

Document: EB 2013/109/R.13/Add.1  
Agenda: 6  
Date: 6 August 2013  
Distribution: Public  
Original: English

**E**



Enabling poor rural people  
to overcome poverty

## **President's Report on the Implementation Status of Evaluation Recommendations and Management Actions**

### **Volume II**

### **Agreement at completion point Recommendations and follow-up actions taken by the Programme Management Department**

### **Addendum**

#### **Note to Executive Board representatives**

##### Focal points:

##### Technical questions:

**Shyam Khadka**  
Senior Portfolio Manager  
Programme Management Department  
tel.: +39 06 5459 2388  
e-mail: s.khadka@ifad.org

**Kaushik Barua**  
Portfolio Officer  
Programme Management Department  
tel.: +39 06 5459 2697  
e-mail: k.barua@ifad.org

Queries with respect to the response of the Independent  
Office of Evaluation to the report should be addressed  
to:

**Ashwani Muthoo**  
Acting Director, Independent Office of Evaluation of  
IFAD  
tel.: +39 06 5459 2053  
e-mail: a.muthoo@ifad.org

##### Dispatch of documentation:

**Deirdre McGrenra**  
Governing Bodies Officer  
Tel: +39 06 5459 2374  
e-mail: gb\_office@ifad.org

Executive Board — 109<sup>th</sup> Session  
Rome, 17-19 September 2013

---

**For: Information**

## Contents

<b>Abbreviations and acronyms</b>	<b>i</b>
<b>Categories used for the classification of agreement at completion point agreed actions</b>	<b>iii</b>
<b>A. Country Programme Evaluation</b>	<b>1</b>
Ghana: Country Programme Evaluation	1
Rwanda: Country Programme Evaluation	4
Viet Nam: Country Programme Evaluation	8
Yemen: Country Programme Evaluation	11
<b>B. Interim Evaluation</b>	<b>15</b>
Brazil Interim Evaluation: Sustainable Development Project for Agrarian Reform Settlements in the Semi-Arid North East	15
Ghana Interim Evaluation: Rural Enterprises Project, Phase II	17
Tanzania Interim Evaluation: Rural Financial Services Programme and Agricultural Marketing Systems Development Programme	20
<b>C. Corporate Level Evaluation</b>	<b>24</b>
Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment	24

## Abbreviations and acronyms

ACP	Agreement at Completion Point
AfDB	African Development Bank
AGRA	Alliance for a Green Revolution in Africa
Al Amal MFB	Al-Amal Microfinance Bank
AMSDP	Agricultural Marketing Systems Development Programme
AMSDP	Agricultural Marketing Systems Development Programme
APR	Asia and the Pacific Division
ASAP	Adaptation for Smallholders Agriculture Programme
AWPB	Annual Work Programme and Budget
BAC	Business Advisory Centre
CCI	Community Innovation Centres (s)
CIDA	Canadian International Development Agency
COM	Information and Communications Technology Division
COSOP	Country Strategic Opportunities Paper
CPE	Country Programme Evaluation
CRMP	Al Dhala Community Resources Management Project
DANIDA	Danish International Development Association
DHCP-II	Dom Helder Camara Project-II
DSF	Debt Sustainability Framework

EB	Executive Board
ECD	Environment and Climate Division
EOP	Economic Opportunities Programme
ESA	East and Southern Africa Division
FAO/TCI	FAO Investment Centre Division
FIP	Fisheries Investment Project
GFP	Gender Focal Point
GIZ	German International Development Cooperation
GRGP	Ghana Rural Growth Programme
HRD	Human Resources Division
ICO	IFAD Country Office
IFDC	International Fertilizer Development Center
IFPRI	International Food Policy Research Institute
KWAMP	Kirehe Community-based Watershed Management Project
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation
MDA	Ministry of Rural Development ( <i>Ministère du développement agricole</i> )
MIVARF	Marketing Infrastructure, Value Addition & Rural Finance Support Programme
MOF	Ministry of Finance
MOPIC	Ministry of Planning and International Cooperation
MOSEDP	methodologies for market based socio economic planning (
MOU	Memorandum of Understanding
MSE	Micro and small enterprise
NBSSI	National Board for Small Scale Industries
NRGP	Northern Rural Growth Programme
NRGP	Northern Rural Growth Programme
PAPSTA	Support Project for the Strategic Plan for the Transformation of Agriculture
PASP	Post-harvest Agribusiness Support Project
PCR	Project Completion Report
PCT	Programme Coordination Team
PMD	Programme Management Department
PMU	Project Management Unit
PPP	Public Private Partnerships
PPPMER II	Rural Small and Microenterprise Promotion Project - Phase II
PRDP	Participatory Rural Development Project
PRICE	Project for Rural Income through Exports
PRM	Resource Mobilization and Partnership Office
PRONAF	National Programme for the Strengthening of Family Agriculture
PSR	Project Status Report
PTA	IFAD Technical Division
QA	Quality Assurance
REP III	Rural Enterprises Project -III
RFSP	Rural Finance Support Project
RFSP	Rural Financial Services Programme
RTF	Rural Technology Facility
RTIMP	Roots and Tubers Improvement Programme
SACCOS	Savings and Credit Cooperatives
SARI	Savanna Agricultural Research Institute
SCCULT	Savings and Credit Cooperative Union League of Tanzania
SKM	Strategy and Knowledge. Management Department
TAMFI	Tanzania Association of Microfinance Institutions
TG-G	Thematic Group on Gender
WCA	West and Central Africa Division
WMP	Watershed Management Planning
YI-REP	YemenInvest Rural Employment Programme

## Categories used for the classification of agreement at completion point agreed actions

CE	completion evaluation
CLE	corporate level evaluation
CPE	country programme evaluation

SN	serial number
----	---------------

### Level

IFAD	IFAD corporate level
REG	IFAD regional level
CTRY	IFAD country level
GOV	government authorities (national, local level and institutions)
PROJ	project

### Nature

PLCY	policy
STR	strategy development, including COSOPs and projects
OPER	operational and implementation

### Themes

ASR	analysis, studies and researches
BEN	beneficiaries and stakeholders' participation and consultation
COS	Country Strategic Opportunities Programme (COSOP)
DEC	decentralization
DES	project design
DIA	policy dialogue
FLD	field presence
GDR	gender (including targeting to women)
GOV	governance
HR	human resources (management, recruitment)
INF	infrastructure (construction, contracting, management, supervision)
INN	innovation
KM	knowledge management
NRM	natural resource management
ORG	organizations, groups, institutions and collective approaches
PAR	partnership
PRM	private sector, market and enterprise development
PMA	project management and administration
RFI	rural finance
RME	results monitoring, evaluation
SCA	replication and scaling up
STRA	strategy
SUP	supervision
SUS	sustainability
TCB	training, capacity-building
TGT	targeting

# Agreement at completion point recommendations and follow-up action taken by the Programme Management Department

## A. Country Programme Evaluation

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
<b>Ghana: Country Programme Evaluation</b>							
Ghana	CPE	1	CTRY	STR	COS	As part of COSOP preparation, IFAD should commission specific studies, action-research or "intelligence-gathering" work to support major strategic decisions and changes.	As agreed in the ACP, RAFiP (the Rural and Agricultural Finance Programme) has mapped and analysed three major value chains supported by IFAD, providing private operators, particularly financial institutions, with vital financial information to assess the profitability and risks for investment at the various steps in the value chains. At the strategic level, the new COSOP emphasises improved M&E and learning, knowledge management and partnership with research institutions to strengthen the evidence base for decision making in programme design and implementation.
Ghana	CPE	2	CTRY	OPER	COS	A priority for the forthcoming COSOP should be to analyse value chain gaps and scout for successful private-public partnership experience, in the region or elsewhere, in subsectors relevant to IFAD.	The mapping and financial overlay is being carried out (see above). The survey is covering three value chains (VCs), i.e. maize, cassava and soya. In the design of the Ghana Rural Growth Programme, arrangements have been made with PTA and PRM to provide technical support for PPP (private-public partnership) development, building on successful experience elsewhere. Further, partnerships are being formed with GIZ and DANIDA to build on their specific strengths in working with the private sector. In addition, appropriate external expertise has been mobilized for design and implementation support.
Ghana	CPE	3	PROJ	OPER	DES	At the project design level, similar work (specific studies, action-research or "intelligence-gathering") should help fill knowledge gaps and investigate areas of risk.	This is ongoing under the design of the Ghana Rural Growth Programme (see studies mentioned above which are being carried out and will contribute to the design of subsequent projects), which is to be presented to the EB in April 2014.
Ghana	CPE	4	CTRY	OPER	RME	Systematic data collection and analysis is needed to assess the impact of projects and programmes, including quantitative data on income and food security.	NRGP (the Northern Rural Growth Programme) has started to collect and analyse income related data on the basis of a small sample. The M&E guidelines of NRGF are being revised to ensure systematic collection and analysis of such data. Baseline surveys have been completed for RAFiP and NRGF, while the survey for REP (Rural Enterprises Programme) is still ongoing. The ICO (IFAD Country Office) is building a monitoring system that will allow cross referencing secondary sources (i.e. the Ghana 2012 Comprehensive Food Security and Vulnerability Analysis and IFPRI's baseline study on agriculture, poverty and market access) with data generated by the implementing agency.

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
Ghana	CPE	5	CTRY	OPER	ASR	In this context, partnerships should be forged with international subject matter specialists and Ghana-based (national and international) social science research institutes, and to a far greater extent than observed to date.	IFPRI (the International Food Policy Research Institute) submitted a baseline study on agriculture, rural poverty and market access in Northern Ghana in January 2013 (see above). During COSOP implementation, the IFPRI-IFAD partnership will be sought to be continued, and attention will be given to identifying partnership opportunities with Ghanaian and international research institutions.
Ghana	CPE	6	CTRY	STR	TGT	IFAD should combine countrywide programmes with specific interventions focusing on the north of the country, particularly the Upper West region, and further cooperate with relevant Government initiatives (e.g. Savannah Accelerated Development Initiative). Synergies between geographically-targeted interventions and countrywide programmes will need to be clearly specified.	The Ghana Rural Growth Programme will combine the Government's scaling up, mainstreaming and enhanced efficiency objectives, while specific investments under the programme will be focused on the North and other poverty pockets in the country. In this context, public private partnerships are being facilitated by IFAD and the ongoing NRGF to provide farmers in the poor North with access to larger commodity markets in the South, which serves as an entry point for enhanced private and public investment. The 2012 Comprehensive Food Security and Vulnerability Analysis prepared by WFP indicate that the Upper East region is showing the highest incidence of food insecurity and vulnerability. IFAD is committed to continue its ongoing dialogue with the Government of Ghana to ensure allocation of its resources and investments to those districts where they can achieve the highest level of results.
Ghana	CPE	7	CTRY	STR	INF	IFAD should concentrate on devising an intervention model suitable for the Upper West region. The model should concentrate on (i) transportation infrastructure	The Ghana Rural Growth design is taking this recommendation into consideration. Discussions are ongoing with GoG and AfDB to mobilize adequate cofinancing for infrastructure investments in the Upper West Region.
Ghana	CPE	8	CTRY	STR	NRM	(ii) water management and irrigation (river gardens, water pumping, small dams where feasible)	The Ghana Rural Growth design is taking this recommendation into consideration. Discussions are ongoing with GoG and AfDB to mobilize adequate cofinancing for infrastructure investments in the Upper West Region, including on the theme of water management and irrigation highlighted in the evaluation.
Ghana	CPE	9	CTRY	STR	TGT	(iii) strengthening existing value chains more suitable for the poor (e.g. tuber cultivation, higher humidity crops, tree crops, small livestock such as guinea fowl, small ruminants).	The Ghana Rural Growth design is taking this recommendation into consideration. Discussions are ongoing with GoG and AfDB to mobilize adequate cofinancing for investments in this regard in the Upper West Region, including on value chains, as highlighted in the evaluation.
Ghana	CPE	10	CTRY	STR	SCA	IFAD should seek greater support from other donors, the private sector and the Government as well as from other similar initiatives in the region for the scaling up of its most successful innovations.	ICO Ghana is and will be looking extensively for partners to join the GRGP framework, including the AfDB, CIDA, GIZ, DANIDA, FAO. As deputy lead of the development partners in the agricultural sector, the Ghana CPM has initiated the idea of joint DP (development partners) /GoG field visits. One first visit that was organized by CIDA has facilitated learning and information sharing, as a basis for better harmonization, collaboration and learning. Further, IFAD has proposed the creation of an operations group for joint analyses, knowledge exchange, harmonization and coordination. Key

