

Document: EB 2014/112/R.5/Add.1  
Agenda: 5  
Date: 6 August 2014  
Distribution: Public  
Original: English

**E**



Investing in rural people

## **President's Report on the Implementation Status of Evaluation Recommendations and PRISMA Management Actions**

### **Volume II**

### **Agreement at completion point Recommendations and follow-up actions taken by the Programme Management Department**

### **Addendum**

#### **Note to Executive Board representatives**

##### Focal points:

##### Technical questions:

##### **Shyam Khadka**

Senior Portfolio Manager  
Programme Management Department  
Tel.: +39 06 5459 2388  
e-mail: s.khadka@ifad.org

##### **Kaushik Barua**

Portfolio Officer  
Tel.: +39 06 5459 2697  
e-mail: k.barua@ifad.org

Queries relating to the comments of the  
Independent Office of Evaluation of IFAD on this  
report should be addressed to:

##### **Kees Tuinenburg**

Officer-in-Charge,  
Independent Office of Evaluation of IFAD  
tel.: +39 06 5459 2274  
e-mail: k.tuinenburg@ifad.org

##### Dispatch of documentation:

##### **Deirdre McGrenra**

Head, Governing Bodies Office  
Tel.: +39 06 5459 2374  
e-mail: gb\_office@ifad.org

Executive Board — 112<sup>th</sup> Session  
Rome, 17-18 September 2014

---

**For: Information**

## Contents

<b>Abbreviations and acronyms</b>	<b>ii</b>
<b>I. PRISMA 2014: Individual recommendations and actions</b>	<b>1</b>
A. Country Programme Evaluation	1
Madagascar - Country Programme Evaluation	1
Mali - Country Programme Evaluation	3
Nepal - Country Programme Evaluation	5
Uganda - Country Programme Evaluation	8
B. Corporate Level Evaluation	11
IFAD's institutional efficiency and efficiency of IFAD-funded (from Action Plan)	11
<b>II. Follow up on historic recommendations: PRISMA 2008-2012</b>	<b>20</b>
A. Country and project evaluations from PRISMA 2012	21
B. Country and project evaluations from PRISMA 2011	32
C. Country and project evaluations from PRISMA 2010	40
D. Country and project evaluations from PRISMA 2009	53
E. Country and project evaluations from PRISMA 2008	57

## Abbreviations and acronyms

ACP	Agreement at Completion Point
AD2M	Projet d'appui au développement du Menabe et du Melaky
AGRA	Alliance for a Green Revolution in Africa
APR	Asia and the Pacific Division
AROPA	Projet d'appui aux organisations professionnelles et aux services agricoles
ASAP	Adaptation for Smallholders Agriculture Programme
AWPB	Annual Work Programme and Budget
CAADP	Comprehensive Africa Agriculture Development Programme
CFS	Controller's and Financial Services Division
COSOP	Country Strategic Opportunities Paper
CPE	Country Programme Evaluation
CPM	Country Programme Manager
DSF	Debt Sustainability Framework
ECD	Environment and Climate Division
ESA	East and Southern Africa Division
GEF	Global Environment Facility
HRD	Human Resources Director
HVAP	High Value Agriculture Project in Hills and Mountain Areas
ICO	IFAD Country Office
LAC	Latin America and the Caribbean Division
LFLP	Leasehold Forestry and Livestock Programme
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation
MICs	Middle-income countries
MOU	Memorandum of Understanding
NAADS	National Agricultural Advisory Services Programme
NEN	Near East, North Africa and Europe Division
NRM	Natural Resource Management
PARECAM	Programme d'appui à la résilience aux crises alimentaires à Madagascar
PBAS	Performance-based allocation system
PMD	Programme Management Department
PPMS	Project and Programme Management System
PPRR	Programme de promotion des revenus ruraux
PRELNOR	Programme for the Restoration of Livelihoods in Northern Uganda
PROFIRA	Project for Financial Inclusion in Rural Areas
PTA	Policy and Technical Advisory Division
QA	Quality Assurance
RERP	Rural Enterprises and Remittances Project
TOR	Terms of reference
VODP2	Vegetable Oil Development Project-Phase II
WCA	West and Central Africa Division
WUPAP	Western Uplands Poverty Alleviation Project

## Categories used for the classification of agreement at completion point agreed actions

SN serial number

### Type of evaluation

CLE corporate level evaluation  
CPE country programme evaluation

### Level

IFAD IFAD corporate level  
REG IFAD regional level  
CTRY IFAD country level  
GOV government authorities (national, local level and institutions)  
PROJ project

### Nature

PLCY policy  
STR strategy development, including COSOPs and projects  
OPER operational and implementation

### Themes

ASR analysis, studies and researches  
BEN beneficiaries and stakeholders' participation and consultation  
COS Country Strategic Opportunities Programme (COSOP)  
DEC decentralization  
DES project design  
DIA policy dialogue  
EFF efficiency  
FLD field presence  
GDR gender (including targeting to women)  
GOV governance  
HR human resources (management, recruitment)  
ICT information and communication technology  
INF infrastructure (construction, contracting, management, supervision)  
INN innovation  
KM knowledge management  
NRM natural resource management and environment  
ORG organizations, groups, institutions and collective approaches  
PAR partnership  
PRM private sector, market and enterprise development, value chains  
PMA project management and administration  
RFI rural finance  
RME results monitoring, evaluation  
SCA replication and scaling up  
STRA strategy  
SUP supervision and implementation support  
SUS sustainability  
TCB training, capacity-building  
TGT targeting

# Agreement at completion point recommendations and follow-up action taken by the Programme Management Department

## I. PRISMA 2014: Individual recommendations and actions

### A. Country Programme Evaluation

Country	Evaluation	N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
<b>Madagascar - Country Programme Evaluation</b>							
<b>Recommendation 1. Continuation and fine-tuning of three strategic thrusts: (i) support for devolution and decentralization; (ii) popularization of agricultural techniques; and (iii) value chain approaches</b>							
Madagascar	CPE	1	CTRY	STR	DEC	In terms of institutional priorities, the new COSOP should continue to support devolution and decentralization. This entails continued support for the regional structures anticipated by the Agricultural Sector Programme (regional agricultural development funds, agricultural service centres), the progressive regionalization of project management structures, and devolved State technical services. However, it will be equally important to stress the development of partnerships with rural communities in order to support capacity-building so that they can assume responsibility for the planning of local development.	Strategic Objective (SO) 3 of the new draft COSOP focusses on these priorities. This includes the capacity building of public and private organisations, strengthening the institutional environment at the local and regional levels, enhancing partnerships- all initiatives supporting structures that will implement decentralization.
Madagascar	CPE	2	CTRY	STR	DES	With regard to intervention thrusts, it will be important to continue support for the popularization of improved agricultural techniques (especially intensive and improved rice systems), which is a national priority in view of the low productivity of Malagasy agriculture.	Strategic Objective (SO) 1 of the new draft COSOP focusses on popularization of improved agricultural techniques. This includes strengthening production and diversity in value chains, transformation of production and agricultural businesses, promoting access of youth to services and improved techniques.
Madagascar	CPE	3	CTRY	STR	COS	Based on the results of certain grants and supplementary funds (SCAMPIS, INBAR and PARECAM), grant activities should be better integrated in the country programme, by mobilising a package of specific grants to the country.	The new draft COSOP provides clear strategic directions for grants, and promotes an approach of integration with the country programme.
Madagascar	CPE	4	CTRY	STR	PRM	The evaluation recommends continuing agricultural value chain approaches, avoiding less effective mechanisms (for example market access centres), laying more stress on contractualized agriculture and involving traders and private entrepreneurs more fully from the start (i.e. during the project formulation phase), so as to boost synergy among agricultural production, processing and marketing.	SO 2 of the new COSOP focuses entirely on the promotion of agricultural value chain and a strengthened partnership with private sector.
<b>Recommendation 2. Environmental protection and adaptation to climate change as cross-cutting activities in the strategy and in operations</b>							
Madagascar	CPE	5	CTRY	STR	NRM	These issues should be promoted in strategy and operations through partnerships, particularly : (i) establishing a strategic partnership with the ministry responsible for the environment	The IFAD country office (ICO) facilitated the formulation by the Ministry of Agriculture, in collaboration with the Ministry of Environment, a strategy for integrating climate change adaptation into the portfolio.

Country	Evaluation	N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
Madagascar	CPE	6	CTRY	STR	NRM	(ii) stepping up coordination and the sharing of experience with the main donors involved in catchment area management (for example the World Bank, the African Development Bank and the French Development Agency) in order to incorporate this approach into IFAD supported interventions.	The design of the new ASAP project is being utilized as an occasion to develop partnerships and exchange of experiences with main donors in the area of catchment area management.
Madagascar	CPE	7	CTRY	OPER	NRM	Greater coordination between grants and loans would also highlight (i) soil and water conservation measures	The new COSOP will adopt a landscape approach as recommended by the Environmental Strategic Assessment.
Madagascar	CPE	8	CTRY	OPER	NRM	(ii) the sustainable development of non-wood products (for example bamboo and rattan) for craftwork and building, drawing for example on lessons from the experience of the INBAR grant and the grant approved for the Indian Ocean Commission.	The new COSOP integrates non-farm value chain development like non-wood products.
<b>Recommendation 3. Setting the long term sustainability of benefits at the heart of the programme</b>							
Madagascar	CPE	9	CTRY	OPER	SUS	The next COSOP should anticipate a strategy to consolidate benefits (for example in the case of PPRR and AD2M) through selective support initiatives (i.e. financing follow-up only for components that show good results) and a more realistic timeframe for new projects (for example ten rather than six years, in view of the difficulties of getting under way).	The new COSOP pays greater attention to the consolidation of results which includes the planning of follow-up financing phases. More realistic timeframe will be considered for the new projects under the next COSOP.
<b>Recommendation 4. Better definition of the respective roles of CAPFIDA and the IFAD office in Madagascar in supporting the portfolio, non-lending activities and monitoring of the COSOP</b>							
Madagascar	CPE	10	CTRY	OPER	FLD	It will be best not to overburden the IFAD office with administrative duties, but to focus more on its role of strategic guidance in non-lending activities and involvement in subregional activities in order to obtain a better understanding of experiences and disseminate information on them (regional grants, sharing of experience among countries).	The roles of CAPFIDA (IFAD Programme Support Unit) and its coordination mechanism had been updated. It currently allows greater complementarity between ICO and CAPFIDA.
Madagascar	CPE	11	CTRY	OPER	DES	The experience of CAPFIDA and its financing should be shared and discussed within IFAD's Financial Operations Department as an example of an instrument to support implementation of the country programme and non-lending activities.	The 'Capfida' experience was shared and discussed within ESA in 2013; SKD is preparing a capitalization note on Capfida' ME&KM; a video: Discovering CAPFIDA: <a href="http://youtu.be/NKGX8ChEJY">http://youtu.be/NKGX8ChEJY</a> has been produced.
Madagascar	CPE	12	CTRY	OPER	FLD	IFAD should prepare for the out-posting of the Country Programme Manager to Antananarivo.	The recruitment of Madagascar CPM is scheduled in 2014.
Madagascar	CPE	13	CTRY	OPER	RME	The monitoring of non-lending activities and grants should be incorporated into the monitoring activities of the COSOP and the SEGS/ZARAFIDA system.	The ZARAFIDA system has been updated and includes non-lending activities and grants monitoring.
<b>Recommendation 5. In the short and medium term, special attention to two operations (AROPA, FORMAPROD)</b>							
Madagascar	CPE	14	PROJ	OPER	TGT	In the case of AROPA, the project's approach should be reconsidered through a clearer definition of the various objectives and support mechanisms for (i) farmers' organizations and their umbrella organizations in the poorest communities	This has been done. The AROPA updated results framework now clearly identifies activities that contribute to improving farmers' income or to the objective of strengthening their organizations.

Country	Evaluation	N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
Madagascar	CPE	15	PROJ	OPER	TGT	(ii) the chamber of agriculture	A participatory institutional diagnostic assessment led to a reprioritization of roles that are clear for each type of organization: economic role for farmers organizations (value chain development and income improvement); policy role for the agricultural chambers (policy dialogue around PSAEP/CAADP and coordination of the services delivered under the extension services strategy)
Madagascar	CPE	16	PROJ	OPER	TGT	(iii) the institutions anticipated by the Agricultural Sector Programme (regional agricultural development funds and agricultural service centres).	Efforts are ongoing to further clarify the functions of CSA/FRDA; also they have already adopted more flexibility to better meet demands.
Madagascar	CPE	17	PROJ	OPER	PMA	In the case of FORMAPROD, it will be necessary to support preparations for implementation and establish a solid management team at the central level (rather than delegating management to other project teams that are not involved with agricultural training).	At the national level, an executive secretariat is currently under establishment. Meanwhile, an inter - ministerial commission dedicated to vocational training is developing the methodologies for the implementation of FORMAPROD.
Madagascar	CPE	18	PROJ	OPER	PAR	It is recommended to continue and step up collaboration with partners with proven technical experience in agricultural training (for example the French Development Agency, the Island of Reunion and other partners yet to be identified).	In 2013, FORMAPROD received support from both Agence Française de Développement (AFD) and UNESCO in international technical assistance. The partnership with the Reunion Island has been launched in early 2014.
Madagascar	CPE	19	PROJ	OPER	KM	It is recommended to carry out a study of successful initiatives in the same sphere in Sub- Saharan Africa or elsewhere, and organize exchange visits.	A partnership has been launched with Reunion Island for exchange visits and training of project staff. Experts in vocational training from Cameroon will be coming to Madagascar to share their experiences. And an exchange visit to Cote d'Ivoire has been planned.

#### Mali - Country Programme Evaluation

#### Recommendation 1: IFAD and the Government should take advantage of this 'forced pause' (referring to the unstable political situation in the north due to which project activities have been stalled) to define the thrusts of the new COSOP.

Mali	CPE	1	CTRY	OPER	COS	Given the limited resources allocated to preparing COSOPs, IFAD could use grants to ensure an adequate level of expertise in formulating the COSOP and to ensure a participatory preparation process.	A new COSOP is scheduled in 2015. Grant resources will be considered to ensure adequate level of expertise and a participatory preparation process.
Mali	CPE	2	CTRY	STR	COS	The following measures should be taken to correct strategic orientations: (i) a diagnosis in the COSOP of poverty and rural development opportunities and a more thorough analysis of conflict-related risks and measures to reduce such risks.	These two aspects will be considered next year during COSOP preparation.
Mali	CPE	3	CTRY	OPER	DIA	Preparation of a plan for communication and policy dialogue activities: (i) experience gained in supporting (issues such as responsibility for local development interventions and national norms that are ill-suited to conflict fragile zones, weakness in support of ANICT), (ii) lessons learned in involving grassroots and umbrella organisations in project management and policy dialogue, (iii) sustainability of productive and environment micro projects.	Within the COSOP preparation, the policy dialogue component will be developed. Regarding communication, a plan has been developed with IED support through a divisional grant and a specific officer has been recruited by the national coordination of IFAD supported projects and programmes (CNPPF) to implement the strategy.
Mali	CPE	4	CTRY	STR	TGT	There should be more weight given to the south of the country in setting geographic priorities and more thematic approaches should be encouraged.	In 2013, 2 new projects were designed : an ASAP component to be added to an on-going project (PAPAM) to be implemented in Kayes and Sikasso, and a new project on Youth (FIER) to be

Country	Evaluation	N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
							implemented in Sikasso and Koulikoro in a first phase. Both of them will be implemented in the southern regions of Mali at least at the beginning. However, interventions in Northern Mali are not suspended and activities are carried out to support local populations who have been targeted by the projects for years and who cannot be abandoned in such a critical situation.
Mali	CPE	5	CTRY	STR	COS	The portfolio should encompass interventions with a thematic or sub-sectoral focus, allowing a greater focus on structural aspects, reforms and policy dialogue. (as per the evaluation, these subsectors should include rural finance, small-scale irrigation, NRM and rangelands, basic infrastructure and capacity building for local communities, with a focus on training and integration of young people).	The thematic approach is under implementation since the preparation of an intermediary note, jointly prepared in 2012 by the Malian Government and IFAD, to manage the portfolio during the crisis period. This note presents 3 main thematic to be developed: Microfinance, Youth and Agri productivity (with a focus on small scale irrigation and climate resilient activities). Consequently two new projects on Youth issues and on Adaptation to Climate Change have been designed in 2013 and were approved by IFAD's December 2013 Board.
Mali	CPE	6	CTRY	STR	TGT	In the case of conflict, this approach would allow reallocation of resources and activities to areas where operations can continue in security.	This approach is implemented in FIER: the project will start in two southern regions and then in a second phase new regions will be chosen according to the evolution of the situation and the demand of the Malian Government.
Mali	CPE	7	CTRY	STR	PAR	There should be greater involvement of other donors in financing basic infrastructure and services. (This is borne out by IFAD's last two corporate level strategic frameworks and the joint evaluation of AfDB and IFAD.)	The Canadian Cooperation agreed to give a grant to IFAD to expand the activities of IFAD supported Rural Microfinance project (PMR) at a level of 12.8 M Can Dollars. New partnerships will be hopefully developed during the coming months with the resuming of activities of many donors.
Mali	CPE	8	CTRY	STR	PRM	The evaluation recommends more systematic involvement of private entrepreneurs and professional organisations in programme activities, beginning with project design but also during implementation. This includes focusing from the start on economic viability of production activities and closer attention to processing, enhancement and marketing. At the same time, risks from an environmental and social point of view (such as land tenure issues) should be taken into account.	This recommendation has been fully taken on board during FIER design. Farmer Organisations have been involved in the design, with a specific focus on youth and women organisations. Their role in implementation phase has defined with them and specific funds are dedicated to support them. During ASAP design, Farmers Organisations expressed their interest to participate in the policy debate related to climate resilient issues and they will be supported for that. Regarding the private sector, it will be involved in FIER implementation to define its demand in terms of capacity to facilitate youth employment.
<b>Recommendation 2: Definition of an action plan for current operations</b>							
Mali	CPE	9	CTRY	STR	PMA	With regard to operations in south Mali, the plan should focus on institutional bottlenecks encountered during the implementation of PAPAM, in order to review IFAD's contribution to the programme.	PAPAM has benefited from strong attention in 2013 and the support will continue in 2014. Last year a joint WB/IFAD mission was organised to restructure the project. Another mission, organised in early 2014 showed that problems are still being encountered. A set of decisions have been taken to speed-up the implementation of the project and a new mission is scheduled in June to measure the progress and take further decisions to really solve the institutional bottle-necks.
Mali	CPE	10	CTRY	STR	PMA	For operations in the north (PIDRN and PIDRK), given the conflict and risks of misappropriation of resources, it would be appropriate to plan for a definitive termination of the projects if the situation does not change within a clearly	It has been decided not to follow this recommendation. The two projects have been maintained in order to support local populations in a difficult context where many donors have left the field. In this context, activities have been positively



Country	Evaluation	N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
						defined period.	implemented with different partners (AVSF, local NGOs, WHO...). Regarding supervision missions, meetings with representatives of beneficiaries and local NGOs were organized with mission members in Bamako. PIDRN has been extended for a year and is closing in June 2014. PIDRK should also close this year but its extension will be assessed during the next supervision mission.
<b>Recommendation 3: Improvement in the management at the programme level</b>							
Mali	CPE	11	CTRY	STR	RME	The evaluation recommends boosting of the management and monitoring systems at the country level. A common logical frame of reference should be developed within which the respective contributions of each project could be measured and evaluated, and which could be integrated into a harmonized M&E system.	This is on-going. At CNPPF level, an M&E officer has been recruited to support the management and the monitoring systems in each of the IFAD supported projects and to facilitate the coordination among the M&E officers. His task is also to create a common framework in which all the projects will insert information into a harmonised system.
Mali	CPE	12	CTRY	STR	DIA	Dedication of greater attention to analysis and capitalization, and to consolidate the experience of IFAD projects, in order to discuss and share them with development partners and provide inputs to policy dialogue based on concrete experience.	The communication officer mentioned above will be in charge of that. Moreover, a communication specialist will be recruited through ASAP and will work within the CNPPF to analyse, capitalise and communicate on adaptation aspects.
Mali	CPE	13	CTRY	STR	RME	Improvement in the effectiveness of project M&E systems by strengthening methodology (particularly for impact studies) and monitoring of the quality of activities and their costs (anticipated and actual) by allocating necessary human and financial resources to national monitoring capacities in collaboration with other donors.	Collaboration with other donors in this regard has not been easy during the past months due to the crisis but efforts are being developed to improve collaboration among partners.
Mali	CPE	14	CTRY	OPER	FLD	The evaluation recommends a better match between objectives and human and financial resources among: the IFAD country office and the National Programme and Project Coordination Unit within the Ministry of Agriculture.	Division of roles and coordination among the CNPPF (National Programme and Project Coordination Unit) and IFAD bureau are good and there is no specific problem or redundancy of activities among them. IFAD office is in charge of supervision and represents IFAD in donor groups and meetings with Government. CNPPF is in charge of coordinating the project teams and improving the linkages between projects and IFAD. There is no competition neither loss of resources in the current system.
<b>Nepal - Country Programme Evaluation</b>							
<b>Recommendation 1: Develop new partnership paradigm and pipeline based on a two-pronged strategy.</b>							
Nepal	CPE	1	CTRY	STR	PRM	IFAD strategy should take into consideration the development of business-minded, profitable producers' groups and cooperatives in key value chains accessible to smallholders, as well as the development of partnerships with private service providers, buyers and input suppliers where they are available (also see full para 4a of the ACP). Further, based on public-private partnerships, public sector agencies would be engaged in addressing bottlenecks of a public goods nature (roads, electricity etc.).	The new COSOP developed and approved in 2012, took care of these aspects. All new projects and 2 of the existing ones include these types of promotion and partnership with private sector.
Nepal	CPE	2	CTRY	STR	TGT	Projects should take advantage of clusters or growth nodes along the road corridors. A complementary approach should	The corridor approach has been adopted in the new COSOP and developed in new projects, such as the new rural enterprise

