. IFAD's focus on supervision and implementation support for problem projects already targets many projects in fragile situations. A future differentiated approach would aim to maximize both support to problem projects, and learning opportunities from successful projects in fragile situations.' With regard to additional budgets, the approach paper suggests additional resources for programmes in fragile	The strategy also clearly suggests differentiated supervision and implementation support. From the strategy (annex I, para 8): 'Supervision and implementation support are of key importance in fragile situations from a risk management perspective, as they guide the application of flexible approaches. Supervision guidelines already assess key issues that affect project outcomes in MFS such as: (i) drivers and consequences of fragility; (ii) institutional capacity; and (iii) gender and targeting in fragile contexts. These will be highlighted and extra focus added in MFS projects. Furthermore, specific procedures will be developed for remote supervision (in areas where supervision activities are not feasible due to conflict, or for other access issues). Some of these flexible practices have already been implemented in very fragile contexts. In terms of choice of partners, in extremely fragile situations such as Somalia (which	0

Corporate Level Evaluation - Fragile and conflict-affected states and situations									
Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme		Recommendation	2016 Follow Up	2017 Follow Up	Status
							<p>situations. The modality and structure for additional resources will be developed as the strategy is developed (in alignment with other corporate processes such as the PBAS reform). As stated in the approach paper, 'IFAD will explore how fragility could be incorporated into the PBAS, while retaining the system's foundations as a performance-based model. The option of creating a specific "crisis response window" (or similar) will be considered as a way of establishing an additional source of financing. IFAD will also review options to give Member States and other partners the opportunity to provide IFAD with financing earmarked for fragile situations through complementary or supplementary financing windows and to further leverage remittance flows for investment.'</p>	<p>is often at the bottom of global lists on fragility and conflict-related instability), IFAD has partnered with the private sector because this is sometimes the only type of partner willing to engage in such contexts. In Mali, IFAD chose to work with the World Health Organization given the urgent need for health services. In terms of procedures and processes, in conflict-hit Yemen IFAD is ensuring continued support; likewise, in Sierra Leone during the Ebola outbreak, IFAD provided undiminished support, including through remote supervision. IFAD has also developed differentiated procedures for results measurement and M&E, with many projects in fragile situations covered by geo-referencing programmes to assess project progress. A geo-referencing study of the entire country of Iraq has just been finalized with WFP.' In addition, PTA staff are now included in virtually all CPMTs covering the design process, and reviewing most crucial project milestones. Participation in missions by PTA staff in fragile and non-fragile situations is encouraged to the extent possible, given resources available. The development of updated supervision guidelines, including aspects related to fragility, is underway in the OPE division.</p>	
CLE	8	IFAD	STR	FLD		Explicitly prioritize the establishment of new IFAD country	This is ongoing: currently over half the ICOs are in countries with fragile	As stated, this is ongoing. Fragility is a key dimension in the	O

Corporate Level Evaluation - Fragile and conflict-affected states and situations									
Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme		Recommendation	2016 Follow Up	2017 Follow Up	Status
						offices and out-posting of CPMs in countries affected by fragility and conflict.	situations (as per the current list).	development and vision of the decentralization plan.	
CLE	9	IFAD	STR	PAR		Create strategic partnerships to leverage complementary skills and provide a higher level and broader basis of implementation support.	This is addressed in the approach paper and will be part of the final strategy. As stated in the approach paper, 'The specific importance of partnership in fragile situations warrants its inclusion as a guiding principle. Partnerships help IFAD to manage risks and enable it to stay engaged in more challenging contexts because they provide the means to address root causes of fragility that lie outside IFAD's areas of comparative advantage but pose a threat to IFAD's country programmes. IFAD's use of partnerships in fragile situations will be guided by the IFAD Partnership Strategy (2012). Partnerships with the Rome-based agencies and other United Nations agencies will receive particular attention in fragile situations, as will partnerships with other development partners with strong implementing capacity, such as trusted civil society organizations and the private sector. Partnerships with humanitarian agencies are key to bridging the humanitarian-development gap.'	This is a key principle in the strategy, and also being implemented through different initiatives in IFAD. As per the strategy (para 18e): 'Strategic and complementary partnerships. Partnerships help IFAD to manage risks and enable it to stay engaged in more challenging contexts because they provide the means to address root causes of fragility that lie outside IFAD's areas of comparative advantage. IFAD's use of partnerships in fragile situations will be guided by the IFAD Partnership Strategy. Partnerships with the Rome-based agencies (RBAs), IFIs and other international agencies will be prioritized, as will partnerships with other development partners with strong implementing capacity, such as trusted civil society organizations. The memorandum of understanding recently established between IFAD and the World Food Programme (WFP) in Sudan is an example of such a partnership. When feasible, IFAD could explore strategic partnerships with the private sector, in line with its Private-Sector Strategy. Partnerships with humanitarian agencies as well as civil society will be key to bridging the humanitarian-development gap. In all cases, IFAD will ensure sequencing and segregation of responsibilities to ensure that	F