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
							models/strengths associated with IFAD's intervention include access to finance, access to markets and private sector development/value chain linkages for poor farmers.
Ghana	CPE	11	CTRY	STR	SCA	In developing or introducing new initiatives (for scaling up), IFAD and its partners should adopt a more cautious approach based on pilot testing, particularly for approaches new to Ghana.	The Ghana Rural Growth Programme adopts a deliberate programme approach to embed a systematic approach to scaling up, based on implementation of activities (including pilot activities for new initiatives), evaluation and learning, modification/adaptation, and further planning for scaling up.
Ghana	CPE	12	CTRY	OPER	RFI	One priority area is: Matching grants in rural finance which have important potential for policy dialogue on support to micro and small businesses without distorting the market.	Steps have been initiated in this regard. A joint study with PTA and FAO/TCI on MGs is being carried out during 2013 to better understand the impact and effects of this instrument based on the pilot activities carried out since 2008.
Ghana	CPE	13	CTRY	OPER	RFI	IFAD and its partners should consider a joint review of the experience with matching grant across IFAD's portfolio as well as of RAFIP implementation experience in order to better devise non-distortionary tools to foster agricultural financing; special savings and credit financial products that appeal to the poor, such as "susu" collection and group lending and may help improve the coverage of very poor categories.	A joint study with PTA and FAO/TCI on MGs will be carried out during 2013 to better understand the impact and effects of this instrument based on the pilot activities carried out since 2008. NRGPs promotion of cashless credit to Farmer Based Organizations will be continued, while RAFIP will continue to support Rural Financial Institutions to enhance their efficiency and outreach. Financial inclusion has been included as a key performance indicator for the programme.
Ghana	CPE	14	CTRY	OPER	SCA	The promotion of the concept of farmers' field fora to support pro-poor technology transfer in agriculture is another promising innovation which, however, requires further refining.	The design of GRGP has involved FAO to support implementation of the farmers' field fora (FFF).
Ghana	CPE	15	CTRY	OPER	PRM	IFAD and its partners should first review successful experiences in the Africa region with a view to developing pro-poor value chains and engaging with private-sector operators.	PTA and PRM have been mobilized to contribute to the design of GRGP with focus on PPPs, as a key mechanism to transfer knowledge from other countries to enrich the Ghana programme.
Ghana	CPE	16	CTRY	OPER	PRM	Successful approaches could then be piloted in Ghana, using grants if necessary, so as to garner real-world knowledge and resources from successful private entrepreneurs.	Ghana has a yellow DSF status, thus it cannot receive stand-alone country grants. However, the mechanism proposed by GRGP is in line with the recommendation.
Ghana	CPE	17	CTRY	OPER	PAR	IFAD should also explore opportunities for collaborating with AGRA, which, although not a private operator, is implementing an integrated programme of seed distribution, soil conservation, education and extension, and market access (encompassing value-chain activities) in Ghana, with a substantial private-sector cooperation element.	Partnership opportunities with AGRA (Alliance for a Green Revolution in Africa) have been explored in October 2010 through a joint field visit with IFAD, AGRA and NRGPs. As a follow-up, NRGPs has started to develop joint activities with AGRA's implementing agencies, i.e. the International Fertilizer Development Center (IFDC) and the Savanna Agricultural Research Institute (SARI). The 2012 AWPB includes the collaboration with the "Farmer-To Market Project", the "E-Platform" and joint siting of warehouses with IFDC. Also, NRGPs is linking the beneficiaries of SARI's "Integrated Soil Fertility Management Programme" to extension services and participating financial institutions to allow them access important complementary services and support.

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
Ghana	CPE	18	CTRY	STR	NRM	An environmental assessment should form part of the COSOP, even before the subject is dealt with at the project design stage.	Based on general recommendations in the COSOP, a detailed environmental assessment with specific attention to CC adaptation has been incorporated in the ASAP design in March 2013.
Ghana	CPE	19	CTRY	OPER	NRM	Such an environmental assessment should also deal with areas of potential negative impact, such as polluting effluents from cassava processing and chemical processing of small enterprises, soil erosion, and water-borne disease in the case of irrigation.	This has been mainstreamed into the design of the next ASAP project (the environmental assessment will also deal with potential areas of negative impact, including pollutants from processing and their impact on natural resources).
Ghana	CPE	20	CTRY	STR	FLD	IFAD should take the country office and CPM outpost opportunity to further support its country programme, including non-lending activities.	The day-to-day contact and follow up with programmes has increased. Supervision/implementation support missions are carried out twice a year and CPMT meetings are held. Furthermore, the PMUs visit the IFAD office when in Accra. Programme partnerships are supported by frequent contact with other DPs and implementing agencies.
Ghana	CPE	21	CTRY	STR	KM	In terms of knowledge management, it should further mobilize expertise and analytical resources from within Ghana and the region as a whole, both for COSOP preparation and project design.	Within the context of limited resources, the ICO is building these contacts over time as and when opportunities emerge. This includes expertise mobilised for the activities, and expertise that are based in the country and are in regular touch with the ICO.
Ghana	CPE	22	CTRY	STR	DIA	Country presence should also contribute to policy dialogue and partnerships building.	IFAD is one most active Development Partners in the Agricultural sector. Since August 2012 the deputy DP lead of the Agricultural Sector Working Group and from approx. June 2013, IFAD will become the DP lead. Furthermore, IFAD is participating in UN committee work, the M&E Sector Working Group, and ad hoc policy meetings and workshops. IFAD presence in country has contributed to intense engagement with partner country in policy dialogue.
Ghana	CPE	23	CTRY	STR	RME	IFAD will need to take advantage of its country presence to support the assessment of results, notably impact, at the project level and make a systematic review of the programme as a whole.	The GRGP design highlights the new opportunities for a more programmatic engagement thanks to country presence, and its triennial programme management cycle provides a system that links detailed performance reviews to the commitment and design of supplementary financing for scaling up.
<b>Rwanda: Country Programme Evaluation</b>							
Rwanda	CPE	1	CTRY	STR	SCA	Provide institutional support to local government for the scaling up of agricultural innovations and pave the way to SWAp preparation	As the agricultural sector is gradually moving towards SWAp implementation and financing modalities, IFAD is also committed to moving towards more strategic programme management and increasing reliance on national systems in line with the Paris declaration. Institutional support is being provided to local government to disseminate innovations within the Ministry institutions and partners.
Rwanda	CPE	2	CTRY	STR	SCA	Provide programme-based support to participate in harmonized frameworks in rural finance and cooperative development (This calls for a gradual shift from project focus towards more attention on the systematization of lessons learned both	Under the second pillar of the 2013-2018 COSOP, IFAD intends to support ongoing policy development on the rural and agriculture financial services strategy and the other initiatives related to the legal environment for the warehouse receipt system, leasing policy, agriculture insurance, and the



Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
						from within and outside the IFAD portfolio. It also calls for further dialogue and harmonization with development partners and for sharing knowledge, experiences and values in the policy arena.)	microfinance strategy. Regarding cooperative development interventions, IFAD will also seek to have a more harmonized approach.
Rwanda	CPE	3	CTRY	STR	SCA	In order to scale up innovations from earlier projects, the long-term challenge is of an institutional nature. As decentralization proceeds into its third phase (2011-2015) and district and sector administrations/governments further develop their capacity, it may be possible to transfer full responsibility for implementation to local governments. IFAD, in collaboration with the central and local governments and other developing partners, should support the development and systematization of approaches and guidance tools that help local governments plan implement and monitor the various technical interventions.	KWAMP continues to strengthen the role of the Kirehe district in project planning, implementation and watershed management planning. Innovations are documented and shared at local level and with other institutions within the Ministry of Agriculture. In its new COSOP, this kind of intervention will continue to be supported mainly through its first pillar focusing on "Integrated watershed management, marshland and hillside irrigation and agricultural-livestock intensification".
Rwanda	CPE	4	GOV	STR	SCA	These approaches and tools may create the basis for central government grants to local governments for watershed development, which could be one of the important pillars of the agricultural SWAp.	This recommendation is being implemented in KWAMP and will receive further support in the first pillar of the new COSOP, with cofinancing opportunities to be pursued with the European Union and other development partners.
Rwanda	CPE	5	CTRY	STR	SCA	IFAD will explore opportunities for integrating its interventions in the forthcoming SWAp in order to ensure its participation in major strategic and policy dialogue initiatives in the agriculture and rural development sector. IFAD's participation in the SWAp may also include the development of implementation tools and methodologies that ensures ownership by local governments in up-scaling innovations.	The 2013-2018 COSOP plans an increased IFAD participation in major strategic and policy dialogue initiatives in the agriculture and rural development sector. Scaling up of innovative and successful pilots will strongly be pursued in its second financing cycle of the COSOP. More specifically, the development of concept notes on soil and water conservation and Community Innovation Centres (CCIs) has been completed and the one for Watershed Management Planning (WMP) is ongoing.
Rwanda	CPE	6	CTRY	OPER	DIA	Through a modest financial contribution to harmonized thematic programmes, IFAD could establish its presence in high-level policy dialogue and share its experiences.	This is being explored in the new COSOP and in the formulation of the new project PASP (Post-harvest Agribusiness Support Project). Specific areas of intervention for policy dialogue are being identified.
Rwanda	CPE	7	CTRY	OPER	RFI	In rural finance, explore the option for support to Access to Finance Rwanda (AFR). Even a modest financial participation from IFAD would be important because it would allow IFAD to contribute to the agenda and work, based on its own experience in implementing the portfolio and, at the same time, benefit from exchanges of information. (IFAD's contribution to AFR should be based on an assessment of whether this facility provides an effective contribution to rural poverty reduction objectives.)	With the formulation of PASP and the new COSOP, emphasis will be given to a harmonized approach that builds on IFAD lessons learnt in rural finance and supports policy development on the rural and agriculture financial services strategy. Collaboration with Access to Finance Rwanda (AFR) will also be explored. The potential areas of engagement include initiatives related to the legal environment for the warehouse receipt system, leasing policy, agriculture insurance, and the microfinance strategy. Collaboration with AFR will definitely be driven by its positioning in the country, including its effectiveness in increasing access to finance.

