

Document: EB 2011/103/R.7/Add.1
Agenda: 5
Date: 3 August 2011
Distribution: Public
Original: English

E



Enabling poor rural people
to overcome poverty

President's Report on the Implementation Status of Evaluation Recommendations and PRISMA management Actions

Volume II

Agreement at completion point Recommendations and follow-up actions taken by the Programme Management Department

Addendum

Note to Executive Board representatives

Focal points:

Technical questions:

Shyam Khadka
Senior Portfolio Manager
Tel.: +39 06 5459 2388
e-mail: s.khadka@ifad.org

Dispatch of documentation:

Deirdre McGrenra
Governing Bodies Officer
Tel: +39 06 5459 2374
e-mail: gb_office@ifad.org

Queries with respect to the response of the Office of Evaluation to the report should be addressed to:

Luciano Lavizzari
Director, Independent Office of Evaluation of IFAD
Tel.: +39 06 5459 2274
e-mail: l.lavizzari@ifad.org

Executive Board — 103rd Session
Rome, 14-15 September 2011

For: Information

Contents

| | |
|---|-----------|
| Abbreviations and acronyms | ii |
| A. Country Programme Evaluation | 1 |
| Argentina: Country Programme Evaluation | 1 |
| Mozambique: Country Programme Evaluation | 4 |
| B. Completion Evaluation | 6 |
| Benin: Roots and Tubers Development Programme | 6 |
| China: West Guangxi Poverty Alleviation Programme | 9 |
| Yemen: Raymah Area Development Programme | 13 |
| C. Corporate Level Evaluation | 17 |
| IFAD's capacity to promote pro-poor innovation and scaling-up | 21 |
| Joint Evaluation of AfDB and IFAD | 21 |

Abbreviations and acronyms

| | |
|----------|--|
| AfDB | African Development Bank |
| CAADP | Comprehensive Africa Agriculture Development Programme |
| CPT | Country Programme Team |
| EOP | Economic Opportunities Programme |
| ESA | Eastern and Southern Africa Division |
| FFT | food-for-training |
| FFW | food-for-work |
| FIP | Fisheries Investment Project |
| GIADP | Guangxi Integrated Agricultural Development Project |
| IMI | Innovation Mainstreaming Initiative |
| INTA | Agricultural Technology Institute |
| LAC | Latin America and the Caribbean Division |
| M&E | Monitoring and Evaluation |
| MAEP | Ministry of Agriculture, Livestock and Fisheries (Benin) |
| MAGyP | Ministry of Agriculture, Livestock and Fisheries (Argentina) |
| Mercosur | Southern Common Market |
| MIS | Management Information System |
| NEN | Near East and North Africa Division |
| OECD | Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development |
| PACER | Rural Economic Growth Support Project |
| PADER | Rural Development Support Programme |
| PAFIR | Rural Finance Support Program |
| PBAS | Performance-Based Allocation System |
| PDRT | Roots and Tuber Development Programme |
| PMD | Programme Management Department |
| PRODEAR | National Rural Areas Development Programme |
| PRODERI | Inclusive Rural Development Programme |
| PROMER | Rural Markets Promotion Programme |
| ProPESCA | Artisanal Fisheries Promotion Project |
| RB-COSOP | Results-Based Country Strategic Opportunities Paper |
| RCC | Rural Credit Cooperatives |
| RIMS | Results and Impact Management System |
| UCAR | Ministry of Agriculture's Unit for Rural Change (Argentina) |
| VIG | Village Implementation Groups (China) |
| WCA | Western and Central Africa Division |
| WGPAP | West Guangxi Poverty-Alleviation Project |

Categories used for the classification of agreement at completion point agreed actions

| | |
|-----|------------------------------|
| CE | completion evaluation |
| CLE | corporate level evaluation |
| CPE | country programme evaluation |
| SN | serial number |

Level

| | |
|------|---|
| IFAD | IFAD corporate level |
| REG | IFAD regional level |
| CTRY | IFAD country level |
| GOV | government authorities (national, local level and institutions) |
| PROJ | project |

Nature

| | |
|------|---|
| PLCY | policy |
| STRA | strategy development, including COSOPs and projects |
| OPER | operational and implementation |

Themes

| | |
|------|---|
| ASR | analysis, studies and researches |
| BEN | beneficiaries and stakeholders' participation and consultation |
| DEC | decentralization |
| DES | project design |
| DIA | policy dialogue |
| FLD | field presence |
| GDR | gender (including targeting to women) |
| GOV | governance |
| HR | human resources (management, recruitment) |
| INF | infrastructure (construction, contracting, management, supervision) |
| INN | innovation |
| KM | knowledge management |
| NRM | natural resource management |
| ORG | organizations, groups, institutions and collective approaches |
| PAR | partnership |
| PRM | private sector, market and enterprise development |
| PMA | project management and administration |
| RFI | rural finance |
| RME | results monitoring, evaluation |
| SCA | replication and scaling up |
| STRA | strategy |
| SUP | supervision |
| SUS | sustainability |
| TCB | training, capacity-building |
| TGT | targeting |

Agreement at completion point recommendations and follow-up action taken by the Programme Management Department

A. Country Programme Evaluation

| Country | Evaluation | S N | Level | Nature | Theme | Agreement at completion point (ACP) Agreed Action | PMD Follow Up |
|--|------------|-----|-------|--------|-------|--|--|
| Argentina: Country Programme Evaluation | | | | | | | |
| Argentina | CPE | 1 | CTRY | STR | STR | The Government and IFAD should jointly consider options to increase resource allocation, whether within the framework of the performance-based allocation system (PBAS) or through other sources, including co-financing from the private sector and multilateral agencies with rural lending programmes. | A new national programme is under design, which will almost double the size of IFAD programme in Argentina. Thanks to the Spanish Fund, IFAD will contribute USD 58 M to a USD 142 M programme to support family farming and vulnerable groups in the North-west and Center regions of the country. |
| Argentina | CPE | 2 | CTRY | STR | PMA | The increase in resource levels would be based on a commitment to improve portfolio performance (by significantly reducing delays). | The design mission is tackling one by one the causes of delay that can be reduced through project design and implementation arrangements. Political commitment to effectively address public policies and investments in favour of IFAD target groups appears to be slowly turning into a State, rather than a government policy. |
| Argentina | CPE | 3 | CTRY | STR | ASR | The increased resource levels would also be based on considering alternative definitions of rural populations to those used in official statistics to determine the percentage of rural population, one of the variables included in PBAS calculations. IFAD, in collaboration with regional partners (e.g. the United Nations Economic Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean, and the World Bank) and national partners (the National Statistics Institute [INDEC], MAGyP and the National Agricultural Technology Institute [INTA]), can contribute to opening a debate on statistical criteria for identifying rural population. | The debate is wide open and a recent World Bank study estimates that, by using OECD (Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development) criteria to classify urban-rural population, rural population in Argentina would triple. National statistics are unlikely to change in the short term, for internal reasons; however, scientific evidence that the Argentinean rural population is closer to 40% than to the currently declared 11% is already available. And even using current official statistics, over one million Argentinean rural inhabitants have one or more unmet basic needs and can be classified as poor. |
| Argentina | CPE | 4 | GOV | STR | STR | The national counterpart mobilization policy initiated with PRODEAR (National Rural Areas Development Programme) should continue, whereby the Government of Argentina finances more than 50 per cent of the project, as well as ensuring – where feasible and advantageous in terms of operating efficiency and generating synergies – a higher level of co-financing by | The PRODERI Programme (Inclusive Rural Development Programme) currently under design has the following financing structure: IFAD PBAS funds (USD 7.9 M); IFAD through the Spanish Trust Fund (USD 50 M); GOA counterpart funding (USD 58 M); and beneficiaries' contributions (USD 26 M). IFAD contribution, including resources from the Spanish |