Country	Evaluation	N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
						be developed for remote and isolated communities in the mountains and on the hill tops, far from the road network, with limited access to water and poor soils and conditions for agricultural production (such communities should be helped in increasing their food production and improving their livelihoods).	and remittance project. For remote households, the CIF (community investment fund) implemented by WUPAP is a good solution.
Nepal	CPE	3	CTRY	STR	TGT	Sector-based interventions may include leasehold and community forestry, livestock, improvements in food production, commercial production of high-value-to-weight produce for niche markets, such as medicinal and aromatic plants (MAPs) and vegetable seeds, and access to water and possibly also energy (e.g. solar units).	All of these sectors are now implemented by ongoing projects, as well in new one like ASAP which will include alternative energy.
<b>Recommendation 2: Factoring in the conflict dimension and its impact.</b>							
Nepal	CPE	4	CTRY	STR	COS	In framing the next COSOP, IFAD could consider drawing on an approach which draws on the analytical logic of the 2011 WDR and the g7+ New Deal. (such an approach is intended to support processes of strategic thinking by governments and takes political instability and institutional fragility as the principal constraints to socio-economic development, and draws on the experiences of countries that have registered some success in moving away from repetitive, ingrained insecurity and violence.)	This has been adopted. The COSOP buildup on reconciliation process, policy wise and at grass root level: forging links between communities and civil services. Agriculture and rural development is at the core of the activities and will also use the resources of migration remittances.
Nepal	CPE	5	CTRY	STR	COS	The core of the approach should include a clear (and continuous) diagnosis of the stress factors' that animate instability and fragility – an understanding of which can help identify the combination of confidence-building measures and institutional strengthening programs needed to 'change the narrative' of mistrust in the state.	Each project (existing and upcoming) is working at grassroots level, district level and national level, building bridges between the various scale of intervention and ensuring that local experience are scaled up and turned into policy dialogue opportunities. (LFLP is a perfect example of this approach and WUPAP is slowly building towards this as well). These approaches promote confidence-building across different levels of government.
Nepal	CPE	6	CTRY	STR	TGT	IFAD strategies should take into account factors emerging from protracted civil conflict (such as emergence of female-headed households and the increased importance of remittances in rural areas) in its programs and policy dialogue, in cooperation with other development partners.	The RER project under design in 2014 is fully dedicated to micro enterprise and support to migrant returnees who want to invest remittances into a new business, including their families.
<b>Recommendation 3: Strengthening the link between policy dialogue agenda in strategy (COSOP) and portfolio (programmes).</b>							
Nepal	CPE	7	CTRY	STR	COS	It is recommended that IFAD and Government jointly identify relevant policy issues in COSOP and embed them within project design and implementation, including necessary resource allocation. For financing the related work, and to the extent feasible, IFAD will complement loan with grant resources to support policy development and dialogue.	4 areas of policy dialogue were identified in the new COSOP: i) economic and institutional models for inclusive business partnerships, particularly for the provision of support services and for marketing (SO1); (ii) optimisation of migration remittances for productive investment (SO2); (iii) institutionalising leasehold forestry for consolidating poor communities resource use rights and building ecosystem resilience, building on a policy-oriented assessment of 18-year experience gained through IFAD-supported projects, to be developed with FAO support (SO2); and (iv) adaptation to climate variability through climate-smart investments and NRM arrangements (SO2). Also, importantly, each new design

Country	Evaluation	N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
							includes a policy dialogue component.
Nepal	CPE	8	CTRY	STR	ASR	Though IFAD does not have the comparative advantage for producing analytical work, it could bridge the gap through closer cooperation with international and local think-tanks, research centres, and universities – possibly through better targeted grants programme.	Regional grant with APRACA (rural finance), ICIMOD (livelihoods) and FFR (remittances) will help produce high-quality analytical work in the relevant areas.
<b>Recommendation 4: Appreciating local context; providing adequate implementation support.</b>							
Nepal	CPE	9	CTRY	STR	SUP	The evaluation recognises that the allocation for programme management and implementation support in Nepal is in line with mid-sized country programmes; but also highlights that the semi-fragile and volatile Nepalese context demands resources above the average. Allowing for local realities is only in part a project preparation/ appraisal issue, but also requires adapting project design to take account of the lessons of experience and to adjust to changing local dynamics. This in turn requires more implementation support resources than IFAD has normally provided to Nepal.	In terms of implementation support, one supervision and one follow up mission per project each year has been implemented and is now the norm in the portfolio. The intensification of missions has clearly increased the pressure on projects to perform and the quality of implementation has been gradually improving. In addition, Sahayatri, the country programme support unit will enable closer follow-up and supervision, as the situation warrants, and enable sustained improvements.
Nepal	CPE	10	GOV	OPER	PMA	The government should engage external technical support from specialised service providers in the private sector and civil society to address three problem areas that are common in a significant part of the portfolio: (i) implementation driven by quantitative targets rather than being responsive to the demand and problems of beneficiaries; (ii) monitoring systems that do not capture livelihoods changes and indicators for objectives; and (iii) sub-standard financial management.	Partnerships were heavily promoted in the COSOP, MoUs signed and agreed with the Government. Unfortunately, the Government did not retain its commitment and diverged from the agreement (this was the case with NGOs to be engaged in both HVAP and ISFP).
<b>Recommendation 5: Addressing disadvantage</b>							
Nepal	CPE	11	CTRY	OPER	TGT	Group formation should be based on a thorough analysis of prevailing economic and social conditions and on an identification of the various categories of poor, and project support should be geared towards facilitating inclusion. (considering points raised in the ACP- including the fact that differences in economic status may not always parallel caste/ ethnicity)	Targeting is entirely based on economic aspects and not on social classes or castes as it brings more discrimination. The differences in economic status are the basis for differentiation, including through the different categories of economic well-being/ poverty: poor, ultra poor, well off etc. But a clear monitoring by caste and indigenous groups and gender disaggregated data is maintained to ensure equitable distribution and avoid elite capture. (New mechanisms have been tested in the new ASAP and RER projects, as well as WUPAP Community investment fund. Once signed, the top-up with PAF, funded by the World Bank will help to innovate more in this area.)
Nepal	CPE	12	CTRY	OPER	TGT	When supporting value chain and rural enterprise development, projects may also provide support to other value chain stakeholders (such as entrepreneurs and less poor farmers) provided this in turn brings increased benefits to smallholders. Mechanisms to ensure that the poor and socially excluded households also have access to project benefits will also be required.	These mechanisms are in place in rural enterprise and remittances project, with number of beneficiaries targeted for the various categories of ultra-poor, poor, well off, etc., to ensure benefits are delivered to ultra-poor and poor segments of the population.

Country	Evaluation	N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
<b>Recommendation 6: Measuring and communicating impact</b>							
Nepal	CPE	13	CTRY	OPER	RME	Two important evaluation techniques that deserve wider use in the coming COSOP cycle are case studies of outcomes (encompassing both successes and failures), and opinion polling (perhaps the most objective way to measure the extent to which institutions are achieving popular legitimacy).	Outcome surveys have been implemented by the LFLP and HVAP projects. Opinion polling has not yet been tested.
<b>Recommendation 7: Aligning COSOP and PBA cycle management</b>							
Nepal	CPE	15	CTRY	STR	STR	It is recommended that IFAD and Government prepare the COSOP to cover two 3-year performance-based allocations (PBAs) according to IFAD's funding cycle. For the first PBA cycle, the COSOP should contain a relatively detailed outline of the pipeline, based on identification undertaken as part of the COSOP preparation. Pipeline project(s) should be comprehensively described in a Concept Note agreed to by IFAD and Government, to support project design and approval during the first two years of the COSOP implementation period. As for the second PBA, a comprehensive COSOP review combined with project identification should be undertaken in COSOP year 3 to allow for design and approval in COSOP year 4 and 5.	The COSOP has been structured as recommended. The first 3 year PBAS of the COSOP covers an ASAP project and 1 rural enterprise and remittances project. The second 3 years PBAS includes a top-up to a successful project in the current portfolio (to be determined in 2016) and a full project under the umbrella of ADS (which will be strengthened by that time). Two projects have already been designed, respectively for the Sep 2014 Board and April 2015 Board.
<b>Uganda - Country Programme Evaluation</b>							
<b>Recommendation 1: Expansion of the geographic coverage of IFAD operations to the northern region</b>							
Uganda	CPE	1	CTRY	STR	TGT	The CPE recommends that, during the COSOP preparation process, IFAD and GoU identify and discuss the opportunities and constraints of investments in the northern region. Depending on the outcome of this analysis, as well as on the evolution of the region's rapidly evolving socio-economic situation over the next few years, this could be done under the overall coordinating framework of the Peace, Recovery and Development Plan, recently extended for another 3 years up to end-2015, as well as through investment project(s) that broadly contribute to furthering the development of the region, such as the on-going investment in the oilseeds sub-sector under the Vegetable Oil Development Project, Phase 2 (VODP2).	An investment project in the Northern Region of Uganda (Programme for the Restoration of Livelihoods in Northern Uganda - PRELNOR) has been identified and included in the pipeline of the new COSOP (2013-18) for financing in the 2013-15 PBA cycle. Submission to the Executive Board (EB) is planned for December 2014, design is currently ongoing.
<b>Recommendation 2: Support to commodity value-chain development</b>							
Uganda	CPE	2	CTRY	STR	PRM	Building on the success of VODP and its innovative public-private partnership, the CPE recommends that IFAD and GoU explore opportunities for promoting value chain development in specific sub-sectors in Uganda. In particular, it is recommended that during the COSOP preparation process, IFAD and GoU undertake a thorough analysis to determine which commodity value chain should be given priority.	Investment priority for the 2013-15 PBA cycle has been given to rural finance (key strategic thrust of IFAD COSOP) and the Northern region (see recommendation above). Identification of possible other sub-sectors for investment will be done in 2014-15 to orient the investment of 2016-18 PBA resources (see ACP).
Uganda	CPE	3	CTRY	STR	PRM	The CPE recommends investing efforts in exploring	PPPs have a prominent role in the new COSOP (2013-18). An

Country	Evaluation	N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
						additional and alternative forms of public-private sector partnerships (PPPs) at different stages in the value chain, including with small and medium enterprises, commercial banks, as well as with larger private sector entities.	important ongoing initiative in this respect, beside the continuous investment in the oil palm and oilseeds commodity chains, is the negotiation with the EU Delegation in Kampala to launch the Small and Medium Agribusiness Development Fund (SMADF), an equity fund for investment in small and medium agribusiness companies.
<b>Recommendation 3: Definition of a realistic and appropriately resourced agenda for policy dialogue</b>							
Uganda	CPE	4	CTRY	STR	DIA	The CPE recommends that, during the preparation of the next COSOP, IFAD and GoU define realistic objectives for policy dialogue and specify areas where IFAD will play a lead supportive role, in partnership with other development partners, to improve the agriculture-related policy environment. The development of a joint policy dialogue agenda should be supported by relevant analyses and should largely focus on areas where IFAD can contribute relevant experiences from its work in Uganda and other countries.	Specific areas and realistic objectives have been defined in the COSOP (2013-18). Identified areas include: (i) the reform of NAADS for more effective provision of agri-business advisory services; (ii) the regulatory framework for Tier IV financial institutions (including SACCOs); (iii) the new microfinance policy and strategic framework; (iv) the establishment of a sustainable institutional framework for oil palm growers' associations; and (v) the support to a sustainable SACCO apex organization.
Uganda	CPE	5	CTRY	OPER	DIA	Specific areas for policy dialogue will be identified as part of the COSOP formulation process. As the policy environment is constantly evolving, additional areas for policy dialogue will be identified during COSOP implementation, and COSOP annual reviews will be the opportunity to review and adjust the objectives.	See above.
<b>Recommendation 4: Further strengthening of project results</b>							
Uganda	CPE	6	CTRY	STR	STR	The CPE identifies specific measures that IFAD and GoU can implement to ensure the further improvement in project results, from moderately satisfactory to satisfactory or highly satisfactory in the future. This would also contribute to enhancing COSOP level effectiveness. The following four areas need particular attention to improve the results in the future: (i) ensuring due synergies among activities within and across projects financed by IFAD in Uganda, so that they can contribute to even more positively impact on the lives of the rural poor.	The Uganda COSOP Team has been established as the primary coordination forum to ensure synergies at country programme level. The new COSOP puts particular emphasis on geographic and thematic focus and consistency to enhance impact.
Uganda	CPE	7	CTRY	STR	NRM	(ii) increased focus on enhancing results in two impact domains where the CPE found performance to be overall moderately unsatisfactory; namely, natural resources and environmental management, as well as human and social capital and empowerment	The new project in the North (PRELNOR) places particular emphasis on natural resources and climate change adaptation (including ASAP co-financing). Human and social capital empowerment is a key drive of the new COSOP, with particular reference to strengthening of rural people organizations such as farmers' organizations, SACCOs and savings and credit groups.
Uganda	CPE	8	CTRY	STR	SUS	(iii) improving the sustainability of project benefits by, inter-alia, preparing exit strategies early on in implementation, as well as strengthening capacity of key institutions	Being done as part of the design of new projects (see PROFIRA and PRELNOR). PROFIRA stressed importance of appropriate policy, regulatory and institutional framework for sustainability of the sector (Tier IV regulatory framework; support to a sustainable SACCO apex organization; and conducive new policy and strategic framework for rural finance). PRELNOR is currently under design, but emphasis is put on working with

Country	Evaluation	N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
							existing institutions and building their capacity.
Uganda	CPE	9	CTRY	STR	SCA	(iv) paying more systematic attention to ensuring scaling up of innovations that have been successfully implemented in the context of IFAD-financed projects	A clear and realistic scaling up agenda has been included in the new COSOP. VODP2 is scaling up the successful investment in oil palm through public-private partnership (PPP). PROFIRA is scaling up the methodology of savings and credit groups as well as the capacity building efforts on SACCOs with focus on sustainability of the supported institutions. The household mentoring approach successfully tested in DLSP will be scaled up in the new project PRELNOR and, more in general, mainstreamed in the Ministry of Local Government interventions.
<b>Recommendation 5: Functional and workload analysis as a basis for determining staff requirements and division of labour</b>							
Uganda	CPE	10	CTRY	OPER	ASR	The CPE recommends that IFAD undertake a functional and workload analysis to determine the administrative resources required to ensure that the next COSOP objectives are achieved in a timely manner. This entails assessing the human and budgetary resources available for managing the Uganda country programme, including for financial management and procurement purposes.	The human and budgetary resources for the Uganda country programme are adequate within the overall corporate budgetary and work force plan limitations.
Uganda	CPE	11	REG	OPER	HR	The role and responsibilities of the IFAD divisions at headquarters in Rome involved in supporting the Uganda country programme should also be clarified and defined.	This is an issue that goes beyond the Uganda country programme and touches on the functional relationships of HQ divisions with ICOs in general. Overall, the relationship between HQ and country offices is being clarified at the corporate level: this includes tools being developed to assign greater responsibilities to country offices and different models being implemented and assessed.
Uganda	CPE	12	REG	OPER	FLD	The CPE recommends that IFAD actively consider strengthening the Uganda country office, including outposting the Uganda CPM.	Outposting of the CPM to Uganda is being considered within the context of the divisional priorities. No strengthening of the budget office has occurred due to budget constraints; but other corporate measures are being implemented to support ICOs.

## B. Corporate Level Evaluation

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
<b>IFAD's institutional efficiency and efficiency of IFAD-funded operations (from Action Plan)</b>							
<b>Recommendation 1: Scaling up of high impact, innovative approaches emerging out of IFAD-supported projects and programmes should become the objectives of IFAD's business model</b>							
						<b>Increase strategic selectivity</b>	
IFAD	CLE	1	IFAD	POL	TGT	Prepare a paper outlining various options for country selectivity for consideration by the Executive Board.	The relevant paper is due for the September 2014 Board. IFAD management believes that the issue of country selectivity would need to be addressed in the context of the PBAS Working Group and the paper to this effect is planned to be submitted in the September 2014 session of the Executive Board.
						<b>Increase in-house technical expertise and reduce dependence on consultants</b>	
IFAD	CLE	2	IFAD	POL	EFF	Develop a grant programme to enhance strategic partnerships with FAO and CGIAR to provide technical assistance to fragile and weakly performing borrowing countries and to increase the production and management of knowledge	A programme with the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO) to bolster supervision and implementation support activities to address issues in poorly performing projects, especially ones in fragile institutional and social contexts was approved by the Executive Board in September 2013.
IFAD	CLE	3	IFAD	POL	FLD	Help build national technical capacity by drawing on the growing skilled labour force in borrowing member countries	IFAD is doing this in different ways. It is encouraging greater government participation in all phases of its programme and project work, and is promoting greater cooperation and cofinancing with local partners. With country presence and direct supervision, the involvement of locally recruited national staff is on the increase. This will help build, in part, national capacity in the longer run.
IFAD	CLE	4	IFAD	POL	FLD	Expand, as warranted, ICOs and strengthen their capacity by recruiting country programme officers and assistants	The Executive Board approved the establishment of 10 additional offices in the 2014-2015 period. This brings total ICOs up to 50. The Executive Board was informed that the 10 new offices will be staffed by Country Programme Officers.
IFAD	CLE	5	IFAD	STR	HR	Rationalize the use of consultants by recruiting additional specialist staff in PTA, to increase in-house technical capacity for providing field support during project design and supervision	The creation of new staff positions to strengthen internal technical and policy expertise within PTA is underway, including in areas such as country-level policy dialogue, nutrition, institutions/ programme implementation and rural enterprises/ markets.
						<b>Balance the workload among CPMs</b>	
IFAD	CLE	6	IFAD	STR	HR	Develop a more robust database with a management dashboard showing the status of the programme of work as a tool for workload analysis	Reports already available in PPMS showing status of programme of work and CPM responsibilities for investment projects. This reporting will be further enhanced after the deployment of GRIPS II and introduction of reporting from Data Warehouse.
IFAD	CLE	7	IFAD	STR	HR	Monitor CPM workloads using multiple factors (design, supervision, policy dialogue, etc.) and redistribute workload as necessary, through staff recruitment, rotation, country redistribution, etc.	System reports as above will support this process. Further rationalisation of the workload among CPMs has been undertaken following the conclusion of Efficiency evaluation and this exercise will be undertaken periodically. Over 2013, increased efforts have focused on staff mobility and career development (including for CPMs) - overall, over 180 people took advantage of some form of mobility, representing about 30% of the staff. This has been fully followed up, but needs

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
							regular monitoring in the future, which will be conducted through strategic workforce planning measures.
						<b>Implement a more differentiated allocation of resources and increase customization to country needs</b>	
IFAD	CLE	8	IFAD	POL	PMA	Focus administrative budget allocations to increase support to projects facing potential or actual risks (need-based differentiated allocation of resources)	In cases where additional resource allocations help in improving the performance of potential or actual problem projects, additional resources have been made available. A significant part of the portfolio is not fully responsive to IFAD's efforts given that these projects are affected by factors beyond IFAD's control (such as projects affected by conflict).
IFAD	CLE	9	IFAD	POL	TGT	Develop and implement more responsive instruments for MICs	IFAD's strategy and instruments for engagement with MICs are being reviewed to increase responsiveness to evolving circumstances in these countries. Management's proposals will be discussed in the IFAD10 replenishment consultation within a broader review of IFAD's business model.
						<b>Aim for better integration between lending and non-lending activities</b>	
						<b>Knowledge management and grants strategy</b>	
IFAD	CLE	10	IFAD	POL	KM	Implement the knowledge management (KM) framework and plan, including incentives for staff participation	The Knowledge Management Framework prepared in 2013 will enable IFAD to more effectively synthesize and manage lessons, experience and knowledge for improved performance. It supports the increasing focus on and linkage between improved M&E, impact evaluation, policy dialogue, partnership-building and scaling up. A process is underway to identify gaps and prioritise learning activities in the form of a targeted KM plan, placing emphasis on learning partnerships and improved use of the global and regional grant programme as a vital knowledge instrument. Its implementation will be underpinned by incentives developed for staff to manage knowledge more effectively that were integrated into IFAD's new competency framework (based on a review of good practice in other organizations), and the IFAD-wide KM Coordination Group which promotes a more collaborative and coherent approach to KM.
IFAD	CLE	11	IFAD	POL	RME	Conduct, synthesize and report on up to 30 impact evaluations	A RIMS survey inventory analysis was carried out to select the 24 projects that will be subject to ex post impact evaluation. The six projects to use randomized control trials (RCTs) methods were identified. Their evaluations will be conducted in the context of the 3IE Agricultural Innovation Thematic Window (supported with US\$10 million from DFID and the B&MGF). These projects have been matched with internationally renowned research institutions, including IFPRI, Wageningen University and Research Centre, the University of California, etc. which will conduct the impact studies. Support for the design of RCTs for ASAP-related projects is also being provided.



Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
IFAD	CLE	12	IFAD	POL	EFF	Revise internal guidelines to enhance the strategic orientation of IFAD's annual grant work plan for 2014-2015	Internal guidelines were revised in January 2014 to improve the strategic underpinning of the grant allocation process and pipeline development. The Matrix that drove allocations in 2014 was fully based on and corresponds with IFAD's Medium-term Plan and Strategic Framework objectives. Therefore, this has been fully followed up but a possible reorientation will be structured after the grants evaluation.
IFAD	CLE	13	IFAD	POL	EFF	Review and update IFAD's grants policy, strategy and procedures	Work on this action is in progress. The on-going Corporate Level Evaluation on the Grants Policy has triggered discussion on issues relating to policy focus and further streamlining of procedures, also as a part of the root and branch review of the grant programme led by IFAD's Vice-President.
IFAD	CLE	14	IFAD	POL	EFF	Upgrade the corporate management information system on projects (PPMS) to include information on stand-alone grants	Action completed. The GRIPS (Grants and Investment Projects System) was deployed in April 2013.
						<b>Policy dialogue</b>	
IFAD	CLE	15	IFAD	POL	DIA	Implement the action plan for CLPD prepared by PTA, including preparation of the first policy brief, active support to CPMS, and preparation of 4-5 country briefs per year	Advances have been made in mainstreaming policy engagement as a core part of IFAD's business model, though, among others, technical support to country programme management teams (CPMTs), learning events and consultations, including with policy makers from Member States. These initiatives will be continued in 2014 and 2015, not least as an integral dimension of scaling up processes. The efforts around country-level policy dialogue are being led by a Senior Policy Advisor (soon to be joined by another Policy Advisor).
						<b>Results-based country strategic opportunities programmes</b>	
IFAD	CLE	16	IFAD	POL	COS	Review and update IFAD's RB-COSOP guidelines, including the criteria for deciding when an RB-COSOP is required, e.g. in small country programmes	The issuance of revised RB-COSOP guidelines is scheduled for mid-2014. An inter-departmental team led by the AVP/PMD has been set up, and will produce a concise version of RB-COSOP guidelines and a full RB-COSOP Source Book.
						<b>Streamline operational processes</b>	
						<b>Quality enhancement and quality assurance processes</b>	
IFAD	CLE	17	IFAD	POL	DES	Revise the QE process	The QE process has been formally reformed with a view to enhancing the effectiveness and efficiency of PTA's contribution to the quality of IFAD-funded projects. As a result, the bulk of PTA engagement was shifted from the QE review panel "event" towards greater participation of PTA in the country programme management team (CPMT).
IFAD	CLE	18	IFAD	POL	DES	Revise the QA process; early engagement of staff may involve travel	The quality assurance (QA) process has been revised. Following a pilot period in 2013, all project concept notes are now reviewed before entering into IFAD's project design pipeline (in addition to the "traditional" QA review held at the end of the project cycle). Moreover, in 2014, the QA Secretariat is also piloting an approach to provide QA input at the Quality Enhancement (QE) review stage. QA Secretariat staff will accompany select supervision missions, starting in March 2014, to monitor compliance with

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
							QA recommendations and better understand common challenges and issues encountered during supervision.
						<b>Project supervision and financial management</b>	
IFAD	CLE	19	IFAD	POL	SUP	Issue revised guidelines for project supervision that incorporate the recommendations made in CLEE and the corporate-level evaluation of supervision	Draft Joint Implementation Review guidelines have been prepared and circulated internally for comments before being formally issued.
IFAD	CLE	20	IFAD	POL	SUP	Implement reforms to enhance the quality of financial management in projects, such as introduction of risk-based methodologies, increased reliance on country systems and capacity-building in financial management for project staff and IFAD's workforce	Gradual introduction of modern Financial Management practices is on-going. A range of CFS Guidance Notes have been issued on FM risk assessments, selection of project auditors, financial reporting and documenting results of FM assessments. Staff training was completed on country PFM (public financial management) Assessments. Capacity building events for project staff were conducted for APR and WCA/ESA.
IFAD	CLE	21	IFAD	POL	PMA	Replace the LGS with a new, modern web-enabled platform, to create a strong foundation for subsequently developing a borrower self-service portal that supports electronic disbursements	The legacy loan administration system has been retired and the replacement Flexcube system (Phase 1) with an integrated Data Warehouse was rolled-out in November 2013. Work is ongoing to finalise certain reports and functionalities which were not ready on go-live. This is expected to be finalised by Q2 2014.
IFAD	CLE	22	IFAD	STR	FLD	Scale up the Nairobi disbursement processing unit to an interregional decentralized hub servicing Western and Central, Eastern and Southern, and Northeast and Near African countries, by gradually shifting additional loan administration tasks from Rome to the Nairobi unit	The scaling up of the Nairobi Disbursement Centre is progressing. The Centre now processes all ESA and 90% of WCA disbursements. Transfer of NEN disbursements to the Centre is scheduled to commence by mid-2014.
						<b>Accounting and financial reporting</b>	
IFAD	CLE	23	IFAD	POL	FLD	Provide an enabling environment to support extension of decentralized country offices by implementing a financial accountability framework for decentralized operations in ICOs and enabling access to financial systems	This action is being addressed as part of a broader corporate initiative, the outcome of which will determine IFAD's approach to expenditure monitoring and reporting on IFAD Country Offices (COs).
IFAD	CLE	24	IFAD	STR	EFF	Enhance system automation and business processes to achieve both reporting accuracy and resource monitoring effectiveness, as well as process simplification	<p>Actions completed include: automation of payments voucher generation and computations of MICS for processing of Consultants' Payments; self- approval of low value payments as an initiative of the risk based controls framework; systems auto alerts for Contributions correspondence with Member States.</p> <p>Actions in progress include: Supplementary Funds database and reporting automation.</p> <p>Actions starting in 2014 include: Payroll one-off staff payments to be processed in Accounts payable; automation of the financial statements preparation and review process; paperless approval.</p>
						<b>Enhance staff skills and productivity</b>	
IFAD	CLE	25	IFAD	STR	HR	Intensify staff training programmes in project supervision, financial management, etc.	Staff training on assessing PFM systems of countries using the PEFA (Public Expenditure and Financial Accountability) methodology was completed in November 2013. An e-learning tool on IFAD's FM policies and procedures has been developed in all official languages and disseminated in early 2014 to IFAD workforce, FM consultants and project FM staff.

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
IFAD	CLE	26	IFAD	STR	KM	Make relevant knowledge products available to frontline staff, such as CPMs, in easily accessible formats	Knowledge management process has been strengthened within IFAD, with a continuous stream of learning and knowledge-sharing events, and improvements to the quality enhancement QE/QA processes. See also progress on action 10 above on KM Framework and Plan.
IFAD	CLE	27	IFAD	STR	HR	Intensify staff training programmes for topics such as project supervision and financial administration, etc.	Same as 25 above. (repeated in the CLEE Action Plan submitted to the Board; retained here to retain the original numbering up to 50 recommendations)
<b>CLEE recommendation 2: Articulate and implement a clear vision for country presence and how IFAD would operate in a decentralized environment</b>							
IFAD	CLE	28	IFAD	POL	HR	Prepare and submit for Board approval a review of IFAD's Country Presence Policy and Strategy	IFAD's Country Presence Strategy for 2014-2015 was submitted to the Executive Board in December 2013 (EB 2013/110/R.5/Rev.1), then was discussed in an informal session with the Executive Board in January 2014, and subsequently was approved. This entails the continued use of existing criteria for opening country offices and existing criteria for selecting various models of country office and the existing exit strategy for country offices, and finally, establishment of up to 10 additional country offices, nine of which are specified.
<b>CLEE recommendation 3: Manage oversight and support units, including critical ICT functions, with a clear focus on increasing service quality and cost-efficiency</b>							
						<b>Improve business processes</b>	
IFAD	CLE	29	IFAD	STR	EFF	Develop efficiency indicators and benchmarks for key business processes to facilitate the identification of opportunities for process streamlining and cost saving	The development of a new suite of internal process efficiency indicators is in progress to identify pragmatic ways of tracking costs and performance in a number of key processes; a pilot will be launched in 2014. Preliminary consultations are underway with other IFIs about the possibility of establishing common process and efficiency measures.
IFAD	CLE	30	IFAD	STR	EFF	Delegate procurement authority to division directors for conducting low-value procurement of up to €10,000 and related changes in workflow	The new version of the Corporate Procurement Manual has been prepared and the agreed changes will be applied in the first half of 2014. This includes the delegation of low value procurements to Division Directors. The new manual will be issued with a President's Bulletin by end Q2 2014. The related changes in PeopleSoft workflow are expected to be released by April 2014 as a pilot project for 2 divisions. After successful testing this will be rolled out to other divisions together with an enhanced and user friendly e-procurement interface.
IFAD	CLE	31	IFAD	STR	EFF	Further streamline travel processing, including making the necessary adjustments to the Enterprise Resource Planning (ERP) system	The following adjustments to the PeopleSoft system are to be delivered by April 2014: (1) allowance of the system to automatically process a 50% daily subsistence allowance (DSA) for Preferred Hotel Programme ( PHP) location, Rome; (2) implementation of the expense automation process; (3) pre-calculation of terminals on TA; (4) changes to the current workflow, allowing Travel Manager to modify the report after Budget Holder approval, elimination of the need for Budget Holder approval when the difference between Travel Expenses Report (TER) and Travel Authorization (TA) is less than 10%, batch approval for TERs with zero changes. To be delivered in Q2 2014: (1) integration with United Nations Department of Safety and Security (UNDSS) to allow users to pre-populate data from their TA; (2) review of Business Purposes related to

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
							travel; (3) control for consultant payments.
IFAD	CLE	32	IFAD	POL	EFF	Streamline the Corporate Procurement Guidelines to enhance administrative efficiency by eliminating transactional steps for low-value and low-risk purchases	The new version of the Corporate Procurement Manual has been prepared and the agreed changes will be applied in the first half of 2014. This includes the delegation of low value procurements to Division Directors. The new manual will be issued with a President's Bulletin by end Q2 2014. The related changes in PeopleSoft workflow are to be released by April 2014 as a pilot project for 2 divisions. After successful testing this will be rolled out to other divisions together with an enhanced and user friendly e-procurement interface.
						<b>Increase application of information and communications technology</b>	
IFAD	CLE	33	IFAD	STR	ICT	Integrate the core IT platforms (Oracle-PeopleSoft ERP, Agile Open Source and Microsoft)	Integration of core IT platforms is more of an approach than a specific project. For example, the implementation of Flexcube integrated Loan/Grants disbursements with PeopleSoft Payments and the Data Warehouse. GRIPS is integrating the Loan and Grants pipeline data for the first time in IFAD history, with further integration to the disbursement system. Other examples of projects implementing integrations are: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Scriptoria and the MultiCorpora translation system</li> <li>• Members interactive Platform and the Governing Bodies meeting tool</li> <li>• The People directory system with PeopleSoft HR</li> <li>• PeopleSoft T&amp;E with the UNDSS security system</li> </ul>
IFAD	CLE	34	IFAD	STR	ICT	Upgrade IFAD's software systems to enable more effective and efficient administrative support of ICOs	New systems GRIPs and Flexcube which are replacing the legacy PPMS and LGS systems allow ICOs browser based access to IFAD's core project pipeline and disbursement systems. This means that ICOs will always have access to the same version of the software as headquarters and removes the inefficient upgrading of the old client based systems. <p>Analysis of the current business process has started to understand the requirements of relevant stakeholders in functionality such as procurement, local payments and expense reconciliation. Any change to business process will require the agreement across functional areas and may impact the hosting agreements in terms of system use.</p> <p>A project is underway to provide improved connection with ICOs specifically in the first instance to improve Video Conferencing.</p>
IFAD	CLE	35	IFAD	STR	ICT	Implement Information and Communications Technology (ICT) systems to support IFAD's operational monitoring and evaluation processes	Systems identified to support M&E that were identified at Information Technology Governance Committee (ITGC) for 2014/2015 are: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Project financial risk indicators</li> <li>• Audit report tracking for Grants</li> <li>• Extend results and impact monitoring to project level</li> </ul> <p>At the impact level, new guidelines are being developed in 2014. The process will include software for data entry and analysis, to assist projects and to be developed by PMD in</p>

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
IFAD	CLE	36	IFAD	STR	ICT	Implement mobile technologies to allow access to IFAD systems on the move via a range of devices including smart phones and tablets	consultation with ICT. New applications being developed are browser based and so can be accessed from mobile devices. The Members' interactive platform for example was upgraded to allow use from mobile devices, resizing the layout of information depending on the device being used. Oracle has released an application for mobile devices which allows access of IFAD business intelligence (BI) applications from mobile devices which is currently being tested. Moving forward, opportunities to leverage mobile technologies will be analysed in areas such as approval processes.
IFAD	CLE	37	IFAD	STR	ICT	Develop business intelligence solutions to provide relevant management information to support business decisions	The new LGS reporting was implemented in Data Warehouse using BI. Employee BI dashboards for HRD which give a dashboard view of employee data held in the different PeopleSoft HR modules have been delivered for use in HRD. The latter will be rolled out as a self-service functionality for all employees in 2014.
IFAD	CLE	38	IFAD	STR	ICT	Introduce the Grants and Investment Projects System (GRIPS), retire PPMS and reconfigure existing systems that rely on it	CSD: GRIPS has been implemented for Grants. A project is currently underway to bring investment project data into GRIPS, scheduled for go-live in early Q2 2014. This will improve reporting significantly as it will allow financial and other data to be sourced from multiple applications.
IFAD	CLE	39	IFAD	STR	ICT	Upgrade the Operations Dashboard to accommodate new business imperatives, using information from GRIPS and Flexcube	This is envisaged once Data Warehouse has been fully populated. Data Warehouse will allow for integration of information from different systems (i.e., PeopleSoft and FlexCube) and within modules of PeopleSoft.
<b>CLEE recommendation 4: Better manage scarce budgetary resources towards high-quality results</b>							
IFAD	CLE	40	IFAD	POL	EFF	Augment capacity in the central budget function; a Director of BOD will be recruited, reporting to the Vice President of IFAD	Director of BOD has been recruited and joined in April 2014, reporting to the Vice-President.
IFAD	CLE	41	IFAD	OPER	EFF	Strengthen the mid-year review and optimize the budget reallocation process	The mid-year review process in 2014 will benefit greatly from the centralization of the funds arising from vacant positions. A rigorous review will be carried out, led by a senior consultant.
IFAD	CLE	42	IFAD	OPER	EFF	Study the possibility of automating quarterly budget monitoring and sharing	Automation and sharing of quarterly reports is being developed within the Oracle BI tool, and will be piloted in due course.
<b>CLEE recommendation 5: Manage strategically the skills composition, cost and performance of the workforce</b>							
IFAD	CLE	43	IFAD	STR	HR	Refine the strategic workforce planning exercise in 2014 (and successive years), to ensure that IFAD has the requisite workforce in terms of headcount, competencies and skills to enable it to deliver on the key strategic objectives of IFAD9, 2013-2015	The SWP is firmly established as an annual process that provides a staffing complement for each division, which is used as the basis for the annual budget exercise. The process to agree on the workforce for 2015 begins in March 2014.
IFAD	CLE	44	IFAD	OPER	HR	Develop and implement a job titling and job family system for IFAD, as a follow-up to the job audit exercise	Job family and job titling systems were endorsed by the OMC in December 2013. Also, the OMC endorsed the introduction of Generic Job Profiles in IFAD. These three tools will be officially launched in March 2014.

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
IFAD	CLE	45	IFAD	OPER	HR	Implement a new rewards and recognition framework, taking into account best practices for talent and rewards management that include monetary and non-monetary rewards	IFAD's first Reward and Recognition Framework including monetary and non-monetary rewards will be implemented in 2014 based on the 2013 performance cycle. The Framework complies with ICSC guidelines and is aligned with key UN common system priorities in the area of human resources management.
IFAD	CLE	46	IFAD	OPER	HR	Strengthen the performance management system to provide managers with the tools to recognize excellent performance and to motivate staff to achieve continuously stronger results	Following an external assessment, IFAD's performance management process and system have been further enhanced in support of the implementation of the Reward and Recognition Framework. As part of this process, a new Competency Framework was launched in 2013 and will be a central element of IFAD's HR management as it will be used in strategic workforce planning, recruitment, performance management and 360 degree feedback, reward and recognition, and staff development.
IFAD	CLE	47	IFAD	OPER	HR	Follow up on the 2012 Global Staff Survey to address key staff concerns	During 2013 a major follow up to the 2012 GSS results was organized. Staff was consulted on their major concerns and on required actions. Senior Management agreed on 6 recommended actions through an extensive consultation process. Recommendations and actions that were implemented include specific policy changes and supportive arrangements (e.g. indefinite contracts, rotation, online career/ interview coaching) behavioural change initiatives (e.g. IMT behavioural commitments, management development programme) and implementation of new ways to engage staff (e.g. Info to staff on EB, organisation of first Global Staff Meeting, etc.). In February 2014 OMC was presented with a summary of results.
<b>CLEE recommendation 7: Instil an institutional culture of accountability and performance, and strengthen reporting for results</b>							
IFAD	CLE	48	IFAD	OPER	HR	Revise the IFAD accountability framework to incorporate CLEE recommendations	An update on IFAD's accountability framework, including an outline of the key components, was presented to the Executive Board in its 110th session. Details and structures of the three components- political covenant with member states, internal controls and complaints and response mechanisms- were outlined. Further, the CLEE recommendations are being addressed by the divisions/ departments concerned for incorporation into IFAD's accountability framework
IFAD	CLE	49	IFAD	OPER	HR	Define delegation of authority to address CLEE recommendations	Management is currently reviewing and modernizing IFAD's Delegation of Authority Framework. This work will cover a range of different areas, all the way from the delegation of authority on financial and human resource matters, to devolving greater authority to field offices in order to accompany IFAD's new and evolving business model. This work is currently in progress and is being undertaken under the overall guidance of the Office of the President and Vice President, in close collaboration with the Office of the General Counsel. Improvements will be made to areas identified in the CLEE as requiring further attention, in addition to the concerns reported by IFAD departments through an information collection process that has been set in motion. A modern electronic platform, that is accessible and user-friendly, is the expected end product.

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
IFAD	CLE	50	IFAD	STR	RME	Improve the data and information base for IFAD's Results Measurement Framework	M&E and impact evaluation capacity is being strengthened to provide expert advice to projects at different stages of the programme cycle. Impact evaluation guidelines have been developed, placing strong premium on the integration of IFAD-supported project M&E systems within broader national M&E systems. To support gender mainstreaming throughout IFAD's programmes and projects, IFAD has set up systems to closely monitor and report on gender indicators. Guidelines for the Results and Impact Measurement System (RIMS) and the preparation of Project Completion Reports (PCRs) will be updated in 2014 to ensure that improved M&E and impact assessment methods and practices are fully mainstreamed into IFAD's results measurement processes.

## II. Follow up on historic recommendations: PRISMA 2008-2012

**Note:** All evaluations that were included in the PRISMA between 2008 and 2012 were tracked and followed-up a second time for the recommendations that were not fully implemented when reviewed for the first time. Two project evaluations were not covered, however:

- A project evaluation from North Korea in 2010: North Korea is no longer in the pipeline and no project is foreseen in the country, therefore it is not possible to follow up on recommendations, and follow up was not conducted in previous PRISMA cycles; and
- A project evaluation from Burkina Faso in 2009: In this case, the recommendations were addressed to a possible follow up project PNGT2 (Community-Based Rural Development Project Phase II). The PNGT 2 project was not designed by IFAD. In line with the government's revised rural sector strategy, IFAD was asked by the government to design follow-up projects to two other projects, namely the PICOFA and PDRD projects. Lessons and experiences from these projects were incorporated into the Neer/Tamba project that focused on soil and water conservation and agroforestry, and operated in the same areas. Therefore IFAD was not involved in PNGT 2, and the recommendations from the evaluation were no longer relevant for IFAD.

In terms of CLEs, the second round of follow up was done for the private sector evaluation (2012), the innovation evaluation (2011), and the rural finance evaluation (2008). For the following recommendations, follow up on individual recommendations was not undertaken:

- Evaluation on the regional strategy in the Asia and Pacific from PRISMA2008: The regional strategy was not adopted and the recommendations have been superseded by developments since the evaluation (evaluation conducted before 2008).
- The field presence evaluation from PRISMA 2008: The evaluation and its recommendations have been superseded by extensive developments since the evaluation (conducted before 2008). IFAD's Country Presence Strategy for 2014-2015 was submitted to the Executive Board in December 2013 (EB 2013/110/R.5/Rev.1), then was discussed in an informal session with the Executive Board in January 2014, and subsequently was approved.
- Joint Evaluation with the African Development Bank in 2011: This has been followed-up a second time by IOE in close co-operation with IFAD management.



## A. Country and project evaluations from PRISMA 2012

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up	Status	PRISMA year	Update in 2014
<b>India - Country programme Evaluation</b>										
India	CPE	20	GOV	OPER	STR	State Government should ensure: (i) smooth flow of funds; ii) timely provision of counterpart funds; (iii) their direct participation in Joint Review Missions; (iv) timely follow-up on agreed recommendations; (v) ensure competitive and attractive salaries and allowances, including their timely adjustments, so as to recruit and retain highly qualified project staff, including NGO staff; and (vi) and last but not least, continuity of tenure of Project Directors and key-management staff.	There are no current problems with flow-of-funds. All supervision missions are undertaken jointly with State Governments - they are called Joint Review Missions (JRM). Follow-up on mission recommendations is excellent in most cases. In 2011, three projects moved out of problem status. Salary structures range from being very competitive to being very uncompetitive. Project Directors continue to rotate frequently in some States (for example Tamil Nadu, Madhya Pradesh and Maharashtra). Often, this is due to state-level political issues.	PA / partial	2012	Some of these issues were leading to problems in projects. Overall, there has been a reduction in problem projects from 5 in 2010 to 1 in 2014. There are no current problems with flow-of-funds. All supervision missions are still undertaken jointly with State Governments - the Joint Review Missions (JRM). Follow-up on mission recommendations continues to be consistent and excellent.
India	CPE	22	CTRY	OPER	COS	Given the size of the programme, the country and the number of rural poor, it is recommended that financing larger projects should not result in a commensurate cut in IFAD's administrative budget allocated towards country programme management.	The 2012 India budget allocation has seen a very marginal decline compared to the 2011 budget execution.	PA	2012	With the approved zero nominal growth over the IFAD 9 period, there is a slight decrease in admin budget year on year. Big reductions in unit costs have been achieved. Formulation costs are now as low as US\$80 000. Supervision mission costs are now as low as US\$30 000. This has mostly been achieved by relying on local expertise and mission teams comprised of national consultants.
India	CPE	23	CTRY	OPER	FLD	There is a need to further strengthen the IFAD country office in India, including the out posting of the country programme manager (CPM) to Delhi and appointment of a full-time coordinator. In general, a strengthened country office is required to enhance project supervision and implementation support, improve policy dialogue, strengthen cooperation and harmonisation with other donors, and further facilitate	This is subject to IFAD's Country Presence Policy and Strategy approved by the EB in Sept. 2011, which sets out the policy for outposting CPMs and opening up sub-regional offices. The India Country Office has been strengthened with the appointment of a senior Country Coordinator in September 2011.	O /ongoing	2012	The India Country Office has been strengthened with the appointment of a senior Country Coordinator in September 2011. IFAD has committed to outpost the CPM by the end of 2015. IFAD is waiting for the Host Country Agreement to be approved by the Cabinet. Once approved, and signed by both parties, the CPM can be certified for out-posting.