Corporate Level Evaluation - Fragile and conflict-affected states and situations									
Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme		Recommendation	2016 Follow Up	2017 Follow Up	Status
								IFAD focuses only on development financing.'	
						Empowerment of staff			
CLE	10	IFAD	STR	HR		Efforts should be made to introduce specific incentives for staff working in fragile states and conflict-affected situations, including those based in headquarters discharging similar functions. Greater attention to capacity-building and training needs of staff should also be explicitly promoted, and platforms for exchanging knowledge, good practices and experiences of working in fragile states (across regional divisions) should be introduced.	This has been addressed in the approach paper, especially through non-financial incentives. As per the paper, '36. Human resource management and empowerment of staff are the subject of recommendations in the CLE on fragile states and play a key role in IFAD's organizational and operational resilience. The Human Resources Division (HRD) will contribute to developing IFAD's strategy for engagement in countries with fragile situations and Management will review incentives for staff working in fragile situations, whether based in headquarters or in ICOs, on the principle that willingness to work in countries with fragile situations should be rewarded, recognizing the benefits such experience brings to the institution. Such incentives would be of a non-financial nature and take into consideration issues such as security and broader concerns about staff well-being and career development.'	This has been addressed in the strategy. Based on the availability of resources, incentives will be provided to staff working in the most fragile situations. From the strategy (annex I, para 21-23): 21. Human resource management and empowerment of staff (both international and local) play a key role in IFAD's organizational resilience. IFAD will assign specific resources to support staff members operating in fragile situations in preparing for their work environment and to facilitate their professional development. Capacity-building will cover project management, risk management (how to foresee, mitigate and plan for contextual risks impacting IFAD projects), budget management in fragile contexts, partnership-building (managing partnerships in a rapidly changing environment) and security training. Staff working in fragile	F

Corporate Level Evaluation - Fragile and conflict-affected states and situations									
Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme		Recommendation	2016 Follow Up	2017 Follow Up	Status
								<p>situations will be coached in how to handle specific challenges. For all training activities, as per the decentralization framework, opportunities for ICOs will be prioritized.</p> <p>22. Along with these elements, a comprehensive review of IFAD's duty of care for staff members working in such situations will be undertaken to ensure the appropriateness of IFAD's medical coverage schemes in extreme conditions. The specific circumstances of local staff members should be considered, especially when situations could lead to suspension of operations.</p> <p>23. IFAD will review the application of the performance management framework for staff working in fragile versus non-fragile situations, ensuring that objective-setting and performance evaluation in fragile situations are based on realistic expectations and provide the flexibility to recognize when changes in the external risk environment have made agreed objectives unfeasible. Setting, monitoring and assessment of staff objectives will take account of the serious contextual challenges. Expertise gained from working in fragile situations will facilitate career development (e.g. such experience will be recognized in recruitment processes). Also, mobility will be ensured for international staff posted in MFS after a determined period.'</p>	

Corporate Level Evaluation - Fragile and conflict-affected states and situations									
Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme		Recommendation	2016 Follow Up	2017 Follow Up	Status
						Results Measurement			
CLE	11	IFAD	STR	RME		Plan and resource project monitoring and evaluation more selectively. Greater attention needs to be paid to planning for monitoring and evaluation during project design. At present, the approach is one size fits all. All projects should be required to defend their design with proven evidence from earlier phases or other locations that the intervention will work in the planned context. Where evidence is lacking, contexts are different or where a project is an acknowledged innovation or pilot, monitoring and evaluation will require more resources.	M&E will be addressed through an ongoing series of reforms across the self-evaluation system, including updating completion and supervision guidelines, updating the RIMS framework and guidelines, developing new country strategy guidance, and developing an M&E curriculum. These changes are being implemented under an overall self-evaluation reform process. These changes will improve M&E processes and systems across the portfolio, including the countries with fragile situations. In addition, given the institutional constraints in these countries, IFAD will encourage impact assessment methodologies that are simple and cost-effective but capable of capturing coherent results data in fragile situations.	M&E reform and strengthening is ongoing through a series of interlinked processes as stated earlier. As stated, these include updating completion and supervision guidelines, updating the RIMS framework and guidelines, developing new country strategy guidance, and developing an M&E curriculum. These changes are being implemented under an overall self-evaluation reform process.	O
CLE	12	IFAD	STR	RME		Revise IFAD's results measurement framework to include indicators of outcomes related to fragility. The major gaps lie in measuring women's empowerment and institutional performance. Indicators and means of measurement need to be established in both areas.	See response above. In the overall M&E framework, gender indicators and markers have been integrated across the project cycle. In addition, institutional performance is a key element of analysis in fragile situations. After the approval of the strategy, detailed indicators if required will be developed. Based on feedback received during the April EB, gender will be integrated as a key principle of the strategy. If required, additional indicators will be developed for programmes in fragile situations.	See response above. In the overall M&E framework, gender indicators and markers have been integrated across the project cycle. For all projects in fragile situations (and non-fragile situations), IFAD will measure women's empowerment and gender mainstreaming and effect on institutions through the results measurement framework across the project cycle. For ongoing projects, all projects will measure "gender focus" and "effectiveness of targeting approach" as outlined in the project status report. At completion, projects will report on and measure "gender equality and women's empowerment" and "targeting and outreach". All output- and outcome-level data	F

Corporate Level Evaluation - Fragile and conflict-affected states and situations									
Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme		Recommendation	2016 Follow Up	2017 Follow Up	Status
								will be presented on a gender-disaggregated basis. Similarly, indicators related to institutional strengthening and sustainability have been incorporated through the project cycle in fragile situations: 'institution building' as a separate indicator during implementation, also included as a dimension of sustainability; 'institutions and policies' as a specific impact indicator at completion.	