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
Rwanda	CPE	8	CTRY	STR	PAR	Regarding cooperative development, IFAD should contribute to efforts to develop a harmonized support framework. The Rwanda Cooperative Agency reports that it is planning to harmonize the current highly fragmented support for cooperative development; it would be appropriate for IFAD to support this endeavour. If the initiative leads to a harmonized framework with financial support from government and several development partners, IFAD should explore the possibility of making a financial contribution so as to become an active participant	Support to cooperative development as well as rural finance will follow a more harmonized approach under its new COSOP and the new project PASP.
Rwanda	CPE	9	CTRY	STR	PMA	IFAD/Government project cooperation should rely more on the Government's accountability and implementation systems, recognized as among the best and most efficient in sub-Saharan Africa. IFAD should move away from micro management, leaving this to government systems, while adopting a more strategic management approach.	IFAD reliance on country systems continues and implementation arrangements for existing and new projects are integrated within the Single project implementation unit (SPIU), thus avoiding the creation of parallel implementation structures.
Rwanda	CPE	10	CTRY	STR	PAR	In this new role, IFAD would use more of its country programme management resources for addressing strategic issues both within and above projects. This should also include more strategic use of technical assistance grants, not only for project design but also for developing the capacity of institutions so that national institutions can take over activities once the projects end.	Implementation support missions are undertaken periodically to address strategic issues in projects. For example in PRICE, IFAD and the Government of Rwanda has commissioned a feasibility study that will inform on the approach to be used for coffee and tea development through a credit scheme that is not putting the livelihoods of farmers at risk.
Rwanda	CPE	11	CTRY	STR	PMA	IFAD's projects should include the provision of technical assistance/facilitation support, not as decision-making managers but as advisers and facilitators, to the implementing management units - whether at the central ministry level or within district administrations.	Ongoing and new IFAD projects have interventions aimed at strengthening the capacity of national bodies and implementing partners in the coordination/implementation of project activities This includes implementing management units at both the central and district levels.
Rwanda	CPE	12	REG	OPER	FLD	A clearer division of labour between the offices (IFAD HQ, regional, country office) would imply giving a more substantive role to the country office in partnership-building, policy dialogue and knowledge management. In this context, consideration should also be given to defining the technical backstopping functions of the Nairobi office, which, for example, could include quality assurance of baseline and impact surveys.	The country office is fully involved in design and implementation/supervision missions. The Regional office is also been used for technical backstopping in areas such as land tenure and environmental issues.
Rwanda	CPE	13	CTRY	OPER	SUP	Transaction costs for IFAD, the concerned Ministries and the development partners can be reduced by having more joint supervision and implementation support missions. When feasible,	Joint supervision mission were conducted in PAPSTA (with DFID) and PPPMER II (with UNIDO). This will be further explored in the new COSOP as more partnership/cofinancing opportunities are foreseen. Thematic supervisions will also be

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
						it should be considered to field a single mission covering several projects executed by the same Ministry.	explored.
Rwanda	CPE	14	CTRY	STR	NRM	IFAD's future programme should continue its watershed development initiatives, including the promotion and scaling up of agricultural innovations and soil and watershed protection.	Watershed development remains a key priority in the new COSOP under its pillar 1 focusing on "Integrated watershed management, marshland and hillside irrigation and agricultural-livestock intensification". Scaling-up of innovations is also explored in the COSOP.
Rwanda	CPE	15	CTRY	STR	NRM	IFAD should better assess and document environmental risks as well as opportunities. The next COSOP should include a strategic analysis of environmental and natural resource management issues, in line with the requirements of IFAD's Environment and Natural Resource Management Policy, and explore opportunities for qualifying for carbon financing. Future project designs should include environmental and social impact assessments.	Environment and natural resource management is a key focus in the new COSOP. Natural resource management is part of the pillar 1 and environmental issues are addressed using the Adaptation for Smallholders Agriculture Programme (ASAP) funds. A USD 7 million grant will assist the new project (PASP) increase the climate resilience of value chains and reduce the impact of climate change on productivity and profitability of the smallholders farming system through the promotion of adaptation policies, techniques and technologies. Opportunities for carbon financing are being explored under KWAMP.
Rwanda	CPE	16	CTRY	STR	PRM	IFAD should consider moving towards higher-value commodities produced in intensive systems with a high labour input, and with potential for creating significant non-farm employment in processing and marketing enterprises. Based on current intensive zero-grazing systems, dairy would be an obvious candidate - but other candidates may include high-value horticultural products.	Under the new project (PASP), IFAD will contribute to meet government targets towards the growth of the off-farm rural sector building on the experience of the two phases of PPPMER by promoting the development of small-scale and microenterprises (e.g. for storage and food processing) linked with the targeted value chains. The horticulture value chain is also supported under PRICE.
Rwanda	CPE	17	CTRY	STR	PRM	Support a pro-poor development of export and cash crops and products through private-public partnerships (For tea and coffee, there are still a number of unexploited value addition activities. Albeit currently in a difficult start-up phase, sericulture could well create many on- and off-farm jobs in activities that are highly labour-intensive and with products of high value to weight.)	Under PRICE public-private partnerships are being developed in the tea sector by supporting tea cooperatives to acquire 30-40% equity shares in the shareholding of tea factories to be established on greenfield sites. The project also has a sericulture development component.
Rwanda	CPE	18	CTRY	STR	TGT	Special mitigating measures (e.g. based on support to subsistence crops or food-for-work schemes) need to be considered for very poor households.	In the new COSOP, vulnerable groups will be a key focus through pillar 3 focusing on "Nutrition and social and economic inclusion of most vulnerable populations". Food-for-work (in KWAMP) and income-generating activities such as the construction/rehabilitation of rural feeder roads (in PRICE) will mainly target the very poor.
Rwanda	CPE	19	CTRY	STR	PRM	In pursuing public-private partnerships, support will be needed to promote transparent agreements and competition in order to address situations whereby a large private investor, owing to limited competition, might exploit producers.	Building on its previous experience with PPP in PDCRE (Smallholder Cash and Export Crops Development Project), IFAD has replicated this model in PRICE by ensuring a more transparent and equitable partnership with the private sector. Specifically, PRICE is supporting tea cooperatives to

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
						Consideration will need to be given to the complexity and scale of operations. For certain levels of scale and complexity, private companies may be in a better position than the newly-established cooperatives. Thus, an approach for private- sector development, including development of public-private partnerships, should be developed to guide such support.	acquire up to 30-40% of equity shares in the shareholding of factories to be built on the four greenfield sites that have been allocated to private investors.
<b>Viet Nam: Country Programme Evaluation</b>							
Vietnam	CPE	1	CTRY	STR	PRM	The CPE recommends that the approach of value chains be strengthened in the next COSOP. However, because the value chain approach is still relatively new and unknown in many of the areas covered by IFAD- funded operations, a thorough analysis of selected value chains (e.g. rice and coffee) will be needed before new small-scale agriculture interventions are designed for rural areas.	Support for the value chain approach is a prominent feature of the 2012-2017 COSOP for Vietnam. This is particular related to Strategic Objective 1 (SO1) "Enable poor rural provinces to carry out market led pro poor development as well as SO2" Improve access of poor rural people – particularly women – to commodity and labour markets. In the provinces where IFAD supported projects are operating, studies of value chains for coffee, pepper, rice, livestock production and peanuts have been carried out in 2012 prior to the commencement of investment activities.
Vietnam	CPE	2	CTRY	STR	TGT	Ways and means of bringing ethnic minorities into the development process, at different stages of the value chain, will also need to be explored.	In the 2012-2017 COSOP it is noted that key activities such as the aim to increase the agricultural productivity and competitiveness of, primarily, female smallholders; enhance opportunities for market entry and improve the livelihoods of female farmers; and diversify livelihood opportunities for both male and female unskilled and waged workers towards off-farm activities. Activities will particularly aim at facilitating greater participation of and benefit flow to ethnic minority groups taking full advantage of their traditional knowledge, culture, governance systems and natural resources. To further cater for the inclusion of ethnic minorities, the on-going design of the new project in Ha Tinh and Quang Binh provinces (Sustainable Rural Development for the Poor, SRDP) is adopting a gradual approach for market integration for these groups with an initial emphasis on livelihood improvement as well as vocational training.
Vietnam	CPE	3	CTRY	STR	PRM	Moreover, given the somewhat limited investments in business development services and limited partnerships with the small- and medium-scale private sector, the CPE recommends that IFAD and the Government encourage the strategic engagement of the private sector in supporting this building block in the next COSOP.	Following the CPE and the subsequent COSOP a range of instruments for private sector engagement are being developed such as the Agribusiness Promotion Investment Fund (APIF). APIF makes strategic investments in medium sized agro-enterprises with documented backward linkages. Once fully tested the APIF concept can be up scaled to the national level in cooperation with the Vietnam Business Challenge Fund funded by DFID. On the policy side the COSOP notes that for Public Private Partnerships (PPP), IFAD support would be provided for public-private dialogue platforms and initiatives in scaling up models of PPP. Specifically IFAD is a member of the PPP working group

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
							within the Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development and assisting in developing a framework the concept. The ICO (IFAD Country Office) has also initiated a collaboration with Nestle and MARS for the development of the value chains for coffee and cocoa with smallholders. The contract farming arrangements being pioneered represent a model that could be up-scaled on a national basis.
Vietnam	CPE	4	CTRY	STR	TGT	The CPE recommends that the Government and IFAD should move towards a model that combines, for example, three to five contiguous provinces as part of a single IFAD-funded operation when possible.	For the two new designs of the two new investments in Ha Thing/Quang Bing and in the Mekong only adjacent provinces are included in the projects. This will improve efficiencies in terms of reduced supervision costs, inter-provincial thematic studies, audit and joint utilization of technical assistance.
Vietnam	CPE	5	CTRY	STR	RFI	Microfinance and the role of the banking system are features of the current programme that will need to be strengthened to support the market integration approach. Current solutions mainly involve funding subsistence-level production. Overall, the programme has had a very limited impact on bank operations and lending policies for supporting farmers and the rural poor. The CPE recommends that IFAD should make every effort to address this major gap in rural finance in any future policy dialogue with the Government.	Following the CPE and the COSOP, the ICO has undertaken an assessment of IFAD's support to rural finance for the past decade with the aim of defining the way for the Fund's support in this area. This exercise was completed in December 2012. As a result a new subsidiary loan agreement model and a manual have been developed for working with banks. These new instruments, which are currently being adapted by existing programmes, will ensure an improved linkage of bank lending to the intended target groups and actors in value chains. Instead of working with new credit lines for banks IFAD is seeking to put in place arrangements for leveraging existing larger credit lines most notably financed by the World Bank. Concerning Saving and Credit Groups (SCFs), which have been very successful instruments for poverty reduction in IFAD programmes, the Fund will work in cooperation with Agence Française Development (ADF) and other donors to develop a sustainable financial and institutional framework for these entities. This work which is being pioneered in the two projects currently being designed aims at transforming SCF into microfinance institutions which can be supervised by the central bank.
Vietnam	CPE	6	CTRY	STR	KM	With regard to the next COSOP, IFAD will need to concentrate on its non-lending activities and grant capacity in order to fill specific knowledge gaps, such as the need for a holistic approach to the development of ethnic minorities in upland areas, better understanding of youth migration and opportunities for rural youth, etc.	In the 2012-2017 COSOP, is noted that IFAD will use its grants to fill in specific knowledge gaps, which include a holistic approach to the development of ethnic minorities in upland areas, better understanding of youth migration and opportunities for rural youth, public-private partnerships and pro-poor value chains analysis, climate change adaptation research and capacity building, payments for environmental services. National research institutions are currently working on knowledge products related to public-private partnerships. The project supported by IFAD in the Dak Nong province is developing an approach for working with ethnic minorities in a more holistic manner. The other initiatives stipulated in the COSOP will be launched in the coming two to three years.