| Country | Evaluation | S N | Level | Nature | Theme | Agreement at completion point (ACP) Agreed Action | PMD Follow Up |
|-----------|------------|-----|-------|--------|-------|---|---|
| | | | | | | other cooperation agencies. | Fund, is less than 50% of total programme cost. |
| Argentina | CPE | 5 | CTRY | STR | PMA | IFAD should ensure the highest quality in technical support during project design and implementation to accelerate the achievement of results and overall portfolio execution. | Final design will privilege TA selection mechanisms that reward good performance through beneficiaries' participation and cost-sharing |
| Argentina | CPE | 6 | CTRY | STR | INN | IFAD should reduce its thematic area of action and concentrate efforts on promoting and implementing a smaller number of activities with high innovation content. | The new programme only has two components (investment funds and TA/capacity building) to maximize simple and flexible implementation arrangements at central and provincial levels. |
| Argentina | CPE | 7 | CTRY | STR | INN | A dialogue should be undertaken with the Government and other key actors in the sub-region to identify innovations. | The main innovation area the new programme will face is to set up sustainable rural financial services. Gender mainstreaming and youth will also be at the center of PRODERI's development support |
| Argentina | CPE | 8 | CTRY | STR | KM | IFAD should continue to develop knowledge management (a vital area in terms of scaling up), both through projects and in coordination with IFAD regional programmes. | KM in Argentina will be facilitated by the coordinating function of the Ministry of Agriculture's Unit for Rural Change (UCAR), managing all externally-funded rural development projects countrywide. A new phase of FIDA MERCOSUR regional programme currently under design will focus on KM and South-South cooperation. |
| Argentina | CPE | 9 | CTRY | STR | RFI | IFAD should intensify its interaction with the Government of Argentina in connection with financing for the small-holder farming sector, which the Government is tackling in terms of access to resources. | Intense interaction is currently underway with Government of Argentina in this thematic area. The UCAR has recently recruited a rural financial services (RFS) expert to undertake a sector study. IFAD will integrate PRODERI's final design mission with at least one RFS expert. |
| Argentina | CPE | 10 | CTRY | STR | INN | Based on work done through horizontal cooperation between Argentina and Brazil and Argentina and Chile – both with IFAD support – the search for institutional innovations in support for small-holder agriculture could be pursued further. | Government of Argentina is aware of the need to achieve institutional innovation in this area. The REAF MERCOSUR has offered a platform where proposal for new legislation on RFS have been developed, discussed and approved as a recommendation to MERCOSUR member States' governments, including Argentina |
| Argentina | CPE | 11 | CTRY | STR | RFI | Two experiences in the Argentina rural context warrant consideration through a dialogue, exploring options with the private sector as well: (a) loans granted under trust funds managed by public or semipublic agencies to provide technical, commercial and financial assistance to small producers | PRODERI has a small RFS pilot element within its investment fund's component. This reimbursable fund is designed on the basis of the two "models" retained by the CPE's agreement at completion point. |
| Argentina | CPE | 12 | CTRY | STR | RFI | Two experiences in the Argentina rural context warrant consideration through a dialogue, exploring options with the private sector as well: (b) loans granted to producers' | The final design mission will intensify contacts with the private sector to seek new partnerships that can be tested in the early stages of programme |

| Country | Evaluation | S N | Level | Nature | Theme | Agreement at completion point (ACP) Agreed Action | PMD Follow Up |
|-----------|------------|-----|-------|--------|-------|--|--|
| | | | | | | cooperatives | implementation. |
| Argentina | CPE | 13 | CTRY | STR | TGT | Priority should continue to be given to areas where poor rural people are concentrated, including under national programmes such as the National Rural Areas Development Programme (PRODEAR). | The new programme is also national, but prioritises the Northern and Central regions of Argentina, starting from the North-western Provinces of Catamarca, Jujuy, La Rioja, Salta and Tucumán. |
| Argentina | CPE | 14 | CTRY | STR | DIA | IFAD should continue to allocate grants in Argentina to promote non-lending activities that are highly satisfactory in terms of policy dialogue and knowledge management | A regional conference on policies for small-scale farmers is being organized by the Latin American and Caribbean division for Sept. 2011 in Buenos Aires. Argentina will continue to benefit from a new phase of the FIDA MERCOSUR regional programme focusing on KM and South-South cooperation. |
| Argentina | CPE | 15 | CTRY | STR | PAR | In supporting its innovation agenda, IFAD should deepen its partnerships using grants with research institutions in the agriculture sector, and ensure connections with IFAD-funded projects in Argentina. | IFAD works in close cooperation with the Argentinean National Institute of Agro-zoo technical Technology (INTA) to ensure that research innovation reach IFAD projects and intended beneficiaries |
| Argentina | CPE | 16 | CTRY | STR | DES | IFAD should program and design its activities in Argentina with the active participation of all those government agencies involved in the design and implementation of IFAD-funded projects, both federal and provincial. In addition to its traditional partners, IFAD should ensure that consultative processes include, early on and systematically, the Ministry of Economy, the Chief of the Cabinet of Ministers and production ministries in beneficiary provinces. | IFAD mission has consulted with all its federal partners (Economy, Agriculture, Foreign Affairs and Chief of Ministers' Cabinet) in designing PRODERI. Several provinces have also been consulted through field visits and exchanges with Ministers, Secretaries and staff from local Min. of Production and Agriculture. Farmers' organizations have also been consulted. |
| Argentina | CPE | 17 | CTRY | STR | DEC | The CPE recommends decentralized execution for the projects funded by IFAD, by means of a model combining strong coordination at the national level with substantial provincial management supported by capacity-building where needed. | The new programme will be coordinated by the UCAR at federal level and implemented by the provinces, with UCAR direct support where needed and requested. |
| Argentina | CPE | 18 | CTRY | STR | DES | The CPE recommends that the coordination of federal, provincial and IFAD operating rules and procedures be an integral part of initial project design (prior to signing loan contracts) | Programme design already includes such operating rules and procedures that will be fine-tuned and completed in final design (May 2011), i.e. prior to loan signing (July-Sept. 2011). |
| Argentina | CPE | 19 | CTRY | STR | BEN | The CPE recommends that programmes and projects be designed and managed with broad participation by all provincial and federal stakeholders. | Detailed design mission has consulted with Ministers, Secretaries and high-ranking officials from the Provinces of La Rioja, Jujuy, Córdoba, Entre Ríos, Tucumán, Catamarca. Further consultations will take place at final design. |
| Argentina | CPE | 20 | CTRY | STR | FLD | It is recommended that IFAD and the Government, in reviewing their long-term relationship and in the context of a significant increase in the portfolio, undertake a | Although necessary, country presence is currently not foreseen, as Argentina is not in the list of country presences approved by the EB. LAC is currently |

| Country | Evaluation | S N | Level | Nature | Theme | Agreement at completion point (ACP) Agreed Action | PMD Follow Up |
|---|------------|-----|-------|--------|-------|--|---|
| | | | | | | discussion on ways of achieving a country presence. | strengthening its country team through the recruitment of a resident fiduciary expert as long-term consultant. |
| Mozambique: Country Programme Evaluation | | | | | | | |
| Mozambique | CPE | 1 | CTRY | STR | STR | Selection of new intervention areas and new value chains for support will be determined by agro-ecological potential and market opportunities. | Key criteria used for selection of intervention area in all recent IFAD-supported projects in Mozambique. Latest example: the artisanal fisheries promotion project (ProPESCA), built around the concept of growth-pole. Similar criteria will be used for the selection of value-chains for next agricultural project in the South. NB: these criteria have to be carefully balanced with targeting aspects (see point 8 and 10 below) |
| Mozambique | CPE | 2 | CTRY | STR | STR | Both the country strategy and programme design should strive to ensure the integration of the three strategic thrusts: (i) increasing surplus production and its value | These three strategic thrusts will continue to constitute the main pillars of the new COSOP under elaboration |
| Mozambique | CPE | 3 | CTRY | STR | PRM | (ii) facilitating market linkages and developing smallholders' organizations and agribusiness small and medium-sized enterprises | See above |
| Mozambique | CPE | 4 | CTRY | STR | RFI | (iii) enhancing the access to finance of poor rural people and SMEs | See above |
| Mozambique | CPE | 5 | CTRY | STR | FLD | IFAD and the Government should continue to work in strengthening those measures, mechanisms and systems that are already being put in place to enhance coordination, namely: (i) the already established Country Programme Team (CPT), with one of the main tasks to ensure coordination among different programmes. | CPT established and functional. Key driver of the COSOP elaboration process. Main forum for dialogue and coordination among different programmes. |
| Mozambique | CPE | 6 | CTRY | STR | PAR | (ii) the elaboration of specific mechanisms for coordination among various programmes and projects | Project design embeds coordination and complementarities: (i) rural finance support for PROMER (Rural Markets Promotion Programme) and ProPESCA (Artisanal Fisheries Promotion Project) managed by PAFIR (Rural Finance Support Programme); (ii) rural roads investment of PROMER and ProPESCA coordinated through relevant national authorities (Road Fund). |
| Mozambique | CPE | 7 | CTRY | STR | SUP | (iii) IFAD direct supervision and cross-use of project resources and expertise in supervision and implementation support, including joint planning and budgeting when appropriate. | All projects are directly supervised by IFAD. Increased exchange and cross-use of expertise among projects (e.g. M&E, financial management), although some limitations in this respect due to time constraints of project teams. Joint planning and budgeting already happening for complementary interventions (e.g. rural |