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up	Status	PRISMA year	Update in 2014
						follow-up on supervision and mid-term review decisions.				
India	CPE	25	CTRY	OPER	FLD	In this regard, the opportunities, challenges and budgetary implications of out posting the India CPM should be examined in order to bring full decision making and follow-up actions related to IFAD operations closer to the country level.	IFAD has committed to outpost the CPM by the end of 2015. The budget implications of outposting the CPM will be examined and will be clear when the process of outposting progresses further are unknown. More active follow-up at the country level has now been enabled through the appointment of the Country Coordinator in September 2011.	O	2012	IFAD is waiting for the hosting country agreement (HCA) to be approved by the Cabinet, so that it can be signed, and out-posting can occur. IFAD has committed to outpost the CPM by the end of 2015. Decision making and follow-up are already decentralized to the country following the appointment of a Country Coordinator in September 2011.
India	CPE	29	GOV	OPER	HR	Central Government and State Government shall endeavour to ensure continuity in project directors to the extent possible.	In some States (for example Tamil Nadu, Madhya Pradesh and Maharashtra), there is still very poor continuity of project directors. In other projects (Uttarakhand, North-East), the continuity of project directors has improved.	PA	2012	There has been a big overall improvement in the reduction of rotation across the country programme. However in some States there is still frequent rotation of project directors.
India	CPE	30	CTRY	OPER	HR	IFAD and the Government could consider alternatives including, inter alia, recruiting from the open market or deputing senior level staff from established civil society organizations.	Alternatives were considered during the design of both the new projects in Uttarakhand and Jharkhand. Usually, the government nominates a civil services officials. In the case of Jharkand, in order to maintain continuity, the incumbent project director was appointed. In the case of Uttarakhand, the discussions are ongoing about the recruitment process.	O	2012	Alternatives are being exercised in all the new projects. The favoured option at present is a part time IAS (Indian Administrative Office) officer as the PD, with a full time deputy PD (sometimes recruited from the open market).
India	CPE	33	CTRY	OPER	RME	In close collaboration with the Asia and the Pacific Division, IOE will explore opportunities for supporting the Planning Commission's efforts to establish an independent evaluation outfit in India. Given its mandate and specialisation, IFAD's contribution will be restricted to evaluation capacity development in the agriculture and rural sectors. This will include initiatives to	IOE has updated Management that IOE has held numerous discussions with the Planning Commission (Abhijit Sen) and the Ministry of Finance (several staff) on independent evaluation in India. In fact, in early 2011, the Government of India indeed established an Independent Evaluation Office, and further discussions are ongoing (with the head of the office, Abhijit Banerjee) on how	O	2012	For IOE follow up

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up	Status	PRISMA year	Update in 2014
						further enhance project-level monitoring and evaluation systems, so that they are also equipped to effectively collect, analyse and report on results and impact in addition to the achievement of physical and financial targets.	IOE can support their activities and capabilities in the future.			
<b>Kenya - Country programme Evaluation</b>										
Kenya	CPE	2	CTRY	STR	COS	The COSOP should specifically analyse, among other issues, the poverty profile of the rural poor in arid and semi-arid lands, the prevailing institutional capacities and infrastructure to support economic development, as well as the opportunities for partnership with other donors who could provide essential complementary inputs.	This is reflected in the TOR (Terms of reference) for COSOP formulation. IFAD has contributed to the formulation of the "Joint Initiative between the Government of Kenya (GoK) and Rome-based Agencies on Disaster Risk Reduction (DRR) and Resilience Building in the ASALs of Kenya" but IFAD role in implementation from 2013 will be determined by provisions in the new COSOP. The COSOP TOR specifically highlights these recommendations of the CPE: analysis of the poverty profile of the rural poor, institutional analysis and opportunities for partnerships.	O	2012	Issue fully addressed. The COSOP approved in September 2013 provides a poverty profile of arid and semi-arid lands (ASALs) smallholders, institutional capacities and partnership opportunities as follows Key file 2: Organizations matrix (strengths, weaknesses, opportunities and threats; Key file 3: Complementary donor initiative/partnership potential; and Key file 4: Target group identification, priority issues and potential response.
Kenya	CPE	3	CTRY	STR	COS	The COSOP should clearly define a narrower set of sub-sectors to prioritise in the future, including commodity value chain development with greater engagement of the private sector, small-scale participatory irrigation development especially in the arid and semi-arid lands, livestock development, agriculture technology to enhance productivity and long-term soil fertility, and natural resources and environmental management.	This is reflected in the TOR for COSOP formulation: highlighting that the COSOP should clearly define a narrower set of sub-sectors including commodity value chain development.	O	2012	Issue fully addressed. 2. The COSOP approved in September 2013 is focused with emphasis on intensification, value addition, market access, and sustainable natural resource management in the agricultural sector.
Kenya	CPE	4	CTRY	STR	COS	The COSOP should explicitly articulate thematic areas that will not be covered by IFAD	This is reflected in the TOR for COSOP formulation: clearly stating that the COSOP should	O	2012	Issue fully addressed. New COSOP approved in September 2013 states that - IFAD contribution to improving

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up	Status	PRISMA year	Update in 2014
						interventions in the future, including domestic water supply, health and sanitation, as they are not areas where IFAD has a comparative advantage.	articulate thematic areas that will not be covered by IFAD in the future, including domestic water supply, health and sanitation.			rural incomes and livelihoods was constrained by: the highly varied nature of activities; insufficient attention to policy dialogue and partnerships; and the exclusive focus on the HMP areas and non-exploitation of the economic potential in the ASALs. Accordingly this COSOP focuses on two priority themes – sustainable natural resource management (NRM) and intensification of agricultural production with linkage to markets.
Kenya	CPE	9	CTRY	STR	INN	The next COSOP should clearly highlight areas where innovation will be pursued in the country programme, following a thorough assessment of areas where the introduction of innovation in agriculture can contribute to better results in reducing rural poverty.	This is reflected in the TOR for COSOP formulation (the first mission to be held in May 2012), requiring that clear areas for innovation should be highlighted. Objectives and scope of work also include identifying opportunities for innovation within each of the strategic objectives, including existing activities/initiatives with potential to be scaled up.	O	2012	Issue fully addressed. Areas for innovation are highlighted in COSOP which was approved by EB September 2013. COSOP highlights opportunities for scaling up of innovations by GoK, IFAD, donor agencies, the private sector, and south-south cooperation. Under Strategic objective 1 innovations will cover content of training in sustainable NRM and rainwater harvesting, formulation of community-based plans aimed at improving NRM and rural livelihoods, integration of climate change adaptation for enhanced resilience of ecosystems with livelihoods, mechanisms of payment for ecosystem services, low carbon technologies for value chain development and employment creation, improving access to land for cultivation in the forest reserve buffer zone, and use of mapping and GIS as NRM tools. Under Strategic objective 2, innovation will focus on holistic extension systems to ensure that the introduced technologies for intensification take into account climate change, mechanisms for reaching women and youth, efficient and sustainable technologies, and reduction of vulnerability to risks and shocks. Under Strategic objective 3, innovative ways will be needed for strengthening pastoral groups, reinforcing marketing structures in strategic sites, access to credit, and fostering public-private partnerships along the agricultural value chain.

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up	Status	PRISMA year	Update in 2014
Kenya	CPE	10	CTRY	STR	SCA	The new COSOP should devote emphasis to scaling up for wider poverty impact. This will however require greater investment in building partnership with multilateral development banks and other donors as well as engage the Government in policy dialogue, based on good practice examples and lessons emerging from the field.	This is reflected in the TOR for COSOP formulation, emphasizing scaling up for wider poverty impact. Specific objectives also include articulating a clear link between scaling up and the objectives and indicators in the results matrix and defining the drivers, spaces and pathways for scaling up.	O	2012	Issue fully addressed. New COSOP emphasizes that IFAD will continue to strengthen partnerships with government agencies, development partners, farmers organizations, the private sector and research bodies in its effort to make available the necessary knowledge and resources to enable poor rural people to overcome poverty. First programme signed under COSOP in March 2014 is based on partnership with the EU, the private sector and farmer organizations. A 2 <sup>nd</sup> programme under design is based on potential partnership with EU, FAO, WFP, private sector and farmer organizations.
Kenya	CPE	11	CTRY	STR	COS	The new COSOP should more precisely articulate how the various IFAD instruments (loans, regional and country grants, policy dialogue, partnership building and knowledge management) will complement each other and contribute towards the achievement of country programme objectives.	This is reflected in the TOR for COSOP formulation, emphasizing the need for articulating how the various instruments will complement each other and contribute towards achievement of country program objectives. The specific objectives include examining the full range of instruments including loans, grants, policy dialogue, partnerships, knowledge management, pooled financing arrangements and scaling up.	O	2012	This recommendation is addressed as we engage the design of new loans, country and regionals grants to strengthen linkages between IFAD various instruments.
Kenya	CPE	12	CTRY	STR	COS	The non-lending activities will need to be resourced adequately, if they are to truly contribute to strengthening coherence within the country programme.	This will be reflected in the formulation of the COSOP and in annual budgeting exercise. The TOR already specifies that non-lending activities will need to be adequately resourced. A closer examination of various non-lending activities including knowledge management, policy dialogue and partnerships has been specified in the objectives and scope of work.	O	2012	Issue addressed. A programme-analyst non-lending officer was assigned to IRON (IFAD Regional Office in Nairobi) in 2013 to strengthen the management of non-lending activities and linkages with the country programme.
Kenya	CPE	13	CTRY	STR	DIA	In terms of priority for policy dialogue, based on the experience from IFAD-supported projects, the Fund	The formulation of the COSOP will provide an entry point for this emphasis; this is reflected in the TOR. Specifically, under	O	2012	Issue addressed. The COSOP Provides that for policy dialogue outcome expectations will also focus on strengthened knowledge base in

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up	Status	PRISMA year	Update in 2014
						could support Government in developing new and refining existing policies for livestock development especially in arid and semi-arid areas, water management, and private sector engagement in small scale agriculture.	the COSOP, IFAD would support the formulation of polices for the Dairy Industry, Feed and Fertilizer, and Horticulture, and participate actively in policy dialogue with government and other donors related to the ASALs.			climate resilient livelihoods and ecosystems as well as community based environment and NRM. Based on the experience in Kenya, IFAD will pursue the following approaches for policy dialogue: (a) participation in relevant sector working groups, identifying key policy issues and pursuing these with the Government of Kenya (GoK), including improving private sector participation in project implementation; (b) strengthening the capacity of GoK agencies to formulate national policies; (c) supporting organizations of rural people to enable them to participate in policy dialogue; (d) operationalizing at the county and project levels national policies, such as the new ALFA Act; (e) creating opportunities for regional or south-south sharing of policy experience and approaches; and (f) agreeing on policy reforms prior to project implementation.
Kenya	CPE	14	CTRY	OPER	PAR	Partnerships with the African Development Bank (AfDB), Food and Agriculture Organization (FAO), United States Agency for International Development (USAID) and World Bank should be strengthened, especially in identifying options for co-financing operations and scaling up, as well as undertaking joint policy dialogue with Government on key agriculture and rural development issues.	The formulation of the COSOP will provide an entry point for this emphasis. The formulation team will consult with various partners in finalising the COSOP.	O	2012	Issue addressed. The preparation of the COSOP was highly participatory involving stakeholder and high-level consultations in the Ministry of Finance and the 10 agricultural sector ministries; United Nations agencies such as the Food and Agriculture Organization, World Food Programme, United Nations Development Programme and the United Nations Human Settlement Programme; the United States Agency for International Development, non-governmental organizations (NGOs), farmers umbrella organizations and the private sector. IFAD is part of the United Nations Country Team (UNCT), and the agricultural and rural development donor groups where consultations are conducted between partners. Partnerships are being strengthened under the country programme. A new programme - Kenya Cereal Enhancement Programme (KCEP) signed in March 2013 - was designed with technical support from FAO and is

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up	Status	PRISMA year	Update in 2014
										financed in partnership with European Union. A new design is underway with potential partnership with EU, FAO and WFP.
Kenya	CPE	17	CTRY	OPER	TCB	IFAD can provide support to capacity building of government officials for better service delivery at the local level, support the Government in the implementation of the national irrigation policy, and contribute to improving its financial and procurement systems to ensure more timely flow of funds and due diligence in use of resources.	Capacity building at the local government level is integral to IFAD projects and Government endorsement of small-scale irrigation will enable support for irrigation policy.	O	2012	Capacity building at the local government level is integral to IFAD projects and Government endorsement of small-scale irrigation will enable support for irrigation policy.
Kenya	CPE	20	REG	STR	FLD	It is essential that the relationships between the Kenya country office and the IFAD regional office in East and Southern Africa be rapidly outlined and communicated to all concerned in Kenya and throughout the region.	The relationships will be further outlined following the visit by the new East and Southern Division (ESA) Director and the Human Resources (HR) Advisor to Nairobi. At the Nairobi Office retreat in January 2012, it was proposed to make the Nairobi Office an IFAD Regional Office at Nairobi (IRON) since it now has staff from ESA, CFS, ECD and partly PTA. Another idea that was mooted was to reinforce the exchange of expertise and experience between ESA and WCA and the inclusion of some WCA countries in the workload of the Nairobi CFS staff.	O	2012	Issue addressed. Office regional business model and organogram was developed in consultation with business partners, HRD, PTA, Field support Unit, etc. and presented by ESA director at Global staff meeting in February/March 2014. Change agenda is underway and staffing is addressed: recruitment, transfer, and where applicable separation of staff is underway in line with new business model.
Kenya	CPE	21	REG	STR	FLD	The regional office's organizational structure should be articulated clearly, including its relationships with headquarters and the various country programmes in the region, the technical expertise that should be housed there, and its work programme.	The formalization of relationships between the regional office and headquarters, and the country programmes, and the technical expertise to be housed in Nairobi will be further advanced following the visit of the new ESA Director and HR Advisor to Nairobi in April 2012. Since June 2011, the following additional staff has joined the Nairobi Office: CPO (03/10/11),	O	2012	Issue addressed. Office regional business model and organogram was developed in consultation with business partners, HRD, PTA, Field support Unit, etc. and presented by ESA director at Global staff meeting in February/March 2014. Change agenda is underway and staffing is addressed: recruitment, transfer, and where applicable separation of staff is underway in line with new business model.

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up	Status	PRISMA year	Update in 2014
							RCES-ECD (09/01/12) and financial Intern (30/01/12). The process to recruit a Regional Finance Officer (CFS) is ongoing.			
Kenya	CPE	22	REG	OPER	FLD	It would be advisable to develop specific indicators that can be used to evaluate the performance and contribution of the regional office at an appropriate time in the future, including indicators that might shed light on value for money of the regional office.	The indicators will be revisited after the visit of the ESA Director and HR Advisor. In the meantime, the vision for the Nairobi Office defined at the retreat in January is: "Work together seamlessly as one organization to maximize IFAD impacts in East and Southern Africa - so as to be recognized as an effective partner in alleviating rural poverty"	O	2012	Issue addressed. Audit of office scheduled in 2014 to evaluate IRON performance. Findings and recommendations of the audit will document value for money.
Kenya	CPE	23	REG	OPER	FLD	Similarly, it would be useful for ESA to prepare a periodic progress report on the regional office for the IFAD Senior Management, outlining the achievements and challenges of such a decentralised organizational arrangement.	The ESA Director will outline the reporting framework after the visit to Nairobi in April	O	2012	Issue addressed. Office regional business model and organogram were developed in consultation with business partners, HRD, PTA, Field support Unit, etc. and presented by ESA director at Global staff meeting in February/March 2014. Change agenda is underway and ESA director regularly updates Senior Management and President on progresses.
<b>Niger - Country programme Evaluation</b>										
Niger	CPE	4	CTRY	STR	PAR	IFAD should support the process of regionalization of the rural development strategy for Maradi, as the Government would like to see, and fully integrate IFAD financed interventions within the regional strategy, which will then constitute the programme which the Government would control.	The government's rural development strategy (SDR) has now been replaced by a new food security and agricultural development strategy (i3N- Initiative for Nigerians Feeding Nigerians). Therefore, this recommendation in its current form is no longer relevant. In the context of the new strategy, IFAD's operations are fully integrated in the new i3N strategy.	NA / not applicable	2012	IFAD's RB COSOP 2013-18 is fully aligned with the main strategic thrusts of the 3N Initiative. IFAD's support to the regionalisation process of the 3N is now scaled up to three regions (Tahoua, Maradi and Zinder),
Niger	CPE	6	CTRY	STR	PAR	The strategic guidelines and procedures for implementing IFAD's new COSOP should be defined jointly with the national and regional governments and the technical and financial	The guidelines and procedures will be elaborated in 2012. The consultations include the government both in the centre and in the provinces- including Maradi, as well as Tahoua and	O	2012	National and regional partners are actively involved in supervision and implementation support activities. IFAD is playing a lead role at regional level as the main development operational partner with field operation still active.



Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up	Status	PRISMA year	Update in 2014
						partners active in the Maradi region.	Zinder- and technical and financial partners.			Others partners (Swiss, Italy, Danish Cooperation (DK Coop.) adopting IFAD's operational framework to finance development operations.
Niger	CPE	7	CTRY	STR	COS	The new COSOP should make provision for non-lending activities to assist the local partners (government and civil society) in preparing the rural development strategy for the Maradi region, and to support coordination of its implementation, and its monitoring and evaluation.	The rural development strategy (SDR) has been replaced by the i3N.	NA	2012	Grants component (DSF, FEM, etc.) are financing policy dialogue and institutional and capacity building in the three regions focus on regionalisation and implementation of the 3N.
Niger	CPE	8	GOV	STR	PAR	The Maradi letter of understanding and the recently-created coordination mechanism between the Government and the technical and financial partners in the Maradi region should be re-examined in light of their contribution to implementing the regional rural development strategy.	The joint program to be signed in May (which will signify a coordination mechanism between UN agencies and government) will contribute to the i3N.	NA	2012	The joint Programme is no longer active. The 3N regionalisation and its coordination mechanism is now under the Haut Commissariat a l Initiative 3N.
Niger	CPE	17	CTRY	OPER	SUP	The length and frequency of supervisory missions should be increased and lending agencies with international standing should be called upon to provide regular technical assistance commensurate with needs.	Regular technical assistance is provided. However increased length and frequency of supervision missions is also subject to budget availability: currently the country programme does not have enough resources for more than one supervision mission per year. Also insecurity in the project area implies that missions cannot be very long due to security reasons. In particular, insecurity in the project areas limits the mobilisation of international TA.	PA	2012	Regular technical assistance has been increased mainly mobilising national consultants and regional/national researches institutes. Increased TA resources at projects level provided adequate financing and implementation support. However, high insecurity in the programme area implies several limitations to field operations including supervisions.
<b>Uganda: Vegetable Oil Development Project - Interim Evaluation</b>										
Uganda	IE	2	CTRY	STR	ASR	Efforts to identify new areas for future oil palm production will be continued through oil palm research trials.	The Government is continuously collecting data and other information for oil palm expansions. The process has been slowed due to	O	2012	Oil palm has been identified as a priority crop by the National Agricultural Research Organisation (NARO). An Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) has been signed between Vegetable Oil

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up	Status	PRISMA year	Update in 2014
							understaffing at the Project management unit (PMU) in the transition period between the two phases of the project, where the focus has been on the oil palm production already taking place.			Development Project-phase 2 (VODP2) and National Agricultural Research Organisation (NARO) covering oil palm production, including research in new areas.
Uganda	IE	10	CTRY	OPER	PRM	IFAD and GOU will continue to support the development of food standards and codes of practice for the vegetable oils subsector through Uganda National Bureau of Standards (UNBS).	This is foreseen in the design document. The details of the partnership between VODP2 and Uganda National Bureau of Standards (UNBS) will be worked out during the next year when the PMU will be fully operational.	O	2012	The details of a partnership have been finalised, and an MOU has been signed between VODP2 and UNBS to develop work in the area of food standards and codes of practice.
Uganda	IE	13	CTRY	OPER	TGT	The follow-on project will take account of the need for special skills in post-conflict work and coordination with other donors and NGOs working in this region.	A targeting study was carried out in the whole project area, providing guidance on how best to implement the project in the various hubs, depending on their level of integration into the value chain. The smallholders in the Northern area are typically the least integrated, and a special approach has been developed to target these. Operational partnerships with operators with necessary skills in post-conflict work will be worked out as necessary during project implementation.	O	2012	This recommendation has been kept in mind; however it has been ascertained by the project and the government that the situation is not currently a post-conflict environment. Therefore, no specific measures need to be undertaken.
Uganda	IE	18	GOV	STR	PAR	Citronella is produced in limited quantities and remains a niche crop and it is unlikely to receive significant public investment. There is need for the GOU to identify partners, either NGOs or a private sector operator to carry on the Citronella work.	Work in this respect, which is not an immediate priority for the time being, will be done by the PMU when it is fully operational.	O	2012	Citronella is not a priority crop for the project or for the government. Therefore, there are no special efforts with regard to citronella (as stated above, the priority is on oil palm).
Uganda	IE	19	CTRY	OPER	PAR	Once a viable partner is identified, IFAD will provide modest grant financing to support this endeavour.	A modest grant financing will be provided; this will be done based on the results of the work mentioned above.	O	2012	See above: citronella is not a priority.
<b>Dominican Republic: South Western Region Small Farmers Project – Phase II - Completion Evaluation</b>										
Dominican Republic	CE	10	CTRY	OPER	BEN	Promote competition for access to project funds to	The third strategic objective of the COSOP explicitly targets	O	2012	Competitive access to project funds has not occurred thus far. As of April