Corporate Level Evaluation: Replenishments

Corporate Level Evaluation: Replenishments									
Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme		Recommendation	2016 Follow Up	2017 Follow Up	Status
CLE	1	IFAD	OPER	REPL		Building on the experience in previous replenishments, more time should be devoted to discussing development results including the MTR, ARRI and relevant independent evaluations.	The Synthesis of Lessons Learned from the IFAD9 Impact Assessment Initiative was presented to the Evaluation Committee in March and to the EB in April. This impact assessment is a milestone for IFAD10, it lays a scientific basis for assessing the impact of IFAD9 and draws key lessons for the design and implementation of projects. This work is a major contribution to improving our results and impact in IFAD10 and beyond.	The IFAD11 Consultation dedicated the first day of the two day session to the discussion of the MTR. This included IOE presentation on its Annual Report and Results and Impact of IFAD Operations Evaluated in 2015 (ARRI). The third session of the Consultation will be informed of IOEs findings on IFAD's decentralization experience and on IFAD's performance-based allocation system, including Management's response thereto. Furthermore, the lessons learned from the IFAD9 Impact Assessment Initiative have been taken into account when designing IFAD's new Development Effectiveness Framework (DEF) that improves the focus on results. The DEF has been presented to the Board in December 2016 and includes actions to systematically improve results measurement, strengthen accountability and harvest lessons and evidence from projects. Further, the approach to measuring impact has been incorporated into new impact indicators that form part of revised RMF and targets for new impact indicators which were verbally presented to the Board.	F

Corporate Level Evaluation: Replenishments									
Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme		Recommendation	2016 Follow Up	2017 Follow Up	Status
CLE	2	IFAD	STR	REPL		Voice, representation and governance merits further study. The implication of the fact that participation and contribution is delinked merits further thought and study both in terms of financial incentives, visibility, burden-sharing and perceived influence. Gaining insights into this complex field would be highly beneficial to PRM, who should conduct or commission the study.	Voice, representation and governance arrangements area major focus of the Ad Hoc Working Group on Governance Issues. The Working Group is expected to prepare a report on this matter, including any recommendations, and on voice and representation, governance.	Voice, representation and governance arrangements are major focus of the Ad Hoc Working Group on Governance Issues. The Working Group has prepared a report with its recommendations and presented to the Governing Council in February 2017. Furthermore, typical composition for IFAD replenishment Consultation has been as follows: all Member States from Lists A and B and 18 Member States from List C, the latter to be appointed by the members of List C and communicated to the President. The Governing Council Resolution on IFAD11 in February 2017 was revised to reflect the Working Group on Governance (WGG) recommendation on representation of List C in Replenishment Consultations. The WCG report, which was considered at the upcoming GC meeting, recommended that List A and B cede four seats in the Consultation to List C. As a result the number of List C members participating in the Consultation will raise from 18 to 22, keeping the total number of participating members at 55.	O
CLE	3	IFAD	OPER	REPL		The demand for more informal sessions and more engagement with Management and between Members could be met through use of working groups or informal sessions, as is the practice in peers; this might enhance the sense of ownership. To broaden understanding and ownership, consideration should be given to organize informal side events at the GC prior to the first replenishment	Informal seminars of the Executive Board are now open to all Member States as per decision of the Executive Board in February 2016. Previously, the informal seminars were open only to the Executive Board representatives.	An informal pre-consultation on IFAD11 was organized in November 2016 and was open to all membership. The main objective was to receive indication by Members on potential themes for IFAD11 and on the work plan for the four formal sessions of IFAD11. An intersessional seminar is also scheduled to take place in June 2017 ahead of the second session.	F

Corporate Level Evaluation: Replenishments									
Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme		Recommendation	2016 Follow Up	2017 Follow Up	Status
						consultation meeting to discuss the agenda and a similar event to present the consultation report the following year.			
CLE	4	IFAD	STR	REPL		Finally, further study is also recommended of the implications of changes to the List system. An effective system for dialogue which can help generate consensus and ownership of decisions is a fundamental building block for maintaining trust in the institution and its multilateral character.	Implication of changes to the List system have been considered by the Ad Hoc Working Group on Governance Issues. The Working Group will prepare a report with any recommendations on the List system and present it to the Governing Council in 2017, through the December Executive Board	The WG reached a consensus with regards to the need for a clearer definition of the three lists that should better reflect the political and economical changes that occurred at global level since the establishment of IFAD. Member States' eligibility/ineligibility for IFAD financing provided a means to distinguish among MSs. Three new definitions were proposed to and adopted by the GC in February 2017, as guidelines for Members until the time comes that paragraph 3 of Schedule II of The Agreement Establishing IFAD is amended.	PA
CLE	5	IFAD	OPER	RME		Results reporting can be further improved. It is recommended that the MTR of IFAD10 be presented to IFAD11 in a dedicated meeting a few months prior to the first session. Should a three year replenishment cycle be retained in the future, IFAD 11 would be held in 2017. The MTR should also include a completion report of IFAD9. This would allow members to discuss results and lessons from IFAD9 and progress in implementing IFAD10, as well as examine emerging global issues of importance that could inform the	IFAD10 MTR will take place at the first meeting of IFAD11 Consultations. 3-year cycle is retained for IFAD11. IFAD10 MTR will include a completion report of IFAD9.	The Mid Term Review of IFAD10 has been discussed with Members of the Consultation at the first session of Consultations on IFAD11. Together with the MTR Management presented the completion report for IFAD9. The 3 year cycle was retained. Prior to the discussions at the first session, Members of the Consultation were given the opportunity to provide comments to the MTR itself which were addresses at the first session.	F