| Country | Evaluation | S N | Level | Nature | Theme | Agreement at completion point (ACP) Agreed Action | PMD Follow Up |
|------------|------------|-----|-------|--------|-------|---|--|
| | | | | | | | finance in PROMER and ProPESCA areas). |
| Mozambique | CPE | 8 | CTRY | STR | TGT | IFAD and the Government should pay more attention to targeting aspects in future interventions and thus develop a more articulated targeting approach in the context of the next COSOP to ensure that disadvantaged groups can also participate in economic development along approaches that are not targeting them exclusively but support their inclusion into development processes. | More emphasis is being given to targeting aspects in the new COSOP (under elaboration). Design of recent projects (PROMER and ProPESCA) has put a lot of emphasis on target group analysis and elaboration of targeting strategies. |
| Mozambique | CPE | 9 | CTRY | STR | TGT | There is a need to better reflect aspects related to gender equality and HIV/ AIDS | Gender aspects are being treated as part of the stronger emphasis on targeting aspects to ensure participation of disadvantaged groups. A specific grant on HIV-AIDS in coastal areas is being negotiated through BFFS (Belgian Fund for Food Security) in support of ProPESCA. |
| Mozambique | CPE | 10 | CTRY | STR | TGT | IFAD and the Government should examine the future geographic focus in light of the emerging data on poverty and the changes in trends of poverty incidence and severity and the economic opportunities and potential. | Latest household survey results have been released end of last year. New COSOP is taking them into account for selection of intervention areas. NB: need to balance poverty focus with aspects related to economic opportunities and potential (which is not always easy). |
| Mozambique | CPE | 11 | CTRY | STR | STR | It is essential that IFAD, like all other partners, continue supporting the emerging mainstream frameworks and institutions as it cannot afford to only focus on disadvantaged areas and socio-economic groups without building the mainstream systems to hook them to, thus ensuring a pro-poor conducive environment. | Continued support in mainstream framework in the three main sectors where IFAD is engaged: agriculture, fisheries and rural finance. |
| Mozambique | CPE | 12 | CTRY | STR | INN | A more structured approach for innovation should be explored in the next COSOP, to identify opportunities for a more systematic identification of priority areas for innovation as well as mechanisms and processes for replication and scaling up. Dedicated resources and efforts should be devoted to those aspects that are essential for replication and scaling up innovations, such as in particular knowledge management. | Being done as part of the new COSOP elaboration. KM increasingly assuming more importance: (i) allocation of project resources to build up capacity of KM in implementing agencies; (ii) strengthening of M&E systems as mechanisms to identify opportunities for innovation and scaling up; (iii) establishment of M&E officers sub-group to share on KM and M&E. |
| Mozambique | CPE | 13 | PROJ | OPER | INN | Efforts should be made to promote project implementation units as "temporary change process tools", owned by the implementing government partners, with the ultimate goal of integrating changes and innovations into government structures and programmes. | No parallel Project units. All units are fully embedded in and owned by Government lead agencies |
| Mozambique | CPE | 14 | CTRY | STR | PAR | IFAD and the Government should, in the future, explore | Being explored as part of the new COSOP elaboration. |

| Country | Evaluation | S N | Level | Nature | Theme | Agreement at completion point (ACP) Agreed Action | PMD Follow Up |
|------------|------------|-----|-------|--------|-------|---|---|
| | | | | | | options for gradually assigning increased implementation responsibility for programme components to private and civil society organisations. | Extensive engagement of producers' organizations (farmers and fishers) in the elaboration process. Role of these organizations been thoroughly discussed, although there is an acknowledged need to build their capacity for it (see ACP). |
| Mozambique | CPE | 15 | CTRY | STR | PAR | The right balance will have to be found between the need to further engage these partners in programme implementation with higher responsibility and the reality about the actual capacity of existing potential partners in terms of the skills and expertise required for this purpose. | This is not an action, but rather a "caveat" for action 14 above, and is being considered. |
| Mozambique | CPE | 16 | CTRY | OPER | ORG | IFAD should play a role in promoting producers' organizations in agriculture and fishery to ensure that they can better respond to the needs of their members and that they can be further involved in project implementation. | Given high importance in the new COSOP and being done as part of two specific projects (PROMER and PropESCA). However, IFAD does not necessarily have the most suitable investment tools in this respect (loans to Governments). |
| Mozambique | CPE | 17 | CTRY | STR | FLD | Particular emphasis should be given to the strengthening of IFAD's country presence, including considering possible out posting of professional positions from IFAD Headquarters in Rome. | Host Country Agreement signed in February 2011. Associate CPM (APO) outposted in Mozambique since March 2011. New Programme Assistant locally based being recruited (expected by mid-2011). IFAD Country Officer being issued an IFAD contract from April 2011. |

B. Completion Evaluation

| Country | Evaluation | S N | Level | Nature | Theme | Agreement at completion point (ACP) Agreed Action | PMD Follow Up |
|--|------------|-----|-------|--------|-------|---|---|
| Benin: Roots and Tubers Development Programme | | | | | | | |
| Benin | CE | 1 | CTRY | OPER | ASR | The evaluation recommended that thematic studies should be conducted on roots and tubers development projects cofinanced by IFAD (a thematic evaluation of the performance and impact of such projects in Western and Central Africa. The evaluation should pay particular attention to the impact that recent technological, socio-economic and institutional changes in the root and tuber subsectors have had on the living conditions of the poorest active rural populations and on the environment.). | The challenge for Roots and Tubers is that those are mainly produced by subsistence farmers. Recent technological advances in Roots and Tubers have had limited impact on the poor. One hypothesis is that, the demand of improved varieties is low because it's unlikely that farmers will be able to recover the investment made to improve production. Furthermore, Roots and Tubers are commodities with very thin margins. To be attractive, investments in Roots and Tubers need to be done on a very large scale. At this time, there seems to be little interest to investigate these issues. |
| Benin | CE | 2 | CTRY | OPER | ASR | The evaluation recommended that thematic studies should be conducted on targeting strategies used in | The current targeting strategy is to actively seek the poor in rural areas, with some productive assets (land, |

| Country | Evaluation | S N | Level | Nature | Theme | Agreement at completion point (ACP) Agreed Action | PMD Follow Up |
|---------|------------|-----|-------|--------|-------|--|--|
| | | | | | | projects cofinanced by IFAD (either as a thematic evaluation or as a learning theme for the ARRI. The analysis should cover the extent to which targeting mechanisms in project design (i) are clearly defined, (ii) are properly implemented, (iii) enable reaching the poorest and most vulnerable, (iv) contribute to lowering the cost of intervention per direct beneficiary). | skills, willingness to learn, etc.) to participate in IFAD's programmes, without excluding the poorest. No thematic studies have been conducted to target the poorest because the poor targeted continue to be extremely vulnerable to poverty and subject to fall deeper in poverty if not targeted by our programmes. |
| Benin | CE | 3 | CTRY | STR | INN | The evaluation recommended innovating on approaches and technologies designed in favour of the poorest roots and tubers producers and processors, to develop their potential for contributing to agricultural and rural development, and to play a direct role in improving their living conditions. It was recommended that these approaches should be part of the implementation strategy for Benin's National Policy on Roots and Tubers Promotion. | The MAEP (Ministry of Agriculture, Livestock and Fisheries) is currently examining how to address the needs of the poorest roots and tuber producers and processors so they can develop their potential for contributing to agricultural and rural development to play a direct role in improving their living conditions. Ways forward include partnerships and thematic studies. |
| Benin | CE | 4 | CTRY | STR | TGT | The evaluation recommended developing an effective approach to target the poorest roots and tubers producers and processors. It suggested that project monitoring and evaluation systems should be used to ensure that the target group is actually being reached. | Many of the PDRT (Roots and Tubers Development Programme) activities have been incorporated in the PADER (Rural Development Support Programme). The current targeting strategy is to focus and institutionalize the learning with the existing beneficiaries but not to expand it to new target groups. This recommendation is being evaluated and will be reviewed during follow-up missions. |
| Benin | CE | 5 | CTRY | OPER | TGT | The evaluation recommended actively combining support for production and processing within each of the disadvantaged households, which would entail working simultaneously with the men and women from the same household. | Many of the PDRT activities have been incorporated in the PADER. This specific aspect will be looked into during the upcoming supervision missions. This recommendation is being evaluated and will be reviewed during follow-up missions. |
| Benin | CE | 6 | CTRY | OPER | TGT | The evaluation recommended developing and promoting specific ways of ensuring secure access to land for the targeted producers (those with very little land), to enable them to invest in soil fertility without the risk that they would suddenly lose their land | This is being discussed at the national level as part of the Millennium Challenge. |
| Benin | CE | 7 | CTRY | OPER | TGT | The evaluation recommended promoting private services that are accessible to the poorest producers and processors, such as the supply of inputs (plant material, fertilizer etc.) and access to credit, which are essential for intensification of roots and tubers production | This recommendation is being evaluated and will be reviewed during follow-up missions. |
| Benin | CE | 8 | CTRY | OPER | TGT | It was suggested to establish processing workshops for disadvantaged women, which would be collectively | This recommendation is being evaluated and will be reviewed during follow-up missions. |