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up	Status	PRISMA year	Update in 2014
						carry out community-based production projects, incentivizing participation by young people;	rural youth and the promotion of non-farming income generating activities. Competitive mechanisms are foreseen in project designs.			2014, IFAD country programme implementation will officially move from the Ministry of Agriculture to the Ministry of Economy, Planning and Development, and its implementation structure in the field entirely revisited, in light of the country programme's insertion into a broader policy framework, i.e. as the rural development articulation of a National Development Strategy.
Dominican Republic	CE	13	CTRY	STR	INF	If continued support is to be provided for social works, explicitly define the relationship between community representation and grass-roots organizations with respect to responsibilities for maintenance and possible future expansion of the works;	No further support in this areas is envisaged within the current country programme (COSOP).	NA	2012	The current country programme's entry point is the Business Plan - a combination of tools for farmers' associations and producers cooperatives' capacity-building, training, productive investments and connection to market outlets and inclusive value chains. It is expected that a more equitable access to sustainable productive initiatives and inclusion of family farmers into more lucrative markets shall result in the improvement of social well-being of communities involved.
Dominican Republic	CE	16	CTRY	STR	DES	In terms of food security, an investment should be made in designing a program with prospects for improvement over the medium to long term, rather than the short term, as well as exploring the possibility of combining it with government subsidies.	Food security is addressed mostly by the project in the western (border) area by focusing on food staple crops (such as beans, cereals). Possible linkages with Conditional Cash Transfer (CCT) programmes are being explored.	O	2012	The current re-orientation of IFAD country programme in DR is centred on its integration in the National Development Strategy and the Multi-year Rural Development Plan. Food security is a key element of this plan and IFAD projects are now geared to contribute directly to its improvement on a national scale.
<b>IFAD's Private Sector Development and Partnership Strategy - Corporate level evaluation</b>										
IFAD	CLE	8	IFAD	PLCY	PRM	A separate private-sector development financing facility should be established.	This was not supported by the Executive Board. There were extensive discussions during the 104th session (when the strategy was presented and discussed). However, the Board did not fully support the proposal for a financing facility; therefore Management decided not to pursue this option further.	NA	2012	This was not supported by the Executive Board and therefore there is no real substantive update, since Management cannot pursue this option further.
IFAD	CLE	9	IFAD	STR	HR	IFAD should assess the human resources and	This was not supported by the Executive Board. The feasibility	NA	2012	The feasibility study was not conducted, again due to non-approval

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up	Status	PRISMA year	Update in 2014
						organizational architecture needed to appropriately manage IFAD private sector development.	study was to be conducted in the context of the separate financing facility. However, there have been other initiatives to strengthen staff capacity towards better managing private sector development. This includes assigning a Senior Technical Adviser on private sector development, recruiting another technical adviser on rural markets and enterprise development; strengthening knowledge management through workshops.			by the Board. However, human resources in IFAD have been greatly strengthened. IFAD now has a senior technical advisor on private sector development and a technical advisor working on rural markets and enterprise development, in the Technical Advisory division (another advisor to be recruited in 2014). A private sector partnership and resource mobilization officer has also been recruited to broker global partnerships, in the Partnership and Resource Mobilization division. Two Associate Professional Officers (one in each division) are also supporting the work around private sector development and partnerships.

## B. Country and project evaluations from PRISMA 2011

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up	Status	PRISMA year	Update in 2014
<b>Argentina - Country programme Evaluation</b>										
Argentina	CPE	3	CTRY	STR	ASR	The increased resource levels would also be based on considering alternative definitions of rural populations to those used in official statistics to determine the percentage of rural population, one of the variables included in PBAS calculations. IFAD, in collaboration with regional partners (e.g. the United Nations Economic Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean, and the World Bank) and national partners (the National Statistics Institute [INDEC], Ministry of Agriculture, Livestock and Fisheries (MAGyP) and the National Agricultural Technology Institute [INTA]), can contribute to opening a debate on statistical criteria for identifying	The debate is wide open and a recent World Bank study estimates that, by using OECD criteria to classify urban-rural population, rural population in Argentina would triple. National statistics are unlikely to change in the short term, for internal reasons; however, scientific evidence that the Argentinean rural population is closer to 40% than to the currently declared 11% is already available. And even using current official statistics, over one million Argentinean rural inhabitants have one or more unmet basic needs and can be classified as poor.	O	2011	The debate is wide open and a recent World Bank study estimates that, by using OECD criteria to classify urban-rural population, rural population in Argentina would triple. National statistics are unlikely to change in the short term, for internal reasons; however, scientific evidence that the Argentinean rural population is closer to 40% than to the currently declared 11% is already available.

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up	Status	PRISMA year	Update in 2014
						rural population.				
Argentina	CPE	5	CTRY	STR	PMA	IFAD should ensure the highest quality in technical support during project design and implementation to accelerate the achievement of results and overall portfolio execution.	Final design will privilege TA selection mechanisms that reward good performance through beneficiaries' participation and cost-sharing	O	2011	Programme implementation now privileges TA selection that rewards good performance through beneficiary participation and support to farmer organisations' capacities.
Argentina	CPE	7	CTRY	STR	INN	A dialogue should be undertaken with the Government and other key actors in the sub-region to identify innovations.	The main innovation area the new programme will face is to set up sustainable rural financial services. Gender mainstreaming and youth will also be at the center of PRODERI's (Programa de Desarrollo Rural Inclusivo) development support	O	2011	This has been developed further and key partners engaged. Closer interaction for joint learning is underway with the UCAR (Unidad para el Cambio Rural) and key partners (IDB and WB).
Argentina	CPE	9	CTRY	STR	RFI	IFAD should intensify its interaction with the Government of Argentina in connection with financing for the small-holder farming sector, which the Government is tackling in terms of access to resources.	Intense interaction is currently underway with Government of Argentina in this thematic area. The UCAR has recently recruited a rural financial services (RFS) expert to undertake a sector study. IFAD will integrate PRODERI's final design mission with at least one RFS expert.	O	2011	Intense interaction is now underway with Government of Argentina in this thematic area, involving the UCAR's rural financial services (RFS) expert and project specific staff. IFAD continues the dialogue with the UCAR on the quality of the RFS interventions in the framework of project supervision.
Argentina	CPE	10	CTRY	STR	INN	Based on work done through horizontal cooperation between Argentina and Brazil and Argentina and Chile – both with IFAD support – the search for institutional innovations in support for small-holder agriculture could be pursued further.	Government of Argentina (GoA) is aware of the need to achieve institutional innovation in this area. The REAF MERCOSUR has offered a platform where proposal for new legislation on RFS have been developed, discussed and approved as a recommendation to MERCOSUR member States' governments, including Argentina	O	2011	The same efforts are underway. GoA is aware of the need to achieve institutional innovation in this area. The REAF MERCOSUR has offered a platform where proposal for new legislation on RFS have been developed, discussed and approved as a recommendation to MERCOSUR member States' governments, including Argentina.
Argentina	CPE	12	CTRY	STR	RFI	Two experiences in the Argentina rural context warrant consideration through a dialogue, exploring options with the private sector as well:(b) loans granted to producers' cooperatives	The final design mission will intensify contacts with the private sector to seek new partnerships that can be tested in the early stages of programme implementation.	O	2011	IFAD is exploring options to collaborate with the private sector in finding innovations in Argentina, including with UNILEVER. However, RFS are not yet part of these efforts.
Argentina	CPE	20	CTRY	STR	FLD	It is recommended that IFAD and the Government, in	Although necessary, country presence is currently not	PA	2011	This has a similar status as before: since Argentina is not on the list of

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up	Status	PRISMA year	Update in 2014
						reviewing their long-term relationship and in the context of a significant increase in the portfolio, undertake a discussion on ways of achieving a country presence.	foreseen, as Argentina is not in the list of country presences approved by the Executive Board. LAC is currently strengthening its country team through the recruitment of a resident fiduciary expert as long-term consultant.			country presence countries approved by the Board (but for other efforts, see note on plans for a regional presence). Although necessary, country presence is currently not foreseen. LAC has strengthened its country team through the recruitment of a resident long-term fiduciary consultant. Further, IFAD plans to establish a regional presence from a future office in Montevideo, Uruguay.
<b>Benin Roots and Tubers Development Programme - Completion Evaluation</b>										
Benin	CE	1	CTRY	OPER	ASR	The evaluation recommended that thematic studies should be conducted on roots and tubers development projects cofinanced by IFAD (a thematic evaluation of the performance and impact of such projects in Western and Central Africa. The evaluation should pay particular attention to the impact that recent technological, socio-economic and institutional changes in the root and tuber subsectors have had on the living conditions of the poorest active rural populations and on the environment.).	The challenge for Roots and Tubers is that those are mainly produced by subsistence farmers. Recent technological advances in Roots and Tubers have had limited impact on the poor. One hypothesis is that, the demand of improved varieties is low because it's unlikely that farmers will be able to recover the investment made to improve production. Furthermore, Roots and Tubers are commodities with very thin margins. To be attractive, investments in Roots and Tubers need to be done on a very large scale. At this time, there seems to be little interest to investigate these issues.	NA	2011	This situation in Benin remains unchanged with regard to this issue. Few producers are willing to purchase the improved varieties of Roots and Tubers. Because production remains in the realm of small scale production, there is little interest to make large investment in technological advancements. Efforts are underway to sensitize producers about the added value of improved varieties as well as the benefits of organizing into a group with the responsibility to provide cooperative services to its members.
Benin	CE	3	CTRY	STR	INN	The evaluation recommended innovating on approaches and technologies designed in favour of the poorest roots and tubers producers and processors, to develop their potential for contributing to agricultural and rural development, and to play a direct role in improving their living conditions. It was recommended that these approaches should be part of the implementation strategy for Benin's National Policy on Roots and Tubers Promotion.	The MAEP (Ministry of Agriculture, Livestock and Fisheries) is currently examining how to address the needs of the poorest roots and tuber producers and processors so they can develop their potential for contributing to agricultural and rural development to play a direct role in improving their living conditions. Ways forward include partnerships and thematic studies.	O	2011	The MAEP (Ministry of Agriculture Livestock and Fisheries) has had a number of changes of leadership and each came with a different focus. With the PADER now closed, Roots and Tubers are targeted with the PACER - projet d'appui à la croissance économique et rurale. The focus however is on professionalization and access to market. Many of the same households targeted with the PDRT are now receiving capacity building services to help them transform their products according to specific norms and sell them on local, national and regional markets.

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up	Status	PRISMA year	Update in 2014
Benin	CE	4	CTRY	STR	TGT	The evaluation recommended developing an effective approach to target the poorest roots and tubers producers and processors. It suggested that project monitoring and evaluation systems should be used to ensure that the target group is actually being reached.	Many of the PDRT (Roots and Tubers Development Programme) activities have been incorporated in the PADER (Rural Development Support Programme). The current targeting strategy is to focus and institutionalize the learnings with the existing beneficiaries but not to expand it to new target groups. This recommendation is being evaluated and will be reviewed during follow-up missions.	O	2011	Same approach: Many of the PDRT (Roots and Tubers Development Programme) activities have been incorporated in the PADER (Rural Development Support Programme) and subsequently in the PACER (Rural Economic Growth Support Project) with the closing of the PADER. The current targeting strategy is to focus and institutionalize the learnings with the existing beneficiaries but not to expand it to new target groups.
Benin	CE	5	CTRY	OPER	TGT	The evaluation recommended actively combining support for production and processing within each of the disadvantaged households, which would entail working simultaneously with the men and women from the same household.	Many of the PDRT activities have been incorporated in the Rural Development Support Programme (PADER). This specific aspect will be looked into during the upcoming supervision missions. This recommendation is being evaluated and will be reviewed during follow-up missions.	O	2011	In targeted households, the relevant project now works with both men and women. Many of the PDRT (Roots and Tubers Development Programme) activities have been incorporated in the PADER (Rural Development Support Programme) and subsequently in the Rural Economic Growth Support Project (PACER) with the closing of the PADER.
Benin	CE	7	CTRY	OPER	TGT	The evaluation recommended promoting private services that are accessible to the poorest producers and processors, such as the supply of inputs (plant material, fertilizer etc.) and access to credit, which are essential for intensification of roots and tubers production	This recommendation is being evaluated and will be reviewed during follow-up missions.	O	2011	The PACER has a financing window to provide financial services to small holders engaged in any of the 4 cultures targeted. The financing is for working capital, inputs and small equipment.
Benin	CE	8	CTRY	OPER	TGT	It was suggested to establish processing workshops for disadvantaged women, which would be collectively owned but individually used, and technically designed to optimize labour productivity and respect both women processors' working conditions and the environment.	This recommendation is being evaluated and will be reviewed during follow-up missions.	O	2011	This recommendation has been fully followed up by trying the approaches recommended. The PADER has experimented with collectively owned processing shops. In most instances, the experience has not yield satisfactory results. Because the facility is collectively owned, in essence it belongs to no one and maintaining the shop and the equipment has been a challenge. Under the PACER, the project is supporting privately owned processing shops where small holders can

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up	Status	PRISMA year	Update in 2014
										transform their products in return of a small fee.
Benin	CE	9	CTRY	OPER	TGT	It was recommended to facilitate market access for the poorest, for example by organizing small-scale producers and processors into marketing associations equipped with storehouses in proximity to markets, support the establishment of a (private) demand and price information network, and develop relationships with the various actors in roots and tubers value chains so that ways of lowering transaction costs could be jointly sought.	Systems will be put in place to ensure that the poorest are not left out.	O	2011	These issues have been addressed with the PACER. Small holders are encouraged to organize themselves or to join already established groups or organisations. The PACER provides market information and facilitates the development of networks for smallholders to facilitate access to input, improve consumer knowledge, and increase market access.
Benin	CE	10	CTRY	OPER	TGT	It was recommended to combine the data generated by the market price collection and monitoring system coordinated by the National Food Security Support Office with those coming from the production and productivity monitoring system piloted by the Roots and Tubers Information System, in order to carry out prospective analysis on changes in supply and demand for roots and tubers products. Such analysis should then be used by public-sector technical services to advise roots and tubers producers and processors on market prospects, not to push them towards speculation but to sensitize them to trends and risks relating to changes in markets and prices	The recommendation is currently under review at the MAEP (Ministry of Agriculture and Fisheries). Follow-ups will be initiated during upcoming supervision missions.	O	2011	This recommendation is still under review. The continuous change in leadership within the Ministry of Agriculture poses the challenge of buy-in and later on accountability.
Benin	CE	11	CTRY	OPER	TGT	The evaluation recommended helping rural men and women working in the subsector to organize to defend their interests, in order to obtain better working conditions	This recommendation is being evaluated and will be reviewed during follow-up missions.	O	2011	Upon evaluation of the recommendation it was determined that if falls outside project activities.



Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up	Status	PRISMA year	Update in 2014
						(proper pay, working hours, safety and hygiene, job security etc.).				
Benin	CE	13	CTRY	OPER	PRM	The evaluation recommended strengthening and rationalizing the production chain for plant material of improved varieties and expanding it to other roots and tubers.	The recommendation is currently under review at the MAEP. Follow-ups will be conducted during upcoming supervision missions.	O	2011	This aspect is being addressed with the PACER. The approach of improving plan material in the PDRT and later on the PADER has been replicated with rice, pineapple and soybean under the PACER.
Benin	CE	14	CTRY	OPER	SUS	The evaluation recommended continuing to disseminate sustainable production technologies for roots and tubers (technical fiches in local languages, group training, demonstrations, radio broadcasts etc.)	This recommendation is being evaluated. Follow-up discussions will be conducted during upcoming supervision missions.	O	2011	This aspect is addressed in the PACER through the communication and knowledge management programme of the project.
Benin	CE	15	CTRY	OPER	PRM	The evaluation recommended improving quality management and marketing organization for cassava flour. To this end, greater stress should be placed on setting up production units based on the ALITECH model, i.e. small or medium enterprises equipped with minimum equipment, such as a greater, press and gas dryer or solar tents.	This recommendation is being evaluated. Follow-up discussions will be conducted during upcoming supervision missions.	O	2011	This recommendation was initially implemented in the PADER and later on pursued in the PACER. Adjustments are being made regarding the ownership of these transformation units as mentioned above.
Benin	CE	16	CTRY	OPER	PRM	The evaluation recommended continuing to work on developing quality standards for roots and tubers products and putting in place a quality control system and a product traceability and certification system	This recommendation is being evaluated. Follow-up discussions will be conducted during upcoming supervision missions.	O	2011	This recommendation has now been implemented with the PACER.
Benin	CE	17	CTRY	OPER	ORG	The evaluation recommended encouraging producer and processor groups to evolve towards service cooperatives, on the basis of their members' objectives (in order to facilitate access to inputs, information, credit, markets etc.) or lobbying associations (in order to strengthen their members' bargaining power vis à-vis	This recommendation is being evaluated. Follow-up discussions will be conducted during upcoming supervision missions.	O	2011	This recommendation has now been implemented with the PACER.

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up	Status	PRISMA year	Update in 2014
						public and private service providers). In the long term, if the need is felt within these grass-roots organizations, they should be helped to form federations.				
Benin	CE	18	CTRY	OPER	PMA	The evaluation recommended replicating the results-based payment model for public and private service providers in the context of other IFAD-financed projects.	This recommendation is being evaluated. Follow-up discussions will be conducted during upcoming supervision missions.	O	2011	This recommendation has now been implemented with the PACER.
<b>China West Guanxi Poverty Alleviation Project - Completion Evaluation</b>										
China	CE	6	CTRY	STR	DES	In settings where food-for-work (FFW) and food-for-training (FFT) is deemed essential for broad participation and coverage, a second generation solution should be devised with the Chinese authorities, for instance by linking donor-funded projects with government programs for infrastructure and human capacity building.	After the completion of WGPAP (West Guangxi Poverty-Alleviation Project), the government has continued financing the development of infrastructure and training of farmers in rural areas. Therefore, no food-for work and food-for training is foreseen under GIADP (Guangxi Integrated Agricultural Development Project) to be funded from WFP or other donors. GIADP will be co-financed by the government (National and Provincial) and IFAD only.	NA	2011	Food-for-work and food-for-training have been discontinued for all IFAD projects in China. Instead the projects work closely with government and other donor supported projects to mainstream direct support for infrastructure development and human capacity building.
China	CE	9	CTRY	OPER	PAR	Partnerships with provincial Rural Credit Cooperatives (RCC) networks should be put on a completely new footing, by taking into account the ongoing reform and by agreeing on a set of information to be shared that is conducive to a real-time assessment of loan portfolios and banking performance indicators in general.	Rural finance service partnering with Rural Credit Cooperatives (RCC) is not foreseen in the GIADP, since there is no micro-finance component foreseen. But in future projects in the country where rural financial service provision will be considered, the partnership with the RCC network will be positively considered, take into account the learning from IFAD's experience in this sector during the 2005-2010 COSOP in China.	NA	2011	The two latest projects (Shiyan Smallholder Agribusiness Development Project - SSADeP-project no.1699 and Jiangxi Mountainous Area Agribusiness Promotion Project - JiMAAP-project N. 1701), out of the five that were developed for China since Guangxi Integrated Agricultural Development Project (GIADP) under the 2010-2015 RB-COSOP, have re-introduced improved rural financial services for IFAD's target groups as major components. These have been developed on a completely new footing that aims at providing carefully targeted Guarantee Facilities that seek to leverage substantial credit

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up	Status	PRISMA year	Update in 2014
										funds from formal financial institutions, including RCCs and the Agricultural Bank of China, which are now known to have substantial liquidity that they find hard to place in the hands of the poor because of risk averseness. In addition, more innovative approaches and best practices are being sought globally through several means, including a regional grant facility, for subsequent piloting and incorporation in these new projects.
<b>Innovation - Corporate level evaluation</b>										
IFAD	CLE	17	IFAD	OPER	HR	Efforts in knowledge management could be introduced as an indicator in the annual performance evaluation process of IFAD and of project staff.	While this has not been implemented across staff, knowledge management forms a key part of assessing performance of staff. As part of the restructuring processes including performance assessment, this is under active consideration.	PA	2011	In October 2013, IFAD launched a new competency framework that includes learning and sharing behaviours, based on a review of best practice in organizations globally. The new framework clearly integrates knowledge management as a corporate priority that is expected of all staff at every level in the organization. The framework will be used in recruitment, performance management, 360 degree survey, staff development and training, and it is expected to foster the integration of knowledge management in every organizational process.
IFAD	CLE	18	IFAD	STR	INN	Resources permitting, Management is committed to conducting a cultural analysis to provide a basis for bringing about the required changes in IFAD's innovation objectives, capabilities, processes and organizational climate. Needless to say, this is not an easy task and will require time.	This has not yet been done, owing to resource constraints; however a number of initiatives have been taken to enhance staff participation in knowledge-sharing and innovation, this includes the knowledge events mentioned, encouraging staff from different divisions to participate, initiating staff awards which rewarded (among other criteria) innovation.	NA	2011	This has not been conducted; due to resource constraints the analysis was not conducted. See above for organizational improvements since 2011.