Corporate Level Evaluation: Replenishments									
Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme		Recommendation	2016 Follow Up	2017 Follow Up	Status
						provisional agenda for IFAD11.			
CLE	6	IFAD	OPER	RME		<p>It is further recommended that in IFAD10 efforts be made to more explicitly articulate the underlying theory of change among the different levels in the RMF, as well as find ways to maintain or reduce the total number of indicators, if possible, rather than include additional indicators. This would contribute to making the RMF a more useful tool for reporting as well as managing for results. Finally, IOE data should be used in reporting results against indicators in the RMF, as and where available.</p>	<p>Revisions to RMF, revisions to RIMS and strategy for IFAD10 impact assessment are being proposed in the context of the new Development Effectiveness Framework.</p>	<p>A revised IFAD10 RMF was developed and approved by the Board in December 2016. The Board noted that the refinements were based on the results of the IFAD9 impact assessment, the midterm review on gender, other evaluation findings, and the approved Sustainable Development Goals framework. The IFAD11 results measurement framework will be presented at the third session of the IFAD11 Consultation. In order to ensure continued relevance and alignment with the SDGs and the Strategic Framework, Management will present a review of IFAD's results measurement framework. The process will lead to the development of streamlined and refined results measurement approaches and targets, aligned with the theory of change set forth in the Strategic Framework.</p>	F

Corporate Level Evaluation: Replenishments									
Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme		Recommendation	2016 Follow Up	2017 Follow Up	Status
CLE	7	IFAD	STR	REPL		As in the past, due efforts, resources and energies must continue to be attributed to mobilize resources through replenishment process that are not earmarked, as these are the most useful type of funds to fulfil IFAD's mandate. While it is critical for IFAD to mobilize additional resources, such resources must be provided so that: they finance activities squarely within IFAD's strategic framework; the governing bodies are able to fulfil their supervisory role vis a vis these resources; they are of a minimum quality, i.e. preferably untied and un-earmarked and subject to IFAD's standard administrative arrangements, rather than requiring burdensome special treatment; and, most important of all, they must be truly additional crowding in new resources, and not displacing regular resources. IFAD Management and Member States should explore what flexibility with respect to existing administrative, legal and governance requirements may be necessary and tolerable to secure an appropriate level and type of additional financing.	For IFAD10 unrestricted complementary contributions (UCC) have been agreed in four main areas: mainstreaming nutrition, 4Ps, SSTC and climate change. Focal points for UCC have been nominated. List of countries for UCC has been proposed. Report on supplement funds to the EB timely provided in September 2015. A working group has been formed to propose a revised financing architecture for ASAP to the EMC. A Letter of Intent has been drafted for donors (i.e Germany) who have announced a UCC for climate (as a contribution to a second phase of ASAP) at COP21. In 2015 IFAD's Executive Board approved the Sovereign Borrowing Framework prepared in consultation with the Member States. The framework, established to guide future sovereign borrowing, represents an innovative financial policy tool to meet the increased need for investing in the Fund's agricultural development projects.	Following the approval of IFAD's Sovereign Borrowing Framework in 2015 further borrowing has been sought and a borrowing agreement with the Agence Française de Développement for EUR 200 million has been approved by the Board in April 2017. IFAD11 foresees to accept core contributions, DSF compensation contributions and possibly unrestricted complementary contributions. In addition Management will propose the introduction of concessional partner loans made by Member States (the grant element thereof). These contributions will be discussed at the second and third Consultation sessions.	O
CLE	8	IFAD	PLCY	STRA		Building on the findings of the IOE evaluation synthesis on MICs, Management should update the MIC policy, including clarifying the resource allocation options to such countries in the future	An Update on IFAD's engagement with MICs was presented to the Executive Board in April 2016. Management will present a single corporate document on MICS, PBAS and fragile situations to the Board in December 2016.	The IFAD11 Consultation will be informed on how IFAD will remain relevant in a context of various challenges and opportunities associated with investing in smallholder agriculture in low-income countries, lower middle-income countries, upper middle-income countries, and countries in fragile situations and how these will be tackled in the context of the	F

Corporate Level Evaluation: Replenishments									
Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme		Recommendation	2016 Follow Up	2017 Follow Up	Status
								performance-based allocation system and decentralization. The paper will build on the one on "Tailoring operations to country needs" presented to the Executive Board in April 2017 as well as the Business Model and the Financial Strategy papers being submitted at the same time.	
CLE	9	IFAD	STR	REPL		<p>Continuous engagement may further strengthen the process. Interviews revealed a strong desire not to see the replenishment as ad hoc 3-year events, but more as a continuous engagement, something that would be facilitated by the preparation of the vision. But given the large number of Member States this might also be facilitated by setting criteria for selecting key donors and representatives of key membership groups on which to develop and continuously update engagement profiles. In terms of mobilizing resources, irrespective of global trends, there is no alternative to close engagement with individual donors, as decisions to fund a specific institution does not necessarily reflect any global trend, but is often opportunistic and a reflection of the immediate policy priority of that country. Engagement is particularly important at the time of end-of-year budget period where allocation decisions are made, and IFAD may have the opportunity to pitch its case to good effect. Given the diversity of decision-makers, it would be important that senior level staff maintain a dialogue with key donors across the involved</p>	<p>Strategic advocacy with select Member States would be identified during the course of IFAD11. New strategic approaches would be deployed during IFAD11 consultation to engage with Member States. External political communications firm would be hired to gather early evidence and advise on advocacy plans for identified key donors. Country-tailored strategic political outreach, identification and outreach strategies for key decision makers, engagement of advocates/advisory group would be applied to position IFAD as a key partner to deliver on the target country's own development priorities.</p>	<p>Strategic advocacy with select Member States would be applied during the course of IFAD11. Country-tailored resource mobilization and strategic outreach, identification and engagement with the key decision makers, establishment of advocates/advisory group would be applied to position IFAD as a key partner to deliver on the target country's own development priorities.</p>	O