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
Vietnam	CPE	7	CTRY	STR	RME	The CPE also recommends that knowledge-sharing be strengthened by establishing a standardized, countrywide M&E system, which would make it possible to follow up progress in implementing the results-based COSOP and fine-tune the evolving country strategy.	The ICO has completed a comprehensive manual for M&E in early 2013. This document will be used by all on-going and future projects as well as for COSOP monitoring. The manual has a standardised results framework, which will ease aggregation of country programme impact. Furthermore the manual could be adapted for use by other country programmes in the region.
Vietnam	CPE	8	CTRY	STR	PAR	It is recommended that IFAD should continue to participate in the One UN Initiative, albeit in a selective manner, with regard to agenda items commensurate with its resources and comparative advantage.	To the extent possible the ICO participates in the One UN initiative when relevant. If the working group for the improvement of the livelihood for ethnic minorities is re-established the ICO will seek to participate.
Vietnam	CPE	9	CTRY	STR	PAR	It is recommended that, during formulation of the next COSOP, IFAD should reach agreement with the Government on increased levels of counterpart funding, especially in view of the country's middle-income country status and numbers of poor rural people. The COSOP might also include broad criteria for determining the proportion of such counterpart funding (e.g. minimum percentage of total projects costs) in future IFAD-supported projects in Viet Nam	Increased counterpart funding is being contemplated in on-going designs however these efforts are to some extent made difficult due to the declining growth of the Vietnamese economy for the past three years with the resulting budgetary constraints.
Vietnam	CPE	10	CTRY	STR	NRM	IFAD should scale up its involvement in issues relating to the environment, natural resources management and climate change. While it is true that other donors are heavily engaged in these areas, IFAD is in a unique position to explore the impact of potential environmental damage and the effects of climate change on the rural poor. It is also well placed to introduce measures against erosion or salt water intrusion or in support of forest cover rehabilitation. This should be an important feature of the next COSOP and, possibly, one of the key pillars of IFAD's future engagement in Viet Nam.	As recommended by the CPE the third strategic thrust in the 2012-2017 COSOP is: "Enhance the capacity of poor rural households' to adapt to climate change" Currently this thrust is being rolled out in the two on-going designs in terms of the introduction of an innovative matching grant facility for climate change adaption and disaster mitigation in upland areas. For the Mekong Delta project, ASAP funds have been mobilized to develop measures to combat the effects of salt water intrusion and the introduction of climate smart agricultural practices. Cooperation with other partners such as JICA and GIZ has been established to exchange knowledge on approaches on climate change adaption in the Mekong. Allocation of grant funding for the Ministry of agriculture and Rural Development (MARD) for policy development in climate change adaption is planned under ASAP.
Vietnam	CPE	11	CTRY	STR	FLD	The CPE believes that IFAD's country office in Viet Nam has made an important contribution to the overall success of its country programme. The establishment of a country office with sufficient capacity to support project preparation, implementation and supervision has been broadly successful and should be maintained.	The ICO in Vietnam will be maintained. In 2012 efficiency measures in terms of decentralization of loan and grant administration to the ICO were introduced thus successfully reducing the time for processing of withdrawal applications. Other efficiency measures include a decentralized ICO internet based budget management system used for all local expenditures including local consultants. A number of procedures adopted by the Vietnam ICO serve as a model for other IFAD country offices.

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
Vietnam	CPE	12	CTRY	STR	DIA	Looking forward, policy dialogue at the central level and the scaling up of successful innovations will need to be more systematic, anchored in IFAD's operational field experience, and in line with the structures and processes of the Hanoi Core Statement.	The scaling up agenda for the Vietnam country programme currently include frameworks for sustainable Saving and Credit Groups, methodologies for market based socio economic planning (MOSEDP) at the commune and district level (MOSEDP) and the introduction of measures for climate smart agricultural practices once tested. In its efforts to upscale the MOSEDP process to the national level the central Government is using the experience gained in the provinces supported by IFAD.
Vietnam	CPE	13	CTRY	STR	FLD	IFAD will need to provide its country office with clear guidelines on prioritizing this agenda, in line with IFAD's new business model and an enabling work environment, i.e. appropriate human and financial resources.	Under the new management in APR procedures are being developed to optimize and improve the working conditions for ICOs in the region including the office in Vietnam.
<b>Yemen: Country Programme Evaluation</b>							
Yemen	CPE	1	CTRY	STR	ORG	IFAD should continue to support social mobilization in the country's rural areas and strengthen the social and economic institutions of the poor to plan and manage their own development.	IFAD has been explicitly supporting social mobilisation, and strengthening the social and economic institutions of the poor, in Yemen's rural areas since 2005. Participatory community organisations constitute the foundation for IFAD investments under the Dhamar PRDP (operational since 2005) and Al Dhala CRMP (operational since 2008). The country programme has also started investing in the creation of commodity-based producers' associations, complementary to CBOs, in order to empower poor rural women and men within profitable value chains. These include agricultural producers' associations under the EOP (EB approval Dec. 2009) and fisheries organisations under the FIP (EB approval Dec. 2010).
Yemen	CPE	2	CTRY	STR	PRM	The next COSOP will need to emphasize the expected economic orientations of interventions and support the creation of economic opportunities for the rural poor.	The new country programme, developed under the 2010-2012 PBAS cycle, focused precisely on the creation of sustainable and diversified economic opportunities for poor rural women and men. This is reflected in the goals, objectives and component of all three projects designed within the cycle, namely the EOP, FIP, and YI-REP. This is already mainstreamed in the country programme and will be reflected in the next COSOP.
Yemen	CPE	3	CTRY	STR	TGT	The CPE also recommends that more attention be paid to gender and youth as cross-cutting themes of the next country strategy.	Gender mainstreaming and targeting of youth constitute integral pillars of the country programme since 2005 as reflected in the Dhamar PRDP, Al Dhala CRMP, EOP, FIP and YI-REP. Of the cumulative beneficiaries of the active portfolio, some 75% consist of youth and some 50% of women.
Yemen	CPE	4	CTRY	STR	GDR	As women's seriously disadvantaged position remains a key challenge to the country's human development, IFAD should accord priority to promoting gender equity and women's empowerment across its entire Yemen portfolio, particularly with regard to addressing constraints	All community based organisations supported under the country programme have equal representation of women members. All savings and credit groups are entirely composed of women, strengthening access to savings services and microfinance. Training and capacity building activities are equally accessed by women. Key leadership

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
						to women's access to capital, land, knowledge and technologies, and strengthening their role in decision making. The Fund should continue to deploy women staff; strengthen project management's commitment to gender issues; ensure adequate levels of funding for gender-specific activities.	positions under the country programme, such as the CPO and the first Executive Director of the Economic Opportunities Fund, which is managing the entire new country programme, are woman. The country programme is further promoting the ILO's decent work agenda which incorporates specific provisions for equal treatment of women employees, most recently under the YI-REP.
Yemen	CPE	5	CTRY	STR	TGT	The Fund should place greater emphasis on youth programmes (e.g. vocational training, access to microcredit, and support to microenterprises) as a way of tackling high youth unemployment.	The entire new country programme focuses on promoting sustainable rural economic growth and employment creation. Instruments include the full range of financial services (equity, venture capital, debt financing, microfinance, and insurance) for MSMEs the expansion of which creates sustainable employment opportunities for poor rural women and men. In addition to vocational training, the new country programme is investing in rural labour market intermediation in order to match the supply of vocational training with private sector demand for labour.
Yemen	CPE	6	CTRY	STR	COS	The next COSOP for Yemen should focus on a more manageable range of subsectors.	The new country programme is investing in subsectors with comparative advantage, market demand and growth potential. To date, coffee, honey, horticulture, fisheries, handloom textiles and natural stone processing have been identified fulfilling these conditions. This approach will be reflected in the new COSOP.
Yemen	CPE	7	CTRY	STR	RFI	The CPE recommends that IFAD should continue to back rural finance by exploring two strategies: providing support for newly-created MFIs and promoting the development of SCAs.	The Economic Opportunities Fund (which is managing the entire new country programme) is investing in: (i) a 10% equity position and a shareholders current account for on lending in Al Amal MFB; (ii) MOUs with Al-Kuraimi MFI and Tadhamon MFI for rural loan products and capacity-building; and (iii) a temporary risk-sharing mechanism to stimulate their rural lending operations. The country programme has already invested heavily in women's SCA's in the Dhamar and Al Dhala projects, with phenomenal results. For example, some 245 women's SCA's have been established and are operating well under the Dhamar PRDP.
Yemen	CPE	8	CTRY	STR	NRM	The CPE also stresses the importance (in view of the erosion of scarce fertile soil and rapid depletion of water resources, aggravated by the effects of climate change) of greater investments in anti-erosion activities and water harvesting in rainfed areas, including terrace rehabilitation, upstream wadi protection and rehabilitation/ construction of water reservoirs for livestock consumption, domestic use and complementary irrigation.	The IFAD country programme in Yemen has focused on natural resource management and conservation, erosion control and mitigation, water scarcity and harvesting, wadi bank protection and water management since 1979. The focus of these efforts are sharpened under the new country programme, with major emphasis on technology promoting water use efficiency and resource conservation under the Economic Opportunities Programme. NEN is currently partnering with academia in the UK on sophisticated modelling and mapping of climate change impacts for smallholders across Yemen, with a view to targeting mitigation investments accordingly.



Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
Yemen	CPE	9	CTRY	OPER	NRM	IFAD should also dedicate further efforts to improve the efficiency of irrigation systems in order to boost agricultural productivity and minimize water losses.	The new country programme - primarily the EOP (approved in 2009) focuses on water harvesting and water use efficiency (drip irrigation) for coffee and horticulture value chains.
Yemen	CPE	10	CTRY	OPER	NRM	IFAD should also continue to support water users' associations with regard to operation and maintenance.	All IFAD investments in irrigation development in Yemen have been complemented by investments in participatory water management (e.g. WUAs for irrigation system O&M). For example, refer to the EOP.
Yemen	CPE	11	CTRY	OPER	PRM	In terms of productive activities, IFAD should continue its support to developing the value chains for (i) high-value commodities (coffee, honey, horticultural products) with the engagement of the private sector, and (ii) fisheries.	The EOP (approved Dec 2009) is investing in coffee, honey and horticultural products. The FIP is investing in fisheries and aquaculture. The private sector constitutes the entry point into development of these value chains, and the project investments are supporting improved contractual relationships between producers' associations and the private sector.
Yemen	CPE	12	CTRY	OPER	NRM	Investments in fisheries should also be supported by sustainable fisheries resource management.	Sustainable fishery resource management is one of the two components of FIP, which was approved in Dec 2010. The EU is substantially cofinancing IFAD's investment in fisheries resource management, stock assessment and fisheries management planning.
Yemen	CPE	13	CTRY	STR	TGT	IFAD should continue to focus its activities in the areas where the incidence of poverty is highest (western and coastal areas) while also taking advantage of potential economic opportunities. This would include rainfed areas, irrigated land devoted to high-value commodities and the coastal regions.	The recommended focus on poor areas has been a hallmark of IFAD operations in Yemen since 1979. Areas with economic opportunities, rainfed areas, and irrigated areas with high-value commodities have been targeted by the country programme since 2009. Coastal regions have been targeted throughout IFAD's operations in Yemen. The number of settlements to be covered is defined in each design report since 2009 (EOP, FIP, YemenInvest). These target areas will be confirmed in the new COSOP.
Yemen	CPE	14	CTRY	OPER	TGT	While national-scale programmes would be a move in the right direction, a realistic indication should be given of the number of settlements to be covered by future projects/ programmes.	All projects under the new country programme have careful detailed, realistic and phased projections on the number of settlements and beneficiaries to be targeted. Under PMD's business model, these elements are in any case required for QE and QA processes.
Yemen	CPE	15	CTRY	STR	COS	In the context of discussions with the Government for the next COSOP, IFAD should have an ongoing assessment of its strategic direction in light of the current unstable political situation and the wide range of social, economic and security challenges facing the country.	Assessment of strategic direction and business continuity to mitigate risk has been ongoing since the conflict commenced in early 2011; the operating model in Yemen was changed accordingly and is well documented. It includes tightened fiduciary controls through the ICO and consultants; an intensified country portfolio performance review process with Government; an off-site portfolio review process with project directors, financial managers, procurement officers, M&E officers and Government officials (MOPIC, MOF, MAI); and continuous localised supervision and support activities led by the ICO.
Yemen	CPE	16	CTRY	STR	SUP	This would include various scenario settings and risk analysis. Consideration should be given inter alia to the adequacy of IFAD's operating model to	Expertise is mobilised in missions and different phases of the project cycle. The intensity of supervision is the maximum possible within current budgetary constraints and the