| Country | Evaluation | S N | Level | Nature | Theme | Agreement at completion point (ACP) Agreed Action | PMD Follow Up |
|---------|------------|-----|-------|--------|-------|---|---|
| | | | | | | owned but individually used, and technically designed to optimize labour productivity and respect both women processors' working conditions and the environment. | |
| Benin | CE | 9 | CTRY | OPER | TGT | It was recommended to facilitate market access for the poorest, for example by organizing small-scale producers and processors into marketing associations equipped with storehouses in proximity to markets, support the establishment of a (private) demand and price information network, and develop relationships with the various actors in roots and tubers value chains so that ways of lowering transaction costs could be jointly sought. | Systems will be put in place to ensure that the poorest are not left out. |
| Benin | CE | 10 | CTRY | OPER | TGT | It was recommended to combine the data generated by the market price collection and monitoring system coordinated by the National Food Security Support Office with those coming from the production and productivity monitoring system piloted by the Roots and Tubers Information System, in order to carry out prospective analysis on changes in supply and demand for roots and tubers products. Such analysis should then be used by public-sector technical services to advise roots and tubers producers and processors on market prospects, not to push them towards speculation but to sensitize them to trends and risks relating to changes in markets and prices | The recommendation is currently under review at the MAEP. Follow-ups will be initiated during upcoming supervision missions. |
| Benin | CE | 11 | CTRY | OPER | TGT | The evaluation recommended helping rural men and women working in the subsector to organize to defend their interests, in order to obtain better working conditions (proper pay, working hours, safety and hygiene, job security etc.). | This recommendation is being evaluated and will be reviewed during follow-up missions. |
| Benin | CE | 12 | CTRY | STR | SUS | The evaluation recommended ensuring the sustainability of results and scaling up of innovations promoted by PDRT. This could be done in the framework of ongoing and future IFAD-financed projects, following the programme approach initiated under PADER. | This recommendation is being addressed with the transfer of many of the PDRT activities to the PACER. Such as the use of improved varieties created under the PDRT project and the financing of improved varieties. |
| Benin | CE | 13 | CTRY | OPER | PRM | The evaluation recommended strengthening and rationalizing the production chain for plant material of improved varieties and expanding it to other roots and tubers. | The recommendation is currently under review at the MAEP. Follow-ups will be conducted during upcoming supervision missions. |
| Benin | CE | 14 | CTRY | OPER | SUS | The evaluation recommended continuing to disseminate sustainable production technologies for roots and tubers | This recommendation is being evaluated. Follow-up discussions will be conducted during upcoming |

| Country | Evaluation | S N | Level | Nature | Theme | Agreement at completion point (ACP) Agreed Action | PMD Follow Up |
|--|------------|-----|-------|--------|-------|--|---|
| | | | | | | (technical fiches in local languages, group training, demonstrations, radio broadcasts etc.) | supervision missions. |
| Benin | CE | 15 | CTRY | OPER | PRM | The evaluation recommended improving quality management and marketing organization for cassava flour. To this end, greater stress should be placed on setting up production units based on the ALITECH model, i.e. small or medium enterprises equipped with minimum equipment, such as a grater, press and gas dryer or solar tents. | This recommendation is being evaluated. Follow-up discussions will be conducted during upcoming supervision missions. |
| Benin | CE | 16 | CTRY | OPER | PRM | The evaluation recommended continuing to work on developing quality standards for roots and tubers products and putting in place a quality control system and a product traceability and certification system | This recommendation is being evaluated. Follow-up discussions will be conducted during upcoming supervision missions. |
| Benin | CE | 17 | CTRY | OPER | ORG | The evaluation recommended encouraging producer and processor groups to evolve towards service cooperatives, on the basis of their members' objectives (in order to facilitate access to inputs, information, credit, markets etc.) or lobbying associations (in order to strengthen their members' bargaining power vis à-vis public and private service providers). In the long term, if the need is felt within these grass-roots organizations, they should be helped to form federations. | This recommendation is being evaluated. Follow-up discussions will be conducted during upcoming supervision missions. |
| Benin | CE | 18 | CTRY | OPER | PMA | The evaluation recommended replicating the results-based payment model for public and private service providers in the context of other IFAD-financed projects. | This recommendation is being evaluated. Follow-up discussions will be conducted during upcoming supervision missions. |
| China: West Guangxi Poverty Alleviation Programme | | | | | | | |
| China | CE | 1 | CTRY | STR | TGT | The design of future IFAD funded rural development projects in China should continue to be responsive to the multidimensional character of poverty and the growing expertise of national stakeholders in this kind of operations | The ongoing design of the Guangxi Integrated Agricultural Development Project (GIADP), which will be submitted to the Dec 2011 Executive Board, responds to this recommendation by responding to the needs of the target groups in the project area by aiming for multi-sectoral support to the poor, including: improving the access of the poor to productive assets, safe drinking water, information and technical services, and remunerative markets; diversifying their income sources through development of agro-products. The composition of design team is mainly composed of national experts, six out of a total of seven experts. The design of the project is a result of close consultations with national, provincial and county stakeholders, and representatives of |

| Country | Evaluation | S N | Level | Nature | Theme | Agreement at completion point (ACP) Agreed Action | PMD Follow Up |
|---------|------------|-----|-------|--------|-------|---|--|
| | | | | | | | beneficiary households including the poor. Out of 8 counties to be covered by the project in the province, 4 were thoroughly visited and face-to-face consultations and interviews held with beneficiary groups, private sector players, and local government authorities at country, prefecture, township, both "administrative" and "natural" village levels. |
| China | CE | 2 | CTRY | OPER | TGT | Targeting of project townships should continue to be based on factual indicators. In projects focused on service provision, all villages within one township should be included in the project, and natural villages more clearly identified. | For service provision, GIADP targets all villages within a project township. This is ensured by applying inclusive targeting approaches, whilst focused targeting is maintained for specific project activities at the household level to ensure the benefit and the participation of the poor. "Natural" villages, several of which form an administrative village, are selected in accordance with their potential to optimise their benefit from project investments, while taking account of the equitable distribution of the community wealth built. |
| China | CE | 3 | CTRY | STR | TGT | A transparent assessment of the special needs of the various ethnic minority groups is critical. | A social development expert is included in the design team for the GIADP to focus on analyzing the constraints and needs of the poor and ethnic minorities in the selected project areas. The design of the project will thus take into account the needs of ethnic minorities in the project area. Project support activities, especially those related to socio-economic enhancement, are designed to be inclusive towards the ethnic minority groups, and special and repeated support will be provided where applicable. |
| China | CE | 4 | CTRY | STR | BEN | The design process should replicate WGPAP's good practice of strong involvement of local expertise at all levels, including from the anticipated target population. | The proposed GIADP is being designed by fully consulting with local technicians, officers and target groups. (Also refer to follow up on CE1) |
| China | CE | 5 | CTRY | OPER | DES | The design process should include the joint calculation of ERRs at appraisal, and a set of guidelines that enable projects to revisit the ERR calculation at completion based on own expertise. | The economic analysis for GIADP will be done taking this into account, including making provisions for the subsequent re-calculation of the ERRs at completion as applicable. |
| China | CE | 6 | CTRY | STR | DES | In settings where food-for-work (FFW) and food-for-training (FFT) is deemed essential for broad participation and coverage, a second generation solution should be devised with the Chinese authorities, for instance by linking donor-funded projects with government programs for infrastructure and human capacity building. | After the completion of WGPAP, the government has continued financing the development of infrastructure and training of farmers in rural areas. Therefore, no food-for work and food-for training is foreseen under GIADP to be funded from WFP or other donors. GIADP will be co-financed by the government (National and |