Corporate Level Evaluation: Replenishments									
Eval.	SN	Level	Nature	Theme		Recommendation	2016 Follow Up	2017 Follow Up	Status
						agencies, also in between replenishments, so that IFAD remains on the “radar screen” of donors and is aware of any ad hoc opportunity to mobilize resources, also outside the replenishment negotiation period. This seems particularly important given the reduced number of countries who contributed to IFAD9.			

Historic Follow up from 2015

Corporate Level Evaluation: IFAD Supervision and Implementation Support Policy

Eval.	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2015 Follow up	2016 Follow Up	2017 Follow Up	Status
Corporate Level Evaluation: IFAD Supervision and Implementation Support Policy										
CLE	1	IFAD	PLCY	SUP		<p>SIS activities should be a joint responsibility between IFAD and the Government. IFAD management should prepare an accountability framework with clear distinction of roles and responsibilities. IFAD should retain a leading role in the review of fiduciary issues while the Government/PMUs could lead the process of identifying issues and solutions; The terms "Supervision" and "Recommendations" could be replaced by "Joint Implementation Review" and "Agreed Actions".</p>	<p>The supervision guidelines are being updated with precisely these objectives (the draft if at an advanced stage and will soon be finalised and issued by Management). They have been restructured as 'IFAD's Joint Supervision and Implementation Review Guidelines', with a clear focus on joint accountabilities and responsibilities. The term supervision has been replaced by 'joint implementation review' and recommendations by 'agreed actions' to reflect joint ownership of the agreed commitments. This principle of joint ownership is explicitly stated in the policy at various points, including in para 5. IFAD still retains a leading role in fiduciary issues, with reviews of withdrawal applications, procurement plans (and with development of improved systems and processes underway in the</p>	<p>Management is in the process of revamping and modernizing its supervision practices as an essential step to assess results and promote in-course corrections. SIS practices are also being streamlined as a clear joint IFAD-government responsibility, in accordance to this recommendation and in alignment with the principle of joint ownership and accountability of the IFAD's Policy on Supervision and Implementation Support. The new approach will be reflected in updated supervision guidelines by the end of 2016.</p>	<p>Management has updated its approach to SIS, in line with this recommendations incorporating the principle of joint ownership and accountability of the IFAD's Policy on Supervision and Implementation Support. This approach has guided the development of a specific module on implementation (SIS) into the new Operational Results Management System (ORMS), soon to be launched (Q4) . This module allows a clear distinction between the fiduciary aspects of project supervision and the process of identifying issues and solutions in open dialogue with Government/PMU. The outcome of this joint exercise is summarized in the Agreed Actions sections of the system. The ORMS, when finalised, will be the source of information for project outputs and performance data, as well</p>	O

Eval.	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2015 Follow up	2016 Follow Up	2017 Follow Up	Status
Corporate Level Evaluation: IFAD Supervision and Implementation Support Policy										
							<p>organisation to implement these reviews even more effectively), while the process of identifying issues and solutions is firmly a joint responsibility (with the actual implementation done as always by PMU/ Government). Different modalities and delivery mechanisms have been outlined to deliver these missions across different institutional contexts.</p>		<p>as the place where all project-related information is stored (with linkages to other existing systems as relevant). Project SIS reports as well as aide memoires will also be sourced from ORMS. In line with this recommendation, the recommendations formerly included in missions' aide memoires will now be called "agreed actions". As regards the Guidelines themselves, Management is working on them in line with the principles described above. Following the approval of the DEF and the revamped RIMS, all necessary milestones have been set for the Guidelines to be finalised before the end of 2017.</p>	

Eval.	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2015 Follow up	2016 Follow Up	2017 Follow Up	Status
Corporate Level Evaluation: IFAD Supervision and Implementation Support Policy										
CLE	2	IFAD	PLCY	SUP		<p>IFAD should make strategic use of its grant instrument and/or mobilize additional resources (i.e. ad-hoc multi-donor trust funds) to enhance project readiness and support SIS activities. This would require the establishment of project preparation facilities.</p>	<p>This has been done, with the FAO Grant designed specifically to support persistent problem projects. The update on this grant is also provided in the section on efficiency recommendations: ' The grant programme on capacity development of weakly performing projects and country programmes is implemented by FAO in 8 countries with fragile and/or weak institutional settings in Africa, the Middle East and Asia. The Initiative provides capacity development to 18 on-going projects on about 7 main topics. IFAD has been soliciting and tracking regular updates on the progress of the grant and results achieved.'</p> <p>Based on the results of this initiative, further facilities could be designed.</p>	<p>Regional divisions make use of country grants (as opposed to pre-financing by the Government) to implement start-up plans aiming at facilitating and accelerating project's start-ups. The grants generally cover the recruitment of project staff, first months salaries, baselines survey, purchase of equipment, preparation of bidding documents. Management is promoting wider utilization of this type of grants, and at the same time exploring additional measures to enhance project readiness.</p>	<p>The new business model for IFAD 11 proposes the establishment of such a facility to improve project readiness and preparation. A multi divisional working group has been set up to define, objectives, eligibility criteria, requirements to apply and implementation modalities of this facility, also looking at previous experiences.</p>	O