### C. Country and project evaluations from PRISMA 2010

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up	Status	PRISMA year	Update in 2014
<b>Nigeria - Country Programme Evaluation</b>										
Nigeria	CPE	17	CTRY	STR	ORG	The development of robust farmer associations as part of a stronger local governance framework that can lead to better empowerment of the poor would be another area of innovation for IFAD and Government to pursue in the future.	The recently closed Roots and Tubers Expansion Programme (RTEP) started working on strengthening farmer associations. Unfortunately, the time was not enough to consolidate this work. It is expected that the implementation of the value chain programme scheduled to be designed in the next few months will build on the unfinished RTEP work and use it as an entry point for the development of commodity value chains.	O	2010	The Value Chain Development Programme (VCDP) for rice and cassava value chains has entered into force. Recruitment process for the programme team is ongoing in various states. Once this team for the VCDP is in place, the formation and strengthening of farmers groups and producer groups will be an important first step of implementation. The discussion around governance of these organisations will build on the RTEP.
Nigeria	CPE	19	CTRY	STR	FLD	IFAD should seek ways and means of strengthening its country presence, for example in terms of human and financial resources, infrastructure, roles and responsibility.	IFAD deployed extensive efforts to recruit a well experience Country Programme Officer (CPO) who has, to some extent, strengthened the technical capacity of the Country Programme Office. Unfortunately, the financial resources have not been commensurate with the technical capacity. For instance, the Country Programme Office is not endowed with a vehicle to allow full mobility of the Office staff for programme supervision and interaction with other donors.	PA	2010	Done: The CPO was recruited in 2009 while a resident CPM was outposted in 2011. Both officers have been addressing issues to improve on country portfolio. In addition, the country office engages short-term consultants on retainer contracts for procurement and financial management to help improve on the quality of service delivery by programmes and the government of Nigeria. The issue of mobility has been addressed by having one office vehicle.
Nigeria	CPE	20	CTRY	STR	FLD	The option of out-posting the country programme manager (CPM) should be explored. Such an IFAD country presence could eventually have a sub-regional dimension, which would entail the CPM covering and based in Nigeria also assuming responsibilities for IFAD operations in selected neighbouring countries.	This option is worthwhile and the IFAD West and Central Africa Division has been reflecting on it on the basis of its medium-term plan. In the meantime, the pressing need is to strengthen the Country Programme Office through additional financial means.	PA	2010	This has been done. Associate Country Programme Manager (ACPM) was outposted in 2011

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up	Status	PRISMA year	Update in 2014
<b>Sudan - Country Programme Evaluation</b>										
Sudan	CPE	4	CTRY	STR	NRM	Land tenure, traditional rainfed cultivation, overgrazing and livestock should continue to be addressed. However, consideration should be given to pursuing these in a more focused and systematic manner to ensure greater integration and synergies in these areas.	The country team will be producing a detailed analysis in the second semester 2010 on the constrains and lessons learned from the land tenure reform process and its outcome in the context of the Gash Sustainable Livelihoods Regeneration Project (SD-630). With regards the opening of stock routes and management of the mobility of pastoral herds, the experience of the WSRMP (loan SD-655) is still in the consolidation phase and being monitored in the context of the direct supervision missions.	O	2010	Land tenure and Natural resource Management (NRM) have been retained as key priority area for policy dialogue in the RB-COSOP for Sudan endorsed in December 2013, to improve rights of pastoralists and smallholders. This will include establishment of a NRM framework at state level and enhanced policy dialogue at national level. The COSOP has also reflected the lessons learnt regarding land tenure issues drawn from the Gash Sustainable Livelihood Regeneration Project (GSLRP) as presented in the Completion Report and from the ongoing projects such as the Western Sudan Management Programme and the Butana Integrated Rural Development Project.
Sudan	CPE	5	CTRY	STR	INR	Notwithstanding the programme's good performance in the areas of rural finance or institutional innovations, the Evaluation recommends that IFAD redouble efforts in promoting pro-poor agricultural innovations. These have been weaker than innovations in the other programme components. A more systematic approach to replication and scaling up of agricultural innovations should also be developed.	In collaboration with Mr Cheikh Sourang, the country team is learning to use the scaling up framework for its on-going and future operations. The work is still under progress.	O	2010	The RB-COSOP has envisaged the scaling-up of three key innovations, concerning rural finance, CBOs and rangeland management under the ongoing and pipeline projects. It will also provide a framework for the scaling-up of a successful World Bank experience in livestock production and marketing which is currently under design: the Livestock Marketing Resilience Project (LRMP). 1. Rural finance. The three successfully piloted delivery models for rural finance (bank-owned microfinance, community-owned apex institutions, and women's savings and credit groups), will be scaled up. These models are centred on the formation of women's saving groups and therefore present an excellent opportunity to focus on gender equity and women's empowerment. 2. CBOs (Community-based organizations). Scaling up the number and scope of CBOs has the potential to improve productivity, resilience to climate change, good stewardship of natural resources and community-based extension, and also to create and

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up	Status	PRISMA year	Update in 2014
										<p>improve value chains. Piloting has shown that people are willing to pay for services and able to democratically manage their organizations and conduct business. CBOs provide opportunities to focus on young people and women's empowerment.</p> <p>3. Rangeland management. Good management of social fencing has been shown to increase rangeland and animal productivity, and to bring other benefits, e.g. increased social capital, formation of community assets such as water points and fodder storage, increased employment opportunities, reduced conflict among settled and mobile livestock keepers, and reduced dependence on distant grazing. The principle is that settled communities and agro-pastoralists agree to improve the productivity of common rangelands around their village.</p> <p>Good management of social fencing contributes to realizing the vision for sustainable management and to improving the climatic resilience of natural resources. In addition, new innovative approaches will be tried in the Sudanese context, such as developing public-private partnerships (PPP) in livestock, which is currently explored in the design of the LRMP, and seed production, in the ongoing project Seed Development Project. Possibilities for further application of PPPs will be investigated. Collaboration with research agencies, such as the Agricultural Research Corporation (ARC) will be continued to develop new technical innovations to enhance productivity and climate change resilience.</p>
<b>Ethiopia - Country Programme Evaluation</b>										
Ethiopia	CPE	8	CTRY	OPER	PMA	Within rural finance, efforts need to be made in automating the manual systems and introducing proper, real time, management information	The second phase of the ongoing Rural Financial Intermediation Programme, slated for EB presentation in 2011, will include specific	O	2010	RUFIP II is now in its second year of implementation. The project has allocated close to US\$5 million for capacity building to upgrade MIS systems for both the MFIs as well as

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up	Status	PRISMA year	Update in 2014
						systems.	investments to strengthen the existing Micro-Irrigation Systems (MIS) systems of participating Multi Financial Institutions (MFIs).			the Savings and Credit Cooperative (SACCO) sub-sector. Yet this amount is still not adequate for the whole sector. In that regard, the large MFIs have opted to use their own resources to automate and have left the capacity building grant for the smaller MFIs to use under the direct guidance and technical assistance provided for by AEMFI (The Association of Ethiopian Micro Finance Institutions) Coupled with this, IFAD in partnership with UNCDF/ILO has put together a proposal for an additional USD10 million for RUFIP II to push forward the e-banking and mobile money as well as micro insurance and data collection using the FINTRUST Framework and all this under the financial inclusion agenda. The project will also benefit from the MIX market methodology project currently under PTA and RUFIP II will implement that in its MFI sub-sector
Ethiopia	CPE	19	CTRY	STR	PAR	The complexity of diverse procurement procedures with the cofinancier (AfDB) and cooperating institution (World Bank) has not been conducive to smooth implementation and should be avoided unless one set of procedures and rules for procurement can be agreed.	Noted and appropriate measures taken to forestall such protracted procedures. However, the complexity of procurement procedures is an inevitable cost of co-financing.	PA	2010	After intensive discussions with Government and AfDB and the WB during design and partners, it was agreed to use one system i.e. the IFAD procurement system. The project is now directly supervised by IFAD. The WB is no longer supervising the project. Hence, this is no longer an issue for this project.
<b>Pakistan - Country Programme Evaluation</b>										
Pakistan	CPE	7	CTRY	STR	TCB	IFAD should build up the capacity both of local governments (at the district, tehsil and union levels) and of representatives of elected bodies (e.g. village councils, local legislative assemblies, etc.) that play an important role in planning and resource allocation for rural poverty alleviations at the grass-roots level and in promoting accountability and transparency of local	See 5 above. It should be noted that currently there are a lot of uncertainties on the prospect of decentralisation and devolution.	PA	2010	IFAD interventions since 2010 have focused on building the capacity and strengthening community organizations and relying on line departments at provincial and sub-provincial level for the delivery of services.

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up	Status	PRISMA year	Update in 2014
						administrations involved in IFAD-supported projects.				
Pakistan	CPE	9	CTRY	STR	TGT	The CPE recommends that the Fund continue to support the Government in its engagement in disadvantaged, remote and conflict-ridden areas such as the NWFP (North West-Frontier Province), AJK (Azad Jammu and Kashmir) and the FATAs (Federally Administered Tribal Areas). However, this requires a much more differentiated approach which is flexible and adapted to such challenging areas, paying careful attention to the specific social context, culture and priorities of the rural people living there.	For the PBAS 2010-12 cycle, GOP has requested IFAD to finance two new projects respectively in Punjab and Balochistan. This means that IFAD won't have new projects in NWFP, AJK and FATA in the near future.	NA	2010	Geographical priorities are defined by the Government, in consultation with IFAD. From latest discussions with the Government, it seems that the Government favours a balanced distribution of IFAD resources among provinces rather than a geographical concentration in few selected areas. An additional element to be taken into consideration is that Provinces have to express willingness to receive IFAD funding: a recent case shows that while the Federal Government indicated preference for using IFAD finances in NWFP, the NWFP Government indicated that it was not interested in borrowing from IFAD. Experience and lessons from the South FATA Development Project suggest that IFAD does not have the instruments to successfully operate in conflict areas, and suggest that IFAD do not engage in operations in highly insecure or conflict areas.
Pakistan	CPE	10	CTRY	STR	PMA	In these areas, it will be essential to mobilize specific expertise for project design, implementation and supervision.	Agree, but see 9 above.	NA	2010	Not applicable, since as per rationale above, IFAD will not work with a special focus on the conflict areas.
Pakistan	CPE	11	CTRY	STR	STR	The interventions in these areas should be given more time in project execution, without having negative impact on country PBAS score.	This is beyond operations.	NA	2010	Not applicable, since as per rationale above, IFAD will not work with a special focus on the conflict areas.
Pakistan	CPE	13	CTRY	STR	INR	Promoting innovations will also call for greater synergies between, and the wider use of, the mix of instruments (loans, grants, policy dialogue, etc.) available to the Fund as well as enhanced country involvement in and ownership of grants.	This remains a challenge, especially in terms of loan / grant linkages and country ownership of grants (particularly regional ones). However, efforts have been made to enhance the synergies, e.g., the better integration of lessons from grant projects into the design of loan operations (e.g., Punjab).	PA	2010	There has now been progress against this recommendation, e.g. in the recently approved LAMP a grant component to support policy development has been included in the project design (although this has not been pursued systematically).
Pakistan	CPE	14	CTRY	STR	INR	Innovative approaches are needed in a number of areas	No major actions yet, due to either varied operational	PD / pendin	2010	Projects developed since 2010 have tried to include more innovative



Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up	Status	PRISMA year	Update in 2014
						such as remittances (savings accounts, investment opportunities); migration (improving the value of landless people on the employment market through vocational training and helping them find employment in small towns, urban centres and overseas); promotion of local governance; and the use of grants (as opposed to loans) to support efforts by larger development actors in conflict areas such as FATAs.	priorities or limitation of instruments.	g		approaches in project design, although in many cases provision of basic services rather than innovative solutions was the main focus of the projects. Experience and lessons from the South FATA Development Project suggest that IFAD does not have the instruments to successfully operate in conflict areas, and suggest that IFAD do not engage in operations in highly insecure or conflict areas.
Pakistan	CPE	15	CTRY	STR	FLD	IFAD should establish a more consolidated and permanent country presence in line with Executive Board approved policies and budget allocation (one option to strengthen country presence in Pakistan is to outpost the Country Programme Manager from Rome).	Pakistan is IFAD's official list of countries where the country office will be formally established and be led by an out-posted CPM. IFAD has communicated with GOP on the matter.	O	2010	A Country Office has been established, although a formal Host Country Agreement has not been signed with the Government - the Country Office is thus not formally accredited. The Country Office is led by a Country Program Officer (CPO). Although the option of outposting a CPM in Pakistan has been considered, at the moment it does not seem one of the priority countries for outposting.
<b>Guatemala Rural Development Programme for Las Verapaces - Interim Evaluation</b>										
Guatemala	IE	11	PROJ	OPER	SUS	The evaluation recommended that a review be performed, together with FONAPAZ (the National Fund for Peace), of PRODEVER's (Rural Development Programme for Las Verapaces) current operating and financial capacity, including Government contributions, up to the programme's conclusion.	This is a recommendation that overlooks the country's financial reality and the consequent budgetary restrictions. Despite the current financial constraints, the programme has met its targets. Government's contribution is limited in the new programmes to taxes and duties.	PA	2010	The recommendation was fully complied with, and the project was closed in March 2012.
<b>China Qinling Mountain Area Poverty Alleviation Project - Interim Evaluation</b>										
China	IE	1	CTRY	STR	DES	The continuing pockets of poverty in the project provinces suggest that there is a valid reason for proceeding with a follow-on project. A follow-on project should be considered with a continuing	PI is in the process of a country program review and an update of this COSOP for China. A follow up project has been considered by both China and IFAD, but a final decision was not yet taken.	O	2010	A follow up project, Shiyan Smallholder Agribusiness Development Project (SSADeP) (Project No.1699) has been designed and approved in December 2013 for the same project area in Hubei. The key elements from Qinling Mountain Area Poverty Alleviation

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up	Status	PRISMA year	Update in 2014
						focus on areas of poverty. The design process should retain key elements such as: targeting the poorest households, participation of women and farmers in village planning processes, an integrated and specific package of interventions addressed to the needs of the villagers, and a project management process that strengthens local governance.				Project (QAPRP) have been retained in addition to refocusing activities on market linkages, value chain development, agribusiness development, and rural financial services, in line with the new emphasis under both government and IFAD strategies.
China	IE	2	CTRY	STR	DES	IFAD and the Government of China (GOC) should work together on identifying which aspects of project design must be compliant for the whole project period and which aspects can be subject to change in line with project conditions.	IFAD and GOC work closely and continuously on these aspect in ongoing projects in the sphere of supervision and evaluations.	O	2010	IFAD and GOC now review IFAD's comparative advantage and the agreed IFAD country strategy, and all new projects are aligned accordingly with the appropriate degree of flexibility, as and when necessary, to ensure maximum impact.
China	IE	5	CTRY	STR	DES	A clearer investment mechanism is required per village so that the greatest economies of scale and optimum benefits can be achieved. In project design, guidelines for an investment quota could be defined based on area, population, and potential.	This is under consideration for infrastructure investments in the oncoming projects.	O	2010	The new SSADeP (project no. 1699) has been designed taking into full account the actual needs of the villages to be included, through a careful needs assessment by the Village Implementing Groups, in close consultation with the township and country project management offices. All such demands have been compiled, consolidated and reviewed by the project leading groups at all the relevant levels. And once approved the resources are transferred depending on the nature of the activities and the manner of their implementation (i.e. community execution by force account versus competitive bidding for major civil works like roads and irrigation rehabilitation).
China	IE	9	CTRY	STR	ASR	Further analysis is required in terms of the characteristics and needs of migrant labour and the attitude of households towards external employment opportunities.	This could not be addressed thus far.	PD	2010	Further analysis carried out during the design of SSADeP has highlighted some of the needs of migrant labourers, who have acquired new skills and extra income from their travels and have shown renewed interest to return to their roots and reinvest in micro and

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up	Status	PRISMA year	Update in 2014
										small enterprises and/or cooperatives with the small producers back home. On the other hand the same analysis has indicated renewed interest of some poorer villagers to consolidate their agricultural lands and subsequently lease these to more professional farmers, and they will become wage labourers or migrate seasonally in search of work and more income. In the latter cases it has been shown that rent of the land constitutes a significant share of total family income of the migrants. SSADeP was designed to address the needs of both these two groups through, inter-alia: (1) building strong market linkages for the enterprises and cooperatives willing to engage or include the small farmers in their midst or as equal partners; (2) supporting the on-farmer development of this newly consolidated farms for higher productivity and commercialised production for niche value chains; etc.
<b>Philippines Western Mindanao Community Initiatives Project - Interim Evaluation</b>										
Philippines	IE	10	CTRY	STR	SUS	Clarity of responsibilities is also important if the project covers parts of Autonomous Region in Muslim Mindanao (ARMM) as well as Region 9 (e.g. in Basilan).	Programme does not cover these areas	NA	2010	The new FishCORAL under government review covers two bays in ARMM. Project management in ARMM uses the region's autonomous structure. Management accountabilities and responsibilities of each implementing unit are specified. There are clearly terms of references for the project staff in ARMM as well as for other regions.
Philippines	IE	11	CTRY	STR	PMA	Project management in conflict zones: Project execution and supervision and implementation support mechanisms need to be flexible, given the constantly changing security circumstances in the region.	The INREMP is not going to cover the deep conflict affected areas covered under WMCIP. Nevertheless, the management of the project is flexible and largely dependent on the local conditions at any given province or municipality.	NA	2010	The use of ARMM's autonomous structure gives FishCORAL project execution adapted to the region's political situation and admin structure. Project is managed by the Bangsamoro people and within their systems, thus providing flexibility and at the level of supervision and implementation support.
Philippines	IE	15	PROJ	STR	SUS	Mindanao conflict and regulation of resource use: Future projects must recognize and support the dynamics of	If conflict affected areas are included under the project these recommendations will be executed.	NA	2010	FishCORAL has consulted the tri-communities in the target areas during the project formulation. The project documented the indigenous peoples in

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up	Status	PRISMA year	Update in 2014
						tri-communities (Muslim, Christian and Indigenous Peoples) in conflict areas by bringing these partners together to resolve conflicts and manage natural resources.				the target bays. Project's strategy respect indigenous ways in the delivery of Project services in close consultation with the local communities.
Philippines	IE	16	GOV	STR	NRM	Environment: The influx of mining activities within the four provinces poses a clear threat to the sustainability of WMCIP and needs to be kept under review. If there is no IFAD follow on intervention, as part of the mainstreaming, DAR (Department of Agrarian Reform), DENR (Department of Environment and Natural Resources), and relevant LGU (Local Government Unit) should be involved in this review.	Since IFAD does not have a follow-up project in the exact areas covered under WMCIP there is no information available about the follow-up from DAR, DENR and LGUs on this recommendation.	NA	2010	Three provinces under WMCIP are covered in Project CONVERGE. The clusters of agrarian reform communities that will undertake value chain developments under Project CONVERGE have not reported threats due to mining activities in their areas. DAR, DENR and relevant LGUs are involved in this review of potential interventions in relation to mining activities.
Philippines	IE	23	PROJ	OPER	RFI	Credit: A different credit modality should be sought with other government entities. This should take into account lessons learned from the evaluation of the previously IFAD-funded Rural Micro-Enterprise Finance Program and the recently launched Rural Micro-Enterprise Promotion Project (RuMEPP). For example, RuMEPP's effort to use the credit funds as a deposit/guaranty in the Small Business Guaranty and Finance Corporation working in partnership with MFIs is a step in the right direction.	No credit facility is foreseen under INREMP. Provision has, however, been made to link with existing credit providers in the areas to be covered.	NA	2010	There are no credit facilities for the two new projects of FishCORAL Project and Project CONVERGE. Project beneficiaries will be linked to existing local banks or micro financing institutions located in their areas for credit access.
Philippines	IE	24	CTRY	STR	PAR	Environment: If a follow on intervention continues to work in coastal areas, greater effort has to be made to enhance the involvement of the DA (Department of Agriculture) - Regional Field units and Bureau of Fisheries and	No coastal areas are covered under INREMP as activities will be concentrated along the catchments in the upper river basins.	NA	2010	FishCORAL is implemented by the Department of Agriculture-Bureau of Fisheries and Aquatic Resources (DA/BFAR). There will be four regional BFAR Field management units for this project. In the new project, DA/BFAR working with LGUs will provide technical assistance and extension

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up	Status	PRISMA year	Update in 2014
						Aquatic Resources, especially in regard to extending technical assistance to the various land and water resource management technologies.				services to the various land and water resource management technologies.
Philippines	IE	25	CTRY	STR	PAR	Department of Environment and Natural Resources (DENR) complementarity of two laws, namely RA 7586 and RA 8550 affecting marine and coastal resource management and fisheries in National Integrated Protected Areas Systems (NIPAS), needs to be addressed. The Fisheries Code (RA8550) is more localized and operable at the Local Government Unit (LGU) level. NIPAS requires congressional approval across a vast stretch of protected areas.	The cross-sectoral nature of upper river basin management caused the design of INREMP to include the development of proposals that will resolved the issues of: (a) fragmented and overlapping policies, legislation and institutional responsibilities; (b) conflicting, contradictory or ambiguous regulations and institutional roles; (c) insufficient capacity of concerned stakeholders to ensure sustainable management of critical watersheds; (d) ineffective implementation and enforcement of forest and mining laws and regulations; (e) inadequate land tenure classification; and (g) insufficient funding. The Project implementation does not require that laws or major policies be changed significantly, except to ensure that the policies and regulations are consistent. Existing laws and policies are already supportive of INREM approach, except for some inter-sectoral inconsistencies and lack of implementation. As a general strategy, the Project will seek to empower communities and indigenous peoples and local governments, through multi-sectoral bodies and guided by science-based analysis and economic appraisal of watershed conditions, to take decisions on inter-sectoral conflicts (e.g. forests vs. mines, high-value agriculture vs.	NA	2010	The FishCORAL project operates in municipal waters under the purview of LGUs. Municipal water use and management is governed by RA 8550 or the "Philippines Fisheries Code" and RA 7160 or the "Local Government Code". The 11 target bays are not under NIPAS. One of the strategies of the project is to establish Marine Protected Areas which is covered by Executive Order 553 calling for the adoption of Integrated Coast Management (ICM) as a national strategy to ensure the sustainable development of the country's coastal and marine resources.