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
						respond to these challenges. For example, it is essential to mobilize experts in design, supervision and implementation who are experienced in peace-building and tribal affairs and accustomed to working in conflict areas.	security context.
Yemen	CPE	17	CTRY	STR	SUP	IFAD should give enhanced attention to supervision and implementation support for all ongoing projects/programmes in Yemen. This may incur additional budgetary allocations. The enhanced attention to supervision should include inter alia the careful monitoring of work programmes, phasing of activities and periodic assessment of progress of key milestones.	Monitoring of work programmes, phasing of activities and assessments of progress against milestones constitute statutory elements of direct supervision in PMD's business model. These elements will be reflected in the COSOP to be designed in 2013
Yemen	CPE	18	CTRY	STR	COS	IFAD should also consider developing a contingency plan in the event of any severe disruption in the country's social, security or economic situation.	Contingency planning reflected in the framework of the alternative supervision modalities described above.
Yemen	CPE	19	CTRY	STR	PAR	To achieve greater coherence and competencies on the ground, IFAD will need to step up efforts to mobilize rural development partners and ensure closer collaboration with other donors in Yemen.	The EOP has an IFAD cofinancing ratio of 1:2 while the FIP has a ratio of 1:2.7. The new RGP has a ratio of 1:5. Key cofinancing partners include the EU, the IsDB, and the private sector.
Yemen	CPE	20	CTRY	STR	PAR	IFAD should also seek to ensure the presence of complementary programmes in the same locations, including co-financing.	see above
Yemen	CPE	21	CTRY	STR	STR	This could be achieved by improving IFAD advocacy and ensuring that, at early stages of project/programme design, it engages in discussion to identify areas of complementarity and possible co-financing.	Partnerships and cofinancing for EOP, FIP and RGP initiated at the earliest stage of design.
Yemen	CPE	22	CTRY	STR	GOV	IFAD will need to pay particular attention to institutional development. This should include action at the central and governorate levels to strengthen capacity to plan and implement rural development and to provide training to improve technical capacity. Greater support to and involvement of groups of private-sector farmers will be needed in order to obtain better results.	The Government has created the new Economic Opportunities Fund - a public-private partnership serving rural areas - to manage the IFAD country programme. IFAD is also investing in building the capacities of public institutions at central level (through a series of small grants for MOPIC, MOF and MAI) and at governorate level (through the decentralised governorate projects such as Dhamar and Al Dhala).
Yemen	CPE	22	CTRY	STR	DIA	IFAD should take advantage of its privileged position as the Government of Yemen's main development partner in rural poverty alleviation, and take a more prominent role in policy dialogue on key rural development issues.	IFAD has had substantial policy influence in Yemen over the years. The ICO and HQ are heavily engaged in policy dialogue with Government, focusing on emerging lessons from operational experiences, particularly on the policy and institutional space for rural economic opportunities and employment creation.
Yemen	CPE	22	CTRY	OPER	DIA	Such dialogue should cover the questions of subsidized diesel fuel for agriculture (often the biggest driver of water depletion, as it effectively lowers extraction costs and therefore farmers	IFAD is not positioned to influence Government in areas in which it is not investing, such as fuel costs for groundwater extraction or spate irrigation. IFAD participates in relevant UN-Government forums dealing with policy aspects, such as

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
						have no incentive to save water), equity improvement in spate irrigation and rural finance. Policy dialogue on rural finance might, for example, involve the Government's policy, financial and supervisory framework to support the growth and sustainability of fledgling SCAs.	the Consultative Group and the UN country team. These elements will be confirmed in the design of the new COSOP in 2013. On rural finance, the EOF is taking an equity position in a major MFI, thereby obtaining a seat on its BoD and influencing bank policy. It is also supporting the other two MFIs in Yemen through TA for development of adapted rural finance products.
Yemen	CPE	23	CTRY	OPER	DIA	IFAD should also continue- by participating in the appropriate UN group- to assist the government in developing a comprehensive long-term vision on Qat that would address both supply and demand.	IFAD participates in relevant UN-Government forums dealing with policy aspects, such as the issue of Qat production and consumption.
Yemen	CPE	24	CTRY	OPER	FLD	The CPE recommends that IFAD should consider strengthening its country presence to enable it both to participate more actively in policy dialogue with the government and to strengthen its partnerships with donors.	The recommended strengthening of the ICO is dependent on budgetary allocations and divisional cost efficiency analysis. Partnerships and cofinancing are highly developed, as indicated earlier. The CPM's role in policy dialogue is reflected in the specific objectives of the assignment, and the results documented.

## B. Interim Evaluation

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
<b>Brazil Interim Evaluation: Sustainable Development Project for Agrarian Reform Settlements in the Semi-Arid North East</b>							
Brazil	IE	1	CTRY	STR	DES	A second phase of the DHCP project should require IFAD and the Government of Brazil reaching a clear agreement on the institutional organization of DHCP-II and the level of administration of the project loan.	The agreements reached with the GoB are the following: the Ministry of Agrarian Development (MDA) will be the executing agency and the day-to-day activities will be implemented through its Secretary of Territorial Development (SDT). The Project will rely on a project management unit (PMU) based in the north-eastern city of Recife, Pernambuco, and field operational activities will be carried out by small local offices located in the different territories to be included in the Project area. The Project loan will be administered by the MDA that will delegate some responsibilities to the PMU, although the more sensitive responsibilities will be centralized in MDA headquarters in Brasilia.
Brazil	IE	2	CTRY	OPER	DES	This should include an agreement with the Government of Brazil to carry out, jointly with IFAD, the project design and the procedures for negotiations and signature of the loan agreement.	The project design is being carried out jointly between MDA and IFAD. The procedures for negotiation and signature of the loan agreement are clearly defined by IFAD's General Conditions and by Brazilian legislation and incorporate joint efforts by IFAD and the Government of Brazil.
Brazil	IE	3	CTRY	OPER	DES	In the new project, opportunities to reduce administrative and management costs by making use of decentralized structures should be identified.	The above mentioned local offices are the decentralized structures to be used in the project implementation. This will contribute to reducing administrative and management costs.

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
Brazil	IE	4	CTRY	STR	DES	In line with the rationale of the RB-COSOP, opportunities for cooperation and involvement of state-level governments should be included in order to maximise the potential influence of the DHCP-II at state-level.	The DHCP-II is conceived as a reference for the state-level IFAD projects, so that these projects are going to take advantage of the experiences and good practices developed by the DHCP. These will be implemented in close relationships with the states' governments.
Brazil	IE	5	CTRY	STR	DIA	Define the links between DHCP-II and public policies for rural development at the federal, state and municipal levels for a more effective channelling of resources to family farming and poverty reduction.	The most important aspect of the DHCP-II will be the policy dialogue and support to the articulation of public policies and their implementation at federal, state and municipal levels. The policies will mainly be aimed at family farming and achieving poverty reduction. Indeed, the project's general objective will be to contribute to the design and articulation of public policies, and in this regard it was included in the project as a specific component.
Brazil	IE	6	CTRY	STR	KM	Incorporate in project design a strategy for knowledge generation and dissemination.	Another crucial aspect of the DHCP-II is related to knowledge management. This is reflected in one of its objectives, namely "to promote the replication and dissemination of innovative methodologies and experiences developed by the project". This priority is being reflected in the project activities.
Brazil	IE	7	CTRY	OPER	RME	Incorporate a results-oriented M&E system that will enable the project to measure the progress in implementing the proposed approach and the results achieved at various levels (gender, ethnicity, age, households and institutions, empowerment, citizenship, environmental sustainability).	It was agreed with the Government to prioritize the setting-up of a results oriented M&E system with differentiated gender and youth indicators. This activity is under development as part of the project design process.
Brazil	IE	8	CTRY	OPER	KM	The new phase should incorporate instruments for extracting information about the DHCP experience with a view to disseminating knowledge in national and international fora. In this context, IFAD should increase and facilitate opportunities to transfer DHCP experience at the regional level and in forthcoming initiatives for South-South cooperation.	The DHCP prioritized knowledge management activities, including dissemination of successful experiences. The DHCP-II will follow the same pathway and, indeed, the first component of this new project is being designed to stress policy dialogue, especially policy inputs that will emerge from project experiences. Additionally, a number of exchange activities have been carried out with participation of the project staff and stakeholders from African countries such as Senegal, Cape Verde, South Africa and others. Finally, the project is going to benefit from and to contribute to the on-going knowledge management processes in the Semiarid Northeast of Brazil Programme, which is part of the IFAD Country Programme.
Brazil	IE	9	PROJ	STR	DES	The project should include strategies for income generation through agricultural and non-agricultural activities.	These strategies have been included in the project design as part of Component 3 aimed to increase agricultural production and access to markets.
Brazil	IE	10	PROJ	STR	PRM	With regard to agricultural activities, support should be provided for upgrading products with high value-added and facilitating linkages of family farmers with value chain and markets.	This strategy is part of component 3 as mentioned above, and it was included in the Aide Memoire signed on March 28 2013, at the closing of the detailed design mission.

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
Brazil	IE	11	PROJ	STR	NRM	These activities should be implemented in line with the principle of environmental conservation that was a distinguishing feature of DHCP.	In terms of environmental conservation, the project adopted the approach of supporting small farmers' adaptation to climate change. This focus was included in component 3 and is reflected in the Aide Memoire signed on March 28 2013, at the closing of the detailed design mission.
Brazil	IE	12	PROJ	OPER	TGT	The project should also identify instruments and strategies for the expansion of non-farm employment opportunities, especially for young people.	The support to income generation will include non-farm activities which will prioritize youth and women. This was included in the Aide Memoire signed on March 28 2013, at the closing of the detailed design mission.
Brazil	IE	13	PROJ	OPER	TGT	In the contexts of both agricultural and non-agricultural activities, the project should continue its support to initiatives aimed at facilitating access of beneficiaries to bottom-up financial and non-financial business development services oriented to grassroots associations.	Financing from complementary sources, mainly from the PRONAF (the National Programme for the Strengthening of Family Agriculture- a public credit programme for family farming) will be facilitated by the project, and also access to technical assistance services to be provided by the Ministry of Agrarian Development. These definitions were also included in the Aide Memoire signed on March 28 2013, at the closing of the detailed design mission.
Brazil	IE	14	CTRY	STR	SUS	Define at the outset the strategy for engagement with settlements and communities, and its duration. This includes the type and length of support and the indicators triggering the termination of project support – the exit strategy. The design should specify the institutional features and conditions expected at the time of project completion to ensure the continuation of benefits after the end of project financing.	Sustainability is a key focus area for this project, agreed between IFAD and the Government, both in institutional, organizational and environmental terms. Concrete mechanisms and operational definitions are being built as part of the on-going project design process.
Brazil	IE	15	CTRY	STR	COS	Where applicable, look for complementarities among DHCP actions and experience with IFAD programmes operating in the same states and territories.	Please see SN 4, 6 and 8 above. Furthermore, building synergies with other IFAD projects and programmes has been accorded the highest priority in this project design and for the other projects at state-level in Brazil.
<b>Ghana Interim Evaluation: Rural Enterprises Project, Phase II</b>							
Ghana	IE	1	CTRY	STR	SCA	A follow-up project will be designed as a programme, combining the scaling up of the successful approach developed to date, with innovation to further refine the different elements in view of (i) enhancing complementarity with Agricultural Value Chain development, (ii) increase efficiency to make mainstreaming of BACs and RTFs nation- wide affordable to Government and sustainable, and (iii) enhance clients' access to complementary elements of MSE support.	A follow-up project called the Rural Enterprises Programme (REP III was designed in 2010, approved on 15th September 2011, the Loan Agreement was signed on 3rd November 2011, and the project was launched on 20th December 2011 and commenced implementation in February 2012. The REP III design has amplified support for Value Chain development through a re-orientation of the activities of the BACs (Business Advisory Centres) and RTFs ( Rural Technology Facilities) as well emphasising an increased collaboration with NRGF and RTIMP. The REP III design has incorporated the continuation of the efforts of REP II to pursue the implementation of LI 1961 (2009) to establish the Department of Trade and Industry at the District level to complete the mainstreaming of the BACs and RTFs. The design of REP III has also ensured that clients' access to complimentary MSE (micro and small