Eval.	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2015 Follow up	2016 Follow Up	2017 Follow Up	Status
Corporate Level Evaluation: IFAD Supervision and Implementation Support Policy										
CLE	3	IFAD	PLCY	SCA		<p>Scaling-up opportunities of successful interventions should be reviewed during the course of SIS activities, with the effective engagement of local and national authorities, in order to build ownership and provide political mileage for the achievements made.</p>	<p>Scaling up has received specific, and separate, attention in the new guidelines. This includes a section on the role of joint supervision and implementation review (JSIR) in scaling up activities. Some indicative text from the scaling up section is ' IFAD's corporate strategy now requires all new RB-COSOPs and projects to incorporate specific proposals to seek out innovation, learning and scaling-up opportunities. Given the 'organic' linkages between different stages of the project cycle, the implementation phase, including the JSIR processes, provide effective entry points to design improved scaling up initiatives based on knowledge and learnings from implementation experience.'</p> <p>In terms of clear guidelines, Annex 11 of the latest draft includes clear steps, and highlights the importance of ' drivers (ideas, vision leadership, external forces, incentives) and spaces (financial, environmental, social, institutional political, partnership,</p>	<p>In December 2015, Management released the IFAD' s Operational Framework for Scaling up Results, providing the operational guidance to country teams on how to mainstream the scaling up agenda across the project cycle. The new Joint Supervision Guidelines, currently being developed, will foresee the inclusion of an assessment of Scaling-up opportunities of successful interventions.</p>	<p>In December 2015, Management released the IFAD' s Operational Framework for Scaling up Results, providing the operational guidance to country teams on how to mainstream the scaling up agenda across the project cycle. The SIS module and enhanced Guidelines foresee the inclusion of an assessment of Scaling-up opportunities of successful interventions at MTR. The system will allow to identify projects that have potential for scaling up and link them to internal procedures (additional financing) when applicable at any time of project implementation. Moreover, the additional financing procedures, currently under review, also provide guidance to projects to review scaling up opportunities at MTR that can be scaled through additional financing.</p>	F

Eval.	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2015 Follow up	2016 Follow Up	2017 Follow Up	Status
Corporate Level Evaluation: IFAD Supervision and Implementation Support Policy										
							learning) and the need for a systematic approach for success in scaling-up'. Country level questions that should be examined to develop a feasible pathway and to identify suitable projects, as well as entry points for scaling up have also been identified.			

Eval.	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2015 Follow up	2016 Follow Up	2017 Follow Up	Status
Corporate Level Evaluation: IFAD Supervision and Implementation Support Policy										
CLE	4	IFAD	OPER	SUP		<p>SIS arrangements, including budgetary allocations, need to be flexible. At the same time, IFAD management should mainstream the QA of SIS activities.</p>	<p>The issue of flexible budgets has been addressed in the context of developing an annual JSIR plan. The JSR annual plan should 'identify the main issues to be addressed during the coming year, the inputs required in terms of specialized expertise (in-house, in-country and consultants) and budget. How these resources are to be utilized and the optimal time schedule for fielding of missions should be elaborated, including in-loan grants, MTRs, project completion report, etc. An annual JSIR plan is also prepared for CI supervised projects. The CPM should agree with the CI the issues to be addressed, IFAD participation in JSIR missions and other IFAD inputs and resources needed to support the plan. Such plans are updated annually.' (para 25) Further, with regard to budget flexibility, the guidelines state specifically: 'The JSIR budget should be allocated flexibly in relation to the specific needs, as well as to enhance efficiency and following appropriate consultation within IFAD</p>	<p>A special supervisory effort will be required in countries where project start-up delays are particularly long, and where project implementation problems are severe. Supervision efforts will therefore continue to be customized to the country and project situation. This will be done by increasing the frequency and quality of supervision and implementation support, in turn permitted by expanding capacity in IFAD country offices to undertake this work. As mentioned above, Management's efforts are under way to streamline supervision reporting tools into one single action-oriented instrument. A new on-line Supervision template is being conceived, merging the Supervision report template and the project status report currently in use. The template would be self-explanatory, in line with the proposed updated Guidelines and take into account any mandatory reporting requirements (legal, financial, other), without duplicating the</p>	<p>IFAD's SIS effort are customized to the country and project situation. Regarding the QA of SIS activities, the workflows associated with the ORMS will mainstream and standardize across divisions the responsibilities of CPMs, portfolio advisors and directors in relation to the clearance of SIS reports.</p>	O

Eval.	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2015 Follow up	2016 Follow Up	2017 Follow Up	Status
Corporate Level Evaluation: IFAD Supervision and Implementation Support Policy										
							and the country partners. Efficiency gains can be made through use of suitable local consultants, partnerships with national, regional and international organizations, cost sharing with Government agencies and, where possible, collaboration with IFAD grant funded projects. If appropriate, the plan should take into consideration the potential for combining JSIR missions and activities with other project and country-level activities such as design work and the annual country programme (COSOP) review.' (para 26)As part of the corporate development process, section I addresses the issue of quality assurance/ enhancement of JSIR and implementation support, and outlines some practices currently undertaken or under development in the different regional divisions. While there is some diversity in the methods adopted by different divisions, there is also a common portfolio review conducted across all divisions at the PMD level. Some details presented in the guidelines	Guidelines. The template shall be conceived as an interactive tool, of which sections will automatically feed into the Aide Memoire and Management Letter, and of which some sections will not be disclosed (as per IFAD's Disclosure Policy).		