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up	Status	PRISMA year	Update in 2014
							biodiversity conservation), that ensure sustainability and avoid further natural resource degradation			
<b>Argentina: Rural Development Project for the North-Eastern Provinces - Completion Evaluation</b>										
Argentina	CE	3	CTRY	STR	PMA	Operating regulations – beyond general guidelines – should be established in the course of each specific negotiation process.	During the Nov. and Dec. 2009 training events in Buenos Aires, this requirement was specifically discussed and it was agreed to further detail Operations Manuals, if and as required by local and provincial specificities.	O	2010	No further progress, since operational manuals will be developed as and when required by local and provincial authorities. During the Nov. and Dec. 2009 training events in Buenos Aires, this requirement was specifically discussed and it was agreed to further detail Operations Manuals, if and as required by local and provincial specificities.
Argentina	CE	4	GOV	STR	ORG	Rural development should support the consolidation of existing local and regional organizations.	This principle is widely accepted by both federal and provincial authorities.	O	2010	This is part of practice and the principle is widely accepted by both federal and provincial authorities.
Argentina	CE	6	CTRY	STR	DIA	Some processes under way such as the policy discussion on rural finance around REAF (Specialized Meeting on Family Agriculture) initiatives provide an opportunity for dialogue in this regard. IFAD, in particular, should support such discussion and policy-making processes, identifying success factors in other countries and facilitating exchanges with other projects. In addition, important lessons can be drawn from successful experiences in the country, such as the Social Capital Fund (FONCAP) and the examples of cooperatives receiving funding from PRODERNEA.	There is still much room for improvement in the Rural Financial sector in Argentina. Meanwhile, both PRODEAR and re-oriented PRODERPA have no RFS components as such. As for REAF, the regional success of this experience, particularly in the MERCOSUR area, has deeply influenced the internal policy discussions that led to the institutionalization of this sub-sector in 2008, further strengthened in 2009 with the upgrading of family farming to a Secretaría de Estado under the Ministry of Agriculture.	O	2010	Same status: There is still much room for improvement in the Rural Financial sector in Argentina. Meanwhile, the regional success of the REAF experience, particularly in the MERCOSUR area, has deeply influenced the internal policy discussions that led to the institutionalization of this sub-sector in 2008, further strengthened in 2009 with the upgrading of family farming to a Secretaría de Estado under the Ministry of Agriculture.
Argentina	CE	12	GOV	STR	NRM	The challenge associated to a larger pressure on natural resources (water, soil, vegetation) as a consequence of the expansion of the agricultural frontier, more intensive production methods,	This area has been neglected for a long time, although IFAD operations have had limited size to produce important (positive or negative) environmental impacts. Discussions are underway with	O	2010	This area has been neglected for a long time, although IFAD operations have had limited size to produce important (positive or negative) environmental impacts. Environmental scoping and risk mitigation was included in the Inclusive Rural Development

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up	Status	PRISMA year	Update in 2014
						and a limited environmental awareness is a key issue that needs to be addressed beyond the possibilities of individual projects. This situation calls for policy dialogue at local, provincial and national levels focusing on sustainability.	GEF unit at IFAD to introduce an additional, specific component to the Rural Areas Development Programme (PRODEAR) national programme with Global Environment Facility (GEF) funding for environmental purposes. The CPE National Roundtable Workshop (NRTW) in June 2010 will offer an excellent opportunity to discuss this further with both the Government of Argentina's (GOA) Ministry of Agriculture and the <i>Secretaria de Medioambiente</i> .			Programme (PRODERI) design, but is not yet fully applied in implementation. IFAD continues emphasising the importance in supervision and will also reflect it appropriately in the upcoming design of the Andean Producers' Project.
<b>Madagascar Upper Mandrare Basin Development Project – Phase II - Completion Evaluation</b>										
Madagascar	CE	3	GOV	STR	PAR	It will be essential that such partnerships be included both in the regional development programme and in communal development plans, so as to ensure coordination of interventions, optimal use of available financial and human resources in the region and communes, and, ultimately, ownership of achievements by regional and communal authorities. The region and its public technical services, on the one hand, and the communal development committees, on the other hand, must play an active role in the formulation and negotiation of partnerships, and in the coordination and implementation of local development projects and interventions of sectoral programmes at the regional and communal levels, respectively.	The budget entry of these investments is made through different channels. This does not facilitate their links. Nevertheless, the region has made efforts in the inventory of the achievements of different interventions. Each IFAD funded operations get a regional steering committee ensuring participation of all major stakeholders including farmer organizations.	O	2010	The "commune" and the "region" become the main levels of projects planning and activities programming. But partnership promotion and aid coordination by them remain a challenge because of the diversification of the investment channels (especially through NGO) due to the last political crisis
Madagascar	CE	5	GOV	STR	STR	The development of value chains, already initiated in the project area and focused	The strategy adopted by the regions is to focus on a few value chains based on the	PA	2010	The region added 5 more prioritized value chains in order to diversify risks and achieve the various production

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up	Status	PRISMA year	Update in 2014
						mainly on three irrigated crops (rice, onion and garlic), should be diversified in such a way as to achieve a better balance between irrigated crops, rainfed crops and livestock, in order to reach the maximum number of farmer categories, reduce risks related to the market and the natural environment, and achieve the various production objectives of farmers (food security, income generation, social status, etc.).	regional potentials and opportunities. The value chains developed by each project (PROSPERER-Support Programme for Rural Micro-enterprise Poles and Regional Economies, AROPA- Support to Farmers' Professional Organizations and Agricultural Services Project, PPRR- Rural Income Promotion Programme) are retained by the region.			objectives of farmers
Madagascar	CE	6	GOV	STR	PRM	Better integration must be sought both vertically by acting on all the links in the chain, with particular attention to the supply of agricultural inputs and equipment, and horizontally by better integrating value chains with each other.	It requires important financial resources and implementation capacities. It is not feasible for the entire sector given the lack of means at the disposal of the administration. The government began to consider rice (any aspect upstream and downstream of the industry for its development).	PD	2010	IFAD funded project intervention allowed the region to mobilize others resources (WB, UE, GIZ, etc.) and to develop this integration approach. This region now has an updated investment plan and has become an investment concentration area in the country.
Madagascar	CE	13	CTRY	OPER	DES	When starting up any project, a summary of project documents in the national language should be delivered to representatives of the target population.	The dissemination of full project document in national language is not yet feasible given the lack of technical vocabulary of the Malagasy language. A summary of the project actually exist in Malagasy.	PA	2010	The country still faces a lack of technical vocabulary of the Malagasy language.
Madagascar	CE	15	CTRY	STR	SUS	Subsidies to farmer groups can be justified as a first step to starting up or intensifying an economic activity, but should be gradually replaced by resources mobilized by the population and through individual and group credit.	The implementation strategy is being developed. This is part of the recommendation of the review of the COSOP in 2008 and 2009. Credit is taking a more important part.	O	2010	All IFAD funded projects use only subsidies for training need. Farmers give back the crop inputs they have taken in the early growing season.
Madagascar	CE	17	CTRY	OPER	SUP	It would be beneficial to increase the number and weight of project reviews during the implementation period (usually known as 'mid-term reviews'), which constitute the most appropriate	The mid-term review of projects is already done as requested. - The project review just before the achievement is not very appropriate for best fit at the right time.	O	2010	The mid-term reviews of projects are done as recommended; the priorities outlined are covered.



Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up	Status	PRISMA year	Update in 2014
						occasion to jointly evaluate (Government, project team, IFAD and possibly co-sponsors and the cooperating institution) project performance, identify major constraints to performance and make the proper adjustments to implementation modalities.				
Madagascar	CE	24	GOV	OPER	SUS	With support from RMF, the region should assume full responsibility for the maintenance of inter-provincial roads. Roadside dwellers (users' associations of tracks and roads) should be involved only for emergency works (accidental interruptions etc.).	The Region and the Ministry of Public Works have worked hard to increase budgets for maintenance. But the needs far exceed available financial resources.	PD	2010	Budget for maintenance was increased and maintenance was done. The Region and the Ministry of Public Works mobilised funds from the national road maintenance fund and from others projects.

#### D. Country and project evaluations from PRISMA 2009

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up	Status	PRISMA year	Update in 2014
<b>Brazil - Country Programme Evaluation</b>										
Brazil	CPE	8	CTRY	STR	TGT	In addition to focusing on the North-east, the Fund should consider the possibility of expanding its geographic outreach to cover the rural poor living in the Northern areas of the country, which also show high levels of poverty. IFAD should seek ways and means to support indigenous peoples in the Amazon in consultation with governmental agencies for indigenous peoples, such as the National Foundation for Indians (FUNAI). For this purpose, the Latin America division might also consider mobilizing resources from the indigenous people grant facility available at IFAD.	After a broad consultation process in which participated the Federal Government, State Governments and other institutions, it has been agreed during COSOP preparation to maintain the geographical focus in the Northeast, although the possibility to explore other opportunities in the Amazonian states is still open.	NA	2009	The agreement with the Government of Brazil is IFAD to remain in the North-east and not to expand to other regions. Among the main reasons for this decision are the high prevalence of rural poverty in the Northeast and the limited availability of IFAD resources
Brazil	CPE	12	CTRY	STR	RFI	IFAD should pay deeper emphasis to strengthening of rural financial services at the	Brazil counts as a country with broad rural finance sector with important amounts of resources	NA	2009	No additional up-date to what was previously mentioned: "Brazil counts as a country with broad rural finance

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up	Status	PRISMA year	Update in 2014
						grassroots level. Through loans, IFAD could cooperate in creating or strengthening microfinance entities capable of providing a variety of financial services, including savings and non-agricultural loans. In addition, there are good opportunities to expand outreach to the rural poor through retail partnerships.	(PRONAF* and others). In this situation, IFAD's direct involvement in the provision of financial services is not a priority.  * National Programme for the Strengthening of Family Agriculture			sector with important amounts of resources (PRONAF and others). In this situation, IFAD's direct involvement in the provision of financial services is not a priority."
<b>Albania: Mountain Areas Development Programme - Completion Evaluation</b>										
Albania	CE	11	CTRY	OPER	TCB	IFAD assistance for the restructuring of Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries (MAFF) will also include staff and management training.	The identification of the training needs is ongoing.	O	2009	IFAD support for restructuring has included a number of training initiatives: During 2009-2010, 57 FAF-DC personnel attended international and national training in subject covering: microfinance; Micro and SME (small-medium enterprise) (MSME) financing; customer relations; procurement and financial management; equity financing and methodologies, and; anti money laundering. A total of 33 staff members were trained in-country in FAF-DC operational procedures and 30 persons in the newly acquired banking software. During 2011, 36 FAF-DC personnel attended international and national trainings on: microfinance; Micro and SME (MSME) financing; marketing research; equity investment; lending methodology and portfolio monitoring. With regards to the new banking software installed at headquarters and all branches, FAF-DC staff has been trained in loan portfolio management and monitoring; accounting; fixed assets management; and inventory. During 2013, 35 FAF –DC personnel attended international and national trainings on: Full package of Microfinance Software training program required by FAF DC and developed by the Company ASPEKT. The training programs of

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up	Status	PRISMA year	Update in 2014
										Microfinance Software offered by ASPEKT were:a) Functional User trainingb) Advance user trainingc) System user trainingd) Production of Relevant Manuals
<b>Belize: Community-Initiated Agriculture and Resource Management - Completion Evaluation</b>										
Belize	CE	1	CTRY	STR	STR	There should be continued investment in the southern districts of Belize. There are a number of initiatives developed through the project such as livestock development and bee keeping which still require support to ensure that the full benefits from project investments can be realized.	The Government of Belize requested IFAD to focus on the sustainable and inclusive expansion of the access to rural financial services by the rural poor population. The provision of non-financial services will be ensured by the EU-funded Belize Rural Development Project (BRDP). Activities such as those mentioned in the evaluation will be eligible for both receiving financial and non-financial services.	PA	2009	The Belize Rural Finance Project (BRFP) currently under implementation supports Credit Unions to provide financial services to credit-worthy groups, including those in the southern districts of Belize.
Belize	CE	4	PROJ	OPER	RFI	Reflows from the Rural Credit Fund need to be quarantined for continued support to the two participating credit unions.	The financial sustainability of the CUs have received specific attention during the RFP design: government would continue to support the CU needs till they can access commercial lines of credit to meet their needs	PA	2009	As the ultimate goal of the RFP is to support the development of a sustainable CU movement in Belize able to provide services with focus on underserved rural client, the Rural Credit Fund has now started its operations. The close collaboration among PMU, Belize Credit Union League and other partners such as the Central bank of Belize will allow for a continuous support to interested CUs once the RFP will end its operations.
Belize	CE	14	PROJ	OPER	DES	Future projects should clearly state their intentions and potential time frames, and gauge and manage the level of expectations generated.	This issue will be carefully taken into consideration during the implementation of the RFP.	O	2009	The BRFP project currently under implementation in Belize has realistic objectives that are expected to be reached within the time frame established at design.
Belize	CE	16	PROJ	OPER	ORG	The groups to be financed need to either be in existence prior to the project and/or have specific self-generated objectives and a common cause. The methodology of requiring communities to form small groups specifically to access funds is not recommended;	The RFP will increase credit unions' capacity to provide a wide range of financial services and apply various rural finance methodologies, including group lending.	PA	2009	The BRFP is strengthening Credit Unions' capacity to provide various financial services, including through group lending. Further, as recommended, the project is not representing a direct or indirect incentive to create ad-hoc groups in order to access such services.

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up	Status	PRISMA year	Update in 2014
						support to individuals may also be appropriate.				
Belize	CE	18	PROJ	OPER	PMA	Project processes need to be sufficiently flexible to respond to changes in project situation, particularly after the mid-term review (MTR)	IFAD direct supervision will ensure flexible and timely response as needed.	O	2009	So far, project processes have been quite flexible in responding to necessary changes in project implementation. After MTR, the PMU has managed to respond promptly to all agreed-upon recommended actions.
Belize	CE	23	PROJ	STR	BEN	Policy level review and practical support for decentralization is needed to assess the representation of different ethnic groups in decision-making for their own development. There is a need for community leaders, both traditional mayors and local councils to receive more orientation, training and basic tools for leadership.	This is not within the scope of new IFAD loan-funded intervention. However, IFAD is presently financing with a small country grant the National Village Council Association (NAVCO) with the purpose of strengthening the Belize incipient decentralisation process.	PA	2009	The small country grant to NAVCO (through UNDP) helped to sensitize targeted local leaders and local communities on basic concepts of rural financial services among other things. More attention to decentralization can also be the focus of future IFAD interventions in Belize.
Belize	CE	28	GOV	STR	PAR	There is a need for GoB and donors to consider more public/private partnerships in project management and implementation. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The mechanism of a Project Steering Committee (PSC) is a critical partnership for project implementation and in this regard, issues such as selection of members, conflict of interest, incentives, etc. must be realistically addressed.</li> <li>The GoB should make election to PSC/Boards more transparent.</li> </ul>	The new Rural Finance Policy (RFP) is implemented by the private sector through the credit unions. The role and composition of the RFP Oversight Committee has been extensively discussed during the programme design and lessons learnt from previous projects have been taken into account.	PA	2009	After Mid-term Review (MTR) (2012) credit unions engagement in rural areas is increasing thanks to the project. A twinning partnership arrangement with a reputable technical service provider in the field of Credit Union (CU) is currently being drafted and is expected to enhance CU sustainability in the provision of rural finance services. The Programme Oversight Committee (POC) is fully staffed and is having a crucial role in guiding PMU and BCUL (Belize Credit Union League) in their efforts to improve project performance.
Belize	CE	29	GOV	STR	PMA	There is a need to orientate and strengthen the Steering Committee/Board at an early stage in the project so all members understand the culture, responsibilities and requirements as a member and to make sure that they are capable of making the necessary decisions.	This recommendation will be addressed in the implementation of the RFP.	O	2009	The RFP POC has immediately started guiding the work of the PMU and has a key role in facilitating project implementation. The quality of its performance is outstanding.

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up	Status	PRISMA year	Update in 2014
Belize	CE	30	GOV	STR	KM	Better communication mechanisms and practices are required at all levels to expedite critical correspondence, exchange views more regularly, increase mutual understanding of the challenges faced by the project and lead to more rapid identification of solutions.	This recommendation will be addressed in the implementation of the RFP.	O	2009	The close collaboration between POC and PMU is a stated fact. The project is working on the intensification of knowledge and information exchanges among C.U.s through the Belize Credit Union League (BCUL).

### E. Country and project evaluations from PRISMA 2008

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up	Status	PRISMA year	Update in 2014
<b>Morocco - Country Programme Evaluation</b>										
Morocco	CPE	2	CTRY	STR	STR	The new COSOP must take into account: (i) the changes in the poverty situation in Morocco, which is now more well-known thanks to the poverty map, but also changes in the obstacles to poverty reduction	A poverty assessment will be undertaken during COSOP formulation.	NYD	2008	During COSOP formulation, a poverty assessment (status and evolution) has been carried out on the basis of available data at the national and communal level together with poverty reduction strategies. In addition, an analysis of the economic situation, the National Initiative for Human Development and rural development strategy and the newly established agricultural development strategy (the Green Morocco Plan) has been achieved. Determinants of poverty have been identified and strategic objectives have been formulated accordingly. A new poverty map has been published in 2010 with updated data. Targeting in the subsequent projects has been done based on these new data.
Morocco	CPE	4	CTRY	STR	PAR	(iii) The definition of partnerships, including partnerships with <i>government institutions</i> , by broadening the partnership to take account of institutions that have so far been little involved. (...) At the same time, the definition of partnerships with <i>international organizations</i> should be more detailed, and the role of non-governmental actors and the	A consultation workshop will be held with other donors and international organisations involved in rural development to define rules of engagement within the framework of the new COSOP.	NYD	2008	The formulation process of the 2009-2014 COSOP included large participatory workshops with several national institutions, civil society organisations (national and grassroots associations and cooperatives) and international institutions involved in poverty reduction and agricultural development. The implementation of ongoing projects is based on partnerships with several national institutions, associations and

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up	Status	PRISMA year	Update in 2014
						private sector in the programme of cooperation between IFAD and the Government of Morocco needs to be more clearly defined.				cooperatives. Two projects were cofinanced by international institutions (GEF and OFID) and partnerships are envisaged with other international institutions in the new programme for the development of mountain zones.
Morocco	CPE	6	CTRY	STR	DIA	Lastly, the preparation of the new COSOP should be organized within the framework of broader consultation and coordination involving all public, private and associational actors, and regular updating and adjustment of the COSOP programme should be anticipated, since a strategy must be flexible if it is to adapt to changes in the political, social, economic and institutional context.	Broad consultations will be held during COSOP formulation, as explained above. As regards the updating and adjustment of the COSOP programme, the COSOP to be prepared will take this recommendation into account when applicable.	NYD	2008	See above. As regards the updating and adjustment of the COSOP, the mid-term review of the present COSOP has concluded to its still pertinent objectives with regard to those of the new 15-year Mountain development programme, and thus, has recommended its prorogation to the first phase of the programme over a period of 5 years. A mid-term review will be undertaken to make necessary adjustments if necessary.
Morocco	CPE	7	CTRY	STR	KM	Supplementary. In partnership with the specialized units of Ministry of Agriculture and Marine Fisheries (MAPM), adopt a more ambitious communication strategy based on a wider dissemination among partners of advances that might help to boost policy dialogue for the mobilization of policymakers and the rural population;	The COSOP to be prepared will take this recommendation into account where applicable and will adopt a wider communication mechanism with MAPM.	NYD	2008	In order to ensure knowledge management and communication, the COSOP stressed the need for synergy and complementarity with provincial, regional and national partners through a data-sharing system based on experience, results and multidimensional information. In addition, a special central coordination unit has been set up to ensure dialogue between projects, IFAD, MAPM and MEF and diffusion of advances and best practices. Furthermore, policy dialogue and mobilization of policymakers are carried out continuously that is, at the end of each IFAD mission (implementation support, supervision, mid-term reviews, completion) the results and recommendations of the missions are widely discussed with the ministries involved.
Morocco	CPE	9	CTRY	STR	PRM	The issue of marketing and the <i>integration of agricultural products promoted by IFAD-financed projects into appropriate commodity chains</i>	The COSOP to be prepared will take this recommendation into account where applicable to be introduced in the design of all new projects.	NYD	2008	The formulation process of the 2009-2014 COSOP was concomitant with the elaboration of the new agricultural development strategy based on value chain development. The IFAD

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up	Status	PRISMA year	Update in 2014
						warrants special attention with a view to fostering the economic viability of many interventions and the sustainability of their impact. Here, it seems necessary to establish better links among productive activities launched in the target douars, input markets and end-consumers.				Programme took into account this new development thrust in its Strategic Objective 3 and since, two ongoing projects targeting small farmers and herders were designed along the new lines which revolve around developing and integrating the three value chain links i.e. production, processing and marketing of agricultural and agro-industrial commodities, in addition to acquisition of seals of quality for these products, particularly in the mountainous zones that are a priority throughout this country programme. A forthcoming Programme under preparation is similarly being designed along these same lines.
Morocco	CPE	10	CTRY	STR	INR	Possible synergies between project activities (based on loans) and technical assistance grants for research and development deserve more reflection with regard to strategy, as well as operational aspects.	The COSOP to be prepared will take this recommendation into account when possible.	NYD	2008	The COSOP has stipulated synergies between projects activities (based on loans) and technical assistance grants in the fields of studies to provide a solid basis for improving implementation efficiency and discussion with other national and international partners and donors with a view to ensuring application on a wider scale. In terms of implementation, each project of the portfolio comprises besides the loan a grant to promote pilot operations and innovations linked to the main interventions of the projects and facilitating these interventions.
Morocco	CPE	11	CTRY	STR	INR	Improvement in the performance of the partnership as a whole is important in both promoting and replicating innovations. There are two priorities: (i) to anticipate a framework for the <i>systematic collaboration between grants and projects</i> (pilot experiments, analysis and capitalization, the dissemination of advances) and (ii) to strengthen collaboration between innovating agents (NGOs, the research and development	The COSOP to be prepared will stipulate close linkages between grants and projects as recommended.	NYD	2008	As regards the first priority, the COSOP took it into account by stating complementarity between loans and grants. This complementarity has been effective in all ongoing projects and will be strengthened in the new programme. As for the second priority, a close collaboration between other development programmes, research institutions, NGOs, farmers and IFAD has been instituted in all ongoing projects.