| Country | Evaluation | S N | Level | Nature | Theme | Agreement at completion point (ACP) Agreed Action | PMD Follow Up |
|---------|------------|-----|-------|--------|-------|---|---|
| | | | | | | | Provincial) and IFAD only. |
| China | CE | 7 | CTRY | STR | PAR | Project partnerships should extend over the boundaries of provincial and local government. | Partnerships have been built based on convergence of interests and mutual leverage. There were not and will not be limits on territory or institutional boundaries. |
| China | CE | 8 | CTRY | OPER | BEN | VIGs or analogous bodies at village level should not only play a role for planning and monitoring purposes, but should be strengthened in their core management capacity, with special regard to service delivery functions and equitable gender representation in positions of responsibility. | VIGs are temporary grassroots organisations set up to assist the implementation of projects, such as GIADP. The core members of such VIGs, who are in fact the village committee members, will be trained to enhance their internal management capacity, whilst participating in the planning and monitoring of project implementation. VIGs also ensure the functions of facilitating the organization of beneficiary training, encouraging mutual learning and assistance among beneficiary households. VIGs include at least one representative of the local women's federation and one or two female villagers, who all benefit from capacity building activities to be conducted under the project(s). |
| China | CE | 9 | CTRY | OPER | PAR | Partnerships with provincial Rural Credit Cooperatives (RCC) networks should be put on a completely new footing, by taking into account the ongoing reform and by agreeing on a set of information to be shared that is conducive to a real-time assessment of loan portfolios and banking performance indicators in general. | Rural finance service partnering with Rural Credit Cooperatives (RCC) is not foreseen in the GIADP, since there is no micro-finance component foreseen. But in future projects in the country where rural financial service provision will be considered, the partnership with the RCC network will be positively considered, take into account the learning from IFAD's experience in this sector during the 2005-2010 COSOP in China. |
| China | CE | 10 | CTRY | STR | DIA | Key areas of policy dialogue should be determined systematically and given due and documented attention over the project implementation period. | Key areas of policy dialogue will be included as part of the knowledge management activities under GIADP and they will be further developed and documented during implementation. Policy dialogue has also been given more emphasis in the forthcoming RB-COSOP (2011-2015) and will be further incorporated in the implementation of the China country programme. |
| China | CE | 11 | CTRY | STR | INN | Building on the orientations of the 2005 COSOP, new IFAD-funded projects should put significantly more emphasis on innovation and its promotion | Innovation and its promotion are emphasized in the design process of GIADP, as well as in the RB-COSOP being finalised for EB consideration during 2011. Such efforts will however build on the successful implementation of past projects and be in line with the country's development priorities. |
| China | CE | 12 | CTRY | STR | INN | Ambitions of the project partners regarding innovations should be screened systematically from formulation | Innovations are being screened through in-depth discussions with local experts/technicians, as well as |

| Country | Evaluation | S N | Level | Nature | Theme | Agreement at completion point (ACP) Agreed Action | PMD Follow Up |
|---------|------------|-----|-------|--------|-------|---|--|
| | | | | | | stage onwards and be periodically reassessed. | local authorities, during the design process of GIADP. Only those innovations, which are regarded as effective in reducing poverty and in improving rural livelihoods in the project area, such as renewable energy sources (biogas digesters) and marking linkages through cooperatives, are being taken into account. |
| China | CE | 13 | CTRY | STR | INN | Particular attention should be devoted to the identification of local sources of innovation and their mobilization during project implementation. | Innovations for GIADP are formed through absorbing the contributions by local experts based on the characteristics of poverty in the project area, which will be a continuing process. |
| China | CE | 14 | CTRY | STR | INN | Innovations that exist or emerge in the global context should be made available to IFAD-funded projects more pro-actively, possibly also via IFAD grants. | Three new grants are being considered for supporting various innovations or global goods. They include a GEF (Global Environment Facility, now Global Environment and Climate Change Unit) grant plus two large country grants, one for promoting south-south cooperation and the other to support the shared sustainable use of common natural resources between China and Mongolia. These efforts will be further strengthened through future projects to be included under the RB-COSOP being currently designed. |
| China | CE | 15 | CTRY | STR | INN | Priority areas should encompass innovations that respond to global challenges, such as food security, soil fertility, alternative energies and climate change. | GIADP responds to this recommendation by focusing on innovations that will improve food security through increased productivity, improve soil fertility through field drainage, and develop alternative energy by scaling-up of biogas. Increasing resilience to global challenges such as marketing factors and climate/environment challenges will be included as one priority in the new COSOP. |
| China | CE | 16 | CTRY | STR | RME | New IFAD-funded projects should take stock from the accumulated experience of the WGPAP and actively foster a quantum leap in the state-of-the-art of M&E and MIS, with the aim to make advanced M&E and MIS methods a mainstream feature in China. | GIADP promotes the development of M&E to MIS. Proposals are afoot to develop a more robust M&E and MIS system and guidelines for the projects and the country programme as a whole. Work on these has been planned to start during 2011, using one of the ongoing projects as a starting point. |
| China | CE | 17 | CTRY | STR | RME | The generic requirements of an overarching, yet concise, M&E system for multidimensional poverty-alleviation projects in marginal rural areas should be defined, best in a joint effort between national expertise and IFAD resources. | Recently-improved practices of M&E systems developed through other projects in the country will be introduced for GIADP. It will further define the responsibilities of the M&E system of each level, including the monitoring of targeting, beneficiaries by gender, and the assessment of outcomes and impact through RIMS (Results and Impact Management |

| Country | Evaluation | S N | Level | Nature | Theme | Agreement at completion point (ACP) Agreed Action | PMD Follow Up |
|---|------------|-----|-------|--------|-------|---|--|
| | | | | | | | System) and benchmark surveys. These practices require trainings for PMUs' (Project Management Unit) staff and M&E officers before the implementation start-up of the project. A Multi-Poverty Assessment Tool was also developed with assistance from IFAD, which will be made available for use under the project. |
| China | CE | 18 | CTRY | STR | RME | The basic architecture of a real-time MIS, based upon such M&E requirements, should be designed in a way that it can be used for a wide array of IFAD-funded projects, in China and possibly also elsewhere. | A country programme wide MIS is being considered to go beyond the GIADP, which if successful will be incorporated in an IFAD wide system and compatible with Government system. A special effort will be needed to initiate this in close consultation with government and key partner agencies. Consequently, it is likely to take time to develop it fully. Meanwhile, project level MIS will be set as implementation progresses so that they can eventually become a sub-system of the overall country programme one. This will be long term plan. |
| China | CE | 19 | CTRY | STR | RME | In the context of designing a real-time MIS also, a partnership between national expertise and IFAD would be advisable. | National expert(s) are being contracted to develop a country programme MIS in addition to specific MIS for some of the projects that need the support. |
| Yemen: Raymah Area Development Programme | | | | | | | |
| Yemen | CE | 1 | CTRY | STR | DES | In the design of future projects, it is important that objectives and activities are commensurate with the institutional, social and economic capabilities of the country. In this regard, sufficient administrative resources should be allocated by the management to ensure that adequate analytic work can be undertaken during project design in Yemen that would enable a thorough understanding of the country's policy and institutional environment. | <p>The projects being designed under the 2010-2012 PBAS cycle (Economic Opportunities Programme (EOP), Fisheries Investment Project (FIP), YemenInvest-Rural Employment Programme) are already based on an understanding of the country's policies, in light of its institutional, social and economic capabilities. More details in project design documents (Design Main Report and Working Papers).</p> <p>It should be noted that incremental budgetary resources for further research and analysis during the design process are not available, particularly in light of the sharpened focus on efficiency.</p> <p>The Quality Enhancement and Quality Assurance reviews of the EOP and FIP did not express any concerns regarding project consistency with the institutional, social and economic capabilities of the country.</p> |
| Yemen | CE | 2 | CTRY | STR | NRM | Given the concerns for depletion of underground water resources in Yemen, the environmental impact | The need to consider eventual environmental implications during design is already well established |

| Country | Evaluation | S N | Level | Nature | Theme | Agreement at completion point (ACP) Agreed Action | PMD Follow Up |
|---------|------------|-----|-------|--------|-------|---|---|
| | | | | | | implications of IFAD-financed operations and the proposed coping strategies should be clearly articulated in design. | in IFAD's Environmental and Social Assessment Guidelines and in project design procedures. At country level, concerns about groundwater depletion are already informing national development and poverty reduction strategies. The EOP focuses on improving water use efficiency in irrigation by introducing water harvesting infrastructure and drip irrigation. The project "will not support new shallow wells/boreholes" (MR #111). Where groundwater is already in use and the settlement will continue to depend on it for irrigation, an environmental study will be carried out, even when not legally required in feasibility study. Reliability of the source and potential risk of additional withdrawals in connection with potential shifts in land use will be assessed (MR #112). Availability of water is a key settlement selection criteria in the targeting strategy (MR #13). With respect to coping strategies, EOP will support the adaptation of weather index-based insurance to enable poor farmers to transfer risk of drought to insurers. The FIP and YemenInvest will promote sustainable economic opportunities in sectors with low water intensity (fisheries, natural stone, textiles). The main use of freshwater in fisheries is in ice production and fish processing. Where ice plants will be built, an assessment of available freshwater reserves will be undertaken; where sufficient freshwater is not available, saline or seawater may be used to make ice. In the natural stone sector, water is used to cool cutting equipment used in quarrying/processing. An EIA will be undertaken in advance of any investment, and an assessment of impact on available freshwater resources will be included. Water recycling systems will be developed to reduce water use. |
| Yemen | CE | 3 | CTRY | OPER | NRM | Construction of large infrastructure projects should systematically include comprehensive and rigorous environmental and social impact assessments, before activities are commissioned. | Environmental impact assessment of infrastructure projects is already required by national law in Yemen. Rigorous environmental and social impact assessment is already a requirement of IFAD project design, in compliance with the Environmental and Social Assessment Guidelines. Both the EOP and FIP have undergone rigorous environmental and social impact assessment during the design process. During implementation, social and environmental impact will |