Eval.	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2015 Follow up	2016 Follow Up	2017 Follow Up	Status
Corporate Level Evaluation: IFAD Supervision and Implementation Support Policy										
							include: 'The main instrument for enhancing quality and reviewing implementation progress is tied to the annual portfolio review process. This process, internal to the PMD, takes place at the regional (division) and the corporate levels. Each region produces an Annual Review of Regional Portfolio Performance (ARPP) report, which effectively identifies cross-cutting issues, contributes to learning across projects in the region, and suggests measures to improve project outcomes with a focus on problem and risky projects. This focus is maintained at the corporate level, leaving an opening to strengthen monitoring of the JSIR work and its outputs against an agreed Divisional JSIR plan. At present such a plan is not required from each Division leaving a gap in the quality enhancement process. The only independent avenue for evaluating benefits/impact of the JSIR process are the Country Portfolio Evaluations undertaken by the Office of Evaluation, which only cover a small sample each year. At the			

Eval.	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2015 Follow up	2016 Follow Up	2017 Follow Up	Status
Corporate Level Evaluation: IFAD Supervision and Implementation Support Policy										
							Divisional level, different approaches have been adopted to enhance quality and to monitor progress of the JSIR work. APR and EN regularly assess JSIR reports with the help of an independent reviewer to improve standards based on an integrated view of performance across key strategic, operational and fiduciary areas. In addition, feedback is also obtained from project implementers as to the usefulness of support provided by the JSIR missions. West and Central Africa Division carries out post-mission reviews with the full IFAD level CPMT and has engaged services of an organizational development specialist, who provides hands on support to staff and regularly trains staff on principle and practices of good JSIR approaches. ESA has set up a portfolio review team (PRT), comprising the regional economist, financial management and knowledge management officers, and the programme assistant. The PRT reviews the coherence of PSR ratings and			

Eval.	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2015 Follow up	2016 Follow Up	2017 Follow Up	Status
Corporate Level Evaluation: IFAD Supervision and Implementation Support Policy										
							addresses major fiduciary and technical issues arising from the JSIR process during the annual portfolio review process.' (para 90-91)			

Eval.	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2015 Follow up	2016 Follow Up	2017 Follow Up	Status
Corporate Level Evaluation: IFAD Supervision and Implementation Support Policy										
CLE	5	IFAD	OPER	SUP		<p>SIS reports' formats and contents should be adjusted to the needs of Project Management. SIS's "agreed actions" should focus on the key measures that have the highest impact on project performance. Aide-Memoires can be shorter and data requirements can be reduced to avoid burdening PMUs.</p>	<p>This has been done in the context of formulation of 'agreed actions' throughout the guidelines. The agreed actions feed directly into improved outputs, outcomes and objectives as defined in the programme. The new outline for the aide memoire is clear and coherent. In terms of reducing data requirements, clear objectives (as stated in responses to other recommendations) and processes have been developed. Clearer processes will reduce the need for extraneous information and data. But in general, there is also a need to improve the overall quality of data, and this includes collecting data more consistently at the impact level.</p>	<p>See above on the new template.</p>	<p>As mentioned above, Management is working in streamline supervision reporting tools into one single action-oriented instrument, the ORMS. The implementation module of ORMS merge the supervision report template and the project status report currently in use, as well as the superseding the current system for reporting on RIMS. Making report shorter and focused. The main content of the aid memoir will be a summary of findings and the Agreed Actions table, were progress can easily be tracked. The ORMS modular approach allows for continuous supervision of specific implementation aspects, shifting from a mission led, to an issue led process. This will facilitate monitoring of their implementation, as CPMs will be able to input information in the system at any time when relevant information becomes available.</p>	O

Eval.	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2015 Follow up	2016 Follow Up	2017 Follow Up	Status
Corporate Level Evaluation: IFAD Supervision and Implementation Support Policy										
CLE	6	IFAD	OPER	SUP		While it is acknowledged that all IFIs are struggling with this challenge, IFAD should further strengthen its efforts to ensure that a functioning M&E system is in place before project implementation starts.	The quality of M&E results is often a function of projects' capacity for coherent, regular data collection and analysis through M&E systems. This is a problem that extends beyond IFAD-financed projects to the majority of development and government financed programmes and projects. IFAD provides support to M&E processes overall, most specifically by developing guidelines and handbooks as support tools for projects. In the last year, IFAD has updated its RIMS Handbook for annual reporting (with changes, including integration of environment and climate change related indicators). Further guidance tools under development are the impact guidelines (including greater flexibility in terms of methods and processes available to projects, gradation in terms of suggested systems and expected level of rigour to suit the capacities of projects) and updated PCR guidelines (whereby the project completion process would be viewed as a more holistic process, drawing on results and	Management is currently working on a Development Effectiveness Framework that includes the CLEAR grant initiative, the establishing of a certification framework for M&E, an overall enhancement of the self-evaluation framework anchored in results, and the creation of an online system to track results throughout the project cycle. This will address the concerns expressed in this recommendation.	In December 2016 the Executive Board approved the Development Effectiveness Framework, IFAD's comprehensive and coherent approach for measuring results. The DEF includes several elements that are linked to the revamping and modernisation of supervision practices, including: i) enhancing IFAD's self-evaluation tools, such as the project status and results report; ii) enhancing the use of evidence in portfolio management through the systematic analysis of IFAD's development investment portfolio; iii) systematically review the portfolio's components in order to build an evidence base that can be used for identifying projects that are likely to be successful; iv) aligning the indicators used for project monitoring and evaluation with those used by the Results and Impact Management System (RIMS); and v) reforming and folding the RIMS into supervision reporting. Furthermore, in April 2017 the Board approved the upgrading of the set of RIMS indicators and their measurement	F