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
							enterprise) support services would be enhanced by emphasising support for MSE institutional strengthening at the district and regional levels especially.
Ghana	IE	2	CTRY	STR	SUS	The BACs should be consolidated within the current districts, maintaining the core programs and continuing to assess and support requirements for business growth.	The Programme phase includes continued support for the existing 66 rural districts that were supported under both REP I and REP II to enable the BACs focus their technical assistance to existing MSEs for business growth. To this end, interventions at the MSE level are mainly aimed at business improvement and expansion, market access and employment generation. REP is providing capacity building to the BAC staff to function effectively, particularly in delivering business counselling services.
Ghana	IE	3	CTRY	STR	SCA	Nationwide expansion of the BAC and RTF models should be pursued within the design of REP-III.	The design of REP has adequately addressed this. At least 95 additional BACs are being established throughout the country and 30 additional RTFs would also be established under AfDB funding and would be strategically distributed across the country.
Ghana	IE	4	CTRY	OPER	SUS	A more efficient and sustainable model will be proposed for RTFs, based on a detailed review of their governance and management structure, and cost implications.	This has been addressed through a number of initiatives. A study was conducted in the early part of 2012 which reviewed the operations and management of the existing 21 RTFs and made recommendations which have been factored into the AfDB design of REP regarding the future direction of the RTFs. A number of options are being considered including public-private partnership arrangements, outright sale of some of the existing RTFs, partial privatisation and wholly public-owned entities for some, depending on the defining circumstances of each RTF.
Ghana	IE	5	PROJ	STR	TGT	Project-supported interventions should be diversified in such a way that different activities are relevant to different types of enterprise, - e.g. those that are ready and able to access credit and those that are not.	REP is providing an array of integrated MSE support interventions at the district level including business development services (community-based trade skills training, quality improvement skills training, small business management, credit management training, marketing training and support); technology promotion and transfer services (technical skills training to master craft persons and apprentices, environmental and work place management, production of equipment and tools, etc.), and rural financial services (access to credit). Clients demand these services on the basis of their needs through the AWPB planning process each year.
Ghana	IE	6	PROJ	STR	TGT	BAC and RTF support needs to be targeted towards different groups in different ways so that positive results in terms of contribution to poverty reduction are achieved at all levels. Some consideration should be given to the contribution required by poorer districts and clients so that they are not marginalized from participating due to the low level of resources available to them.	The procedure and processes involved in the preparation of the REP AWPB takes care of this. The BACs and RTFs are guided by the targeting strategy and mechanisms of the Programme. Although the preferred option for the Programme is to demand a demonstration of commitment from clients as a basis for REP III support, there is room for special considerations where potential may be constrained by a lack of financial means. But even here,

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
							there must be convincing evidence of the inability of the proposed clients and their potential if supported.
Ghana	IE	7	PROJ	OPER	TGT	More specific support packages to be developed, to respond to the diverse capacities and assets, particularly regarding training needs and financial instruments to access finance across the varying target groups to be developed during the design of the forthcoming Rural Enterprises Programme.	Training modules have been developed and packaged to respond to the needs of particular segments of the Programme clients. The capacity of the clients, the BAC and PFI staff are being enhanced to more effectively deal with the financial requirements of rural MSEs.
Ghana	IE	8	PROJ	OPER	PRM	There is a need to create a stronger link between the BACs and the national standard agencies so that growing enterprises can comply with national and international trade standards.	As part of the institutional capacity development of MSE support institutions under the Programme at national, regional and district levels, the strengthening of the linkages between the BACs and all other relevant institutions has been clearly identified for action.
Ghana	IE	9	PROJ	OPER	PRM	NBSSI should be supported to develop the capacity for playing a more important role in providing effective services to the BACs and in facilitating the linkages between BACs and the Ghana Standards Board.	NBSSI is a leading national implementing entity of REP and in line with the Programme design to strengthen and support such institutions to gradually assume responsibility for the Programme, various forms of support have been planned within the overall Programme implementation framework.
Ghana	IE	10	PROJ	OPER	PMA	A greater collaboration between the Ministry of Trade and Industry (MOTI) and the Ministry of Food and Agriculture (MOFA) will be promoted through institutional reform and support from REP at the District level.	This been addressed through an increasing use of the BACs and RTFs (supported by REP and MOTI) by NRGF and RTIMP (Root and Tuber Improvement and Marketing Programme), both implemented by MOFA, at the district level to deliver various forms of support to the rural MSEs. The BACs are providing business counselling and business management support to clients of both NRGF and RTIMP. The RTFs on the other hand are producing agro-processing equipment for the cassava processors under RTIMP.
Ghana	IE	11	PROJ	OPER	RFI	The Rural Enterprises Programme should intensify its support on the demand side, through information and referral services to clients to direct them to appropriate rural financial institutions. BACs should support the clients to intensify savings, information and referral services.	This is part of the normal day-to-day activities of the BACs and even the RTFs. Indeed, the BACs have been trained to ensure that any clients that require financial services are adequately prepared to meet the requirements of the banks before they are referred.
Ghana	IE	12	PROJ	OPER	RFI	There is a need to link strategically with other IFAD interventions in rural finance particularly to improve credit supply.	The REP III design envisaged a close collaboration between REP III and RAfiP to build the capacity of the PFIs to improve credit delivery. This is yet to be concretised and the operational modalities clearly established. Common clients of both REP and RTIMP can access the existing financial services provided they meet the requirements.
Ghana	IE	13	PROJ	OPER	RFI	The Project Coordination and Monitoring Unit will continue to coach BACs on how to link clients most effectively to the rural banks and other RFIs. The REP-III design will include recommendations to address bottlenecks in	The capacity enhancement of all implementers of REP III at the various levels (including the BACs) to enable them deliver improved services is a key task for the REP PCMU. The design of REP III has addressed this.

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
						accessing finance and ensuring clear roles for implementation.	
Ghana	IE	14	CTRY	STR	DES	Greater involvement of the district planning and coordinating unit (DPCU) should be built into the REP-III design. Inclusion of the District Agriculture Development Unit (DADU) in the district MSE sub-committee would assist with linking agricultural and MSE development.	The REP III PCMU has improved on the participatory planning process for the AWPB by inviting the District Planning Officers and the District Coordinating Directors to the Annual Review Workshop in 2012. In 2013, it is intended to further include the District Budget Officers and the District Agric. Directors. The District Directors of Agric. are coopted members of the district MSE sub-committees.
Ghana	IE	15	CTRY	STR	DES	National trade organizations and apexes, as well as local trade associations, need to be strengthened in the context of REP-III.	The REP III design has addressed this and the PCMU is seeking the appropriate mechanisms to engage with the Association of Ghana Industries (AGI) and the Association of Small-Scale Industries (ASSI).
Ghana	IE	16	CTRY	STR	DES	The local economic development process could be supported to ensure MSEs are included in the district level development agenda and plans. There is potential to strengthen both the MSE sector and operations by integrating project monitoring and strategic regional MSE development at the regional level.	The REP III design has included the establishment of a Regional Committee on Micro and Small-Scale Enterprise Promotion (RECOMEP) to be situated at the Regional Coordinating Councils with the key focus to receive all information on MSE development at the district level to enhance their coordination of the economic development efforts across the various regions.
Ghana	IE	17	CTRY	STR	DIA	Another opportunity to be pursued is the development of a Ghana MSE policy based on learning and knowledge from the implementation of previous REP interventions.	REP is contributing significantly to institutional development at the national level. The development of a Ghana MSE policy will be fully underway once the implementation of REP III gathers full momentum.
Ghana	IE	18	CTRY	STR	DES	The design should review the institutional mechanisms developed under REP II and build on lessons to provide a framework allowing the successive mainstreaming of REP into existing institutions and evolving structures. The Programme should incorporate specific activities aiming at strengthening institutions and building an enabling environment for MSE sector development at national, regional and district level.	This has been addressed by the REP III design. The exit strategy for the Programme is hinged upon strengthening the relevant institutions including NBSSI, GRATIS, DAs and others and to increasing involve them in leading the implementation of the respective components of the Programme. The introduction of the RECOMEP is a part of this strategy.
<b>Tanzania Interim Evaluation: Rural Financial Services Programme and Agricultural Marketing Systems Development Programme</b>							
Tanzania	IE	1	CTRY	STR	SCA	The scaling up phase may also involve a transition from the project mode (to a large extent a feature of RFSP and AMSDP) to a more decentralized approach relying on mainstreaming support into government systems (see the discussion in paragraph 251 of the evaluation report). The risks associated with this and other issues related to scaling up should be considered in MIVARF.	Field implementation of MIVARF is anchored at the LGA (local government authority) level. MIVARF support is an integral part of the District Agricultural Development Plan (DADP), an approach that is advocated through the Agricultural Sector Development Programme (ASDP). The ASDP is a SWAp (Sector Wide Approach) that addresses issues under the agricultural sector in a holistic manner.
Tanzania	IE	2	CTRY	OPER	SCA	<b>Avoid support to unsuccessful activities and organisations.</b> IFAD, the Government, and/or local government authorities (LGAs) should resist different kinds of pressure for continuing the support in the cases of unsuccessful activities and	Based on the agreed eligibility criteria set out in the MIVARF design, the selection process for the gMFIs and other groups (e.g. AMCOS) is done based on a rigorous needs assessment that sets out standards to qualify for support and the type of support needed. This will ensure



Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
						organizations "in order to save the organization".	support is channelled to the right organizations.
Tanzania	IE	3	CTRY	OPER	DES	Certain levels of mortality are to be expected for the supported gMFIs, producer groups and agribusinesses. The design of MIVARF should attempt to define acceptable mortality rates (or targets/success indicators for survival) for the different target groups/enterprises.	In line with the above, success indicators for gMFIs and other groups (producer/processor groups or agribusiness) are being refined by the PCT (project coordination team) in collaboration with other stakeholders based on acceptable minimum standards.
Tanzania	IE	4	CTRY	OPER	BEN	In order to improve transparency and mutual accountability, it would be useful to define the support for beneficiary groups in a contract or Memorandum of Understanding between the district/programme and the beneficiary group. Such a contract or Memorandum of Understanding would specify mutual responsibilities and obligations, what type of support will be provided and for how long, etc.	MoUs have been prepared to clearly define roles and responsibilities of partners and expected outputs. The MoUs at the lowest level (LGA and groups) are further complimented by MoUs between the Districts and the Regional Authorities as well as between the Regional Authorities and the Programme Coordination Team (PCT). The PCT also has MoUs with national level stakeholders such as the Central Bank, the Cooperative Development Departments etc.
Tanzania	IE	5	CTRY	STR	TGT	<b>Targeting.</b> IFAD should continue concentrating on support that more directly benefits the rural active poor.	MIVARF support is focused on the rural active poor as per the principle of engagement which underlines competition for resources and viability of the enterprises the beneficiaries are engaged in. The eligibility criteria put more emphasis on targeting the rural active poor.
Tanzania	IE	6	CTRY	OPER	TGT	IFAD support for small and medium sized agribusinesses, such as through guarantees from financial institutions, should be a secondary priority or carried out in partnership (e.g. with AGRA).	MIVARF is designed to operate a Guarantee Fund as well as an Innovation Fund through partners. The PCT has launched a process to widen the scope for more interested potential partners to participate.
Tanzania	IE	7	CTRY	OPER	TGT	IFAD should support linkages between producer groups of small farmers and larger producers and agribusinesses.	This is captured under the Producer Empowerment and Market Linkages as well as the Value Addition Sub-Components of MIVARF.
Tanzania	IE	7	CTRY	STR	SUS	<b>Approach (pursuit of economic viability).</b> Financial and commercial viability must be at the forefront when deciding whom to support and how to do it.	As in 2 above, selection of beneficiaries is based on eligibility criteria which among other things insist on economic viability. Furthermore, a rigorous needs assessment precedes the decision as to what kind of support MIVARF will extend to the selected beneficiaries. For example, preparation of Institutional and Business Development Plans (IBDPs) for partners (e.g. Community Banks) is done with the aim of ensuring spot-on support in expanding rural outreach at an optimum shared delivery cost.
Tanzania	IE	8	CTRY	OPER	SUS	This will also require that more attention is given to scale – e.g. instead of supporting the emergence of many small and weak SACCOS the programme should consider to support the expansion of larger SACCOS, having good survival potential, so that these SACCOS may open branches in non-served areas.	MIVARF strategy does not provide for support aimed at promoting new SACCOS (Savings and Credit Cooperatives) unless there is a justified reason to do so. Identification of well-functioning SACCOS (preferably operationally self-sufficient) is of paramount importance to ensure a meaningful support for quick and sustainable results.

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
Tanzania	IE	9	CTRY	OPER	PAR	In this context, there may also be a need for facilitating mergers.	MIVARF will provide support to apex organisations (SCCULT, TAMFI, COBAT) to demonstrate that there are mutual benefits for individual members to form networks. This may encourage formation of more networks or even mergers for more benefits.
Tanzania	IE	10	CTRY	OPER	RFI	It may not be necessary to work with SACCOS in some areas that now benefit from the availability of other financial services (e.g. MFIs and banks).	The MIVARF support assumes availability of synergies in a focal area. This allows for a support package that compliments/builds on existing efforts such as presence of MFIs or banks where it may not need to work directly with SACCOS but through the existing microfinance institutions. This is one of the MIVARF eligibility criteria.
Tanzania	IE	11	CTRY	OPER	SUS	Similar approach should be applied in support for producer/marketing groups. Working with fewer and larger groups with good prospects for expansion and increasing their value added is preferable to giving temporary and insufficient support to many small groups who are left nowhere with limited prospects of survival as the support ends.	More emphasis is given to support functional groups of producers/processors along the selected value chains. MIVARF will provide "needs specific" support package to individual groups while advocating for collective marketing as a basis for sustainable market linkages. Formation of networks for mutual benefits of members is envisaged.
Tanzania	IE	12	CTRY	OPER	SUS	It should be possible to avoid inclusion (towards the end of the implementation period) of groups for which the support duration will be too short.	MIVARF is designed to be implemented over a period of 7 years. The strategy is to ensure all participating partners/LGAs have a minimum of 3 full years of support on a diminishing basis. This calls for a negotiated exit strategy from year one of the support to ensure smooth handing over. The eligibility criteria also require the selection of functioning groups which will not require a lot of time to support in order for them to become sustainable.
Tanzania	IE	13	CTRY	STR	SUS	IFAD should consider extending the MIVARF implementation period (period of five years) to ensure sufficient time to establish well-functioning, sustainable groups.	As above: MIVARF is designed to be implemented over a period of 7 years. The strategy is to ensure all participating partners/LGAs have a minimum of 3 full years of support on a diminishing basis. This calls for a negotiated exit strategy from year one of the support to ensure smooth handing over. The eligibility criteria also require the selection of functioning groups which will not require a lot of time to support in order for them to become sustainable.
Tanzania	IE	14	PROJ	OPER	PMA	Where possible in moving to a national programme, MIVARF should try to concentrate its investments to deepen impacts and avoid scattering resources within or across too many districts.	MIVARF has started by competitively selecting one district in each region. Although the design provides for a specific number of districts to be covered by the Programme i.e. 78, the additional districts will depend entirely on the set out criteria as well as performance of those on board. The idea is to have as few districts as possible but with a bigger impact from an expanded outreach.
Tanzania	IE	15	PROJ	OPER	PMA	The district administrations will require substantial external hand-holding and support (from a PCU) in order to handle the business and value chain development activities. Such hand-	The LGAs competitively propose areas of intervention based on the principal of engagement and eligibility criteria through the Regional Secretariats. MIVARF will then engage private service providers to carry out the

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
						holding is costly and will result in very high delivery costs if the investment per district is modest (because the MIVARF budget may be spread over many districts). To be most cost effective, MIVARF should clearly articulate how it will work with both the LGA system and private service providers to optimize service delivery to the beneficiaries and reduce costs.	business and value chain development activities in collaboration with the LGAs. The arrangement is guided by a minimum acceptable delivery cost per beneficiary that will be substantiated in "Performance Based Contracts" between the LGAs and the SPs.
Tanzania	IE	16	PROJ	OPER	PMA	Options for reducing delivery costs and improving cost-effectiveness: MFI/NGOs, such as BRAC, are becoming major players and mobile-phone banking is becoming accessible to rural communities while expanding its range of services, which may offer low-cost opportunities for financial inclusion of the rural poor.	The Programme is working closely with its partners as well as potential partners. Identified potential partners (e.g. Community Banks, NGOs/MFIs such as CRDB Microfinance Co. Ltd, Tujijenge, COBAT, TAMFI, SCULLT) have been taken through a process of developing results-oriented IBDPs which form the basis of support in ensuring a cost-effective expansion of financial services to the rural active poor. The design of the Programme also provides for an Innovation Fund which will partly be used to support innovative low cost practices of offering financial services such as mobile phone banking by participating institutions.
Tanzania	IE	17	PROJ	OPER	PMA	Options for reducing delivery costs and improving cost-effectiveness within agricultural marketing, there are options for using well-functioning producer groups as service providers to assist newly formed groups in their development. There may also be options in contract farming schemes where large nucleus farmers or contract farming enterprises may be facilitated to support the capacity development of the small farmer groups who supply the enterprise.	The adopted MIVARF strategy is guided by the Value Chain Approach in developing replicable market linkages. Apart from SPs (service providers), MIVARF will encourage the use of performing groups of processors/producers (Super Groups) to undergo ToT and ensure quicker and cheaper dissemination of knowledge and skills to a wider area. Moreover, in fostering forward and backward linkages, support will be provided to nuclear farmers or contract farming enterprises to develop the feeder groups where applicable.
Tanzania	IE	18	PROJ	OPER	KM	<b>Build on existing knowledge and experiences from AMSDP and RFSP.</b> Either as part of the closing of AMSDP and RFSP or as part of the inception phase of MIVARF, IFAD should facilitate the production of practical what-to-do manuals, developed based on the experiences and lessons learnt.	Manuals have been developed to guide implementation of activities based on the experience of AMSDP (Agricultural Marketing Systems Development Programme ) and RFSP (Rural Financial Services Programme). These include Warehouse Receipt Scheme manual, Trainer's Manuals for Service Providers (training of producer/processor groups, SACCOS). The M&E/KM manual as well as the Financial Management manual have also been further developed based on the ones used under the closed AMSDP and RFSP.
Tanzania	IE	19	PROJ	STR	PAR	It is important that the MIVARF develops operational partnerships with other programmes and organizations (that support the development of rural finance, agricultural marketing and value chains) and also facilitates the MIVARF target districts to access such cooperation.	This is well articulated in the MIVARF eligibility criteria that guide participation in the Programme interventions. Selection of proposals for support (from the LGAs) and other implementing partners underscores the importance of existing synergies/linkages. These are considered strong elements in ensuring cost-effectiveness, expanded outreach and hence sustainability. Furthermore, the entry point for MIVARF is the region whereby it has a MoU with

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
							the Regional Authority. The region signs a MoU with the LGA which then signs a MoU with the producer/processor groups and gMFIs.
Tanzania	IE	20	PROJ	OPER	SUS	<b>Sustainable field-based partnerships.</b> MIVARF should eliminate the perception of "MIVARF groups" and instead promote an approach whereby producer groups and gMFIs that are supported by MIVARF are facilitated support and services from other organizations and programmes. From the start of MIVARF's support for a group, attention should be given to avoiding the development of "MIVARF-dependency" and to promoting self-reliance.	This is well articulated in the MIVARF eligibility criteria that guide participation in the Programme interventions. Selection of proposals for support (from the LGAs) and other implementing partners underscores the importance of existing synergies/linkages. These are considered strong elements in ensuring cost-effectiveness, expanded outreach and hence sustainability. Furthermore, the entry point for MIVARF is the region whereby it has a MoU with the Regional Authority. The region signs a MoU with the LGA which then signs a MoU with the producer/processor groups and gMFIs.

### C. Corporate Level Evaluation

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
<b>Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment</b>							
IFAD	CLE	1	IFAD	PLCY	GDR	Management recognizes that IFAD needs to take on the challenge of developing a better set of indicators to measure impact and results in gender equality and women's empowerment.	A concept note has been prepared in consultation with PMD to strengthen the gender perspective of the RIMS surveys, including a small element on gender equality and empowerment (linked to the Women's Empowerment in Agriculture Index). IFAD is currently seeking financial support for developing and piloting in IFAD-supported projects.
IFAD	CLE	2	IFAD	PLCY	GDR	IFAD can and will do better, including by finding the right partners to address the relatively weaker performance on the third strategic objective – improving women's well-being and easing their workloads by facilitating access to basic rural services and infrastructure (where success is contingent on investments that are often outside IFAD's remit (i.e. outside of agriculture and rural development) and need to be funded by partners.	In the short run, IFAD is giving more visibility to the issue of equitable workloads by identifying the time-related benefits associated with water-related investments in IFAD-supported projects; and (ii) preparing a thematic note on gender and equitable workloads.
IFAD	CLE	3	IFAD	PLCY	GDR	Management agrees that IFAD needs to equip itself with the instruments and resources needed to promote gender equality in its human resources policies.	A review of HR policies from a gender perspective has started, also integrating recommendations received through the 2012 Global Staff Survey. Results on the recruitment (mainstreaming gender aspects in addition to geographical distribution), job rotation and indefinite contracts are planned by the end of 2013. This review of the policies adds to the nursery facility and the breast feeding and replacement policies already in place.