| Country | Evaluation | S N | Level | Nature | Theme | Agreement at completion point (ACP) Agreed Action | PMD Follow Up |
|---------|------------|-----|-------|--------|-------|---|---|
| | | | | | | | be assessed for each infrastructure sub-project during the feasibility study phase, jointly with local communities. |
| Yemen | CE | 4 | CTRY | STR | PRM | It is recommended that opportunities be further developed to involve more actively producers associations and other value chain actors in the provision of such services to the rural poor. | It is already planned under the EOP and FIP that producers' associations and other value chain actors (primarily processors and exporters) will provide services to small producers. In particular, technical extension and business advice will be provided to small producers and their associations by supply chain managers linked to processors/exporters, on the basis of contractual arrangements. The supply chain managers will be cost-shared by the project, on declining basis. |
| Yemen | CE | 5 | CTRY | STR | DES | Project objectives should be achievable and measurable | This is already required under the RB-COSOPs and RB project design guidelines. The objectives of the EOP, FIP and YemenInvest are, respectively, to: (i) create sustainable economic opportunities for poor women and men in programme areas; (ii) create sustainable economic opportunities for poor women and men in fishing communities; (iii) create sustainable and diversified employment opportunities for unemployed and underemployed women and men in rural areas. In accordance with design requirements, each project is based on a results-based Logframe and contains key performance indicators and monitoring mechanisms in compliance with RIMS. |
| Yemen | CE | 6 | CTRY | OPER | SUP | Project supervision should pay attention to results, in addition to achievement of physical and financial targets. | Under the supervision guidelines, project supervision processes already focus on assessing results (to the extent information is available), in addition to the review of physical and financial performance. Under the EOP and FIP, a three-layered results-based M&E system will be implemented by the EOF: (i) outputs – physical and financial inputs, actions and outputs; (ii) outcomes – use of outputs and measuring their benefits at beneficiary and value chain level; (iii) impact – measuring results and impact in comparison with objectives. |
| Yemen | CE | 7 | CTRY | OPER | SUP | Implementation of supervision recommendations should be monitored and followed up in a timely manner. | It is already standard practice for supervision missions to provide recommendations and for subsequent missions to follow-up on their implementation. Action plans developed by supervision missions are also followed up at divisional level. A number of Mid-Term |

| Country | Evaluation | S N | Level | Nature | Theme | Agreement at completion point (ACP) Agreed Action | PMD Follow Up |
|---------|------------|-----|-------|--------|-------|--|---|
| | | | | | | | Reviews of projects have recently been completed, specifically Dhamar Participatory Rural Development Project – November 2009, Community Based Rural Infrastructure Project – April-May 2010, Al-Dhala Community Resources Management Project – Oct 2010. The recommendations of the Dhamar and community based rural infrastructure projects MTRs were followed up during a mission in July 2010 and those of the Al-Dhala project during a follow-up mission in January 2011. It should be noted however that limited supervision budgets necessarily limit the ability of the CPM to field follow-up missions. |
| Yemen | CE | 8 | CTRY | OPER | RME | Project level monitoring and evaluation systems should be well-resourced | Provision of proper resources for project M&E is recommended in the IFAD Guide to Project M&E. In the design of the EOP, FIP and YemenInvest specific budgets are allocated for M&E activities. The staff of the Economic Opportunities Fund will include a Senior M&E Officer and a M&E Assistant. |
| Yemen | CE | 9 | CTRY | OPER | RME | Baseline surveys should be undertaken during design or at the outset of execution | Baseline surveys need to be undertaken by project staff (or outsourced) at an early stage of implementation, not by foreign experts during design. It should also be noted that design budgets do not include funding for baseline surveys. In the EOP, FIP and YemenInvest, baseline surveys are planned during the first year of implementation, as is recommended in IFAD's Guide to Project M&E. |
| Yemen | CE | 10 | REG | STR | STR | During the annual portfolio review process, IFAD Management should ensure that 'projects at risk' such as RADP are thoroughly discussed and an action plan devised to ensure better performance in the future. | There are currently no 'at-risk' projects in the Yemen portfolio. In any case, the Project Status Reports and internal portfolio review process already require action planning and close follow up for any projects at risk. |
| Yemen | CE | 11 | CTRY | OPER | SUS | In the context of small-scale infrastructure development activities, attention should be given to building management capabilities among beneficiaries and their groups for operations and maintenance. | Producers' associations are central to the value chain development strategies of the EOP, FIP and YemenInvest. Under the EOP, producers' associations will be involved in small-scale infrastructure at all stages (design, construction, supervision, use). At least 3 members of the relevant PA will accompany the supervising engineer during supervision of construction and will receive ongoing training to enable assumption of full responsibility for Operation & Maintenance. Under FIP, professional management will |

| Country | Evaluation | S N | Level | Nature | Theme | Agreement at completion point (ACP) Agreed Action | PMD Follow Up |
|---------|------------|-----|-------|--------|-------|--|--|
| | | | | | | | be contracted for the O&M of integrated fish landing complexes, on the basis of an arrangement in which fishers' organisation are the majority shareholders. The capabilities of fishers' organisations to take on this role will be strengthened. Supply chain managers will also work with the staff and management of the integrated landing complexes to enable them to comply with international food safety standards. |
| Yemen | CE | 12 | CTRY | STR | SUS | Exit strategies should be developed early on the process, well ahead of project closure. | This is already required by IFAD's project design guidelines. An exit strategy is already defined for the EOP and FIP, during the design phase. |
| Yemen | CE | 13 | GOV | OPER | PRM | The Government of Yemen should consider including in its own development plans the completion of the road from Beit al Faqih to Al Hadia, which is critical to further improve connectivity, access to markets, and communication. | The Government of Yemen needs to balance both very high levels of need and severe budget constraints. Long term strategic priorities do include improvement of road infrastructure and 10,973km of road are currently under construction. The Beit al Faqih to Al Hadia road will also be considered. |

C. Corporate Level Evaluation

| Country | Evaluation | S N | Level | Nature | Theme | Agreement at completion point (ACP) Agreed Action | PMD Follow Up |
|--|------------|-----|-------|--------|-------|---|---|
| IFAD's capacity to promote pro-poor innovation and scaling-up | | | | | | | |
| IFAD | CLE | 1 | IFAD | PLCY | INN | Management fully supports the idea of setting a clearer innovation agenda. IFAD Management has, however, some concerns regarding the setting of the agenda using a "big bet" approach. Although the evaluation report does not see this approach as a substitute for the current broad-based innovation approach, care must be taken to ensure that this does not happen in practice. | IFAD has developed a corporate innovation agenda (draft of March 16, 2011, drafted by the office of the Strategy and Knowledge Management, SKM, approved by the Knowledge Management and innovation core group, and currently under discussion in PMD). The agenda provides a framework to i) strategically align IFAD resources to specific innovation priority areas/themes to promote 'intensive and focused (corporate) efforts' with attention to IFADs comparative advantage and high probability for innovative breakthroughs and ii) give strategic corporate guidance to the broad based "let a thousand flowers bloom" model - which currently defines IFAD's approach to innovation. |
| IFAD | CLE | 2 | IFAD | STR | INN | Management views the big bet approach as complementary to the current approach in order to allow a focus on those areas where it is generally acknowledged that IFAD faces major challenges across | The agenda also outlines the "Big Bets" to be focused on (while not viewing this as a complete substitute for the current broad-based approach). Preliminary assessments suggest three possible emerging areas of |