Eval.	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2015 Follow up	2016 Follow Up	2017 Follow Up	Status	
Corporate Level Evaluation: IFAD Supervision and Implementation Support Policy											
							analyses from project M&E systems). In addition, IFAD is increasingly advocating conducting baseline surveys at the beginning of project implementation and including crucial M&E advice during start-up workshops. The objective is to have M&E systems in place as soon as possible in the project life cycle, but considerations such as financing sources and recruitment (subject to national legislations) also influence progress in this regard.			methodologies. The SIS section in ORMS systems include a specific M&E sub-section with guiding question to ensure a quality M&E system is in place. Under the same framework, IFAD is undertaking two complementary initiatives through grant funded programmes; the development of a tool that will be able to assess in country M&E systems and capacities and identify the gaps and develop action plans for strengthening the capacities and providing systematic capacity building in countries on M&E in rural development through the Centres for Learning on Evaluation and Results (CLEAR).	

Eval.	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2015 Follow up	2016 Follow Up	2017 Follow Up	Status
Corporate Level Evaluation: IFAD Supervision and Implementation Support Policy										
CLE	7	IFAD	OPER	SUP		<p>IFAD management should invest more on KM activities linked to SIS and strengthen policy dialogue opportunities by using its middle management (regional directors) to bring systemic issues to the attention of the national authorities. Grant resources can be also used to finance KM activities and research studies to support an evidence based policy dialogue.</p>	<p>There is a specific focus on KM, and guidance and suggested activities in the guidelines include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • learning in the context of the project or programme implementation for improved performance and results; and • learning about innovative techniques and approaches that have potential for scaling up, and for sharing with a wider audience. <p>The JSIRs will assess whether projects have a KM plan, assessing what support is required for the development of a plan, reviewing progress of KM activities and measuring the emerging results and impact from these activities. Bringing systemic issues to the attention of national authorities will be done through a range of comprehensive and systemic measures, including discussions and follow up with national authorities following missions and policy dialogue activities at the country level, not merely through individual participation of middle management.</p>	<p>Some fundamental changes in the revised guidelines, among others, will include: (i) shifting from a culture of supervision "by mission" to a culture of "continuous supervision"; (ii) anchoring supervision in results by updating LogFrames and streamlining project performance ratings to be supported with evidence; and (iii) streamlining supervision reporting tools into one single action-oriented instrument. This new approach will allow greater capture and use of knowledge generated from supervision. It will help IFAD build up a stock of good operational practices and technical knowledge that will be used to enhance project performance and support country policy engagement.</p>	<p>Some fundamental changes in the revised guidelines, among others, will include: (i) shifting from a culture of supervision "by mission" to a culture of "continuous supervision"; (ii) anchoring supervision in results by updating LogFrames and streamlining project performance ratings to be supported with evidence; and (iii) streamlining supervision reporting tools into one single action-oriented instrument. This new approach will allow greater capture and use of knowledge generated from supervision. It will help IFAD build up a stock of good operational practices and technical knowledge that will be used to enhance project performance and support country policy engagement.</p>	O

Eval.	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	R	Recommendation	2015 Follow up	2016 Follow Up	2017 Follow Up	Status
Corporate Level Evaluation: IFAD Supervision and Implementation Support Policy										
CLE	8	IFAD	OPER	SUP		In view of a likely flat budget in the coming years, SIS efficiency could be enhanced by savings generated from the adoption of a country program approach, nationalizing SIS activities with increased use of local/regional consultants, mobilization of technical support from PTA, FAO and grant-funded partners, and cost-sharing arrangements with Governments. Part of these savings should be re-invested on additional capacity building of CPMs/CPOs, further strengthening IFAD Country Offices, and extending the duration of supervision missions.	Measures for increased efficiency have been outlined through the guidelines or have been developed and implemented recently: this includes specific references to use of local consultants (already in practice across many programmes), cost-sharing and nationalising activities and budgets, using grant-funded partners (such as with the FAO grant) to improve project quality. IFAD is already operating in an environment of flat or declining budgets across programmes, and is delivering products within such constraints and innovating to deliver quality and quantity within these constraints. Regional divisions have the flexibility to use costs savings in order to achieve greatest impact through their programmes, and this could include the measures suggested.	Management's major shift towards more continuous supervision and implementation support, initiated in 2015, embraces efforts to identify more creative, cost-effective ways to undertake supervision and implementation support, learning from innovative methods already in use in some regional divisions.	Management's major shift towards more continuous supervision and implementation support, initiated in 2015, embraces efforts to identify more creative, cost-effective ways to undertake supervision and implementation support, learning from innovative methods already in use in some regional divisions. IFAD's decentralization is also expected to improve SIS efficiency.	O