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up	Status	PRISMA year	Update in 2014
						system, farmers, other development programmes) and IFAD's programme, which will probably entail boosting IFAD's involvement and intervention.				
Morocco	CPE	14	CTRY	STR	PMA	Projections in terms of project planning, disbursement capacity and staff availability (especially taking into account the voluntary severance programme) have turned out to be unrealistic, and a <i>discussion of these procedures</i> and projections is therefore needed to ensure the <i>real availability of human and financial resources</i> as and when anticipated. This recommendation applies also to the sustainability of results and impacts, which is often considered late in the project cycle.	The COSOP to be prepared will address these issues. Furthermore, a dialogue with the GOM is ongoing through the current projects, as a platform on streamlining flow of funds and allocation of competent human resources.	NYD	2008	Indeed staff availability has been a constraint on project implementation performance and hence had a negative impact on disbursements. Furthermore, coordination between the Ministry of Agriculture (implementing agency) and the Ministry of Finance (in charge of disbursements procedure) is weak. Dialogue around these two issues is continuous, as it is for providing the necessary staff through private technical assistance. This solution is now generalised to all post-COSOP projects. As regards sustainability of results and impacts, the new agricultural development strategy (GMP/PMV) bases all its interventions on pre-established cooperatives, thus ensuring ownership and sustainability of the achievements. The IFAD projects work along these lines and the main interventions along the different links of the value chains are subject, early in the project cycle, to the formation of beneficiary cooperatives and to their capacities building.
<b>Colombia Rural Micro-enterprise Development Programme - Completion Evaluation</b>										
Colombia	CE	2	CTRY	STR	PRM	Enhance the availability of business and market information to support both RMEs and providers of technological services, using for that purpose the various systems that have been implemented by the Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development The challenge is to adapt these systems and make them more accessible and user-friendly, bearing in	Access to technical, financial or merchandising services is increasing, with a major budget of the Ministry and Territorial Governments	O	2008	The technical and financial support services to support the Microempresa Rurales (MERs) are now diversified and expanded, through: MADR, departmental governments, and, in a lesser extent through local governments. The MADR has structured an investment strategy that includes specific solutions to the needs for entrepreneur technical support for the various segments of MER, nowadays executed via the "Dirección de Desarrollo de



Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up	Status	PRISMA year	Update in 2014
						mind the knowledge level of the micro entrepreneurs				Capacidades y Generación de Ingresos” with a budget of around USD 70 million for 2014. In addition, the MARD (Ministerio de Agricultura y Desarrollo Rural) is operating a Micro Rural Enterprise Observatory as a tool to organize and disseminate useful information for taking business decisions. On the other hand, through the “Banca de las Oportunidades”, they have developed specialized services for the design and scaling of financial solutions for micro-entrepreneur families, by modifying the regulatory framework, experimenting with new products or services and promoting its adoption through the formal banking, cooperatives and financial intermediaries.
Colombia	CE	6	CTRY	STR	ORG	The strategy of organizational strengthening requires the inclusion and the initiation by the project of useful social activities that will give members of the organization an increased sense of ownership Some of the organizations visited by the mission have made a major effort in this regard The equation organization = business is generally very vulnerable, given the potential for failure in marketing processes, unless the organization is also carrying out other activities	The spirit of cooperation and to offer health, educational services and other benefits is increasing, but it all depends of the social capital of the organization	O	2008	Strategies related to associative rural development are taking up a new place on Colombia’s discussion agenda on policies and investments for development. During 2013, the National Planning Department has initiated a process of analysis of the status of rural organizations in the country, including a review of the legal and tax alternatives in which the economic initiatives of the rural poor are framed and managed. Its purpose is to propose potential tax and legal alternatives to improve the institutional framework in which operate the diversity of rural associations and which combine strategies and productive actions, economic, social, educational and recreational. In addition, through IFAD’s new operation in the country, the MARD and DNP are seeking also to rebuild social capital in 100 rural municipalities in areas of post conflict, using an investment strategy that seeks to rebuild and/or increase the social and business capital of the most vulnerable territories of the country. This is in line with the priority

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up	Status	PRISMA year	Update in 2014
										expressed by the Government of Colombia (GdC) for the COSOP updating exercise made in 2008, and which emphasizes the role of IFAD in the provision of support to the formation of social capital in rural areas.
Colombia	CE	7	CTRY	STR	DEC	Continue deepening and decentralizing activities by increasing the involvement of public and private entities in the regions in activities that are currently being supervised directly by the national technical coordination unit (NTCU)	Although slowly, the decentralisation process is ongoing.	O	2008	Decentralization has continued slowly in the spaces that are within the competence of the MARD, but respond more to scattered initiatives than to strategies and effective tools for decentralization. Progress has been made by mobilizing the inclusion of local networks of services and financing to the MER that include universities, NGOs and associations of beneficiaries.
Colombia	CE	8	CTRY	STR	RFI	Strengthen financial operators in order to enable them to diversify the supply of services and begin offering working capital and marketing loans, collective loans, savings accounts, insurance and fund transfers Implement a programme for the development or transfer of methodologies to diversify financial products, employing a multi-product approach based on detailed analysis of demand in each region	The rural micro-financial sector is rapidly increasing with the support of second tier banking and the controlling organizations	O	2008	In recent years new actors are participating in the rural financial sector, diversifying the range of institutions, services and products. The strengthening of these operators has been made through training tools and technical assistance, national and international, including important investments carried out by IFAD through the Oportunidades Rurales project and with an active and growing participation of the Banca de las Oportunidades, that currently has available funding to subsidize the costs of marketing new products, incentives for pilot projects that are not initially profitable, and technical assistance for the recruitment of a consultant or institution with wide international or local experience in microfinance technologies, strengthening cooperatives and NGOs, or studies that allow a better understanding of the needs of customers subject of the policy.
Colombia	CE	9	CTRY	STR	RFI	Increase the coverage of agencies of financial operators in remote rural areas that are currently not being served by: (i) promoting partnerships	There is a major relation with Cooperatives and non-formal entities. At the same time, the presence of the financing NGOs is increasing, an	O	2008	The access to the financial services markets have expanded through the inclusion of new regulated and non-regulated public and private institutions, that today are developing

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up	Status	PRISMA year	Update in 2014
						among financial operators and consolidated ARMEs that operate self-managed credit funds These associations have experience in the administration of loan funds and they can partner with financial operators in pre-selecting loan applications, linking collections of loan payments to deliveries of products and consolidating payments in bank accounts of the financial operator; and (ii) promoting partnerships through non-bank representative offices	example being the Rural Women Bank (Banco de la Mujer Rural)			new services and products for the rural poor, including the provision of saving services through electronic banking, new remote and on-site financial education tools, access to low-cost life insurance for the protection of physical assets of the MER, etc.Regarding the self-managed funds owned by the beneficiaries, progress have been made on actions to look for articulation mechanisms with financial operators, but in general remain as a local funding tool, especially for the small and remote MERs.Also, through an agreement signed by the Proyecto de Microempresa Rural/MADR and FINAGRO, it has been included in the General Agriculture and Rural Development Law (its eventual approval is subject to the peace agreements which are currently discussed in La Habana) the creation of a Fund of rural microfinance (FMR) administered by the Fund for the financing of the Agricultural Sector, as a separate patrimony in order to finance, support and develop rural microfinance in the country. This FMR would be made up of the National Government and the funds contributed by the Project through the MARD.A specific challenge is the structuring of associated financing mechanisms to the MERs through the formal market, to sustain their growth and consolidation strategies. Until today there are no relevant instruments that allow the MER access to financing as legally constituted companies (and not as the sum of the individual credits of its associates).Finally, initiatives of e-banking are occupying an important place on the national agenda and that can benefit especially to rural areas, combining policy settings to implement several initiatives (consultancy support, international workshops, pilot projects to validate new products and

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up	Status	PRISMA year	Update in 2014
										the co-financing financial institutions) to promote financial inclusion projects through mobile-banking projects.
Colombia	CE	10	CTRY	STR	RFI	Stimulate the participation of savings and loan cooperatives in rural microcredit, since these institutions have a strong regional identity and enjoy a great deal of trust among the public	Some progress has been made in a specific project, but not in general terms.	PA	2008	There has been a limited step forward in broadening the participation of the cooperative sector in the provision of financial services to the rural population. Except for new specific cases (Barichara Cooperative, Cooperative Housing Foundation, etc.) generally, a systematic strategy to mobilize the cooperative sector has lacked. By the end of 2013 there are 972 points of services or contact the cooperative sector, and only 395 are located in rural areas. The presence of the cooperative sector is still the less relevant in terms of points of attention and coverage of rural users dominated today by the banking sector (about 8 000 contact points), and then the microfinance NGOs sector (with 1 023 points of attention).
<b>Georgia Agricultural Development Project - Completion Evaluation</b>										
Georgia	CE	2	CTRY	STR	RME	Impact indicators relevant to the Fund's concern for marginalized groups should be included in the design of programmes	This is being addressed in the design of the forthcoming Livestock Development Programme	O	2008	Impact indicators relevant to the Fund's concern were added to the design of the Agriculture Support Project (ASP) and they will be taken into consideration in the ongoing design for the new project in Georgia
Georgia	CE	4	CTRY	STR	TGT	At the project design phase, IFAD should clearly identify the target groups that can realistically be assisted, and the strategies and project components to be adopted to reach them, in line with IFAD's targeting policy and government priorities	This was being addressed in the design of the Livestock Development Programme. As changes in the political situation and priorities in the country changed, project design is currently frozen. This recommendation will be taken into account when operations in the country start again	O	2008	Recommendation on targeting has been taken into account in the design for the ASP and its supplementary funding. Also, special attention will be paid to targeting issue, while designing the new project in Georgia in 2014.
Georgia	CE	5	CTRY	STR	TGT	In the case of households unable to take advantage of interventions aimed at agricultural commercialisation, IFAD should draw the Government's attention to the risks of marginalising poor	This was being addressed in the design of the Livestock Development Programme. As changes in the political situation and priorities in the country changed, project design is currently frozen. This	O	2008	After the political change in 2012, the GoG started to pay great attention to the agricultural sector in general and to rural poor/marginalized people in particular. It is expected that this approach will continue for the coming years and it will be mainstreamed in

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up	Status	PRISMA year	Update in 2014
						households and communities in rural areas so that specific plans and measures to support them could be jointly developed within its overall growth-oriented strategies and policies	recommendation will be taken into account when operations in the country start again.			the new design process for Georgia in 2014.
<b>Mongolia Arhangai and Huvsgul Rural Poverty Alleviation Project - Completion Evaluation</b>										
Mongolia	CE	4	IFAD	STR	SUP	To ensure compliance with the project design and with recommendations of supervision missions, IFAD and its Cooperating Institution need to clearly define the supervision arrangements to allow for continuity and follow-up. In particular, it is recommended that: a) the Cooperating Institution responsibilities be more clearly defined in final agreements;	The supervision responsibility is taken over by IFAD.	NA	2008	IFAD took over the supervision and loan administration of the portfolio since beginning of 2008. The supervision is undertaken according to the IFAD supervision and implementation support policy and procedures. This has been classified as followed up,
Mongolia	CE	5	IFAD	STR	SUP	b) clear performance indicators for the Cooperating Institution be developed and the Cooperating Institution be held accountable for them	The supervision responsibility is taken over by IFAD.	NA	2008	IFAD took over the supervision and loan administration of the portfolio since beginning of 2008. The supervision is undertaken according to the IFAD supervision and implementation support policy and procedures. This has been classified as followed up,
Mongolia	CE	6	IFAD	STR	RME	c) IFAD provides the needed guidance to the Cooperating Institution in supporting the project to establish a good system to monitor and assess project impact.	The supervision responsibility is taken over by IFAD.	NA	2008	IFAD took over the supervision and loan administration of the portfolio since beginning of 2008. The supervision is undertaken according to the IFAD supervision and implementation support policy and procedures. This has been classified as followed up,
Mongolia	CE	9	GOV	STR	ASR	For the provision of extension services, the GOM should carry out a needs analysis among beneficiaries to better understand what type of information they require and on what specific issues. (...) The GOM agrees that extension is critical and needs to be strengthened. The	This recommendation will be taken into consideration in the context of future interventions in this area.	NYD	2008	Needs assessments are undertaken by the PMPMD project before deciding what investment would be made to the herders' groups and women's groups supported by PMPMD, including extension services, provision of training. Under PMPMD, training efficiently is also regularly monitored and evaluated as part of the M&E system. Under PMPMD, no specific

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up	Status	PRISMA year	Update in 2014
						proposals would stretch from a better, participatory-based identification of training needs mechanism to monitor and evaluate training efficiently and the role of media and other Information and Communication Technology tools. Yet, a decision on how to implement and finance proposals on this recommendation will require some time of reflection by the GOM. This should be done prior to future IFAD-funded interventions in the country.				investment included for media and other Information and Communication Technology tools.
<b>Rural finance - Corporate level evaluation</b>										
IFAD	CLE	1	IFAD	POL	RFI	IFAD Management decides to make Rural Finance an area of excellence and define a strategy to do so, through the development of effective partnerships with rural finance centres of excellence, field practitioners and donors IFAD is committed to making the necessary investments to improve the RFP, in-house capacity, and instruments (as detailed below) to ensure the Fund lives up to its ambition.	IFAD has made arrangements for grant supported partnerships: i) a grant agreement closing in 2010 has been signed with the Consultative Groups to Assist the Poor (CGAP), a consortium of 33 public and private development agencies who work in the field of microfinance; ii) similarly, a grant agreement has been signed with the Micro Finance Centre (MFC), a network of microfinance service providers, who also provide services through the Micro Insurance Centre (MIC).	O	2008	IFAD has been continuously working to enhance its effectiveness in rural finance. An Action Plan was defined in 2006, updated in 2009 and 2013. Interventions have been focusing on: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1.Strengthening formal partnerships with several regional centres of excellence (e.g. UNCDF; PAMIGA; APRACA; Knowledge Management Partnership; CGAP regional hubs; MIX)</li> <li>2. Enhancing IFAD role in the international arena and global discussion on financial inclusion (G-20;G-8; MFW4A; CGAP; Micro Insurance Network)</li> <li>4.Develop in-house training plan for IFAD staff in collaboration with regional divisions</li> <li>5.Provide early technical support during project design and throughout implementation</li> <li>6.Review Performance Monitoring and institute requirement for systematic use of performance-based contracts</li> </ul> In 2013 the SmartAid exercise - an independent external evaluation of IFAD systems, policies, and procedures and incentives affecting the Fund work in rural finance - was

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up	Status	PRISMA year	Update in 2014
										conducted. IFAD received 61 out of 100 points, meaning that overall it has "good" systems in place to support rural finance. IFAD increased its score by eight points since its participation in SmartAid 2009.
IFAD	CLE	3	IFAD	POL	RFI	PMD will also ensure that from mid-2007 onwards, all projects with a rural finance component have adequate continuous rural finance expertise available during the project identification and design process This will be achieved through continuously improving IFAD's in-house capacity and through regional partnerships for rural finance, which IFAD has started to form as part of the RF Action Plan The development of technical partnerships with regional RF centers of excellence will therefore be pursued and expanded (in particular in Latin America and Asia, where they are still to be defined).	The western and Central Africa Division (PA) has provided a grant to UNCDF to ensure technical support to partner countries in the design and implementation of projects with rural finance components. A grant has been provided also by the Eastern and Southern Africa Division (PF) to the Knowledge Management Partnership (KMP), which is now approaching its second phase, for similar purposes in this regional area. In Asia, the only relevant activity is carried out by MIC. No initiatives have been taken so far in Latin America.	O	2008	In 2012, PMD, in an effort to ensure that technical inputs come early enough in project cycle so that they can better contribute to the definition of country-strategies and the design of projects/programmes, conducted a thorough review of the QE process. A 'new' QE system was proposed to and approved by the IFAD Senior management in 2013. Under the new process, the bulk of PTA support has been shifted towards greater participation of Technical Advisors earlier in project design and in the implementation support stage as part of a continuous process of quality enhancement. Technical Advisors' direct participation in the Country Programme Management Teams contribute to project design when it is most important i.e. in the early stages of COSOP/project design. IFAD has also strengthened the partnerships with trusted reliable TSPs and global/regional centres of excellence in rural finance (e.g. UNCDF; PAMIGA; APRACA; AFRACA Knowledge Management Partnership; CGAP regional hubs). IFAD partners have been regularly involved in the quality enhancement process of IFAD supported Rural Finance projects, including in in-country operations. These regional technical partners are the cornerstone of enhancing IFAD's capacity in the field, given their ability to support the Fund in elaborating regional RF strategies, project formulation, and performance monitoring.
IFAD	CLE	5	IFAD	OPER	TCB	PMD commits itself to develop in 2007/2008 (and provide the required funding to do so) a	An in-house training course has not been developed yet. The ongoing Rural Finance	O	2008	A comprehensive internal capacity building plan in rural finance has been developed and implemented.1. Basic

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up	Status	PRISMA year	Update in 2014
						short 2-3 days basic course on rural finance, as part of the Rural Finance Action Plan.	Thematic Group works to share information and trends on rural finance issues. The Group is also a vehicle for enhancing and facilitating participation in training activities organised by other organisations. Fourteen IFAD staff participated in the 2007 and 2008 World Bank in-country study tours, which take place in different countries, whereby participants take stock of WB projects' experience in rural finance. This year as in previous years the Group disseminated information on the annual Boulder Microfinance Training course and the two IFAD scholarships from CGAP for which field and HQ staff are eligible. Several IFAD staff have participated in the last 3 courses. In addition, CGAP organizes training courses in microfinance for donors 3-4 times a year. The group has also disseminated information on the microfinance training courses offered by the Frankfurt School for Finance and Management.			survey of regional divisions' main priorities for capacity building in RF;2. Detailed assessment of regional divisions' demand by PTA and CGAP;3. Development of a capacity building plan – foreseeing the development and delivery of learning events/training as well as technical guidance notes on key topics;4. Rural finance training/learning events carried out at HQ in 2010, 2011, 2012, 2013 (foreseen to continue in 2014 and beyond). Several technical guidance notes ('How to' notes) based on IFAD experiences and good practices in rural finance have been developed <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>E-learning modules on performance monitoring and analysis have been developed to reach out to COs and PMUs. More than 100 IFAD staff have so far participated in this training and received a recognized MIX certificate.</li> </ul>
IFAD	CLE	6	IFAD	OPER	HR	IFAD commits to ensure that the position of the senior technical advisor for rural finance will be selected as soon as possible, preferably by April 2007 and that all necessary steps will be taken to move the two current RF positions from temporary status to more stable contract types and funding sources, to ensure continuity of essential expertise.	The position for senior technical advisor was filled in November 2007. In regard to the other two RF positions, the Terms of Reference for a P3 and a P4 position were developed in April 2008. It is expected that these TORs will be approved, guaranteeing some continuity.	O	2008	All RF positions (1 P5; 1 P4; 1 P3) have been filled in.
IFAD	CLE	8	IFAD	POL	RFI	IFAD Management will organize opportunities for interaction with its EB on best practice for rural finance and the implications that IFAD	There are some ongoing initiatives in relation to the optimisation of IFAD funding instruments. Under the auspices of the Vice President,	O	2008	IFAD has been exploring ways to optimize the use of funding instruments, including for increased provision of technical assistance. IFAD has supported several types of



Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up	Status	PRISMA year	Update in 2014
						faces when aiming to meet them, as well as practical change processes required to (i) optimize the use of IFAD funding instruments, including for increased provision of technical assistance and (ii) improve project implementation mechanisms through testing alternative modalities to the standard "project management unit" approach.	a "new financial instruments" initiative is under development. PT and ED are also studying the possibility of a public-private partnership, so far limited to Italian private companies, for the development of a "solidarity card" to be developed in partnership with IFAD as an alternative means for fundraising for microfinance projects.			innovative funding mechanisms for the agricultural sector: (i) Equity investments in the agricultural sector, (ii) Public-Private Partnerships (PPPs) along commodity value chains, (iii) Financing Facility for Remittances (FFR), (iv) Weather Risk Management Facility, (v) Platform for Agriculture Risk ManagementIn close cooperation with the two Regional Divisions for Africa. IFAD also initiated discussions with CIDR to appraise IFAD's potential participation to a Regional Facility that will promote Participatory Microfinance Approaches in Africa (PAMIGA). This facility will support MFIs that develop operations in remote rural areas and use innovative participatory governance systems to minimize costs and facilitate sustainability.
IFAD	CLE	9	IFAD	POL	DES	To shorten the project cycle (including from approval to effectiveness), IFAD will pilot, as part of the implementation of its corporate Action Plan, a shortened project cycle that will also concern a selected number of rural finance project. The pilot will aim to reduce the total time from inception to start-up to less than 24 months and to reduce project design documentation to 50 pages in total. Details of the pilot process will be determined in 2007 and implemented over two years.	So far piloting is being undertaken in the implementation of a project in Mongolia. The CPM has in fact requested funding from the Innovation Mainstreaming Initiative (IMI) to pilot the project before it goes into full implementation. At the moment, the project has just undergone the QE process. After 12 months of implementing the pilot project, the appraisal process of the loan project will take place and if needed adjustments will be made before it goes to QA and then to final Board approval. This phased approach will also enable the Asian Development Bank, which will co-fund this project, to be fully ready for implementation when it takes place.	O	2008	This exercise is part of the IFAD wider effort to enhance its effectiveness. The project documentation has been brought to 50 pages in total and project design simplified. The design of rural finance projects has been streamlined, with a strong focus on implementation modalities, which have to be clearly spelled out in the PIM. This has contributed to reducing the total time from inception to start-up (e.g.; PRODECOR RUFEP; PROFIT). More needs to be done in this area.