| Country | Evaluation | S N | Level | Nature | Theme | Agreement at completion point (ACP) Agreed Action | PMD Follow Up |
|---------|------------|-----|-------|--------|-------|--|---|
| | | | | | | regions, countries or in specific sectors. In such cases, IFAD would publicize these challenges to a large global audience. | focus for IFAD innovation efforts, namely: (i) Collective action and property rights for the transformation of smallholder farming. (ii) Building Human capabilities: the synergies between Rural Entrepreneurship, Gender and Youth. (iii) Sustainable agricultural intensification. In terms of process, IFAD will build on regional grant strategies, learn from broader consultations (including those organised by IFAD such as the Smallholder Conference in January 2011), clarify and then prioritise challenges. |
| IFAD | CLE | 3 | IFAD | STR | INN | IFAD would scout systematically for better solutions. | A strategy for scouting for better solutions and developing a "pipeline of ideas" has been outlined in the innovation agenda. The steps involved include: extracting value from IFAD operations; widely publicizing challenges; systematic leveraging of research and development partnerships; organizing a Global Rural Innovation Exhibit and Conference to encourage sharing and cross-learning between rural innovators and other stakeholders. |
| IFAD | CLE | 4 | IFAD | STR | INN | IFAD would provide the required institutional and financial support. | This is already underway; a number of knowledge-sharing initiatives have been undertaken at the institutional level (also see below). More than 100 staff from HQs and in the field have been exposed to/trained in Creative Problem Solving under funding of the IMI. In the same vein, 39 IMI (Innovation Mainstreaming Initiative) bid winner have been directly involved in carrying out an entire innovation process over two years on average. |
| IFAD | CLE | 5 | IFAD | PLCY | INN | Management recognizes, in particular, the need to use IFAD grants in a more strategic manner to support such big bet approaches. | The agenda sets out a corporate framework to increase the impact of grants. Consultations will build on the regional grant strategies to either corroborate the indicated grand challenges or suggest new areas of intervention. |
| IFAD | CLE | 6 | IFAD | STR | SCA | Successful solutions could be scaled up in IFAD's own programmes as well as in those of its partners. | Scaling up has been treated as "mission critical" in PMD; financing the agenda includes options such as treating the IMI resources as flexible resource pool/'seed money' for incubating ideas which will feed into the grants to scale up some of the ideas incubated by the IMI. An institutional review on scaling up in IFAD has been conducted by the Wolfensohn Centre for Development and findings were presented to IFAD. It found scaling up successful development initiatives |

| Country | Evaluation | S N | Level | Nature | Theme | Agreement at completion point (ACP) Agreed Action | PMD Follow Up |
|---------|------------|-----|-------|--------|-------|--|---|
| | | | | | | | as a key to development (and aid) effectiveness and to achieving the Millennium Development Goals. |
| IFAD | CLE | 7 | IFAD | PLCY | SCA | IFAD will strengthen its knowledge management in order to contribute to scaling up. | Various measures to strengthen the knowledge management culture in IFAD are underway. The institutional review of scaling up also provided a number of steps to strengthen this. |
| IFAD | CLE | 8 | IFAD | PLCY | SCA | IFAD will undertake policy dialogue and partnership building in order to contribute to scaling up. | Policy dialogue initiatives in recent months include consultations for the Rural Poverty Report, the international conference on "New Directions for Smallholder Agriculture", the conference in collaboration with the International Finance Corporation- "Smallholder agriculture as a business: legal dimensions of building inclusive value chains" |
| IFAD | CLE | 9 | IFAD | PLCY | SCA | Adequate resources and space need to be allocated to non-lending activities, which are essential in scaling up | The focus on non-lending activities has increased in recent years: this includes increasing focus on partnerships and policy dialogue as key dimensions of country presence. At the corporate level, IFAD is engaging more effectively on policy dialogue including through initiatives such as the Rural Poverty Report and the Smallholder Conference. |
| IFAD | CLE | 10 | IFAD | STR | SCA | Staff competencies should be further developed to ensure success in the area of scaling up. | Staff competencies are being addressed; this includes learning events (including during the institutional review), sensitising Country Programme Managers to scaling up (including through guidelines in the COSOP sourcebook), emphasising the importance of the triad of innovation, learning and scaling up. As outlined in the progress report on the strategy for knowledge management (presented in EB 102) scaling up is now integrated into project and program design. |
| IFAD | CLE | 11 | IFAD | STR | KM | Stronger efforts are needed in exchanging experiences and lessons on innovation and scaling up within and across the five geographical regions in which IFAD works, both in the regions and among operational staff at headquarters. | A number of corporate knowledge-sharing initiatives have been taken in the last year. This includes conducting a knowledge-sharing event on the occasion of the portfolio review presentation covering best practices, stories from the field, portfolio management tools, discussions on emerging issues. All events were open to all PMD divisions and other non-PMD departments as well. Also conferences were held in the last year, including interactions on the Rural Poverty Report, consultations with all staff on the new strategic framework and focus, the inter-institutional conferences on smallholder farming and value chains, occasional papers written by divisions and distributed |

| Country | Evaluation | S N | Level | Nature | Theme | Agreement at completion point (ACP) Agreed Action | PMD Follow Up |
|---------|------------|-----|-------|--------|-------|--|---|
| | | | | | | | across divisions, thematic papers such as the paper on gender dimensions of agriculture and rural development. |
| IFAD | CLE | 12 | IFAD | OPER | KM | Some specific initiatives could include the holding of periodic knowledge fairs at headquarters, focusing on initiatives by regional divisions | Knowledge fairs have been organised at regular intervals in Headquarters (see above). |
| IFAD | CLE | 13 | IFAD | OPER | KM | Initiatives could include inviting project staff as guest speakers from one region to the annual project implementation workshops organized by another regional division | Project staff has been invited across divisions to regional implementation workshops; further learning routes programmes were organised across divisions including representatives from projects in Latin America visiting the APR region. |
| IFAD | CLE | 14 | IFAD | OPER | KM | Initiatives could include better linkages among existing IFAD regional electronic networks | ESA (Eastern and Southern Africa regional division) and WCA (Western and Central Africa regional division) have collaborated on the Fidafrique electronic network. |
| IFAD | CLE | 15 | IFAD | OPER | KM | Initiatives could include ensuring that country presence staff are better integrated and have opportunities for sharing knowledge | All department-wide events now ensure that country staff are also included either in person or through teleconferencing (including PMD staff events, portfolio review events). An induction program for over 30 staff from the country offices was organised in the first quarter of 2011. |
| IFAD | CLE | 16 | IFAD | STR | RME | At the project level, improvements in M&E are essential | Projects have been provided support on M&E systems; this includes through recruiting specialist institutions in NEN (Near East and North Africa regional division) through grants (for impact surveys), capacity-building grants in WCA through the West Africa Rural Foundation, in ESA through the "Managing for Impact" grant, in LAC through collaboration with PREVAL, in APR through annual performance workshops on M&E. |
| IFAD | CLE | 17 | IFAD | OPER | HR | Efforts in knowledge management could be introduced as an indicator in the annual performance evaluation process of IFAD and of project staff. | While this has not been implemented across staff, knowledge management forms a key part of assessing performance of staff. As part of the restructuring processes including performance assessment, this is under active consideration. |
| IFAD | CLE | 18 | IFAD | STR | INN | Resources permitting, Management is committed to conducting a cultural analysis to provide a basis for bringing about the required changes in IFAD's innovation objectives, capabilities, processes and organizational climate. Needless to say, this is not an easy task and will require time. | This has not yet been done, owing to resource constraints; however a number of initiatives have been taken to enhance staff participation in knowledge-sharing and innovation, this includes the knowledge events mentioned, encouraging staff from different divisions to participate, initiating staff awards which rewarded (among other criteria) innovation. |