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
IFAD	CLE	4	IFAD	PLCY	GDR	IFAD Management has taken note of the finding that, while IFAD's gender architecture is appropriate on the whole, it needs to be reviewed to achieve greater clarity and accountability. It also concurs with the finding that it is difficult to track the resources allocated to gender, a challenge shared by other international agencies. Nevertheless, IFAD will seek better ways to do this (also refer to recommendation 14).	A study of IFAD's gender architecture was undertaken in 2011 and the recommendations are being followed-up, particularly with regard to gender focal points (GFPs) and role of the Thematic Group on Gender (TG-G). At present, there are GFPs in SKM, ECD, COM, HRD and APR; ESA and WCA have full-time gender coordinators. As a result of very recent staff movements, there are several gaps in the GFPs among the other regional divisions at headquarters. This staff performs gender-related activities in addition to their full-time jobs. There are also GFPs at country office, programme and project level who perform these duties in addition to their regular work. The TG-G continues to be an important resource augmenting the activities of the gender staff and GFPs. The voluntary membership of over 70 staff (77 per cent are women), drawn from 20 divisions, reflects the widespread interest in gender at IFAD. This is an important vehicle for sharing expertise, sounding out ideas, and developing new products to meet priority needs in IFAD. Regarding the tracking of resources, an initial meeting has been held with AVP, FOD at which it was agreed that PTA would start developing a methodology for ex post tracking of resource allocation.
IFAD	CLE	5	IFAD	PLCY	GDR	IFAD Management has noted the evaluation's recommendation that "an overarching evidence- and results-based corporate policy on gender equality and women's empowerment be developed by Management for submission to the Executive Board in 2011." Management will implement this recommendation if it is endorsed by the Executive Board.	A corporate policy on gender equality and women's empowerment was presented to, and approved by, the EB in April 2012.
IFAD	CLE	6	IFAD	PLCY	GDR	The gender policy document could clarify basic concepts and would need to be operational in terms of identifying responsibilities, actions and resources. The policy could be accompanied by a results framework (paragraph 236 of the evaluation) and an implementation strategy that is well integrated within and supportive of IFAD's systems.	The policy includes an annex defining key gender concepts, an implementation plan and allocation of responsibilities for implementation across IFAD.
IFAD	CLE	7	IFAD	PLCY	GDR	The policy would need to be developed through a participatory and consultative process.	The policy was developed with the support of the policy reference group, as well as inputs from the thematic group on gender, and direct consultation with IFAD divisions.
						<i>The following issues would also need to be reviewed and addressed in the development of the gender policy:</i>	
IFAD	CLE	8	IFAD	STR	GDR	(a) Promoting performance on gender equality and women's empowerment in job descriptions and work planning/performance management within IFAD	Gender equality and women's empowerment matters will be included in job descriptions with relevant content; similarly this will be included in PES objectives of Gender Focal Points. Staff is also increasing awareness and skills on gender related aspects through gender specific training

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
							initiatives that have been carried out in 2012 and are planned on a regular basis every year.
IFAD	CLE	9	IFAD	STR	GDR	(b) Promoting gender balance in staffing, including in IFAD country offices and at IFAD headquarters	Chapter 2 on staff selection will be reviewed by the end of 2013 to mainstream gender equality in all stages of the recruitment process including shortlist, panel composition and appointment board composition, and to identify gender equality as one of IFAD's selection principles.
IFAD	CLE	10	IFAD	STR	GDR	(c) Ensuring work-life balance within IFAD	PTA is working with HRD to develop a corporate eLearning module on gender and diversity that will raise awareness on, among other things, work-life balance. PTA also conducted a gender analysis of the GSS 2012 and the findings have been included in the corporate response. One of the initiatives (constructive work environment) includes specific reference to work-life balance.
IFAD	CLE	11	IFAD	STR	GDR	(d) Investing more in managing knowledge, enhancing learning and undertaking analytic work, and engaging in policy dialogue and advocacy related to gender issues, both directly and through enhanced partnerships	PTA has worked with regional divisions to produce a series of regional/subregional gender briefs in order to place key gender issues and responses in the local context. In line with PTA's new approach to KM, a series of KM products are under preparation including gender, and gender in relation to different specific themes such as value chains, rural institutions, women's leadership, equitable workloads; water and time use study; synthesis of household methodologies. The gender and targeting website is being updated with SKM. For partnerships - see below.
IFAD	CLE	12	IFAD	PLCY	GDR	(e) Developing a coherent framework for business processes already in place to further IFAD's work on gender equality and women's empowerment.	PTA is developing a gender marker system which will be used to characterise scores for project design (QA), implementation (PSR), completion (PCR) and evaluation. A system will be introduced for tracking the gender performance of individual projects.
						<i>In the process of preparing the policy, depending on the decision of the Executive Board, IFAD would also:</i>	
IFAD	CLE	13	IFAD	PLCY	GDR	(a) Review the need for the Executive Board and Senior Management to lead and oversee issues related to gender equality, and propose ways and means for strengthening their capacity and roles in this area (paragraph 235 of evaluation, first bullet)	It has been agreed that the reporting on progress with regard to gender-related activities and the policy will be through OMC. Members of Senior Management and the EB had the opportunity to review the first annual report on gender in December 2012, as an annex to the RIDE. The capacity requirements of SM and EB will be considered as part of the gender capacity development plan to be developed in partnership with HRD.
IFAD	CLE	14	IFAD	PLCY	GDR	(b) Undertake a comprehensive review of IFAD's overall gender architecture, including: oversight functions at Management level; required profiles, location and numbers of dedicated gender positions in the Programme Management Department (PMD) and other divisions, including the Human Resources Division (HRD); redefinition of the role of gender	Ongoing activities to strengthen the gender architecture include: (i) preparing coherent structure for IFAD's gender architecture, including the location of gender focal points (GFPs) at HQ, ICOs and PMUs; (ii) preparing terms of reference for, and appointing, GFPs and alternates at HQ divisional level, ICOs and PMUs, and identifying ways in which time devoted to gender-related activities by GFPs

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
						focal points and allocation of adequate resources for this function; and role and structure of the Thematic Group on Gender.	and alternates are credited in the PES; (iii) training and capacity building of GFPs at HQ and regional/sub-regional level; and (iv) identifying the role of EB and senior management in supporting gender initiatives, and addressing their capacity building requirements.
IFAD	CLE	15	IFAD	STR	GDR	IFAD will continue to improve gender responsiveness in project design and implementation.	PTA is developing a toolkit on gender and targeting in the project cycle, comprising tip sheets, TORs and other guidance materials. Capacity building of staff at IFAD HQ took place in May 2012. PTA together with ESA held a regional gender workshop in December 2012, and a country workshop in India in October 2012. Seeking financial support for replicating these workshops in other regions.
IFAD	CLE	16	IFAD	STR	GDR	IFAD will continue to include gender expertise in project-cycle-related missions, in project management and country presence structures.	With the new style of PTA with regard to greater participation in project design and implementation support, there is more opportunity to participate in CPMTs and missions. ESA and WCA have regional gender coordinators; since November 2012, there is no longer a gender specialist staff position in the India ICO. It would be most effective if other regions and large country programmes had dedicated gender specialists.
IFAD	CLE	17	IFAD	STR	GDR	IFAD will seek to improve its capacity to learn more on gender equality and women's empowerment through existing knowledge management processes, and its monitoring and reporting systems, including the Results and Impact Management System (RIMS) and project logical frameworks.	The capacity to learn more will be enhanced by ongoing initiatives described elsewhere in this PRISMA response, such as the gender marker scores and tracking for project design, implementation and completion/evaluation; the updated gender website with regional sub-pages; the introduction of the divisional gender award; and the strengthening of the gender dimension of RIMS.
IFAD	CLE	18	IFAD	STR	GDR	IFAD will also continue to implement the four commitments it made relative to the third Millennium Development Goal (MDG3 – the promotion of gender equality) when receiving the Global MDG3 Champion Torch.	Most elements of the four commitments are embedded within the new gender policy. The four commitments are to: (i) improve our results on the ground by continuing to better integrate gender equality and women's empowerment into the strategic framework, country programmes, and monitoring and evaluation systems; (ii) strengthen women's leadership and decision-making influence in agriculture and natural resource management at all levels; (iii) develop strategic communications and advocacy in favour of increased investment in rural women, for sustainable agricultural development and food security; and (iv) increase our own investment in technology development and capacity strengthening for gender equality and rural women's empowerment through the grants programme.
IFAD	CLE	19	IFAD	OPER	GDR	On the occasion of the October 2011 review of progress made in fulfilling Torch commitments, an award will be given to the division that has made the most progress.	A proposal for making an annual award linked to the divisional performance and to be announced on Rural Women's Day (15 October) is under discussion.

Country	Evaluation	S N	Level	Nature	Theme	ACP Agreed Action	PMD Follow Up
IFAD	CLE	20	IFAD	STR	GDR	In relation to important opportunities over the next 18 months (post-evaluation), IFAD will continue to provide leadership within global policy processes to advance the gender equality and empowerment of rural women.	IFAD is an active member of the Joint Programme on Rural Women's Economic Empowerment with RBAs and Un Women, and is co-leading the implementation in Ethiopia. Also active in the Inter-agency network on women and gender equality, and in 2012 organised side events at the Commission on the Status of Women in New York. The ability to participate in some major events, such as CSW 2013, is now being constrained by budgets.
IFAD	CLE	21	IFAD	STR	GDR	The President of IFAD will continue to play a leadership role on this issue.	The President maintains high visibility for gender issues - for example, the statements he delivered during the 36th Governing Council. He commented on women as IFAD project participants, as well as recognising the importance of achieving a better gender balance among IFAD staff.
IFAD	CLE	22	IFAD	OPER	GDR	While awaiting the review of IFAD's gender architecture, IFAD's Executive Management Committee will nominate a member of the Operations Management Committee as responsible, under the leadership of the President, for implementation, oversight and reporting on gender equality and women's empowerment within IFAD.	OMC continues to be the reporting mechanism and the AVP, PMD has been nominated as the senior management gender champion, with supporting roles from the Director of HR and Deputy Director, PRM.
IFAD	CLE	23	IFAD	OPER	GDR	Starting in early 2011, IFAD will more systematically include a gender perspective in training activities to be undertaken on operational aspects (PMD-organized) and on key competencies. PMD (for operational training) and HRD (for competency training) will submit a plan to this effect by end-January 2011.	Staff training on gender was delivered in May 2012; and a toolkit on gender and targeting in the project cycle is being developed. A capacity building plan is under preparation in partnership with HRD.
IFAD	CLE	24	IFAD	OPER	GDR	In addition, Management will nominate a senior staff member in HRD to oversee the development of a gender and diversity strategy that will be part of the corporate gender policy, in line with the target set under IFAD's current Results Measurement Framework.	HRD has nominated a senior staff member (Staff Development Manager) to oversee the achievement of the G&D targets set out in the gender policy.
IFAD	CLE	25	IFAD	OPER	GDR	IFAD will also strengthen corporate reports such as the Report on IFAD's Development Effectiveness (RIDE) to report on its gender performance.	The first annual report on gender appeared as Annex 1 in 2012 RIDE. See this report for the full results of gender-related activities in IFAD from July 2011-June 2012.
IFAD	CLE	26	IFAD	STR	GDR	In addition, IFAD will introduce gender as one of the "big bets" in IFAD's corporate innovation agenda until 2015 (target year for the MDGs).	Big bets have been dropped. However, gender is one of the dimensions to be included in the IMI on scaling up.
IFAD	CLE	27	IFAD	OPER	GDR	IFAD will also support innovative approaches, and their scaling up, by building partnerships with regional knowledge centres of excellence on this theme.	PTA is preparing a paper on gender and targeting within the scaling up agenda. Concept note prepared to seek funding for scaling up household methodologies for results impact in IFAD-supported projects through a write-shop, TOT and scaling up.