| Country | Evaluation | S N | Level | Nature | Theme | Agreement at completion point (ACP) Agreed Action | PMD Follow Up |
|--|------------|-----|-------|--------|-------|---|--|
| IFAD | CLE | 19 | IFAD | STR | KM | Pending such a study, Management is nonetheless committed to taking steps to encourage greater knowledge sharing and risk taking in order to motivate staff to innovate. | The knowledge-sharing initiatives mentioned above highlight efforts to motivate staff towards knowledge sharing. A number of corporate processes have also become more transparent and participatory: including the PMD online tools (RIMS, Project Status Report, Operations Dashboard) and the "Make it Better" blog, which allows all IFAD staff to comment on upcoming policies and strategies. |
| IFAD | CLE | 20 | IFAD | STR | KM | Management is also committed to bringing about institutional and process changes to achieve greater knowledge sharing and innovation. | See above |
| Joint Evaluation of AfDB and IFAD | | | | | | | |
| IFAD | CLE | 1 | IFAD | PLCY | PAR | Step up support to CAADP in implementing its mandate, and provide a joint statement of support for CAADP. | IFAD has greatly increased its participation in CAADP (the Comprehensive Africa Agriculture Development Programme) support both at the continental level through participation in the partnership meetings, as well as at Regional Economic Community (particularly with ECOWAS, the Economic Community of West African States) and country level through participation in CAADP compact and National Investment Plan processes. |
| IFAD | CLE | 2 | IFAD | PLCY | STR | At the country level, support the development of sound national ARD policies focused on results that are aligned with the CAADP policy framework and the commitments of the Maputo Declaration. | IFAD has contributed to a number of investment plans through the capitalization of its on-going projects which a number of countries have chosen to scale-up, as well as through participation in funding implementation of the plans as in the case of Togo. |
| IFAD | CLE | 3 | IFAD | PLCY | PAR | In line with a country-led approach, wherever possible the two institutions (AfDB and IFAD) should align their ARD strategies and business plans with national sector policies and strategies. | All COSOPs in Africa are explicitly describing how they align and support CAADP compacts and investment plans, and COSOP annual and mid-term reviews are reviewing their alignment to CAADP. M&E systems are being aligned to aggregate information aligned to Govt's overall CAADP framework indicators |
| IFAD | CLE | 4 | IFAD | PLCY | DIA | At the level of global policy, develop knowledge and capacity to engage in international advocacy on trade issues affecting African producers. | Additional capacity has not been developed, but in the context of senior management participation in international forum, the issue of improving trade incentives for Africa's farmers is highlighted. This issue also figures in IFAD's Rural Poverty Report. |
| IFAD | CLE | 5 | IFAD | STR | FLD | Increase and strengthen country presence | Both regions have significantly increased country presence: 7 in WCA and 8 in ESA. They have also increased technical and financial resources at the country level. ESA has also strengthened the Nairobi |

| Country | Evaluation | S N | Level | Nature | Theme | Agreement at completion point (ACP) Agreed Action | PMD Follow Up |
|---------|------------|-----|-------|--------|-------|---|---|
| | | | | | | | hub. These measures have served to increase efficiency and provide enhanced technical support and increased contribution to policy dialogue, formulation and improved implementation support. As a result, increasingly country presence is augmenting the impact of IFAD-financed investments in the region and contributing more significantly to improved livelihoods of the smallholder farmers in Africa. |
| IFAD | CLE | 6 | IFAD | PLCY | DES | Finance simpler, more sharply focused projects and programmes, to be undertaken within the framework of coordinated sector plans. | Given significant increase in funding and focus on lessons learned and sustainability, emphasis is on single project per PBAS cycle, with fewer components/activities and clearly aligned to Government CAADP framework. |
| IFAD | CLE | 7 | IFAD | PLCY | DES | Provide increased support to ARD in fragile states, with specific attention being devoted to the choice and sequencing of aid modalities. | IFAD has placed emphasis on increasing support to addressing basic needs and food security in these countries, by enabling the rural poor to start rebuilding productive asset bases, support for social infrastructure and services, reconstructing and development of rural organizations and their empowerment. For countries in post-conflict, sequencing of the aid modalities is critical hence The approach has been two-pronged to address short-term recovery needs while paving the way for development in the medium and long-term. Crucially the volume of resources has also increased both from IFAD and from co-financiers |
| IFAD | CLE | 8 | IFAD | STR | DIA | Build increased skills, knowledge and capacity in the areas of policy, analytical work, knowledge management and managing partnerships. | Both ESA and WCA have increased investments in innovative knowledge management approaches focused on drawing out practical lessons of projects for wider dissemination and scale-up. For example in Uganda, staff capacity has been enhanced at the level of the project (the CAIIP, Community Agriculture Infrastructure Improvement Project) and the Ministry (Ministry of Local Government). |
| IFAD | CLE | 9 | IFAD | STR | TCB | AfDB and IFAD should, in collaboration with other institutions, support governments in undertaking capacity needs assessments in the Agriculture and Rural Development sector, and provide substantial support for capacity-building and institutional development, including gender mainstreaming. The two institutions should also support similar work for decentralised institutions. | This has been conducted in a number of countries, for example in Togo, IFAD has partnered with AfDB in capacity building on ARD (agriculture and rural development) issues, including in the Ministry of Agriculture. |

| Country | Evaluation | S N | Level | Nature | Theme | Agreement at completion point (ACP) Agreed Action | PMD Follow Up |
|---------|------------|-----|-------|--------|-------|---|---|
| IFAD | CLE | 10 | IFAD | STR | PAR | Maintain and extend the current bilateral partnership, based on the memorandum of understanding of 2008, setting a limited number of precise, strategic regional priorities. It should focus on the respective comparative advantages and specializations, complementarity, and increasing the emphasis on results. | The current bilateral partnership is being reviewed annually, a meeting was held in November 2010, with another scheduled for May 2011 with all the three regional divisions. The meetings will cover thematic issues of common interest and will also involve sharing the respective pipelines for co-financing. |
| IFAD | CLE | 11 | IFAD | STR | PAR | At the regional level, AfDB and IFAD should take forward their partnership within the wider partnership around CAADP, and in support of CAADP. | This is occurring through Government-led CAADP processes where AfDB and IFAD join together with other donors in supporting sectoral strategies and investment plans. |
| IFAD | CLE | 12 | IFAD | STR | ASR | Engage more strategically in analytical work and allocate additional resources both in financial terms and in building staff capabilities. | Analytical work has received greater focus in IFAD; this includes the creation of the office of the Chief Development Strategist, a new focus on thematic publications and analytical work. |
| IFAD | CLE | 13 | IFAD | STR | KM | Plan selected joint activities between the divisions such as a knowledge programme to cross-fertilize lessons learned, best practices and experiences, along a proactive policy for exchanging staff and consultants. | Interactions have occurred on thematic issues such as rural finance, remittances, facility for fertilisers, bio-fuels. This has included sharing of experiences among IFAD and AfDB staff. However the policy of pro-actively exchanging staff and consultants has not yet been implemented. |
| IFAD | CLE | 14 | IFAD | STR | STR | Differentiated allocation levels of administrative resources for fragile states and low-income countries. | No a priori differentiation in allocation levels, but divisions provided flexibility to reallocate to reflect country realities. |
| IFAD | CLE | 15 | IFAD | STR | DES | Joint project identification, design and approval: 5 countries | Efforts are ongoing to share respective co-financing pipelines and therefore encourage joint participation at the design stage. In some countries, the joint design has already started, including in Burkina Faso, Togo. |
| IFAD | CLE | 16 | IFAD | STR | PAR | Amount cofinanced: Each institution to increase the amount cofinanced by a minimum of 15 percent above baseline | This has been achieved. |
| IFAD | CLE | 17 | IFAD | OPER | SUP | Number of joint supervision missions undertaken: Jointly supervise all cofinanced operations starting in 2010 | While all co-financed projects have not been jointly supervised, a number of countries have started: including Ghana, Mozambique, Gambia, and Swaziland. |
| IFAD | CLE | 18 | IFAD | OPER | ASR | Increase in relevant analytical work, either directly or through partnership arrangements: IFAD/AfDB to collaborate in carrying out three economic sector work activities using IFAD grant resources | This has not been done in terms of identifying specific work activities in collaboration with AfDB; however IFAD has been investing resources in knowledge management and analytical work. |
| IFAD | CLE | 19 | IFAD | OPER | ASR | Share analytical work in a mutually beneficial manner: IFAD and AfDB working group to jointly identify issues | Through the annual review meetings, AfDB and IFAD have engaged knowledge sharing on the different |

| Country | Evaluation | S N | Level | Nature | Theme | Agreement at completion point (ACP) Agreed Action | PMD Follow Up |
|---------|------------|-----|-------|--------|-------|--|---|
| | | | | | | for further analyses, when needed and share outputs on regular basis | thematic areas (recommendation 13). In the future, outputs of analytical work will be shared on a regular basis. |
| IFAD | CLE | 20 | IFAD | OPER | PAR | Partnership coordinator: A coordinator to be appointed in 2010 to manage the partnership | Not appointed. Though staff members have been assigned functions to coordinate the partnership, no coordinator has yet been appointed. |
| IFAD | CLE | 21 | IFAD | OPER | KM | Share information broadly on a regular basis: Both institutions have appointed focal points to regularly exchange information on project and country strategy pipelines and share results for ongoing and completed portfolios | This has been achieved through participation in the review meetings; IFAD has also shared different portfolio management tools with AfDB management. The November 2010 meeting also explored the issue of jointly undertaking activities on knowledge management. |
| IFAD | CLE | 22 | IFAD | OPER | HR | Staff exchange programme: Undertake a staff exchange programme starting in 2010 for 1-to-2-year deployment periods | Not done. This has to be explored further with AfDB in terms of identifying appropriate roles and responsibilities. |